



BİNGÖL ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ
İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI ANABİLİM DALI

**VICTIMS OF NATIONALISM: A COMPARATIVE
STUDY OF *THE LEMON TREE* AND *SEVDALİNKİ***

Hazırlayan
Yüstra BOYLU

YÜKSEK LİSANS TEZİ

Danışman
Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Emine Yeşim BEDLEK

Bingöl – 2019

BİNGÖL ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ
İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI ANABİLİM DALI

**VICTIMS OF NATIONALISM: A COMPARATIVE
STUDY OF *THE LEMON TREE* AND *SEVDALİNK***
(MİLLİYETÇİLİĞİN KURBANLARI: LİMON AĞACI VE SEVDALİNK
ÜZERİNE KARŞILAŞTIRMALI BİR ÇALIŞMA)

Hazırlayan
Yüstra BOYLU

YÜKSEK LİSANS TEZİ

Danışman
Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Emine Yeşim BEDLEK

Bingöl – 2019

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BİLİMSEL ETİK BİLDİRİMİ	III
APPROVAL PAGE	IV
PREFACE	V
ÖZET	VII
ABSTRACT	VIII
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER ONE.....	5
NATION AND NATIONALISM.....	5
1.1. Nature of Nationalism.....	5
1.2. Types of Nationalism.....	15
CHAPTER TWO.....	19
SANDY TOLAN AND TRACES OF NATIONALISM IN <i>THE LEMON TREE</i> ... 19	
2.1 Sandy Tolan’s Life and Her Works.....	19
2.2 The Summary of <i>The Lemon Tree</i>	21
2.3 Multiculturalism in <i>The Lemon Tree</i>	23
2.4 Nationalism in <i>The Lemon Tree</i>	26
CHAPTER THREE.....	34
AYŞE KULİN AND TRACES OF NATIONALISM IN <i>SEVDALINKA</i>	34
3.1 Ayşe Kulin’s Life and Her Works.....	34
3.2 The Summary of <i>Sevdalinka</i>	37
3.3 Multiculturalism in <i>Sevdalinka</i>	39
3.4 Nationalism in <i>Sevdalinka</i>	42
CHAPTER FOUR.....	51
THE COMPARISON OF <i>SEVDALINKA</i> AND <i>THE LEMON TREE</i>	51
4.1. Orientalism.....	51
4.2. From Victim to Victor.....	53
4.3 The Apathy of Other States.....	58
4.4. Hope and the Possibility of Dialogue.....	64
CHAPTER FIVE.....	67
CONCLUSION	67

REFERENCES.....	69
ÖZGEÇMİŞ	74



BİLİMSEL ETİK BİLDİRİMİ

Yüksek Lisans tezi olarak hazırladığım “Victims of Nationalism: A Comparative Study of *The Lemon Tree* And *Sevdalinka*” adlı çalışmanın öneri aşamasından sonuçlanmasına kadar geçen süreçte bilimsel etiğe ve akademik kurallara özenle uyduğumu, tez içindeki tüm bilgileri bilimsel ahlak ve gelenek çerçevesinde elde ettiğimi, tez yazım kurallarına uygun olarak hazırladığım bu çalışmamda doğrudan veya dolaylı olarak yaptığım her alıntıya kaynak gösterdiğimi ve yararlandığım eserlerin kaynakçada gösterilenlerden oluştuğunu beyan ederim.

... / 07/ 2019

imza

Yüstra BOYLU

APPROVAL PAGE
BİNGÖL ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ MÜDÜRLÜĞÜNE

Victims of Nationalism: A Comparative Study of *The Lemon Tree* And *Sevdalinka*", başlıklı bu çalışma, 02/07/ 2019 tarihinde yapılan tez savunma sınavı sonucunda oybirliğiyle başarılı bulunarak jürimiz tarafından İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı Anabilim Dalı'nda Yüksek Lisans tezi olarak kabul edilmiştir.

TEZ JÜRİSİ ÜYELERİ (Unvanı, Adı ve Soyadı)

Başkan : **İmza:**

Danışman : **İmza:**

Üye : **İmza:**

ONAY

Bu Tez, Bingöl Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yönetim Kurulunun/07/ 2019 tarih ve sayılı oturumunda belirlenen jüri tarafından kabul edilmiştir.

Doç. Dr. Yaşar BAŞ

Enstitü Müdürü

PREFACE

First, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my advisor Dr. Emine Yeşim BEDLEK for her supportive attitude, encouraging guidance and supervision throughout the research.

I would like to thank to my family, especially my parents, Ayhan and Aydın SEZGİN for their life-long support and guidance. I owe special thanks to my brother Erhan SEZGİN for his support, encouragement and his confidence in my pursuit of the study.

I also thank to my dear friend, Şengül KESMEZ who never left me alone and helped me whenever I needed.

Finally, I would like to express special thanks to my husband, Mehmet Ali BOYLU for this endless tolerance, support and encouragement.

Dedicated to Yusuf Bera



ÖZET

Bingöl Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yüksek Lisans Tez Özeti

Tezin Başlığı: Milliyetçiliğin Kurbanları: Limon Ağacı ve Sevdalinka Üzerine Karşılaştırmalı Bir Çalışma

Tezin Yazarı: Yüstra BOYLU

Danışman: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Emine Yeşim BEDLEK

Anabilim Dalı: İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı

Bilim Dalı: İngiliz Kültürü ve Edebiyatı

Kabul Tarihi:

Modern çağda, Filistinliler ve Bosnalılar milliyetçi düşüncenin yol açtığı ayrımcılıktan ötürü en kötü iki kaderi yaşamış uluslardır. Buradaki en şaşırtıcı husus, benzer uygulamalara maruz kalan milletlerin bu acıların temel sebebi olmasıdır. Yahudiler ve Sırp'lar ortak tarihlerine ve kültürel geçmişlerine aldırmandan kendilerine yapılan kötülüklerin daha fazlasını yapmışlardır. *Limon Ağacı* Filistin ve İsrail çatışmasına, günlük hayatlarına, çekilen acılara ve umuda ayna tutarken, *Sevdalinka* Bosnalı ve Sırp çatışmasındaki benzer durumları yansıtır. Bu tez tarihsel durumların sözü edilen anlatılardaki yansımaları inceler. Ulusların ortak paydaları, kasıtlı ayrımcılık ve önyargı oluşturma süreçleri, insan hakları ihlali örneklendirilir. Yapay bir unsur olarak milliyetçilik ve milliyetçiliğin çeşitleri irdelenir. İki eser de ön yargılardan uzak, insancıl bir yaklaşımla yazılmıştır. Ortak kültüre sahip bu ulusların tüm olumsuzluklara rağmen, birbirleriyle iletişim kurmalarının ve birlikte yaşamalarının mümkün olduğu vurgulanır. Tüm süreç göz önüne alındığında, ulusları huzura götüren tek ya da en faydalı yolun ötekini hoş karşılamak ve onunla duygudaşlık kurmak olduğu sonucuna varılır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: ayrımcılık, milliyetçilik, şarkiyatçılık, umut, yahudi karşıtlığı.

ABSTRACT

Bingol University Institute of Social Sciences Abstract of Master's Thesis

Title of the Thesis: Victims of Nationalism: A Comparative Study of *The Lemon Tree* And *Sevdalinka*

Author: Yüsra BOYLU

Supervisor: Dr. Emine Yeşim BEDLEK

Department: English Language and Literature

Sub-field: English Culture and Literature

Date:

The Palestinians and the Bosnians have experienced two of the most miserable fates by virtue of national discrimination in modern era. The confusing point, here, is that the main reason of the miseries is the nations who had been exposed to the same discrimination and hurt. The Jews and the Serbs overdid the atrocities done to them regardless of their common historical and cultural backgrounds. *The Lemon Tree* mirrors Palestinian and Israeli conflict, the daily life, the nation's sufferings, and hope; *Sevdalinka* reflects the similar cases of Bosnian and Serbian conflict. The thesis analyzes the reflections of two historical cases on two narratives. The common grounds of the nations, the processes of building prejudice and deliberately discrimination, human rights violation are exemplified. As an artificial factor the concept of nationalism and kinds of nationalism are studied. The possibility of communication and co-existence of the nations having common cultural background is stressed. Regarding the whole process, it is concluded that the only or the most useful way to comfort for all the nations is to welcome and tolerate the other.

Keywords: anti-semitism, discrimination, hope, nationalism, orientalism.

INTRODUCTION

This thesis mainly aims to examine the traces of nationalism in two contemporary novels *The Lemon Tree* written by Sandy Tolan and *Sevdalinka* by Ayşe Kulin. It deals with the Palestinian-Israeli conflict and Bosnian-Serbian conflict comparatively. It is real that people from different ethnic and religious origins lived together somewhere in the world at a time in peace preserving their own religion, language and identity namely their individuality contrary to the people killing each other for the sake of their ideological diversities in modern world. Especially, it was 19th century, during the catastrophic times of Ottoman Empire; countries such as England and Russia were deeply occupied with getting a share of the Empire to maintain control over the area and important trade routes. Following the First World War, any conditions and ideologies helped to establish and strengthen the sentiment of nationalism all over the world. The logic of providing the Western Europe control over Eastern Europe recommended nation states that rely on homogeneous ethnic and religious groups. Indeed, the concept of nation state is nothing else than to establish dominance on some other weaker groups. In modern warfare, imperialism, and the quasi –theological ambitions of totalitarian rulers- is indeed the age of refugee, the displaced person, mass immigration.¹ So ethnocentric perceptive of nationalism has been produced and preserved throughout the years.

Using forms of narrative as both primary and secondary source of historical information I have studied the novels in the light of New Historicism and Cultural Criticism Theory. In that “new historicism deconstructs the traditional opposition between history (traditionally thought of as factual) and literature (traditionally thought of as fictional).² Moreover for cultural criticism “culture is a process, not a product; it is a lived experience, not a fixed definition. More precisely, a culture is a collection of interactive cultures, each of which is growing and changing, each of which is constituted at any given moment in time by the intersection of gender, race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, socioeconomic class, occupation, and similar factors

¹ Edward W. Said, *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays*, Cambridge MA, Harvard University Press, 2000, p.357.

² Lois Tyson, *Critical Theory Today*, Routledge, Newyork, 2006, p.286.

that contribute to experience of its members.”³ Culture’s apprehension of reality, its experience of reality and its representation reality converge are on focus.⁴ New historicism and cultural criticism theory has interest in the operation of oppression, views the oppressed people as victimized by the dominant power structure and as capable of resisting and transforming that power.⁵ So it is possible to get the spirit of the age, political agendas, and ideological conflicts of culture within the framework of the theory.⁶ It provides to make contact with reality. Stephan Greenblatt, a literary historian and one of the founders of New Historicism, asserts that the theory proposes the verbal traces detached from the lives real people actually live.⁷

The thesis focuses on the processes “by which individual identity and social formations- such as political, educational, legal and religious institutions and ideologies- create, promote or change each other” in Palestine and Bosnia.⁸ It questions the operations of oppression and victimized nations by dominant powers and structures, roots of tolerance and association on their common lands. I have investigated the concept of nationalism and focused on the similarities of Israeli-Palestinian and Serbs-Bosnian conflicts, two of the bloodiest hostilities experienced in modern world using two contemporary novels; *The Lemon Tree* by an American writer Sandy Toland and *Sevdalinka* by a Turkish writer Ayşe Kulin. Both writers call in to the catastrophe of the nationalism on the way of construction of Serb and of Jewish nations and state the daily life mirroring the ordinary people of those societies. The challenging and painful processes are represented into discourses that turn history into story. Both novels draw attention to the harmony of various ethnic groups in advance and the process of spreading seeds and flowering of differences and bias. The novels are demonstratively rich in realistic detail and handle to give a sense of much wider oppressed communities in recent history. Both are written in a manner not restricted by a national frame, as written by two foreign writers, focusing on some general dilemmas with the histories of the Palestinian and the Bosnian and the conflicts faced on their lands. The basic historic predicament of both situations is

³ Tyson, *ibid*, p.296.

⁴ Catherine Gallagher & Stephan Greenblatt, *Practicing New Historicism*, University of Chicago Press, 2000, p.41.

⁵ Tyson, *ibid*, p.297.

⁶ Tyson, *ibid*, p.282.

⁷ Gallagher & Greenblatt, *ibid*, p.21.

⁸ Tyson, *ibid*, p.284.

inscribed within the story as an originary problematic of presentment and form. Sandy Tolan's *The Lemon Tree* tells the story of a Palestinian and a Jewish family and their atrocious cases as a result of the conflict depicting all developed from the racist viewpoint and national focus including the 1948 disaster caused the destruction of the Palestinian society, and the possibility of communication and relation between opponents. *Sevdalinka* by Ayşe Kulin narrates the peaceful lives of a group of people from different origin and their relations under the Bosnian and Serbian conflict, whose primary victims have been Bosnian Muslims destructed owing to their religion, being stimulated and justified in terms of religious nationalism. The novels narrate also "the dichotomy of ethnic cleansing, the forcible removal of unwanted populations through violence and terror; and ethnic policing, which includes corporal punishment, mass incarceration and administrative harassment."⁹

Perhaps because the authors have journalist backgrounds, they are able to weave together engaging personalized accounts that are, nonetheless, weighty.¹⁰ There are deep personal roots to their works and significant implications from their professions. What the novels have in common is the attention the writers pay to the oral history process, using documentary evidences their interviews and observations on their methods, stressing the various ethnical dilemmas. The writers build the realities related to these nations, fictional frameworks and stories using documentary sources. So the events are in the forefront and they will be analyzed in addition to the characters.

The first chapter, "Nations and Nationalism", discusses the meaning and processes of constructing nations and nationalism, under the guidance of some remarkable scholars and puts across the types of nationalism. In the second chapter, "Sandy Tolan and Traces of Nationalism in *The Lemon Tree*", information on Tolan's life and his works is given, *The Lemon Tree* is summarized, multicultural patterns in the book are studied, nationalism and its outputs in the novel are analyzed. In the third chapter, "Ayşe Kulin and The Traces of Nationalism in *Sevdalinka*", Kulin's biography is included, her works are placed, general information on *Sevdalinka* is given, multicultural patterns, the process of

⁹ Anthony Oberschall, "Frontiers and Ghettos: State Violence in Serbia and Israel by James Ron", *Social Forces*, Vol.82, No.4, 2004, p.1657.

¹⁰ Sherna Berger Gluck, "Feminism in the United States Radical Sisters: on Second -Wave Feminism and Black Liberati..." *Oral History Review*, May 2009, p.9.

construction of nationalism and products of nationalism in Bosnia are discussed. In the fourth chapter, “The Comparison of *Sevdalinka* and *The Lemon Tree*”, similar cases of the Bosnian-Serbian and Palestinian-Israeli conflicts are handled, Orientalism in Palestine and Bosnia is questioned, the apathy of other countries towards the Bosnian and the Palestinian is revealed, the similar cases of the Serbian and the Israeli are compared and sympathetic characters of the novels, favorable situations, possibility of dialogue and hope in the miserable lives of the people are exemplified.

The nations that have (a bond through) a common history are deliberately discriminated. Bosnian Muslims, Serbs and Croats all speaking the same language “trace their descent to the tribes that migrated to the area around the sixth century and were Slavic in language and culture by the time they settled in the area.”¹¹ The Slavic people speaking the same language identified themselves as Serbian for those who lived at the east, as Croat for those who settled down at the northwest and Adriatic coast, and as Bosnian for those who lived in the neighborhood of Bosnian river, in the highlands and forestlands around.¹² Serbs from the origin of South-Slavic people shared the same lands and environment, common cultural practices and experiences with another South-Slavic origin nation; The Bosnians who were later regarded as the other highlighting their religious beliefs in spite of their historical background. As for the Israeli and Palestinian conflict, if questioned, it will be seen that the main element used for discrimination, their religions have an association at the top. Clearly, within common historical and cultural backgrounds, they had lived within a contradiction: they were friends, they were enemies. Dalia, the protagonist of *The Lemon Tree*, refers to the futility of discrimination and she states “We share a common destiny here, I truly believe that we are so deeply and closely related-culturally, historically, religiously, psychologically. And it’s so clear to me that you and your people are holding the key to our true freedom. And I think we could also say, Bashir, that we hold the key to our freedom. It’s a deep interdependence.”¹³

¹¹ Qtd in Michael A. Sells, *The Bridge Betrayed*, University of California Press, 1998, p.13.

¹² Ayse Kulin, *Sevdalinka*, Everest Yayınları, Istanbul, 2016, p.257.

¹³ Sandy Tolan, *The Lemon Tree*, Black Swan, London, 2006, p.387.

CHAPTER 1

NATIONS AND NATIONALISM

1.1. The Nature of Nationalism

There is no other issue dramatically shaping the political and social boundaries of the world than the issue of nationalism and race. It is more serious matter of debate in multicultural societies however it is of great concern in even the smallest and purest communities. An old word nation “has gathered much moss with the lapse of centuries. As derived from the Latin ‘natio’ it meant birth or race and signified a tribe or social grouping based on real or fancied community of blood and possessed presumable of unity of language.”¹⁴ Nationality is akin to be understood being formed naturally. Nationality is not an inherent attribute of human kind, it is something the artifacts of men’s convictions and solidarities but now it comes to appear that having a nation is like having a nose and two ears.¹⁵ Nationality is an artificial, contingent tie binding resembling people and helping to form indiscrete groups. The main objective of nationalism is that people are to be organized into larger groups and culturally homogeneous units. There are many constitutive elements used in defining nationality such as; blood, common customs, traditions, territory, religion and political property all of which are used to help or hinder to construct nationality. Some of them were more important in early history and some gained importance in time, but none of them have indispensable and eternal influence on nationality. All of the aspects are used only for pragmatic- politic aims not for the sake of real national entity.

Benedict Anderson, an authority on the concept of nationality, proposes nation as being “an imagined political community- and imagined as both inherently limited and sovereign.”¹⁶ Ernest Gellner, well-known social anthropologist, stresses that it is a myth to regard nationality as a God-given way of classifying humankind and a long-delayed political destiny.¹⁷ He also describes it as “the general imposition of a high culture on society, where previously low cultures had taken up the lives of

¹⁴ Carlton J. H. Hayes, *Essays on Nationalism*, The Macmillian Company, 1926, p.3-4.

¹⁵ Ernest Gellner, *Nation and Nationalism*, Cornell University Press, 1983, p. 6-7.

¹⁶ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, Verso, London, 2006, p. 6.

¹⁷ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 48-49.

the majority, and some cases of the totality of the population.”¹⁸ Anthony D. Smith, British historical sociologist having studies on nationalism, characterizes an ethnic group distinguishing it by four features: “the sense of unique group origins, the knowledge of a unique group history and belief in its destiny, one or more dimensions of collective cultural individuality, and finally a sense of unique collective solidarity.”¹⁹ The scholars have defined the concept from different perspectives and sometimes with prejudices. Far from a clear explanation, Hans Kohn, an American philosopher and pioneer in academic study of nationalism, defines nationalism as a living and corporate idea, sentiment, and state of mind putting great emphasis awareness of cultural distinction, a long and common history and influence of mature nations.²⁰ As far as it goes, nationality is simply a process of persuasion, persuasion of one’s own and the other on the formation of common features, cultural boundaries, will, identification and compulsion. It is a general process of constructing the notions of “we” and “they”.

Along with having a political, psychological and social aspect, nationality is a historical concept, it is the product of the historical development.²¹ It is not something of organic, pure formation; it is a product of voluntarist and planed process. “Nations, however, have no clearly identifiable births, and their deaths, if they ever happen, are never natural.”²² Nationalism, as understood, is a young tendency not having roots in early history. In hunting- gathering societies and when the first states were formed in agrarian period, nationality and ethnicity weren’t taken into consideration along the way constructing groups. Additionally, in agrarian societies, there was nothing important related to nationality, but with the foundation and standardization of modern life, that is industrial society, the concept of nationality has gone up in value.²³ It is closely related to the class and cast system the ruler and ruled position. It goes back to the second half of the eighteenth century and manifests with French Revolution which increase the dynamic force of the new

¹⁸ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 57.

¹⁹ Shlomo Sand, *The Invention of Jewish People*, Verso, New York 2009, p. 29.

²⁰ Krzysztof Jawkulowski, “Western (civic) “versus” Eastern (ethnic) Nationalism. The Origins and Critique of the Dichotomy”, *Polish Sociological Review*, No. 171, 2010, p. 291-292.

²¹ Hans Kohn, “The Nature of Nationalism”, *The American Political Science Review*, Vol.33, No. 6, 1939, p.1010-1011.

²² Anderson, *ibid*, p. 205.

²³ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 8-38.

movement.²⁴ It is simply convinced that every nation must at least have a state ruled by their own. Especially in 20th century, when construction of nation-states reached to pick, each of the states wished for constructing their own national states based on national soul with the style of virtuous dominion. Yet, the dominion transitivizes and becomes a tool to suppress the minorities who are the integral part of the desired society.

Nationality is basic prosperity not only for individual but for countries. Any individual over the world can or may have nationality as he/she has gender; likewise any country may or can have nationality for its political power²⁵ It is made legal and natural to follow national traces. As Etienne Balibar, a French philosopher asserts that “No nation possesses an ethnic base naturally, but as social formations are nationalized, the populations included within them, divided up among them, dominated by them, are ethnicized—that is, represented in the past or in the future as if they formed a natural community.”²⁶ Together with the natural reality of nationality, national and imagined factors of the process are apparent. Anderson states clearly that “It is imagined because the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion.”²⁷ In general people are akin to idealize their nationality. Of course it is arbitrary to be born in anywhere or as a member of any nation, but later it becomes a crystal-clear fact to struggle to make that nation eternal.²⁸ Herein nationalism signalizes the attitudes, social movements and ideologies that characterize the behaviors engaged in the struggle to maintain, achieve, or upgrade their position in the world.²⁹

Everywhere over the world, people are tend to form groups, draw lines between one another and marginalize the other. From the primitive to the modern societies, people are tend to put themselves into circles, groups and discriminate themselves from the other people out of the circumference. The borders of a small village, a river or some other lines used to divide the two societies or individual work

²⁴ Kohn, *ibid*, p. 1001.

²⁵ Anderson, *ibid*, p. 6.

²⁶ Sand, *ibid*, p. 23.

²⁷ Anderson, *ibid*, p. 6.

²⁸ Anderson, *ibid*, p. 11-12.

²⁹ Louis Wirth, “Types of Nationalism”, *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 41, No. 6, 1936, p. 723.

well, they may become the certain borders to hate, otherize or ignore the others opposite. There are numerous reasons of the situation such as making use of the resources beyond their authority, idealizing everything related to their own, despising the other and so on. In a world of equalities and similarities, artificial, socially constructed norms are used to build the barriers among people. Hence, constructing nationality is one of the easiest and the most competent realities that enable the discrimination and distinction.

In reality nationality, like anything related to human life, is strongly influenced by social norms and socially, deliberately constructed standards, social constructionism. Social knowledge, without a doubt, traces ideologies. That is, the system of social construction is governed by the body of norms and power relations as facts.³⁰ The process is built so schemingly and covertly that people do not need to think over it and consider it as a natural and inherent fact of life itself. However humans are intentionally disposed by evolutionary design in order to discern ethnics as biological essentialness; ethnic membership is regarded as a fundamental property transmitted at birth that determines people's behaviors.³¹ The conditions are produced, maintained and changed on the ground of interpretative process with specific purposes and analysis.³²

The issue of nationalism has such a wide range of ramifications and comprises and such a diversity and complexity of phenomena that it has come up with a compelling process of study and mostly unconvincing products. The birth of any nation is not a sudden and rapid event, it happens after a long period of formidable pregnancy. In this process, intellectuals have such a strong power that they can not only produce new cultural items such as signs and symbols but also manipulate the whole cultural facts. As intellectuals have the role of organizing and producing a nation, their first dictionaries, poems and novels depicting the imagined nation serve for this role.³³ Nationalism is simply an intellectual and emotional phenomenon exceeding basic power relations of modernity that serve for capitalist

³⁰Stephan Turner, "Social Constructionism and Social Theory." *Sociological Theory* 9.1, 1991, p. 22-33.

³¹Edouard Machery & Luc Faucher, "Social Construction and the Concept of Race." *Philosophy of Science* 72. 2005, p. 1212.

³²David R. Marines, "The Social Construction of Meaning." *Contemporary Sociology* 29.4, 2000, p. 577.

³³Sand, *ibid*, p. 62.

purposes.³⁴ Tom Nairn, in *The Break-up of Britain*, claims that “the theory of nationalism represents Marxism’s great historical failure.”³⁵ Doubtlessly the notion of nation has been disguised however the dominant powers desire. In fact all of the reality depends on economy, imperialism, Marxism, and politics. There are many reasons to consist basis for nation however there is no other way more significant than the case made for primacy of capitalism.³⁶ For this reason new scientific areas are created like orientalism which “records the birth and development of a doctrine, which claims a monopoly over interpreting and representing the East to Westerners and Easterners alike, intimately linked to and contaminated by the interests, strategies and policies of Euro-American Imperialism.”³⁷ Gellner also stresses on the link between nationalism and the process of imperialism, colonialism and de-colonization and dedication, in modern era, it is the fruit of technological and economic superiority not of military force.³⁸ That is, the main purpose of nationalism is constructing homogeneous cultural units that will form the base of political life and economic stability. The political roof over the economy accordingly over the culture brings prosperity to the power holders. Prestige, domination and power are vital issues of nationalism.

People are tend to be distinguished not only in terms of more natural properties like blood and common descent, but they are likely to be discriminated with regards to constructed characteristic like language, common history, religion, custom and citizenship. When they became insufficient to draw certain lines and borders; myths, memories and symbols are used to ease and strengthen the process that refers the magical type of thinking allowing mental access by means of concrete elements.³⁹

The natural tendency of mankind which is produced by social conditions since time practically immemorial, appearing us as natural that is tendency of love of birthplace or place of childhood, its climate, its surroundings namely love of familiar,

³⁴ Sand, *ibid*, p. 41.

³⁵ Anderson, *ibid*, p. 3.

³⁶ Anderson, *ibid*, p. 37.

³⁷ Fawwaz Traboulsi, “Edward Said’s Orientalism Revisited”, *The Translator* 15.1, 2009, p. 179.

³⁸ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 42-43.

³⁹ Jaskulowski, *ibid*, p. 300-301.

is used to empower the dynamic force of nationalism.⁴⁰ Surely the tendency wouldn't be able to construct such a powerful ideology, to reach the goal, it is used to accompany and help the social and intellectual projects. A common national past, history and destiny appeal the process. So there is, perhaps, no other effective way on binding experience of people than making up a common past on construction. According to Otto Bauer, a famous Austrian socialist, "the nation is the totality of men tied by the community of destiny to the community of character."⁴¹ It becomes apparent that the function of memory and inherited identity cannot be underestimated, so a common history is tried be constructed. Joseph Stalin outlines nation being historically constituted as "stable community of people, formed on the basis of a common language, territory, economic life, and psychological make-up manifested in a common culture."⁴² In fact "writing about the past was designed to serve moral and religious purposes."⁴³ Learning history was made a compulsory reality. Personal identity and historical background were deliberately made successive and inseparable parts of each other. Based upon state- controlled (primary) education, state- organized propaganda and projected rewriting of history, discrimination and classification in integrated society grows up automatically and adopted naturally. Where biology is inefficient, the term cultural community gains importance. For instance, if one is not sure about the reality of biological-genetic community of the Jews, their lasting and common culture gains importance and the policy is organized taking the prospective of cultural distinction into account.

Human language is, of course, a process of undersigned one, but to create a nation for political reasons or for capitalist reasons, it becomes a deliberate process. For instance, to reach wider population on behalf of printing, especially the western world tried to create a (universal) language addressing more and more people.⁴⁴ Also when it comes to unite the people under the umbrella of nationality it is also used as used in almost everywhere in the world. As a result, small minorities in the countries

⁴⁰ Kohn, *ibid*, p. 1002.

⁴¹ Quoted in G. Haupt, M. Lowy, and C. Weil, *Les Marxistes et la question nationale, 1848-1914*, Paris: Maspero, 1974, 254.

⁴² Sand, *ibid*, p. 34.

⁴³ Sand, *ibid*, p. 66.

⁴⁴ Anderson, *ibid*, p. 37-41.

like Turkey, Iran, and Iraq are generally encouraged to speak the common language.⁴⁵

Ethnicity for some is a primitive and inherent feature of humanity whereas some consider it as a basic tool the process of political and social construction of the populations. So as to display other ethnic groups' situation in a state where a main nation is empowered politically and other ethnic groups are ignored; Gellner's words also reveal it "... nationalism is a theory of political legitimacy, which requires that ethnic boundaries should not cut across political ones, and, in particular, that ethnic boundaries within a given state – a contingency already formally excluded by the principle in its general formulation - should not separate the power-holders from the rest."⁴⁶ So the fundamental purpose is to promote national consciousness, differences and necessity of distinctions. In reality, nationalism has hardly ever aimed and experienced peace, equality and unity as it is claimed. Moses Hesses concludes "that behind the problem of nationality and freedom there is a still deeper problem which cannot be solved by mere phrases, namely the race question, which is as old as history itself and which must be solved before attempting the solution of the political and social problems."⁴⁷

Sometimes, just a line can be enough for distinguishing or disintegrating the society that was an entire reality the previous day. For example, after the collapse of Ottoman Empire, the country was divided into different episodes while there was no real, tangible reason for this division. As a result of the dead straight line drawn by a British officer, who became Iraqis learned that they were descendants of the ancient Babylonians and the Arabs made acquainted with the fact that they were descendants of Saladin's heroic warriors and now Turkey came to know that they were white Aryans, the descendants of Sumerians and the Hittites.⁴⁸ On the top of citizenship nationalism residing on citizenship, ethnic nationalism is another way of discrimination drawing the lines among the countries, especially among the societies. Here, citizenship nationalism comes on stage by itself. It is generally easy to hate someone from a different citizenship nationality even if they do not have any

⁴⁵ Anderson, *ibid*, p. 45.

⁴⁶ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 1.

⁴⁷ Moses Hess, *Rome and Jerusalem: A Study in Jewish Nationalism*, New York: Bloch Publishing Company, 1918. p.40.

⁴⁸ Sand, *ibid*, p. 16.

relations and misconduct. I think it is not less influential than ethnic nationalism. In that, people of the same ethnic roots sometimes marginalize their cognates only on the ground of their citizenship. However, the case of extending blood family becomes more important issue especially for the young nations to survive.⁴⁹

Social experiences determine the religious faith. That is; interaction to are another, moving somewhere else, being influenced by another religion or being exposed to some specific condition affect the religious beliefs and attitudes. On the way of imagining communities based on nationality, religion takes place on stage among the most important figures. It is generally used as a framework shaping the process as an aim to offer, from which relief should be acquired to which tale to be read and told. It is an ordinary action to link between religious principles and cases with the planned points. In general, if there are not some other bases, the events are shown as the plans and wishes of God. Something happens or happened (almost always things serving for nationalism) since God wanted them to happen like that. Religion, faith and identity “are social experiences rather than cognitive affective or spiritual properties of an individual.”⁵⁰ Religious communities try to construct religious civilizations also. They take important roles on constructing national history to convince the descendants of the imagined nation. Carlton Hayes concluded in 1920s that “the upshot of the whole process is that a nationalist theology of the intellectuals becomes a nationalist mythology for the masses.”⁵¹ Especially in agricultural societies these intellectuals are important figures on designation of the whole societies. In these societies these literate intellectuals are mostly priest, rabbis, monks, missionaries and ulema all of whom are religious functionary. Therefore their messages were important for and well accepted by the collocutors. Religion is used to be more persuasive so Treitschke, the first who helped to link Jews and their ancient homeland on a secular perspective, asserts that “A full merger of Jewry with the peoples of the West will never be achieved. It may only be possible to soften the opposition, since it is used in ancient history.”⁵²

⁴⁹ Sand, *ibid*, p. 253.

⁵⁰Duane R. Bidwell, “Practicing the Religious Self: Buddhist-Christian Identity as Social Artifact”, *Buddhist-Christian Studies*, Vol. 28, 2008, p. 6.

⁵¹ Sand, *ibid*, p. 54.

⁵² Sand, *ibid*, p. 82.

The opportunity of cheap paper, wide-ranging print, widespread literacy, easy communication chances help to formulate and propagate the concept of nationality. Gellner binds nationalism with the power and access to education of a viable modern high culture.⁵³ Both of the factors are closely associated with industrialization because industrial society requires a sharp polarization. Now that there is nothing on earth providing equal and the same advantages to both interlocutors, the one that is more powerful wins. Through education, power holders of high culture expose whatever they wish. Real or invented, folk culture with a deal of effort and standardized and sustained propaganda that is enculturation by the way of education can be turned into a new high culture.⁵⁴ Hereby a sharp polarization and social discontinuity becomes inevitable in industrial modern society.

Discriminated groups don't occur rapidly; they are more likely to be constructed by means of cognitive images and are in need of mutually reinforcements.⁵⁵ All of the disputes of contemporary North America, German during Nazi era, nineteenth-century France, today's Palestinian case and so on are outcomes of socially constructed nationality and race. One nation's act determines another nation's consciousness towards nationalism. The European distinction of racism led to the discrimination and German ethnic cleansing ended up uneasily with Zionist idea. In an action- reaction case, yesterday's nightmare of identity becomes tomorrow's identity dreams. The Jews in general had terrible experiences and were slaughtered in Europe however after their arrival in Palestine, they didn't avoid harming the other, and furthermore, they became more cruel and behaved more feloniously to Palestinian than the Europe was to them. As a result of anxiety and fear created by uncertainties and inner struggles national identity "dislike of the unlike" becomes a long standing situation in the integral part of the society.⁵⁶

The planned processes bring disillusionment and make the nations feel sad in general. The decisions made deeply can solve problems and cure troubles on surface not in reality. Including independence wars, ongoing violence causes never-ending troubles and traumatic outcomes. Changing the usual and actual way of life of people

⁵³ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 88-89.

⁵⁴ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 97.

⁵⁵ Michael W. Link & Robert W. Oldendick, "Social Construction and White Attitudes toward Equal Opportunity and Multiculturalism", *The Journal of Politics* 58.1, 1996, p. 163.

⁵⁶ Sand, *ibid*, p. 253.

which has been experienced is of course a case of painful and conflict-ridden process. The different nations, for instance; the exile don't feel safe at all, they feel either as in their country even if they are somewhere else on earth or feel lonely on their own country even if they return. S.I. Agnon demonstrates the fact while accepting the Nobel Prize for Literature in 1996 "As a result of historical catastrophe in which Titus of Rome destroyed Jerusalem and Israel was exiled from its land, I was born in one of the cities of the exile. But I always regarded myself as one who was born in Jerusalem."⁵⁷ In consequence of nationality, only the case of "us" and "them" may be a strong and enough reason of hate, otherizing, bad treatment, and even war. While people had lived happily and brotherly in the Balkans until the last there decays, the land was ensanguined only for a case of socially constructed discrimination.

"A person's identity and dignity is, for Kant, rooted in his universal humanity, or, more broadly, his rationality, and not in his cultural or ethnic specificity."⁵⁸ Essentially, note by the way that, a person or a society may have different kind of nationality at the same time; most states on the earth are multinational or multiethnic in reality. The general approach is "that to condemn nationalism as the cause of our present discontent is just as absurd as to exalt the nation into the permanent unity of human society, possessing absolute and eternal values of its own."⁵⁹ The summary of the issue is being lack of sense of toleration for the diversities in societies. Regarding the consequences of the constructed nationality, if people respect the varieties, differences like Ziauddin Sardar proposes in his article, the age of nationalism as worked here will be past. In other words "We need to move away from the politics of contested identities that heighten artificial differences towards acceptance of the plasticity and possibilities of identities that focus on our common humanity."⁶⁰

⁵⁷ Qtd in Sand, *ibid*, p.129.

⁵⁸ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 31.

⁵⁹ Frederick Hertz, "The Nature of Nationalism", *Social Forces*, Vol.19, No.3, 1941, p. 414.

⁶⁰ Ziauddin Sardar, "A Garden of Identities: Multiple Selves and Other Futures." *Journal of Futures Studies*, 10.2, 2005, p.18.

1.2. Types of Nationalism

Nationalism has been taken into consideration and distinguished from different viewpoints. For instance, Professor Hayes has distinguished it as original and derived nationalism whereas Professor Handman has discussed four types of nationalism: irredentism, oppression-nationalism, prestige-nationalism and precaution-nationalism.⁶¹ Nationalism is divided into good and bad by many scholars from distinctive perspective. Frederick Hertz explains good and bad nationalism as pacific and aggressive ones emphasizing that “A nation content with things as they are, or too weak to alter them, is pacific, and a dissatisfied and strong nation is aggressive.”⁶² Kohn makes an extremely moralistic and prejudiced distinction between good nationalism associating it with the west and bad nationalism standing for non-Western world.⁶³ Although, he first followed a neutral line on this topic, later he maintains a prejudiced attitude defining civic (Western) nationalism in a good manner and ethnic (eastern) nationalism with an oriental perspective.⁶⁴ Some other scholars and academicians like John Plamenatz, James Kellas and Anthony D. Smith who are the considerable figures studying on the sentiment of nationalism, also trace Kohn’s typology with the same ethnocentric and prejudiced perspective.⁶⁵ They are so eager to prove the sharp diversities between east and west that, they ignore the artificial, socially-constructed invention of nationalism.

The issue has not been classified with all types of it all-round, thus I have simply tried to compile the kinds of nationalism exist. “Its global spread is read through the malignant metaphor of metastasis as well as under the smiling sings of identity and emancipation.”⁶⁶ As a product of politics and history, different kinds of nationalism go to the fore in each group, putting forward some certain features, under different circumstances. Hegemony nationalism a kind of nationalism stresses the military, political and economic advantages rather than other common component of nationalism like language, religion, culture or race. In plain terms, the kind of nationalism has common ground with whether imperialism or fascism.⁶⁷ It is used as

⁶¹ Wirth, *ibid*, p. 724.

⁶² Frederick Hertz, *ibid*, p. 413.

⁶³ Jaskulowski, *ibid*, p. 290.

⁶⁴ Jaskulowski, *ibid*, p. 290.

⁶⁵ Jaskulowski, *ibid*, p. 290.

⁶⁶ Benedict Anderson, “Introduction”, *Mapping the Nation*, Verso, London, 1996, p.1.

⁶⁷ Wirth, *ibid*, p. 728.

a tool to advance colonial or political interest along with chauvinism. Particularistic nationalism one other type of nationalism based on the secessionist demand of national autonomy, caring about cultural needs, national unity and freedom.⁶⁸ Race, common history, language culture and religion come into prominence on this kind of nationalism. People that struggle to gain their freedom from the empires they belonged to and those who wants to unit with their cognates they left with arbitrarily drawn boundaries exemplify this kind of nationalism. Marginal nationalism refers to a mixed culture and a mixed racial makeup that is seen in the frontier region of two states, hereby it is illustrated in Europe.⁶⁹ People of the borders tend to both preserve their own nationalism existence and integrate with the other.

The nationalism of minorities addresses the kind of nationality that is experienced by ethnic, cultural, political, racial minorities based on a common cultural heritage. The minorities mostly struggle against assimilation, othering and subaltern and try to protect their cultural and nationalism values. Democratic Nationalism aims at homogenizing culturally heterogeneous populations included arbitrarily into political units according to political principles.⁷⁰ Ethnic nationalism is the type of nationalism aiming to construct any nation to have its own state following blood and common descent. Regional Nationalism is also called as Restorative Nationalism “advocates the autonomy and ultimately independence of formerly independent political units now submerged into larger political structures.”⁷¹ Oppression nationalism is the system of reactions found to override in a group of members of which are liable to a certain regime of inabilities and definite subordination.⁷² The minorities living under the control of other nation exemplify kind of nationalism, like the Armenians in Turkey, the Poles in Germany etc. Nationalism of Irredentism refers the idea of reuniting the nations who have common history, culture or ethnicity and are under the domination of different groups, which generally in the some neighborhood.⁷³ Precaution nationalism addresses to the reaction to the incitement presented by competitive organization of the contemporary

⁶⁸ Wirth, *ibid*, p. 729-730.

⁶⁹ Wirth, *ibid*, p. 733.

⁷⁰ E. K. Francis, “The Ethnic Factor in Nation-Building”, *Social Forces*, Vol.46, No. 3, 1968, p.338.

⁷¹ Francis, *ibid*, p. 338-341.

⁷² Max Sylvius Handman, “The Sentiment of Nationalism”, *Political Science Quarterly*, Vol.36, No.1, 1921, p.108.

⁷³ Handman, *ibid*, p. 108.

state-system and identification of trading expansion aiming national security and well-being.⁷⁴ Exclusive Nationalism addresses the type of nationality that excludes the people who don't have a common ethnicity.⁷⁵

Diaspora nationalism simply maps the nationalist feelings of the people living far from their homeland. It is generally faced to risk of either assimilation or marginalization. The matter of social transformation, cultural revivification, the desire of acquisition of territory and handling the natural enmity illustrate acute problems and process faced by diaspora nationalism.⁷⁶ This type of nationalism mainly focuses on minority rights. Social nationalism also called as Inclusive Nationalism, means depending on shared national culture, not on common descent as since it provides anyone to adopt the culture and join the nation.⁷⁷ Inclusive Nationalism refers to system covering people of different nationalities to reach their purposes. Prestige Nationalism refers to the possibilities that provide the nation with greater respect and consideration and honor of its group.⁷⁸ Religious Nationalism suggests an institutional, religious approach to the design of collective representation shaped by the orders of God and that of a certain religion.⁷⁹ Official nationalism refers to the nationalism of the state covering all of those legally called to be citizens regardless of their ethnicity, culture and national identity.⁸⁰ Romantic Nationalism used to express “a romantic outlook with regard to life in general and specifically to nationalism as opposed to the rationalism and cosmopolitanism of the Enlightenment.”⁸¹

Cultural Nationalism “a significant ideological force that promoting a distinctive communitarian vision of the nation has regularly been adopted by a rising intelligentsia as a political option against the state.”⁸² According to Johan Gattfriend Herder, the father of cultural nationalism, the products of national characters like

⁷⁴ Handman, *ibid*, p. 109.

⁷⁵ James G. Kellas, “Ethnic and Social Nationalism”, *The Politics of Nationalism and Ethnicity*, Newyork, Macmillan Education, 1991, p.51.

⁷⁶ Gellner, *ibid*, p. 108.

⁷⁷ Kellas, *ibid*, p. 51.

⁷⁸ Handman, *ibid*, p. 109.

⁷⁹ Roger Friedland, “Religious Nationalism and the Problem of Collective Representation”, *Annual Review of Sociology*, Vol. 27, 2001, p. 125.

⁸⁰ Kellas, *ibid*, p. 52.

⁸¹ Edward C.Thaden, “The Beginnings of Romantic Nationalism in Russia”, *The American Slavic and East European Review*, Vol. 13, No. 4, 1954, p. 500.

⁸²John Hutchinson, “Cultural Nationalism, Elite Mobility and Nation-Building: Communitarian Politics in Modern Ireland”, *The British Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 38, No. 4, 1987, p. 482.

family features, the way of life and education of a people help to develop and dominate a nation.⁸³ Expansionist Nationalism relies on imperialism and claims a nation's superiority another in an aggressive and destructive manner. It inherently advocates exploitation. Post - Colonial Nationalism is the type of nationalism arising in countries where were colonized in advance. Pan-Nationalism is the system that desire to the society that common mother tongue. Liberal Nationalism refers to the peaceful nationalism desiring democratic tolerant and emancipatory values for the nation. Multinationalism addresses several number of citizenship individuals hold and the number of countries where they live regarding genuine, long-term exposure of different national cultures.⁸⁴ Internationalism is the system of ideologies connecting societies regardless of their ethnicity, culture, language, and so on. In fact Industrial society and today's global economy entail internationalism which is an easy consequence of complex partition of labor and interdependence internationally along with internally.

⁸³ Royal J. Schmidt, "Cultural Nationalism in Herder", *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 17, No. 3 1956, p. 407-408.

⁸⁴ Elizabeth A. Dries, "Multinationalism and Performance: Does Multinational Experiences Predict Competence?" University of Michigan, 2009 p.6.

CHAPTER TWO

SANDY TOLAN AND THE TRACES OF NATIONALISM IN *THE LEMON TREE*

2.1. Sandy Tolan's Life and His Works

Sandy Tolan, a professor at the University of Southern California (USC)'s Annenberg School for Communication and Journalism in Los Angeles, is an American best-selling author, award-winning radio and print journalist generally reporting on and commenting about Israel and Palestine.⁸⁵ He currently writes for the *Los Angeles Times*, *The Daily Beast*, *Salon*, *The Los Angeles Review of Books*, *Truthdig* and *Al-Jazeera English*, also he maintains a blog at RAMallahCafe.com that chronicles the daily life in West Bank by means of analysis and commentaries from Los Angeles in addition to his multimedia projects with his students, colleagues and cultural identity low-wage labor for "The California Report", high school students, Fusion, Global past and other renowned outlets.⁸⁶ He has written many columns mostly on the Palestinian-Israeli conflict. He is cofounder of Homelands Productions and has won numerous awards.⁸⁷

The central focus of his works has been racial and ethnic identity, the intersection of land conflicts, natural resources and global economy.⁸⁸ On development of his original interest in Israel-Palestinian conflict he tells:

Throughout my career, I have been drawn to international stories about the intersection of land, natural resources, indigenous and cultural identity. I had always been interested in covering such issues in Israel and Palestine. Like many Americans, Jews and Gentile alike, I was raised with the story of the heroic birth of Israel out of the ashes of the Holocaust but had come to understand that there was another people's story in the Holy Land too: After marrying a Palestinian journalist whom I met on a journalism fellowship at Harvard (we were married for eight years), I began to travelling to the region extensively to explore the different narratives of history, identity, war and peace, throughout Israel, the West Bank and Gaza. This resulted first in

⁸⁵ <http://sandytolan.com/about/>.

⁸⁶ <http://sandytolan.com/about/>.

⁸⁷ <http://freshfiction.com/author.php?id=12417>.

⁸⁸ <http://sandytolan.com/about/>.

series of reports for National Public Radio (NPR) about water in the Holy Land and then my 1996 book, *The Lemon Tree: An Arab, A Jew and the Heart of the Middle East*.⁸⁹

He also expresses on his website:

Like many Americans, I grew up with one part of history, as told through the heroic birth of Israel out of the Holocaust, The mother of one of my schoolmates had lived in Anne Frank's neighborhood, and got out of Amsterdam in a harrowing journey, just in time. I knew of Israel as a safe haven for the Jews. I knew nothing about the Arab side. For millions of Americans, Jews or Gentile, it was the same. They too were raised with the version of Middle East history as told in Exodus, Leon Uris's hugely influential mega-bestseller, first published in 1958, then made into a movie starring Paul Newman. In Uris's engaging novel, Arabs are alternately pathetic or malicious, or perhaps worse: In Exodus, they have little claims on their land "If the Arabs of Palestine loved their land, they could have been forced from it-much less run from it without real cause." But as generations of historians, Israeli and others, have since documented, and as Dalia and Bashir recounted to me in their own words, the actual history of the two peoples' relations is for more complex, not to mention richer and more interesting.⁹⁰

His novels are:

- *The Lemon Tree*
- *Children of Stone: The Power of Music in a Hard Land* selected as a finalist for a 2015 LA Times Book Prize is about Palestinian's dream to build a music school in the middle of Israel's military occupation.⁹¹ It is also about freedom and conflict.

⁸⁹ <http://ramallahcafe.com>.

⁹⁰ <http://sandytolan.com/the-lemon-tree/#new-page-1>.

⁹¹ <http://sandytolan.com/about/>.

- *Me and Hawk, A Boy and His Hero 25 years Later* tells the story of an exploration of race and sports in America, which is called ‘a solid hit’ by New York Times.⁹²

2.2. The Summary of *The Lemon Tree*

It tells the story of a Jewish family, the Eshkenazis, coming from Bulgaria and an Arab family, the Khairis that lived in the same house on the same land at different time along with the estrangement, occupation, grief, hope, and unexpected realities. The children of these families Dalia Eshkenazi and Bashir Khairi are at the center of the novel dealing with their nations’ history and survival.

Ahmad Khairi built a house in 1936 in Al-Ramla where his family had lived for centuries. The Khairis, Muslim Arabs of Palestine, could live at that house until 1948 when the military forces of Israel expelled them with the majority of Arab resident of Al-Ramla during the Independence War of Israel. The family moved to Ramallah in West Bank leaving their belongings and house with the hope of returning soon. But Ahmad and Zakia Khairi with their nine children could not return again and became refugees in Ramallah.

Meanwhile, Moshe and Solia Eshkenazi with their one-year old daughter Dalia were sent to Israel newly forming Jewish State, from Bulgaria after the World War II due to the Nazi trouble that expanded throughout the Europe. After their arrival, like most of the arriving Jews, they were offered an empty house abandoned by the Arabs. The house that the Eshkenazis chose to settle down in Al-Ramla was that the Khairis left behind. The Eshkenazis were convinced that the house was abandoned voluntarily and the owners had fled like cowards.

The novel starts with the case of the Palestinians who could travel to their own homes in Israel after the 1967 war. Bashir Khairi, Ahmad Khairi’s oldest son, goes to visit his family’s old house with his two cousins, Yasser and Ghiath. When they arrived at Yasser’s old house, they weren’t welcomed and they were threatened so they retreated in haste. On their arrival of Ghiath’s old house, they came into a school, his house was a school then and they were permitted to walk through it after the class period, when they came upon the Bashir’s old house, surprisingly Dalia

⁹² <https://annenberg.usc.edu/faculty/journalism/sandy-tolan>.

Eshkenazi, the new owner of the house, welcomed them and established a connection, a friendship with Bashir that will long for decades. She visits Bashir's family at Ramallah and tries to learn the realities of the origins of the family house and Jewish state. When Dalia fights for Israel's right to exist, Bashir struggles to return their homeland. He is charged of being a terrorist and is imprisoned many times about a quarter of his life by Israelis.

The lemon tree planted by Ahmad Khairi symbolizes that, the Khairis are rooted and connected to their homeland inherently. The misery of family members of Khairis, their psychological breakdown, the outputs of exile and nationalism, the sense of displacement, human right violation, the apathy or the unfair attitudes of other countries are handled by means of documentaries and newspaper articles. It mixes the national narratives with national history. It is a product created by means of personal, historical discussions and written essays. The book is based on a radio documentary Tolan had reported and produced in 1998.⁹³ It is grounded on reality.

The novel centralizes the suffering of the people, especially Dalia and Bashir, as examples of the suffering of two nations claiming to own the same land. Tolan writes the novel on a humanist approach questioning the objective truth and equalizing the two nations, handling the conflict from different perspective. Tolan explains in Author's note that "many of the events depicted in the book are from fifty, sixty or seventy years ago: none the less their retelling relies like everything else in the book entirely on the tools of reporting and research: interviews, diaries, newspaper clippings, and primary and secondary historical accounts."⁹⁴ Also he adds that the descriptions of the events surrounding the two families are based on family interviews that exemplify the Eshkenazi and Khairi's cases.⁹⁵ Tolan also states that:

The house depicted in the book is an actual place, and the lemon tree in its yard is real one. You could see the place for yourself if you boarded a bus in the West Jerusalem terminal, rode west, climbed and then plunged down the hills toward the Mediterranean, and banked up a two-lane rise until you came to a bustling, industrial town in a place once known as Palestine that is now the state of Israel. When you stepped off the bus, you'd walk down the busy

⁹³ Pressman, *ibid*, p. 430.

⁹⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p. 11.

⁹⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, p. 10.

main road known as Herzl Boulevard, past the juice vendors, the kebab stands, and the old storefronts selling trinkets and cheap clothing, and take a left at a street called Klausner. There, at the next corner, you'd spot a run-down gas station, and across the street a modest house with a pillared fence, a towering palm, and stone of the color of cream.

This is the place, you could say to yourself. This is the house with two histories. The house with the lemon tree.⁹⁶

The readers are provided with a compelling narrative based on real historical episodes and political developments with moral issues. In this way the novel that present multiple perspectives enables more convincing and effective discussion.

2.3. Multiculturalism in *The Lemon Tree*

For most of the people, Jews were simply a part of the landscape of Palestine. The degree of interaction was so high that it was undeniable with Jews from the kibbutzim bartering for wheat, barley and melons at al-Ramla's Wednesday market, Arab laborers working in nearby Jewish fields, Jewish farmers bringing their horses into al-Ramla to be shod, Jewish engineers and conductors working for the Palestine railroad that passed through town, Arabic-speaking bearded Jews riding by donkey to purchase bags of cement at the local factory, with Jewish tailors, Jewish photographers, Jewish seamstresses, Jewish physicians, and doctors that served for the whole society would be remembered as a natural part of the Palestine land.⁹⁷

After the starting of chaos, some tried to keep the road open between the communities and pursued hope for a peaceful settlement: Some Arab leaders in al-Ramla and neighboring Lydda maintained contact with their Jewish neighbors even in the midst of the fighting.⁹⁸ They struggled to help their Palestinian Muslim neighbors. A Jewish farmer, known as Shlomo the stranger, a neighbor from Na'an, galloped into the village on horseback warning seriously and shouting "The Jewish

⁹⁶ Tolan, *ibid* p.XI.

⁹⁷ Tolan, *ibid*, p.34.

⁹⁸ Tolan, *ibid*, p.90.

army is coming! You must leave, or you will be killed” and the villagers moved to al-Ramla assuming they would return as soon as the danger had passed.⁹⁹

Some of them rejected to fight against the Palestinians and felt miserable and a great number of people protested Israel’s policies. In the wake of Six Day War for the new role of Israel as occupier, a soldier carried on “It’s an absolutely lousy feeling being in a conquering army.”¹⁰⁰ The Sabra and Shatilla massacres shocked the world provoking outrage in Israel where thousands of protestors including Dalia and Yehezkel demanded a formal inquiry, objected to the act.¹⁰¹ Among the growing number of voices in Israel rises in protest against its policies, one of the most prominent was a young Israeli sergeant, an observant Orthodox Jew, Yishai Rosen-Zvi stating “I won’t take part in a siege enforced against hundreds of thousands of people, including women and children... I won’t starve entire villages and prevent their residents from getting to work each day or to medical check-ups, I won’t turn them into hostages of political decisions. A siege against cities, like bombing raids from helicopters does not stop terror...”¹⁰²

Significant attempts helping to please the other cannot be disregarded. Ghiath’s house was a school now and when they asked to see the house, the principal showed hospitality and let them to walk through the rooms after the class period.¹⁰³ Dalia seemed to be a candle in a darkened room, with her open-minded, sympathetic different attitudes. Dalia allowed them to see the house smiling broadly.¹⁰⁴ She wanted to make them feel welcome and comfortable. Opening her house to its old owners, welcomed them, received warmth and Arab hospitality, hence Bashir comprehended that “every Israeli was not the enemy.”¹⁰⁵ Moreover Dalia wrote the story of the Eshkenazis, the Khairis and the house, and the warm personal connection they experienced across the gulf of political differences to release the realities, the facts of life in Palestine.¹⁰⁶ Dalia tries to retell the reality of the story of the house and the Arab side to the Jewish readers and she confesses:

⁹⁹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.95-96.

¹⁰⁰ Tolan, *ibid*, p.239.

¹⁰¹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.308.

¹⁰² Tolan, *ibid*, p.364.

¹⁰³ Tolan, *ibid*, p.29.

¹⁰⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p.223.

¹⁰⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, p.252.

¹⁰⁶ Tolan, *ibid*, p.301.

It was very painful for me, as a young women 20 years ago, to wake up to few then well hidden facts. For example, we were all led to believe that the Arab population of Ramla and Lod had run away before the advancing Israeli army in 1948, leaving everything behind in a rushed and cowardly escape. This belief reassured us. It was meant to prevent guilt and remorse. But after 1967, I met not only you, but also an Israeli Jew who had personally participated in the expulsion from Ramla and Lod. He told me the story as he had experienced it, and as Yitzhak Rabin later confirmed in his memoirs. My love for my country...was losing its innocence... some change in perspective was beginning to take place in me.¹⁰⁷

Acting fairly, she called the deportation of Bashir and others as “violation of human rights.”¹⁰⁸ Considering the house involving two families, two histories, endless circle of the pain to address the honor of the families; Dalia wanted to do something to heal the wounds and they agreed the house to become a pre-school, Open House, for the Arab children of Israel as Bashir wished.¹⁰⁹ It was a good start providing nice time for the Arab children who needed to joy there and deserved to have their childhood. A center for Arab-Jewish coexistence at Open House, in its fifth year, more willingness had been seen among Israelis to engage in Arab-Jewish dialogue.¹¹⁰

When accusing the other for the cause of the troubles, and the attacks, retaliations, and counter reprisals took the hold of the society. Yitzhak Rabin who could make a difference and struggled for accommodation and peace said that “Enough bereavement. Now we have to struggle for peace. This is the most challenging of all wars- the war for peace” had been shot destroying any changes for accommodation at least for a long time.¹¹¹ He, as an Israeli Jew participating personally in the expulsion from Ramla and the head of the conservative wing of the Labor Party toward the Israel; Political center, verified the Palestinian claims and honored them saying that “As a soldier, I feel that these people have fought with a

¹⁰⁷ Tolan, *ibid*, p. 301-302.

¹⁰⁸ Tolan, *ibid*, p.304.

¹⁰⁹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.287-288.

¹¹⁰ Tolan, *ibid*, p.344.

¹¹¹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.347-348.

courage that deserves respect.... They deserve to have an entity...”¹¹² He respected to the Palestinians, their experiences, their courage with an empathetic dealing.

The terrible outlooks of Palestinians were also displayed international news agencies. “Practically everything in their way died” stated the *Chicago Sun Times*, “armored cars swept through the town, spraying it with machine-gun fire” was recounted by New York Times reporter, “the corpses of Arab men, women, and even children strewn about in the wake of ruthlessly brilliant charge” depicted the New York Herald Tribune’s reporter.¹¹³

By the time the relief officials imparted growing alarm over malnourished children of Palestine, the countries from all over the world did their share; 1000 tons of wheat by Australia, 150 tons of fruit by France, 200 Tons of potatoes by Ireland, 20 tons of olive oil by Italy, 50 tons each of peas and bean by Netherlands, 600 tons of rice and sugar by Indonesia, 50 tons of fish by *Norwes*, 50 tons of meat by South Africa, medical supplies by the American Red Cross, 500 bales of clothing, 175 pound of vitamins and \$ 25000 toward the purchase of flour in Egypt by Christian charities, \$200000 toward the purchase of baby food by the Arab American oil company and shipped first-aid boxes, syringes, typhoid, cholera vaccines, two trainloads of wheat and boxcar full of milk by other agencies were sent.¹¹⁴

2.4. Nationalism in *The Lemon Tree*

The Lemon Tree mainly narrates nationalism and exemplifies the process of developing national identity in Palestine. It deals with how the national identities of Israeli and Palestinians are formed and strengthened. A great number of literary works are produced solely for the purpose of highlighting the awareness of national memory. John Milton mentions of Israel’s Restoration in his famous poem *Paradise Regained* and underlines that the restoration would be by some metaphysical and miraculous events rather than by force:

Yet He at length, the time to himself best known
Remembering Abraham, by some wondrous call
May bring them back repentant and sincere,

¹¹² Tolan, *ibid*, p.300-302.

¹¹³ Tolan, *ibid*, p.106.

¹¹⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p.153.

And at their passing cleave the Assyrian flood,
While to their native land with joy they haste,
As the Red Sea and Jordan once He cleft,
When to the Promised Land their fathers pass'd;
To his due time and providence I leave them.¹¹⁵

Lord Byron, Water Scott, Robert Browning William Wordsworth, George Eliot were other literary figures dealing with Jewish question on romantic field, focusing on their national misfortunes, their admired encouragements, loyal characters, national independence and so on.¹¹⁶ Moreover famous literary figures like Lord Byron, Coleridge, James Joyce and Alexander Pope marked a subjective portrait of a Jew.¹¹⁷ In addition to the writers and poets, famous philosophers like John Locke, Kant, Fichte, Isaac Newton, and Pascal tried to justify the suggestion that Palestine was the real and inherent land of the Jews.

Throughout history, educational curriculum is intertwined with principles of national history. It was taught to Jews that “Arabs had fled like cowards, with their hot soup still steaming on the table” to rationalize their settling.¹¹⁸ Also for the Palestinians, the refugee children were the ones affected by the changing life conditions and expressing the wish for return would recite at the beginning of each school day:

Our aim is to return
Death doesn't frighten us,
Palestine is ours,
We shall never forget her.
Another homeland we shall never accept!
Our Palestine, witness, O God and History
We promise to shed our blood for you¹¹⁹

¹¹⁵ Qtd in Regina Shariff, *Non-Jewish Zionism*, Zed Press, London, 1983, p.34.

¹¹⁶ Sharif, *ibid*, p.43-47.

¹¹⁷ Sharif, *ibid*, p.34.

¹¹⁸ Tolan, *ibid*, p.27.

¹¹⁹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.161.

Zionism is surely an important political issue supporting Jewish people legally and ensuring homeland for them in Palestine.¹²⁰ It is not a problem implanted and cultivated merely by Jews; its roots go back to non-Jewish policies rather than the publication of Theodor Herzl's *Der Judenstaat* in 1996, which is regarded as the birth of Jewish political Zionism.¹²¹ It does not coincidence that from the biggest powers on earth like USA and England to Palestine neighbors try to do their best to realize the Zionist dream in Palestine. By means of the translation of Bible into the vernacular, the Old Testament conduced to familiarize the Western thought with the history, traditions and laws of the Hebrews and the land of Palestine hereby "The Old Testament Stories and characters became as familiar as bread."¹²² The manipulated historical process of Zionism concerning only the Jewish presence begins though the instrument of the propagation of these stories.¹²³ Everything related to Hebrew was glorified and overvalued, for example Hebrew language was asserted "as the Holy Tongue (Leshan Ha-Kodesh), the language in which God had revealed himself to his people."¹²⁴ The emigration, the journey to Israel was regarded a return after two thousand years of exile, an opportunity to keep the Talmudic promise, "He who makes four steps in Israel, all his sins will be forgiven,"¹²⁵ the holiness of the emigration was strengthened. Zionism, the political movement encouraged to the emigration of European Jews to the Holy Land proposing to "arrange their life in Syria and Palestine by setting in the field for agricultural work" and the vision of a Promised land where they could live as free man on their own soil.¹²⁶

Due to the imperialist racist perception of the West, the issue continues insoluble, damaging and otherizing the Palestinian side. In fact, in the modern world, Zionist colonization of Palestine addresses to larger European colonial movement. Zionism is a natural output of colonialism, imperialism and anti-Semitism. The political and economic significance of Palestine enabling control over Mediterranean Sea makes the land important for the Western countries. Jewish settlement in Palestine was of great concern for the British, for three main reasons during 19th

¹²⁰ Qtd in Shariff, *ibid*, p.1.

¹²¹ Sharif, *ibid*, p.3.

¹²² Sharif, *ibid*, p.13.

¹²³ Sharif, *ibid*, p.13-14.

¹²⁴ Qtd in Sharif, *ibid*, p.14.

¹²⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, p.133.

¹²⁶ Qtd in Tolan, *ibid*, p.120.

century: “the European balance of power, the security of India as threatened by France and Russia, and the unimpaired transit route to India via Syria.”¹²⁷ A Muslim traveler wrote of al-Ramla by the tenth century depicted it as a fine, well-built city with its good and plentiful water, abundant luscious fruit, with advantages of its location in the midst of beautiful villages and lordly towns, close to holy places, with the facility of commerce and easy livelihood, with its well-favored lands.¹²⁸ In 1930s when the town was housed and used as a colonial office by British forces, a British sub commissioner filed briefings periodically to his Majesty’s government in London noting the crops and tonnage.¹²⁹

The major powers of Christian world (the U.S., Britain, France, Germany, Canada and Russia) have tried to justify the use of military power to destroy the Palestinian nation and have utilized the political, economic and military beneficiaries of the destruction. America also tries to justify the Jewish national Restoration on Palestine, and a well-known American world traveler, fundamentalist, evangelist, and author William E. Blackstone offers the following solution:

Why not give Palestine back to them [the Jews] again? According to God’s distribution of the nation it is their home, an invaluable possession from which they were expelled by force. Under their cultivation it was a remarkably fruitful land, sustaining millions of Israelites, who industriously tilled its hillsides and valleys. They were agriculturists and producers as well as a nation of great commercial importance – the center of civilization and religion. Why shall not the powers which under the treaty of Berlin, in 1878, *gave Bulgaria to the Bulgarians and Servia to the Servian now give Palestine back to the Jews?*¹³⁰

“Today it is still a little known fact that Napoleon Bonaparte was the first statesman to propose a Jewish state in Palestine, 118 years before the Balfour Declaration. Weizman even called Napoleon “the first of the modern non-Jewish Zionists.”¹³¹ Surely it was something he wanted just to serve for imperial and commercial wishes of France rather than Biblical orders.

¹²⁷ Sharif, *ibid*, p.43.

¹²⁸ Qtd in Tolan, *ibid*, p.36.

¹²⁹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.36.

¹³⁰ Qtd in Shariff, *ibid*, p.92.

¹³¹ Qtd in Shariff, *ibid*, p.51.

Theodor Herzl's *The Jewish State* proposed the vision of a 'Promised Land' where they could live as free men on their own soil regarded the heart of Israel and had already become a hero to Jews in Bulgaria.¹³² He was met by great numbers of people with exaltation. Herzl emphasized that the Jews were hated with their hooked noses, black or red beards and bandy legs and wished to live without being despised for them and to live at peace with all the world like the German, the Englishman, the Frenchman, like all of the civilized peoples and as a matter of course, he was praised as the leader of the new Jewish nationalism with his utopian ideas.¹³³ On his way back from Istanbul to get the support of Ottoman Empire to establish a Jewish State, Herzl, was welcomed with great sensation, amazing public demonstration and exaggeration.¹³⁴

A great number of young men signed up to become freedom fighters, namely sacrifice.¹³⁵ They would rather be dead than a free man in exile, stateless. To protest the arbitrary treatment, injustice and injury, young men teenagers became involved in the revolt and war.¹³⁶ On Dalia's offer of nonviolent approach Bashir clarified the predicament they experienced: "Dalia. I have tried to go back to Palestine on board the Ship of Return (Al-Awda), following the Gandhi's road. I did not carry a missile or a bomb.... I was carrying my history and my love for my homeland. But what was the result, Dalia? The ship was sunk before it sailed. It was sunk while it was docked in a Cypriot port. They sunk it so that we would not return... Why aren't we given our right to return? Why are we prevented from determining our future and establishing our state..."¹³⁷ Bashir expressed his sob story and deep pain: "Do you know, Dalia that in 1948, with childhood innocence, I played with one of the booby-trapped toys that were scattered by the Zionists-Stern, the Haganah and Irgun? The gifts of the terrorist Zionist organizations to the children of Palestine... The booby-trapped toy exploded in my left hand to crush my palm, to scatter my bones and flesh. And shed my blood...." and as a result of explosion in Gaza, "six year old Bashir lost four fingers and the palm of his left hand". The call of the Jewish State gave rise to opposition against the Jewish and the natives desired to detach the

¹³² Tolan, *ibid*, p.120.

¹³³ Tolan, *ibid*, p.121.

¹³⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p.121.

¹³⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, p.220.

¹³⁶ Tolan, *ibid*, p.290.

¹³⁷ Tolan, *ibid*, p.326.

Jewish people.¹³⁸ So Bashir saw the actions against the Jews as a kind of legitimate resistance.¹³⁹

For those who stay, it is an inevitable fact to feel alienated from the state and neighborhood. Landscape alienation by dominant force, and restore the environment are conscious steps for nation building process. By the spring of 1948, little was left to debate, as the factories had been nationalized and property seized for the state the Jews started to ruin the lives of Arabs to heal their ruined lives. When the 3 cousins walked on the streets where they were raised, they came by the unfamiliar streets all of which had at least new names with indecipherable Hebrew lettering.¹⁴⁰ Dalia remembers that when she was about seven or eight years old, she climbed up the black metal gate which Ahmad Khairi had placed at the end of the stone path in front of the yard. There was a delicate piece of wrought iron in the shape of a star and crescent: the symbol was not an Arab house and grasped the delicate crescent, and threw it away.¹⁴¹

Exile is one of the central themes resulted from the conflict that influences any character in the novel. Simone Weil, a Jewish philosopher, notes that feeling rooted somewhere you belong is one of the most significant needs of human being.¹⁴² As a result of being lack of content and the sense of security the Palestinians in exile have problems in their daily lives. On the way of visiting his homeland, Bashir's emotions were beyond the description. "It was the breath, the currency, the bread of his family, of nearly every family he knew. It was what everyone talked about, all the time: return. In exile there was little else worth dreaming of."¹⁴³ Also to express her misery on their exile, Ghiath, Bashir's sister, says that "I would rather sleep under a lamppost in al-Ramla than in a palace in Ramallah."¹⁴⁴ The complexities of Khairi's experiences as a result of exile is on focus throughout the story. Especially Ahmad Khairi experiences the conflicts of identity and belonging. After Ahmad Khairi's death Zakia Khairi tells to Dalia his situation "whenever he felt troubled at night and

¹³⁸ Tolan, *ibid*, p.327.

¹³⁹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.250.

¹⁴⁰ Tolan, *ibid*, p.28.

¹⁴¹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.182.

¹⁴² Qtd in Victoria Mason, "Children of the 'Idea of Palestine': Negotiating Identity, Belonging and Home in the Palestinian Diaspora," *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 28:3, 2008, p.274.

¹⁴³ Tolan, *ibid*, p.21.

¹⁴⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p.316.

could not sleep, he would pace up and down their rented apartment in Ramallah, holding a shrived lemon in his hands”, it was the lemon which your father had given Ahmad on his visit the house he built.¹⁴⁵ His situation reminds that the trees are regarded as central figures that bridge the perceived physical and emotional distance between homeland and diaspora.¹⁴⁶ The physical characteristic of trees is used help to evoke imaginary of family, relatedness and national community.¹⁴⁷ Because “behind every Palestinian, there is a great general fact that he once so long ago lived in a land of his own called Palestine, which is no longer his homeland.”¹⁴⁸

Whereas the Palestinian refugees left their homes and properties hoping to return and get them after chaos, the Israeli had already planned not to let them return anymore. The refugees would have the right of return and they never stopped longing for their native land. “In the re-creation of Palestine through such ‘acts of memory’, Palestine was made tangible to an almost sensory level where children born in the diaspora could describe their family’s house down to the texture of the bricks, the position of an olive tree in the yard or the scent from a decades-old lemon tree.”¹⁴⁹

Violation of human rights came out such a level that the Israelis lost their humanity and the Palestinians could not maintain their lives. Israel defied the United Nation’s solutions and proposal of peace and justice and dared to deport Bashir and other three Palestinians unrighteous.¹⁵⁰ The Arabs of Israel lived under martial law for several years and those wishing to move were required special permit from Israeli authorities.¹⁵¹ The case of Rasmiah Odeh who was jailed in connection with the Supersol bombing and whose father was taken to the prison to witness his daughter’s interrogation shows the barbarity of the conflict explicitly. Her father expresses:

When they took me back Rasmiah couldn’t stand on her own feet lying on the floor and there were bloodstains on her coats. Her face was blue and she had a black eye... They were beating me and beating her, and we both screaming. Rasmiah was still saying: ‘I know nothing’ And they spread her

¹⁴⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, p.302.

¹⁴⁶ Qtd in Joanne C. Long, “Routing Diaspora, Reviving Nation: Zionist Landscapes of Palestine-Israel”, *Transactions of Institute of British Geographers*, 34(2008), p.65.

¹⁴⁷ Long, *ibid*, p.71.

¹⁴⁸ Edward Said, *The Question of Palestine*, Vintage Book, 1992, p.115.

¹⁴⁹ Qtd in Mason, *ibid*, p.273.

¹⁵⁰ Tolan,*ibid*, p. 292.

¹⁵¹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.174.

legs and shoved the stick into her. She was bleeding from her mouth and from her face and from her end. Then I became unconscious.¹⁵²

The development and maintenance of a national identity give rise to unbearable pains and in other respects, crime against humanity. The lives of ordinary people become unliveable for the sake of self-definition. After all is said and done, severity reproduces severity and hatred.



¹⁵² Tolan, *ibid*, p. 256.

CHAPTER THREE

AYŞE KULİN AND THE TRACES OF NATIONALISM IN *SEVDALINKA*

3.1. Ayşe Kulin's Life and Her Works

Ayşe Kulin was born on 7 September 1941 in Istanbul. She studied at Literature Department at Arnavutköy American Women College.¹⁵³ She starts to write at secondary school and decides to be writer after her graduation from college. After getting married, she lived in Rome, Paris and London. She started to study Sociology at London School of Economics but could not complete it.¹⁵⁴ She worked as editor and reporter for different newspapers. Also she served as stage producer, art director, and scenarist at television, advertisement and movies for long years.¹⁵⁵ Between 1977 and 1982 she wrote for the newspaper, *Cumhuriyet*, then for a short time worked for newspaper *Dünya*, and for a long time her writings were published on the magazines of Sabah Group.¹⁵⁶ Her writings have been translated into many different languages and she has become a globally known Turkish writer. Some of her works like *Güneşe Dön Yüzünü*, *Köpri*, *Gece Sesleri*, *Türkan* and *Veda* were adapted to cinema and TV series. She has received many prestigious awards both national and international.

Kulin is interested in Bosnian-Serbian conflict and describes herself being descended of Bosniak origin.¹⁵⁷ In *Sevdalinka*, in the chapter named “Bosniaks” she expresses being connected to Ban Kulin who was sent to Bosnia formerly by the Hungarian to manage there. Moreover; her mother is of Cherkes origin, so her personality and literary identity have been shaped under these multicultural conditions.¹⁵⁸ Her family's cosmopolitan structure is high lightened in her narratives;

¹⁵³ <http://edebiyat.fakultesi.com/kopru1.htm>.

¹⁵⁴ <http://m.biografi.info./kisi/ayse-kulin>.

¹⁵⁵ Gülsemin Hazer, “Bir Varoluş Mücadelesinin Romanı; *Sevdalinka*”, 1. Uluslar arası Balkanlarda Tarih ve Kültür Kongresi, 2006, p.63.

¹⁵⁶ <http://m.biografi.info./kisi/ayse-kulin>.

¹⁵⁷ Qtd in Demet Yener& Cumhur Aslan, “*Sevdalinka ve İnsanlık Ayağa Kalk Romanlarında Bosna Savaşındaki Toplumsal Yapı ve İlişkilerin Oluşumsal Yapısalıcı Eleştirisi*, *Journal of Awareness*, Vol: 3.2, 2018, p.34.

¹⁵⁸ Qtd in Vedat Yeşilçiçek, “Ayşe Kulin'nin Hayatı , Sanatı ve Eserleri”, Unpublished Thesis, Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Entitüsü, 2010, p.28.

not only in *SevdaLinka*, but also in *Nefes Nefese, Adı: Aylin* and many other stories.¹⁵⁹ When Kulin talks about her perspective on life, objectives in novel, her historical biography, her experiences and ideological state, she underlines that:

I make every novel and the characters giving life to it, speak according to their own culture and environment. Fiction allows anything, but I prefer to direct reader with real images. That is, the characters, the date, and the place should be persuasive for reader. Accordingly, to me, even at the most fictional texts, it is necessary to avoid being artificial. Surely, this constructs the centre of the cases which I create. For example, my family has lived in exile and I have felt this to the bones, lived this misery and trauma. I have listened from the first hand... What is migration? What is being extirpated from the homeland? How and to what does this cost? I know which miseries it causes. Hence it is not difficult for me to emphasize. The reflections of these details on my novel as real scene are the genuine essence of my authorship and literary personality.¹⁶⁰

As she specifies her personal background assists her with a great deal of intriguing subjects and plots. Originated from real life experiences, her works naturally offer satisfying and attractive reading.

She focuses on love, religion, migration, the sentiment of homeland, conflict, the matter of family, social life, historical awareness, familial affairs, happiness, human, personal relations, self confidence, resolution, the conflict of traditions and modernism, Western life style, feminist factors, didactic discipline in her works.¹⁶¹

Her stories are:

Güneşe Dön Yüzünü (1984)

Foto Sabah Resimleri (1997)

Geniş Zamanlar (1998)

Bir Varmış Bir Yokmuş (2007)

Taş Duvar Açık Pencere (2009)

¹⁵⁹ Yeşilçiçek, ibid,p.34.

¹⁶⁰ Yeşilçiçek, ibid,p.49 (Translations are done by me).

¹⁶¹ Yeşilçiçek, ibid,p.323-454.

Her Essays are:

Babama (2002)

İçimde Kızıl Bir Gül Gibi (2002)

Researches and Biographic Writings are:

Kardelenler (2002)

Sit Nene`nin Masalları (2008)

Türkan (2009)

Her novels are:

Adı: Aylın (1997)

Bir Tatlı Huzur (1996)

Sevdalinka (1999)

Fureya (2001)

Köprü (2002)

Nefes Nefese (2004)

Gece Sesleri (2007)

Bir Gün (2005)

Veda (2007)

Umut (2008)¹⁶²

Türkan (2009)

Hayat- Dürbünümde Kırk Sene 1941-1964 (2011)

Hüzün- Dürbünümde Kırk Sene 1964-1983 (2011)

Bora`nın Kitabı (2012)

Dönüş (2013)

¹⁶² Yeşilçiçek, ibid, p.62-63.

Gizli Anların Yolcusu (2013)

Hayal (2014)

Handan (2014)

Tutsak Güneş (2015)

Kanadı Kırık Kuşlar (2016)

Kördüğüm (2017)¹⁶³

3.2. The Summary of *Sevdalinka*

Sevdalinka, which means Bosnian songs, often concerns love, intense longing, love's yearnings along with historic events.¹⁶⁴ "The word 'Sevdah' (Sevda, karasevda) in the Turkish language reflects the longing and torment of lover, its root is based in Arabic language 'sewda' and is reference to black bile."¹⁶⁵ "Sevdalinka, like most of the forms of music, has been connected with cultural and sometimes political nationalism, which are often intertwined."¹⁶⁶ Sevdalinka can also be correlated to good mood, desire enjoyment, urge and the state of being slightly inebriated.¹⁶⁷

In general, the novel is written within an optimist/humanist approach and praises the multicultural structure of Yugoslavia. The approach of Western Countries towards the conflict, the results of oppression, worsening life conditions and psychology of ordinary people are questioned. Thereby it has been published in Bosnian and Serbian language.¹⁶⁸ Ayşe Kulin explains the objective of writing the novel introducing the misery of the Bosnian nation who were consistently massacred by crusader army before Ottoman Empire, by Serbians and Croatians after the First and Second World Wars and the War of 1992 because of the religious matter to the

¹⁶³ <http://m.biografi.info/kisi/ayse-kulin>.

¹⁶⁴ Risto Pekka Pennanen, "Melancholic Airs of the Orient- Bosnian *Sevdalinka* Music as an Orientalist and National Symbol", *Studies across Disciplines in the Humanities and Social Sciences* 9, p.78.

¹⁶⁵ Sibel Bayram, "The Geography of Women in Ayşe Kulin's *Sevdalinka*", *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, Vol:5.23, 2012, p.103.

¹⁶⁶ Pennanen, *ibid*, p.86.

¹⁶⁷ Pennanen, *ibid*, p.79.

¹⁶⁸ Yeşilçiçek, *ibid*, p.51.

Turkish nation.¹⁶⁹ *Sevdalinka* is based on real life events. It is a historical, documentary novel including real facts, individuals, information, history and documents. She uses historical evidences, documentaries, news, and reports to interpret the real conditions. Kulin admits that the subject is handled documentarily and the characters are fictional except for the historical and political persons.¹⁷⁰ She gives the list of references at the end.¹⁷¹ This is what makes it a documentary novel.

Sevdalinka tells the story of a forbidden love, an infidelity with the narrative of Bosnian War including political, cultural, and ideological developments and identifies conflicts and the outputs of the war. It tells the story of break up a family together with that of the Yugoslavia. It deals with the events between 1986-1993 both related to Nimeta and Bosnia. *Sevdalinka* describes the events in Sarajevo from September, 1986. Nimeta the protagonist of the novel is married to Burhan, a construction engineer, who frequently goes out of Sarajevo for work, and they have two children, a son named Fiko and a daughter Hana. Burhan is an understanding but indifferent spouse. Nimeta, a Bosnian woman, is a reporter and during one of her business trip, she meets with Stefan Stefanovic, a Croatian reporter, then she starts to cheat her husband with him. She perceives her relationship with Burhan as mundane and her affair with Stefan exciting. She struggles between her secret affair and her family and chooses her family but later Burhan finds out the infidelity and leaves the house and decides to fight for Bosnian Independence. Although Fiko does not know anything, he considers that his mother is responsible for his father's going and decides to join Bosnian war power with his uncle Raif, who has lost his wife and son because of the Serbian atrocity.

Peaceful lives of different ethnic groups are of great concern. Besides the relationship of Nimeta and Stefan, that of Mirsada of Bosnian origin and Petar of Serbian origin underlines the multicultural structure of Bosnia. Nimeta's friends, the newspaper employees, the architecture of Bosnia are also used to exemplify the multicultural reality. Nimeta displays a strong personality. In addition to her responsibilities towards her family as classical image of a woman, she takes her work at the centre and deals with her country's situation. As Stefan and Nimeta are

¹⁶⁹ Kulin, *ibid*, p. IX.

¹⁷⁰ Kulin, *ibid*, p. IX.

¹⁷¹ Kulin, *ibid*, p.337-338.

reporters, the atrocities done to Bosnians, genocide and changing life conditions in Bosnia come at the centre shadowing the secret affair. The novel depicts a clear case of polarization both in Bosnia and in Nimeta's heart: her hearth is similar to Bosnia; shattered, struggling for survival, full with misery.¹⁷² It describes the scramble of Bosnian nation before and during the liberty war, cruelties of the Serbians and the Croatians, the apathy of other countries to Bosnia with documents. Nimeta's story ends at the ambulance during Fiko's struggle for life in 1993 but at the end of the novel the war is summarized as it went on until 26 February 1996. Finally both Nimeta's life and the Bosnian War are not clearly concluded, so the novel ends with a complicated drama and hope.

3.3. Multiculturalism in *Sevdalinka*

Bosnia was a symbol of mosaic culture with its synagogues, mosques, Orthodox and Catholic churches standing side by side, with its tolerant people skilled at speaking different languages and respecting various traditions. The two towers Uzeyir and Momo, the first is symbol of Islam and the second is symbol of Christianity were built so as to signify the colorful and elaborated ethnic identity of Bosnia. Kulin stresses the multicultural structure of Bosnia in the novel and states:

Not only the Muslims, but also thousands of people living in Bosnia from different religions and different ethnic groups attended to the movement of "DON'T DIVIDE BOSNIA."

The march started with a small group in the west of the city. As they made their way to the city center, people from every neighborhood, from every street, from every building, started to join the convoy in groups.

Bosniaks, Serbs, Croats, Muslims, Orthodox, Catholics, and Jews, women and men of different ages, who have lived in Bosnia for centuries, have lived together in harmony; they were walking with Tito's paintings and Yugoslavian flags in their hands, in a glimpse of color and emotion, in every step, believing in their missions, not to divide the world's beautiful cities with

¹⁷² Hazer, *ibid*, p.71.

shame. All the Bosnians, the young and old both walked and sincerely believed that there will never be war in their small country.

They've been living together for five hundred years. They had never separated their neighborhoods, workplaces or schools. After the Tito revolution, this cohesion seemed to wipe out any ethnic and religious distinctions in their daily lives. Every child, from the moment she was born, was growing up as the closest friend to her, whoever the child in the neighboring house was.

Aliyas with Boris, Boris with Jankos played in the same gardens and yards, studied at the same schools. Serbian women could go to bed with Muslim men without taking offense and likewise the Muslims with the Catholics. People with different beliefs and origins would become friends, colleagues, partner or get marry. Bosnians formed a mosaic that enriched and beautified because of having different religions and races.¹⁷³

Moreover, in Yugoslavia, everyone is brother and everyone is related. For at least seventy years they have been marrying each other without having reservations. That is neighbors and relatives are gonna shoot each other? You worried in vain.¹⁷⁴

As Cleary proposes “in most instances the conflicting communities have been so intermixed, however, that partition could not finally deliver the ‘clean cut’ it was supposed to do.”¹⁷⁵ The reason of attendance to the movement was that they were aware of the mosaic formation of Bosnia, lived together wiped out any kind of discrimination on daily life, became friends of the neighbors, got married each other disregarding their origin and being proud of the diversities.¹⁷⁶ Sonya of Serbian origin, Ibo of Jewish origin, Nimeta of Bosnian Muslim origin were arm-in-arm and shoulder to shoulder.¹⁷⁷ Mirsada is a Bosnian woman whereas her darling Peter is a Serbian. They even acquire some phrases of other religions; when Stefan as a Serbian Orthodox, talked to the hairdresser, answered him “inşallah” and the

¹⁷³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.104-105. (Translations are done by me).

¹⁷⁴ Kulin, *ibid*, p.63. (Translations are done by me).

¹⁷⁵ Joe Cleary, *Literature Partition and Nation State*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2002, p.22.

¹⁷⁶ Kulin, *ibid*, p.105.

¹⁷⁷ Kulin, *ibid*, p.105.

hairdresser was confused by his words and added that his grandmother was a Muslim too, emphasizing the mosaic structure of Balkans.¹⁷⁸

Tito's army under the communist rule consisted of the people of all the major Yugoslav ethnic and religious groups struggled for a unified Yugoslavia together. The peaceful atmosphere, the era of brotherhood and unity provided by Tito began to change after Tito's death and the nationalist demands of a Greater Serbia naturally Serbian domination reactivated.¹⁷⁹ When Burhan was called and urged to hand over his company that was in Knin under Serbian domination, he was told that the municipality didn't want the strangers to exist within the boundaries of Serbian authority, he was bothered by the phrase of strangeness and answered "five hundred-year strangeness could have been a well song if you identified the Bosnians as stranger, which adjective would you ascribe to the non-Yugoslavs? Do you call them Martian?"¹⁸⁰

Despite the dehumanization of both perpetrators and the target population, as a result of multicultural structure of Bosnia, some resisted to keep their humanity. Bosnian Muslim survivors generally reported that a Serbian or (in case of Croat violence) a Croat helped them to escape.¹⁸¹ Thousands of Serbs is mentioned to refuse to fight and torture, so they were exposed to punishment. Melika Kreitmayer, a chief gynecologist of an investigation into mass rape by Serbian forces "reported cases of some young women who were abducted and taken to a house, but released without being raped after having been instructed to tell others they had been."¹⁸² Stefan Stefanović, even if he wasn't a Bosnian Muslim, wished to make an investigation on Bosnian refugees (in refugee camps) and to bring to the attention of international public opinion. He also worried about the conflict and yearned the peaceful days in the country. The sensitive people did their best to release the truth like Stefan and Petar.

Media took important role on inciting and motivating the society. TV helped to spread the renewed interest in genocide, mass killings, inhumanity, justice and human rights paradigm. Even though the world shut its ears and eyes to the atrocity

¹⁷⁸ Kulin, *ibid*, p.190.

¹⁷⁹ Sells, *ibid*, p.7.

¹⁸⁰ Kulin, *ibid*, p.75-76.

¹⁸¹ Sells, *ibid*, p.78.

¹⁸² Daniel Kofman, "Israel and the War in Bosnia", *This Time We Knew*, NYU Press, 1996, p.99.

in Bosnia the interviews and scenes of international television conducted to draw attention.¹⁸³ A reporter from Newsday newspaper demanded to interview with the captives in the camps and a reporter from *Guardian* was sent to Bosnia.¹⁸⁴ An English reporter went to Tuzla to see a four years old girl who had been raped and received a treatment.¹⁸⁵ She went there making great efforts risking death to announced the world the Serbian fierce. A CIA report states that “ the Serbs were the only party involved in a systematic attempt to eliminate all traces of other ethnic groups from their territory” and the systematic tune of Serbian actions strongly suggests the veiled role in the purposeful destructions of non-Serbian population”¹⁸⁶ As for the claims of the Serbs, Helsinki Watch report clarifies the situations noting that “Although some of their concerns have proven correct, others have been wildly exaggerated and, in some cases falsified.”¹⁸⁷

3.4. Nationalism in *Sevdalinka*

Cultural struggles, both state-building and state-dividing projects are complex problems demanding complex institutional solution. Political events are to be held far from a narrow sense; they construct the basis of many areas from national education system to national literatures. The action of alienating the inhabitants who would have a common cultural heritage and constructive-destructive dynamics between nations requires a long and complicated process. Instructing indigenous dwellers as wished to get political domination, subordinating military power, reformulating, redefining and reshaping them according to imperial strategies, ignoring the benefit of the native population are widely seen-way of reconstructing a region. Edward Said, the founder of academic field of Orientalism, defines the process as “to reclaim, rename, and re inhabit the alienated landscape through the imagination.”¹⁸⁸

The Bosnians were discriminated, otherised and culturally eradicated in addition to being massacred. Bosnia has been at the centre of orientalist discourses

¹⁸³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.203.

¹⁸⁴ Kulin, *ibid*, p.199.

¹⁸⁵ Kulin, *ibid*, p.211.

¹⁸⁶ Qtd in Kofman, *ibid*, p.97.

¹⁸⁷ Qtd in Kofman, *ibid*, p.98.

¹⁸⁸ Qtd in Cleary, *ibid*, p.193.

because of its Muslim Population and Ottoman influence on its culture. So the Oriental Otherness of Bosnian nation has been underlined in the Austria-Hungarian Empire (1878-1918), and in the Bosnian War (1992-1995) and its aftermath.¹⁸⁹ The Bosnians were discriminated as Burhan explains “They are changing the meaning of Bosniak on the sly. They will erase our ethnic identity; we will stay with our religious identity. Then they will soon lay claim to our nine century old country. If we were stamped as Muslim, it would be easier to be dismissed from Europe after all.”¹⁹⁰

The most important signifier of discrimination in these cases is religious dimensions of the assault. Mythology, myths of origin, religious symbols, symbol of passion, eschatological longings were used by religious nationalist in addition to history, literature, culture and art. The religions that order peace, hope and kindness were used to inspire hate, battle and murder. Religion is manipulated to motivate and justify the perpetrators, the evil. The abuse of religion doesn't depend on conscious beliefs or sincereness; rather it relies on the levels of the subconscious and mass psychology.¹⁹¹ “The term ‘ethnic’ in the expression ethnic cleansing, then is a euphemism for ‘religion’, concerning a purely extrinsic definition of the victims caused by religious identity and intrinsic feature of religious mythology that motivates and justifies the barbarity.”¹⁹²

The conflict and violence in Bosnia was a religious matter in several senses; destroying the chosen people based upon their religious identity, carrying out the violence acted with the blessing and support of Christian Church leaders, grounding the violence on religious mythology that qualifies the targeted people as race traitors and destruction of them as a sacred act.¹⁹³ The reconstruction of Serbian mythology was created under the influence of German romantic nationalism of Johann Gottfried Herder during the Serb revolt against Ottoman occupation and by key figure of Serbian romantic literary movement Vuk Karadzic regarded as the founder of modern Serbian literary consciousness, producing literary works linguistically and

¹⁸⁹ Pennanen, *ibid*, p.77.

¹⁹⁰ Kulin, *ibid*, p.109.

¹⁹¹ Sells, *ibid*, p.XV.

¹⁹² Sells, *ibid*, p.15.

¹⁹³ Sells, *ibid*, p.144.

ethnically pure of foreign contamination, as the source and voice of national spirit.¹⁹⁴ His folk epic emphasizing the importance of the story of Prince Lazar and Kosovo helped to identify the Serbian nation as a whole:

Whoever is a Serb of Serbian blood
Whoever shares with me this heritage,
And he comes not to fight at Kosovo,
May he never have the progeny
His heart desires, neither son nor daughter;
Beneath his hand let nothing decent grow
Neither purple grapes nor wholesome wheat;
Let him rust away like dripping iron
Until his name be extinguished.¹⁹⁵

As central enduring, and powerful symbol within Christianity, The Good Friday story of the crucifixion of Jesus has been of great importance and “the story of suffering and death of Jesus Christ, the divine Son in the belief of many Christians, is ritually performed and reenacted in masses and services, in sermons, in literature, and particularly during the Good Friday commemorations in Easter week in the practice of mediating on the stations of the Cross and in solemn Good Friday mass.”¹⁹⁶

A Serbian religious nationalist created a formula the manipulations of the discourse of humanitarianism and nonviolence and claimed that “Christianity was superior to Islam because Christianity forbids all violence, even in self-protection.”¹⁹⁷ “Since religious affiliations became the crucial determinant of ethnic belonging in the Balkans, ‘the Serbs’ turned to ‘haven’ for guidance in their discursive emerge and often sought mythic and theological justifications for the excess of violence in the new national vision of race, class and gender.”¹⁹⁸ Also The Serb Orthodox Church worked to serve for religious nationalist activism, magnified

¹⁹⁴ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.37-38.

¹⁹⁵ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.39.

¹⁹⁶ Sells, *ibid*, p.29.

¹⁹⁷ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.133.

¹⁹⁸ Belge & Parla, *Balkan Literatures*, Istanbul Bilgi University Press, Istanbul, 2009, p.92.

and supported the cruelty and destruction in Bosnia. A Serb priest informs on Muslims and Croats having a genocide plan against Serbs and asserts that “one who forgives is worse than one who did the bad deed in the first place.”¹⁹⁹

The Slavs were regarded as Christian by nature and any conversion from Christianity was thought as a betrayal of the Slavic race.²⁰⁰ However the Bosnians had a typical sect, religion and sense of decency that is called Bogomilism. Kulin details the sects, highlights the similarities between Bogomilism and Islamic tradition and depicts the transition process in *Sevdalinka*.²⁰¹ She also adds that because of their belief and the differences from Christianity the Bosnians have suffered from Catholics and Orthodox for years.²⁰²

The Bosnians destiny was on a quandary. Croat and Serb nationalism relies on identification of a particular branch of Christian religion and under the circumstances of such a religious nationalism a Muslim is marginalized or treated as a second-class citizen at best.²⁰³ Bosnians are dehumanized and portrayed outside the scope of reason and civilization by the other Christian Balkan people. Dragos Kalajic, Serb religious nationalist, alleged that “Slavic Muslims didn’t belong to Europe, that their culture was an unconscious expression of ‘semi-Arabic subculture’ and that the Slavic Muslims of Bosnia inherited an inferior ‘special gene’ passed on by the Ottomans from North African Arabs.”²⁰⁴ Being descendent of Ottoman and Islamic culture, the Bosnians were seen as contamination by the Orient that precludes the ethnoreligious purity of the area. Although the members of the army were to represent the whole society of Yugoslavia, it was clear that they hated media members of non-Serbian origin.²⁰⁵

According to Joe Cleary, who has studies on cultural, political and intellectual struggles, constructing national literatures is of great concern since the designed literatures aid to constitute and promote “a sense of a shared cultural inheritance and a sense of a common destiny.”²⁰⁶ “At the heart of the agitation by

¹⁹⁹ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.83.

²⁰⁰ Sells, *ibid*, p.36.

²⁰¹ Kulin, *ibid*, p.253-254.

²⁰² Kulin, *ibid*, p.254.

²⁰³ Sells, *ibid*, p.8.

²⁰⁴ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.83.

²⁰⁵ Kulin, *ibid*, p.46.

²⁰⁶ Cleary, *ibid*, p.51.

Serb radicals against the Muslims of Yugoslavia there has been a mythology which presents Slavic Muslims as Christ killers.²⁰⁷ It addresses to the central event of Serb national mythology, the martyrdom of Prince Lazar. “In 1389 the forces of the Ottoman Turkish Sultan Murat dashed at Kosovo with the Serb army led by Prince Lazar. Both Lazar and Murat were killed. In the view of Serb tradition, the death of Lazar marked the end of Serb independence and the beginning of five centuries of rule by Ottoman Empire.”²⁰⁸ The key figure in the reconstruction of the Lazar story was *vladika* Petar II Petrovic (1813-1851), better known under the name of Njegos, Njegos’s key work is *The Mountain Wreath* (*Gorski vijenac*) published in 1847 and considered by many Serb nationalist to be the central work of all Serbian literature.²⁰⁹ It “moves the conflict from the realm of blood feud into a cosmic duality of good and evil; Slavic Muslims become the ‘other’.”²¹⁰

Narrative identity that consists of “stories we tell to ourselves about ourselves and the stories we or other tell to others, or stories that are told to others about ourselves—all the stories in which we are included.”²¹¹ Of course the songs, folk poems and epics were motivating and encouraging for not only fight and independence also for domination. In order to make a territory national homeland, it is necessary to put emphasis on differentiation just for making it belong to a nation. The case of Milan Babić, a hyper nationalist Serbian leader, exemplifies the influence of narratives inherited from generation to generation. He was brought up listening the narratives of the massacre that had occurred fifteen years before he was born and he acted and maintained his life with the hatred of the fact he didn’t witness.²¹² Raif talks about the history of Bosnians and nurtures Fiko on nationalism conflict.²¹³ Fiko was deliberately taught to discriminate and plant seeds of hate and hostility by his uncle Raif throughout years.²¹⁴ That is to say, literature is used as a powerful instrument that helps to shape the process.

²⁰⁷ Sells, *ibid*, p.31.

²⁰⁸ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.31.

²⁰⁹ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.41.

²¹⁰ Sells, *ibid*, p.42.

²¹¹ Belge & Parla, *ibid*, p.279.

²¹² Kulin, *ibid*, p.54-55.

²¹³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.111.

²¹⁴ Kulin, *ibid*, p.115.

Rafael Lemkin, a Jewish lawyer who coined the term genocide, stresses that genocide does not refer to the immediate extermination of an entire nation, but rather it sparks off a planned process of different acts purposing the destructing of fundamental essences of the life of national groups listing the institutions of language, culture, the security of property, national feelings, health, dignity, liberty and human life.²¹⁵ Discrimination and othering have a corporate and cumulative identity in order that the identity has relations with and uses public institutions (universities, trading companies, governments, geographical societies), traditional learning of the Bible, the classics and philology and other specified writing such as exotic description, travel books and fiction. The aim of shelling the National Library of Bosnia-Herzegovina on 25 August, 1922 was surely “one essential component of a systematic campaign of cultural eradication.”²¹⁶ Besides documentary evidences, the traces of Bosnian Muslim people like birth records, graveyards, and work records have been eradicated.²¹⁷ The National Library, the National Museum, the Oriental Institute, the archives of Herzegovina, local museums, schools, graveyards, clock towers, ancient bridges, historic districts, marketplaces, mosques, synagogues and churches were destructed in order for annihilation of Bosnian culture.²¹⁸ In the wake of the acts of the dominant power, the people preferred to maintain their life in their homeland exemplified the idle lives. Fikret, Nimeta’s uncle, expresses his disappointment for the changes done in the country and eradication of significant foundation that symbolize the Bosnian culture like mosques and his disbelief in sincerity of the dominant groups.²¹⁹

Hyper nationalist, racist leaders and twisting the matter are important factors to encourage the nation and to strengthen the borders. Milosević, who was sent Kosovo to calm down the Serbians not to excite, provoked the crowd bawling that “nobody can beat you in this land, nobody can leer you” though there were nobody beating the Serbians and there was no police, who was left not being beaten, knocked or stoned by the Serbians.²²⁰ The murdered people in any occasion are indicated as Serbs but they were not. Milosević tried to justify the action by a moral obfuscation

²¹⁵ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.24.

²¹⁶ Sells, *ibid*, p.1-2.

²¹⁷ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.3.

²¹⁸ Sells, *ibid*, p.149.

²¹⁹ Kulin, *ibid*, p.25.

²²⁰ Kulin, *ibid*, p.30.

“everyone is guilty” in this war.²²¹ Milosević, in 28 August 1987, incited and in 28 August 1989, flamed the Serbian nationalism.²²²

An aggressive armed force ousted the people who were in majority from their own land tried to reduce them to refugees on the borders of their own country. In *Sevdalinka* the starting clear point of the Bosnian-Serbian conflict is manifesto prepared by the Serbian academicians published in *Vecernje Novosti* claiming that the Serbia people, living in Croatia, are under high duress and if the precautions are not taken it was implied that big problems would be experienced throughout the Yugoslavia.²²³ The Serbs were implied to be exposed, exploited for centuries. In spite of the protest of even *Belgrad newspapers*, their leader Milosević didn't deny it.²²⁴ The declaration worried the whole society that was accustomed to live peacefully. Aleksander Rankovic, an old police spy, becoming the flag of Serbian nationalism, is one other notable figure who seminanted and greened the bad seeds of ultra-nationalism and racism.²²⁵

Due to the hatred, nationalism and racism it became impossible to live at peace as before. Even if there was no reason Mirsada was dismissed from the Serbian News Agency where she started to work just as to be close to Petar.²²⁶ Petar was obliged to change Mirsada's name because of nationalism bias:

- Will I be Miza neighborhood and Mirsada at work?
- For some people not to disturb you, Mirsada.
- Who are they?
- Yugoslavia is changing rapidly, darling, I am sure how people start to act tomorrow. I don't desire to change your name, just for favour.²²⁷

They needed to deceive people and change their identity to survive. A Serbian newsman Petar was murdered because he collaborated with a Bosnian Muslim

²²¹ Sells, *ibid*, p.86.

²²² Kulin, *ibid*, p.52.

²²³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.7.

²²⁴ Kulin, *ibid*, p.11.

²²⁵ Kulin, *ibid*, p, 8.

²²⁶ Kulin, *ibid*, p.127.

²²⁷ Kulin, *ibid*, p.39. (Translations are done by me).

Mirsada and helped her to hide her real identity.²²⁸ They slaughtered Mirsada, shooting her in the nape, breaking her backbone, chopping her, smashing...²²⁹

The ordinary men's speech would turn inevitably to the sorry state of the nations and increasingly anyone would discuss politics. Desperate civilians on each side were under heavy attack. The civilians whose pure aim was to protect their peaceful and colorful way of life in Bosnia carrying banners were shot and bombed by armed Serbian militants.²³⁰ The Serbian soldiers slaughtered the men, women and children raped the girls, stabbed the babies, trampled on Koran, cut about the family photos on the walls, and tormented the Muslims. A bus full with children under the age of 5 years got shot by snipers and all of them died.²³¹ Azra, Nimeta's neighbor, was slaughtered being bombed in bread line.²³² The Serbian women stoned and sprayed boiling water on the Bosnian women and children who were obliged to exile and carried by vans.²³³ The purpose of the war was debarring from the humane facilities like hospitals, pharmacy and so on. In Sarajevo firstly the pharmacy, the post office and health clinic were bombed, and burned.²³⁴

The case of loss deepened longing to go home and feeling safe at homeland. The people who couldn't hurt a fly were on the mountains to kill. The independence of their countries became prior to anything even themselves. It was assured that the only way for national liberation of the Arabs was armed insurrection. Burhan joined army volunteers.²³⁵ The wish of revenge makes people stronger to achieve the objective. The characters inundated with becoming Bosniak and surviving as Bosniak.²³⁶ Fikret, an example of resistant identity, a young boy at his 18 is another example of resistant identity as he rejects to migrate to Istanbul with his family and runs away from the house to fight for his motherland.²³⁷

The influence of any war on daily life is deep and serious. The trauma it causes dominates the lives of the victims. From the day his 3-month son was

²²⁸ Kulin, *ibid*, p.225.

²²⁹ Kulin, *ibid*, p. 210.

²³⁰ Kulin, *ibid*, p.106.

²³¹ Kulin, *ibid*, p.148.

²³² Kulin, *ibid*, p.212.

²³³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.211.

²³⁴ Kulin, *ibid*, p.130-132.

²³⁵ Kulin, *ibid*, p.158.

²³⁶ Kulin, *ibid*, p.163.

²³⁷ Kulin, *ibid*, p.23.

defenestrated and murdered, his young wife was raped and brutally murdered, he lost his aunt and friends at the massacre of Zvornik, Raif refused to speak and became a living dead.²³⁸ It became impossible for the Bosnians to maintain their lives at peace as before.



²³⁸ Kulin, *ibid*, p.172.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE COMPARISON OF *SEVDALINKA* AND *THE LEMON TREE*

4.1. Orientalism

Simply the othering of the Easterners as alien is called Orientalism. Orientalism is the generic term Edward Said employs to describe the Western approach to the Orient; “Orientalism is the discipline by which the Orient was (and is) approached systematically, as a topic of learning discovery, and practice.”²³⁹ The discrimination reaches such a level that it becomes a career. Said clarifies the process “Orientalism can be discussed and analyzed as the corporate institution for dealing with the Orient-dealing with it by making statements about it, authorizing views of it, describing it, by teaching it, ruling over it: in short Orientalism as a Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient.”²⁴⁰ Together with the colonial settling in Palestine, Zionism brought about numerous negative attitudes towards the native Arabs deliberately. Jewish superiority and Arab inferiority became common on any field of the life. The terminology used to describe the east and west was all once designed as to show how the east is in need of being supported by the west, thus the terms used to express the Oriental are “irrational, depraved (fallen), childlike, ‘different; whereas that of the occidental are “rational, virtuous, mature, ‘normal.’”²⁴¹ Franz Fanon, remarkable figure that struggles to represent how the Easterners are despised by the West and how they are seen inferior and backward, states in his well-known book that the dominated is even dehumanized coming down to the state of an animal.²⁴² As they are lack of the sense of liberty of propriety, invasion of the troubling East does not mean after all, but liberty and rationalization.²⁴³

Armond Freiherr Von Schweiger-Lerchenfeld claimed all Muslim peoples are the “Other” and virtually lack of positive qualities:

²³⁹ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism*, London, Penguin, 2003, p.73.

²⁴⁰ Said, *ibid*, p.3.

²⁴¹ Said, *ibid*, p.40.

²⁴² Franz Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth*, Grove Press, 2004, p.48.

²⁴³ Said, *ibid*, p.150.

The main meals always take place in the evening, namely in the hours of the day when it is not too late, at least during the warm season, to make an excursion to a vantage point where the real Muslim devotes himself entirely to contemplation and idling. The Orientals appreciate this state of *kef* – literally good mood – or the state free of all reasoning; desire for idleness and distantness, spiritual inertness. In performing *kef*, all Muslims are identical: the lively Arab, the unhurried Turk, the restless Kurd, the quarrelsome Circassian, the stale Tartar, the violent Albanian and the power-seeking Bosnian.²⁴⁴

Also Branimir Marijic, a Bosnian Franciscan monk and scholar makes a sharp distinction between the Christian West and the Islamic East which is closely akin to the typical Orientalist discourse in the following table:

<u>Christian West</u>	<u>Islamic Orient</u>
rationality	mystery
spiritual ideal of religion	carnal ideal of religion
developed culture	ancient traditions
chastity (sexual control)	unlimited (male) eroticism
song as emotional symbol	song as emotion ²⁴⁵

The powerful states did not care for the Palestinians or Bosnians and the nations were left to experience two of the worst destiny of the modern era owing to their religious beliefs. When Slovenia declared its independence all of the Europe were at her back and supported her, so there didn't exist any conflict.²⁴⁶ But the Bosnian have nowhere to go because they were on the horns of a dilemma, they were seen as Croats by Catholics and as Serbs by Orthodox.²⁴⁷ They were left to isolation.

The Arab inhabitants deported or requested to leave their place of residence; however in most of the places Israeli officials wouldn't acknowledge that forced

²⁴⁴ qtd in Pennanen, *ibid*, p.79.

²⁴⁵ Pennanen, *ibid*, p.82.

²⁴⁶ Kulin, *ibid*, p.72.

²⁴⁷ Kulin, *ibid*, p.71.

expulsion had taken place and tried to demonstrate that there was no reason whatsoever for their escape.²⁴⁸ People were left to death, murdered or were obliged to exile because of an artificial philosophy orientalism, one of the outputs of nationalism. The plan and proposal of external powers caused conflict and led to deaths as it wasn't accepted by the Arabs for its unfair sharing.

4.2. From Victim to Victor

Israel and Serbia are two examples of the guilty modernized states with regard to the atrocity seen in Palestine and Bosnia. The conflicts are experienced regardless of The Croatian Ustasha massacre over Serbs during the Second World War and Jewish massacre by Nazi regime in the first half of the 20th century. Bosnian-Serbian and Palestinian-Israeli cases indeed recall a familiar dilemma: “evil never presents itself naked on the stage of history; it always appears dressed up as itself the victim, the defender, the perhaps misunderstood struggler for survival.”²⁴⁹

The Serbian are admittedly tend to “talk about the massacre of the Serbs by the Croat Fascists in the Second World War, or dream of Greater Serbia, which dates back to the nineteenth century and beyond, even to the Battle of Kosovo of 1389, that holiest of days in Serb folk mythology.”²⁵⁰ The Serbian treated recklessly forgetting the mass crimes done against them, 300 thousand expelled Serbs from Croatia, and hundreds of houses were burned.

It is stated in *Sevdalinka* that, the Serbian people were slaughtered, otherized and humiliated, blamed of coming from a savage, primitive, oriental race by the Croat nationalist.²⁵¹ According to the Croats, the Serbs belonged to an oriental, rude and primitive race, and were villagers of the Balkans, close minded, alienated people.²⁵²

The Jews were despised, were subject to strict sanctions, curfews, and restrictions and weren't permitted to use their substantive rights in Europe. The people, the nations experienced a collective fear of annihilation, sustained the same

²⁴⁸ Tolan, *ibid*, p.150.

²⁴⁹ Kofman, *ibid*, p.107.

²⁵⁰ Qtd in Kofman, *ibid*, p.110.

²⁵¹ Kulin, *ibid*, p.53-54.

²⁵² Kulin, *ibid*, p.54.

fear on other nations. Said signifies the bewildering point of the situation “Perhaps this is the most extraordinary of exile’s fates: to have been exiled by exiles –to relive the actual process of up- rooting at the hands of exiles.”²⁵³ The Holocaust constructs the basis of one part of the myth of Israel as it was obviously used to justify the creation of Israel on the land of Palestine as a result of horror of the Holocaust²⁵⁴ Many scientific expeditions were done to prove the unconditioned causes for Jews to possess their own promised land, yet nothing found but for subjective, designed offers. Mostly the “...Balfour’s rather ambiguous and enigmatic attitudes on the Jewish Question demonstrate a case in point for our contention that Zionism, racism and anti-Semitism are all part of one phenomena: the very nature of Zionism not only accommodated anti-Semitism, but often welcomed it.”²⁵⁵ Though it is generally claimed that Zionism is a reaction for anti-Semitism, they are just counterpart since “Just like anti-Semitism Zionism expresses itself in disharmony, in strong intolerance, injustice, and in lack of understanding the opponent.”²⁵⁶ The law for the Defense of the Nation in Bulgaria proposed discrimination and restrictions against the Jews aiming to protect their own nation.²⁵⁷ “Zionism, rather than a national project, devoted to the establishment of a modern Jewish nation-state in Palestine.”²⁵⁸ The cornerstone of the Zionist theory, namely that anti-Semitism is the visa to the Jews passport into the world of modernity found its ultimate justification in the Nazi theories of racial supremacy.

In *The Lemon Tree* it is stated that the Jews were despised by the Bulgarian, the persecution of the Jews would formally begin, the sign of “Jewish Residence” were required on every Jewish home, and the Jews were subject to strict curfews; they were no longer permitted to be members of professional associations and political parties, they weren’t permitted to marry Gentiles, to enter air raid shelters, to own cars, radios or telephones, they had to wear the yellow star.²⁵⁹

²⁵³ Said, *ibid*, p.361.

²⁵⁴ Lea David, “Holocaust and Genocide Memorialisation Policies in the Western Balkans and Israel/Palestine”, *Peacebuilding*, Routledge, p.8.

²⁵⁵ Sharif, *ibid*, p.76.

²⁵⁶ Qtd in Sharif, *ibid*, p.4-5.

²⁵⁷ Tolan, *ibid*, p.61.

²⁵⁸ Qtd in Cleary, *ibid*, p.80.

²⁵⁹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.58-59.

Both the Israeli and Serbian would refuse the same fate they designed for the Bosnian and Palestinian nation. The wish of emancipation of a nation becomes trouble and fierce persecution for another nation. In an effort to achieve their nationalist goals both the Jews and the Serbians were prone to ignore and override the Palestinian and the Bosnian rights and preserve imperialist-nationalist project in their favors.

Bosnians and Palestinians were not the part that started the war, they were the part that bore arms so as to survive and defend their homeland. The conflict cannot be named as war since a war is made between armed adversaries; indeed, it is an organized destruction and deterritorialisation of largely unarmed populations. During and after the successive local wars, history brutally witnesses, tragic deaths, holocausts, cold-blooded atrocities, collective trauma, burning and ruined cities and lives, traumatic exiles, everlasting physical and spiritual wounds in Palestine and Bosnia. The relegation of minorities to second-class citizenship, forced population transfers, exile, ethnic cleansing, are just some ways of the barbarous treatments of nationality passion that desire culturally and ethnically homogeneous domains. Israel and Serbia overdid the scope of genocide they experienced in the past; they imitated or reiterated atrocities, occasionally of doing one better than the Nazis and the Croats.²⁶⁰ The suffering of the victims was so intense that, they could do nothing yet pray that they would die soon. It was a vulnerable decision or in fact preference whether to live under the domination of the other non-Muslims nation or to leave their hometown with a sense of completely homelessness and doubt.

Population transfer, a euphemism for specific practices as demographic manipulation, colonization, removals, deportation, mass expulsion and even genocide remains an extensive term in humanitarian law instruments and international human rights.²⁶¹ However population transfer collided with basic human rights. By force or by the threat of force group were transferred involuntarily with the scope of systematic policy. Population transfers in Bosnia and Palestine brought about many violations of specific rights such as the right to property; the right to enjoy the possessions, the right to privacy, the right to work, the right to self-

²⁶⁰ Qtd in David, *ibid*, p.9.

²⁶¹ Qtd in Joseph Schecla, "A Righteous Inconsistency: Applying International Norms to Population Transfer in Bosnia and Palestine", *Critique: Journal for Critical Studies of the Middle East*, 7:12, 2007, p.78.

determination, the right to social security, the prohibition of arbitrary expulsion or detainment and discrimination. The conflict means decomposed and separate families that breathe yearningly. Bosnian people are accustomed to live in migration from the end of the Ottoman domination.²⁶² From the beginning of the April, the time of declaration of Serbian Republic in Bosnia, tens of thousands of people were forcibly, excruciatingly obliged to migrate that is to exile.²⁶³ People who lived in exile, and those who are forced to migrate, both look for safe, peaceful place to maintain their life.

“For Serbia and Israel the fundamental issue is a long-term conflict dealing with an uneven, contested legacies of wars and “in both setting attempts to mandate the commemoration of past human rights abuses as one-sided and selective actually end up in the perpetuation of conflicts, not in the promotion of human rights”²⁶⁴ History witnessed a large scale of disaster, a human catastrophe, miserable humanity both in Bosnia and in Palestine on their way of exile and migration. Families were to split up, they transformed from a quiet life to a depository of misery and trauma. Malnutrition and insufficient water were on the rise, the conditions were beyond all bear for the refugees. The restrictions on food supplies were used as a key method to pressure the civilian population. During the conflict, Jewish militia had massacred hundreds of children, women and unarmed men at an Arab village, Deir Yassin and there were terrifying rumors of rape.²⁶⁵ People were left to live without electricity or running water in rubbish filled streets and alleys with running out food and medical supplies. Psychological operations, dog attacks, the beatings humiliation, torture by electricity or sticks and murdering were organized and practiced so methodically that it was undeniably systematic as a deliberate policy confinement in specially-constructed cells.²⁶⁶

Both the Arab residents of Palestine and the Muslim resident of Bosnia were forced to leave their homes. On their way of leaving, with the certain hope of coming back soon, so many people, particularly children, died of thirst and starvation. Under the explosions and shootings there was no freedom of movement. Both staying and

²⁶² Kulin, *ibid*, p.17.

²⁶³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.182.

²⁶⁴ David, *ibid*, p.2.

²⁶⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, p.92-93.

²⁶⁶ Tolan, *ibid*, p.254-254.

leaving were risky and whichever the people chose they would run a risk. The Bosnians were obliged to leave their home to the Serbians.²⁶⁷ Stefan, with his fake Serbian identity, settled in a house which was left by a Muslim family. The Palestinians were exiled and the Jews settled down in their houses, Dalia's family began to live in the house of Bashir's family. The novels deeply concern with the harsh fate of the Palestinians and Bosnians in Diaspora.

People became uprooted and the sense of futility dominates the characters. The disappointment of Nimeta's family in *Sevdalinka* and Bashir's family in *The Lemon Tree* as displaced person are unbearable. The Khairis were forced to live in exile, in diaspora, that is in misery. Ahmad felt trouble at night because of displacement. All of the Khairis, in particular Bashir, try to maintain the Palestinian identity suffering from homesickness, isolation, estrangement and lack of belonging.

From the April 1992 ten thousands of Bosniaks were obliged to migrate by means of torture or threat.²⁶⁸ The memories, the events expressed by Raziyanim, Nimeta's mother, are all full with misery and separation. After the annihilation of his town, Zvornik, Raif begins to live in exile, with the feeling of displacement and depression. Nostalgic memories of home and homeland are focus at both.

To be able to change the course of the events both most of the Palestinians like Bashir and his friends and that of the Bosnians like Burhan, Fiko and Raif try to do their best to prove the statement "we cannot let go. There is a need to keep talking and telling our story, even though it might be like a lone voice in the wilderness".²⁶⁹ The sense of disappointment, injustice and frustration made the suffering people irritable and rebellious and armed struggle was advocated by most people like Fiko, Burhan and Bashir. The people began to reason that force troubled and expelled them from their land and only force would get it back. The characters inevitably experience a similar displacement.

Israel and Serbia used their past experiences, made use of the tough break to justify their territorial expansion, suppression of the other, to provide justification even for aggression and oppression as legitimate acts of self-defense.²⁷⁰ The

²⁶⁷ Kulin, *ibid*, p.187.

²⁶⁸ Kulin, *ibid*, p. 182.

²⁶⁹ qtd in Gluck,*ibid*, p. 9.

²⁷⁰ Qtd in David, *ibid*, p.9.

historical injustice against the Serbian and the Israeli should have prevented Srebrenica genocide in Bosnia and Al-Nakba catastrophe in Palestine. The desire of dominating the policies, mastering the other, controlling economy and civil service incite and impassion them to battle. Tzvetan Todorov, a remarkable philosopher and historian, asserts that “though nobody wants actually to be a victim of genocide, it really advantages to claim to have been a victim of genocide.”²⁷¹ Hence Israel and Serbian created new victims on behalf of justice for victim nations. The four nations are ethnic groups suffering historical injustice strictly. Israeli/Serbian past experiences, their victimhood are expected to result in implementation of human rights, but instead they created new catastrophes.

4.3. The Apathy of Other States

With the purpose of acquiring and controlling the territories on the process of implantation of new settlers, the Serbian and the Israelis were given broader rights obviously. The international communities of the states took active role in peace building processes in Bosnia and Palestine, of course playing favorites. The action done in Bosnia or Palestine actually refers to removing the indigenous population in favor of an exclusive group of external people “whom the states defined under their law as having Serbian or Jewish nationality.”²⁷²

Neither Oslo Accords nor Dayton Accords achieved desired results; they were just used to rationalize the legality of the dominant nation. For instance, though the right to return or compensation was discussed in negotiation process, the basic rights never practiced fully. The rate of injustice, the Palestinian people (both outside and inside the Palestine) were exposed to, was so high that the dispossessed Palestinians could not return to their own villages even when United Nations voted that they would be permitted to come back their homes after the war; Israel rejected to acknowledge any such right and continued to devastate most of the Palestinian villages to make such a return impossible.²⁷³ The Law of Return (1950) that provides any Jew with the automatic right to live in Israel, and the Law of Citizenship (1952)

²⁷¹ Qtd in David, *ibid*, p.12.

²⁷² Qtd in Schecla, *ibid*, p.89.

²⁷³ Qtd in Cleary, *ibid*, p.40.

that grants automatic citizenship to any Jewish immigrant who wishes to come back to Israel explicitly exemplifies the double standard involved.²⁷⁴ Only few of the settlement so far have returned to their own homes in the areas controlled by other national authorities. The Dayton Accords, the settlement agreement in Bosnia-Herzegovina with the frame work of international humanitarian norm and human rights, has effectively made way for the acquisition of the land by force and naturally failed at implementing the right of return.²⁷⁵ Dayton peace agreement that terminates the war in Bosnia is an implement to divide Bosnia iniquitously. It is out of the way of proposing the real peace to the country. According to the agreement, 51 % of the country was given to Bosnian-Croat Federation, 49% of the land was given to Serbia whose population was just 34% of Bosnia before the war.²⁷⁶ Like that The Serb Civic Council formed to work for multireligious society emphasized that the population of Bosnian Serbs was less than 50 percent and criticized the international community for dealing by the religious nationalist conflict as the sole representative of the Serbian people.²⁷⁷

United Nation General Assembly determined “that Zionism is a form of racism and racial discrimination.”²⁷⁸ The declaration of the fact denies the suggestion of national liberation of Jewish people. However the problem of Zionism and the case of Palestinian people have been remarkable issues of debate for decades. Key leaders were exiled, tens of thousands were jailed, thousands were killed hundreds were executed; countless houses were demolished by the turn of 1940, by British authorities in consequence of defeating the Arab Rebellion through severe countermeasures.²⁷⁹ When the rebels were on Arab side, it was easy and necessary to interfere in whereas in the event of assault of Jewish nationalists, nothing was done to help the Arabs. In May 1947, Andrei Gromyko, the Soviet ambassador to United Nations suggested a speech to the General Assembly that the Soviet Union would support a Jewish state in Palestine.²⁸⁰ David Ben-Gurion declared Israel’s independence proclaiming that “It is the self-evident right of the Jewish people to

²⁷⁴ Qtd in Cleary, *ibid*, p.48.

²⁷⁵ Schecla, *ibid*, p.81-84.

²⁷⁶ Tolan, *ibid*, p.336.

²⁷⁷ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.78-79.

²⁷⁸ Qtd in Sharif, *ibid*, p.1.

²⁷⁹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.50.

²⁸⁰ Tolan, *ibid*, p.129.

be nation, as all other nations, in its own Sovereign State” regardless of the Palestinian nation’s natural rights.²⁸¹ On the recommendation of the United Nations Special Committee on Palestine, the UN General Assembly had voted to partition Palestine into two separate states-one for the Arabs and one for the Jews.²⁸² Even though Jews represented about one-third of the population and owned 7 percent of the land, the plan stipulated that 54.5 percent of the land and more than 80 percent of its cultivated citrus and grain plantations would go to Jewish State.²⁸³

The right of return was enshrined by the United Nation in December 1948 and was declared as refugees wishing to return to their homes and live at peace with their neighbors, it should be permitted to do so at the earliest practicable date and that compensation should be paid for the property of those choosing not to return.²⁸⁴ However it counted for nothing and Israel had no intention of implementing it. Although the right of return was accepted by most of the countries, none of them could force Israel to implement the resolution guaranteeing it. On June 11, when the truce went into effect, all the materials and the supplies would remain frozen in place with a strict UN arms embargo seemingly imposed on all parties; however the Jewish managed to break the embargo in the intervening few weeks with the shipments of rifles, armored cars, machine guns, tanks, artillery, Messerschmitt planes and ammunition from Czechoslovakia whereas the British exerted pressure on Transjordan to obey the embargo.²⁸⁵ It was a certain act making the Palestinian experience unequal and desperate fact.

Even when the news of ethnic cleansing, death camps, enforced ghettos, mass atrocities and deportations couldn’t be masked and made reaction unavoidable, the officials uttered peculiar statements condemning the atrocities, but meticulously refrained from naming the offender and claimed that information in hands is a lack of clarity.²⁸⁶ The offers and debates carried on the solution of both cases were mostly on values, and policy than facts. The reality that Serbs were the main aggressors was mostly denied and it was tried to prove that Bosnians were equally guilty.

²⁸¹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.96.

²⁸² Tolan, *ibid*, p.88.

²⁸³ Tolan, *ibid*, p.89.

²⁸⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p.157.

²⁸⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, 102-103.

²⁸⁶ Kofman, *ibid*, p.111.

MacKenzie, one of the most out-spoken opponents of Western military intervention of on Bosnian-Serbian case, often tried to justify the claim “all parties were to blame for the war.”²⁸⁷

Although the other states were to allow effective and full support so as to investigate and monitor human rights conditions they closed their eyes to the troubles and kept silent. Western powers both kept an arms embargo against the Bosnian and refused to use force to help them, leaving the people of Bosnia to get rid of the conflict themselves while making it impossible. “On October 18, 1995, a front-page headline in the New York Times indicated that there had been new “mass killings” of the civilians” in Bosnia, however the event was not recorded.²⁸⁸ The continuing atrocities in Bosnia was denounced by officials and Louis Gentile, the United Nation High Commission for Refugees head of operations in Banja Luka was prompted to state that “It should be known, and recorded for all time, that the so-called leaders of the Western world have known for the past year and a half what is happening here. They receive play-by-play reports. They talk of prosecuting war criminals but do nothing to stop the continuing war crimes. May God forgive them, May God forgive us all.”²⁸⁹ In May 1947, Andrei Gromyko, the Soviet ambassador to United Nations suggested a speech to the General Assembly that the Soviet Union would support a Jewish state in Palestine.²⁹⁰ The Soviets supported the establishment of Jewish State and partition of Palestine. The U.S president Bill Clinton proved their indifference to Bosnian destruction by saying that “Until these folks get tired of killing each other bad things will continue to happen”.²⁹¹ Bosnians were not supported by the Islamic World since they were not seen as genuine Muslims by Muslim leaders. The idea that the “West is by nature inimical to Islam, thus furthermore polarizing elements of Muslim and Christian population” strengthen the argument of Islamic militant.²⁹²

The West had seen the justice in the Zionist cause after the Holocaust and proposed solution not in their homeland in Europe, but in Palestine. Though population transfers, in general, are seen in religious, ethnic or national minorities,

²⁸⁷ Kofman, *ibid*, p.91.

²⁸⁸ Sells, *ibid*, p.10-11.

²⁸⁹ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.115.

²⁹⁰ Tolan, *ibid*, p.129.

²⁹¹ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.127.

²⁹² Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.115.

both the Bosnians and the Palestinians were in majority while they faced the troubles. As a step of location policy, U.S. president Harry Truman pressed Britain and Palestine to abandon restrictions on land sales to Jews and to allow one hundred thousand DPs into Palestine.²⁹³ The Palestine Royal Commission presented a 418-pages report to the British Parliament announcing “half a loaf is better than no bread”.²⁹⁴ The commission tried to convince about the partition and that the partition would bring peace; concluding “Partition offers a prospect ... of obtaining the inestimable boon of peace”²⁹⁵ As Croatia closed its door to the new refugees, the Bosnians awoke from the dream that the West would salve them.²⁹⁶ The Arabs were not sure about the British of favoring the Arabs, they were aware of the fact that Balfour Declaration didn’t aim to protect only the rights of the communities in Palestine, but served for building a Jewish State, a trade union, a university, a bank and a Jewish militia know a Haganah all of which came in useful for Jewish nation.²⁹⁷ Over the summer of 1996, in consideration of Dayton Accords, some Bosniaks attempted to return to their homes in the Zone of Separation, between The Federation of Bosnia-Herzegovina and Republika Sipska, yet; they were prevented from exercising their rights by ethnic Serbian forces.²⁹⁸

Lord Shaftesbury, an English reformer and politician, who imagined a Jewish state in Palestine where was an empty country for him, formulated the slogan: “A country without a nation for a nation without a country” which was later transformed by Jewish Zionist into “A land without people for a people without a land.”²⁹⁹

Likewise, in 1995, the former U.S. Secretary of the State Henry Kissinger announced that “there is no Bosnian culture” proposing the partition of Bosnia between Serbia and Croatia and placing the Muslims, who didn’t want to be a part of those states, in a Muslim state.³⁰⁰ Western powers conducted a conference in London, in 1992 condemning ethno-religious terror, pledging to support Bosnia’s territorial integrity and rejecting the use of force to change boundaries; however

²⁹³ Tolan, *ibid*, p.83.

²⁹⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p.45.

²⁹⁵ Tolan, *ibid*, p.45.

²⁹⁶ Kulin, *ibid*, p.188.

²⁹⁷ Tolan, *ibid*, p.38-39.

²⁹⁸ Qtd in Schecla, *ibid*, p.87.

²⁹⁹ Qtd in Sharif, *ibid*, p.42.

³⁰⁰ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.149.

Cyrus Vance, the delegate of United Nations, and David Lord Owen, the delegate of European Community, proposed a plan of divided Bosnia-Herzegovina into ten cantons designated with a dominant ethnic group of Croat control that leads the destruction of Bosnian Muslim communities.³⁰¹ Azra, Nimeta's neighbor proved the prejudiced perspective of the West "The west remembers human rights after the last Muslim dies."³⁰²

Perhaps Western political and military leaders support the killing in Palestine and Bosnia as a continuation of an old blood feud. When Radovan Karadžić, a war criminal Serbian statesman, heard that Bosnia made an application for independence, he stated overstepping the limits of decency "The child is born dead. Surely we will not permit a bastard of Muslim to be born and grow up in our land."³⁰³ The West didn't care about them since the murdered and tortured people had faith in different religion, if they belonged to the same religions that of the Western people, the west would interfere. Not only the Western countries and United Nations but also the human rights organizations were uninterested and ineffective. The first aim of backing other states was to get rid of Israelis in Europe and the second was to rule the East and to keep down the whole Arab world through this government.³⁰⁴

"Genocide has occurred. It has occurred with the acquiescence of Western governments, in violation of the United Nation Charter and the Convention on Genocide of 1948."³⁰⁵ The last survivor of non-Serb population of northern Bosnia was being taken away under the eyes of the world, but unnoticed, additionally, under the name of 'civil war', 'age-old antagonism', 'blame on all sides' a coded set of phrases assisted to make the killing of Bosnian Muslims appear unstudied.³⁰⁶ Regrettably, it is hard to believe that people were being exterminated because of race ethnic identity or religion and governments who had the power to stop it refused to do so. "I don't give two cents about Bosnia. The people there have brought on their

³⁰¹ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.100.

³⁰² Kulin, *ibid*, p.130.

³⁰³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.103.

³⁰⁴ Tolan, *ibid*, p.244.

³⁰⁵ Sells, *ibid*, p.XXI.

³⁰⁶ Sells, *ibid*, p.11.

own troubles” is stated by New York Times columnist Thomas Friedman on June, 1995 marking the logical end of moral equalizing.³⁰⁷

The Serbs and the Jews did not mind out the solutions of the other states and their opponents and disregarded common profits. Lord Carrington, a brilliant politician and the foreign secretary of England, prepared a plan that payed regards equally and allowed each nation freedom of language, religion, education and flag, yet refused by Miloseviç despite the approval of others.³⁰⁸

4.4. Hope and the Possibility Dialogue

Common interest and friendship are on focus. The two novels prove the possibility of dialogue and being friends in spite of the chaotic conditions. Dalia in *The Lemon Tree* and Stefan in *Sevdalinka* are similar characters and milestones who try to overcome the obstacles of communication between nations by welcoming the persons from the other nations and getting in touch with them.

Ayşe Kulin and Sandy Tolan write in a manner of humanism with remarkable sensibility to both nations’ grievances. Both help to provide a deeper awareness and deeper understanding of the conflict with a hope possibility of dialogue and tolerance. The novels try to tell the suffering of both nations objectively, and all round. They help to hear the feelings and thoughts of each side. They write in a perspective favoring of victim nations.

In both situations children tried to continue their education in schools or school-like places under terror. The teachers tried to impress patriotism on the children at gun point. Thanks to the hope for their future the Bosnians didn’t hinder the children’s education and maintained education in safe places even during the war.³⁰⁹ The relationship of Nimeta her friends, and Stefan proves te possibility of dialogue sincerely. Also when Raziyanım says that the Serbians have been furious and desperate people from all eternity, Fiko objects and tell that “my best friends are Serbian, Janis, Miloş, Konrad”³¹⁰

³⁰⁷ Qtd in Sells, *ibid*, p.141.

³⁰⁸ Kulin, *ibid*, p.94.

³⁰⁹ Kulin, *ibid*, p.124.

³¹⁰ Kulin, *ibid*, p.108.

Dalia questions the stories told them at school and tries to understand the Arabs biases. The personal-exceptional bond of Dalia and Bashir put forwards the possibility of dialogue, co-existence and hope. The representation of hope offers an alternative form of nonviolent struggle. At the end, after the death of her parents, Dalia wants the Khairis to return to their house but as it is dangerous they couldn't, then she wants to do something beneficial both for the Arabs and the Jews, so with Bashir's blessing she decides to donate the house to become a kindergarten where the Israeli and the Palestinian children could learn side by side as a way of co-existence.

Life was an endless kind of hope. They unintentionally expected hope even under the bombs, bullets with the fear of death in the smell of blood.³¹¹ Both the Bosnian and their leader Aliya İzzetbegović trusted the Western countries and dreamed that they wouldn't let such a war under their nose in this century, but it was just a dream.³¹² When they talked about probable end of Bosnian people, Sonya tells hopefully that "the world don't let to his. Even if nobody cares, there are Jews who have been there, they don't let. I won't lose my hope. The madness will end"³¹³ Nimeta claims that the case is not that of unbeliever Muslim case, it is the focus of human rights, so the Western community who have high opinion of human rights will not admit the conditions in Bosnia.³¹⁴ The Bosnians were depicted as waiting hopefully its young hero, Fiko at the end of *Sevdalinka*.³¹⁵ The people didn't give up hope on any occasion even during explosions. The story starts at September reminding sadness and ends at March referring to hope revival of a nation.

In *The Lemon Tree*, Varda Carmon told hopefully to Yitzhak Yitzhaki "don't worry, it will be alright" at that they heard more explosions.³¹⁶ Finally, after the death of the lemon tree, Dalia with a group of Arab and Jewish teenagers planted a new lemon tree into a hole beside the old stump (in the old garden of Ahmed Kahiri) with the hope of the next generations creating a reality.³¹⁷

Even the names of the novels, characters and their tendencies highlight positive attitudes under such miserable conditions. *Sevdalinka* means the native love

³¹¹ Kulin, *ibid*, p.333.

³¹² Kulin, *ibid*, p.123.

³¹³ Kulin, *ibid*, p.122.

³¹⁴ Kulin, *ibid*, p.130.

³¹⁵ Kulin, *ibid*, p.334.

³¹⁶ Tolani, *ibid*, p.90.

³¹⁷ Kulin, *ibid*, p.392.

song of Bosnia that reflects the specific character of Bosnian heritage and involves timeless lyrics of love but it is also about loss and exile.³¹⁸ The Lemon Tree is a symbol connecting people to the land. The lemon tree implies being strong, energetic, freedom-fighting, close to nature and emotionally rooted in homeland.³¹⁹ Throughout the book the tree reminds a nice smell of missing and belonging. The name of Bashir stands for hope referring “god news” or “the bearer of good things” in Arabic.³²⁰ When Bashir started to draw in prison, “one painting he made in the 1970s shows a green-eyed Palestinian peasant woman, one hand on an olive branch and the other holding a torch with the colors of Palestinian flag”.³²¹



³¹⁸ Sells, *ibid*, p.147.

³¹⁹ Long, *ibid*, p.70.

³²⁰ Tolan, *ibid*, p.80.

³²¹ Tolan, *ibid*, p.279.

CONCLUSION

Before some deliberate designs, there didn't exist any danger from the Palestinians to the Israelis and from the Bosnians to Serbs in either Palestine or Bosnia. The narratives exemplify the impact of institutional settings, norms and legality in Israel and Serbia where reminded the heaven once and became a hell later. The fate of Bosnians and Palestinians meet on many points. One of the most remarkable of them is that they faced the troubles not mainly because of the controversies and disagreement but because of deliberate designs of some leaders and foreign states.

In Palestine, Historic Balfour Declaration (the British support for a Jewish national homeland promised in Balfour declaration) in 1917 that proposes a national homeland for Jewish people in Palestine was one of the most important starter of a Jewish government in Palestine.³²² When the Balfour Declaration was approved by the League of Nations, “the Jewish people became a national entity recognized by international law” and the existence of the Palestinian Arab people was denied.³²³ Likewise the manifesto prepared by Serbian academicians published in *Vecernje Novosti* was the most significant starting point of the discrimination and conflict in Bosnian.

Both the Bosnians and the Palestinians experienced a great challenge from nonviolent resistance and noncooperation to guerilla warfare and international war. A considerable number of Muslims and Jews lived in Palestine and that of Bosnian and Serbian lived in Bosnia peacefully until the troubles started. Nationalism is obviously a tragic detour on the road of a peaceful democratic state order. Where before the modern era, each nation in Europe struggled to have its own state; many Europeans have been prepared and been “even eager to participate in transnational framework such as the EU, in part because their perceived need for collective self-determination has largely been satisfied”.³²⁴

For cultural geographers the structures, plans of city and settlement patterns manifest social, cultural and national character of the society and code for

³²² Tolan, *ibid*, p.33.

³²³ Sharif, *ibid*, p.84-85.

³²⁴ Jerry Z. Muller, “Us and Them: The Enduring Power of Ethnic Nationalism”, *Foreign Affairs*, Vol.87, No.2, p.28-32.

construction of identity.³²⁵ The destruction of symbolic buildings Momo (Christian) and Uzeyir (Muslim) that stood for mosaic formation of Bosnia is an action of overshadowing hybridity.³²⁶ On the other hand, the building of the wall which was claimed to be “security barrier” in Palestine, but rather the “apartheid wall” is a tool preventing the nations from interaction.³²⁷

Apparently the matter of nationalism has been destructive reality for many of discriminated people in modern world. In fact, in spite of conflict, the nations long term survival was thought to be dependent on a way to coexist with the other.³²⁸ Then the stereotype “never again” must be retrieved as meaningful to be faithful to those who faced the devastating outputs of nationalism. Turning the home into Open House, a kindergarten for the children of Palestine and Arab-Jewish dialogue reminds Said’s former suggestion:

..... As the Palestinians and Arabs we have not even tried to study this enormous subject, nor in any serious way we have tried to see how it impinges on the Jews and indeed Western, conscience as something all too real. Thus we need a discourse that is intellectually honest and complex enough to deal both with the Palestinian as well as the Jewish experience, recognizing where the claims of one stop and where the other begin.³²⁹

Finally, the possibility of peaceful lives depends on understanding and tolerating of each side, if this can be achieved, the celebration of hybrid life on the same land can be tasted, like a smell of lemon tree or a tone of love song (Sevdalinka).

³²⁵ Monica Kaup, “The Architecture of Ethnicity in Chicano Literature”, *American Literature*, Vol.69, No.2, p.361.

³²⁶ Kulin, *ibid*, p.198.

³²⁷ Tolan, *ibid*, p.380-381.

³²⁸ Tolan, *ibid*, p. 137

³²⁹ Mark Chmiel, “Dialogue and Solidarity”, *Journal of Palestine Studies*, Vol.36, No, 4, p.111.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities*. Verso, London, 2006
- _____, *Mapping the Nation*. Verso, London, 1996,
- Bayram, Sibel, “The Geography of Women in Ayşe Kulin’s *Sevdalinka*.”
Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi, Vol:5.23, 2012, p.103-107.
- Belge, Murat & Jale Parla. *Balkan Literatures*. Istanbul Bilgi University Press, Istanbul, 2009.
- Bidwell, Duane R. “Practicing the Religious Self: Buddhist-Christian Identity as Social Artifact.” *Buddhist-Christian Studies*, Vol. 28, 2008, p.3-12.
- Cleary, Joe. *Literature Partition and Nation State*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2002.
- David, Lea. “Holocaust and Genocide Memorialisation Policies in the Western Balkans and Israel/Palestine.” *Peacebuilding*, Routledge, 2016, p.1-16.
- Dries, Elizabeth A., (2009), *Multinationalism and Performance: Does Multinational Experiences Predict Competence?*, University of Michigan, Unpublished Thesis, USA.
- Fanon, Franz. *The Wretched of the Earth*. Grove Press, 2004.
- Francis, E. K. “The Ethnic Factor in Nation-Building.” *Social Forces*, Vol.46, No. 3, 1968, p.338-346.
- Friedland, Roger. “Religious Nationalism and the Problem of Collective Representation.” *Annual Review of Sociology*, Vol. 27, 2001, p. 125-152.
- Gallagher, Catherine & Stephan Greenblatt. *Practicing New Historicism*. University of Chicago Press, 2000.
- Gellner, Ernest. *Nation and Nationalism*. Cornell University Press, 1983.
- Gluck, Sherna Berger. “Feminism in the United States Radical Sisters: on Second – Wave Feminism and Black Liberati...” *Oral History Review* May 2009, p.1-12

- Handman, Max Sylvius. "The Sentiment of Nationalism." *Political Science Quarterly*, Vol.36, No.1, 1921, p.104-121.
- Haupt, G. M, Lowy, and Weil, C., *Les Marxistes et la question nationale*, 1848-1914, Paris: Maspero, 1974.
- Hayes, Carlton J. H. *Essays on Nationalism*. The Macmillian Company, 1926.
- Hazer, Gülsemin. "Bir Varoluş Mücadelesinin Romani; *Sevdalinka*." *1. Uluslararası Balkanlarda Tarih ve Kültür Kongresi*, 2006, p.63-80.
- Hertz, Frederick. "The Nature of Nationalism." *Social Forces*, Vol.19, No.3, 1941, p. 409-415.
- Hess, Moses. *Rome and Jerusalem: A Study in Jewish Nationalism*. New York: Bloch Publishing Company, 1918.
- Hutchinson, John. "Cultural Nationalism, Elite Mobility and Nation-Building: Communitarian Politics in Modern Ireland." *The British Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 38, No. 4, 1987, p. 482-501.
- Jawkulowski, Krzysztof. "Western (civic) "versus" Eastern (ethnic) Nationalism. The Origins and Critique of the Dichotomy." *Polish Sociological Review*, No. 171, 2010, p. 289-301.
- Kaup, Monica. "The Architecture of Ethnicity in Chicano Literature." *American Literature*, Vol.69, No.2, 1997, p.361-397.
- Kellas, James G. "Ethnic and Social Nationalism." *The Politics of Nationalism and Ethnicity*, Newyork, Macmillan Education, 1991, p.135-136.
- Kofman, Daniel. "Israel and the War in Bosnia." *This Time We Knew*, NYU Press, 1996, p.90-127.
- Kohn, Hans. "The Nature of Nationalism." *The American Political Science Review*, Vol.33, No. 6, 1939, p.1001-1021.
- Kulin, Ayse. *Sevdalinka*. Everest Yayınları, Istanbul, 2016.
- Link, Michael W. & Oldendick, Robert W. "Social Construction and White Attitudes Toward Equal Opportunity and Multiculturalism." *The Journal of Politics* 58.1, 1996, p.149-168.

- Long, Joanne C. "Routing Diaspora, Reviving Nation: Zionist Landscapes of Palestine-Israel." *Transactions of Institute of British Geographers*, 34(2008), p.61-76.
- Machery, Edouard & Luc Faucher. "Social Construction and the Concept of Race." *Philosophy of Science* 72. 2005, p.1208-1219.
- Marines, David R. "The Social Construction of Meaning." *Contemporary Sociology* 29.4, 2000, p.577-584.
- Mark, Chmiel. "Dialogue and Solidarity." *Journal of Palestine Studies*, Vol.36, No, 4, 2007, p.111-112.
- Martiniello, Marco. "Citizenship, Ethnicity and Multiculturalism: Post-National Membership Between Utopia and Reality." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 1997, 20:3, p.635-641.
- Mason, Victoria. "Children of the 'Idea of Palestine': Negotiating Identity, Belonging and Home in the Palestinian Diaspora." *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 28:3, 2008, p.271-285.
- Muller, Jerry Z. "Us and Them: The Enduring Power of Ethnic Nationalism." *Foreign Affairs*, Vol.87, No.2, p.18-35.
- Nikiforova, Basia. "Multicultural Values and Borders." *LIMES: Cultural Regionalistics*, 2:1, 2009, p.26-38.
- Oberschall, Anthony. "Frontiers and Ghettos: State Violence in Serbia and Israel by James Ron." *Social Forces*, Vol.82, No.4, 2004, p.1657-1659.
- Pennanen, Risto Pekka. "Melancholic Airs of the Orient- Bosnian *Sevdalinka* Music as an Orientalist and National Symbol." *Studies across Disciplines in the Humanities and Social Sciences* 9, 2010, p.76-90.
- Pressman, Jeremy. "The Arab-Israel Conflict and the Case of *The Lemon Tree*." *International Studies Perspective*, 2008, 9, p.430-441.
- Said, Edward W. *Orientalism*. London, Penguin, 2003.
- _____. *Reflection on Exile and Other Essays*. Cambridge MA, Harvard University Press, 2000.

____. *The Question of Palestine*. Vintage Book, 1992.

Sand, Shlomo. *The Invention of Jewish People*. Verso, New York 2009.

Sardar, Ziauddin. "A Garden of Identities: Multiple Selves and Other Futures." *Journal of Futures Studies*, 10.2, 2005.

Schecla, Joseph. "A Righteous Inconsistency: Applying International Norms to Population Transfer in Bosnia and Palestine." *Critique: Journal for Critical Studies of the Middle East*, 7:12, 2007, p.77-105.

Schmidt, Royal J. "Cultural Nationalism in Herder." *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Vol. 17, No. 3 1956, p. 407-408.

Shariff, Regina. *Non-Jewish Zionism*. Zed Press, London, 1983.

Thaden, Edward C. "The Beginnings of Romantic Nationalism in Russia." *The American Slavic and East European Review*, Vol. 13, No. 4, 1954, p. 500-523

Tolan, Sandy. *The Lemon Tree*. Black Swan, London, 2006.

Traboulsi, Fawwaz. "Edward Said's Orientalism Revisited." *The Translator* 15.1, 2009, p.179-183.

Turner, Stephan. "Social Constructionism and Social Theory." *Sociological Theory* 9.1, 1991, p.22-33.

Tyson, Lois, *Critical Theory Today*, Routledge, Newyork, 2006.

Yener, Demet & Cumhuri Aslan. "Sevdalinka ve İnsanlık Ayağa Kalk Romanlarında Bosna Savaşındaki Toplumsal Yapı ve İlişkilerin Oluşumsal Yapısalcı Eleştirisi." *Journal of Awareness*, Vol: 3.2, 2018, p.13-50.

Yeşilçiçek, Vedat, (2010), *Ayşe Kulin'in Hayatı , Sanatı ve Eserleri*, Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Çanakkale.

Wirth, Louis. "Types of Nationalism." *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 41, No. 6, 1936, p. 723-737.

<https://annenbergl.usc.edu/faculty/journalism/sandy-tolan>

<http://edebiyat.fakultesi.com/kopru1.htm>

<http://freshfiction.com/author.php?id=12417>

<http://m.biografi.info./kisi/ayse-kulin>

<http://ramallahcafe.com>

<http://sandytolan.com/about/>

<http://sandytolan.com/the-lemon-tree/#new-page-1>



ÖZGEÇMİŞ

KİŞİSEL BİLGİLER

Adı Soyadı	Yüstra BOYLU
Doğum Yeri	Bingöl
Doğum Tarihi	1988

LİSANS EĞİTİM BİLGİLERİ

Üniversite	Atatürk Üniversitesi
Fakülte	Kazım Karabekir Eğitim Fakültesi
Bölüm	İngilizce Öğretmenliği

YABANCI DİL BİLGİSİ

İngilizce	YDS: 86,25 YÖKDİL: 95
------------------	----------------------------

İŞ DENEYİMİ

Çalıştığı Kurum	Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı
Görevi/Pozisyonu	İngilizce Öğretmeni
Tecrübe Süresi	7

İLETİŞİM

E-mail	yusraboynu@gmail.com
---------------	----------------------