



KADİR HAS UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES  
PROGRAM OF COMMUNICATION STUDIES

**A TASTE FOR THE “REAL”: THE CASE OF ARTISAN  
SOURDOUGH BREAD TREND IN TURKEY**

BÜŞRA ŞAVLI

SUPERVISOR: ASSOC. PROF. LEVENT SOYSAL

MASTER’S THESIS

ISTANBUL, AUGUST, 2019

**A TASTE FOR THE “REAL”: THE CASE OF ARTISAN  
SOURDOUGH BREAD TREND IN TURKEY**

BÜŞRA ŞAVLI

SUPERVISOR: ASSOC. PROF. LEVENT SOYSAL

MASTER’S THESIS

Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies of Kadir Has University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master’s in the Discipline Area of Communication Studies under the Program of Communication Studies.

ISTANBUL, AUGUST, 2019

I, BÜŞRA ŞAVLI, hereby declare that;

- this Master's Thesis is my own original work and that due references have been appropriately provided on all supporting literature and resources;
  - this Master's Thesis contains no material that has been submitted or accepted for a degree or diploma in any other educational institution;
  - I have followed "Kadir Has University Academic Ethics Principles" prepared in accordance with the "The Council of Higher Education's Ethical Conduct Principles"
- In addition, I understand that any false claim in respect of this work will result in disciplinary action in accordance with University regulations.

Furthermore, both printed and electronic copies of my work will be kept in Kadir Has Information Center under the following condition as indicated below

The full content of my thesis/project will be accessible only within the campus of Kadir Has University.

The full content of my thesis/project will not be accessible for 2 years. If no extension is required by the end of this period, the full content of my thesis will be automatically accessible from everywhere by all means.

BÜŞRA ŞAVLI



---

21.08.2019

KADIR HAS UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES

**ACCEPTANCE AND APPROVAL**

This work entitled **A TASTE FOR THE “REAL”: THE CASE OF ARTISAN SOURDOUGH BREAD TREND IN TURKEY** prepared by **BÜŞRA ŞAVLI** has been judged to be successful at the defense exam held on **21.08.2019** and accepted by our jury as **MASTER’S THESIS**.

APPROVED BY:

(Assoc. Prof. Levent Soysal) (Advisor)

(Kadir Has University)

(Asst. Prof. Defne Karaosmanoğlu)

(Kadir Has University)

(Prof. Dr. Nilay Ulusoy)

(Bahçeşehir University)

I certify that the above signatures belong to the faculty members named above.

  
Prof. Dr. Sinem Algül Arıkuşese  
Dean of School of Graduate Studies

DATE OF APPROVAL: 21 / 10 / 2019

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ABSTRACT</b> .....	<b>iv</b>
<b>ÖZET</b> .....	<b>v</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b> .....	<b>vi</b>
<b>1. INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1 Methodology</b> .....	<b>9</b>
<b>2. MAKING THE BREAD “GREAT” AGAIN</b> .....	<b>14</b>
<b>2.1 The “Real Bread” 101</b> .....	<b>14</b>
<b>2.2 Theoretical Background</b> .....	<b>18</b>
2.2.1 Search for authenticity .....	19
2.2.2 Slow Food and the rhetoric of “right way of living” .....	22
2.2.3 Virtuous globalization and world culture .....	25
<b>2.3 World Culture and Institutionalized Discourses</b> .....	<b>28</b>
<b>3. SOURDOUGH DISCOURSES: A CASE STUDY IN TURKEY</b> .....	<b>30</b>
3.1.1 Narratives of bread .....	31
3.1.2 Individual matters .....	33
3.1.3 Healthy bread.....	36
<b>3.2 Environmentalism</b> .....	<b>41</b>
<b>3.3 Heritage</b> .....	<b>43</b>
<b>4. CONCLUSIONS</b> .....	<b>48</b>
<b>REFERENCES</b> .....	<b>54</b>
<b>CURRICULUM VITAE</b> .....	<b>61</b>

A TASTE FOR THE “REAL”:  
THE CASE OF ARTISAN SOURDOUGH BREAD TREND IN TURKEY

**ABSTRACT**

ŞAVLI, BÜŞRA. A TASTE FOR THE “REAL”:  
THE CASE OF ARTISAN SOURDOUGH BREAD TREND IN TURKEY, MASTER’S THESIS, Istanbul, 2019.

This thesis focuses on the increasing interest in artisanal sourdough bread in Turkey and the discourses that compound the exchange value of bread, a mass-produced staple food, and make it “real bread”. Artisanal bread seemingly offers an alternative to industrialized, standardized global food system with an anti-consumerist sentiment resting on the search of authenticity and singularities as a current phenomenon. Simultaneously, it has become a trendy consumer product crossing the borders of its niche market. Understanding the increasing market and social value of artisanal bread, it is crucial to examine the institutional discourses that act as the legitimating frames of reference. Complementing the global calls for social responsibility to protect and save the environment and cultural heritage, social movements as Slow Food, and its local branch “Fikir Sahibi Damaklar” in Turkey, acts as the pioneering key institutions of legitimation of the main discourses that underlie the rising trends of “real bread”. As such, we see a significant emphasis on the individual responsibility for making the “right” choices and the sourdough bread becomes a tool to build an authentic self by being purveyor of individual attainment of good health, to ensure environmental sustainability and diversity, and of the preservation of cultural heritage and the promotion of the local. I argue that these discourses are a part of the constructed system of meanings and practices that appear as an enacting “world cultural” trend. Thus, I demonstrate the trending artisanal bread consumption through an analysis of the rhetoric of authentic and “real bread” circulating in the digital sphere where the narratives of sourdough by popular artisan bakeries and mass producers in Turkey have been shared in an incremental fashion and discuss the conflicts and potentialities emerges with it.

**Keywords:** Real bread, Artisan Production, Institutional Discourses, World Culture

“GERÇEK”İN LEZZETİ:  
TÜRKİYE’DE ARTIZAN EKŞİ MAYALI EKMEK TRENDİ

**ÖZET**

ŞAVLI, BÜŞRA. “GERÇEK”İN LEZZETİ: TÜRKİYE’DE ARTIZAN EKŞİ MAYALI EKMEK TRENDİ, MASTER TEZİ, İstanbul, 2019.

Bu tez, İstanbul’da geleneksel ekşi mayalı ekmeğe karşı artan ilgiye ve bir temel gıda olan ekmeğin değişiminde etkin rol oynayan ve onu “gerçek ekme” yapan söylemleri ortaya koyacaktır. Artizan ürünler endüstriyel, standardize global gıda sistemine tüketim karşıtı bir duyarlılıkla karşı çıkar bir noktada durmaktadır. Fakat eş zamanlı olarak, popüler bir tüketici ürünü haline dönüştürmüştür. Artizan ekmeğin pazar ve sosyal değerinin artışı göz önüne alındığında onu meşrulaştıran kurumsallaşmış söylemlerin incelenmesi hususu önemlidir. Çevre ve kültürün korunmasına ilişkin global çağrılarda bireyin “doğru” seçimleri yapmada üzerine yüklenen sorumluluk büyük derecede artmıştır. Slow Food gibi sosyal hareketler ve Türkiye’deki yerel şubesi “Fikir Sahibi Damaklar”, yükselen “gerçek ekme” trendinin arkasında yatan ana söylemlerin meşrulaştırılmasında öncü kilit kurumlar olarak hareket etmektedirler. Bu söylemlerin ışığında gerçek ekme üretimi ve tüketimi, bireysel ve toplumsal sağlığını, doğal çevrenin ve kültürel mirasın korunması adına “doğru” seçim olarak öne çıkarılmıştır. Bunun nedenini ise artizan ekşi maya ekmeğin “dünya kültürü” kuramının öne sürdüğü gibi belirli anlamlar sistemi ve pratiklerini taşıyan bir trend olarak var olması olarak açıklayacağım. Bu nedenle söylemleri ile ön plana çıkan popüler artizan ekme üreticilerinin “gerçek ekme” iddialarını analiz ederek, söylemleri aynı zamanda bireysel ve toplumsal alanda yükselen tartışmaların ışığında değerlendireceğim. Bu vesile ile hem alternatif hem de kitlesel pazarlarda ticari ve sosyal değeri artan ekşi maya ekmeği önde gelen kurumsal söylemlerin etkisi altında inceleyeceğim.

**Anahtar Sözcükler:** Gerçek Ekme, Artizan Üretim, Kurumsal Söylemler, Dünya Kültürü

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1 The List of Bakers Analysed in The Thesis.....	11
--	----





# 1. INTRODUCTION

On September 2017, I have “witnessed” the last step of the seed journey of *Future Farmers*, a project of seed preservation for future generations sailing from Norway to their last step Turkey, since the Anatolian peninsula is known with hosting the oldest seeds in Göbeklitepe from where the wheat seeds had spread to Europe earlier assumedly, in an event called *Future Farmers and Urban Bakers*<sup>1</sup>. First, we have discussed the historical journey of the wheat and the contemporary issues threatening the future of “real” seeds due to massive industrial productions, environmental disasters and forgotten techniques. Later, to understand our place as individuals in this story, we carried on to have some ritualistic moments where we were carefully carrying different types of ancestral wheat capsuled in little bottles and concluding with a final ceremony where it was attempted to send smoke signals from a bread oven in Mors code for the next generations saying “we are here for them”. Unfortunately, the attempt was failed in practice when even participants were not able to see the smoke. Not just the attempt to symbolically support the future generations, but my passion went missing in this action.

Not a farmer, but as a self-determined “urban” artisan baker wannabe back then I had enough justification to participate in the event to learn the delicacies of making the finest, the rightest and the most honest bread. However, rather than cultivating my passion, I ended up having more questions on my mind because of the exaggeration of the virtuosity in the ritualistic performance of the one world (Lechner and Boli 2008: 2), the origin story representation and the way bread making is connected to many different yet entangled discourses of today’s world. The ritual was a performative act telling its audience that we live in one world and we share it. On the same day I admitted to myself that I was neither a big fan of craft beer nor experimental cheese as well and have noted somewhere that bread was only one of the subjects that was valorised as a result of the significant emphasis that has been given to being

---

<sup>1</sup>For further information on the event and the organisation: <http://www.futurefarmers.com/>

authentic by acknowledging the rights and responsibilities to care one's own health, the environment and the cultural values for the next generations. The narratives of bread-talk as the main reasons behind the valorisation of the bread that have led to the prevalence of the artisan sourdough bread production and consumption which affected me personally as well, are going to be the main concerns of this thesis.

“If you are not eating ‘real food’, if you are not eating ‘real bread’ ... then you are not a ‘real’ human” were the closing remarks of Defne Koryürek, who is the founder of *Fikir Sahibi Damaklar* (Thinking Palates), Istanbul chapter of the global Slow Food Movement, in her 2010 TedxReset talk titled “*The Future of Food and Sustainable Consumption*” (Koryürek 2010). This speech was the initial event that made me curious about the origin of the idea behind the concept of real food and in particular real bread while I was already highly conscious about the people around me who have started being involved in real-food talks and baking their own bread, and initially stimulated me to consider becoming an artisan baker. In her speech, Koryürek, as a cook, an activist and as she puts more emphasis on it, as a mother, mentions her concerns about the food industry and the future of her daughter in the face of industrial food production and its risks. Throughout her speech, she asserts that in order to protect our bodies as well as the future generations, we should investigate the ingredients and the means of production. In addition to that, for the environment and for our cultural values we should remember the importance of someone's direct involvement in the process by having a high sense of conscience and educate ourselves, she says. With Fikir Sahibi Damaklar, she has started her quest on finding the means of “real food” and organized “Real Bread Workshop” under the concept of “virtual kitchen” in 2009<sup>2</sup>. For them, the real bread is the “traditional” sourdough bread which is made ecologically by the whole wheat sourdough that contains more minerals and vitamins. Real flour is definitely not the white one which is only a bad copy of the traditional one and should not be served to one's own children in any circumstance. Our children should be taught to read the ingredients behind

---

<sup>2</sup> Real Bread Workshop was held online and can be followed from the following link:  
<http://fikirsahibidamaklar.blogspot.com/2009/06/sevgili-dostlarm-ocak-ayndan-bu-yana.html>

the industrial products to understand the artificiality and they should spend time in the kitchen to understand the value of the real food.

The melancholia of not knowing the “reality” I have been missing from my life by eating either sliced and packaged industrial bread or “*francala*”<sup>3</sup> made of white flour was the trigger for me to get involved in sourdough bread-making myself and over time, even considering a career and lifestyle change around it by becoming an artisan bread maker after years of high education. Even though I have never eaten a slice of sourdough bread before unlike others claiming as their main staple of their childhood thanks to their mothers and grandmothers, by watching those videos and reading online, I have learned how to grow a sourdough starter. With the motto of “turn your passion into your profession” I started taking artisan bread classes, got myself a 93-year-old sourdough starter to make the best authentic breads, and joined to several workshops to develop my artisan skills. Feeding and taking care of my sourdough starter like a baby, the passion I felt while I was waiting for my bread to come out of the oven and the curious waiting before cutting it to see if the open crumb was proper, became a daily ritual overnight. I was taking photos of the process of bubbly starter, writing a diary for the first time in my life to share later these feelings I was immersed in under the #sourdoughlovers hashtag on Instagram and eventually became a part of the sourdough spectacle. The only thing missing was maybe the lack of the ability to share the amazing smell of freshly baked bread with all those others who share audio-visual or written stories with the same excitement towards the comeback of this “retro” lifestyle as a brand-new experience of authenticity. This passion felt so unique to me, yet at the same time, it was only a glimpse of a ubiquitous phenomenon that took me a while to locate. The artisan sourdough bread trend has started earlier in San Francisco (Bobrow-Strain 2012), has spread to the UK (Sustain 2019) and Northern Europe (Gustafsson and Engstrand 2012), and finally arrived to Turkey’s gourmet scenery.

The observable change in the habits of production and consumption of bread in Turkey in the last couple of years became more visible after several pioneers of artisan bread bakery

---

<sup>3</sup> Francala, is the given name for the French style bread (baguette) consisting white flour in Turkey.

shops came on the scene. Especially with the circulation of online stories of certain artisan bakeries such as *Sour & Sweet* and *240 Derece* (240 Degrees), popular individual bakers who sell the bread they make for themselves such as *Alishiro* and *Fırınımdan Ekmekler* (Breads from My Oven) and the late online success of *Mutfakkitap's* (Kitchenbook) workshops, the number of artisan bakeries and individuals who are involved in artisan bread making online have been increasing every day. Along with the artisan bread trend, the simultaneous rise in other craft food products such as coffee and beer and the increasing interest towards exotic super foods (Wilk 2017) have resulted in the increase in food festivals, food conferences and workshops branded with the emphasis on the new possibilities to have an “authentic life” in urban scenery or how to escape to the rural to find “the real” way of living. The proliferation in the interest towards newly opened bakeries in the up-and-coming or wealthy neighbourhoods of Istanbul, variety of flour types which are labelled as organic and local that we can now find in multiple places, do-it-yourself sourdough bread blog stories and videos circulating and receiving a significant attention in social media, naming the sourdough starters and sharing daily stories of sourdough starters and breads shows the great passion, sentiment and affection attached to the long-time staple of Turkey. With the contribution of well-known TV dietitians or new generation of influencer newly becoming popular on social media, traditional sourdough bread started to (re)appear in Turkish breakfast tables. Simultaneously and definitely not surprisingly, the mass baked good production companies also started to use common rhetoric that producers labelled as alternative and anti-consumerist emphasize to advertise their “unique” products. Not only the producers but the columnists, the writers of best-selling bread books, dietitians and even politicians adapted the same discourses in their daily rhetoric<sup>4</sup>. Through their definitions, sourdough bread has

---

<sup>4</sup> The author of the many of the most shared newspaper articles, Yılmaz Özdil who has nearly one million followers (925K) of Twitter wrote an article titled “Bread” where he was arguing the bread we have been consuming during the last decades was not an honest one.

Relishable breads we had, with cereals, rye and oat. Brown it was.

Cornbread we had. They were genuine Anatolian breads.

The yeast was not ready-made.

Our women produced sourdough in our homes.

Organic it was, natural it was. Sacred it was, respected... (Özdil, 2018)

In his poetic manner, he both points later in the article, the political promises during 1950s and the current President of the time, Erdoğan's promises on “ending the era of white bread” (Hurriyet, 2013). This

become not just a staple food to eat but a subject of a story of individuals who virtuously/proudly manifest themselves as healthy, environment friendly and respectful towards heritage.

Similarly, baking my own bread led to me to think constantly about everything I put on the slice. I was, for the first time, considering how I communicate with the marketplace as a consumer, trying new combinations of tastes while watching Jaime Oliver's Food Revolution on TV and everything else you can imagine a "foodie" does nowadays. This practice of not buying but making the main staple of my diet on my own gave me a feeling of power and control, especially as a member of the Y generation, a feeling that I have not had before. Consequently, as every foodie, in order to learn more on the social context of bread-making, my new "raison d'être", I have started attending several discussions and workshops on the topic including "Future Farmers and Urban Bakers". However, as I have given the hints beforehand, it turned to an anxiety about how to keep control of everything surrounding the bread with a great sense of responsibility. All the stories of the bakers I have been following daily were based on the idea that how simple it is to make and demand real bread: flour, water, salt and passion. However, combining all the stories, I have "discovered" that real bread production and consumption requires a moral stance and even more effort than that, because as long as I continued buying my flour from the supermarket, using plastic bottle water and adding industrial yeast to fasten the process, it was never going to be "real". Consequently, when I gave up and happened to buy the end product, if I choose a "cheaper" super-market option rather than the "fine" – almost a luxury – artisan sourdough version, it would never be "real".

"But why should I care about these trends? If we, the upper-middle-class writers and readers (of this volume), can find and afford this great bread, is not that what counts? But I keep thinking about the global picture" says Belasco (1999: 229) and in a similar fashion, the subtle process that makes this special rustic bread a better choice and the contradictions it brings became my problem as well. Shortly after, the day when I had a feeling of very

---

especially shows the significance of the bread-talk, not in individual or market level, but also political rhetoric, that is shared online widely.

artificial mourning after the death of my precious sourdough starter, this thesis was born. I gave up on my personal quest on finding my inner authenticity and returned to the good old friend so-called “unreal” packaged bread, the bread I have been familiar with for a long time. The mourning was replaced with an inquisition of my initial starting motivation of making my own bread and brand-new future plans of becoming a sourdough bread maker as many other graduates think and actualize working in traditional modes of productions lately. My interest in sourdough, even though it has a short history, therefore, became a good point to start understanding first my existential anxiety reflected itself via an artificial attachment to bread making and identity formation around it and then the analysing the ubiquitous artisan bread trend became visible with the new bakery shops appearing in the city scenery and the mass production versions that reached to a larger audience. That is why even though I could not handle to maintain my sourdough starter, I still wanted to continue thinking about the real or authentic bread but by turning it into an analysis of the use of the discursive keywords representing itself as the main subject of quest, the zeitgeist of contemporary individual.

Several definitions of “real bread” I came across which will be analysing here further, were all suggesting being more authentic and being aware of the consequences of the consumer culture and industrial production with its relation with institutional discourses. Hence, I, in the beginning, argue that the “simple” definition of the real bread is not simple even though it posits itself against the “artificial” one whose ingredients are hard to follow because of the additives. This thesis is going to focus on the main ingredients of not the bread itself but the rhetoric of it that makes the definition. Therefore, in this thesis, I aim to demonstrate where the roots of real-bread-talk are to understand this change in the perception or branding of the main staple of Turkey. In order to do that, I have reviewed the existing literature, not only focusing on the bread itself, but in addition, related studies concerning other global trends.

The trend of artisanal food products, as a ubiquitous phenomenon, has been studied within inter-disciplinary approaches. Even though the literature on artisan bread is limited (Bobrow-Strain 2012, Gustaffson and Engstrand 2012), the issue of craft goods, super-food, ethical consumption, local and traditional products have been studied on other subjects such as coffee, beer, wine, cheese (Raynolds 2002; Carley and Yahng 2018; Maguire 2016;

MacDonald 2013; Paxson 2010) which shed a light for this thesis to have a broader understanding on rising interest in artisan bread production. The main focal of existing alternative food literature seems to be the consumer, where the individual level of the phenomenon has been analysed through studying the identity formation and consumer culture and consumption practices. The conceptualization of the self as agentic actor (Meyer 2010), identity-formation through consumption (De Solier 2013), individualization of consumption (Beck and Beck-Gernsheim 2002), and notably, the consumerism as a life style (Bauman 1990; Giddens 1991), consequently, have been popular reference points to study certain trends. At the same time, with the rise of disaster stories of the loss of environmental sustainability and particular cultural practices, collective identities emerged as oppositional actors standing against the “irrational”, “immoral” “self(ish)” actions of individual consumers (Reckwitz 2017) and the concepts of craft, alternative, ethical and anti-consumerism have been also found their places in the literature (Elliot 2016; Pecoraro and Uusitalo 2013; Goodman 2003, 2004; Binkley 2008).

The rise of these global alternative trends have also been attempted to explain by several scholars studying globalisation with different conceptualizations such as “global ecumene” (Hannerz 1989), “global cultural flows” (Appadurai 1990) and “world system and culture” theories (Lechner and Boli 2008; Lechner 2009) as a result of mass educational organizations (Meyer et al. 1992; Schofer and Meyer 2005), rise of international NGOs (Boli and Thomas 1999), dispersion of the concept of rights and diffusion of attributes to individuals and organizations as global virtues (Thornton et al. 2012). It has been argued within the concept of world culture, these attributes, moral codes or virtues, lifestyles and understandings of general concepts dispersed via circulation of information by international organizations and collectives. “World cultural trends are woven into the taken for granted fabric of everyday life” says Boli (2005: 385) to show the ubiquity of certain global trends. Hence, it can be easily considered that a change in the bread, one of the main staples of daily diet in Turkey can be an indicator of world cultural trends as well.

“World culture”, Lechner and Boli (2008) argue, is an organizational form of everyday practices that are elements of rationalized and institutionalized discourses in a global manner.

In this sense, world cultural trends occur as a result of continuous representations of certain values and practices highlighted by organizational social structures and rational actors and the internalized embracement of these values and actions by producers and consumers, with the preferences of, for instance, artisan, traditional, fair trade, organic or gluten-free products. While this is easily applicable for the artisan sourdough bread case in Istanbul, valorisation of the particular, creating authentic narratives on material commodities, and moralisation of everyday life (Kopytoff 1986; Reckwitz 2017) are not just a set of shifts in sourdough bread, but general tendencies that can be observed as a new trend in urban lifestyles (Gottdiener 2000). Hence, I argue that, in addition to the micro-level, the individual side of the trend, following an institutional framework (Meyer 2010: 9), in this case, “world culture” will help better understand the creation, rationalization and the expansion of these seemingly unique and particular but in terms of the discourses they carry, isomorphic trends.

All things considered, in this thesis I came to the conclusion that the reason behind this current rise in interest towards and the commercial and social value of artisan bread are a combination of several entangled institutional discourses and contemporary virtues. Even though the trend shows itself as a “selfish” consumer act based on the quest for authenticity that can be explained as a way of identity formation on the surface, the expectations from an authentic self, on social media or in everyday life, include being socially responsible. Stories of sourdough bread are expressed with great sentiments and autobiographical narratives to highlight the uniqueness of the process yet it still carries a rationalized order of valorisation. The main discourses I have found in the bread-talk of individual bakers, artisan bakeries, mass producers and bread experts that give powerful moral background to their rhetoric and legitimize their statements are individualism, environmentalism and heritage in the case of artisan sourdough bread. Therefore, as I have mentioned earlier, being involved in artisan sourdough bread practice, either via producing and promoting it or simply consuming it, has been regarded as signals of an authenticity that puts forward individualistic, environmentalist and traditionalist values. It can be observed in both individual level or as a way of branding in a corporal level regardless of the means of production, this is the reason, I argue that not the “real” subject of the bread, but the discursive narratives that constitute bread as “real” are the main reasons of the expansion of it as a world cultural trend.



## 1.1 Methodology

Since the revitalization of real bread mainly made possible by the circulation of narratives, it is no surprise that this thesis reveals “stories” to sell itself just like most of the artisan bread makers do with their meticulously written captions under their photos on social media or in their website. The day I received a photo of a snail with a caption of “slow life” from my mother who does not even speak English and definitely not a member of Slow Food became another trigger point for me to think further on the massive circulation of information and creation of trends online.

This not very “unique”, “authentic” but “handmade” thesis aims to discuss the trend of artisan sourdough bread in the trajectory of authentic narratives that carries these institutional discourses by analysing the common rhetoric circulate in the digital sphere where the narratives of sourdough have been shared in an incremental fashion. Even though the initial aim was to make in-depth interviews with the artisan bread makers, I wanted to investigate the online stories of the narrative-makers because the rhetoric of “real” bread, as it signals the “truthfulness” of the subject, is the main concern of this thesis since rhetoric “may be viewed not as a matter of giving effectiveness to truth but of creating truth” (Scott 1976 cited in Consalvo and Paul 2013: 2). In this regard, it is important to consider discursive field of moral stories valorising the bread as Charland argues “subjects within narratives are not free, they are positioned and so constrained. All narratives have power over the subjects they present” (1987:140 cited in Herman 1999).

Hence, in order to analyse the issue, I have selected discourse analysis which is a qualitative interpretative analysis of the use of language and narration in any form of text (Gill 1996, Foucault 2002) to legitimise “particular conceptions of social reality” and constructed social relations and authorities (Deacon et al. 2007:151-55) as my main methodology. As Hall states, discourse analysis is “not about whether things exist but about where meaning comes from” (2001:73). By this mean, in order to have a broader perspective and to see the circulation of the information built in narrative which I could not assess by in-depth interviews or consumer research and to understand how these stories “make explicit and implicit claims to truth and authenticity” (Dobson 2015: 23) with similar constructed ways

of saying by using subjective and sentimental narratives (Foucault 2002), I have conducted the research online by reviewing websites, social media channels, interviews and manifestations on artisan sourdough bread which has been labelled as real or the right option.

The initial reason to choose rhetoric of bakers was the prevalence of my encounters with these narratives of individuals referring certain bakeries, which later I realized has similar discourses with multiple non-governmental organizations and even with mass producers. With the focal transition from consumer to producer (Valor 2007: 17) and the rise of concept of the self-entrepreneurship as “the entrepreneurial subject of neoliberal capitalism” (Marwick, 2013 7), branding, community management in social media became vital issues in both individual or corporate levels as well as having a consistent rational but at the same time subjective and sentimental narrative which can be observed in the rising numbers of individuals who sell artisan sourdough bread heavily relying on their online presence on Instagram accounts and blogs (Fuchs 2015). However, even though the aim looks like to have an authentic, unique and subjective story, different artisan bakery brands, individual bakers and others who collaborate in the bread-talk constantly repeat the same narratives of individualism, environmentalism and heritage as their main ingredients as it will be analysed and demonstrated in this thesis.

Since the main concern of this thesis was the discontent with the use of “real” for the artisan sourdough bread, I have made my first research with the keywords and hashtags related to “real bread” in different search engines and social media channels. After combining my initial encounters and the online research, I have collected the recurring brand names and their stories published in website and social media pages. These are, as you can see in Table.1, are the most commonly known and preferred artisan bakers and mass producers. I have followed these brands over 2 years on several platforms including their websites, social media channels and occurrences in other medias such as newspaper and online blogs, and checked the hashtags they use to see individual reflections on the trend which can be regarded as a practice of “netnography” (Kozinets 1997).

**Table 1.1. The List of Bakers Analysed in The Thesis**

<b>Bakers</b>	<b>Location (Distribution)</b>	<b>Website - Instagram</b>
<i>240 Derece</i>	Yesilkoy (online distribution)	<a href="https://www.240derece.com/">https://www.240derece.com/</a> - @240derece
<i>Grandma</i>	Nisantasi	<a href="https://grandmabakerycafe.com/">https://grandmabakerycafe.com/</a> - @grandmabakerycafe
<i>Alishiro (Ali'nin Ada Ekmegi)</i>	Bozcaada (online distribution)	<a href="https://alininadaekmegi.com/">https://alininadaekmegi.com/</a> - @alishiro
<i>Mitte Brot</i>	(online distribution)	<a href="https://mittebrot.com/">https://mittebrot.com/</a> - @mittebrot
<i>Nino</i>	Besiktas	<a href="http://ninobakery.com">http://ninobakery.com</a> - @ninobakery
<i>Bröd</i>	Nisantasi	<a href="http://www.brod.com.tr/">http://www.brod.com.tr/</a> - @brod_nisantasi
<i>Sour and Sweet</i>	Caddebostan	<a href="https://sournsweet.com.tr/">https://sournsweet.com.tr/</a> - @ss_sournsweet
<i>Firinimdan Ekmekler</i>	(distribution via walking and city public transportation in Istanbul)	<a href="https://firinimdanekmekler.com/">https://firinimdanekmekler.com/</a> - @firinimdanekmekler
<i>Eppek</i>	Fenerbahce (online distribution)	<a href="https://eppek.net/">https://eppek.net/</a> - @ eppek__
<i>Pelin'in Ekmegi</i>	Besiktas	<a href="http://www.pelininekmegi.com">http://www.pelininekmegi.com</a> - @pelininekmegi
<i>Istanbul Halk Ekmek (IHE)</i>	Istanbul	<a href="http://www.ihe.istanbul/">http://www.ihe.istanbul/</a>
<i>UNO</i>	Turkey	<a href="http://www.uno.com.tr/">http://www.uno.com.tr/</a>

To be able to understand the specific example of artisan sourdough bread preference as a global trend of consumption, I believe it is significant to overview and consider the change in “consumer culture” throughout time that eventually leads the emergence of the “universal” values that constitute certain types of food as “real”. I believe neither authenticity or realness that stand as the “visible” motivation of actors of the modern social scene, nor social responsibility calls for concerns for environment and heritage loss can be enough to explain the ubiquitous disposition of the trend. Hence, I aim to review several concepts in the same thesis to shed a brighter light on the complexity of the “valorised virtues” of today which are results of the crystallization of different components of socialites into a single concept of “global” as a whole world culture and civilization (Lechner and Boli 2005: 68). These values are simultaneously in relation with several constructed binaries of social life such as nature/culture-technology, individual/social, local/global, luxurization/democratization or universal/particular, therefore, usually are discussed with their contradictions. In this thesis, as a result of my autobiographical contradictory triggering encounter with sourdough bread, I review the necessary theoretical background from both micro and macro level approaches to have a wider understanding of the phenomenon as well as presenting the case in Turkey. Since most of the theorization of food trends reconstruct the binary between artisanal and industrial production practices by favouring one part, here I want to highlight the parallelism between individual, craft production and mass production brandings standing under the same umbrella of certain discourses and rhetoric based on “common” values, even though the concepts of “artisan” and “industrial” were established as oppositional. All in all, I analyse the trend of artisan sourdough bread in Turkey with a continuous interplay between the analysis of the data collection with the relevant theoretical considerations.

To elaborate the discourses, in the first chapter, I focus on the development of world cultural trends to set the basis for the discourses I will analyse later. I start with the brief change in the perception of bread in the US and in Turkey. Since the literature is limited on artisan sourdough bread, to have the necessary theoretical background I underline the changing concepts in the development of the perception of bread and make use of the existing literature in other similar trends. In the subchapters, I focus on the quest on authenticity as an individualistic side of the trend while later I gave an important place for social side of the

trend and analyse Slow Food Movement as one of the institutional discourse makers. After the brief theoretical review, I conclude the chapter with an emphasis on the world culture and the importance of institutional discourses to be able to understand the phenomenon of artisan sourdough bread.

In the second chapter I demonstrate the case of artisan sourdough scenery in Turkey under three main titles according to the three main discourses I argue as the main reasons that lie behind this world cultural trend, which are individualism, environmentalism and heritage. To start with, in order to make sense of individualistic discourse, I give the examples of storytelling and sensational approach of the narratives of bakers. Then, within the same discourse, I demonstrate the emphasis on cultural capital, productive labour, patience as a virtue and last but not least the health discourse as a subchapter of individualism. Later on, I continue with the discourse of environmentalism and the use of organic and natural labels on sourdough bread. Lastly, I demonstrate the use of heritage to evoke nostalgic sentimentalization and promotion of traditional techniques in artisan sourdough bread making.

## **2. MAKING THE BREAD “GREAT” AGAIN**

In this chapter I firstly demonstrate the change in the perception of bread from a basic staple to an indicator of status and finally with the rise of the sourdough bread as virtuous choice. Therefore, I review the existing literature on bread, analysing the common definition of “real bread” to uncover the discursive narratives behind it. Later on, to make sense of the case study, I give a significant place for the theoretical background on change in consumer culture, the rise in alternative production, the importance of rhetoric of Slow Food on the dispersion of the trend and finally I conclude the chapter by locating ubiquity of sourdough bread as a world cultural trend that carries the discursive narratives.

### **2.1 The “Real Bread” 101**

I have chosen bread as my main subject as besides my personal relationship with this particular bread called the “real” one, bread in general, is already an interesting subject by being “the staff of life” (Borrow-Strain 2008 20), the simplest yet one of the most powerful subjects of political, social, religious and economic movements (Belasco 1999: 221).

In one of the prominent literature on the bread, Bobrow-Strain (2012: 40) demonstrates the historical change in bread production and perception in the US starting from the trend of “white bread” in particular what is called in a generalized sense “Wonder Bread” that is the popular whitened, softened, sliced and plastic wrapped bread which has been highly disregarded in the last decade. He begins his analysis by showing how the “dreams of good bread” led industrial and “transparent” production of white bread to outshine as the best option against the small-scale “cellar” bakeries and their unauthorized and dishonest practices including cheap ingredients and hygiene issues in early 20<sup>th</sup> century. Not just the production methods, but the uniformity and standardization of the loaves, control over the ingredients and baking methods based on mechanical calculations and even the “whiteness” the industrial bread were considered as the simple symbol of modern aesthetics and rationality over traditional handmade breads that differ in size, shape and taste (63). Nevertheless, with the rise of doubt against industrial production different trends in bread

and nutritional diets stepped forward including whole-wheat brown bread, gluten-free options and even excluding the bread from the daily diets (72-90). At the end, once was the symbol of “milk-skinned” aristocrats, then of the “white” middle class, white bread is now one of the new scapegoats of what is going wrong with the today’s world while once cheap and staple of the lower class, whole wheat bread again became popular, this time voluntarily (Belasco 1999: 221). Against the industrialized, artificial, untrustworthy and plastic-wrapped white “wonder” bread which became the sign of “poor” choice in market, the artisan, real, honest and natural sourdough bread is promoted as “real bread” and the symbol of ethical consumption based on knowledge (Bobrow-Strain 2012: 165). Natural has been favoured over plastic, brown over white, craft over convenient and the process over the product (Belasco 1999: 222).

Turkey’s relationship with perception of bread follows a similar path with what the author shows in the case of the US. Unsurprisingly bread was differentiated as “pure” (*has*) and “mixed” (*harci*) where the former was exclusive for ruling class made by bakers the latter was the common bread that was baked at home (Ünsal 2003). From the time when bread was commonly made at home and buying bread from bakeries was a distinctive social act that rose among the population of urban cities, bread started to take its place in front of the windows of small neighbourhood markets and grocery stores. However, it was until 1990s when UNO, which is one of the biggest mass producers of baked goods in Turkey, came to the scene and introduced the plastic wrapped bread that has a longer shelf-life (UNO 2019). The last half century, therefore, either made by famous with the traditional stone oven baking technique or industrially, the commonly consumed type of bread has been the white (*francala*) bread which is still mostly referred as “normal” bread. This “normal” bread alongside the packaged and sliced industrial bread brought the Guinness Records to Turkey in the category of “largest bread consumption per capita” with 199.6 kg annual bread consumption per person (Guinness 2019). With attention to this particular example, citizens of Turkey, for a long time, have been associated bread as a blessing and sacred food. Later on, whether because of the political and economic discussions on the waste of bread or the rise of the popularity of healthy diets and expert opinions on consumption of carbohydrates, the bread-talk on consumption and production of the low grammage standard white bread

started to appear as negative<sup>5</sup>. On the other hand, simultaneously variety of bread types increased, due to whole-grain campaign, gluten-free demands and last but not least, new trend of sourdough cravings.

Given these points, opening a platform to discuss the transition from traditional stone-oven white bread to packaged bread and then to artisanal sourdough bread is significantly critic regarding Turkish citizens who manifestly always had a soft spot for white bread. To set the ground for further discussions. I will firstly start with the acknowledged new definition of “real” bread.

Şahin, the author of the book *Gerçek Ekmek ve Ekmekle İlgili Tüm Gerçekler* (Real Bread and All the Truth About the Bread) which has been widely referred in several popular interviews, blog and social media posts, defines the “real bread” as follows (2014):

... consisting of grains grown by the local seeds of the region where it is found in a soil that has not been poisoned by insects and pests which are grounded in the form of a whole-grain mixed with a sourdough consisting wild yeast and its valuable bacteria, is kneaded by skilled hands of a true baker, long-fermented, and baked in a stone-oven.

According to this definition, the concept of real stands for being anti-industrial, natural, hand-made and traditional. It locates itself on the contrary to the “unreal” one, which is, therefore, industrially made with genetically modified shorter wheat than the wild ancestral ones, on a soil that is cleaned by insects to optimize the harvest profit, is mass produced in factories with the commercial white flour which is softer in taste with industrial yeast to fasten the fermentation process. The discontent on mass food production techniques is not unique to bread but it has been widely criticized in several food subjects and posited industrial “cheap” food as the main reason of increase in the health problems because of distrust in genetically modified foods, environmental disasters due to profit seeker methods in agriculture and loss of cultural values as a result of forgotten traditional techniques. Consequently, the super-foods such as avocado, quinoa, chia seeds, kale, goji berries, açai and finally fermented foods such as kombucha and sourdough are sensationalized and gained popularities by bearing labels of exotic, authentic, environment-friendly, natural, healthy, local and traditional

---

<sup>5</sup> Canan Karatay who is a popular radical anti-bread advocate dietitian and became a very popular public figure with her continuous stigmatization of bread as an unhealthy diet option in Turkey in the early 2010s can be pointed as a prominent example in this issue.



(Mintel Group 2016). These “functional foods” scientifically labelled as “healthy” by many dietitians and experts<sup>6</sup> using the never-ending interest in healthy diets, also come out as solution-food for wider issues such as environmental problems, protection of culture and fair trade (Schiemer, Halloran, Jespersen and Kaukua 2018). As a part of this mega trend of super, solution or functional food, sourdough bread has been regarded as the better option against the industrial version bearing the tag of “real” not just in Şahin’s definition but in several expert-talks and campaigns. Therefore, it is no surprise that these ethical consumption alternatives and their calls has become louder, more normative and enactive.

In this regard, a forceful example in the UK is the “Real Bread Campaign” by the Sustain Allience. They claim that real bread simply is “made without the use of processing aids or any other artificial additives” and adds as following: “from our simple 'no additives' starting point, we're finding and sharing ways to make bread better for us, better for our communities and better for the planet” (SustainWeb 2019). In this regard, they advocate the necessity of label transparency and protection of small businesses and individual bakers of real bread and organize relevant workshops and events. In a similar fashion, Fikir Sahibi Damaklar, the Slow Food branch of Istanbul, in their “Real Bread Workshop” mentioned earlier, suggests that the sourdough bread made by traditional artisan techniques and meticulously selected organic ingredients comes out as the “right” choice for environmental sustainability and diversity, for the preservation of cultural heritage and the promotion of the local, as well as purveyor of individual attainment of good health. They organize a virtual workshop through their blog in order to raise awareness and educate on the production of sourdough bread. As a result of these organizational attempts and individual reflections on social media, sourdough bread rises beyond being a simple choice of staple by being a carrier of a rich value for individual, environment and heritage. Reiterating my argument, I suggest that to be able to understand how artisan sourdough bread came to this point of being a virtuous choice as the real bread, it is significant to start with an overview the development of the consumer

---

<sup>6</sup> The most remarkable example of it is the promotion of Goji Berries by Dr. Oz during the late 2000s. <https://www.doctoroz.com/videos/medicine-hunter-goji-berry>

culture to see its evolution into sourdough preference as a world cultural trend before moving on the case study.

## **2.2 Theoretical Background**

The consumption studies have been a prominent focal in social sciences to make sense of social relations in terms of how people define their self and their place in the society (Bauman 2001). Consumption, in this regard, has been seen as a prestige (Veblen 1899), as a system of signs (Baudrillard 1968), as a distinctive act (Bourdieu 1984), and as a result, an indicator of class differences, social and economic status in early consumption studies (Douglas and Isherwood 1979; Fajans 1988; Mennell 1996; Bell and Valentine 1997; Germov 1997). Nonetheless, the discontent towards the standardized, uniformed practice of mass production era, the pessimistic view of the mass media and the passive view of the “mass” consumer (Miller 1994: 50, cited in Ashley et al. 2004: 65) started to be held in contempt with the rise of individualism in neo-liberal market economy (Warde 1997: 15) with the concept of agentic practice of autonomous individuals, having a variety of market options, “freedom of choice” and “voting power” (Meyer 2010: 11) of active consumer rather than suiting into one type of consumer identity without having the chains of social pressure or approval, has been regarded as a result of the rise in liberal economies and simultaneous rise in individualism (Bauman 2001; Giddens 1991, Beck 1989). Given importance of individual choices, individualization of the consumption practice has been seen as one of the fundamentals of the new society where solid values and normative narratives became loosened while personal narratives, life-styles and self-identities constructed on unique practices of consumption gained power (Featherstone 1991).

This, in the food scenery expressed itself with the “you are what you eat” motto which has been a very generic formula used by many either in institutional level to call for consciousness or as a “life-style” motto manifested in individual social media profiles to manifest the conscious act of consumption (Martin 2016). “Because the attributes of foods resonate directly with the attributes of those who eat them, food is crucial in the definition of personhood; ‘you are what you eat’” (Fajans 1988: 155). Therefore, self and identity

formation, became one of the main focuses in food studies. The freedom from the mass production and distribution of knowledge, the institutionalized concepts of order, progress and control that had their roots in established family, class and nation-state values, on one hand was celebrated with the result of emancipated consumer, on the other hand, it has been also acknowledged that brought the anxiety of being forced to choose by necessary individual interpretations (Beck 1989).

### **2.2.1 Search for authenticity**

One consequence of the dissolution of class in “postmodern consumer culture”, Featherstone argues (1991) that, it led individuals to search for realities in terms of values and connections through nostalgia by creation of aesthetic and moral identities or in other terms, the regulation of inner morality that Elias regards as having moral and aesthetic sensitivity that can be easily applicable for the current trend of the quest of authentic identities (Meyer 2000: 37). In this sense, individuals, driven by the call for uniqueness and authenticity, look for suitable narratives that have relatable values and actions to adapt. The freedom of choices that makes individual autonomous which is both demanded and at the end compelled to exercise (McNaughtan 2012: 760) as Bauman (1990 cited in Warde 1997: 17) suggests, resulted as the emergence of “neo-tribes” that give individuals having sense of belongingness to a small group of a distinct style with means of creating a self-image of something new rather than being a part of the uniformed mass. This has been seen as another way of dealing with the uncertainties and anxieties by involving in a group with a certain degree of social regulation yet still identified as unique, similarly to subculture theories suggests (Warde 1994).

An example of this in food scene is the emergence of foodies and foodie culture who puts “higher moral value placed on producing and learning about material culture over simply consuming it in self-formation, in the context of post-industrial consumer culture and middle-class anxieties over materialism, combined with decline of material production in work” (De Solier 2013: 23) where simple, authentic and hand-made food has been regarded as “truthful, genuine and real” (Cairns et al. 2010). It is argued that tradition forms of artistry, the craft methods, gave the necessary background for foodies to feel artistic and creative by hand-

crafting something their own in order to achieve a certain degree of singularization against the negative effects of standardized ways of labour and rationalized everyday life (Johnston and Baumann 2010).

...individual choice and desire triumph over abiding social values and obligations; the whims of the present take precedence over the truth embodied in history, tradition and continuity; needs, values, and goods are manufactured and calculated in relation to profit rather than arising from authentic individual or communal life. (Slater 1997: 63 cited in Sassatelli 2018: 177)

The lifestyle “choices” that constructed on consumption, even though the alternative consumption intrinsically based itself on the same realm, have been regarded as the main reason of rise in health problems, climate change and loss of traditional “authentic” culture. Since the claim of “what we produced and consumed for the past previous decade were all ‘artificial’ and the new alternative ways of productions will bring back what is ‘lost’” is the mainstream trend as it has been shown, search for the “real” seems like the *raison d'être* of the contemporary individual. Therefore, industrialization of agriculture and mass distribution of the foods produced has been accepted as the main reason for the disconnectedness of the consumer with the means of production because of this defined distance between the consumer and the producer of the food, and therefore a broken link between the social, cultural bonds once assumedly had.

"And what could be better than bread, when it is made honestly, with no trickery or artifice, to convey this feeling of authenticity?" (Éric Kayser 2015)

As one of the pioneers of “artisan bakery” movement, Kayser in his book *The Larousse Book of Bread*, points out that the inquisition of the “authentic” and “real’ is still situated as the main meal on the plates of foodies, food scholars and producers. The increasing interest in writing and following individual food blogs by foodies, subsequently shaped the way the food discourse constructed, the social relations and the circulation of knowledge that spread the food information capital in larger spaces (Zhao and Zeynep 2011). This search for authentic, real experiences can be easily observed in the proliferation of engagement with sourdough bread. It is not only limited with the raise in the amount of production and consumption within the market but also high volume of social media engagement of self-experts and wannabes emerged with the trend of do-it-yourself practices and the craft

consumption. Accordingly, it led to alternative production and consumption methods which are defined as association of certain kinds of food as good to consume in a moral sense. Under the concept of craft consumption, suggested by Campbell (2005), cultivating and making one's own food can be seen as the expression of the new foodies' uniqueness who are self-taught, knowledgeable and authentic (Trubek 2005) and at the same time, the manifestation of exercising "some degree of control" over the safety and purity of the food (Autio et al. 2013: 567) to overcome the anxieties with the common distrust in meta narratives.

Moreover, in their widely acknowledged analysis of foodie culture, Johnston and Bauman argues that, the foodie culture does not only require handcraft knowledge but also being "educated" enough to be able to appreciate geographic specificity, tradition & historicism, geographic specificity, the importance of natural, local and rural productions over commercial, as well as valorising personal connections and simplicity to fulfil the necessities of authentic self (Johnston and Baumann 2010). Either with the valorisation of "less is more" motto of minimalism in everyday life especially regarding social and environmental problems or passionately made "back to past" parties or favouring handcraft goods rather than industrialized ones (unless it is not a particular limited edition for 80s of a famous brand) shows the plurality of the discourses under this nostalgic trend disguised itself under or became more powerful with the concept of "authenticity". As Binkley (2008: 599) observes:

Consumers today asked to look beyond consumer capitalism's drab seriality and moral vacuity, to seek deeper meanings to wider life problems in a range of niche-marketed products bearing the stamp of rebellion, authenticity, simplicity, economic justice and ecological responsibility a development that has led researchers from varied backgrounds to speculate about the political and ethical possibilities afforded by a changing culture of consumption (Atkinson 2003; Harrison et al. 2005).

The niche-marketed products with multiple stamps of discourses provided "deeper meanings" to consumers who have been searching for uniqueness in formerly identified as uniformed set of practices of consumption with application of narrative approach. Using the "freedom" of personal choices under "liberal alternative consumption", foodies have started to show their authentic choices with their subjective stories. Via the use of story-telling constructed within autobiographical experiences of food production and consumption, the moral values have been out forward that set "ethical" and "un-ethical" apart. Paxson argues

that the “economies of sentiment” constituted with these narrations, make certain values more valuable to overcome the uncertainties raised by “the erosion of values with” individualism and constructs a value based normativity on food choices as well (2006: 214). In a similar fashion. Boltanski and Esquerre calls it as “enrichment economy’ where a symbolic value of an “already there” commodity is enriched through the stories that gives a historical depth to it, but at the same time it is luxurised, in a sense enriched (Angeletti 2017: 393-93). Consequently, the use of authenticity as a rhetoric which essentially posits itself against to the luxuries and artificialities that modern societies appreciate (Meyer 2000: 43) received a lot of attention by becoming a hip-consumerism in the sense of fetishization of de-fetishized commodities (Frank 1997) also defined as a new tool of refining tastes.

Since “authenticity” shows itself as one of the main motivations of the sourdough bread consumption as well as the other subject trends of craft or alternative consumption, it is significant to mention that the claim of authenticity goes beyond the trajectory of individual with the requirements of social responsibility. As Wang argues (1999: 364 cited in Rickly 2013: 682) that an “authentic self” consists of both emotion, sensations, pleasure, spontaneity and reason, self-regulation and control. The authentic self should act in both intrapersonal and interpersonal levels, while the former underlines the importance of creating a self-identity the latter necessitates the keep the societal ties. This is the reason that even though individual and social have been regarded as opposite poles, the co-existence of them in the rise of virtues and values under the concept of authenticity that demands individual and institutions mastering and favouring both sides should not be overlooked. Given these points, I will continue focusing on the literature focusing on the “social” level of the issue in order to connect the existing literature.

### **2.2.2 Slow Food and the rhetoric of “right way of living”**

“Slow Food is the alternative, the avant-garde’s riposte. Real culture is here to be found. First of all, we can begin by cultivating taste, rather than impoverishing it, by stimulating progress, by encouraging international exchange programs, by endorsing worthwhile projects, by advocating historical food culture and by defending old-fashioned food traditions” (Slow Food Manifesto 1989).

Their rhetoric resonates the grand narratives of early 20<sup>th</sup> century against mass mechanical production since “real” is used as a nostalgic reference point as it was mentioned earlier. Accordingly, Slow Food advocates slowness against the fast life, quality rather than the quantification, diversity of tastes against standardization and total human involvement and re-embedding consumers to the “real” world, nature/rural as opposed to the non-human technologies of industrial modernity<sup>7</sup>. Slow Food’s one of the main aims is the transformation of consumers into “co-producers” as it can be observed in the trend of foodies and their involvement in food production (MacDonald 2013: 93). Promoting the call for a need to “raise awareness”, being “aware of the realities” and to “protect to right to pleasure and conviviality”, the movement has several projects of education<sup>8</sup>. As much as they encourage local production and aim to preserve the local culture, they are also highly concerned to preserve the quality of the environment which in a way manifested itself when they went against the usage of GMO and the movement gains international popularity<sup>9</sup> and support.

The value making process can be easily seen in the definition of “right” food of Slow Food Movement in their acts towards the promotion of food what they call as “Good, Clean and Fair Food” (Slow Food 2019). They locate the industrialized standardized fast-food as a result of the globalization and as one of the main problem of modern society<sup>10</sup>. Accordingly, as a solution, they call for action to demand “good” food that is quality on the account of its particularity to a region, “clean” food which is environment-friendly and sustainable, and “fair” food that represents the social aspect with the idea of supporting social justice and fair

---

<sup>7</sup> As the movement’s birth as an opposition to McDonald’s<sup>7</sup> suggests, it is without any doubt standing oppose to the four principles of the modern rationalization, McDonaldization of food systems: efficiency, calculability, predictability and control (Ritzer 1993: 99).

<sup>8</sup> Such as “The Ark of Taste” which aims supporting local grocers against the standardization for the sake of fine food protect animal breeds, and plant based foods, advertise taste education, “Terra Madre Day” which is a worldwide celebration of local foods, and “University of Gastronomic Sciences” that works on the education of farming methods, biodiversity, gastronomy and sustainability as a community based program (Paul 2014: 139).

<sup>9</sup> Slow Food Movement now has approximately 1500 convivium in 130 countries including Istanbul branch under the name of *Fikir Sahibi Damaklar*, has more than 100.000 members globally and in contact with more than 160 countries became an international movement (Slow Food 2015).

<sup>10</sup> Born and nurtured under the sign of industrialization, this century first invented the machine and then modelled its lifestyle after it. Speed became our shackles. We fell prey to the same virus: the fast life’ that fractures our customs and assails us even in our own homes, forcing us to ingest “fast- food” (Slow Food Manifesto 1989).

wages (Schneider 2008: 390). Thereupon, they defend their “right to a better environment”, “right to call for claiming the “right to material pleasure and conviviality” (Slow Food 2019), more than they ask for food sovereignty. With the collapse of trust in nation-states and big narratives and the rise of rationalization and the institutionalization of human rights in the post-war era, claiming rights for environmental and cultural existence gained significance in individual and organizational rhetoric and has started being seen as an indicator of thoughtful, right and morally superior act. While the reflections of these claims can be observed in many levels of everyday life in artisan sourdough bread case, the emphasis on individual in terms of education, artisan skills, body surveillance and health and positing sourdough bread as a subject platform for one’s demonstration of socially responsible, “more-than-human” (Beacham 2018) acts on environmental issues and heritage protection cannot be easily overlooked. Both in individual and corporate level, these certain discourses appear as the “must-have” virtuous ingredients of the bread-talk that locate it as the right choice.

However, in terms of valorising local products and promoting certain production techniques, Slow Food Movement received criticism for creating a niche movement by exoticising the main staples of local diets (Leitch 2003 448), “deepening the dinner divide between those who can afford to search for locally grown produce and those who are forced to buy whatever is cheapest on the way home from two jobs in an area without a produce market of any kind” (Miller, 2010 cited in Bender 2012: 17; Pollan 2006) and even paradoxically threatening the local agrobiodiversity by supporting the purity of the heritage variety (Lotti 2010: 71).

While elitism has become the main reason of the criticisms of Slow Food, Petrini, the founder of the movement, suggests ending “the demagogy of price” by valuing artisanal quality foodstuffs (Pietrykowski 2004: 315) and others support him with the reasoning that suggests the low cost of supermarket producing often conceals other costs that globally affect environment, individual health risks, unfair labour as well as exploitation of cultural and traditional values (Schneider 2008: 387). In this regard, Sassatelli (182) asserts that the “goodness” of a food always consists of several discourses implemented in it to justify the morality of the choice and the fairness of the price regarding its value. It should be both good



for one's own but also for common values and the choices that make the self should oversee the more "valuable values" of the community.

Moreover, against to the criticism on the global expansion of the movement that starts as an anti-globalisation act, Petrini suggests the concept of "virtuous globalization" as a balanced option for the binaries of "global" and "local", and "fast" and slow (Honore 2004: 17). While these are the contradictions that make the study of alternative food networks and the trend of craft and ethical consumption so attractive for the scholars, acknowledging the fact that conflicts are important to study further on the issue of legitimising powers and justification of worth and order, rather than extending the criticism against the movement, I would like to focus on how this conflictual structure of the rhetoric of "virtuous globalization" actually led to the global expansion of the trend in both artisanal and mass production levels.

### **2.2.3 Virtuous globalization and world culture**

While setting anti-consumerist moralities, as Carolan discusses (2016: 306), the concept of "virtuous globalization" actually rises the demand for value-added local products on the global market. On one hand, this can be explained by Hartley's commentary on the ethical consumption as follows:

These new social movements were routinely ignored by mainstream politics and persecuted or prosecuted. They found expression exclusively in the private sphere of identity and self-formation, and they were popularized almost exclusively by commercial means. But they began to exert immense pressure on government and industry alike because these were the concerns of the economically decisive baby-boomer generation (2005, 109).

While this can be seen as a victory for the movement, on the other hand, the use of authenticity, nostalgia, right to pleasure or experiencing different cultures through tasting local products that essentially posit itself against to the luxuries and artificialities that modern societies appreciate (Meyer 2000: 43), Binkley suggests that (2008: 602) it was absorbed as a valuable niche-market by the global industry by achieving "a hyper-mediation of ordinary consumption

through the use of verbose discourses of specialization and expertise which accelerate and intensify regular forms of consumption, radicalizing the logic of the very same process of commodification they ostensibly aim to reverse (Baudrillard 1998, Lash & Urry 1994)”.

Consumer culture and “excessive commoditization” have been identified as opposed to the authentic culture or in Kopytoff’s words (1986) “anti-cultural” and the critics against this consequently moralized it as Miller (2001 26) suggests. On the one hand the individuals, who seek authenticity through solely consumption in a culturally capitalistic manner have been regarded as “hyper-individualists”, the collectives, on the other hand, that have structured definitions of a “good way of living” and operate in binaries have been defined as “culture-essentialists” (Reckwitz 2017). However, while these definitions seem antagonistic, Reckwitz suggests that they both work under the same logic of “culturalization”, “singularization” and “valorization” of subjects which explains the complex structure of world cultural trends that can be seen as a reflection of the zeitgeist of today’s socialities.

Under these circumstances, foodies, who have been seen as the seekers of authentic food experiences become cultural producers in “global culture industries” (Lash and Lury 2007) by embracing their identities as reflexive individuals of informational capitalism embracing world cultural trends that values particularities and uniqueness, transcending the limits of space through building online communities and demanding for the varieties of singularities in the global market. Lash and Lury’s concept of “global culture industry” in which commodities are supplanted by brands, and consequently experience value of brand that also takes power from its cultural value, becomes more

significant than the exchange values of commodities. Culture, which was previously a question of representation, becomes “thingified” and appeared as a “living organism”, therefore, now it operates as an assistive element for “organism like” brands as Lash and Lury states, and make them “grow”. This, I believe, is a good metaphor for the promise of unique experience of “living” nature of the sourdough and the way it became a brand itself by using the contemporary discourses and transnational cultural flows. This is how the promotion of both “moral authentic culture” and “right to material pleasure and conviviality” find themselves their unique place in the world trend of food subjects, hence, can be seen as the result of the legitimising power of culture through its expediency (Yudice 2003) via the uses of culture by transnational events and institutional organisations in multiple levels of everyday life, including bread-talks. Bauman’s view on consumer market is an important analysis of this two sidedness of the situation (Bauman 1988: 62 cited in Binley 2008: 609):

[consumption] offers the individual the right to a ‘thoroughly individual’ choice; yet it also supplies social approval for such choice, thereby exorcizing that ghost of insecurity which ... poisons the joy of the sovereign will. In a paradoxical way, the consumer market meets the bill of that ‘fantasy community’ where freedom and certainty, independence and togetherness live alongside each other without conflict. People are thus pulled to the market by a double bind: they depend on it for their individual freedom; and they depend on it for enjoying their freedom without paying the price of insecurity.

In this sense, the search for experiences based on singularities and formation of authentic and unique identities through the preference of artisan sourdough bread, cannot be analysed only at an individual level focusing on consumption practices while it found itself a place in both organizational level as a social phenomenon and in the market place as a trendy option. Social movements

including Slow Food, collective local groups or larger non-governmental organizations such as UN using human rights as the core value (Fliegstein 2008) or in the same manner UNESCO valorising education and cultural singularities (Eriksen 2001; Nielsen 2011) legitimise specific values in their rhetoric on an institutional level as “public institutions of singularization” (Kopytoff 1986: 24) and in sourdough bread case, I argue that the use of specific institutional discourses, individualism, environmentalism and heritage, act as justifications of increasing the social and economic value of it by creating narratives and inspiration to evoke sentiments as being some of the current valued virtues (Boltanski and Thévenot 2006).

### **2.3 World Culture And Institutionalized Discourses**

Given all these points, I argue that the trend of sourdough culture should be evaluated as a world cultural trend with its multi-dimensional discourses that provide the legitimising power of its increased market value and the enactment of the practices and virtues that comes as its additional ingredients to explain the common rhetoric of artisan and mass producers.

“World culture” theory suggests (Boli and Thomas 1997: 172) that mass schooling, alternative movements, sport events, practices and discourses of NGOs, human rights, sustainability and other international encounters create a new culture that is beyond the understanding of separate national forces or transnational corporations but “the institutional character of transnational development” as the central power. “It is the culture of a decentralized “world polity”, in which many states are legitimate players but none controls the rules of the game” says Lechner and Boli (2008: 44) in their theorization of “world culture” where they analyse the chains of global circulation of culture, information, meta and human. “It contains rules and assumptions, often unstated and taken for granted, that are built into global institutions and practices”, therefore, actors, either in individual or organizational level, are motivated by cultural and institutional frames. World culture, in this sense, is

operated by the world polity which is a set of fundamental principles and models defining the nature and purposes of social actors and action (172).

A new state of morality in individual emerges as a result of these circulations through supranational regulatory institutions, multinational companies and brands that came as global actors. Global institutions act in a universal script that is not always fixed but for now operated with “the concept of human rights” and through some other pinch-points necessary such as environmental, heritage and economic issues to control sustainable development and creates its rules and ethics. These “common moral grounds” provide a “symbolic reference system that enables more and more people to participate in a joint dance” (35) and even though “particularism” is one of the most important rhetoric of the institutions, with the expansion of globalism (Robertson 1992; Lechner and Boli 2000) we see the diffusion of virtue of appreciating particularities as a world cultural trend, though subject to local interpretations of it. Through world culture, we see a rise in both individualism and collective identities as well as the production of legitimation of singularities and homogenization in a dualistic process (Boli 2005). This is why, I believe, the ubiquitous trend of sourdough can be best explained within the conceptualisation of world culture. In order to reveal the enactive discourses of artisan sourdough bread narratives, I continue with the case study on analysis of rhetoric of prominent artisan bakeries, individual bakers and mass production brands in Turkey.

### **3. SOURDOUGH DISCOURSES: A CASE STUDY IN TURKEY**

In this chapter, I attempt to demonstrate the discourses of artisan sourdough bread by giving an analysis of the rhetoric of popular artisan bakers in individual, boutique bakery and mass production levels to reveal the commonalities and differences. As I have demonstrated earlier, I have classified certain rhetoric under three main discourses which are individualism, environmentalism and heritage. The bakeries selected here are the ones labelled as the most popular artisan bread bakers as mentioned before and the rhetoric are taken from their websites and social media narratives.

#### **3.1 Individualism**

“Everything started the day I bought the book of Eric Kayser called “Larousse du Pain” in France. It would not be wrong to say that since that day I live and breathe bread” (Pelin’in Ekmegi), this is the beginning of the story of one of the artisan bakers, Pelin’in Ekmegi (Pelin’s Bread). As mentioned before, the life-projects which “can be defined as a more or less integrated set of practices which an individual embrace...because they give material form to a particular narrative of self-identity” became an ultimate solution to handle the risks and uncertainties raised with the dissolution of pre-defined narratives (Giddens 1991: 81). Now it is time to reveal particular narratives for the individual as we can see from the stories of artisan bakers. I will take the narratives in its literal sense in order to start with, because for me “everything started the day” I realized that the most of the bread producers I analyse here are giving an enormous space for the origin stories of their interest in bread in their branding, within similar forms as in the beginning of this sentence. Creating a narrative and a backstory is nothing new for branding of companies, however; the similarities and differences in their branding stories will shape the future of this thesis.

The majority of the artisan popular bakeries that I have analysed, have their own stories to show how they started their journey. Many of them have particular pages labelled as “our story”, “our journey” or “story of our bread”. While the founder of Grandma, unsurprisingly started her story by the stories her grandmother was telling her about bread baking, two

founders of 240 Derece underline the fact that they are childhood friends. Fikir Sahibi Damaklar and Fırınımdan Ekmekler locate their children at the centre of their motivation for the quest of searching for healthy and good bread by learning it by themselves, similarly founders of Eppek and Alishiro states that they started their journey of sharing the bread they were baking for themselves. For Sour and Sweet and Pelin'in Ekmegi, it was a quest of finding the roots of the real food, either sourced by respect or curiosity. The different focus points in their starting points are going to constitute the discourses I am going to discuss, nevertheless they all have same approach of building a narration of how their “passion” for bread grow out and a personal responsibility to share this with others.

### **3.1.1 Narratives of bread**

“... sourdough culture that we vigorously tend to like a beloved pet, religiously adding filtered water and organic flour to sustain its bubbly natural yeasts” (Johnston and Baumann 2010: 1).

As Johnston and Baumann poetically define, sourdough culture became the new representative of showing passion in this sense, literally the living sign of the latest motto of “sharing is caring” and an argumentative tool to show how fragile and smelly the “real” nature is as opposed to the packaged breads that have a very long shelf life and not a distinct taste. The sourdough practices seem like creating a platform to evoke affective and sensual feelings, in particular happiness where can be observed through its manifestations under several hashtags on social media. This romantic, poetic attitude is exactly how new bread lovers stand against the currently standardized lives they have after the perfect lives left behind. The need to have a poetic but also consistent narrative is one of the main motivations of today by emphasizing singularities, unique tastes, experience places, events, stories, communities and identities to get rid of the leftovers of industrial modernity.

“In the homogenized world of commodities, an eventful biography of a thing becomes the story of the various singularizations of it, of classifications and reclassifications in an uncertain world of categories whose importance shifts with every minor change in context” (Kopytoff 1986: 32).

Now it's possible to overhear people commonly saying "it tastes special when you bake your own bread" just like Emine Şahin when she comes up with the concept of "bread therapy", where she argues that "the process of bread preparation, kneading and shaping the dough make people feel relaxed, and it makes them much happier to smell, eat and share the homemade bread with their loved ones". Jameson calls it "intensities" that is "a whole new type of emotional ground" appeared as a result of affectlessness of the postmodernism (1991: 6-10).

Accordingly, artisan bakers also firstly try to create an engagement with their stories through emotions. Grandma's curiosity towards bread, as stated, turns into passion and an eventual happiness coming from the breads they produce. Alishiro also says that it was his inner compass that directed him to Bozcaada where he has been strengthening soul as well as his sourdough to bake his breads. While Mitte Brot aims producing natural and quality baked goods that excite and feed their passion and to share the happiness as an end product, we also learn that Sour and Sweet's emphasis on "sour" comes from their love towards bread. The bread producers, who also posit themselves as consumers of their own bread, see their profession as a way to share their happiness coming from consuming quality and tasteful breads. It can be particularly observed through individual bread bakers Alishiro and Fırınımdan Ekmekler who state that they first bake themselves and then share it with the others. "In a world where everything is standardized, we believe in the value of returning to real tastes, producing and tasting calmly, and we want to share this passion" says Nino and adds that they want to change the meaning of bread from aiming being full to discover and to enjoy it by serving breads that stimulates the five senses and make their customer smile. Sentimentalities and rationalization have been considered as the opposite poles, just like lasting binary of culture and nature or rural and urban; however, their affective state actually shows that there might be something in-between, at least this is how it is manifested in the narratives. As Eppek explains their motivation in artisan bakery to attempt the reconnect rural and urban sceneries while being located in the city but creating a living space where they can feel with the soil, seed, yeast and self.



### 3.1.2 Individual matters

These bakers try to have an affective, natural, sensual and rural experience within the urban scenery and as Mitte Brot defines their philosophy as “based on making professional life as pleasant and productive as possible” to create and opportunity of turning what one’s passion into profession through their efforts as productive leisure as de Solier (2013) also argues. 240 Derece’s story starts with a particular emphasis on this issue. They state that they learned different cultures while travelling to many countries and cities during their studies and business trips and discovered and analysed the bread varieties of these cultures and with the aim of serving tastier and healthier bread, they had artisanal bread training in France, Turkey and Spain. Similarly, her passion lead Pelin’in Ekmeği to find the perfect recipes and flour types to travel San Francisco, France, Italy, Germany. In a similar fashion, a baker called Dilmaç who travelled around Turkey and in 5 countries to find the best sourdough bread was the main subject of a newspaper article by adding a value of “cultural capital” (Bourdieu 1984) to the bread he bakes in a small bread bakery in Bursa.<sup>11</sup> In this sense, while having (Meyer 2010: 9) a higher education increased the legitimisation power of agentic actors, the return to somatic labour after years of academic education or while collar professional background added another layer of value of knowledge and “giving away” years of investment as it can be seen in the biographical texts of artisan bakers that overemphasize the non-bakery backgrounds. Featherstone (1991: 86), in this regard, defines contemporary consumption as a project of self-creation and calls the new consumers as ‘heroes’:

Rather than unreflexively adopting a lifestyle, through tradition or habit, the new heroes of consumer culture make lifestyle a life project and display their individuality and sense of style in the particularity of the assemblage of goods, clothes, practices, experience, appearance and bodily dispositions they design together into a lifestyle ...consumer culture publicity suggests that we all have room for self-improvement and self-expression whatever our age or class origins.

Being emancipated by the imposing effects of former social and cultural tradition, “self-consciousness and personal choice have become built-in expectations within various societal

---

<sup>11</sup>A news article about this case can be accessed from here: <https://www.aa.com.tr/tr/yasam/eksi-mayali-ekmek-uretmek-icin-seyyah-oldu/456468>

domains in individual” (Cortois and Laermans 2017: 61). The creation of the stories of bakers can be also seen as the romantic subjectivisation pattern of self-development, which Reckwitz refers Simmel’s (1903) individual who tries achieving uniqueness by his specialization on a subject. As Reckwitz asserts (2017), in order to amplify the affective experience and as an attempt for self-expression, individuals have become involved in creative and authentic consumption alternative or as becoming co-producers to create entrepreneur self-identities. Furthermore, Campbell (2005) affirms that the rise of craft consumption is a manifestation of crafted skills, knowledge either self-taught or undergoing necessary trainings and most importantly passion that has the potential to become “something” as Alishiro happily states that his passion for bread as a hobby for 20 years of professional life became his new profession. They also put a high value on experimenting to achieve the best result in a similar fashion with the emphasis on self-development. To put it another way, Campbell asserts that “seen in this light, the arena of craft consumption could become highly valued because it is regarded as an oasis of personal self-expression and authenticity in what is an ever-widening “desert” of commodification and marketization” (2005: 37). In this sense Fuchs (2015: 117) asserts that “leisure time is turned into labour time... more disposable time means more time for consumption, creativity and leisure... consumption time becomes production time” to highlight the importance of “digital labour” as a way of contributing to “information economy” by becoming “prosumers”.

Not only in the rhetoric of bakers but also a quick look on social media where I also have found myself following many sourdough bread makers and watching their videos people kneading sticky doughs, knocking on freshly baked bread, cutting in in half and showing off with how it looks, for hours even though at first I had no idea what that meant. However, these activities create a place for consumers, who with these types of leisure-time activities redefine themselves as “rebels”, “to symbolically resolve the contradiction between their role as consumers and their role as producers” (Frank 1997: 55) and to create a “meaningful” identity within the material world. In this regard, this shift towards artisanal consumption and production can also be seen as a result of rise of the concept of foodies (Johnston and Baumann 2010) which is identified as a specific group of amateurs with love of food and

interest to learn different aspects of it. Even though foodies are not professionals, they perform productive-leisure which can be seen as a self-investment especially when it results of changing professions from abstract nature of white-collar jobs where one can barely witness the end product of her labour. Therefore, it is significant how bakers underline their bread making particularly as artisan, where they can finally create “meaningful” and “aesthetically” significant breads meticulously with their bare hands. This can be easily observed in the participation rise in special courses like *MSA* (Academy of Culinary Arts) or a more democratized version of it as self-development places like *ISMEK* (Istanbul Lifelong Learning Centre) where I had actually the best sourdough bread I have ever eaten, in their brand-new centre special for baked goods that one can follow a program of a long-term training to earn certification. Regarding the productive leisure-wise approach, similarly, it is undeniable how much followers and engagements bread makers of Instagram, especially *Mutfakkitap* with 226K, receive.

A significant emphasis in this regard that most of the bread makers especially underline is on the particularity of their breads. Unique recipes and dough folding techniques, or sourdoughs that they have been keeping alive for years and years, these are all assumedly make their bread special and tastier. In a similar fashion, the individual baker of *Fırınımdan Ekmekler*, *Demirtaş* have been branded by the media as “sculptor of his bread” (Anadolu Agency 2017) due to his background in fine arts and added another layer of “creativity” and “artisanry” to his bread. In other words, by stating that all the bread they serve are handmade and there is no industrial product intervening the process, they situate themselves as opposed to industrialization. In an era where the fastest and the most practical is desired, as Nino states, they valorise breads that carries the virtues of slowness, care and labour. 32 hours, 44 hours or 3 days, these are some of the given times to make the real bread that requires long kneading, cold fermentation and most importantly as most of them state patience. Consequently, as they argue, it makes their bread tastier than industrial ones. *Alishiro*, the most idiosyncratically has become famous by making his customers up to two months to receive the bread they ordered. As in one of his interviews, it is mentioned that “after this

long wait, people immediately hug their breads and take a photo to share on social media, because he does not only deliver bread, but happiness” (Aksüs, 2014).

This particularly resonates the “right to pleasure” motivation lies under Slow Food Movement where they stand against to abstractness and fastness of modernity and in a way “de-fetishize of commodified time” (Binkley 2008: 613). In addition, it manifests the idea of having a control over time, in a world mostly defined as fast. The narratives of bakeries so far, I have analysed brought us the discussion of individual’s work on self by having control on life either through productive-leisure or patience. Therefore, I move on with a topic that needs to be discussed with a special significance.

### **3.1.3 Healthy bread**

Increase in the variety of the options with a great scale of price range in the market has been regarded as a result of the rise of individual in relation to its right to choose, among all the other rights prescribed. The individual has been seen as the basic unit of social structures for a while already who has been defined with great autonomy to choose, without any socio-cultural with lessened relations with institutions, and even economic restraints with the adaptations of luxury items with affordable prices. However, this autonomous state of individual also created a need to shoulder responsibility of one’s actions, a need to implement a self-care regime. Therefore, while cherishing its autonomous state, rights and power to choose, individual is also expected to develop its abilities to overcome the consequences of health problems or unemployment which have been seen as its own responsibilities (Cortois and Laermans 2017: 62). In the food discourse, particularly, this emphasis played an important role in the transition to what is defined as the “real” food. The industrialization and mass production of food increased the use of artificial substances to ensure the shelf life of products longer as well as to differentiate the foods via synthetic colour and flavour additives. Industrial foods have been consumed by masses over decades became ‘unreal’ in a sense of ‘unhealthy’.

A well known dietitian in Turkey, Osman Müftüoğlu (2016), calls people to eat real food that is free of additives and full of nutrition by pointing their benefits regarding variety of diseases such as embolism, memory deficits, diabetes, obesity, cancer and more. While these artificial foods and the diseases they carried have been argued as results of profitable solutions of market to alter the ‘essence’ of foods, real food, which has been primarily referred as ‘natural’ food, preserving all the nutrients and vitamins have been seen as the ‘new’ solution. As a result of the given information particularly coming from a scientific authority in a sense, already accepted as active, sovereign and free, consumer assumedly has the right to choose whether to eat real food or unhealthy and artificial ones after a constant re-evaluation of discourses what is good for one’s own or not. This burden of necessity to know the content of the food we consume has resulted into self-interested subjects to create another segment of consumption after the artisanal techniques, consumption of nutritional knowledge that we can witness through social media. Self-identity formed through the perception of body is not only based on the beauty standards but also one’s work on one’s self, either through fitness or in our case, consumption of the “right” foods as a way of surveillance of the body (Lupton 1996: 91). Responsible of its own body, individuals seeking for getting the ‘true’ information, experimenting with results and sharing their experiences with others. While bread was in the first place of ‘avoid’ lists of dietitians for a long time in Turkey, after the rise in the visibility of superfoods and the new trend of fermentation, thanks to the sourdough, bread has been rising like a phoenix in the ‘healthy’ diets.

Pelin’in Ekmeği starts by saying that the sourdough bread has countless nutritional and health benefits that come from its naturalness. She asserts that the wide variety of bacteria and fungi inside the bread do not only increase the flavour but also help us digest easily; the low glycaemic index of sourdough bread satiates us and keep the blood sugar level low; has a high level of B12 vitamins that helps with memory deficiencies; and not lead to any allergies. Mitte Brot, in a similar manner but even with a more scientific choice of words explains how the sourdough bread is healthier than the industrial one due to the chemical reactions occurring the sourdough process helps with the problems of swelling in order to provide a relief for the consumer with intolerances. Both Mitte Brot and Epepek argue that the increase

in gluten intolerance might be the result of industrial breads and sourdough bread with a long fermentation process might not result to allergies.

This is particularly interesting considering the fact that the reason behind UNO and industrial packaged “wonder” breads to be famous was not their price - since they are still more expensive than *francala* - but UNO’s campaign of “hands off my bread” in 1999. From the point where bread was untouched for years and mass producers invited cameras to show the “healthy” bread making process, we jumped to the point where the more touched the bread was, the more bacteria it has, the healthier it is. Meanwhile, unsurprisingly the mass producers have been also added newly defined “healthier” options after the decrease in demand for white, unhealthy bread. For instance, IHE (Istanbul Halk Ekmek) also produces ‘organic whole-grain’ bread which is statedly includes sourdough that makes it a functional food by giving similar scientific explanations and with a longer fermentation process than they used to. Within the light of these rhetorics, one, no matter how hungry for knowledge they are, can only be 100% sure about what decision to make after either an actual observation or a chemical investigation. The uncertainty we experience by the lack of knowledge about the food we consume, regarding the possible additives inside, the production methods, chemicals involved and so on, affects the identity of the consumer (Fischler 1988: 280 cited in Pietrykowski 2004: 310). “Physical and emotional health, radically aestheticized experiences of daily life and deeper expressions of self-identity enacted through alternative life projects” says Binkley (2008: 601). The uncertainty raised by the circulation of several conflicting discourses, according to Binkley (606) became the basis of self-projects and their narrations, however, does it make individuals authentic as they desire to be? The answer for me is that processing the circulation of information, knowing the ingredients of the food consumed does not only make autonomous individual responsible of its own body, but also makes it responsible for others.

### 3.1.4 Responsible self

The rise in individualism, as a concept of having a total control to be able to make choices on one's own life and to maintain its autonomous state through defined rights always remind me of the statement of "with great power comes great responsibility" (Raimi 2002). This famous phrase comes from a popular culture example where Spiderman's revealed super powers are immediately associated with the necessary responsibilities attached to it. It might seem unrelated with the topic of artisan bread consumption, however, contrastingly the rise of sourdough bread as a superfood with the emphasis on it being the healthiest option and at the same time labelling itself as the real, the natural and right choice to consume initially reminds us our responsibilities as individuals to be able to choose what is right by following necessary hidden guidelines that have carried through institutional discourses (Beck and Beck-Gernsheim 2002: 11). In this regard, institutionalized individualism requires being independent from pre-modern bonds but also requires responsibility for us, as well as for our children as in the example below.

Mothers!... our right to feed our kids with the foods we had in our childhood is taken away from us... we are gonna witness more autism in newborns...the possibility for us to see our grandchildren is gonna be lower than our mothers had...Read the label of every product you buy. Question all the ingredients. Avoid industrial, ready-made, packaged foods. Prefer organic goods... even though these products seem more expensive to you... don't forget that not consuming real food is much more expensive (Fikir Sahibi Damaklar 2009).

Fikir Sahibi Damaklar especially played an active role against the legislation passed in 2009 that allows GM foods in the market and let making the decision to consume it actively to the customer by publishing a manifesto about their GM food fasting. The first paragraph of the manifesto shows that the audience of interest is the mothers who are assumedly responsible for the well-being of their children. In the following sentences, they call mothers to educate their children to learn what is good to eat in order them to be able to protect themselves as well. However, more significantly, the power regarding having "necessary" education arise in the following statement:

And remember: today's world is profit oriented! Believe in the purchasing power of the money you earn till its last cents. Invest it in real food. Imagine that all the artificial products on the shelves will lose their profitability when you don't buy them. Imagine that all those jars, boxes,

and bottles that looks like a food will become a damage for their producers. And imagine, one day, if the multinational corporations realize, the consumer turns to the real food, who knows, maybe they re-evaluate their production. Real food sovereignty is a basic right of our children! My daughter is not an experimental subject! (Fikir Sahibi Damaklar 2009)

While food sovereignty it is widely discussed all over the world in terms of famine and poverty, right to have an access to real food also becomes a human right that comes with the power of the individual. While some see it as democratization of marketplace in a sense where you can vote for options when you buy, quality, price, sometimes boycott a certain brand because of their political standpoint, or just because you like advertisement, or you morally believe that there is no other but one option. In the manifesto of Fikir Sahibi Damaklar another significant point arises from the manifesto is the power of individual as a consumer who was previously seen as the cause of almost most of the world problems.

To have a variety of choices lead in this case to have more control over choice and refuse the variety in order to have the “right” choice. Being able to know more about the choice one makes also increases the feeling of control, but this requires being really integrated into the economic life, or being aware of the effect of one’s choices regarding its socio-economic, environmental and cultural ends. As a social and moral actor, individual consumer is more active and public now, rather than just solely reduced to a concept of renunciation, it is a contestation, discussion, re-evaluation of the choices in shelves. It is seen as an action, the all choices consumer makes, either enough or too small to make a difference. What Parsons calls (1962: 101 cited in Binkley 2008: 602) “instrumental activism” that is acting in moral means also stands out as a dominant virtue of individualism, however a domesticated version of it under normative discourses leads to what is described as “institutional individualism” operating with the rhetoric of “good life” for one’s own and “good society”. It valorises the power of the individual, encourages it to develop itself with individual creations and accomplishments, but at the same time those achievements need to be in serve for a good society in order to be valuable. This is the reason Slow Food’s emphasis on both individual who takes pleasure from life and at the same time should have enough conscience and passion to act accordingly can be seen as one of the main institutionalized discourses today.



### 3.2 Environmentalism

As mentioned earlier, concerns regarding environmentalism became one of the main motivations and simultaneously marketing strategies of alternative consumption. After the rise of environmental movements from 70s to 80s, the idea of destruction was connected to consumption (Sedlmaier 2014 233) and led to boycotts of multinational companies (249). As a result of the distrust against industrial production due to the attachment of health issues to it, the demand got higher and within the last five years, “organic”, “bio” products even started to have their own corner at the supermarkets. This has raised another basis of conflict for consumer where organic label was increasing the commercial value of a product, the choice again is only consumers’ to take since with the rise in lifestyles based on clean eating, with raw foods and açai bowls healthy living started to mean almost identical as organic living.

This is why it is almost impossible to separate the discourses of health and nature even though the latter does not lead to former unquestionably. On this issue, I would like to suggest taking what Ostberg (2003) points into consideration to draw attention of the institutionalized “nature” of scientific knowledge as well.

What is problematic is when the natural scientific knowledge of these substances is first transferred to food products and these products are treated as standing in some clear relationships to something called consumers true needs. Again, what we see is the dominating natural scientific discourse constructing a myth of these relationships as being natural (Barthes, 1973).

Even though the use of natural there is not directed towards food, considering the taken-for-granted causality bond between “healthy” and natural that became the new focus of the health gaze it is worth to underline. Having an organic diet at the same time became the tastier option to manifest the enjoyment of life of disciplined selves. Seasonal eating and enjoying the “real” flavours of foods, in this sense, became another way to embody the singular and authentic self-built on natural lifestyle in a time it is almost impossible to know the seasons of many food products since they can be found at the supermarket. This in a way created another dimension to learn more about food, enjoying the special tastes that one can only enjoy in the seasons by selecting the most organic option possible while others only can taste stable standardized taste of a “tomato” and also becoming healthier. Regarding the previously mentioned demand for additive-free, non-industrial and assumedly healthier products, all the

sourdough bakers also give a special place for their use of natural ingredients in their narratives.

Firstly, positioning themselves on the side of real bread as the natural bread, against the industrial one, all the bakers state that they do not use any additives in their bread, especially regarding the yeast. The sourdough as a superfood becomes a durable and healthier option against the industrial yeast that accelerates the process. With the capability of embracing the slowness of natural process I have mentioned earlier, they valorise the power of combination of natural ingredients such as organic flour, purified table water, rock salt and their all natural sourdough starters to create the ‘real’ bread. Freshness of their bread means also quality and honesty for them.

Using only organic ingredients is a very common rhetoric used in gourmetscapes, however a shift towards enjoying the tastes also started not only because of its particularly good flavor but also with a relieved conscience as Slow Food invites others. Their organic standpoint is not only for the sake of body, but also for a sustainable environment. *Eppek and Fırınımdan Ekmekler* in this regard come forward with their emphasis on the sustainability of the environment. *Eppek* first mentions that grains that later become the main ingredient for their bread, flour, should not be grown in a soil that contaminated with petroleum-based fertilizers and insecticides. As Slow Food’s advocacy on biodiversity and call for awareness suggest, one should take the consequences of profit-based grain production into consideration to preserve the quality of the seeds and soil for a more sustainable environment. The best way to do it, as *Fırınımdan Ekmekler* suggests, is to know the farmer, and even see the fields personally if possible. In an event called Future Farmers and Urban Bakers in 2017 and a workshop held by *Food Communities* (III. Gıda Toplulukları Çalıştayı) where I met Murat Demirtaş (the individual baker under the name of *Fırınımdan Ekmekler*) and the farmer Mustafa Alper Ülgen who is described as a trustworthy farmer who only use wheat ancestors in his field in Bayramiç Yeniköy. They emphasize the healthy, tasty and fair-trade, sustainable, environment friendly side of sourdough bread making. They made a point on the issue of profit-seeker methods of industrial farming that cares about the size of harvest. While wheat ancestors growing in a natural soil indeed can lead to a smaller harvest size due to bug

infestations or natural causes, the quality of the harvest and its sustainability matters more than its profit for them.

The environmentalist attitude is also visible in the distribution method of *Fırınımdan Ekmekler*. Since he does not have a bakery shop, nor he is willing to have one, he distributes his bread by either walking or only using public transportation not to individually contribute to the air pollution. Similarly, it can be seen that many of the bakers state that they also do not use industrial chemical-based cleaning products but vinegar as in good old days. Within the discourse of environment, one of the projections is the re-embedding the individuals, consumers, with the means of production however only in alternative consumption. On the other hand, IHE, started a campaign to act more environment-friendly and to compensate their use of plastic in wrapping, collaborated with a municipality in Istanbul and called citizens to recycle five kilograms of plastic in order to earn a bread which resulted with a recycling of nearly 40 tons of plastic.

The increasing attention in academic field regarding the discussions on Anthropocene also created a new rhetoric of man-made damage, in an anthropomorphic sense, to the earth mainly due to the rising climate change more than ever. Therefore, even though I do not have enough space to discuss it further, Slow Food's projects on biodiversity, *Fikir Sahibi Damaklar*'s emphasis in future generations and their right to have a safe environment, just as teenage environment activist Greta Thunberg drew attention to her rights and gained global attention and the shift in the interest in subject of academy go side to side. In this regard, I will go back to the preserving biodiversity by returning to use of wheat ancestors to move further the discussion of locality in a different but related discourse, heritage and culture.

### **3.3 Heritage**

“Bread is sacred! Stake a claim on your traditional bread!” (Fikir Sahibi Damaklar, 2009)

An increased attention to the singularity and in particular locality, which is visible now in the marketplaces as well with the ‘authentic’ products framed with rustic historical packaging

that shows particular characteristics of a local culture, place or a specific time frame and ingredients has been labelled with their particularity brought us to the last but not least discourse of artisan sourdough bread making trend. In this framework, it can be seen that the discourses of locality, heritage, culture, craft/artisan production and memory get entangled and served as a whole to manifest the importance of “real bread”.

To start with, artisan bakers as mentioned earlier in the previous chapter, talk about the significant quality change come from the type of a grain. Even though it was not commonly known before and still can be vague in terms of its meaning, breads using *Siyez wheat* (einkorn) are getting more attention lately. This is due to the fact that there seems to be another unknown causality made between particularity based on location and tradition and quality and trustworthiness. In a similar manner, Böder states that (2013: 118) declaring products or services as ‘traditional’ has become a common marketing strategy within all kind of today’s companies. Of course, also food manufactures make us of it, to create trust in their products within their consumers. Hereby, “traditional” can refer to the ingredients, the recipe as well as the manufacturing process of the goods. In order to transmit this message to the customers, companies use advertising slogans such as “made in grandmother’s kitchen” or the packaging of the product.

In this regard, as expectedly, many bakeries specify the quality of their products based on the particularity of the ingredients they use. *Siyez*, *Kavılca*, *Üveyik*, *Karakılçık*, *Kafkas Kızılı* or *Sarı Buğday* wheats differentiated with the geographies depending on the soil, weather and other environmental factors they were exposed of. Even though it is barely impossible to know the quality of the flour based on the geographies at an individual level, it became something to consider in the evaluation of the food quality. In this regard *Mitte Brod*, for instance, even specify the geographies for the other ingredients that they use in the process of bread making. The rise in the interest towards special wheat types also can be observed in mass production examples, for instance, in addition to the traditional emphasis and whole grain campaign on their brandings, *UNO* also serve a new product with *Siyez* wheat and another series they call “artisan” which appears as a paradoxical interpretation of the trend since the attribution stands for traditional techniques especially regarding “hand-made” while

UNO's motto is "handless" breads. However, their version of artisan sourdough bread demonstrates the significance of the discourse that can serve as a powerful marketing strategy and a necessity to showcase the virtuosity which even covers its conflictual existence.

The locality even became stronger for artisan bread makers after the oldest grain seeds were found in Göbeklitepe, that brought a more valuable label for the grains of Anatolian peninsula and shape the narratives of bakers to give the history of bread 'made in this geography for thousands of years'. Capatti from Slow Food regarding the value of gastronomic memories, states that it is "profoundly linked to the values of the past" (Bowen & De Master 2011: 74). The preservation of typical products, the protection of species from genetic manipulation, the cultivation of memory and taste education- these are all aspects of this passion of ours for time". Taking the emphasis of nostalgia stated earlier within the craft consumption literature, this resonates the idea of the artisan bread as a "symbolic return to the past" (Autio et al. 2013: 568) when it now reconstructed as a safer and better time as "when bread was bread and milk was milk" (569) and we knew where its origins were as opposed to the industrial production and its uncertainties. In a similar fashion, Vedat Milor, who is one of the most famous gourmets and food critics in Turkey argues that (2015) the white bread, which is defined as the egoist and liar son of a very precious father uses the name of his father, ancestor, real bread, without a shame. The increase in gastronomic travel within the quest on exotic that results with the (re)discovery of traditional and "honest" way of living and nostalgia to past with a refusal of co-existence of rural and urban scenes and traditional and industrial methods of production can be seen as a reason for the interest in learning traditional methods of production. However, while the emotion is directed towards the past and the traditional, feeding the affective side of the authentic self, the undeniable rationalized size also brings the mathematics to the field of sourdough where most of the bakeries talks about a formula based on degrees, meticulous adjustments of ingredients given in percentages and timings does not sound traditional when we think about the 'rural grandmothers' who do not go deep in calculations but bake their bread by rule of thumb, except maybe only Fırınımdan Ekmekler who has no standard sourness in his bread since it can be changed when the

fermentation process gets longer while he spends more time with his children as a part-time “house-husband” at home.

The re-emphasis on the cultural heritage is again not a unique case for artisan sourdough but a world cultural trend that appeared as a response to standardization and globalization. In this regard Bowen and De Master (2011: 74) made a commentary that shows how the process is industrialized rather than an organic revitalization case:

Although narratives that surround traditional or artisanal food products tell us that we are consuming “the product of a unique and traditional farming system, surviving in a sea of mass production,” Pratt (2007) reminds us that traditional or artisanal products “are not survivals as such, they are generated out of sustained commercial activity, state regulatory systems, and international trade agreements.” As such, the selection, protection, and institutionalization of these traditional and heritage-based products are enmeshed in particular bounded political, institutional and social settings.

### **3.4 Entangled Discourses of Sourdough as a World Cultural Trend**

I have attempted to demonstrate the narratives of artisan sourdough bread from several points of view to highlight the main discourses lay behind their rhetoric. In this sense, I would like to conclude the chapter by referring back to the concept of world culture.

Starting from the individualism discourse, which I emphasized more compared to the other discourses due to its wide range of sub discourses, a certain set of meanings and practices appear within the rhetoric of bread makers. Their common emphasis on using the freedom of choice, right to build an authentic self, self-development as a necessity for self-progress as well as social responsibility and the virtues of slowing down, enjoying the sentiments yet having a rational basis resonate the contemporary trends and discourses of celebration of particularity, education, mobility and later as we have seen in the other two discourses, right to have a better environment and heritage.

As I have argued earlier, I suggest that these contemporary normative discourses are carried through the internalization of world cultural trends and by gaining power from institutionalized individualism appeared as “authentic culture”. The world cultural trend of artisan sourdough bread, therefore, creates a common ground for people to enjoy their

individualistic freedom as well as celebrating their shared moralities in a sense of one global world. Even though we witness the rise of oppositional states of hyper-individualism and cultural essentialism (Reckwitz 2017), the world culture and its prominent actors of institutional organizations and market economy diffuse both dispositive, after an arrangement accordingly to specific orders of value, in a hybrid form. Therefore, the anxieties and ambivalence resulted from postmodernism are reduced due to the sense of an upper narrative and commonality, while individualistic discourse blockages the excessive moralism of collectives. This is why, even though the individual, boutique bakeries and mass producers are seemingly having in different values and methods, within the world cultural trend of sourdough bread, we can observe their co-existence in the middle between antagonism of elitism and democratization, nature and culture, individual and social, universal and particular and more.

## 4. CONCLUSIONS

In this thesis, I attempted to explain the ubiquitous phenomenon of artisan sourdough bread appeared as a popular trend in Turkey recently. I have suggested that the reason behind the trend can be explained better with a general approach of world culture, rather than focusing on individual level or social levels, by the help of the concept of “world culture”.

Accordingly, I have argued that the world cultural trend of artisan sourdough bread production and consumption shows itself as an authentic choice, however, under the authenticity, it can be seen that almost in the rhetoric of all levels of production, individual, small bakeries or mass producers, the stories lean on three main institutional discourses. These are individualism, environmentalism and heritage.

As I have tried to reveal throughout the thesis, the loaf of this ‘special’ rustic looking bread now even became a canvas, attracts its consumers with the experience of crusty texture and the distinct smell and taste comes from the sourdough which now considered as the ‘good mothers’ of “real” good breads. Something alive, full of microorganisms that you should care with “love”, sourdough and the hands that knead it with “love” became the most attractive feature of this new artisanal trend. The trend of artisanal goods seemingly offers an alternative to industrialized, standardized global food system with an anti-consumerist sentiment. Favouring hand-made goods and craftsmanship, artisanal consumption has been seen as an experience of authenticity and traditionalism with a sense of nostalgia but most importantly it creates the sense of closeness to the means of production through providing a connection between commodity and producer whether directly or through the narratives. The mechanically produced, untouched bread now is explicitly touched, kneaded for a long time in the hands of artisan baker to be more valuable.



These new niche-marketed products have a stamp of rebellion, simplicity, economic justice and ecological responsibility with the anti-consumerist sensibility as a necessary feature of everyday life-style choice that also has been seen as a great symbolic meaning for identity formation. The narratives of all bakers that I have looked at, highlight their negative views of the mass, industrialized production and even though they are involved in the market, alternative market, most of them ignore the economic end of their products by emphasizing their businesses are not profit-oriented. Criticism of the standardization of mass culture opened a way for novelty, diversity and therefore ‘creative’ interpretations of everyday life commodities to bring again what is lost, in a new commodity form. However, simultaneously, it has become a trendy consumer product and the narratives full of certain values seems adding also an economic value to their product. In this sense, the sentiment of anti-consumerism, de-fetishization of consumerism is, in a way fetishized with the same logical process of commodification that is been against to. However, it also became a valuable option in the market with mass production versions for the autonomous consumer with expanded choices and serves for the “democratization of pleasure” of the reflexive individual. “Real” bread, the long-lost traditional sourdough of whether San Francisco or Anatolia, and even regardless of the mean of production, became an indicator of a good, right and authentic life against to standardization because of the discourses it carries.

In the individualism discourses I have reviewed that the consumption, choice of food and particularly sourdough bread in this case, gives a material form to a particular narrative to self-identity of both consumers as myself and producers. Critically aware, seeking for quality, free in choice, possibility of having the “real bread” within the great range of choices in market, individual has some degree of freedom on controlling life. The new artisan bakers who have higher education level than the ‘ordinary bakers’, mostly had a previous professional career, bring the discussion of the importance of leisure-activities, productive-leisure in a way, with full of passion, love and care attached to the sourdough as if it is the only possible way to be in connection with negatively viewed consumer society. This is seen as rebellious and as countercultural to the standardized life, but also became an anti-advertising for the market and creates hip consumerism as Frank suggests. In narratives of

urban bakers, life-projects, which are on-going processes are now mostly valorised if only it includes a great productive effort in leisure time bring ‘tasty’ results. Even though some of them connects their passion retrospectively to their childhood, most of the bakers highlight that they had no background knowledge but got education in several different places, traditions and tried hard. Self-expertise and DIY narrative of urban bakers also show its reflections in the increasing interest towards workshops and through the high interactions with online videos and blogs. Considering the branding of bread as organic, local and traditional and made by artisan techniques and most importantly with passion puts a considerable amount of value to the sourdough bread. Maybe even most importantly, the bakers who are either retired from their profession, or members of Y generation who only had the bravery to quit the path of their parents after already earning a Master’s Degree, and their stories make their values even more valuable with their value-added products.

Another common emphasis was on patience and having a control on sense of time in fast cities. Complementing the coherent life narrative of sourdough lovers, in the paced industrialized world with the fast-food and McDonald’s as the symbol of it, slowing down, being patient, enjoying flavours and so on, become the individual’s another way of controlling life. Taking care of one’s self, body and health becomes an important responsibility and a source of anxiety at the same time. Now you have to know what is inside your food and where it comes from. Because it has also been argued that so-called artisan bread makers sometimes use additives, organic standards do not match as theirs always, traditional does not always mean additive-free, fresh might not mean fresh in their definition. Consequently, in addition to checking the ingredients, one should double check and ask the baker to be fully sure. Natural, homemade, authentic, nostalgic foods are somehow “naturally” seen as healthier, while artificial ones are unhealthy in a very strict binary. In most of the interviews, the healthy sides of sourdough bread as being more easily digestible, healthier in terms of blood sugar and insulin levels with low glycemic index and even suggested for weight loss compared to the industrial bread is highly valorised. But the most interesting part for me to find was that alongside with the all artisan bakeries highlighting

sourdough bread as healthy, industrial bread makers as Halk Ekmek and UNO also demonize white bread and suggests whole wheat and sourdough bread.

Moreover, as a requirement of virtues of the institutionalized authentic self, besides the individualistic rationality as a feature of reflexive project, there is also a collectivistic rationality behind it through the global calls for actions. Means that, individual is also responsible for personal choices that affect environment and culture, so education, gaining knowledge becomes double responsibility in terms of personal and global matters. In Giddens' words "no choice but to choose" reflects the dilemma of the moral consumption. Having the opportunity of living a good, honest, authentic and healthy life is seen and promoted as a "basic" human right even though this needs a much-detailed discussion in terms of its "real" potentiality, mainly because of the economic system. All in all, institutionalized individualism and individualization of rights also helped me lead the discussion towards other powerful discourses as environmental rights and cultural rights to understand artisan bread trend.

Within the environmentalist discourse, the word "organic" does not only indicate the health of the individual but also the responsibility of "community minded consumers" for the environment. Slow Food's one of the main aims is to point the global concerns to preserve the quality of the local environments. The "real bread", as I mentioned before, must be additive-free, eco-friendly and sustainable. The main concern of the discourses on wheat, especially in Anatolia, is that we lost the "great" bio-diversity of wheat kinds. Mass production comes with massive use of chemicals and mass waste, therefore, protection of local agricultural economies, biodiversity against industrial agriculture is the main discourse and sourdough breads, without chemicals but with a longer shelf life that also prevents daily waste of industrial bakers is seen as a powerful fighter for the ecological movements. The urban bakers' emphasis on natural, seasonal and organic ingredients, being against chemicals and specifying the local farmers as their flour sources show the importance of this responsibility. And this is the main point, the artisanal bakers and mass producers do not have the same sense of responsibility since mass producers argue that it is impossible for

them to use organic ingredients to produce bread in mass amounts, but on cultural responsibility they meet in the same line again.

Alongside with the artisanal production techniques, by making emphasis on geographic specificity urban bakers also opens a discussion of heritage discourse. We are already familiar with the notion of what is particular has a better taste, very specific kinds of wheat, whether used for bread or pasta, are seen as more valuable in the market also. Not just because it protects biodiversity but also because it carries the cultural meaning of that particular local area. Because local food has been considered as a tool for enhancing cultural heritage through protection and ensuring the sustainability of traditional tastes and the use of traditional production methods. Most of the urban bakers suggest the use of ancestral wheat of Anatolia with the use of old traditional techniques just as the in Slow Food's rhetoric of "Real bread requires the use of the ancient sourdough technique" (Fikir Sahibi Damaklar 2009). While Murat Demirtaş stated that he has no standard sourness in his bread since it can be changed when the fermentation process gets longer while he spends more time with his children and it does not matter for the consumers because it fits well to his "house-husband" narrative, he also identifies himself as a modern urban baker with his use of strict measurements unlike the Anatolian women who make bread by rule of thumb. But the other urban bakers using traditional methods also try to have a standardized taste of their own unless it can be proudly explained with the natural seasonal changes in wheat or water.

Finally, the rhetoric of standardized ontology of "real bread" as healthy, traditional, natural and eco-friendly complements the authenticity discourse of Johnston and Baumann (geographic specificity, personal connections, hand-craftedness, tradition and historicism, simplicity, natural, local and rural and anti-consumerism) that is already argued to define the characteristics and tendencies of the contemporary consumer society and foodies. However, as I argue, it is the negative sentiment for the industrial global food production system in terms of personal and global matters, but all in all, creators and reproducers of the discourses find their own way within the system by relying on the set of meanings and practices appeared as a constructed system. Therefore, the authenticity discourse and narrative approach only appear as tools of spreading the virtues of world cultural discourses of individualism,

environment and heritage. This disposition, therefore was better explained by the enactive principles created by world cultural virtues that is “central unit of action and value” guiding everyday life practices globally as I have underlined. The world culture and institutional discourses here explained are the main sources of today’s tendency to over valuing the sourdough culture. While it can be studied in detail with a multi-disciplinary fashion in future studies, I believe this thesis shed a light on the case in Turkey for a better understanding of the phenomenon’s institutionalized structure. Nonetheless, I would like to remind that this thesis only serves for a general understanding of the trend rather than justifying the current situation in any sense. There are conflicts and contradictions that need to be studied further to deconstruct the discourses in detail.

## REFERENCES

- Anadolu Agency. (2017) "Ekmeğinin Heykeltıraşı." Retrieval Date: July 2019.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wdP-aIVkEso>
- Aksüs, G. (2014) "Bu Ekmek İçin Beklenir." *Habertürk*. Retrieval Date: April 2019.  
<https://www.haberturk.com/saglik/haber/965760-bu-ekmek-icin-beklenir#>
- Ashley, B., Hollows, J., Taylor, B., and Jones, S. (2004) *Food and Cultural Studies*. London: Routledge.
- Autio, M. Collins, R. Wahlen S. and Anttila, M. (2013) "Consuming Nostalgia? The Appreciation of Authenticity" in Local Food Production. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 37(5): 564-568.
- Bauman, Z. (2001). *Consuming Life*. London: Sage.
- Beacham, J. (2018) "Organising Food Differently: Towards A More-than-human Ethics of Care for The Anthropocene" *Organization*, 25(4): 533–549.
- Beck, U. (1989) *Risk Society: Towards a New Modernity*. London: Sage.
- Beck, U. and Beck-Gernsheim, E. (2002) *Individualization: Institutionalized Individualism and Its Social and Political Consequences*. London: Sage.
- Belasco, W. (1999) "Why Food Matters" *Culture & Agriculture*, 21: 27-34.
- Bell, D. and Valentine, G. (1997) *Consuming Geographies*. London: Routledge.
- Bender, C. (2012) "Thinking Globally, Acting Locally, Discussing Online: The Slow Food Movement Quickens with New Media." *Thesis*. Georgia State University.
- Binkley, S. (2008) "Liquid Consumption." *Cultural Studies*, 22(5): 599-623.
- Bobrow-Strain, A. (2012) "White Bread Bio-politics: Purity, Health, and the Triumph of Industrial Baking." *Cultural Geographies*, 15(1): 19-40.
- Boli, J. and Thomas, G. M. (1999) *Constructing World Culture: International Organizations Since 1875*. Stanford: Stanford University.
- Boli, J. (2005) "Contemporary Developments in World Culture." *International Journal of Comparative Sociology*, 46(5-6): 383–404.
- Boltanski, L. and Thévenot, L. (2006) *On Justification: Economies of Worth*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

- Bourdieu, P. (1984) *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Bowen, S. and De Master, K. (2011) “New Rural Livelihoods or Museums of Productions? Quality Food Initiatives in Practice” *Journal of Rural Studies*, 27(1): 73-82.
- Böder, S. (2013) “The Importance of Being Traditional: Local Food Between Commercialisation and Symbolic Construction.” *The Return of Traditional Food*. Lysaght, P. (ed.) 180-190. Lund: *Lund University Press*.
- Cairns, K., Johnston, J. and Baumann, S. (2010) “Caring About Food: Doing Gender in the Foodie Kitchen” *Gender and Society*, 24(5): 591-615.
- Campbell, C. (2005) “The Craft Consumer: Culture, Craft and Consumption in a Postmodern Society.” *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 5(1): 23-42.
- Carolan, M. (2016) *The Sociology of Food and Agriculture*. New York: Routledge.
- Carley S, and Yahng, L. (2018) “Willingness-to-pay for Sustainable Beer.” *PLoS ONE*, 13(10).
- Consalvo, M. and Christopher A. P. (2013) “Welcome to the Discourse of the Real: Constituting the Boundaries of Games and Players.” *Proceedings of the Foundations of Digital Games*, 55–62.
- Cortois L. and Laermans R. (2017) “Rethinking Individualisation: The Basic Scripts and Three Variants of Institutionalised Individualism.” *European Journal of Social Theory*, 21(1): 60-78.
- De Solier, I. (2013) *Food and Self*. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Douglas, M. and Isherwood, B. (1979) *The World of Goods: Towards an Anthropology of Consumption*. New York: Basic Books.
- Erdoğan, R. T. (2013) “Beyaz Undan Ekmek Dönemini De Kapatıyoruz” Retrieval Date: June 2019. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gScg7vWmhbc>
- Eriksen, T. H. (2001) “Between Universalism and Relativism: A Critique of The UNESCO Concept of Culture” *Culture and Rights: Anthropological Perspectives*, 127-148.
- Fajans, J. (1988) “The Transformative Value of Food: A Review Essay.” *Food and Foodways: Explorations in the History and Culture of Human Nourishment*, 3(1-2): 143-166.
- Featherstone, M. (1991) *Consumer Culture and Postmodernism*. London: Sage.

- Fikir Sahibi Damaklar. (2009) Gerçek Ekmek Kampanyası. Retrieval Date: May 2018.  
<http://fikirsahibidamaklar.blogspot.com/>
- Fliegstein, N. (2008) *Euroclash: The EU, European Identity, and the Future of Europe*.  
New York: Oxford University Press
- Frank, T. (1997) *The Conquest of Cool: Business Culture, Counter Culture*. University of  
Chicago Press.
- Fuchs, C. (2015) "Power in the Age of Social Media." *Heathwood Journal of Critical  
Theory*, 1(1): 1-29.
- Germov, J. (1997) "Whetting the Appetite: A Taste of the Sociology of Food and  
Nutrition". *Annual Review of Health Social Science*, 7(1): 35-46.
- Giddens, A. (1991) *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*.  
Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Guinness World Records. (2000) "Largest Bread Consumption Per Capita." Retrieval Date:  
April 2019 [http://www.guinnessworldrecords.com/world-records/largest-bread-  
consumption-per-capita/](http://www.guinnessworldrecords.com/world-records/largest-bread-consumption-per-capita/)
- Gustafsson, S. and Engstrand, A. (2012) "Sourdough: The Stories Beyond Flour, Water and  
Salt." *Master Thesis*. Lund: Lund University.
- Honoré, C. (2004) *In Praise of Slowness: How A Worldwide Movement is Challenging  
The Cult of Speed*. New York: Harper Collins.
- Jameson, F. (1991) *Postmodernism, or, the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism*. Durham:  
Duke UP.
- Johnston, J. and Baumann, S. (2010) *Foodies: Democracy and Distinction in the Gourmet  
Foodscape*. New York: Routledge.
- Kayser, É. (2015) *The Larousse Book of Bread*. London: Phaidon Press.
- Kopytoff, I. (1986) *The Cultural Biography of Things: Commoditization as Process*.  
Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Koryürek, D. (2010) "Gıdanın Geleceği ve Sürdürülebilir Tüketim: Defne Koryürek."  
*TEDxReset* Retrieval Date: May 2018.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SgG4DTIDHg0>
- Lash, S. and Lury, C. (2007) *Global Culture Industry: The Mediation of Things*.  
Cambridge: Polity.



- Lechner, F.J. and Boli, J. (2008) *World Culture: Origins and Consequences*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Lechner, F. J. (2009) *Globalization: The Making of World Society*. New York: John Wiley and Sons.
- Lotti, A. (2010) "The Commoditization of Products and Taste: Slow Food and The Conservation of Agrobiodiversity." *Agriculture and Human Values*, 27(1): 71-83.
- Lupton, D. (1996) *Food, the Body and the Self*. London: Sage.
- MacDonald, I. M. (2013) "The Morality of Cheese: A Paradox of Defensive Localism in a Transnational Cultural Economy." *Geoforum*, 44: 93-102.
- McNaughtan, H. (2012) "Distinctive consumption and popular anti-consumerism: The case of Wall\*E." *Continuum-Journal of Media & Cultural Studies*, 26:1-14.
- Maguire, J. S. (2018) The Taste for the Particular: A logic of Discernment in an Age of Omnivorousness. *Journal of Consumer Culture*. Vol 18 (1) 3-20.
- Martin, G. (2016) "The Meaning and Origin of the Expression: A Picture is Worth a Thousand Words." *The Phrase Finder*. Retrieval Date: July 2019.  
<http://www.phrases.org.uk/meanings/a-picture-is-worth-a-thousand-words.html>
- Mennell, S. (1996) *All Manners of Food: Eating and Taste in England and France from the Middle Ages to Present*. Illinois: University of Illinois Press.
- Meyer, H. (2000) "Taste Formation in Pluralistic Societies." *International Sociology*, 15(1): 33-56.
- Meyer, J. W. (2010) "World Society, Institutional Theories, and the Actor." *Annual Review of Sociology*, 36(1): 1-20.
- Meyer, J. W., Francisco O. R., and Soysal Y. (1992) "World Expansion and Mass Education, 1870-1980." *Sociology of Education* 65: 128-49.
- Milor, V. (2015) "Çok Kıymetli Bir Babanın Yalancı Oğlu Ekmek." *Hürriyet*. Retrieval Date: April 2019. <http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/yazarlar/vedat-milor/cok-kiymetli-bir-babanin-asiri-egoist-ve-yalanci-oglu-ekmek-40017073>
- Mintel Group. (2016) "Super Growth for "Super" Foods: New Product Development Shoots Up 202% Globally Over the Past Five Years." Retrieval Date: August 2019.  
<https://www.mintel.com/press-centre/food-and-drink/super-growth-for-super-foods-new-product-development-shoots-up-202-globally-over-the-past-five-years>

- Müftüoğlu, O. (2016) "Neden Gerçek Gıda?" *Hürriyet*. Retrieval Date: April 2019. <http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/yazarlar/osman-muftuoglu/neden-gercek-gida-40248794>
- Nielsen, B. (2011) "UNESCO and the 'Right' Kind of Culture: Bureaucratic Production and Articulation." *Critique of Anthropology*, 31(4): 273-292.
- Ostberg, J. (2003) "Functional Foods: A Health Simulacrum." *Advances in Consumer Research*, 30: 129-134.
- Özdil, Y. (2018) "Ekmek" *Sözcü*. Retrieval Date: September 2018. <https://twitter.com/yilmazsozcu/status/1039727708056510464?lang=en>
- Paul, B.D. (2014) "From Slow Food to Slow Tourism." *Annals of Faculty of Economics*, 1(2): 137-144.
- Paxson, H. (2006) "Artisanal Cheese and Economies of Sentiment in New England." *Fast Food/Slow Food: The Cultural Economy of the Global Food*. Richard Wilk (ed.) 201-17. Lanham: AltaMira Press.
- Pietrykowski, B. (2004) "You are What You Eat: The Social Economy of Slow Food Movement." *Review of Social Economy*, 62(3): 307-21.
- Pollan, M. (2006) *The Omnivore's Dilemma: A Natural History of Four Meals*. New York: The Penguin Press.
- Raimi, S. (2002) *Spider-Man*. Columbia Pictures.
- Reckwitz, A. (2017) "Zwischen Hyperkultur und Kulturessenzialismus". Retrieval Date: April 2019. <http://www.bpb.de/politik/extremismus/rechtspopulismus/240826/zwischen-hyperkultur-und-kulturessenzialismus>
- Rickly, J. (2013) "Existential Authenticity: Place Matters." *Tourism Geographies: An International Journal of Tourism Space, Place and Environment*, 15(4): 680-686.
- Robertson, R. (1992) *Globalization: Social Theory and Global Culture*. London: Sage.
- Sahin, E. (2014) "Ekmeğin kaybolmuş büyüü" Retrieval Date: June 2016. <http://www.ufkumuzhaber.com/ekmegin-kaybolmus-buyusu-8732yy.htm>
- Sassatelli, R. (2004) "The Political Morality of Food: Discourses, Contestation and Alternative Consumption." *Qualities of Food: New Dynamics of Innovation and Competition*. Harvey, M., McMeekin, A., and Warde, A. (ed.) 179-191. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

- Schiemer C., Halloran A., Jespersen K. and Kaukua P. (2018) “Marketing Insects: Superfood or Solution-Food?” *Edible Insects in Sustainable Food Systems*. Halloran A., Flore R., Vantomme P., Roos N. (eds) 213-36. Cham: Springer.
- Schneider, S. (2008) “Good, Clean, Fair: The Rhetoric of the Slow Food Movement” *Special Focus: Food*, 4: 384-402.
- Schofer, E. and John W. M. (2005) “The Worldwide Expansion of Higher Education in the Twentieth Century.” *American Sociological Review*, 70: 898-920.
- Sedlmaier, A. (2014) *Consumption and Violence: Radical Protest in Cold-War West Germany*. Michigan: University of Michigan Press.
- Slow Food Manifesto (1989) Retrieval Date: May 2018.  
[https://slowfood.com/filemanager/Convivium%20Leader%20Area/Manifesto\\_ENG.pdf](https://slowfood.com/filemanager/Convivium%20Leader%20Area/Manifesto_ENG.pdf)
- Slow Food International. (2019) Retrieval Date: August 2019. <https://slowfood.com/>
- SustainWeb. (2019) “Real Bread Campaign.” Retrieval Date: June 2018.  
<https://www.sustainweb.org/realbread/>
- Şahin, E. (2014) “Ekmeğin Kaybolmuş Öyküsü” *Serbestiyet*. Retrieval Date: April 2019.  
<http://serbestiyet.com/yazarlar/emine-sahin/ekmegin-kaybolmus-buyusu-131964>
- UNO (2019) Retrieval Date: April 2019. <http://www.uno.com.tr>
- Thomas, G. M., Meyer, J. W., Ramirez, F. O. and Boli, J. (1987) *Institutional Structure: Constituting State, Society and the Individual*. Beverly Hills: Sage
- Thornton, P. H., Ocasio, W. and Lounsbury, M. (2012) *The Institutional Logics Perspective: A New Approach to Culture, Structure and Process*. Cambridge: Oxford University Press.
- Tikkanen, M. (2015) “Through Glass Darkly: Authenticity, History and Consumerism in Philip K. Dick’s The Man in the High Castle.” *Master Thesis*. University of Eastern Finland.
- Trubek, A. B. (2005) “Place Matters” *The Taste Culture Reader: 61 Experiencing Food and Drink* Korsmeyer, C. (ed.) 260-271. New York: Berg.
- Ünsal, A. (2003) *Nimet Geldi Ekine: Türkiye’de Ekmeklerin Öyküsü*. YKY: İstanbul.
- Veblen, T. (1899) *The Theory of the Leisure Class: An Economic Study of Institutions*. New York: Macmillan.

Warde, A. (1994) "Consumption, Identity Formation and Uncertainty." *Sociology*, 28(4): 877-898.

Warde, A. (1997) *Consumption, Food and Taste: Culinary Antinomies and Commodity Culture* London: Sage.

Wilk, R. (2017) "Concluding Thoughts and Marginal Provocations." *Food, Culture and Society*, 20(2): 347-354.

Yúdice, G. (2003) *The Expediency of Culture: Uses of Culture in The Global Era*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Zhao, X., and Zeynep, A. (2011) "Food Blogs and Consumer Culture." *AP-Asia-Pacific Advances in Consumer Research*, 9: 183.

## CURRICULUM VITAE

### Personal Information

Name Surname : Būşra Őavlı  
Place and Date of Birth : Istanbul – 06/06/1993

### Education

Undergraduate Education : Bahcesehir University  
Foreign Language Skills : English C2

### Contact:

Telephone : +905397465521  
E-mail Address : busrasavli@gmail.com