INTERSECTING IDENTITIES:
CONTEXT AND CHANGE IN THE CASE OF MARDINIAN ARABS


A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY


BY


MURAT KÜÇÜK


IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF SOCIOLOGY


SEPTEMBER 2012

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences

_____

Prof. Dr. Meliha Altunışık

Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of Master of Arts.

_____

Prof. Dr. Ayşe Saktanber

Head of Department

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Arts.

_____                    _____

Prof. Dr. Mesut Yeğen                                Prof. Dr. Ayşe Gündüz Hoşgör

Co-Supervisor                                             Supervisor

**Examining Committee Members**

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ferdan Ergut (METU, HIST)

Prof. Dr. Ayşe Gündüz Hoşgör (METU, SOC)          _____

Prof. Dr. Mesut Yeğen (İst. Şehir Uni. SOC)          _____

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ayça Ergun (METU, SOC)             _____

Asst. Prof. Dr. Çağatay Topal (METU, SOC)           _____

**I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.**

Name, Last name:

Signature:

# ABSTRACT

## INTERSECTING IDENTITIES: CONTEXT AND CHANGE IN THE CASE OF MARDINIAN ARABS

Küçük, Murat

M.A., Department of Sociology

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Ayşe Gündüz Hoşgör

Co-Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Mesut Yeğen

September 2012, 174 pages

Identity have come to fore in daily life, political life and social sciences in recent years. Debates on the ways how identity can be studied and conceptualized have been varying. There needs to make critical studies on multicultural Mardin using current theoretical possibilities.

The reason of why Mardin is selected as the case of this study is that the significant role of identity in people living in Mardin as a multi-religious and multi-ethnic site. However, because of that "difference" which is expressed in the "cultural diversity" is understood with only ethnic and religious belongings, social class and gender are generally neglected. In this thesis, identity is studied as intersectionality of ethnicity, social class, and gender differences. It is focused on where, how and how certain identity expressions are selected. Accordingly, it is tried to be revealed that identity is not fixed and essentialist, rather is historical, contextual and contingent in the case of Mardinian Arabs. The most suitable data generation method for this research question is interviewing and participant observation as a part of living experience in the researching site.

Keywords: Identity, intersectionality, cultural diversity, contexuality, Mardinian Arabs

# ÖZ

KESİŞEN KİMLİKLER: MARDİNLİ ARAPLAR ÖRNEĞİNDE BAĞLAM VE
DEĞİŞME

Küçük, Murat

Yüksek Lisans, Sosyoloji Bölümü

Tez Yöneticisi: Prof. Dr. Ayşe Gündüz Hoşgör

Ortak Tez Yöneticisi: Prof. Dr. Mesut Yeğen

Eylül 2012, 174 sayfa

Kimlik, son yıllarda gündelik hayatta, siyasette ve sosyal bilimlerde önemi artan bir tartışma konusudur. Akademik tartışmalarda kimliğin nasıl çalışılacağı ve kavramsallaştırılacağıyla ilgili tartışlamalar çeşitlenmektedir. Bu anlamda, tez sahası olarak seçilen çokkültür Mardin için de yeni ve eleştirel çalışmalar yapmak ihtiyacı vardır.

Tez için saha olarak Mardin'in seçilmiş olmasının nedeni ise, çok-dinli ve çok-etnili bir ortamda kimliğin buradaki insanların gündelik hayatında kapladığı önemli yerdir. Ancak kültürel çeşitlilikte ifade edilen farklılık etnisite ya da din üzerinden algılandığı için, sınıf ya da toplumsal cinsiyet farkları göz ardı edilebilmektedir. Bu çalışmada kimlik, etnisite, sınıf ve toplumsal cinsiyet farkları üzerinden, farklı "kesişimler" olarak çalışılmıştır. Bu kimlik ifadelelerinin ve kullanımlarının nerede, nasıl ve neden seçildiğine odaklanılmıştır. Böylece kimliğin sabit ve özcü değil, tarihsel, bağlamsal ve olumsal olduğu Mardin Arapları bağlamında gösterilmeye çalışılmıştır. Bu araştırma sorusuna en uygun olarak "bilgi toplama" metodu olarak hem görüşme hem de sahada yaşama deneyimininbir katkısı olarak "katılımlı gözlem" kullanılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Kimlik, kesişimsellik, kültürel çeşitlilik, bağlamsallık, Mardin Arapları

To My Parents

and

To İsmail Tufan

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Finally, I would like to express my feeling of gratitude to all my informants in Mardin for sharing their expressions with me for this study. Without their words and contributions this work would never come into existence.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

# CHAPTER 1

# INTRODUCTION

## 1.1.     THE RESEARCH QUESTION

This thesis explores the coexistence of identities and differences in Mardin, where is ethnically and religiously heterogeneous city. The study aims to understand the formation of this coexistence during the nation-state era, but particularly changes since 1960s. In this way, the thesis explores how and why perceptions of identity and structures affect identity formation in Mardin, through applying an intersectionality approach using the narratives of dwellers in Mardin city centre. In other words, the study poses the question how identification and differentiation dynamics work in the case of urban Mardin. To make research and analysis possible, domains of identity were restricted to ethnicity, class and gender.

Cultural diversity has been one of the main characteristics of Mardin for centuries. Sociologically and anthropologically, the migration and settlement of different religious and ethnic groups to Mardin turned the town into a multicultural site. Moreover, components of this demographic structure have been changing for centuries. In addition to sociological and anthropological factors, one also needs to consider the different political and administrative arrangements that were employed to govern this diversity.

New theoretical and methodological tools are needed in order to better understand the complexities of living with diversity. Therefore, the main motive of this study is to understand and analyse how "ethnicity", "class" and "gender" as categories of identification and differentiation intersect in the narratives of native Arab dwellers in Mardin city centre. It is not a study about Arab ethnic identity or about Arabs as an "ethnic group". It is rather a study about how ethnicity, together with social class and

gender, functions in their identity formation. Ethnicity is not a "thing" which not only intersects with other ethnicities or groups, but also intersects with social class and gender. It seeks to understand the complexity and intersectionality of dynamics of identity formation through the evidence generated by participant observations, and formal and informal interviews with local Arab urban dwellers.

The research questions for the thesis are as folllows: How does ethnicity intersect with social class? What is the role of gender in this intersection? Hence, how does ethnicity intersect with gender? How does class intersect with gender?

Conducting a qualitative research using interview and observation on this matter has provided me with an understanding of the dynamics of living together or co-existence in Mardin. I have tried to analyse intersecting dynamics effecting people's identification and differentiation among the local Arab population.

There are four reasons why I have questioned this issue. Firstly, "identity" maintains its significance for every-day interactions, relations among persons and groups, and political arrangements. For example, in daily life in Turkey, questions such as "Who are you?" ("Kimsin?"), "Who is your family?" or "Which family are you from?" ("Kimlerdensin?"), "Where are you from?" ("Nerelisin?"), "What is it that you do?" ("Ne işle uğraşıyorsun?") are questions generally asked while meeting to new people. These questions that are occuring in daily language refer to ethnicity, religion, social class and status, place, and some other affinities.

Secondly, the role and significance of identity in social and political life has been increasing since 1960s. Thereby, new debates and conceptualisations of identity, citizenship, cultural diversity and multiculturalism in social sciences have been developing. Ethnicity, nationality, religion, social class, gender, and age as sources of identification have been increasingly debated and studied in different academic disciplines. Under the influence of post-war and post-colonial conditions after 1950s, and post cold-war conditions after 1990s, theoretical and methodological tendencies have multiplied the ways in which these issues can be studied. Increasing population mobility and cultural plurality around the world has led to a rethinking of those

concepts of identity, culture, ethnicity, and other related issues. Therefore, the most debated developments in identity studies have focused on hybridisation and have produced new identity terms such as "hybrid", "hyphenated", "creol".

Thirdly, identity is an issue of the state and politics, especially with regard to racial, ethnic, national, religious, sexual, gender and age identities. Identity as an issue of politics has a long history. Although religious and tribal affinities were taken as the base for identity politics in multi-ethnic and multi-religious empires, the focus increasingly shifted to nationality and ethnicity in the era of the nation-state. The nationalisation process generally applied a homogenising policy to people belonging to different ethnic and religious affiliations. However, these homogenising policies and practices of nation states started to be questioned with the politically and economically motivated migrations during the post-war process, identity oriented social movements with 1960s and capitalist globalisation process with 1980s. All these developments in the 20th century changed the characteristics of the populations of nation-states.

Lastly, Mardin as the case of the thesis is a religiously and ethnically heterogeneous city for centuries. In recent years, this cultural diversity has been popularised by some political groups, in the media, and in informal discourse. "Tolerance", "civilisations", "cultures", "languages", and "religions" are words frequently used to describe the sociality and history of Mardin in daily, public, and academic speeches. Therefore, it is generally ignored how this cultural diversity is changing within social, political, economic and spatial transformations, and whether it contains the potential for conflict situations. Moreover, there is also an increasing tendency to undertake academic research on the ways and habits of living with diversity in Mardin. With this study, I have tried to add different aspects that affect the dynamics of living together with the help of the intersectionality approach, which integrates ethnicity, class, and gender domains.

## 1.2. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

The focus of this study is to understand the relationship between identification dynamics and cultural heterogeneity. However, it is not restricted to only religious or ethnic identity, as is the case in popular, traditionally academic and political contexts. Studying only ethnic and religious identity prevents us from understanding the roles and effects of other bases of identity, such as social class, gender, age, and disability. Every form of identification needs to be studied in order to understand and analyse the dynamics affecting people's experiences, understandings and expressions of identification. Therefore, I have decided to focus not only on cultural bases of identification (national, ethnic or religious, as generally accepted in cultural identity), but also on social (gender, age) and economic bases (social class and status). To capture and understand the role of other sources of identification, I chose two other main domains of identifications effecting intercultural relations: social class and gender. In this study, I have aimed at understanding how gender and class intersect with ethnicity as a part of constitutive aspects of their identity perception. Conducting research on the multicultural experience of Mardin has provided some interesting observations on the dynamics of "living together" or "co-existence".

I focused on identity definitions affecting factors in formation in terms of subjects' self-expressions and self-descriptions; and their way of perception, defining, labeling, categorizing, symbolizing, and othering. While "a sense of us" is constructed, alongside "a sense of them" through "othering" is constructed. How senses of "us" and "them" change according to people's different positions including ethnicity, social class and gender? While exploring this research question, it is important to consider the "people", not the "culture" (Camps, 2010).

Questioning identity leads to questioning difference. What makes Mardin different is its historical ethnic and religious diversity. Hence, diversity refers to difference. "Identity is marked by similarity, that is of the people like us, and by difference, of those who are not." (Woodward, 2004: 7). "Similarity" and "difference" are related and co-constructed aspects of belonging. In other words, "identity is always dialectic between similarity and difference." (Jenkins, 1997:13). Consequently, "how do we

live together with differences?" has become one of the important questions of contemporary societies and therefore also of social, cultural and political theories and public debates.

Identity is not an abstract and independent concept of time, place, and continuing or changing structural conditions, as essentialist understanding assumes. In other words, identity could be understood and studied as historical, contextual and spatial. If identity is understood, analysed, and conceptualised as a historical and contingent construction, then "race, class, and gender seem like fundamental characteristics of our beings" (Ken, 2007: 3). This fundamentality refers to biological or historical essentialisms in identity and culture studies.

To make a sociological inquiry on identity and cultural diversity requires an understanding of the local dynamics and peculiarities of each case as each case may have a different historical transformation process. Researching these peculiarities has the potential to challenge grand theoretical models and political arrangements, such as citizenship. In this research and theoretical perspective, there are two problematic tendencies: pure, context-free (Malasevic, 2004: 153), totalising and grand theoretical approaches, and theory-free empirical studies, in other words, "the grand theoretical work that asks us to rethink everything on the basis of no serious empirical data and the empirical work that keeps churning out the same banalities as it did twenty years ago" (Baumann, 1999: 143). Therefore, in order to solve these concerns, Baumann (1999: 146) suggests thinking about new research programs as follows:

> Some research projects that could provide us with more interesting observations of multicultural realities and that could also help bridge the gaping gulf between the two heaps, the grand verbose theory and the detailed but unimaginative empirical project.

Trying to integrate theoretical and methodological tools to answer the research question of this study, I have conceived a research design, which took shape during the field research process. Thereby historicity, complexity, relationality, contingency, and contexuality of these concepts could be more easily understood. As Ken (2007: 7) expressed:

the concepts of race, class, and gender -if they exist at all- mean something specific (if hard to define) for people in specific places at specific times. They may simultaneously mean something different and even contradictory in other places at other times, or even within the same situations.

However, I have focused on local dynamics and local processes of living together or co-presence in Mardin city centre, "rather than on the national frame of race and ethnicity" (Amin, 2002: 959) in Turkey. In other words, this study specifically focuses on how "meanings and expressions of race, social class, and gender are localized" (Ken, 2007: 7). Since this local multiculturality or interculturality is restricted to the urban setting.

## 1.3. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH

As mentioned earlier, the reason why Mardin is the topic of this study is that people from different ethnicities and religions/sects have been living together for centuries in this city. This cultural diversity in Mardin has a long history and was created by old settlements of Armenians, Syriacs, Arabs, Kurds, and Turkemens. In other words, the multi-religious and multi-ethnic structure in this city began from ancient times, not recently, as in most of the Western multicultural cities with nation-state era migrations, or in the colonial and post-colonial period. Therefore, this cultural diversity was not generated after the appearance of modern nation societies, because "nation-state" as a form of state and "nation" as a way of society is related to modernity. Therefore speaking of "kavim" (clan, tribe or peoples) seems more suitable for pre-modern migrations. Indeed, Mardin's quality might be called as "native people's multi-culturality".

It also needs to be highlighted that cultural diversity of Mardin is not based on juridical status or on a policy as there is not a recognized legal status for the different ethnic or religious communities. Therefore, we can only speak about an anthropological and sociological cultural diversity. Furthermore, it is not the same cultural diversity with a situation of any time in the past as it is highly related with structural changes. However, which factors and in which degree affects are significant questions to be further explored. This provides understanding its contextality and contingency, thereby historicity.

## 1.4.   CONCEPTUALISATION

There are different terms signifying identity-related meanings. These are summarized as "difference", "belonging", "self", and "commonality, connectedness and groupness" (Brubaker and Cooper 2004).  "Identity is marked by difference but it seems that some differences, (...), are seen as more important than others, especially in particular places and particular times." (Woodward 1997: 3) "Difference is about the non-identical and dissimilar. It is about distinction, division, multiplicity and otherness. As such, difference is not an essence or attribute of an object but a relationship and position or perspective of signification." (Barker, 2004: 53)

In order to understand and analyse identity more comprehensively, I have critiqued existing studies and have added aspects that they ignore or exclude. However, such an approach created different methodological, theoretical, and practical challenges. Therefore, it became necessary to find a new way of studying, which integrates ethnicity, social class and gender. "Intersectionality" as a way of researching, understanding and analysing is taken as the main theoretical frame of this study.

Among multiple forms of understanding, researching, and analysing identity, I have sought to study identity formation in an anti-foundational, relational and processional sense. The aim and the research question of this study require the use of a theoretical frame integrating ethnicity, gender, and social class. However, this integrating should not prioritise one of the identity domains, it is rather to be considered as "co-constructed" or in other words "race, class, and gender depend on and mutually constitute each other." (Ken 2007: 2). This means that we need to research "how particular identifications are always co-constructed with other categories of identity." (Buitelaar 2006: 273). To achieve this aim, the intersectionality approach seems more suitable since it integrates aspects of ethnicity, class, and gender.

The reason of this is that "no one of these dimensions can be fully understood outside the context of the other two" (Ken 2007: 8). In the studies on identity or inequalities, "trying to rank dimensions of oppression reifies them; instead, social analysts must

recognize how structures like race, class, and gender create, shape, influence, and depend on each other" (Ken 2007: 11).

Intersectionality "as a theory to analyse how social and cultural categories intertwine" (Knudsen: 2006: 61) also helps to deconstruct and destabilize the universalism of these categories including class, gender and ethnicity. In intersectionality theory, these categories are not taken for granted but are instead interpreted as constructed categories and positions (Knudsen, 2006: 65). Such deconstruction and destabilization of categories makes it possible to understand and research these categories as historical and contingent. Thereby, "intersectionality may be used to analyse changes, variations and processes." (Knudsen, 2006: 73).

Cultural diversity includes two forms. Firstly, as an experience or practice, living with diversity is sociological and anthropological issue. It includes relations between minorities and majorities, relations within minorities, relations with the market. Secondly, as a policy it is about how cultural diversity could/should be governed. It is related to citizenship status and rights, and organizes relations with the state.

In his critical study "Ethnicity without Groups", Brubaker (2004b: 10) differentiates between "categories of ethno-political practice" and "categories of social analysis", and proclaims not to use categories of ethno-political practices as categories of social analysis as the categories of ethno-political practices are laden with groupist understanding of ethnicity and these groups are reified or substantial things. Therefore, in this study, I have tried to use concepts as "categories of social analysis", and also "as perspectives on the world rather than entities in the world" (Brubaker, 2004a: 4). Groupist understanding of culture, identity or ethnicity homogenises differences within groups and treats them as a unity.

There are critics of groupist concepts from different perspectives. These were labelled "ethnicity without community" (Brubaker 2004a), "multiculturalism without culture (Phillips 2007), and "culture without ethnicity" (Phillips 2007). Brubaker (2004a: 2) defines "groupism" as the tendency to take bounded groups as fundamental units of analysis. Feminist, post-structuralist, and post-modernist

theories in principle accept that "cultures", "communities", "tribes", "races", "nations," and "ethnic groups" are not bounded wholes or as entities and cast as actors (Brubaker, 2004a: 3). However, to criticize groupist language is not to deny that there are group characteristics of culture or that one can study "groups". Instead, Brubaker seeks to study the other ways in which ethnicity "works" because bounded solidarity groups are one of the modalities of ethnicity and of social organization more generally. Brubaker highlights this point:

> [Ethnicity] works not only, or even especially, in and through bounded groups, but in and through categories, schemas, encounters, identifications, languages, stories, institutions, organizations, networks, and events. The study of ethnicity -even the study of ethnic conflict- should not, in short, be reduced to, or even centered on, the study of ethnic groups. (Brubaker, 2004a: 4)

In identity studies on multicultural cases, "ethnicity" and "religion" are generally taken into consideration. However, gender, class and other domains of identity as important cross-cutting variables need to be studied. Cağlar (1997: 176), as an anthropologist, offers a new way of studying identity and cultural diversity in terms of focusing on "more hidden forms of identification". Studying all hidden forms of identification is difficult to put in practice in empirical research. Studying and capturing "more hidden forms" requires an anthropological approach and application of an ethnographic method. Because of the difficulty or impossibility of capturing all dynamics of identification and differentiation, I needed to limit my focus. Before defining these limits, I perused different theses and studies on Mardin (Sarı, 2007; Biner 2007; Oktem 2007; Erol 2008). These studies focused and questioned dynamics of ethnic, religious and political relations, and generated data from an empirical inquiry. Consequently, in addition to ethnic and religious identity, I added class and gender aspects as intersecting units of ethnicity.

The reason why ethnicity, class and gender are more a fundamental/determining base of identity is that "social divisions of gender, ethnicity and class lie at the very heart of 'the social'" (Anthias, 1998). In other words:

> Gender, ethnicity, 'race,' and class are pivotal forms of differentiation and stratification of human populations in the modern era. They may be seen as

crosscutting and mutually interacting discourses, practices, and intersubjectivities that coalesce and articulate at particular conjunctures to produce differentiated and stratified social outcomes. (Anthias, 1999: 138)

Generally, ethnic and religious diversities are taken into consideration in the conceptualizations of cultural diversity. However, other dimensions of identification, which are mostly neglected in multiculturalism debates, may also play an important role in people's discourses and practices with regard to identification and differentiation. To see which type of identification is more effective in their identity discourses, social and economic factors need to be taken into consideration because societies or socialites are heterogeneous not only as regards nationality, race, ethnicity or religion, but also as regards class, status, gender, age, physical and mental characteristics (disabilities), kinship, political affiliations, spatial affiliations and others:

Ethnic (national or religious) identities are treated as the most basic identities that people posses. Subjectivities, 'disjunt' or not, are defined in common sense discourses as ethnic subjectivities. The only other identification that is sometimes deemed relevant is that of gender. (...) The stress is always on the hyphenation of ethnic (national and religious) identities to the exclusion of other forms of identification. Yet the latter may potentially cut across ethnic attachments and generate quite different forms of sociality and alliance, based, for example, on class, gender, lifestyle, religious zeal, political tendency, and so forth. (Caglar 1997: 175)

Therefore, I will use an "intersectional" approach in the analysis of cultural diversity. By including other forms of identification in the study, the "intersectionality" approach has great potential for understanding the complexity. The multiple and intertwining dimensions and relational, processual, dynamic, discursive, dialogical character of identity could only be studied through an intersectional approach because "intersectionality tries to catch the relationship between socio-cultural categories and identities. Ethnicity is combined with gender to reflect the complexity of intersectionality between national, new national background and womanhood/manhood" (Knudsen, 2006: 61). The aim of focusing on intersectionality is to understand the complexity, contextuality, and contingency of identification and differentiation. "[I]t is a matter of context and situation whether people engage the reifying discourse of absolute differences or the processual

discourse of relational differentiations" (Baumann, 1999: 132). "To understand multicultural praxis is to examine precisely when people shift from their one discourse to their other discourse" (Baumann, 1999: 132).

> [t]o capture the relational and dynamic nature of race, ethnicity, and nation by treating them as products of reiterative and cumulative processes of categorizing, coding, framing, and interpreting. Instead of asking "what is race?", "what is ethnic group?", "what is a nation?," a cognitive approach encourages us to ask how, when, and why people interpret social experience in racial, ethnic, or national terms. (Loveman & Stamatov, 2004: 87)

Why is "intersectionality" more suitable for such a study? Firstly, intersectionality does not only take into account ethnic or religious identity, but also includes other types of identity. Secondly, it focuses both on "differences between groups" and "differences within a group", in addition to sameness. In other words, "intersectionality constitutes a critical alternative to identity politics insofar as, next to differences *between* groups, it also takes into account *intra*-group differences" (Prins, 2006: 278). Thirdly, it has more potential for understanding and revealing complexity, contingency and contextuality of sociality and identities by focusing on how identities are interwined.

The advantage of an intersectional approach is to gain a better understanding when dealing with and conceptualising the complexity of sociality, culture and identification. Sociality and culture cannot be understood, analysed and conceptualised without taking into consideration the contexts of time (specific historical conditions) and place (geographical). In contrast to essentialist, stabilized and groupist perspectives on identity, a relational, processual and contextual approach has more potential to deal with this complexity.

Contemporary approaches, including post-modernism, feminism, post-structuralism, post-Marxism, "share a common theoretical ground which is aimed at challenging universalism, positivism and the totalizing objectivities of 'conventional' sociology" (Malesevic, 2004: 143). Therefore, "intersectionality" as a theoretical perspective could be accepted as a way of studying identity in a sense of relational, dynamic and processual language.

In this study, I have tried to focus not on a culture but rather on the people living in/with a culture. In the most recent critical studies, the focus has shifted away from multi-cultural to inter-cultural, cross-cultural, or trans-cultural to emphasize interaction and change. However, this shift may be a trap for new and critical ways of conceptualising and researching cultural diversity. The criticism is summarized by Camps (2010):

> (...) the concept of 'multiculturality' is not the most appropriate, as it tends to foster the existence of closed, isolated cultures, cultural ghettos that propagate themselves while inequalities continue to exist. This error leads to the necessity of replacing multiculturality by 'interculturality' in which the important thing is the relationship, the contact and the alliance between cultures, and not just the recognition of each of them. But we are still talking about cultures and not people, and perhaps we also need to rectify this error. A person cannot be identified in the first place with the culture they belong to in order to then be perceived as a subject with rights.

## 1.5. STRENGHTS AND LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEACRH

To make this inquiry possible, it was necessary to limit the topic both theoretically and methodologically. Theoretically, in the analysis the dimensions of identity and difference have been limited to ethnicity, class and gender. Intersectional analysis of identity formation helps to understand and reveal the role of gender and class in identity formation, inter-ethnic relations and the dynamics of living together. The focus of the study is on relations between individuals or groups, rather than with the state.

In order to answer the question that I address in my research, I have multiplied sources of data and methods of data generation. As ways of generating data, interviewing (formal and informal) and observational (systematic and non-systematic) methods were integrated. By integrating interview and observation methods, I have attempted to integrate narratives on identity and structural changes into the analysis. This made it possible to evaluate differences between "told life" and "lived life". Without consideration of structural transformation and without having information about the process and structure, it is difficult to give meaning to

expressions, and thereby to explain the "dynamics" of identity formation of Mardinian Arabs.

However, the sampling of the case was restricted to the urban setting of Mardin, instead of rural settings. To manage data and make analysis possible, Arabs were selected as a source of evidence, after some preliminary interviews with Christians and Kurds. Therefore, the qualitative data used in the analysis was generated by Arabs only. Pilot studies and the interviews with Syriacs and Kurds were evaluated in the methodology chapter.

## 1.6.    ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS

This study includes eight chapters; the first one will briefly introduce the research problem, methodology, concepts, strengths, and limitations of the thesis.

In the second chapter, the theoretical and conceptual framework used in the study will be examined. In its first part, approaches on identity will be reviewed and debated. Secondly, "intersectionality" as a way of understanding and analysing identity is elaborated.

In the third chapter, methodological perspective, data generation and analysis process will be explained. Firstly, life-story interview and participant observation methods and intersectional analysis of narratives will be detailed. Secondly, sampling, insider-outsider positions and their effect on the study, and the process of interviewing is illustrated.

In the forth chapter, history, sociality and culture of Mardin, as the topic of study, is set out. In the first part, a brief history of Mardin city will be summarized. Secondly, demographic, social, and cultural features of the city related to this study will be examined.

Interviewing and observational data is analysed under titles "ethnic domains of identity among Mardinian Arabs" "places of piving together in Mardin", and "social class differences among Mardinian Arabs" in chapters of four, five and six.

The last chapter offers a conclusion of this thesis through a discussion of the research question in the light of the findings.

# CHAPTER 2

# THEORETICAL AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

## 2.1. INTRODUCTION

Identity, and identity-related terms and issues have significantly received a disciplinary and political attention in recent years. In this chapter, I examine the wide range of concepts and frameworks surrounding identity used in social sciences in three parts. The first part briefly reviews types of identity used in social sciences. Second part examines main approaches on identity in the social and cultural theory. The last part reviews and discusses "intersectionality" as a way of understanding and analysing dynamics of identity.

Identity is an issue on "who is who" and "what is what". "Identity is our understanding of who we are and of who other people are, and reciprocally, other people's understanding of themselves and of others (which includes us)" (Jenkins 2006: 5). Identity as a term, etymologically, is related with sameness, similarity, and commonality or shared aspects. Linguisticly, "identity" comes from Latin root *idem* and refers to 'the same'. In addition to the sameness, it also includes meaning of "the consistency or continuity over time that is the basis for establishing and grasping the definiteness and distinctiveness of something" (Jenkins 2006: 4). In other words, identity, etymologically, two problematic aspects: sameness, and consistency or fixity. Firstly, "difference" aspect added to identity studies. Secondly, instead of consistency or fixity, identity is accepted as processual and social construction.

"In vernacular use, it implies an object or a distinctive fixed essence which a person, a place or a group could posses." (Wetherel, 2010: 5). "Difference" is needed to be

taken as an aspect of "identity construction" because of the absence of "difference" meaning in identity term, as stated by Jenkins (2006: 5) "Taken –as they can only be-together, similarity and difference are the dynamic principles of identification, the hearth social life." Woodward (1997: 4) separates essentialist and non-essentialist perspectives on identity, and says "a non-essentialist definition would focus on differences, as well as common or shared characteristics". Moreover, while emphasising the changing role of "difference" in identity studies, Wetherel (2010: 16) connects this shift to "discursive turn":

> New discursive work on identities now particularly brought into view the centrality of difference to identity formation. Whereas earlier work had tried to capture as the essence of identity what was the same, what was similar and what was shared, theorist now began to highlight the ways in which acts of identity required the marking out of differences, separating self from 'other', creating hierarchies of included and excluded; where the nature of self and group came to be defined through what one was not. There was new interest in the semiotic, cultural and psychological processes involved in these markings of difference.

Consequently, in addition to "sameness" aspect, "difference" is taken into consideration through the intersectionality in this study. However, "identification" instead of "identity", and "differentiation" instead of "difference" are chosen in order to emphasize processual and dynamic characteristics of the subject.

Contrast to conventional/mainstream social theory which sees identity as essential, given, fixed, unitary, pre-political and groupist thing, anti-essentialist accounts accepts identity as relational, processual, historical, contextual and contingent. While conventional and modernist social theory had universalist discourse, anti-essential and anti-foundational perspectives focuses particularities, specificities, and contextual aspects. This way of understanding provides to understand more complex aspects of the identification and to deal with this complexity. These anti-foundational perspectives are mainly summarized as post-structuralism, post-modernism, post-Marxism, social psychoanalysis and reflexive feminism.

In this study, ethnicity, social class and gender as different spheres of identity and difference will be analysed. "Class" is about the space of the social construction of

production and reproduction of material or economic life; "ethnos", race and ethnicity, is related with the domain of the production and reproduction of bonds, sentiments and solidarities relating to collective origin and belonging, in other words, the social construction of collectivity; "gender" linked to space of the social construction of sexual and biological production and reproduction (Anthias, 1998: 513, 523)

## 2.2. TYPES OF IDENTITY

In generally, types of identity are analytically classified as personal or individual on the one hand, and collective or social on the other. However, according to Snow and others (2005: 390), in the literature on identity in the social sciences, this is categoricised as "the personal", "the social" and "the collective".

"The personal identity", or individual aspects of identity, is studied and theorised as psychological theory in psychology and social psychology. Psychology focuses psychic character of the subject, and social psychology studies interaction with psyche and social. Personal identity also includes aspects of one's biography and life experiences. "The social identity" is the issue of social theory and is "the foundational or anchoring concept in that it is grounded in and derives from social roles, such as police, officer, physician, or mother, or broad social categories, such as gender, racial, ethnic, and national categories. (...) 'role identities' and 'categorical identities'" (Snow and others, 2005: 390). Moreover, it can be ascribed or declared. "The collective identity" is related with social movement activities and "is loosely defined as a shared sense of "we-ness" or "one-ness" that derives from shared statues, attributes, or relations (...)" (Snow and other, 2005: 391). Among these three types, social and collective ones is the object of social and cultural theories.

Looking the role of "identity" in social theory, "the study of identity forms a critical cornerstone within modern sociological thought. Introduced by the works of Cooley and Mead, identity studies have evolved and grown central to current sociological discourses." (Cerulo, 1997: 385). Within the mainstream sociology, identity or subject was evaluated in "general societal theory". In 1930s, with micro-sociological

or symbolic interactionalist studies, identity as a specific studying area entered to literature. In 1990s, identity became one of the unifying themes of social sciences (Jenkins, 2006: 8).

From classical sociological theories to contemporary theories, development of identity studies has shifted from unitary understanding to more contingent and relational understanding. In an evolution of identity studies, Wetherell (2010) classifies paths in the identity studies in three ways. First one is studying identity as a subjective individual achievement. Secondly, studying identity means studying categories, roles and social locations. As Wetherell explains that: "[T]he study of 'names and looks' has translated into investigations of social divisions and social solidarities and the practice of marginalization, exclusion, inclusion, resistance, segregation, denigration, etc. linked to belonging.' " (2010: 4). Last one is studying ethical and political aspects of identity. This way of studying was related with the civil rights movements of the 1960s and central to activism, to social justice and to the investigation of these.

## 2.3. APPROACHES ON IDENTITY

In this part of the theory chapter, approaches on identity will be reviewed and discussed. In the social and cultural theory, main perspectives on "identity" have been generally classified as: essentialist/naturalist/primordialist and social constructionist. However, a new critics and proposal to study identity is made by Brubaker (2004). Brubaker criticizes not only essentialist perspectives, but also "social constructionist" perspectives and offers "a relational, processual, and dynamic language" (Brubaker 2004a: 3). Therefore this one could be added as a third approach.

Identity is not a modern or new issue in public debate, daily life and intellectual life. As Smith (1995: 129) states "It is almost as old as recorded history. Certainly, the Bible contains many instances of concern with ethnic and social identity, individual and collective. (...) Ancient Greek mythology, too, reveals a strong interest in problems of social identity (...)". This long history of "identity" refers its function

and role in social life. Jenkins argues this vital role in the daily life:

> [W]hether individually or collectively, we can't live routine lives as human without identification, without knowing – and sometimes puzzling about – who we are and who others are. (...) Without repertoires of identification we would not be able to relate to each other meaningfully or consistently. We would not have that vital sense of who's who and what's what. Without identity there could be no human world. (2006: 7)

In addition to roles in daily life in the history human, it has a disciplinary history. The uses in different disciplinary fields changes from unitary/fixed understanding to fluid/dynamic account. According to Hall (1992: 275-277) there are three different conceptions of identity in the near history: "Enlightenment subject", "sociological subject" and "post-modern subject". Concept of the Enlightenment subject has a fully centred, unified, endowed with the capacities of reason, consciousness and action characteristics. It is also a very 'individualist' conception of the subject and 'his' identities. Secondly, "sociological subject" reflected the growing complexity of the modern world and in interaction with "others" and affected from culture. This way of understanding focuses on the intersection between self and society. "Postmodern subject" is related with shifts and multiplication of systems of meaning and cultural representation. It is conceptualised as having no fixed, essential or permanent identity.

Similar to Hall's (1992) historical classifications of identity, Benwell and Stokoe (2006: 18-19) make another classification according to main cultural and intellectual movements: the Enlightenment self, the Romantic self, the psychodynamic self, and the postmodern self. Starting with Renaissance, within the humanist perspective, Enlightenment is related with "a growing secularisation, the use of reason, experimental scientific method and emphasis on individuality". Secondly, "the romantic self" was a product the Romantic Movement which developed as reaction to some elements of the Enlightenment. "Within Romanticism, the subject is theorised as an expression something innate, but predicated on sensibility and feeling rather than cognition." (Benwell and Stokoe, 2006: 19). The third conceptualisation, "psychodynamic self" was developed with effects of Freud's works in early 20th century. In this conceptualisation, the individual mind was taken as a defining feature

of identity. Lastly, the postmodern self is a formation of late-modern or postmodern times and this is described by Benwell and Stokoe's own words clearly:

> Late modern identity is bound up with both challenge and conformity to essentialism, and throughout its texture we can also trace lines left by the earlier movements. On the one hand, theorists of modern identity emphasise concepts such as 'fluidity', 'migration', 'diaspora', 'crossing' and decentring. On the other hand, much attention is paid to individuals' strategies for shoring up an authentic sense of self in an uncertain world, including the revival of traditions of 'self-improvement' and psychoanalytically-inspired explorations of the self. (2006: 22)

With modernity, discourses of identity gained different aspects. In recent years, these discursive proliferation and critics more expanded. The issue of "identity" has been highly debated in psychology, social, cultural, and political theories in recent years. There are different routes in the history of "identity" studies. Each disciplines focuses different aspect of the identity and uses different theoretical and methodological approaches in research.

> Identity' is one of the most fundamental of all social theoretical concepts. In its most general meaning, it refers to the marking by humans of similarities and differences between things of all kinds and their use to classify, and impart meaning to, the world. Within social theory, the notion of identity is shorthand for humans believing they know who they themselves are, and who others are, in a manner that because it is encoded in language and a range of non-verbal symbolic registers is infinitely more elaborate than the affiliational and oppositional repertoires of other higher primates. Without this complex capacity to know and name self and others, the human world, as we know it, would be an impossible creation. (Harrington and others 2006: 262)

This discursive multiplication on identity urges us to think about new ways of understanding, conceptualizing and researching identity. Generally, main critics focus on conventional understanding and conceptualising of identity as "integral, originary, and unified" (Hall, 2006: 15). In this point, Hall stress "discursive approach" as new way of understanding and studying identity:

> In common sense language, identification is constructed on the back of recognition of some common origin or shared characteristics with another person or group, or with an ideal, and with the natural closure of solidarity and allegiance established on this foundation. In contrast with the 'naturalism' of this definition, the discursive approach sees identification as a construction, a

process never completed – always in process. (2006: 16)

In addition to conventional "integral, originary, and unified" understandings, one of the most debated issues in identity studies is the ambiguity of the identity conceptualizations. While analyzing identity studies, Hall (1992: 274) emphasis this ambiguity: "The trends are too recent and too ambiguous, and the very concept we are dealing with -identity- too complex, too underdeveloped, and too little understood in contemporary social science to be definitively tested."

There are different reasons make identity conceptualisations ambiguous. Transnational population movements in the post-war process, identity based "new social movements" with 1960s, and "cultural turn" and "linguistic or discursive turn" in disciplinary fields, and globalisation considerably affected understandings of identity and culture. Thereby critiques to static notions of identity and culture in the literature have been growing. Culture gained more importance and role in social, cultural and political theories increased. Different forms of identity, especially cultural ones, national, racial, ethnic, religious, gender identities- entered to agendas of disciplines. The "difference" aspect was added to identity studies in addition to "sameness". New forms of identity focusing on interculturality and hybridity were conceptualised: "hybrid", "creolized", "hyphenated" and "diasporic" identities (Caglar, 1997)

### 2.3.1. Essentialist/Naturalistic/Foundationalist Approaches

Essentialism is a general name of way of understanding and conceptualisation that assumes an essential core or a fundamental essence in culture or sociality. "This term has been, since the mid-1980s, at the heart of the debates about extent to which the human condition is formed by natural characteristics of gender and race" (Evans, 2006: 172). Early understandings of identity in the social theory are generally called and criticised as "essentialist", because, it is accepted that identity has fixed, natural, static, universal, unified and groupist characteristics. Snow and others (2005: 391) critices:

21

The essentialist perspective reduces the source of identity to a single determinative attribute regarded as the individual's or collectivity's defining essence. Essentialist perspectives encompass both structural and primordial logics. Structuralists understand identity to be rooted in elements of the social structure, such as roles, networks, and broader social categories, such as social class, ethnicity, and nationality. Alternatively, primordialists understand identity as deriving essentially from presumed biological givens, such as sex and race. Neither of these essentialist variants ignores historical factors or social changes, but these factors are treated more as intervening variables that affect the relative salience and pervasiveness of the structural and biological roots of identity.

Historical roots of the primordialist understanding go to the Romanticism as a reaction to the Enlightenment rationalism. Furthermore, ties of blood, language, and culture are accepted as natural in this perspective.

In the classical social theory, Marx's "class consciousness"; Tonnies's "Gemeinschaft" (a historical transition from "gemeinschaft'/community to "gessellschaft"/association); Durkheim's "collective consciousness" (from the mechanical solidarity to organic solidarity); Weber's "Verstehen" (class, status, ethnicity); Simmel's multiple group affiliations ("The Web of Group Affiliations") concepts are accepted as an indirect way of conceptualizing of the identity. However, the main critics to these conceptualisations are that these have natural, essential and groupist characteristics. Following this understanding, the notion of identity addresses:

the 'we-ness' of a group, stressing the similarities or shared attributes around which group members coalesce. Early literature approached these attributes as 'natural' or 'essential' characteristics –qualities emerging from physiological traits, psychological predispositions, regional features, or the properties of structural locations. A collective's members were believed to internalize these qualities, suggesting a unified, singular social experience, a single canvas against which social actors constructed a sense of self. (Cerulo, 1997: 396-7).

Binary oppositional characteristic of the classical social theory produces essentialist, static, and unitary conceptions. "Because these oppositions assume a fixity of ontological position, we cannot recognize the diverse, fragmented, contradictory, and multiplex nature of the phenomena being addressed." (Anthias, 1999: 126). According to Woodward (1997), there are two types of fixity of identity, or two

kinds of essentialism: "fixity as 'historical'" (universal, transhistorical search for roots and kinship ties) and "fixity as 'natural'" (biological).

Although an essentialist definition of an identity assume that there is one clear, authentic set of characteristics which all members share and which do not change across time, a non-essentialist definition differences, as well as common or shared characteristics both within the group and with other groups (Woodward 1997: 4). These assumptions of natural or biological fixity prevent us to think on historicity and contingency of the identification and differentiation. Lewis and Phoenix (2004: 128) emphasis on "Essentialist notions of identity can prevent us from seeing what is the same is about people of different 'ethnicities' and what is different about people within the same 'ethnic group'." (Lewis and Phoenix, 2004: 128)

### 2.3.2. Social Constructionist Approaches

Social constructionism is a generic name given to anti-essentialist theories. It is opposed to universal, trans-historical and biological explanations for objects and events and also representationalist account of language, or in other words correspondence between signs and objects (Barker, 2004: 32). While essentialist accounts assumes that identity has primordialist, naturalist, static characteristics, social constructionist perspective "rejects any category that sets forward essential or core features as the unique property of a collective's members" and for this approach, "every collective becomes a social artifact- an entity molded, refabricated, and mobilized in according with reigning cultural scripts and centers of power." (Cerulo 1997: 387). Thereby, identities are regarded as the product of negotiation, interpretation, and presentation, rather than biologically preordained, structurally given, or dispositionally determined (Cerulo, 1997).

Identity as a social construction refers to historicity of identification and to dependency on social, cultural and political context. Essentialist perspectives assuming an essence and stability ignore historical, political and contextual features of identity. Moreover, in identity studies, social contructionism "has contributed to dissipating transcendentalist conceptions of identity and directing the attention of

researchers to social action rather than to psychological constructs." (de Fina and others, 2006: 2).

Brubaker (2004a: 3) criticizes constructionism in terms of its two characteristic. Firstly, the notion of social construction is not wrong, however it is today too obviously right, too familiar, too readily taken for granted, to generate the friction, fordce and freshness needed to push arguments further and generate new insights. Second is causally conjoining of constructivist and groupist language. Instead of a groupist and constructionist language, Brubaker (2004a: 3) offers "a relational, processual, and dynamic language".

A different criticis to constructionism is made by postmodern approaches. As Cerulo (1997: 391) notes, constructionist approach to identity is seen as insufficient because of two reasons. Because, it simply catalogues the identity construction process, and also these categories are built through interactive effort, thereby underemphasize the role of power in the classification process. For postmoderns, "the variation within identity categories" is as impostant as "the variation between identity categories". "[T]he postmodern-identity scholars deconstructs established identity categories and their accompanying rhetoric in an effort to explore the full range of 'being'" (Cerulo, 1997: 391)

### 2.3.3. Anti-Foundational, Relational, Processual, and Dynamic Approaches

Brubaker, in his book "Ethnicity without groups" (2004), criticizes "ethnicity conceptualization" in the relevant literature in terms of mainly two aspects: groupism and constuctivism. Instead of a groupist and constructivist language in ethnicity and identity studies, he offers an alternative approach. According to Brubaker, this approach should be "a relational, processual, and dynamic language" and should:

> seek to develop ways of analyzing ethnicity without invoking bounded groups, and to do so in a manner that gives the constructivist project renewed analytical purchase. They share a commitment to disaggregated modes of analysis, but this not entails an ontological and methodological individualism. The alternative to the substantialist idiom of bounded groups is not an idiom of individual choice, but rather (...) a relational, processual, dynamic analytical language. (Brubaker, 2004a: 3).

This critic to groupist language "does not seek to banish 'groups' from the study of ethnicity; it seeks, rather, to open up that study to other ways in which ethnicity 'works'. Bounded and solidary groups are one modality of ethnicity (and of social organization more generally). But they are only one modality. 'Groupness' is a variable, not a constant; it cannot be presupposed." (Burbaker, 2004a: 4).

Using of "identity" in different areas, in politics, everyday talks and social sciences, varies. Generally it is thought that identity have stabilized, reified, essentialist and groupist qualities. In order to abstain from this trap, I will use "identification" instead of "identity". According to Brubaker (2004: 4) "This is a term that has been asked to do a great deal of analytical work, and much of it work is legitimate and important. But it is also a deeply ambiguous term, divided between "soft" and "hard" meanings, between groupist assumptions and constructivist qualifiers, between connotations of unity and multicipity, sameness and difference, permanence and change".

> Ethnicity, race, and nation should be conceptualized not as substances or things or entities or organisms or collective individuals – as the imagery discrete, concrete, tangible, bounded, and enduring 'groups' encourages us to do – but rather in relational, processual dynamic, eventful, and disaggregated terms. This means thinking of ethnicity, race, and nation not in terms of substantial groups or entities but in terms of practical categories, situated action, cultural idioms, cognitive schemas, discursive frames, organizational routines, institutional forms, political projects, and contingent events. It means thinking of ethnicization, racialization, and nationalization as political, social, cultural, and psychological processes. And it means taking as a basic analytical category not the 'group' as an entity but groupness as a contextually fluctuating conceptual variable. (Brubaker, 2004b: 10)

The process of identity studies reveals a shift from as an "entity" or "structure" understanding to the representational or discursive forms. "Arguably, the most important new complication for identity studies was shift from examining what identity is to how identity is discursively constructed." (Wetherell, 2010: 13). In order to make an inquiry on "how identity discursively constructed", it is need to non-essentialist, relational, processual, dynamic, contexual analytical language. Therefore, "intersectionality" seems to more suitable frame and methodology. Because "It is time now to go beyond 'identity'- not in the name of an imagined universalism, but in the name of the conceptual clarity required for social analysis

and political understanding alike." (Brubaker, 2004a: 4). In the next part, "intersectionality" as the frame of the study will be examined and debated.

## 2.4. INTERSECTIONALITY

In this study, I tried to make an intersectional analysis to reveal "complex, contextual, and comparative relations" (Choo and Ferree, 2010:137) among ethnicity, gender and class as main domains of identity and difference. Researches and conceptualisations on identity have undergone a new transition since 1990s, with a critique and contribution from the feminist theory and the women studies. Gender as a single and unitary category started to be questioned, because especially ethnicity and class differences among women were ignored. Therefore, it is offered to focus intertwining characteristics of or relationships between analytical categories, instead of only a single and unitary analytical category. This new approach was conceptualised as "intersectionality". Although this approach is a contribution from feminist studies, it "implies more than gender research, more than studying differences between women and men, and more than diversities within women's groups and within men's groups." (Knudsen, 2006: 61). Moreover, intersectionality, is "in the process of burgeoning" (Phoenix, 2006: 187) and debates on it, a theory or a methodology, has been continuing. "Some suggest that intersectionality is a theory, others regard it as a concept or heuristic device, and still others see it as a reading strategy for doing feminist analysis." (Davis, 2008: 68). A second discussion continues on in which disciplines and topics intersectionality can be applied. "It is not at all clear whether intersectionality should be limited to understanding individual experiences, to theorizing identity, or whether it should be taken as a property of social structures and cultural discourses." (Davis, 2008: 68).

According to Knudsen (2006: 61), "the word intersection means that one line cuts through another line, and can be used about streets crossing each other." The term "intersectionality" was firstly used in 1989 by Crenshaw, in the article on intersection of race/colour and gender, "for the phenomenon of the merging and mingling of multiple markers of difference" (Ludvig, 2006: 246). According to Ken (2007: 12)

Among the first 'inter-' terms used to convey the relationship among race, class, and gender were 'interconncected', by Audre Lorde, Davis, and others in the early 1980s, 'interlocking' by Patricia Hill Collins in 1986, and 'interrelated' by Karen Brodkin Sacks in 1989.

However, with the use of Crenshaw (1989, 1991) and Collins, the term 'intersection' is put into the centre of the paradigm. Intersecionality is accepted a way of understanding, conceptualizing and studying way of social divisions in terms of identity and difference, and inequality or stratification and oppression in the literature (Anthias, 1998: 515).

"The 'intersection' imagery relies on the notion that race and class and gender separate entities that come together -intersect- at specific experiential and structural points." (Ken, 2007: 12). Although "intersectionality" is accepted as one of the most important contributions to feminist scholarship and has a popularity in research practices, "there has been considerable confusion concerning what the concept actually means and how it can or should be applied in feminist inquiry" (Davis, 2008: 67).

"'Intersectionality' refers to the interaction between gender, race, and other categories of difference in individual lives, social practices, institutional arrangements, and cultural ideologies and the outcomes of these interactions in terms of power." (Davis, 2008: 68). This perspective focuses on overlapping or crosscutting particulars of identity and analyzes one form of identity in relation to one another. In this approach, identities are understood "as intertwining system" (Krekula, 2007: 163). In other words, As Knudsen (2006: 61) notes: "Intersectionality may be defined as a theory to analyse how social and cultural categories intertwine. The relationship between gender, race, ethnicity, disability, sexuality, class and nationality are examined." Davis explores:

> Intersectionality seemed ideally suited to the task of exploring how categories of race, class, and gender are intertwined and mutually constitutive, giving centrality to questions like how race is 'gendered' and how gender is 'racialized', and how both are linked to the continuities and transformations of social class. (Davis, 2008: 71)

Intersectonality tries to de-construct static conceptualizations of identity and "the binary oppositions and universalism inherent in the modernist paradigms of Western philosophy and science." (Davis 2008: 71; from Phoenix, 2006 & Brah and Phoenix, 2004). This way of research requires new theoretical framing and provides better understanding of complex dynamics of identitification. Instead of focusing only one aspect of identity/difference, studying one aspect with relations/intersections of other aspects provides better understanding of the complexity of identity/difference and sociality. However "the concept it donates had been employed in feminist work on how women are simultaneously positioned as women and, for example, as black, working class, lesbian or colonial subjects" (Phoenix, 2006: 187; from Brah and Phoenix, 2004).

According to McCall (2005: 1771), intersectionality means that "the relationship among multiple modalities and subject formations" and "a central category of analysis". Moreover, there are three approaches in the intersectionality and "all three attempt to satisfy the demand for complexity and, as a result, face to manage complexity, if for no other reason than to attain intelligibility." McCall (2005) classifies these three approaches according to "their stance toward categories, that is, how they understand and use analytical categories to explore the complexity of intersectionality in social life": Anticategorical complexity, intercategorical complexity, intracategorical complexity.

To conclude, intersectionality provides a sociological framefork for analysing identity and difference in this study through focusing on relationships between cultural and economical bases.

# CHAPTER 3


# METHODOLOGY


## 2.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter examines and discusses methodological tools used in this research, and also summarize fieldwork process. This chapter includes four parts. The first part outlines the research design, the sources of data generation, sampling, and gives brief information about the case. In the second part, techniques of data generation and data analysis are explained. While interviewing and observational methods were tried to be integrated to generate data, this data was analysed according to intersectional analysis method. In the last part of this chapter, fieldwork process, including insider/outsider positionings, and difficulties and strengths of the field study is summarized.

## 2.2. RESEARCH DESIGN AND SAMPLING

In this study, the intersectionality of identifications and differentiations are tried to be understood and analysed in terms of the narrative construction of the interviewee and observational data. To make intersectional analysis manageable, the sample was limited to native Mardinian Arabs.

There are different spheres in which identity is constructed, sustained and changed. Identity, basically, is a question of "who is who" or "who others are". However, firstly, its answer could not be reduced to only one domain of identity, rather it is used situational. Secondly, it is not an "imaginary" thing, rather may be accepted as an "imagined" construction. Therefore, the important point to understand is that why it was constructed in this way, instead of any other way. To find and reveal the reasons, it is needed to focus on the process and historical changes. Reasons are:

- Mardin is the case of the study as it hosts people from different religions, ethnicity or languages for centuries.

- How an ethnic identity, specifically Mardinian Arab identity, is affected from these ethnical and religious differences?

- Diversity in a society is not only based on "cultural", but also social, economical and political. Mardin as the case of the study is not only culturally diverse; it is also socially and economically diverse. Therefore, in addition to ethnic and religious diversity, class and gender differences are analysed as an intersection of ethnicity.

- Intersectionality, as a new way of understanding, analyzing and conceptualising identity, is selected for studying these domains of identity.

One of the determining reason choosing qualitative interviewing is that qualitative interviewing is more suitable for identity studies, because identity is a sensitive issue to make a study on it. Furthermore, qualitative methods aims to to reveal "how people understand their world and their lives" (Kvale, 2007). Specifically, this study focuses on how people understand and construct their discourses of identity and difference in formation process. With interviewing as technique of data generation, it is possible to capture people's own expressions as noted by Kvale (2007: 12):

> The interview is a uniquely sensitive and powerful method for capturing the experiences and lived meanings of the subjects' everyday world. Interviews allow the subjects to convey to others their situation from their own perspective and in their own words.

As a part of research design of the study, I focused relations with theoretical debates on identity and specialities of Mardin case. In this inquiry, I try to understand and analyze the context and specifities of the field or to see "how things work in particular context" (Mason, 2004: 1). Therefore, making a lightly structured research design is required to achive this aim. People may not tell their ideas or feelings expressly in a structured interview, especially identity-related sensitive issues. Therefore, instead of directly asking, a lightly structured questionnaire seems more

suitable for this issue. Moreover, I tried to capture historical and contextual specifities of identification dynamics thrugh interviewing.

To determine the sample, I used purposive sampling according to ethnic, class/place and gender differences. The main focus of the study is that how ethnicity, class and gender intersect in the case of Arab population of Mardin. During the fieldwork process, I decided to restrict the case with Arabs to manage data in the analysis and level of communication. Individuals, Arab dwellers of urban Mardin aged over 50 were selected as the sample of the study. The reason of this is that their being witness of spatially and demographically transformation of the city starting with 1960s. Their discourses and narratives on identity generated by formal and informal interviews, and conversations are taken as sources of this study.

One of the important demographical and class related changes in the Mardin is the construction of two main districts in the city centre. A new district in the bottom part of the old-town was constructed in early 1980s, with migrations from villages of Mardin mainly because of political reasons and forced migrations. These districts are called as "margins" or "slums" (varoş) in the daily uses of Arabs. In these margins of the old-town mainly Kurds and some Arabs from lower class were settled. The new urban site is called as "new-town" (yeni-şehir) in the daily language. This site was constructed with migrations of more wealthy families from the old-town. New-town includes people with different ethnic affiliations including Arab, Kurd, and Syriac and Turk officials. However, the main speciality of the new-town is more related with class position.

## 2.3.    METHODS OF DATA GENERATION AND DATA ANALYSIS

In this inquiry, I use the term "data generation", instead of "data collection", because, data is not a thing "'out there as an already existing stock of knowledge, ready to be collected and independent of our interpretations as researchers" (Mason, 2004: 51). Qualitative researcher is not a completely neutral collector of knowledge about sociality or culture, because s/he actively constructs and analyzes knowledge according to a chosen theoretical/epistemological position. As Mason (2004: 52)

notes that "(...) the term method in qualitative research generally is meant to imply more than a practical technique or procedure for gaining data. It also implies a data generation process involving activities that are intellectual, analytical and interpretative."

I tried to use and integrate different data sources and data generation methods to understand the complexity of the identity formation in this culturally diverse site more completely. As ways of generating data, interviewing, both formal lightly structured life story and informal speeches, and observational, systematic and non-systematic, methods were used. For research questions of this study, "people's knowledge, views, understandings, interpretations, experiences, and interactions are meaningful properties of the social reality" and data sources (Mason, 2004: 62). In the analysis, I tried use these sources as data.

In order to find answers to my research questions, I needed to use multiple sources and multiple methods. In order to increase the quality of the data and to understand the context and to put it easily within this context, this long process of my living in my studying area becomes considerably beneficial for research. Supporting interviewing data with observational methods provided me to increase the quality of data, to understand other dynamics of the context and to interpret the data generated by interviews within its context. It is highly related with how the text is constructed and how observations and informal interviews included in the text as a part verification and validity of the data.

Among a lot of methods of making qualitative research, "the interviewing" and "the observation" are more suitable techniques to generate discursive/narrative data about identification and differentiation. In the literature on identity studies, Abdelal et al. (2009: 4) found four main methods which were the most widely used methods for measuring identity: surveys, content analysis, discourse analysis, and ethnography. Among these methods, the importance of discoursive data is expressed by Abdelal et al. (2009: 7):

For our purposes, scholars who write rich descriptions of cases are engaged in discourse analysis, especially in the sense that they are relying on their own interpretive skills and social knowledge to write convincingly about the content and contestation of an identity. Discourse analysis thus can be considered the qualitative contextualization of texts and practices in order to describe social meanings.

Formal and recorded life story interviewing provides dwellers' with an account of how identity is constructed in their own discourse. Life story as a method of interviewing also provides for more in-depth information and understanding historicity, in addition to contextuality of identification, thereby contingency. Although, most social research (survey, observation, in-depth interviews etc.) focuses on very limited periods of time; life history or life story provides more historical data for the case. Moreover, "what may be of greatest interest in the life story is how people see themselves and how they want others to see" (Atkinson, 2001: 20).

Various informal interviews and conversations provided me with the opportunity of adding information to formal interviews, and more fragmented but related information on the research question. This also provided me with a deeper understanding the dynamics of the case and context. In unrecorded interviews and conversation, an individual feel more comfortable to share their ideas than in the recorded interviewing. While lightly-structured life story interviews were recorded on the audio tape, related aspects of informal speeches and interviews were noted after conversations. Among these notes, critical ones were used in the analysis.

To generate observational data, living in the 'setting' for a definite period is required. Observational methods refer to "generating data, which entail the researcher immersing herself or himself in a research 'setting' so that they can experience and observe at the first hand a range of dimensions in and of that setting." (Mason, 2004: 84). The significance of "immersion" in the research setting is noted by Mason (2004: 55) as following.

It is generally about the study of culture (or similar concepts), and is based on an epistemology which says that culture can be known through cultural and social settings. Ethnographers (...) lay great emphasis on a researcher's 'first-hand experience' of a setting, and on observational methods. The metaphor of 'immersion' in a setting is very frequently used, and says much about ethnography's ontological and epistemological orientations. It emphasizes the use of cultural settings a s data sources (sometimes seen as natural settings), and argues that the best -although not the only- way of generating knowledge of these is for a researcher to get right inside them.

The data generated through integrating interviewing and observational methods in this inquiry helped me to build up a more holistic picture of the case and to understand the complexity of the issue. Adding observational methods to the interview methods is considerably suitable to study on identity. If compared with previous studies on identity and cultural difference in Mardin, methodological choice of this study provided to capture new points. If I did not make and add informal interviews and participant observation to data to sources to analyse, I could not some critical points and definitions in people's self-expressions. Observation provided also understanding differences between "the told" in interviews and "the lived" in the site.

As a method of data analysis "intersectional analysis" of discursive and observational data is used. In the analysis, I tried to integrate data from different techniques including semi-structured interviews, informal interviews, and observations. I focused on intersecting points and tried to catch how, when and why domains of identity intersected, or specifically, ethicised, classed or gendered for this study. concerning. Moreover, it is needed to focus on which domains of identity are selected in particular times and particular place. It is due to reveal how identity formation is contextal, historical, contingent. The question of "when" makes identity formation as historical and processual. The question of "how is considered as ethnicity, gender, and class as mutually constructed and intersected for this study. The question of "why" provides understanding specific reasons of selecting different expressions. Furthermore, uses of terms ethnicity, class, and gender are not enough to reveal complexity and to make intersectional analysis for some cases. As a part of these uses, terms of "ethnicised/ethnicisation", "classed", and "gendered" are also required.

## 2.4. FIELDWORK PROCESS

### 2.4.1. Researching in the Living Site, or Living in the Researching Site

Mardin as the case of this study is also the city which I've been living in since February 2009. Mardin with its changing ethnically and religiously heterogeneous past and present seemed possible for me to study on the dynamics of living together with similarities and differences in the urban Mardin. I decided to conduct my thesis research on the experience of living together or co-presence in Mardin. To understand these dynamics, I decided to use interviewing as a method of data generation. However, living in the case or studying in the living place provided an opportunity to participate in and observe the life experienced in the city. In this process the urban Mardin became a whole space of observation for me. This process includes about two year in the new-town and one year in the old-town. Furthemore, I found a stone-made old house which I am settled as a renter in the old-town thanks to a person who I made an interview for this study.

This researching and writing process of this thesis also becomes a rethinking of my identity perception and the role of identity in the life. I asked different questions: What is the role of structural points in our identity expressions? How limits our actions, ideas, imagination? How and why we need and get identity? Where do we choose different identity expressions? When and why some markers of identity visible or non-visible? Why we need identity in our daily life? What is the role of identity in social and cultural life?

In the begining to this study, I reviewed related studies on identity and cultural diversity in Mardin (Sarı, 2007; Biner, 2007; Öktem, 2007; Erol, 2008). These studies, in brief, focus on intercultural communication, ethnic and religious identity, effects of political changes in the recent past.  In addition to literature reviewing, as a dweller in Mardin I had many possibilities to observe and attend relations between natives, thereby to think constantly on research question of this study during this process. This situation made relations between the case and theoretical problems more dynamic for me.

35

Furthermore, I attended many conferences and symposiums organised in Mardin and I listened different academical and political speeches about history, identity, cultural diversity, native communities of Mardin. I heard questions and critics to these speeches asked by listeners among Mardinins. It is thanks to being an academic member of Mardin Artuklu University. Moreover, I followed news and comments in local media of Mardin in the web. I follwed "facebook" pages about Mardin and Mardinian Arabs. Although I haven't directly used these types of information as a data to analyse, I had an idea about their sentiments in particular isssues to understand the case more.

Through living in the city and conducting relations with dwellers, I became more an insider to the city, I could understand more complexities effecting relations among people of different ethnicities or religions. Through making comparisons between discourses on cultural diversity of Mardin in different studies, academical and political speeches, and the way of experiencing life, the absence of gender and class aspects in ethnicity drew my attention.

Observations and informal interviews provided me to see two important points. Firstly, intercultural relations, and the role of cultural diversity in identity formation differ according to gender and class differences, and it could not be restricted with ethnic and religious belongings. Secondly, demographical mobility and spatial configurations effects experiencing intercultural relations and dynamics of identification. This process provided me to see complexities and relations between ethnicity, class, and gender positionalities as intersecting domains of identity. This is also considered as determining characteristics of qualitative research, as Mason (2004: 24) states:

> Thinking qualitatively means rejecting the idea of a research design as a single document which is an entire advance blueprint for a piece of research. It also means rejecting the idea of *a priori* strategic and design decisions, or that such decisions can and should be made only at the beginning of the research process. This is because qualitative research is characteristically exploratory, fluid and flexible, data-driven and context sensitive. (2004: 24)

I could understand the difference between experienced life and told life in the case of this study. In this study, integration of interviewing and observational methods could be considered as an effort to integrate told life and experienced life. Told life as a different process from experienced life provides information about people's own understandings and construction of identity through language.

## 2.4.2. Insiderness and Outsiderness

In this section, I examines my "constant negotiation" (Ergun and Erdemir, 2009: 3) between insiderness and outsidernes in terms of not being from Mardin or the region; ethnic and religious backgrounds; class and professional position; spatial choice; political views; uses of languages. It is a process for me to understand and discover reflections of identity and neighbour terms in this case. Mardin as a city of religious, ethnic and linguistic diversities was new for me when decided a research on Mardin. In Mardin, belongings are quite strong to make and sustain relations, to solve problems and to establish trust. Belongings are active implicitly and explicitly in daily life due to co-existence with differences. Therefore, these conditions of Mardin provide thinking and understanding more on the role and significance of belongings in the life. As a result, my belongings became quite important to contact with them and to interview with them.

During the fieldwork process, my multiple identities and researcher status had a role in my contact and relations with informants to generate data. Insider and outsider positioning is related with my identities and status as a researcher. It requires "constant negotiation" (Ergun and Erdemir, 2009: 3) with individuals living in the research area. This process includes interaction and dialogue with dwellers, and participation in some events. To overcome my position of outsiderness, in the process of becoming an insider, the period I spent in the field was important. Constant interaction provided them to know and accept me. This constructed a trust relation, and thereby made communication closer. My belongings and qualities including age, gender, ethnicity, religion and working position became important to contact. It is my way of experiencing my identity positions. Working in the university and living in Mardin as non-Mardinian sometimes limited me. Due to

sharing same place and possibilities of meeting in different sites limits them to speak much more comfortably. The reason is that I am also a part of the dynamics and life in Mardin.

In the beginning I settled in TOKİ in the new city two years, and I moved to the old-city for one years. In this manner, I became part of neighbourhood relations in the district. As a settler of these two different ways of settlement, I could easily comparions between relations and perceptions in these two sites.

My position in the city as a dweller majored on daily relations and communication during the process. In a time, this turned from "participant observation" to "participation". While interviews provided more historical information on near past and understanding transformation, observation provided information about present situation and comparing said life-told and life-lived.

The process of research in the field reveals me importance, role and effect of identity positioning to communicate with people and to generate data. Living in the same site and affecting from the same dynamics. It became also a new process of my understanding of my identity with the experience in the field.  I have different identities in the field. The most determining is being researcher.

The process of research in this case, meant living in the research field or studying in the living field for me. From the beginning of the research to end of the writing, it took about three years. Living in my field of study differentiated my relations with subjects of the field and techniques to generate data, compared to a researcher coming to the city to conduct a research, only. In this process, I realized a lot of systematic and non-systematic observations, participation, informal speeches and formal interviews. Living in the field provided me with a different knowledge about the issue I've problematicised, more understanding of complexities of the case and the context. This experience facilitated understanding and analyzing the data.

My position in the field was not a "research and exit" situation, living in it was an ongoing process. This process of living and researching brought also a transformation for my insider and outsider position in the field, as noted by Ergun

and Erdemir (2009: 3): "the identities of researchers in the field are in constant negotiation with the informants". This process of ongoing interaction and interrelation with subjects of the city, and the experience of living in these structural conditions provided me to see "the complexity and ambivalence of the researcher's transformative experiences in the field." (Ergun & Erdemir, 2009: 2).

Living in Mardin restricted relations with natives in a sense, because I could again encounter and communicate with them in different sites. There are many sites and different types of relations including customer, neighbourhood, and etc. In other words, I am not only a researcher coming to Mardin to make only a research for them, and I have different roles and positions in the city an inhabitant. In different times, we encountered and speak about problems commonly affecting our life in the city, and other persons or communities. Furthermore, I shared books in my library, or articles and essays which I wrote to take their ideas and critics with some. Through different conversations, they listened and thereby learned my worldview and comments on different issues; and I learned their comments about different issues and people living in the city.

Being from outside of Mardin also is an advantage by not being a part of existing relations. If I were a local of Mardin, my family origin and its history, and interviewees' perceptions of my family would play an important role, and this might restrict their openness to share. For some, the possibility of contact after research and the sense of shared place played an important role in the interaction and openness of the informant. My profession as a research assistant at Mardin Artuklu University facilitated me to establish contacts in some cases. However, this was perceived by others doubtfully, with not always clearly asked questions in their mind about the research and its background.

Being outsider to the city at the beginning provided me with different insider and outsider positions. In a multi-religious and multi-ethnic setting, my religious and ethnic affinities, and their perception of my affinities or differences played an important role. Being Turk as ethnic background or coming from Western site of Turkey facilitated my relations and communication with Arabs. However, if I was a

Kurd, this type of study on Mardinian Arabs could become much more difficult. However, it changes in the case of Kurds. My thoughs about Kurds and Kurdish issue and membering to Eğitim-Sen became more important for them to accept me in a more insider sense. For Christian Syriacs, my religious belonging and views became determining for them. After they learned that although I was a person coming from a Muslim background, I am deist, they spoke with me in a more explicit and confident sense. These changing positional ties could be considered within the framework of cultural diversity of the city.

In the begining of this inquiry, I interviewed with Syriacs, Arabs and Kurds who are speaking Turkish well. This could be considered as a restriction for this study. Although I don't know local Arabic or Kurdish languages, and people mainly use these languages in their daily life, language did not become a significant limitation to communicate and interview with them. This only restricted me to make some daily speeches with them, especially women. Moreover, Syriacs as a different religious and ethnic community living in the city choose Arabic language in their daily life due to that Arabic is "lingua franca" of the city. Syriac language is mainly used in religious ceremonies in the Churches, in addition to Turkish and Arabic in the Mardin city centre. Syriac people generally say that they don't know Syriac language. It is due to institutional restrictions on teaching their mother tongue. However, it is expressed that Syriacs living in Midyat area know and use Syriac language in their daily life. Therefore, they use Arabic in their daily life and relations both within their own community and with others.

In my case, formal and informal interviews were made in Turkish. However, their mother tongue is different from Turkish, it's Arabic. Apart from daily dialogs, people express themselves more comfortably with their mother language. However, today Turkish is increasingly used in daily life, especially in the new-town. The increasing number of Kurds, who generally does not know Arabic and the decreasing numbers of Arabs in the city, make Turkish a more common used language to communicate between inhabitants.

While my gender position, being "man" in the field makes easier to communicate with men, but it restricted me to make interview with women. Due to gender density in the outside, women's expressions stayed lesser. My relations were much more with artisans and tradesmen in the old-town, ethnically and religiously mixed, but only with men. These way relations with natives became more frequent after I settled in the old-town through neighbourhod relations.

Furthermore, I noticed that there is a tendency that although they were hospitable and open to communication, they abstain speaking about conflict and disagreement issues in their daily life, and political issues.

Being an "outsider" seemed to be a limitation for the inquiry at the beginning. However, living in the setting about three years also decreased possible negative effects. Moreover, being an outsider, in some cases, became an advantage and provided people with more trust and relaxation in telling their life story. These negotiated positionalities emphasized by Ergun and Erdemir (2009: 19) as following:

> (...) researchers treat fieldwork uncertainties around insider-outsider identities not as a challenge but as an opportunity to see and experience the field in novel ways. These uncertainties, when conveyed to the readers as part of a self-reflexive narrative, have the potential to provide a richer and complex understanding of the field and its dynamics.

As a result, Mardin is not a place for me only to research, it a place to live in. I did not take a place and make contact with them only as a researcher in the field, and this position and my relations with inhabitants continues today. Therefore, the fieldwork process turns to a constant process of fieldwork. In the course of time, my position turned from participant observation to more on a participant as a dweller, and as a member of the city. As much as it is a process of internalizing by natives and becoming more insiderness, it became a process of my internalizing the city and dwellers. I became a subject affecting life dynamics, transitions, encountering, problems etc. in the city. I became a part of dynamics and tensions related to city and settlers.

To conclude, if I only used recorded interviewing as technique of data generation for this, I could not capture some critical points in their identity expressions, and I could not situate their expressions to its context. Through this way of researching, I could conceive the role of "context" and "intersectionality" in identity formation

# CHAPTER 4

## ETHNIC DOMAINS OF IDENTITY AMONG MARDINIAN ARABS

### 4.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter is about "ethnic identity", and "ethnicised identity". It is different from "ethnic group" as one of form of the ethnicity (Brubaker 2004b). It tries to demonstrate how ethnicity intersects with class and gender, thereby how ethnicity is classed and gendered.

Etymologically, the word "ethnicity" comes from the Greek term "ethnos" or "ethnikos". The use of the term academically and popularly is fairly modern. Its sociological use was coined by D. Riesman in 1953 and became widespread in the 1960s and 1970s (Malasevic 2004: 1). Apart from the term "ethnicity", there are different ethnos-related concepts in the social and cultural theory literature: tribe, race, ethnic group, nation/nationality, minority, and collectivity/grouping.

The end of the colonialism and increasing cultural diversity with after-war transnational population movements prompted reconsideration on concepts related with "ethnicity", "identity", "culture", and "citizenship" in social, cultural and political theories. This is because new types of co-presence or living together affected relations between native and established people or citizens and immigrants, and immigrants and the state. This situation produced new discussions on social, cultural, economical, political and legal aspects of ethnicity. Through this rethinking, static and unitary understandings of ethnicity, culture, and identity shifted to more fragmented, processual and flexible understandings. In addition to descent or territory aspects in the old definitions, one of the critical additions in the meaning of ethnic or ethnic group is gaining immigrant minority definition (Malasevic 2004: 1).

In the literature on "ethnos", the terms "race" and "ethnicity" are frequently generally used. However, there is a risk that these words connote clear fixed biological or natural, and fixed cultural differences. Instead, the terms "racialised", "racialisation", or "ethnicised", and "ethnicisation" are more suitable to show that it is made significant in social practices (Lewis and Phoenix 2004: 123). According to Lewis and Phoenix (2004: 123), this way of conceptualisation differs from the terms "race" and "ethnicity" in two main ways. Firstly, "racialisiation" and "ethnicisation" emphasize "the social and psychological process involved in putting individuals and groups into 'racial' and 'ethnic' categories". Secondly, the terms "race" and "ethnicity" are no longer understood as natural or fixed things, instead accepted as "identities that result from particular ways of seeing people." These critics on using the words "race" and "ethnicity" reveal how "ethnos" is a processual, relational, changeable and situational construction.

In different theorisations on "ethnicity" or "ethnic group", cultural differences, and common descent/origin or common cultural heritage/tradition are stressed. Lewis and Phoenix (2004: 124) write of ethnicity that it 'refers to a group or community that is assumed to share common cultural practices and history. Religion, language and territory are all included in the term 'ethnicity'." While supporting this definition, De Vos (1995: 28) does not restrict it by group character: "Ethnicity is primarily a sense of belonging to a particular ancestry and origin and of sharing a specific religion or language." Consequently, as basic markers of forming the sense of ethnic belonging, these qualities could be drawn up: common descent and history, shared territory or the sense of homeland, language, common cultural practices, values, norms, symbols, artefacts, and common political experience.

To differ from other related belongings, De Vos (1995: 27) classifies commitments in four titles: past-oriented, future oriented, specific, and general. "Past-oriented commitments" is familial/cultural and associated with ethnicity or ethnic groups, and include loyalty to a tradition based on ancestry including race, religion, language and other cultural traditions. "Future-oriented commitments" are related to ideology, and political orientations. "Specific commitments" one is to loyalty to a profession and to

the social status it bestows. "General commitments" are related to citizenship and about to loyalty to a state, regardless of personal or family origin. According to De Vos "human history shows numerous combinations of tension, conflict, and accommodation related to conflicts between loyalty to a past ethnicity, a present status, or a future idealized concept of society." (De Vos 1995: 43). This part is much more about "past-oriented" familial and cultural commitments.

In this part, domains of ethnic identity to analyse discursive and observational data includes:

- Labels used in self identity expression

- Uses of mother tongues and other languages, and accent

- Marriage patterns

- Shared cultural practices

- Relations with religiously and ethnically others: Syriac Christians and Kurds.

These domains are analysed in terms of "a relational, processual, and dynamic language" (Brubaker, 2004a: 3) and intersectionality theory.

## 4.2. IDENTITY EXPRESSIONS OF MARDINIAN ARABS

This part is about Arabs' self identity perceptions and expressions. One of the important things for identity perception is how people label themselves and others. This gives clues as to which qualities are understood as more important than others. As a selection, it is contextual and relational because it should not be evaluated as valid for every situation.

There are different words referring to people's identity expression in Mardin. In order to understand when and why they choose one word and expression and not another, it is necessary to get involved with them in different interaction sites and situations. There are different expressions which could be caught in programmed and recorded interviews. However, these stay restricted when compared to daily uses in

its "natural" sites. This is because the word they choose or the way they describe "own-selves" and "themselves" changes according to time, context, position and interaction level. This reveals the contextuality of uses of identity. In order to catch this quality of the identity expression, participant observation became highly beneficial.

In this part, labels used for identity expression related to ethnicity are analysed under these titles: the sense of family belonging, the sense of Mardin belonging, the sense of being urban dweller, and the sense of being Arab. In addition to these labels, there are two ways of labelisation associated to the class position: "noble" (asil) and non-noble (asil-olmayan) between families; and çelebi", "efendi", and "ağa" (agha) for elites of the city. As expressed in interviews, these class-related titles were the most used identity expressions in the past.

### 4.2.1.  The Sense of Family Belonging: "Beyt" or "Sülale"

The sense of family or tribe belonging is quite strong in the region among Arabs and Kurds. In urban Mardin, the sense of grouping is much more based on familial closeness for Arabs. While "tribe" belonging is used for rural origin Arabs, it turns to "family" ("beyt" or "sülale" in daily use) in the city centre. "Family" in this sense could be evaluated as urbanised form corresponding to tribal belonging in rural sites. Deep-rooted family origins and narrations on the family, position in power relations of the family in the past are significant points frequently expressed in the interviews and conversations. They have and still protect a sense of common descent in terms of familial ties. This sense also continues with relatives on the other side of the border.

Relations between people are more family-centred and people are known by their family belonging. Everybody generally knows each other through the family s/he belonged to. Therefore the determining identity question is "which family do you belong to?" ("Kimlerdensin?"). It is the most used way of asking "who are you" to know people who s/he is and to put a person in a category. The answer of this question provides much information about the person via familial belongings. The way of expression in local language could be sampled as: "I'm from beyt-ül ..." or "I

am a member of ...zade". It is a way of understanding "who is who", and is also accepted as a sign of character of a person via family.

People generally settled in houses with their family members. There are familial concentrations in districts. Members of a family generally did not disperse in any other districts. This was much more possible for girls of families if married with a man settling in a different district. Family-based names come from "beyt" in Arabic which means "house". These names sometimes were given due to occupations of the family. In these cases, it is more related to class position. Class differences reflect the name chosen such as "zade" as an apparatus, and "noble" ("asil") as an adjective. Therefore, "zade" is only used for some elite and well-known families, not for all. In daily language to describe families the most used expressions are: "big families" ("büyük aileler"), "leading families" ("öndegelen aileler), "wealthy families" ("varlıklı aileler"), "rooted families" ("köklü aileler").

One of the important markers revealing the importance of family belonging for their identity formation is recorded family tree or genealogical chart. To know "who is who" and "where coming from" people benefit from their own family tree. Another significant indicator of why family belonging is determining in their identity formation is "the education and culture received in the family" ("aile terbiyesi ve aile kültürü"). It is expressed in interviews that their beliefs, values, religious rituals, customs and life-style is basically learned in the family. The states that they accepted familial education is more important than formal school education, as providing culture and life understanding.

In the years in which big families were more effective in social, economical and political life, family belonging could provide status, protection and power. One of the significant indicators of this family-based identity understanding can easily be observed in power relations and political struggles. According to the family belonged to, people keep in solidarity and continue relations with the members of previous generations. The number of population and having power provided a status for big families. To protect themselves from threats and risks and to solve problems with

others is related with the power the family belonged to. This is stated by a non-recorded interviewee as:

> Members of big families or close families mutually support and protect one another.[1]

Similar lines are detailed by SB:

> There are many communities of power in Mardin. With powerful community, I mean the families in these groups.
>
> M: Arab or Kurdish families?
>
> Among Arab families, for example some of Mişkin are Arab and in such community; people of Kabala are like this and Arab, Daşi family are Kurd and the same; also some Mişkin are Kurd but they have such group. Mıhallemi are also, as Arab, have such a community of power.
>
> M: What is the case with Christians?
>
> Christians do not possess such power. They live in the shade of one of these authorities.[2]

It reflects on political life and choices of individuals in Mardin. In different speeches on political life on Mardin, it is generally said that familial or tribal connections are determining factors. Every person knows each other by their family belonging and supports others according to this criterion. To support a candidate or a party, it is frequently expressed that a familial decision was taken. This reveals how political struggles are based on familial power and demography.

Today, clan, family and kinship senses and ties is in a dissolution process. In interviews and daily speeches, expression of the name of the family and the sense of "big family" continues today. However, its effects and role has substantially

---

1 Büyük aile üyeleri ya da yakın aileler birbirlerini tutarlar.

2 Bir sürü güç grubu var Mardin'de. Güç grubu dediğim, yani grubun içinde aileler.

M: Arap aileleri, Kürt aileleri?

Arap ailelerinden mesela Mişkinlerin bir kısmı Araptır böyledir, Kabalalılar böyledir Araptır, Daşiler Kürt'tür böyledir, Mişkinlerin bir kısmı da Kürttür, böyledir, Mıhallemiler böyledir, Araptır böyledir.

M: Hıristiyanlarda nasıldır?

Hısitiyanlar da yoktur, o yoktur. Hıristiyanlar bu güçlerden bir tanesinin gölgesinde yaşar.

decreased in general discourse and daily life, especially for new generations. It is much more an identity label, and its role in social life weakened.

Therefore, it not so rigid and has lost its priority in people's mind and daily life. This way of expression has lost its importance because of declining population and dissolving family and kinship ties. Ties and solidarity among the same family members or relatives has been weakening. Emigration and dissolution of urbanite strong, elite and big families also affected their role in the political, administrative and economic life in Mardin. Migrations of members of big families, changes in the economic activities caused a situation in which limited ties between members of inner-family and close families. For power struggle, newly migrated familial groups from some rural areas, Kurds or Arabs, gained important positions with 1960s. In the same migration process, the role of Kurd clans also weakened, and Kurds politicised and participated more on political struggles. Accordingly, while familial or tribal belongings, as a form of group belonging, weakens, a sense of ethnic identity, but not a strong group/ist form, has been increasing among Arabs.

## 4.2.2. The Sense of City Belonging: "Mardinian" and "Native"

Arabs of Mardin generally express their feeling generally not as an ethnic connotation; instead they prefer cultural difference based on family and culture, life-style, city values and customs, and class. Therefore they choose the names of "Mardinli" (hereafter Mardinian), "native" ("yerli"), or "native of Mardin" ("Mardin'in yerlisi"). "Mardinian" as a name of identity is chosen to refer people living in the urban space of Mardin for a long time. The choice of "Mardinian" or "native" instead of "Arab" as an ethnic name is to differ themselves from especially rural-origin people, Arabs or Kurds, and to emphasise a long past of their family, because they perceive themselves as historically natives of the urban of Mardin, excluding people of rural spaces. Their sense of "Mardinian" signifies belonging to the city, its long past and old city culture. In this part, how they perceive Mardin and "culture" is also evaluated in order to better understand their identity perception.

This sense of possession to the city and its culture excludes non-urban origin people, and less-cultured lower-class urbanite families. For local urban settlers, their choice of "Mardinian" put rural origin people on the outside of a sense "us", because, they think that they as families had a long settlement history in it and have an important role in developing social, cultural and economic life of urban Mardin. As a related perception, Mardinian Arabs also differ themselves from Arabs of Midyat and others with regard to city culture of Mardin. This reveals how these choices are not ethnically, instead it is much more culture and life-style related. It is a sample of how ethnicity intersects with class. This can be evaulted as how identity expression is "classed" rather than "ethnicised".

When native urban settlers speak on their identity to differ themselves from especially villagers and Kurds, they generally use "Mardinian", not as the label of "Arab". One of my young interviewee from a high-class leading family of Mardin narrated a dialogue from the class during his university education in Istanbul:

> Teacher: Where are you from?
>
> He: Mardin.
>
> Teacher: Oo, you are Kurd, aren't you?
>
> He: No, I'm a native of Mardin, not Kurd.[3]

This connotes a type of homeland identity, a sense of shared urban territory and a shared developed city culture. In their mind, meaning of this word does not include an ethnic or religious references, it is related more with long settlement process as a family in the urban Mardin and having the city culture.

Although their sense of belonging is more to the city rather than an ethnicity or ethnic group, demographical changes have started to change this sense. Their decreasing population and power in the economy and administration, and increasing

---

3 Öğretmen: Nerelisin

Öğrenci: Mardin'den.

Öğretmen: Oo, Kürtsün, o zaman?

Öğrenci: Yok, ben Mardin'in yerlisiyim, Kürt değilim.

population, power and resistance of Kurds affected their role in the city. This process placed more emphasis on their belonging to the city. The common perception of Arabs to this situation is becoming "minority" in the city. In some informal and formal interviews, a perception of minority in the city demography is often expressed: "We are minority anymore" ("Artık biz azınlığız") or "We became minority." ("Biz azınlığa düştük."). These all affected relations between established and newcomer settlers. These sentences used in some non-recored interviews illustrate the importance of "family culture" to make contact with others

> Family culture is not the same, who do you say hello. There not stayed anyone to say hello, to speak.[4]

> Every family does not visit every family. Only to honest, pure..[5]

I frequently heard many sentences starting with "however, today..." to express a sense of sadness because of demographically and culturally transformation of the city. Related to this, senses of "majority" and being original representative of the city weakened. SB emphasizes how strong their sense of belonging to the city:

> The most important problem of Mardin is getting lost of values which make the city Mardin. There are some qualities that make a city peculiar, these are its culture, architecture and people living this. The most important problem is giving up of natives, thereby evacuating of the city. It's the emigration. In the near feature, there won't be stay the city of Mardin. In that time, we will go to ethnography museum to look round as tourist.[6]

According to these sentences, Mardinian" labelisation includes urban origin and well-known Christian families of the city, but excludes peasant origin, and non-urban Arabs and Kurds. This distinction between rural and urban origin refers also a distinction between "bajar" and "gundi" in Kurdish language frequently used in daily discourse.

---

4 Aile kültürü aynı değil, kime selam vereceksin. Selam verecek, konuşacak kimse kalmadı.

5 Her aile, her ailenin yanına gitmez. Temiz, namuslu olanlarla...

6 Mardin'in en büyük sorunu Mardini Mardin yapan değerlerin hızla silinip gitmesi. Bir şehri kendine has kılan özellikler vardır, bunlar oranın kültürü, mimarisi ve bunları yaşayan insanlarıdır. Mardin'in en önemli sorunu yerlilerin şehri boşaltıp gitmesidir. Göçtür tabii ki de. Yakında Mardin diye bir şey kalmayacak, etnoğrafya müzelerinde turist gibi seyredip gideriz artık.

"Mardininan" refers a special "culture" in their understanding. There are different understandings on culture. In order to understand their labelisation on the city belonging more, it is need to deeply examine the meaning of their culture understanding, because as described in a speech by a Kurd, which can be accepted as common understanding by others, that "Arabs are nationalist of their culture" ("Araplar kültür milliyetçiliği yapıyorlar."). This meaning of culture connotes different references. Firstly, it signifies a distinctive, developed and historical city culture and life style. Secondly, it has a special affinity to a cultural heritage and cultural texture, a shared past, architecture. This implies protecting cultural texture, preservation of physical historical and architectural structure. Thirdly, demographically existing ethnic and religious diversity, but generally including urbanite natives of the city. Their way of understanding "culture" also points out that they perceives themselves as producers and transmitters of this urbanite culture.

First understanding of the culture is related with life habits and relations with others. This use of culture also signifies "politeness". In the sample of "It's a deep culture..." ("Derin bir kültür...") signifies also "non-violence", "minimal brute force" and "tolerance", and more related with ethic. This is one of the expected behaviours from Mardinians, because " being Mardinian" ("Mardinlilik") includes also discourses of "kardeşlik" (brotherhood and sisterhood), peaceful coexistence, non-violent behaviours, tolerance or respect for people's different belongings and their religious buildings. It is related with having a common history of living together as natives of the city. Natives produced this common history and common life patterns and values through sharing the place. Expressing frequently words of tolerance, respect, harmonious relationship are generally, they make always a reference to social and cultural cohesion in the city, but it is more with natives. Therefore, they generally abstained from stating conflict or disagreement points and situations in recorded and non-recorded interviews.

Mardin is known as "the city of tolerance and living with peace", and multicultural heritage. Multi-cultural character and peaceful coexistence are generally expressed for their culture of living. Common discourse on Mardin is that "Mardin is the place

52

of living in peace with others". Therefore, it is generally expressed that Mardin is "the city of religions and languages", "the city of cultures", or "the city of civilisations". This refers to a strong sense of cultural heredity, and a rooted history. Thereby there is an emphasis on protecting this culture, values, and some traditions such as weddings, condolences, and architecture. One of my informants clearly states this cultural collapse comparing with new generations:

> Our youth move away from our culture, and thereby the culture is disappearing gradually.[7]

They worry about the disappearing of city culture and the sense of city-dweller. This culture understanding could be also evaluated as an "idealisation" of the city, and its past, because according to them it is not the same Mardin which we know and we live in today. As a part this understanding, there is a prevalent expression in daily uses that "Mardin is a quite different city", and "Mardin has a different structure". Furthermore, these sentences frequently used in speeches to emphasise transformation of relations between people illustrates:

> It is not the same Mardin of our childhood's.[8]

> In the past, these sorts of things not used to be... [9]

These sentences illustrate images of the city they belong to in their mind. In addition do decrease in migrations of natives, population of village-origin families increased. Migrations of natives are evaluated as migration of wealth, labour force, skills, and city culture and life style. This understanding also includes distinction between "urbanite" and villager". This use of culture marks an opposition to rural values and customs, and includes a reaction to the people of rural origin. It is generally expressed by some speeches as "The culture of the city is getting ruralized."[10]. This process is perceived as "cultural collapse" and "collapse of values". According to many urbanite interviewees, these groups started to effect and dominate power

---

7 Gençler giderek kültürümüzden uzaklaşıyor, kültür giderek kayboluyor.

8 Bu bizim gençliğimizdeki Mardin değil.

9 Geçmişte böyle şeyler olmazdı.

10 Şehrin kültürü köylüleşmiştir.

relations in course of the time via using brute force. This way of behaviour is different from the way in its past, because every person used to know each other via their family connections, therefore they used to abstain this way of behaviours, as cited in different interviews. It also refers to ignorance and unconsciousness for newcomers. This implicitly refers to a "Kurdification" ("Kürtleşme") on their minds. Roles and positions have changed; old villager people settled in the city centre and attended economical activities, political and power struggles, cultural life, daily life, uses of languages. Consequently, a perception developed being the "minority" in the city from owner of the city.

In this way of understanding, being urbanite in the past overlaps becoming "cultured" and "educated". The sentence of "In the past, there were many cultured people"[11]. However, there is difference on culture and life style understandings due to class differences. While looking at upper class people daily routine in the house, they had nanyy ("dadı"), domestic servants, and handmaidens ("besleme kız"). Children of them had also opportunity to learn a musical instrument and use them in evening visits. In time, they lost this distinctiveness about culture and lifestyle, many of them migrated, and thereby culture collapsed. Leaving of upper classes from Mardin is also evaluated as collapse of Mardin city culture and lifestyle.

The distinctive city culture has disappeared due to demographical changes. Especially, higher class Mardinians have a kind of sensibility to disappearing this culture and put forth an effort to protect it in Mardin and outside with some civil organisation. However, lower class people expressed more on problems about life conditions and employment, instead of cultural and life-style related issues. It can be evaluated as how identity expressions changes according to class positions.

To protect culture and architecture, to revise the city image, to develop the city, they founded some civil organisation in Mardin and outside. They aim to change negative images and discourses on Mardin in the east sides of Turkey and reveal the "realities" of Mardin. Depending on this, with the effects of the out-migration,

---

11 Geçmişte çok kültürlü insanlar vardı.

Mardinian people living outside of Mardin give an importance to advertisement of the historical city. Inside or outside of Mardin, some people named themselves as "Mardin volunteer" ("Mardin gönüllüsü") and "Mardin lover" ("Mardin sevdalısı"). The idea of making advertisement of Mardin image including traditional architecture which included in "protected areas" ("Sit alanı"), and demographic cultural diversity and cohesion could be accepted as a part of this understanding, because there are a negative perceptions on minds of Westerners of Turkey. Mardin is generally associated with Kurds. According to natives of Mardin, negative words frequently used to describe the region including Mardin in outside are "Easterner" ("Doğulu"), less-developed and economic backwardness, tribal and feudal, and rebellious, violence and terrorism. Therefore, according to them, the image of Mardin in the Western cities of Turkey is negative. A non-recorded interviewee illustrates:

> In the past, Mardin used to come into question with conflict events. However, there are different things, it is not the thing popularly known.[12]

As a different experience during military service, SE express how being "Eastern origin" ("Doğulu") became a way of undermining in the outside of Mardin:

> There, I had a commander, in the military. He asked me in which cave I was born. I do not say anything but if it was somebody else, he would shoot him. He had no right. I may live in toilet but what right did he have? 'Tell me the cave number' Is this humanity? And he says southeast, as long as he says that everything Southeast is normal. You are a commander, living in big city, civilizations or whatever, if you say so, everything I do is normal.[13]

For Mardinian people, one of the frequently emphasised things about this conflict process in the region is that Mardin city centre was the most peaceful city during this time, because it was least affected city from these events, clashes, and protests in the street, especially taking down the shutters of shops by their owners. As cited in

---

12 Hep çatışmalar, olaylarla gündeme geliyordu... Ancak başka şeyler de var, öyle bilindiği gibi değil.

13 Şimdi benim orda komutanım vardı, askerlikte, diyordu hangi mağarada oturuyorsun. Ben kendi üzerine bir şey demem ama, başka biri olsa vurur onu. Hakkı yok ki hangi mağarada. Ben tuvalette yatayım ama senin hakkın yok ki böyle yapacaksın? 'Mağaranın numarasını söyle.' Yani bu insanlık mı? Bir de diyor Güneydoğu, ulan Güneydoğu ne olursa olsun normaldir, ama sen büyükşehirde medeniyetler bilmem ne, sen böyle söylesen güneydoğu ne yaparsa normaldir. Sen koskocaman yüzbaşısın, böyle dedikten sonra hangi mağarada oturuyorsun, mağaranın numarasını söyle. Ben ne yapsam normaldir.

different interviews, it is thought as a result of existing demographical composition of the city.

Migrations from Mardin made it difficult to maintain the same and fixed identity perceptions in their mind. In the past, demographically this was more suitable for their perception. However, during the near history, natives having "Mardin culture" generally migrated to outside of Mardin. In this process, local dwellers of urban Mardin have changed, thereby existing city culture, and daily relations among settlers differed. This affected their sense of belonging to Mardin. It has turned more on an idealisation of the past. This perception signifies a "past essentialism" through homogenising the shared past and emphasising some certain cultural and historical issues. In a related case, this essentialist understanding also includes debates on origins of cuisine of the city in recent years, because cuisine is understood as one of the important part of their culture understanding.

However, this perception started to change with increasing population of peasant origin people migrated to the city centre, and with the effects of Kurdish Political movement since the 1980s. For some, a sense of Arab identity started to become more important with the effects of this process, and living with Kurds as new neighbours in settlement sites and rivals in economical life in the bazaar. This could be understood in the expression of one SB:

> Now, as it is being pushed away, they are placing importance on it, it has nothing indeed. We do not even call them Arabs; we call ourselves as Mardinian (locals of Mardin). Being a Mardinian is such a great thing, and also a very bad thing at the same time. As a Mardinian, when I went to Syria or Iraq, they call me Selahaddin-i Tirki, meaning Turkish Selahaddin, when I go to Anatolia, they call me Kurd, and when I enter among the Kurds, they call me Arab. (…) Being Mardinian is something like this.[14]

---

14 Şimdi itildiği için önemsiyorlar, yoksa hiçbir şeyi yok. Zaten biz kendimize Arap demiyoruz ki, biz Mardinli diyoruz. Mardinlilik öyle güzel bir şey ki, aynı zamanda öyle korkunç bir şeydir ki. Ben bir Mardinli olarak Suriye'ye, Irak'a falan gittiğim zaman, bana Selahaddin-i Tirki derler, yani Türk Selahaddin, ben Anadolu'ya gittiğim zaman diyor ki Kürtsün, ben Kürtlerin arasına gidiyorum diyor ki Arapsın. (…) Mardinli öyle bir şey.

Changes in categorisation according place reveals to us the contextuality of identity.. SB also notes on being "Mardinian" in the outside, and this refers a spatial co-presence and a sense of shared place with others:

> However, for example when a Muslim and Christian fall under the same brigade during military service, they are considered as fellow townsmen. Nobody cares whether they are Muslim or Christian, they are Mardinians, fellow townsmen, the difference disappears, and it was like that for military service.[15]

Furthermore, they also emphasize more class and status differences through using "culture". They separate themselves from under-classes with more "culture". These characteristics are generally strong sense of "dignity", "honour" and "prestige". As a class based labelisation, "nobility" ("asalet") was also used to define family, not individuals. It is a distinction between "noble" ("asil") and "non-noble" ("asil-olmayan") in addition "urban dweller" and "rural origin dweller" valid in city space. "Noble" refers to some urbanite leading families, Muslim or Christian. Qualities used to describe them are "cultured and educated", having family discipline ("aile terbiyesi"), making beneficial affairs for the society ("hayır işleri"), and not resorting to brute force for any events to solve problems or to make a job.  It is accepted that this continues through familial/generational transition. SN, as a member of "noble" family of Mardin, gives details::

> There is a particular group in Mardin, in the past; we called as "noble" ("asil"). These persons, some are religious savants ("ulema"), and others are bureaucrats. If in a family, no one had any dishonoured behaviours, made beneficial behaviours/jobs, it is called the family as "noble". Today, "nobility" is an education/breeding, this cover only one part. After born, no one is born as "noble". In other words, we speak "nobility", if a family received a good education/breeding; it is "noble". If the new generation of this big-family did not receive a good education, the "nobility" ended. In a manner. In the past, it is not financial situation, however it changed later that financial situation became the determinant quality of being/called as "noble".[16]

---

15 Fakat mesela askerlikte bir Müslüman ile Hıristiyan aynı birliğe düştüğü zaman, hemşeri. Hiç kimse onu Hıristyan mı Müslüman mı olduğuna bakmaz, Mardinlidir, hemşeridir, o ortadan kalkar, askerlikte böyleydi.

16 Belli bir heyet vardı Mardin'de, eskiden, asil dediğimiz. O kişiler, bir kısmı, din bilginleri, bir de bürokrat kesim dediğimiz şey.  Şimdi eğer ki o ailede, o sülalede,  bir kötülüğü yoksa bir iyiliği varsa… ona asil diyorlardı. Şimdi asalet bir eğitimdir. Bir

Some sentences cited in different non-recorded interviews illustrates qualities of being "noble":

"Nobility" comes from the culture. If you are "noble", you live the culture.[17]

Cultures of "noble" people, Muslim or Christian, are similar.[18]

A commonality based on "asalet" is formed by excluding others. "Non-asil" could be rural or urban origin. As a opposite definition, "mountain culture" ("dağ kültürü") or "rural culture" ("köy kültürü") are used to differ. Today, due to population changes uses of "noble" decreased in daily speeches among members of new generation. As different way of expressing change in the city, some express that non-asils increased and became predominant in the city. Looking at relations with "noble"s and "non-asil"s could be summarized as, "They used to show respect to us in the past"[19] in a non-recorded interview by a member of old "asil" family. Although they share same language, same places, same religion, they differ themselves from low-classed and "less-cultured" Arabs. The distinction between "noble" and "non-noble" reveals how class and ethnicity intersected, or how ethnicity is classed.

### 4.2.3. The Sense of Urban and Peasant Origin Differences: "Bajari" and "Gundi"

One of the most significant characteristics affecting relations among people is the rural and urban origin differences. It is a constant tension between rural and urban dwelling people. It is put in words as "bajari" and "gundi" in Kurdish. This dichotomy can be evaulted as two ways: urbanite settler and villager seller in the past; and established "native" settlers and migrated newcomers. This way of expression is much more used and valid in Mardin city space and when encountering

---

kısmını karşılıyor. Şimdi doğarken, asil kimse doğmaz. Yani asalet dediğimiz konu, bir aile iyi bir eğitim almışsa, o asildir. Ondan sonraki gelen aileler, iyi bir eğitim görmemişse, orda asalet bitiyor bir şekilde. Eskiden sadece ekonomik durum değildi, artık sonra sadece ekonomik durum, verilen o lakap bile değiştiriyorlar. O lakaba göre şey yapıyorlar.

17 Asalet kültürden gelir. Asil isen kültürü uygularsın.

18 Asil olanların, Müslüman Hıristiyan, kültürleri benzer.

19 Hürmet gösterirlerdi.

with a villager. One of my informal informants interprets tension between rural and urban:

> The question is not an issue of Kurds and Arabs; it is an issue between "gundi" ("countrymen") and "bajari" ("townsmen").[20]

A related idea on this tension also was expressed by an Arab interviewee, who has migrated from village to urban Mardin, about urbanite Arabs.

> If it had been for Arabs in Mardin, they would not let us into the city.[21]

While Arabs, Armenians, and some of Syriacs are mostly accepted as established dwellers and urbanite people, Kurds and Mhalemis are mostly accepted as peasant origin people living in the city centre today. In addition to this, there was Arabic-speaking villages in the plain, called as "Tat villages." As sample of rural-urban distinction among Arabs in daily life, an urbanite interviewee tells a speech.

> For instance, when a guest come to us and don't want to eat meals, we ask "are we Tatavi, you don't eat our meals."[22]

While evaluating the urbanite and villager dichotomy, there are mainly two ways. Firstly, in the past, villagers were coming to city centre to sell fruit, vegetable and milk products to wholesale traders. However, an important issue which is frequently spoken is scornful treatments and expressions to these villager sellers. One of my non-recored informants notes:

> We heard from our elders that some of Arabs treated examples of mistreatment and scornful expressions to Kurds coming to sell their goods such as yoghurt, vegetables, and fruits.[23]

As related viewpoint, SN interprets that this behaviour was not to their being Kurd, it was only to their being villager:

---

20 Dava Kürt-Arap davası değil, gundi-bajari davasıdır.

21 Ellerinde olsa Mardinli Araplar bizi Mardin'e sokmazlardı.

22 Mesela bir misafir bize gelip de yemek yemek istemezse, "biz Tatavi miyiz ki yemiyorsun" derdik!

23 Büyüklerimizden duyduk, köyden gelip şehirdeki esnafın yoğurt, sebze, meyve gibi satmak isteyenlerlere, çoğunlukla Kürtlerdi, kötü davranma, kötü söz söyleme gibi yaptıklarını duyduk.

Some tradesmen have lately thrown rotten tomatoes on these people. The Arab countrymen coming from village, however, suffered the worse. This is why they went to Kızıltepe instead of Mardin.[24]

Secondly, villagers migrated and settled to Mardin during time. With migrations, this turned a cultural tension between established urbanite settlers and rural origin newcomers in the city centre. Realted to this, there is a prevalent emphasis on "city culture" as contrast to "village culture". Labels of "Mardinian" and "villagers" can be also evaulted as a reflection of this dichotomy. It's a more cultural and life style sense of distinction. There is an expression of city culture in Arabs discourse, and they do not generally like culture of rural people who has migrated to the city centre. This sentence used in different speeches "The culture of city has undergone rustication"[25] is used to illustrates transformation of this dichotomy.

It is also said that there was a clothing difference between people of urban and rural in the past. However, today it is not possible to grasp that whether an individual comes from the village. One of the significant symbols as clothing had a quality to reveal person's rural or urban origin. While dwellers of city wear more modern clothes, including trousers, dwellers of village wears traditional clothes, including "baggy trousers" ("şalvar").

In the past, outlook and clothing provided an idea to categorise people as urbanite or villager. However it has changed and only old-age people use traditional clothes today. Young generation wears the same clothes with urbanite Mardinians. It can be accepted as a result of a standardisation of clothing. According to SN, similar scorning expressions were also made by villagers:

The villagers also made fun of townsmen who came to country, because of wearing trousers etc.[26]

---

24 Bazı esnaflardan çürük domates atma örnekleri olmuş. Fakat gelen Arap köylüye daha beteri yapılıyordu. Hatta Mardin'e gelmek yerine Kızıltepe'ye gittiler bu yüzden.

25 Şehrin kültürü köylüleşmiştir.

26 Köye giden şehirlilerlede köylüler dalga geçerdi. Pantalon giydikleri için falan.

To describe villager as contrast to urban-dweller, clothes and attitudes was used as SN states:

> Clothes were different from villagers. Moreover, villager is more naive, urbanite is more cunning.[27]

The tension between urban Arabs and Kurd, Mahallemi or Arab villagers can be seen in the daily speech. However, the general tendency is to not speak and avoid on these issues. There are different samples in which Kurd villagers easily respond their scorning expression. Two popular stories are narrated by SN:

> An Arab from the city says to a Kurd, who lives in a village just below Mardin, "We send all our scum (sewage – MK) to you". The Kurd gives and answer: 'We make gherkin with those waters, then you eat them'. There is another story. Someone has called a donkey as Kurd. The Kurd feels offended and says, "It is of Arabian origin".[28]

One of the frequently told stories related with tension between urban and rural people is:

> One day, one of the blacksmith, while working, a villager passing in front of his workplace. In that time, he throw a fierce iron working to front of the door, and called to villager: "For crying out load, could you bring that iron?". Thereon, the villager handled the iron and... However, this thrown iron has not killed any person, but the gun which is fired killed particular persons.[29]

This quotation provides to understand the changing positions of rural-urban tension, and how the conflict process changed Arabs' perception about politicised Kurds settled in urban Mardin.

---

27 Köylüyle giyim-kuşamlar değişik. Hem köylü daha saf, şehirli daha kurnaz.

28 Bir şehirli Arap, Mardin'in hemen aşağısındaki köyde oturan bir Kürt'e der ki, 'Tüm pisliğimizi (lağım - MK) size gönderiyoruz'. Kürt de cevap verir: 'Biz de o suyla accur yapıp, yine size yediriyoruz'. Başka bir şey anlatılır. Biri eşeğe Kürt demiş. Kürt darılır, "Aslı Arap'tır" diye cevap verir.

29 Bir gün demircinin biri, çalışırken, dükkânın önünden bir köylü geçiyormuş. Çalıştığı kızgın demiri kapının önüne atıp köylüye seslenmiş, "Allah rızası için şu demiri getirir misin?". Köylü de demiri getirmek için eline alınca... Atılan demir kimseyi öldürmemiş, ama atılan kurşun belirli kimseleri öldürmüştür.

### 4.2.4. The Sense of "Arabness"

The sense of descent and shared past is a part of the ethnic identity formation. Ethnologically and linguistically, Arabs belongs to Sami/Semite linguistic family. It is the same with Syriacs/Aramians living in Mardin. However, Kurds belongs to Indo-European linguistic family. However, this is not a distinctive quality in people's mind, because the sense of "shared past" stays generally restricted with the experience of living in Mardin. This becomes a part of their familial history and migration stories. Therefore the sense of "Arabness" especially stayed restricted to familial relations because of broken ties due to divided borders with Arabs stayed in Arab states, under a new national context with Turkey Republic.

Language, ethnic descent, and religious and sect belief are generally the same for Mardin Arabs. However, because of that they migrated from different place, they were members of different clans or families. They had different migration stories, ways and reasons. A common history started with settlement in Mardin coming from different places in the south. Therefore, there is not a developed and widespread ethnic identity consciousness; it is rather a practical experience concerning familial origin. As a part of this process, the familial groupings shaped in this new site and new kinship relations developed including exogamy between different families. Then this generally turned an ethnic and religious endogamy.

They don't generally like to express an ethnic Arab identity. Many urban Arabs know their historical origin through family origins with the help of genealogical tree. Thereby they have information about original geographical location from where they migrated to Mardin. To differ themselves they generally use their original location and migration time. Being Arab in Mardin is related with a common living experience in Mardin because of sharing same place under the same political and administrative unity. Furthermore commercial partnerships were made and mutually cultural production developed under this political unity. These reveal the importance of the space and political unity in the formation of identity.

The sense of "Arabness" is weaker when compared to the sense of "Mardinli". Depending on this, strong and homogeneous sense of ethnic community stayed weak. Compared with other ethnicities in the urban Mardin, community sense is stronger among Syriacs and Kurds. While a sense of community based on religion and church developed in Syriacs and Christians, a sense of community based more on ethnicity and political issues developed among Kurds with especially the increase of Kurdish Political Movement.

On the other hand, the ethnic diversity is a factor affecting people's identification frequently referenced to construct an "other". SB notes this situation:

> The reality we mention outside and the reality we mention inside differs, because; Mardin has been a city of minorities since the day it was founded. A city of minorities in the sense that the ethnicity of Mardin and the ethnicities that define Mardin's state of belonging to a political and jural authority do not fit together. They never did. That is to say, Persians dominate Mardin, Mardin's etnicity is not Persian, Assyrians dominate Mardin, Mardin's ethnicity is not Assyrian, Urartuians dominate Mardin, Mardin's ethnicity is nor Urartuian, Byzantine dominate Mardin, Mardin's ethnicity is not Byzantine, Arab Muslims dominate Mardin, Mardin's ethnicity is not Arabic, Turks dominate Mardin, Mardin's ethnicity is not Turkish. That's why Mardin has been a city of minorities. It is a city of minorities internally and there is a difference about the political/jural authority it is subjected to.[30]

There is tendency to connect their identity to the nationality of Turkey Republic in a more citizenship sense. EK describes his understanding of Arabness as follows:

> Now dear brother, there is no Arabness here. Now there is Turkishness. Everybody has become Turkish. In the course of time … I cannot say I'm

---

[30] Bizim kapı önünde ifade ettiğimiz gerçekle kapı ardında ifade ettiğimiz gerçek arasında fark var, sebebi şu: Mardin kurulduğu günden bugüne bir azınlıklar şehridir. Şu manada azınlıklar şehri, bir Mardin'in aidiyetini tarif eden siyasi, hukuki iradenin mensup olduğu etnisiteler ile Mardin etnisitesi birbiriyle uyuşmaz. Hiçbir zaman uyuşmamışlar. Yani Mardin'e Acemler hakimdir, mardin'in etnisitesi fars değil; Mardin Asurular, Asuri değil. Mardin'e efendim Urartular hakimdir, Mardin'in etnisitesi Urartu değil. Mardin'e Bizans hakimdir, Mardinin etnisitesi Bizans değil; Mardin'e Müslümanlar Araplar hakimdir, Mardin'in etnisitesi Arap değil; Mardin'e Türkler hakimdir, Mardin'in etnisitesi Türk değil. Bu bakımdan Mardin bir azınlıklar şehri olagelmiştir. Hem kendi içinde azınlıklar şehri, hem tabi olduğu, onun aidiyetini tayin eden siyesi/hukuki irade arasında şey var, fark var.

Arab. Because since the time I opened my eyes, I was educated in Turkey and my children were educated in Turkey.[31]

As seen in this quotation, effects of politics and agencies of Turkish Republic transform people's own identity perception. This implies absence of a separate national Arab identity. However, domination of Arabs on political, cultural and economic life in urban Mardin local context affected Syriacs, Kurds and Turks after their settlement in Mardin. It is a process of resemblance to demographically and culturally dominated group. In other words, this could be called as Arabification (Araplaşma) for others. For this situation, there is a word, "müsta'rebe" in Arabic to refer the people converted to Arab. To detail this issue, Bulaç (2009), as a member of a big family in urban Mardin, makes a difference between "Arab as origin" (ethnically Arab) and "müsta'rebe Arab".

> Turkish Arabs are of Arabic and "müsta'reba" Arabic origin. Arabic origins were the families transferred from Arabic peninsula for a mission to teach Islamism during Hz.Ömer and Hz.Ali times. In the middle ages of Abbasies as the pressure on the Ehl-I Beyt were increasing many families refuged to the region and merged with the locals. Some of them are Kurdi Seyid's and some Serif's.

Arabness as sense of ethnic identity is not strong and as a label of identity is not frequently used or chosen. According to Bulaç (2009), the reason of the weak sense is below:

> During the republic period Arabs did not suffer identity issues. They did not internalized Turkish identity but did not object legal documentation. Arabs like Kurds are the local communities in the area limited by "Misak-I Milli". They were like Kurds voluntarily supported Mustafa Kemal. Most of Arab's being müsta'reba Arab's is one of the reasons Kurds respond this differently. People becoming culturally or subsequently became Arabic if not disturbing can accept another identity and this could be acceptable. Arabs; event though not as much as Kurds, suffered from politics to make region Turkish.

Historically, as a challenge to the existing system, the Kurdish Movement made the sense of ethnic identity more visible in people's life in urban Mardin. During this

---

31 Şimdi muhterem kardeşim Araplık diye bir şey yok burada. Artık Türklük vardır. Artık herkes Türk olmuştur. Çünkü zamanla, ben Arap'ım diyemem. Çünkü ben gözümü açtığımdan beri Türkiye'de tahsil ettim, çocuklarım Türkiye'de tahsil etti.

process, Arabs tended to closer existing citizenship status, not any expression of displeasure. Moreover, there is tendency in recorded interviews to not speak about on political issues and especially on Kurdish issue. Increasing population of Kurds produced a perception of demographically and culturally "Kurdification" ("Kürtleşme") of the city and displeasure on this transformation among Mardinian Arabs.

As a reaction to increasing sense of Kurdness, some religious Arab Muslims emphasize more religious commonality. As frequently expressed "we are all Muslims", they stress on religious ties and common past in the region. In the bases of "members of the same religion" crystallizes with Kurds. Religiously, Arabs of Mardin are Hanefi and Shafi Sunni Muslim. While people in villages are mostly Shafi, urbanite people are Hanefi. However, this difference is not understood as a distinctive issue in people's identity expressions. This reflects on only some daily practices and religious rituals. However, there is only a differentiation according to rituals of Hanefi and Shafi sects. For example, this changes daily relations between men and women, for example handshake between men and women become a reason of cancellation of "ablution" ("abdest"). In Islamic law, there is not a mosque segregation based on ethnic groups. Normatively, Muslims of different ethnicities uses same mosques. However, spatially, there are two "mihrap"s in some old mosques according to both Shafi and Hanefi sects to use in "farz" salaat in Friday worships. As a result, this difference has not produced separate mosques, and common mosques are used for religious rituals.

Group size and population of the group is a significant factor effecting people's sense of "us". According to changes in the group size, identity references changes. This affects spatial configuration and the way of settlement. They mix with Kurds much more, thereby potentials of tension, collaboration in working life is increasing. Today, demographically numbers of Arabs and Kurds more equivalent in urban Mardin.

### 4.2.5. Conclusion

In this part, people's self-expressions and categorisation to others was examined. Different names of self-expressions or categorisations provide significant clues about where they put themselves. How people identify themselves with their occupations or incomes, or more cultural references was analysed. Belongings are so strong and determining in Mardin's culturally diverse social life. In order to describe, to contact, to trust, identity is frequently used. However, the domain of identity changes according to context. The emphasis is in more on familial, cultural, and spatial belonging including the sense of Mardinian, the sense of city dweller, the sense of Arab. This situation supports the thought "everybody has multiple, decentred identities that are complex and situated in particular historical periods and geographical locations." (Hall, 1992). As a place of encountering ethnic and religious differences Mardin makes family and class-status differences important. Commonalities can integrate people from different religions in a same sense of belonging. However, one choice does not eliminate an others, it is only chosen according to context. Looking at expressions of identity how changes contextually. It is closely related with experienced events, and structural changes. Therefore, it reveals how it is historical.

Family belonging and class position of the family is chosen to make "us" and "them" among urban dwellers, in city-space context. It turns to being "city dweller" when encountered villagers as "bajari" and "gundi". In the outside of Mardin, city belonging beomes more important and "native" or "Mardinian" is chosen to differ themselves from Kurd or Arab villag origin people. The sense of Mardian includes different connotations about city life, habits, historical and architectural qualities of Mardin. The sense of city belonging is rather on culture instead of a sense of homeland. It reflects on social life to preserve and support Mardin multi-cultural heritage and history via different association. The significance of history and culture is generally prioritised and refers an essentialist understanding by unifying and fixing it.

Compared ethnic-sense consciousness, family and city belongings are stronger. They do not generrally need to express of being Arab. While the sense of Arab or ethnic community stayed weak, familial, cultural and class belonging is strong. Therefore, big family name and "native" or "Mardinian" are used much more. Familial belonging changes according to class difference as "noble" or "non-noble". Due to the negative image about Arabs in people's mind in Turkey, there is a sense of inhabitation to express Arabness in the outside of Mardin. In more regional level, the geographical description called as Middle-East, and citizenship of Turkey becomes more important. However, relations with Arabs from other countries are much more restricted with the sense familial and kinship. As a comparison to see the effects of culture of Arabs, Arabness in Mardin is more dominant than in Midyat because of population density and spatial configuration of ethnicities.

The identity of being Muslim becomes important in the situation of encounters with Christians. While religion is used to differ from Christians, being city-dweller is used to identify with them. However, it is not the same for Kurds. This turns with Kurds as being city dwellers and class to differ, and as religious belonging and class to identify. In this case, urban or rural origin, and ethnic belongings creates and maintains the difference. Perception of ethnic boundaries is increasing among Muslims. With increasing interaction and encounters with Kurds, the understanding of "us" gains more ethnic understanding and produces their expressing to nearness to Turkishness. This situation reveals that it not a single and fixed identity. It is multiple, but intersected.

Population decrease caused a situation which limited ties and relationship between close families or inner-family. The distinction between urban and rural origin became clearer in this process. This overlaps to increasing of "non-noble"s, villagers, Kurds, and non-Mardinians. This is understood as the reason of disappearing of Mardin culture. After 1980, ethnicity became more important for identity formation due to increase of the Kurdish population and political power. Kurds' increase in the social and political life made Kurds more determining than being village-origin. Therefore, as a connecting factor, religious belonging gains importance for people.

Kurds' emphasis on ethnicity also becomes a factor of increasing sense of ethnicity instead of city belonging among some Arabs. Furthermore, many established Arabs express that new minority position in the city due to demographic change, and Kurd newcomers also affirms this. The increasing awareness towards ethnic identity increased with the Kurdish Political Movement. It is a transformation to more political issue; uniting Kurds in a more ethnic sense bring forth a new grouping in the city social life. Therefore, they find Kurds as segregationist. This is a different thing from acceptance of Kurds as locals. However, some Arabs do not affirm this idea and could support Kurdish Political Movement. As many speeches stated that "Kurds" were constructed as "the other" in this process. The sense of Arab-ness was constructed through its relation and contrast to Kurdnnes due to effects of migration of Kurds and Kurdish political movement. Thereby "Mardinian" gained more ethnic connotations, and class and culture difference was started to more emphasized. This reveals how identification constructed as relationally.

This process changed subjective feelings of belonging to the city, city culture, big family as a specific collectivism or class position has shifted to more of an ethnicity or ethnic group. This is a sample of "'racial' and 'ethnic' identities are produced as a part of a social process, that they are collectively produced and that they may change over time." (Lewis & Phoenix, 2004: 122).

To conclude, senses of grouping or collectivity were generally based more on family, class, and city, but not on ethnicity. As a part of ethnic identity understanding, historical narration has an important part. Arabs emphasize more geographic belonging and have different and partial migration and settlement stories. Therefore, there is a weak a sense of "community" or a sense of "us" based on Arabness. While a family sense as a collectivity was stronger, ethnic consciousness on Arabness stayed weak. Related to this understanding, solidarity was experienced in more familial base, not an ethnic base. In some cases, a class-based solidarity became stronger. Therefore, intra-group solidarity or closeness is more based on class among between families.

## 4.3.  USES OF MOTHER TONGUE AND OTHER LANGUAGES AMONG MARDINIAN ARABS

Language is one of the significant parts of ethnic identity. Under the topic of language the most important issue is knowing and using the mother tongue. De Vos emphasise this role:

> Language as a domain included in the term of ethnicity has an important role to maintain specific ethnic identity, and it "undoubtedly constitutes the single most characteristic feature of ethnic identity. But ethnicity is frequently related more to the symbolism of a separate language than to its actual use by all members of a group. (De Vos, 1995: 23)

In this part, language as a marker of identity will be analysed in terms of the role of Arabic in their identity. This is about used fields of Arabic including daily life, the bazaar, radio, TV, publications, and names of places. Moreover, as a related issue, the accent of Turkish among Arabs will be also be evaluated.

As mentioned before, Mardin is a multilingual site with languages including Arabic, Kurdish, Turkish, and Syriac used in different aims and places. Among these, only Syriac is not spoken in the public street and is used only in religious rituals in the Church. While looking at the role of Arabic in the social life, a local dialect in Arabic language developed during historical process in Mardin. It is called as Mardin Arabic in daily life. Speaking this dialect is continuing. In addition to being mother tongue for Arabs, this Arabic dialect has been the "lingua franca" of Mardin for centuries.

Although the lingua franca of Mardin is Arabic, Turkish is the official and administrative language. This official status of Turkish and implemented Turkification policy affected uses in many fields including uses of mother tongues apart from Turkish in the street and names of districts, streets, and shops in the beginning of the Republic. Urbanite people of Mardin from different religions and ethnicities learned and spoke this Arabic alongside their own language, Kurdish or Syriac. This is generally expressed by different interviewees and informal speeches, SB states:

In this city Armenians speak Arabic, Syriacs speak Arabic, Turks speak Arabic, Kurds speak Arabic. That's the way it is. Names of dishes are Arabic. Things, ceremonies etc. they are partially formed in Arabic. This is about the insides of city.[32]

In a non-recorded interview, an old artisan expressed the meaning of Turkish and Arabic in their lives:

We speak Arabic. We also speak Turkish too, we love it. The language of our state is Turkish.[33]

It is expressed by Arab interviewees they use of different languages in different sites. It is frequently expressed as "In the house, among family, we speak Arabic." They use Arabic, Kurdish and Turkish in the bazaar to make communication with consumers according to their tongue. Finally, Turkish is learned and used in schools and for official jobs. It is this multilingual site to provide people learning others' languages. Unlike mother tongue, locals of Mardin generally know three languages including Arabic, Kurdish, and Turkish. As an example of uses of different languages in a site, in a speech in the Diyarbakır-Mardin, with Turkish:

Passenger: Ahuy, "call to prayer" has finished, we need to catch the salaat, could you drive faster please?

Driver: Biremîn, if you perform the salaat in the dolmush, it is possible.[34]

In this speech, while an Arab passenger speaking with a Kurd driver, he uses "ahuy" in his mother-tongue and as a response Kurdish driver says "biremîn" in his own mother-tongue. These two words refer the same meaning as "my brother". It is a frequently experienced situation that people easily choose the language according to one's speaking mother tongue to communicate. In addition to this, inner-city buses are one of the most used sites for encountering. This could be observed inner-city transportation due to being mixed employment among Arabs and Kurds. Three

---

32 Burada Ermeni de Arapça konuşur, Süryani de Arapça konuşur, Türk de Arapça konuşur, Kürt de Arapça konuşur. Yani böyle bir şey. Yemek isimleri Arapçadır, efendim şeyler, merasimler falan o ayrıca teşekkül eder. Bu şehrin içiyle ilgili bir şey.

33 Arapça konuşuruz, Türkçe de konuşuruz, severiz. Devletimizin dili Türkçe.

34 Yolcu: Ahuy, ezan okundu namaza yetişcez, biraz hızlı olsan?
Sürücü: Biremîn, namazı arabada kılsan da olur.

languages, including Arabic, Kurdish, and Turkish, are interchangeably used by drivers, and passengers if mutually known.

However, this multi-linguality is experienced differently by gender. This generalization is not the same for woman, and multi-linguality was valid only for men, not for women, because women only learn and use their mother tongue, and didn't learn Turkish if she did not attend to the school. As a result they were more mono-lingual. This reveals that only used and functional language is learned by people. Arabic is used as the lingua franca of Mardin due to being used in economical and daily relations. Turkish is also used in the name of work places or shops. Arab men were generally known Kurdish and Turkish in addition to Arabic to make contact with customers or partners in the working place. Among men, today elders, some members of lower class could not learn these languages due to absence of working place relations. Arabic was enough to contact as a consumer. This class difference brought about interaction differences with Kurdish speaking.

Arab women generally did not learn any other language in addition to Arabic if she did not go to the school. They generally learned Turkish at school. However, when compared with men, they used it lesser than men in their daily life, as SE clearly demonstrates:

> Inside the family Arabic was spoken. We all spoke in Arabic. We learned Turkish at school, all of the brothers. My mother does not know Turkish, she is Arabic. (...) My mother did not go to school. Women, mostly, did not know Turkish.[35]

Women only need to learn Kurdish or Turkish to make contact with their renters or neighbours are Kurds or Turks, as SN clearly demonstrated:

---

35 Aile içinde Arapça konuşulurdu. Hepimiz Arapça konuşurduk. Zaten okulda öğrendik Türkçeyi, kardeşlerin hepsi. Annem zaten Türkçe bilmiyor, Araptır. (…) Annem gitmemiş okula. Kadınlar çoğunlukla Türkçe bilmiyordu.

> My mother learned little Turkish. She learned a few words to make connection with the tenants. A few families learned Kurdish because they went to the village.[36]

A similar example concerning Turkish was told by one of informal informants. When they had a Turkish speaking renter, women could start learning basic words to communicate them. This reveals us that language is learned when functional and with interactions. There are intergenerational changes in learning Turkish. Although older women only use Arabic in the daily life and do not know Turkish or Kurdish languages, younger ones almost know Turkish. Reasons of this change are increasing rates on schooling, and spreading Turkish TV channels.

This multilinguality also changes in different sites in Mardin province. While Syriacs of Midyat learn and use Syriac language in their religious and daily life, it is not the same for Syriacs of Mardin. Different from Midyat, Syriacs of Mardin stated that they do not know Syriac and speak Arabic. It could be evaluated as domination of Arabic in daily life in Mardin. Generally, it is a result of legal restrictions on learning Syriac in the Church, in special schools, or in other courses.

Mardin Arabic is different from general Arabic and accepted as a dialect. Although local dialect and speech patterns maintained until now, local Arabic is only a spoken language, and there is not a writing correspondence different from some Arab countries. It is not a literary language, only a spoken language for local Arabs. They do not use it in a writing form or there is not any written communication and publication in Mardin Arabic. When the question "could you read?" is asked to Arabs, the response, if s/he could read, becomes generally is that "I am reading only Quran, I have not not any other knowledge".

The dialect of Mardin Arabic is only learned in the family and in the street. There is not any institution to take "mother tongue education" or "education in mother tongue". There is not any institutionalisation to learn and develop this language and dialect in education for early ages. In addition to this, there have been no publication

---

36 Annem az Türkçe öğrenmişti. Kiracılarla iletişim kurabilmek için bazı kelimeler öğrenmişti. Birkaç aile de köye gitikleri için Kürtçe öğrenmişlerdi.

or broadcasting in radio or TV until recent times. Till now, Arabic was not used in mass media or publishing throughout the Republic. In recent years, TRT, official television, started broadcasting in general Arabic. However, it is more related with religious aims. Moreover, people could only listen to radios or watch TVs of other Arabic speaking countries, especially of Syria's.

However, there was not any effort to develop writing in Mardin by natives. However, in recent years, as an academic department Arabic Language and Literature founded in Institute of Living Languages in Mardin Artuklu University. As a part of this development, Arabic language lessons were opened in the programs of the Mardin Artuklu University for two years. Thereby native Arab students have opportunity to learn written from of Arabic via selecting this lesson. However, there is an idea that Mardin Arabic is written but Latin alphabets, not Arabic alphabets. There is a tendency to write in Latin alphabet/signage in different areas including especially social media. Written Arabic is used in restricted areas in public space. While Kurds increased demands on uses and writing of Kurdish in public space, for Arabs it is not the same. In addition to this, written Arabic, in Arabic alphabet, is used in the protests, such as such as May 1, by leftist and Kurdish political and labour union organisations. Looking at where Arabic is used in public, daily communication, bazaar and some announcements. In the mosque in old and new city of Mardin, religious "sela" announcement of died person is made in two languages, firstly Arabic and then Turkish, traditionally.

One of the significant things about usage of Arabic in the near past for interviewees is that prohibition of mother tongue speaking during their school years or starting with 1948. As apart of language policy, firstly Turkish signage was transformed to Latin alphabet from Arabic with the Language Reform ("Dil Devrimi") in 1932, and uses of other mother-tongues in Turkey was restricted and then banned in the years. Therefore uses of these languages were highly restricted and stayed only home. This official prohibition of speaking Arabic besides Kurdish in public and a pecuniary punishment was implemented for a violation of the rule in a situation of speaking mother tongue apart from official language in the public spaces. This is only

expressed in speeches for a generation going to school in 1940s. However, SB, as a witness of these years, expresses that it could not be implemented:

> In 1948, speaking Arabic in Mardin was banned. For a short time, I guess it was for one or two years. Of course the practice was not good...[37]

This prohibition is not restricted with Arabic language, it also involves Kurdish language. However, CA expresses also differences in implementation of this prohibition between two languages:

> Of course there is also that, I mean, after a time, prohibitions began. I guess so! Actually when we went to school, Arabic was banned but it was more rigid for Kurdish. We did not know the ones who speak Kurdish in school. They were very little in number, number of Kurds in Mardin were very little. They did nothing when one spoke in Arabic, I mean; they collected money like 5 kuruş or 10 kuruş... But that was not applied that much at all.[38]

It is also stated that this was officially permitted with the Democrat Party government in 1950s. It is stated by some interviewees that although prohibition of Arabic and Kurdish applied in a short time, that generation continued using their mother tongues in public during these years.

Despite the limitations, some Arabs stated that Arabic radios and televisions also are being followed in addition to Turkish radios and televisions. They said that they frequently listened to Arabic radios of Syria or Iraq in the past. Today, some of them could watch Arabic TVs of Syria and Iraq. However, the pattern of watching Arabic TVs reduced with spreading and developing of Turkish channels due to broadcast quality. CA notes:

> In the old days Syriac televisions was being watched all the time.[39]

---

37 48'de Mardin'de Arapça konuşmak yasaklandı. Az bir şey, herhalde bir iki yıl sürdü. Tabi uygulaması habil olmayan olmayan…

38 Galiba bir de şey var, yani belli bir tarihten sonra yasaklamalar başladı. Galiba öyle tahmin ediyorum ki! Aslında biz okula gittiğimizde, Arapça için de vardı, ama Kürtçe için daha katıydı. Hiç okullarda Kürtçe konuşulanı, o zaman biz hiç bilmiyorduk. Yani çok azdı, yani Mardin'de Kürtlerin sayısı çok çok azdı. Yani biri o dükkanda dediğim gibi, işyerlerine gelenler, ki onlarda çok azdı. Ama Arapça'yla konuşmak bir yerde hani, bir şey yapılmıyor ama, bir mesela şey yapılıyordu. Konuşursan, ceza verecektiniz 5 kuruş verecektiniz, 10 kuruş verecektiniz şeklinde şeyler yapılıyordu. Ama ceza, bu pek de uygulanmadı.

39 Eskiden mesele hep Suriye televizyonu izlenirdi.

On similar lines, SE makes comparison:

> No, they do not watch it that much anymore. They used to watch. There was TRT 1, then (…) Before there were Syria, Arab, Kerkük.[40]

Although they need some effort and more time to understand this dialect, they could understand except little differences. Some of them say we could not understand it fully. CA interprets:

> If we listen carefully to the Arabic channels, we can understand 60-70 %.[41]

On the other hand, HK notes the same situation:

> I watch TVs of Şam, Syria. There, I do not exactly understand their language.[42]

In addition to audio and visual media, one of the interviewees stated that they frequently listened to Arabic tape cassettes. There are some favourite Arabic singers, such as Feiruz, and Um Kulthoum. In addition to Arabic music, they listened to Arabic, Kurdish and Turkish songs in daily life.

Kurdish is known because of requirements to communicate with Kurds as customers. Kurdish was generally learned within the interaction in the workplace by Arabs. This reveals the functionality reveals how language learning is interactional and functional. SN says:

> To sell his goods, people of Mardin knew Kurdish for sure.[43]

On the other hand, CA also emphasis the role of function in daily uses:

> We did not know Kurdish, we did not learned as children, but was spoken in the streets, very little though. Because the villages Mardin was interconnected spoke in Arabic. For example Yeşilli, Kabala etc. all spoke Arabic. But the

---

40 Yok şimdi artık fazla izlemiyorlar. Önceden izlerlerdi. Bir TRT 1 vardı, sonradan (…) Önce Suriye vardı, Arap vardı, Kerkük vardı.

41 Arapça kanalları çok kendimizi verirsek, yüzde 60-70'ini anlarız.

42 Şam'ı izliyorum, Suriye'yi. Orada tam olarak, onların dilinden anlamıyorum.

43 Malını satabilmesi için Mardinli mutlaka Kürtçe biliyordu.

former generation knew. The ones like my brother, for example, had more relationships and they knew.[44]

In a different case, Kurds after migrated to city centre need to learn speaking Arabic. BC notes:

All the neighbours spoke in Arabic. Kurds also came from the villages in the old times. There was one of them, escape from feud, came to our neighbourhood. About 35-40 years ago. Escaped from the village and came to our neighbourhood. Now they're gone no Antalya, he forgot Kurdish in 10 years and began speaking in Arabic.[45]

Syriac language as language of a group living in the Mardin city centre is not known and could not be learned at all by Arabs and Kurds, because mother tongue of Syriacs is not known and not used by themselves in their daily life. CA says:

All the Syriacs of Mardin speak in Arabic, they do not know Syriac language.[46]

Contrast to this situation, Syriacs living with Kurds in the rural areas learn and speak Kurdish language due to contact interaction with Kurds in the same space, and they do not know their mother tongue as well. However, it is generally said for Syriacs of Midyat that unlike from Syriacs of Mardin, CA compares:

Syriacs of Midyat know Syriac language, of Mardin do not know.[47]

Turkish as official language is generally learned in school. People before the school and uneducated people could not learn the Turkish. In addition to this, there are ones

---

44 Biz Kürtçe'yi bilmiyorduk ve öğrenemedik küçükken, ha çarşıda devamlı konuşulurdu, ama çok az konuşulurdu. Çünkü Mardin'in ilişkide olduğu köyler genellikle onlar da Arapça konuşurdu. Mesela Yeşilli, Kabala, ova köyleri, tat köyleri hepsi bunlar Arapça konuşurdu. Bu nedenle Kürtçe konuşan köyler azınlıktaydı. Yani bizimle ilişkisi olan. Ben dükkânda çalışırdım, onlarla ilişkimiz bizim az olduğu için. Ama bizden öncekiler biliyordu, mesela abim yaşındakiler, daha çok ilişkisi olduğu için biliyordu.

45 Bütün komşular hep Arapça. Ha Kürt insanlar da geliyordu, köylerden geliyor, eskide ha. Bir tane vardı, düşmanlıktan kaçmıştı, bizim mahalleye geldi. 35 sene 30-40 sene önce. Kaçmış köyden gelmiş bizim mahalleye girmiş (…) Şimdi Antalya'ya gitmişler. 10 yıl içerisinde Kürtçe'yi unuttu Arapça'ya başladı.

46 Mardin'deki bütün Süryaniler Arapça konuşurlar, Süryaniceyi bilmezler.

47 Midyat'takiler Süryanice biliyor, Mardin'dekiler bilmiyor.

who learned Turkish during military service. Interviewees generally express their learning Turksih stated by CA:

> Since I was born, until I began to school, the language we spoke was Arabic. When I started to school, I knew at most 20 words in Turkish. Bread, water, come, go, yes, no... Words like that I knew.[48]

On similar lines, SE says:

> All the children of the neighbourhood learned Turkish at school.[49]

As we see in these two quotations, this also could be considered as an example of interactionality in the language learning, because if it was required in daily life, Turkish could be learned out the school in earlier years of people. SE express how the process of learning Turkish in school causes difficulties for children:

> It was hard. It is Arabic you're speaking. Turkish. But the teacher was an Arab too, so he did not deal with it that much, he said "don't worry, you'll learn.[50]

However, there is a change in this situation in near times. In the early years of children, Turkish was learned and spoken among family members. With the spread of television in homes, children could learn and speak Turkish more easily. As a part of this development, among new generation of local Arabs, numbers of person who does not speaking but understand their mother tongue are increasing. Turkish is generally known and used in official works and communication with other language speakers. While Arabic and Kurdish as mother tongues of native of Mardin is learned and used to communication, Turkish as official language has more meaning for native Arabs, as EK clearly demonstrates:

> Inside the family, members spoke in Arabic. Turkish was also studied carefully. Because the future is Turkish now, our family members prepared for it.[51]

---

48 Doğduğumda ilkokul yaşına gelinceye kadar konuştuğumuz lisan Arapça'ydı. Türkçe'yi okula gittiğim zaman en fazla 20 kelime Türkçe biliyordum. Ekmek, su, gel, git, evet, hayır. Yani o tür kelimeleri biliyordum ama.

49 Bütün mahallenin çocukları da okulda öğrenmişti Türkçe'yi.

50 Biraz valla zorluk çektik. Konuştuğum Arapçadır. Türkçe. Ama öğretmen de fazla takmıyordu, ne mesele, o da Araptır. Fazla bir şey olmaz diyordu, öğreneceksiniz.

Demographic change in the density of people of different ethnic belonging affected common communication language. Transition from one generation to a new generation provides continuity of uses of language. Older generations generally know and need to use Kurdish. However, it is not the same for members of new generation. In the new generation, there is not only any site and conditions to learn their mother language, Arabic or Kurdish, but also sites of learning other languages speaking in the city could not be possible. However, this is still possible for children in the old Mardin through continuing old situations for language learning. There was necessity in the past as functional in different fields. With the rise of Turkish televisions, and economically integration to Turkey and global economy especially in the new Mardin; more concentrated relations with Turkish mother language people in mixed sites affected also the position of Turkish. Therefore, prevalence of uses of Turkish has been increasing. In addition to these, difficulties of adaptation to changing situations due to lack of developing under intensive influence of Turkish also could be accepted as a reason. Therefore, Turkish today is in a process of "lingua franca" of Mardin. In this process, Turkish became a mutually known and used language among Kurds and Arabs children to communicate, as SE clearly stated:

> 80% of our neighbourhood was Arabic. There were not much Kurds. When we go near them, we talked in Turkish. They spoke Kurdish between themselves, we spoke Arabic. Turkish was the mutual language, we learned at school.[52]

Spatial concentration of Arabic speaking people and their population is decreasing. Moreover because of decreasing functionality in different job fields and communication sites, Turkish is more often chosen. In the past, it was more functional commercially; however it changed in favour of Turkish over time. In old Mardin, Arabic language is extensively spoken even with children. However, in districts in the margins, Kurdish is more spoken. In the past, new coming or new

---

51 Aile içerisinde doğma büyüme Arapça konuşulurdu, Türkçe'ye de güzelce çalışılırdı. Çünkü istikbal artık Türkçededir. Türkçede olduğu için hazırlanıyordu bizim ailenin fertleri.

52 Bizim mahallenin hepsiylen yüzde 80'i Arap'tı, Kürt fazla yoktu. Onların yanına gittiğimizde Türkçe konuşuyorduk… Kendi aralarında olduğunda onlar Kürtçe, biz Arapça… Türkçe ortak dil, okulda öğrendik.

generation Kurds are generally open to learn Arabic, today there is a negative perception to learn Arabic. It is also the effects of increase in use of Kurdish in public space.

In the local bureaucracy, mostly Arabic people were working; therefore it has been more prevalent during official job. Arabic as a communication language is frequently used in official buildings. Their early learning of Turkish as a part being rulers of Mardin was advantages to hire in official positions and professional jobs. This peculiarity is related with being urbanite and having chance to reach education. This provided a chance to be involved in the educated class in Mardin. Kurdish people living in urban Mardin tended to learn and use Arabic to solve their problems or to make their jobs. However, with rise of PKK and armed conflict, increase in violence in the region; this perception changed. After that time, they did not volunteer to learn and use Arabic. Today, increasing population of Kurds and their getting power in political and economical life, make Kurdish is the same level with Arabic.

A related issue with speaking mother tongue is the Turkish speaking accent as official language. There is not a clear distinction on accent between urban and rural people. Therefore, this does not become an issue for identity perception. However, it reflects on Turkish speaking accent. There are significant examples which affect perceptions of their own language because of new interactional situations. Their way of speaking Turkish could be ribbed and undermined by others. Therefore, some from young generation is more deliberate on teaching their mother tongue to their children to protect their children from undermining and ribbing. One of my informal informants, a young Arab barber, notes that:

> I do not speak with my child in Arabic, I speak in Turkish. He will learn Arabic on the street anyway. First he should speak Turkish well. In the future when he continiues his education, nobody shall make fun of him.[53]

The reason of this perception is that Arabic speaking people going for settlement or education in Western cities of Turkey would be seen pejoratively by others, in

---

53 Çocuğumla Arapça konuşmuyorum, Türkçe konuşuyorum. Arapça'yı sokakta nasıl olsa öğrenecek. Önce Türkçe'yi iyi konuşsun. İleride okuduğunda falan, dışarıda dalga geçmesinler.

schools or universities, or during military service, because their Turkish accent is generally understood as a sign of origin of Eastern Turkey, or as ethnic reference, generally as Kurd.

### 4.3.1. Conclusion

People of Mardin are multilingual. There are three main languages used in the "street": Arabic, Kurdish, and Turkish. Syriac is not known and thereby not used in the street. Main sites to learn these languages are street, school, bazaar, and military service. However, it is understood, in the light of quotations, that how this multilinguality changes, and how an interactional process language learning is. Learning a different language which is spoken by any other groups and thereby intercultural communication is restricted due to different reasons including poverty, womanhood, and low level in schooling. In other words, these cases could be considered as how this process is classed, and is gendered.

Approaches to speaking mother language differ according to generations. New generations generally do not know and could not learn Arabic. New generation of Arabs learn less and use less Arabic in their daily life. However, it changes according to space. Districts of the old city are more homogeneous than new-town's to provide a ground learning speaking native tongue for Arab children.

Mardin Arabic as a lingua franca of city centre is known and learned by other ethnicities living in the there. This lingua franca situation has been changing with increasing population of Kurds. The numbers of Kurds who do not know and do not need to Arabic are increasing. Decreasing population of Arabs and increasing population of Kurds may change "lingua franca" status of Arabic. In this situation, with increasing effects schooling and TV, Turkish as common language is much more chosen especially among new generation. Turkish became more used third language alongside Arabic and Kurdish. It is a process of Turkish being of lingua franca of Mardin in recent years.

Turkish speaking accent due to effects of their speaking mother tongue could become a problem. It determines how they are perceived in the outside of Mardin, because it

is accepted as a sign of being from Easterner of Turkey, or Kurd in some cases in the west of Turkey. This turns them underestimation and ridicule by others.

## 4.4.    MARRIAGE PATTERNS AMONG MARDINIAN ARABS

In this part, marriage patterns of Mardinian Arabs are evaluated in terms of three domains of difference: ethnicity, religion and sect, and class. Marriage is generally accepted as the most distinctive feature of border between ethnic and religious groups. As a part of reflection into practice of identity perception, the way of marriage and the selection of the bride is important for "continuation and protect of the descent and family" ("soyun devamı"), "continuation of the culture", "teaching mother-tongue", "giving family education" ("aile terbiyesi"), and "protecting property".

Intermarriage as a form of exogamy is a type of marriage which people from different religious or ethnic backgrounds get married. The critical point is that according to which criteria bride or groom is selected. In Mardin case, the intermarriage is required to think in these two aspects. While the religion difference becomes a determining factor as a barrier, ethnic descent difference in the same religion could be more tolerated. However, it can not be restricted with ethnicity or religion differences. Moreover, economic background or class differences are also significant factor. For many interviewees, this refers to more economical or cultural commonalties, being urbanite or villager.

The most re-told sentence to stress the equivalence between families: "If families are equivalent to each other, it is possible" and "From the same social circle". This perception also could be summarized in this sentence "They are not with the same status with us"[54]. In this sentence "we" refers to familial "us", because marriage is perceived as an issue about relations between families. Marriage was much more a familial decision in "arranged marriage" in the past, it becomes individual choice today. Family elders had an important role on marriage decisions, and ties and closeness between families or groups reflect on partner selection. Transition from

---

54 Bunlar bize göre insanlar değil.

"familial decision" to more "individual decision" in marriages led to weaken the sense of border between different ethnicities. Under the conditions of "arranged marriages" the border issue was much more visible; however the increasing tendency on individual's own choice unfastens the sense border in the mind. Therefore mixed marriages are more possible today.

There is a tendency to marry with people of same culture in order to communicate each other in the same language and to teach children mother tongue, to give family education, to eat same cuisine culture which is accepted as local Mardin dishes, and protect related urbanite lifestyle and values. Moreover, there are many samples also marriages with girls of relatives living in Syria after stayed other side of the border to continue and product kinship. This reveals also how these kinship or family ties important in people's mind despite the national borders. It produces an ethnic endogamy. A Kurd interviewee expressed this endogamy as:

> They take a Kurd girl as a bride, but they don't give their girls in marriage to outside, or to Kurds.[55]

The main criterion is that which family bride and groom belong to. Therefore, there is a tendency on endogamy between close families. It is need to knowing each other before and having information about families. Marriages generally occurred between relatives or close families.

> Especially big families do not bestow their girls to a different family.[56]

The most common marriage pattern between relatives is giving to priority to son of uncle, called as "cousin marriages" in the past. N2 notes about the tradition of priority of cousins in marriages:

> Before, they asked cousins whether they wanted to marry or not. Even if the girl was older than them, they were consulted… This was the tradition, none

---

55 Kız alırlar, ama kız vermezler.

56 Hele büyük aileler kızını başka aileye vermezlerdi.

of the girls were let marry someone out of the family, cousins were privileged, then the other relatives.[57]

Similar lines expressed by BC:

Before, there was no such thing; people were not used to come to the city central, meet the urbanite. But they used to marry to their relatives, cousins etc.[58]

In the generation of my interviewees, marriage was generally made according to "arranged marriage". Related to this, marriages at early ages also are prevalent point which I heard in recorded and non-recorded interviews. This was valid for people of different social class. Therefore, this intervening of parents restricts individual's choice on the possibility of intermarriage. Today, increasing schooling and individual choice turned this to older ages. Threby, the possibilities of people's selecting their own partners to get married. These changes emphasized by N1:

They are either acquainted or from the same school. For example, it was not like this before, such as being from the same school, all were arranged marriages… Now everyone chooses for themselves. It was not like this before.[59]

In the urban Mardin, intermarriage between Christians and Muslims Arabs is not wanted and accepted by members of two groups. While some Muslims may accept a Christian girl if she changes her religion, this idea is not accepted and practised by Christians. In the samples which love between members of different religions transformed to marriage, girls generally changed her faith to Islam. There were few numbers of intermarriage samples in this way as EK states:

Some girls fall in love with a Muslim boy or man. This cannot be restrained. She goes to that boy. Not by force. When the girl goes, she becomes Muslim,

---

57 Daha önce amca çocuklarına sorulurdu, gözünüz var mı? Kız onlardan büyük olsa bile, onlara danışırlardı… Bu gelenekti, aileler arasında kız dışarı verilmezdi, amca çocuğu öncelikli, sonra diğer akrabalar.

58 Eskide yok, eskide mesela köyde böyle nadir, çok nadir böyle gelecek şehirliye, şehir içine. Ama eskide hep akraba, teyzeoğlu, amcakızı, teyzekızı, halakızı, bilmem ne falan, öyle evleniyorlardı.

59 Yahut tanışıyor yahut aynı okuldadır. Eskiden mesela yoktu bizde, mesela aynı okulda olacaklar, hep görücü usulü… Şimdi herkes kendi beğeniyor. Eski zamanda böyle değil.

or the boy does not force her, lets her go to her church and he goes to his mosque.[60]

On similar lines, N notes:

> There are many Kurd-Arab marriages. However, Assyrian-Muslim marriages happen in abduction cases. There used to be none. But I know people abducting girls from Christians, all of them read the Qur'an.[61]

On the other hand, CA interprets problems about inter-religious marriages

> Now, people of different religions cannot marry. This cannot happen. For example, a girl was abducted in Midyat, this case ended in deaths of people. No such thing happened in Mardin, everyone was reasonable and they knew.[62]

Muslim's marriage with a Christian girl was not definitely accepted by Christians. However in some cases, this cannot be prevented. According to one of my non-recorded woman informant narrated a story about a close relative in her family that while the husband goes to the the mosque, wife goes to the church, Chaldean Catholic, during their marriage life.

On the other hand, there were different examples experienced in the early years of this century. As a way of exceptional situation after 1915 Events, some interviewees expressed that there were Armenian girls protected in the family and brought up as Muslim and then get married a men in their families. N1 illustrates this way of marriage experienced in her own family in past:

> As for Armenians, there are lots of persons who marry Armenian girls in Mardin. Back in the times of Armenians, my grandfather brought two girls and grew them. The large families brought them as odalisques at first. (…) on eof them told that some people brought them to this plain and took away their parents. I guess their parents were slain, I don't know; but the notable persons of Mardin took these young girls in their trust. For example, my grandfather

---

60 Bazı kızlar Müslüman erkeğe, gence aşık oluyor. Bunun önüne geçilemiyor. Gidiyor o gence. Zorla değil. Gidince, kız Müslüman oluyor, veyahut da erkek zorlamıyor, sen kilisene, ben camime gideyim.

61 Kürt-Arap evliliği çok çok. Yalnız Süryaniyle Müslüman evliliği o da kaçırma davasında oluyor. Hiç olmazdı. Amma Hıristiyandan kız kaçıranlar biliyorum, hepsi Kuran okuyor.

62 Şimdi farklı dinlerden evlilikler olmaz. Böyle bir şey asla olmaz. Yani Midyat'ta bir kız kaçırma oldu, ölümlerle bitti. Mardin'de böyle bir şey olmadı, herkes çok makuldü, biliyordu.

brought two of them. Already, the old ones were taken away, only the young were left.[63]

Furthermore, I listened similar stories from some of interviewees about their own family. Today, it is only possible for grandmother generation. However, as a critical point I have observed in these narratives that although there were Armenian bride as family origin but bring up as Muslim, there were not mentioned Armenian groom in this way. While an Armenian/Chiristian girl could be accepted, it is not valid for men's.

In addition to marriage patterns, some love stories told by interviewees becomes a significant indicators how they learn this barrier between different religions in their early ages. One of my interviewee, CA, narrated two love stories between Muslim boys and Christian girls. The first one is about a friend of him:

> I used to have a neighbour, named B. craftsman. He was very active, handsome, and illiterate. He had a Christian lover, I used to write her letters from him. Each time I wrote a letter for him, he bought me food. I was a primary school kid (…). This girl was sending letters all the time, and saying: forget this, I love you too but forget about it, this is impossible because would lead us to death! Letters were coming from this girl, as he was illiterate, I was both reading the letters for him and writing things like, I love you, let us be together, what shall we do, shall we run away together? Lets forget about our religions, it does not matter. I used to write things like this. Can you believe that I am telling these for the first time in my life? And the girl was in return saying that, okay, say we did it, I became a Muslim, but this is impossible, they would not let us live, this cannot go on like this. So, in the end this did not happen. (…) I never met the girl.[64]

---

63 Bak Ermeniyle, Ermeni kızlarıyla evlenen çok Mardin'de. O Ermeni zamanında var ya, dedem bir iki tane getirdi, büyüttü. Önce cariye olarak getiriyorlardı, büyük aileler. (…) biri bizi diyorlardı getirdiler, bizi bu ovaya, annemizi babamızı götürdüler. Herhalde götürdüler katlettiler, bilmiyorum ama, genç kızları Mardin'in ileri gelenleri himaye altına aldı. Mesele dedem iki tane getirdi. zaten yaşlıları götürdüler, gençleri bıraktırlar.

64 Benim bir komşum vardı, B. usta diye. Çok aktif, yakışıklı, okuma yazması yoktu. Onun bir Hıristiyan sevgilisi vardı, ben ona mektupları yazardım. Her mektup yazışımda da bana yemek ısmarlardı. Yani ben ilkokulda çocuğum (…) Sürekli bu kızdan mektup gelirdi, diyordu ki: unut, ben de seni seviyorum, ama unut, bu iş olmaz, çünkü bu iş bizi ölüme götürür! Kızdan mektuplar geliyordu, zaten okuması yazması olmadığı için, hem okuyordum, hem de birkaç da seni seviyorum, senle ne olalım, ne yapalım, kaçalım gidelim, tamam mı? Hatta bu ikimiz de dinimizi şey yapalım, önemli değil. Bu şekilde ben, ben yazıyordum. Hayatımda ilk defa anlatıyorum biliyor musun bunları? E şimdi buna karşılık da kız da geliyor diyordu ki, tamam biz yaptık, ben Müslüman oldum, olmaz diyordu, yaşatmazlar, yani bu böyle gitmeyecek. Yani sonuçta da olmadı. (…) Kızı ben hiç tanımadım.

The second related story is his own experience:

> There was a girl that I loved, an Assyrian. They were leaving here, Mardin. I used to visit them at their home. I went there; I had not opened up yet. Of course this was when I was in secondary school, 1st or 2nd grade. I went there, told her that I loved her. It was too hard for me that I was embarrassed for days, maybe months. She told me that it was impossible, I love you too but this cannot happen. Then the family left, moved away.[65]

It is the most critical point that these experiences reveal that religion is understood as a barrier to get married by members of two religions in their early years, although they are in love mutually. Furthermore, in the case of intermarriage between Arabs and Kurds as members of Islam, there are many samples cited in interviews. In addition to the family and culture criteria, class position becomes a determining criterion. In samples of intermarriage between Kurds and Arabs, criterias including character of the family, financial equavalency, urban-rural origin differences, life style and culture differences, and language difference are started to be considered. Parents or individuals tend to select their partners according to these factors. CA interprets the marriage relations as:

> Except religion, of course it is impossible for us if different religions are in question. Of course, I would prefer someone who speaks Arabic, shares the same culture with me, speaks Turkish, and of Kurd nationality in the last place. However, this does not mean that I never think of this, I do. First of all, you see someone, like him/her, in terms of outlook of course, after you like him/her you do not care about the rest. Of course, sharing a common culture, as the locals of Mardin, is an opportunity of preference. But when you love someone, you would not think as this is Arab or Kurd (…) Later, you consider those. From which family this girl is? So, you know that nothing bad would come from someone local of Mardin, meaning that you know him/her if someone is from Mardin, you know the entire family and the history of the girl.[66]

---

65 Benim sevdiğim bir kız vardı, Süryaniydi. Buradan, Mardin'den gidecekler. Evlerine girip çıkıyordum da. Gittim, daha açılmamıştım. Tabi benim söylediğim orta1, orta 2'den. Geçtim işte, yanına geldim, seni seviyorum dedim. O kadar zorlandım ki, günlerce, belki aylarca şey yaptım. O kadar çok zorlandım ki, ben kıpkırımızı kesildim. Kız dedi ki ama bak olmuyor ki, dedi olmuyor, ben de seni seviyorum, ama olmaz ki. Çekti gitti, aile gitti, taşındı.

66 Din hariç, bizim için tabiî ki din ayrıysa olmaz. Tabi, tercihim Arapça konuşan, aynı kültürü paylaşan, Türkçe konuşan, yani son olarak Kürt olmasını düşünürüm. Ama hiç düşünmem değil, düşünürüm. Ama birinci tercihim, yani baktığın zaman, önce tabi bakıyorsun beğeniyorsun, yani önce sima olarak beğeniyorsun, ha beğendikten sonra bu sefer şeye bakmıyorsun. Tabi ama aynı şeyleri, Mardinliği, ortak kültürü paylaşması farklı tercih imkânıdır. Ama sevdiğin zaman, yahut beğendiğin zaman bu

Similar lines are expressed by BC:

> Now, your father says that this is the daughter of blabla, she has an origin, a ground. If the ground is not good, even 50 floors would not mean anything.[67]

These two interviews points out to the significance of known and trusted family to take bride. On the other hand, SN says:

> To generalize, Arabs of Mardin marries their girls to rich, well educated Kurds, there is no problem in getting married to a Kurd. Mother of the previous Mayor of Nusaybin district was from Mardin, an urbanite Arab (Yıldırımlar). When a girl was asked for marriage among the Arabs, previous Mayor's mother stepped in and said in the ceremony of asking for the girl in marriage that "our boy is a Kurd but a good person, I would suggest you to marry your daughter with him". Here, the reason of some negativities is blood feus and overworking of women in the village, but in central Mardin, the woman is like the primary of domestic affairs of the house, in general, control is under women's initiative and this example is valid for the Arabs of Mardin Central.[68]

This occurs between families having near financial conditions, especially for wealthy big families. As an example, there are many samples marriages between Şatana and Mungan families, as two leading and well-known families in the city. In some cases, agha of the tribe in the rural area could be accepted as equivalent for big families in the urban Mardin. These types of intermarriages based on economic background were also seen in the past as expressed in interviews. Unlike intermarriage between upper class Kurds and Arabs, rural-urban marriages could be possible. BC notes:

---

yahu bu Kürt'tür, bu Araptır diye düşünmez. (…) Sonradan bu olunca daha bir şey olur. Kimlerden bu kız, mesela falan aileden. E şimdi Mardinliden kötülük gelmez, yani Mardin'den korkmuyor, Mardinliyse tanıyorsun zaten, bütün sülalesini tanıyorsun, kızın geçmişini biliyorsun.

67 Şimdi bu senin babana söyle, bu diyecek mesele filanın kızı, onun asılı var, onun bir temeli var, temel. Şimdi bir temel, güzel bir temel olacak, 50 kat takıl bir şey olmaz.

68 Genelleme yapacak olursak Mardinli Araplar, mali durumu iyi okumuş Kürtlere kız verirler, Kürt ile evlilik durumunda bir sorun teşkil etmez. Eski Nusaybin ilçesi Belediye başkanının annesi Mardinli, şehirli Arap'tı (Yıldırımlar). Araplardan bir kız istediklerinde devreye eski Belediye Başkanı'nın annesi girerdi, kız istemede "oğlumuz Kürt'tür ama iyidir, vermenizi tavsiye ederim" der. Burada bazı olumsuzlukların sebebi kan davası ve köyde kadınların fazla çalıştırılması, ama merkez Mardin'de kadın evin içişleri bakanı sayılır, genelleme yapılsa emir kumanda bayanın inisiyatifinde bu örnek Mardin Merkez Araplar için söz konusudur.

We brought one from the village now, and married my daughter to my neighbour. (both Arabs).[69]

Generally, if a Kurdish bride does not know Arabic, it is accepted that she could easily Arabic in the process. It could be evaulted as "Arabisation" with the marriage. However, in the process of demographic changes, increasing Kurdish population and increasing displeasure bring forth a tendency on not to let getting married their children with a Kurd young in recent years. Ethnicity becomes more a boundary issue between Arabs and Kurds, while believing to same religion. One of women non-recorded women informant expressed that:

I don't give my daughter as bride to a Kurd.[70]

This quotation illustrates how ethnicity criteria as an independent factor increased in recent years.

Kinship is only constructed through marriages. As a different form of kinship relations, "kirvelik"[•] provides new relations between outsider families, especially made with Christians. SB clearly mentions closeness between Muslim and non-Muslim families:

And in both rural area and in the city, there is an organization we call "kirvelik". In circumcise ceremonies, there is a kirve for the boy and in wedding ceremonies, there is a kirve for the groom. This organization of kirvelik is even more intense than kinship. As Muslims and Christians do not marry each other, they apply to the organization of "kirvelik" in order to establish kinship. This is still like that. Someone becomes the kirve of the other. Being really close, like brothers, is required; this is valid for the entire family. That organization, the organization of kirvelik, is an organization of relationship that the society replaces with that relationship of kinship.[71]

---

69 Şimdi bir tane biz köyden getirdik, benim kızım da komşuma verdik." (ikisi de Arap).

70 Kızımı asla bir Kürde vermem.

• "Kirve" is the person that helps a boy while being circumcised, and "kirvelik" is the name of this action.

71 Bir de hem kırsal kesimde, hem şehrin içerisinde, bizim kirvelik müessesi dediğimiz bir müessese var. Bu sünnetlerde ve evliliklerde damata ve sünnet olana kirve olunur. Bu kirvelik müessesi akrabalıktan bile daha yoğundur. Müslümanlarla Hıristiyanlar birbirlerinden kız alıp vermedikleri için, akrabalık kurmak için kirvelik müessesine başvurular. Hala böyledir. Biri diğerini kirvesi olur. Çok yakın, yani kardeş gibi olmak gerekli, ailece bu böyledir. Hala o müessese, kirvelik müessesi, o akrabalık ilişkisinin yerine toplumun yerine ikame ettiği bir ilişki müessesidir.

However, "kirvelik" is generally evaluated as a protection by Christians and provides a guarantee to prevent a marriage between these Muslim and non-Muslim families. In addition to "kirvelik" practice, "nursing-motherness" ("süt annelik") was also practiced for the same reason, as stated by some women interviewees.

### 4.4.1. Conclusion

In this part, marriage relations was analysed in terms of religious, ethnic, and class differences. The accounts of these interviewees frequently underline familial equivalence. It based on more related with class and culture positions, if religious uniformity is assured. However, this equivalency changes according to context and families.

Religious differences become the determining criteria with Syriac Christians. However, people learn the religious boundaries in early ages. This could be observed in their love-stories in their childhood. In the interviews, if persons fall in love with a Christians, they are aware of the fact that it is not possible or convert a marriage. Therefore, religion become the most important factor for marriage, and thereby identity formation.

Class and culture and life style based on urban or rural origin become determining criteria about Kurds. While intermarriage with Kurds is much more possible through religious sameness, intermarriage with Christians is very rare and problem due to religious differences. There are many cases that religiously same but ethnically mixed marriage between Arabs and Kurds. Therefore, it could be evaulted as exogamy based on common religion but different ethnicity and language. However, in these cases, class, and villager or urbanite positions become more important. In recent years, increase of Kurdish population and political power affected people understanding of Kurds. Ethnicity becomes more a boundary issue between Arabs and Kurds, while believing to same religion.

For marriages among Arab families, class differences and familial closeness become more important. However, intermarriage based on class differences generally is not possible. As a result, it is more familial and religious endogamy.

As a way of selecting birde of groom, in the past, families had more effect on marriage decision. "Arranged marriage" familial sense is strong and under the family social control. However, the more individual choice possibilities, the less effects of families. This increases exogamy between different groups from Mardin or Turkey.

## 4.5.    SHARED CULTURAL PRACTICES WITH OTHERS

This part includes the analyses of shared religious and non-religious events and celebrations, because these are a sign revealing the closeness with "the other". These events include bayrams, festivals, weddings, funerals and condolences, sick calls, and leisure time activities. In life-cycle, some events including birth, death and marriage, special or religious holidays are accepted as more important than others. Therefore, these are practices which are need to attendance of close persons.

While some indicators differ from one people to the other, there are many commonalities and convergences in habits, practices, and values. In the process, an acceptance also developed to live together in the shared space. This turned then into common or shared values. However, there is a tendency to find strange to their gaining a seat in social, economical and political life. This could be produced exclusion and reproach, alongside to accepting.

### 4.5.1.  Weddings

Weddings as a ritual in which people share happiness with others indicate the degree of interaction among people from different ethnic or social class backgrounds. As a ritual, marriage has three main ceremonies in sequence: engagement, henna night (kına) and wedding. Some cultural specialities lost its importance during the process. For example, some parts of wedding including minor henna night ["küçük kına"], major henna night ["büyük kına"], "gelin alma" [taking from bride from her house], "sabahiye" simplified or lost as cited in interviews with BK. Moreover, in addition dancing "reyhani" as a traditional dance form for Arabs, popular musics and dances added to ceremonies.

As expressed in intervies, originally wedding rituals continued generally three days, and courtyards and housetops were used as the place of ceremonies. EK narrates how houses were used for a wedding ceremony:

> Wedding ceremonies used to be held at homes before; their rooms were of the size of a wedding saloon. Women and men used to sit separately. Now it is in mixed form.[72]

People go to wedding ceremonies as family. However, men and women are generally use separate parts of yards and rooms of houses. There was spatial gender segregation in the wedding place. While men sit and dance in a part in the courtyard, women uses inside of the house or a separated part of the inside of the house. Furthermore, the role of women in preparation of wedding ceremonies in houses was much more than men as expressed by N2:

> Actually, houses were becoming messed up. There were cleaning up works, food was cooked in big caldrons, so there were diswashing works. Great burden was in question.[73]

Spatial transformation of Mardin also transformed wedding rituals. It is a process related with the construction of wedding saloons, especially in the new-town. This transformation affected more on women, and thereby their roles decreased in the ceremony preparation. With this shift from home-spaces to wedding saloons, rituals of wedding lost its specialities and are getting similar with general practices in Turkey. While weddings in the old houses and courtyards, people sits separate as gender, but mixed sitting was turned with wedding-saloons in the new city.

In engagement and wedding ceremonies, it is generally noted in the interviews that individuals or families participates only when invited. There is not any special religious or ethnic criterion, because, it is related with familial relations, and invited people always become relatives, neighbours, and friends. It is also frequently emphasised that other than religious rituals, everything is the same with Christians.

---

72 Düğünler eskiden evde olurdu, odaları bir düğün salonu kadardı. Kadınlar ayrı otururdu, erkekler ayrı. Ama şimdi karşıktır.

73 Zaten düğünlerde evler çok kirleniyordu. Temizliği vardı, o zaman büyük kazanlarda yemekler pişerdi, bulaşığı vardı. Külfeti çoktu.

On the other hand, as cited in different interviews that wedding traditions were different in terms of two aspects from Christians, mixed sitting of men and women, and drinking wine. CA notes:

> I guess that they were sitting together, we were sitting separately. There were many artists among them at wedding ceremonies. For example, there was someone called Mihail, there were many nice things. There were some songs that he sang instantly. The only difference is that their wedding ceremonies start with alcohol, ends with alcohol.[74]

Musicians, musics, and dances are almost common. It is stated that while musicians were generally Christians, generally local Arabic and Turkish songs were singed during wedding ceremonies. On the hand, Kurdish songs and "halay" as traditional dance of Kurds in a part of the ceremony could be chosen if they have Kurdish invited guests. Moreover, when they are invited weddings of Kurds, they made the same thing for Arabs via Arabic songs and "reyhani" as narrated in interviews. However, in any case, there is not Syriac songs in weddings.

### 4.5.2. Funerals and Condolences

Looking at rituals of funeral and who attends provides information about degree of closeness with others. It is expressed that there are some consuetudes during condolences and "mevlut"s. As an important tradition related with funerals in the region is condolences. Frequently expressed commonalities related to funerals and condolences with Christians are: offering "mırra" and "ikliçe"[•] during condolences. For condeolences, women prepared houses and courtyards and cooked meals. It was a burden for women. One of the important changes generally expressed in interviews and easily observed in daily routine is "condolence house"s ("taziye evi") added as a new part of some mosques. This provided an important decrease in the role of women in funerals and condolences.

---

74 Onlar da galiba beraber oturma şeyi var, biz ayrı otururduk. Düğünlerde onlardan çok sanatçılar vardı. Mesela Mihail diye biri vardı, çok güzel şeyler vardı. O an söylediği besteler vardı. Düğünleri, tek farkı onlar başlar başlamaz içkiyle başlarlar, içkiyle bitirirler.

• "Mırra" is a type of bitter coffe. "İkliçe" is e a type of scone with cinnamon.

On commonalities and differences in these rituals, it is generally said that "Only prayer is different" and "There aren't any differences about funerals with Christians". Funerals and condolences as troublesome days for the family of the death, and support and aid become more important in these days. There is tendency to stress commonalities and peaceful relations with Christians during funerals. This sentence illustrates this closeness:

> There some Syriacs, they goes to Muslim's condolences three days, even goes to 'mevlüt's. It is for being neighbour and friend.[75]

If a family or a person is considerably close to family of the death, they certainly go to the funeral. Moreover, they go also condolences and "mevlut"s. If they are not much closer, they go to the condolences instead of funerals. It is expressed:

> In funerals, togetherness of Muslim and non-Muslim is highly restricted. They go each other for condolences.[76]

In a different case, it is said that for Christians:

> They comes more to our condolences, but we goes to their their condolences if we know much.[77]

A different case related with Kurds, SE, settling in a district mix with Kurds,

expresses that:

> Neighbour come, relatives come, people who knows the death all come... Absolutely, Kurds also come, and we goes. However, if we don't know, we don't attend Christians's funerals or condolences.[78]

However, this situation is more related with number of the population, thereby the number of death and funerals become less. Another character of funerals is that men

---

75 Öyle Süryaniler var, müslümanın taziyelerine üç gün de gidiyor, mevlütlere dahi gidiyorlar. Komşu ya da arkadaş oldukları için.

76 Cenazelerde gayri-müslim müslim karışımı değil, taziyelerde gidip gelme olurdu.

77 Onlar taziyelerimize çok gelir, biz de onların taziyelerine çok tanıdık olunca gideriz.

78 Komşu geliyor, akraba geliyor, onu tanıyan hepsi geliyor. Tabi, Kürtler de gelirler biz de gideriz onlara. Ancak, tanıdık olmayınca Hıristiyan cenazesine, taziyesine gitmeyiz.

attend to funerals of neighbours or close families. For condolences, men and women go together or separately. However, there is a spatial segregation for condolences.

> Women and men go separately, because it is organized in different parts in the house.[79]

There is a tendency to ask God to have a mercy on the person who has died ("vefatlarda rahmet okuma") and to pray for others each other. However, it changes according to being Muslim or Christian. When they went to Christians' condolences, they only express despair emotions and offer them condolence, do blessings for Christians. HK notes:

> It is only said that my condolences to you. There is not a prayer for their deaths.[80]

When Christians came to their funerals and condolences, in most speeches it is stated that if a Christian knows Islamic prayer or sura of Fatiha, they pray for the Muslims's death. If they don't know, they ask a Muslim to pray sura of Fatiha on behalf of themselves. In a different interview, SB narrates this situation as:

> Funerals are still like that. People used to attend. No matter whether Muslim or Christian, the number of people coming for condolence is greater than that of the people coming to the funeral. Because not everyone attends the funeral. (…) When it was for a Christian, people said "pray also on my behalf". When a Christian came to the funeral, since the people who knew about the old tradition came, they told someone that "I assigned you as my agent to pray." Then the Muslim said prayers of Fatiha on behalf of the Christian.)[81]

Participation to Christians' funeral or condolence is more related with being neighbour, and familial closeness. In some districts, there was not or less number Christian family settled. Therefore, some Arab settlers of these districts don't know religious days of Christians and don't attend funerals or condolences. In the same

---

79 Kadınlar ve erkekler ayrı ayrı gider: ayrı ayrı yerlerde yapılır zaten.

80 Sadece başı sağolsun, onlarda dua yoktur.

81 Cenazeler hala da öyledir. İştirak edilirdi. İster Müslüman olsun, Hıristiyan olsun, taziyeye gelen, cenazeye gelenlerden çok fazladır. Çünkü herkes cenazeye gelmez. (…) Hıristayana geldiği zaman, mesela "işte sen benim yerime dua et" denirdi. Hırisritiyan geldiği zaman ise, eski bilenler, gelirdi, birine yani "sizi benim yerime dua etmek için vekil kıldım". O zaman o Müslüman onun yerine Fatiha okur.

case, if the condolence is organized in the houses, an aid and solidarity realized from neighbours, Arab or Kurd. It is more related with being close and spatial closeness.

### 4.5.3. Bayrams, Festivals and Leisure Activities

While Muslim congratulates two religious bayrams including holidays of Ramadan and Sacrifice ("Kurban") and, the most known bayrams of Christians by Muslim Arabs are Noel/Christmas, and Paskalya ("hassitmerene" in local Arabic mentioning "Meri'nin uyanışı"). As cited in different interviews, they visit to Christians neighbours and families they know to greet/congratulate their bayrams after the religious ceremonies in the church. While narrating bayrams, Arabs who grew up in the old-town, they also talk about Christians' bayrams in their childhood. In addition to this, as expressed in interviews, families mutually go to their bayram meals.

However, there is a difference about consciousness and meanings of bayrams among Muslims and Christians. While the days of religious bayram of Muslims is much more known by Christians, days and meanings of Christians' bayrams are less known and less visible in the daily life. Moreover, Muslims have less knowledge about Christians' bayrams, rituals and beliefs; however, this is not an obstacle to congratulate, especially via neighbourhood relations. Furthermore, Muslims generally does not know any other special feasts, for example for saints. However, in the new generation, young Arabs do not know Christians religious or special days. Moreover, awareness is more difficult in the new-town and without any Christian close neighbours. The main determinant of difference is the religious affinities of locals. There are common celebrated non-religious festivals such as "Hıdırellez".

Compared to working hours and other routines, leisure times are more voluntarily used hours. Therefore, leisure activities is much more related with individual or familial closeness different from sharing the same space. It signs denser and closer relations between families. During interviews, frequently stated leisure activities for past in the old-town are house visits and tea hours among housewives during daytime; evening visits among close families in houses; picnics among neighbour or

close families in recreation spots; "Hıdırellez" as collectively recreation spots; cinemas; and summer rests in vineyard houses.

However, I noticed in narrations in interviews that there are gender and class differences for these activities. House visits and tea hours was for only among housewives. There was also gender segregation in cinemas as matinees only for women with their children. Furthermore, possibilities of leiusure activies were much more for wealthy families. While wealthy families generally used to go vineyard houses for summer rest in the past, children of middle or lower class used summer times to work or learning occupation as apprentice.

In evening visits, members of big families, man or woman, could play different musical instruments as a part visits besides offering foods and drinks, and chats. They generally emphasized the culture of learning playing musical instruments in their childhood and playing in special days and visits. However, this is class-based quality. It was possible for well-situated or wealthier families. In many interviews, they cited different places for leisure activities. The most mentioned place grounds of Mardin Fortress were used until its closing to public after founded a military settling in it. This place was used for picnics and playing football and other performances especially for children from different religions While there was more possiblities in the past, it is expressed for today as "Today, there are not such places any more"[82].

## 4.6.    RELATIONS WITH OTHERS

This part analysis Mardinian Arabs's relations with and perceptions about ethnicly and religiously "others", Syriac Christians and Kurds. In this part, "othering" refers only on ethnic and religious differences, not class or gender differences. As discussed in theory chapter, identity is not only a self-expression, it is also describing to an "other". Therefore, this also about how Arabs describe other "native" people belonging to different ethnicity and religions living in Mardin. The focus is on relations with natives of Mardin, therefore does not include relations with Turks, who are generally officials.

---

82 Artık bugün böyle yerler yok.

### 4.6.1. Relations with Christians

Christians living in Mardin today are mostly people belonging to Syriac Orthodox Church. Starting with deportation of Armenian families, there are different reasons caused the migrations of Christian's to big cities and foreign countries. Wealth Tax in 1942, September 6-7 1955 events against to non-Muslims living in İstanbul, protests on Cyprus Events related to "the Cyprus Peace Operation" in 1974 directly or indirectly affected established Christian settlers. In addition to these more political based reasons, changes in pattern of employment and getting difficult conditions of way of earning life, worker migration in 60s and 70s and familial acceptance of especially Syriac families to Sweden for settlement and work, are more economical reasons to migrate from Mardin. Increasing security problems became reasons, especially in villages, in the conflict process with 1980s. At the end of Single Party Era, a period which is called "Syriac Renaissance" experienced and many cultural and publication activities of Syriac Christians were realized in the pioneering of the Monastery (Aydın et al., 2001). This short period is the last and the highest point providing visibility in social and cultural life of Mardin for Christians during the Republic era.

In daily life, according to interviews, Christians are known with their religion, not their ethnic belongings as Syriac, Armenian, or Chaldean. Which words are chosen reveals how Arabs construct the main points to differ themselves from Christians. While speaking about them, they prefer "İseviler", "Mesihiler", "gayrimüslim" (non-muslim), and "Hıristiyan" ("Christian"). Some examples from daily uses and interviews are "Our 'İsevi' neighbours…" or "There were 'Mesihi' tailors…".

The main difference is constructed based on religious belongings when being talked about Christians. Many of them do not express any other differences, as illustrated in this sentence "There is not any other difference apart from religion"[83]. As a part this understanding, the most stated important common point is believing the same God with Christians. While putting themselves in the same category of believing God

---

83 Din dışında bir farkımız yok

with Christians, they differs themselves with different way of belief. CA interprets this difference:

> So, they were not different from us. You would not know who is Syriac and who is Muslim. There is no distinction in Mardin. Mardin was then a place that could have been used as a model, but it is not now. It was really a model. Now, as their number has become reduced, it is treated like it has been taken under protection! However, there was really no difference then.[84]

On similar lines, HK express religious based coexistence with mutual tolerance:

> Religion is like some kind of party, if used well. Both we and they admit God. Why would it matter, you are coming from that road and I am coming from this one. In the end, we believe in one God. Why would there be any problems?[85]

One of the prevalent expressions by Mardinian Arabs is the commonality of customs, cuisine and eating habits, and city culture with Christians. This sentence which I heard similar expressions in different speech illustrates this point clearly:

> We used not to understand whether they are Christian or not.[86]

For example, while weddings, funerals or condolences are narrated, it is generally expressed that practices are the same; the only difference is that they goes to Church for religious ceremony as a part of the event. Any other differences are not generally expressed in different shared sites.

There is not any other distinctive culture or lifestyle reference for difference. However, class based distinctions could be made between equivalent leading families. This reveals a sense of class and culture commonality. Between higher class families, more classed relations between families are emphasized by wealthier Arabs.

---

84 Yani bizden bir farkı yoktu. Yani bilemezdiniz kim süryanidir, kim müslümandır. Yani böyle bir ayrım yok Mardin'de. Yani Mardin bugün değil, o zaman model olabilecek bir yerdi. Gerçekten modeldi. Şimdi sayıları çok azaldığı için koruma altına alınmış gibi hareket ediliyor! Ama o zaman gerçekten bir fark yoktu.

85 Şimdi din netice itibariyle bir nevi parti gibidir. Ama iyi kullanılırsa. Onlar da Allah'ı kabul ediyor, biz de Allah'ı kabul ediyoruz. Ne var, sen bu sokaktan inmişin, ben bu sokaktan iniyorum. Netice itibariyle bir allahı benimsiyoruz. Niye yani şey olsun?

86 Hıristiyan olup olmadığını anlamazdık.

There is a tendency to emphasise coherence with Christians. Different samples including economic partnership, consumer relationship and friendship are told to reveal the closeness. In a speech, one of my informants states:

> I have Syriac friends, as well. Our regions is different, but we live together as brother/sister.[87]

Similar lines on how they practise this difference, an interviewee illustrates:

> I go to my mosque; my boss goes to their church.[88]

While speaking about how they live with Christians and habits of living together, there are some words which is frequently use such as "tolerance" ("müsamaha" and "hoşgörü"), "brotherhood/sisterhood" ("kardeşlik"). I frequently heard this way of sentences emphasising the coherence:

> Within mutual respect... ("Karşışıklı saygı içerisinde...")
>
> As if we belong to the same religion… ("Sanki aynı dinin mensuplarıymışçasına…")
>
> As if we are brother/sister ... ("Kardeş gibi...")

In some interviews, this coexistence is emphasised with mutually uses of religions in especially in oaths, for the past:

> Oath in the name of two religions!  ("İki din adına yemin olsun ki!")
>
> For the sake of two religions! ("İki dinin hakkı için!")
>
> For the sale of Qoran, for the sake of the Bible / Hakk-u Kuran, Hakk-u İncil (in local Arabic)

In another interview, Christians' settlement in Mardin before Muslims is remembered and this is actually acceptance and tolerance of Christians to Muslims. HK notes:

> When you consider Mardin, Muslim families of great and small size have settled in here after Islamic conquests. However, there was life here before that. And this life belonged to non-muslims. If that would not have shown us

---

87 Süryani arkadaşlarım da var. Dinimiz ayrı ama kardeş gibi yaşıyoruz.

88 Ben camime, patronum kilisesine gider.

that tolerance, we would not be here today. (…) So, as they had welcomed us with tolerance, we are also doing the same for them.[89]

However, these positive and tolerant perceptions could easily be changed due to some events. September 6-7 1955 events against to non-Muslims living in İstanbul and protests of Cyprus Events in 1974 caused an understanding a more "Christian" as othering. As expressed in some interviews are that Christians were more understand as opponents. This produced a new separation in people's minds based on religious differences. This reveals how some events make stronger borders and evokes emphasising distinction between Muslim and Non-muslim. These changes could be evaluated as how identity expression contextualy and historical.

Furthermore, there is tendency to not express Christian's ethnic belonging and differences among Christians living in Mardin. While being Syriac is generally having positive connotations, it turns negative when talked about Armenians. Christians of Mardin are also called themselves as Syriac Christians. However, it is also expressed in some speeches that some known members of Armenian families do not choose to use and ignore Armenian identity, instead they uses "Syriac". CA interprets situation:

> Still there are Armenians here, but they never introduce themselves as Armenians, but as Assyrians. For example, someone used to be an Armenian a short time ago, meaning 10 or 20 years before, but the same person introduces himself/herself as Assyrian.[90]

The reason of this negative connotation is related with events experienced in the past. When it said "you are an Armenian", it connotes negative things:

---

89 Eğer zamanında bak, şimdi Mardin'e baktığın zaman ister büyük ister küçük Müslüman aileleri İslam fütühatından sonra buraya yerleşmişler. Ama ondan evvel burada hayat vardı, yaşam vardı. Ve bu yaşam gayrimüslümlerdi. Ha, eğer onlar bu müsamahayı bize göstermemiş olsaydılar, biz olmazdık bugün. (…) Ama demek ki bir hoşgörüylen karşılamışlar bizi, ha bugün de biz onları hoşgörüyle karşılarız.

90 Burada Ermeniler var, halen var, ama bunlar hiçbir zaman kendilerini Ermeni olarak şey yapmıyorlar, kendilerini Süryani olarak lanse ediyorlar. Yeni daha, yeni derken bundan 10 sene 20 sene aa falan kişi ermeniymiş ama, kendini Süryani olarak lanse ediyor.

Because when someone gets angry with someone, he says "Are you Armenian?" meaning that he/she is a bad person, due to the events that occurred in the past regarding Armenians.[91]

As in different formal and informal interviews, the history of Armenians and their cultural and architectural contribution on Mardin are generally ignored, as interprete by SB:

> There is an Arabic ethnicity, an Armenian ethnicity in Mardin, which we do not express as a state policy now; you have walked around in Mardin, all of Mardin's cultural, monumantal houses, all of the houses have two belongings. One is Muslim houses, and the other is Christian houses. Muslim houses are Muslim houses, this can be Arabic, Turkish, Kurdish, but Christian houses, in every meaning, nearly without an exception, are Armenian houses. This is both kept confidential by the government and we also do not mention this. Of course, as these houses are like this, the cuisine, fashion, architecture, and ornamenting of those houses belong to both. No matter what you do, there is an Arabic culture in Mardin and it dominates everything.[92]

As in expressed in many narratives, it is understood that sharing space provides voluntarily or necessary much closer relations. This could be evaluated as more or less obligatory coexistence of people of different religious and ethnic belongings. This spatial closeness produced convergences in different traditions and customs. Therefore, while differences were decreasing, commonalities were crystallized.

Migrations of Christians, mainly Orthodox Syriacs, accelerated in 1950s because of economical reasons, and increased with 1960s and 1970s due to also cultural and political reasons. With 1980s, the main reason of the migration is security problems caused by security problem in the conflict process. At the beginning of the 19th, there

---

91 Çünkü Ermenilerle ilgili neden, geçmişteki olaylardan ötürü mesele burada biri birine bir şey etmek istediği zaman, kızdığı zaman diyor ki 'Ermeni misin?', yani kötü birisin anlamında!

92 Bir de Mardin'de bir Araplık var, bir Ermenilik var, şimdi yani devlet politikası bakımından ifade etmediğimiz, şu Mardin'i gezmişsin, Mardin'in kültürel, Mardin'in anıtsal evlerinin, evlerin hepsinin iki aidiyeti var. Bir Müslüman evleri, bir Hıristiyan evleri. Müslüman evleri de Müslüman evidir, bu Arap olabilir, Türk olabilir, Kürt olabilir, ama Hıristiyan evleri, hemen hemen istisnasız, her manada, hemen hemen istisnasız denilecek şekilde Ermeni evidir. Bu hem devlet tarafından saklanır, hem biz bunu gündeme getirmeyiz. Tabi bu evler böyle olduğu zaman, bu evlerin mutfağı da, bu evlerin modası da, bu evlerin in mimarisi de, bu evlerin süslemesi de ikisinindir. Fakat ne yaparsan yap, Mardin'de bir Araplık kültürü var, daha hâkimdir her şeye.

were Christians, including mainly Armenians, in substantial number of the general population of the city centre.

Today, fewness of Christian families is frequently expressed as "today 40-50 Christian families are living in the city centre". HK narrates this demographic transformation from his childhood to now:

> In the years I was born and went to school, there were more non-muslims in our quarter. All of the houses across us were owned by non-muslims and we used to go to school together, there was a more sincere atmosphere in the quarter. Of course, some of them have gone abroad, because of economic conditions, not by force, in order to achieve better economic conditions, and some went to İstanbul and other big cities. Instead, immigration from village to the city took place. Naturally, this has change the balance to some extent. Now, necessarily no person would like to make a mistake in a city, a place, a quarter where he/she was born and grown up. However, the people coming to cities from villages started making mistakes, and the mistakes continued to be encountered until people got used to the place, and of course things have gotten better after getting used to the place. However, locals of Mardin is being reduced, the number of people immigrating to cities from villages and who are of Kurdish origin are increasing.[93]

One of the indicators of this situation is decreasing number of active churches as cited in interviews. For example, in this process, Armenian Red Church ("Kızıl Kilise") changed hand and was used for different functions. One of my interviewees, CA, whose family was a renter of a home possessed of this Church's foundation in his childhood, interprets change in the uses of churches:

> As far as I know, Kırklar church was also present before, there was also another church called Mar Mihail, another was being built there. However, we know that many others were being built; bells were tolling, on Sundays, not only at one place but at many places bells were tolling. But if no religious ceremonies will be held, tolling bells makes no sense… All of these

---

93 Benim doğduğum ve ilkokula gittiğim yıllarda mahallemizde gayrimüslim daha fazlaydı. Bu karşımızdaki evlerin hepsi hemen hemen gayrimüslümlerindi ve beraber okula gider gelirdik, daha samimi bir hava vardı mahallede. Tabi şimdi bunlar, yani ekonomik koşullardan ötürü, yoksa zorlama değil, ekonomik koşulların daha iyi olabilmesi için bir kısmı yurtdışına gitti, bir kısmıysa İstanbul, büyükşehirlere gitti. Onların yerine köyden kente göç oldu. Bu tabi dengeleri biraz daha değiştirdi. Şimdi ister istemez bir insan, doğup büyüdüğü tanındığı bir şehirde, bir yerde, bir semtte hata yapmak istemez. Ama şimdi köyden kente gelenler de başladılar yavaş yavaş hata yapmaya, onlar da tabi adapte oluncaya kadar bir şekilde hatalar devam etti ama tabi onlar da adapte olduktan sonra, bir düzelme var. Bizim Mardin yerlisi çiflik sahibi oluyor, köyden kente göç edip de Kürt kökenli olanlar artıyor burada.

developments have occurred after 68, when we went to the university, and after 70s. Meaning that until 70s, all were active. When I was at the university, these were active.[94]

In a different district, in which there is too few house of non-Muslims, a young interview expressed this situation referring to elders:

> SE: Theirs, our oldies said that there were five houses of them and one house of us. These are migrated poeple.
>
> M: Who is Christian, is this known?
>
> SE: It is clear. We (Muslims) have 100 house, they have 5 house. That district's people know own settled district.[95]

As a result of emigration of Christians, relations normally restricted with Christians. The migrations of Christians are evaluated as "migration of people with capital and craft", as cited in different interviews. In many interviews and speeches, changes in neighbouring relations and intercultural communication were frequently expressed. Spatially, traditional houses and neighbourhood structure in old Mardin provided more closed and concentrated intercommunication and relation between Muslims and Christians. CA reports:

> When we were out of salt, we asked them for some, and when they were out of bread, they asked us for some. They used to come to our house in the evening, my father used to tell them stories. We used to go to their house, they had an old radio, they were turning it on. We did not have any difference.[96]

---

94 Daha önce benim bildiğim, Kırklar kilisesi gene vardı, aşağıda bir kilise vardı Mar Mihail diye bir kilise vardı, orda yapılıyordu. Yani ama şurdan biliyoruz ki birçok yerde yapılıyordu ki, çan çalıyordu, pazar günü bir değil birkaç yerde çan çalıyordu. Ama ordan da, yani ayin yapılmayacaksa çan çalmanın o zaman bir anlamı yok… Biz üniversiteye gittiğimiz, 68'lerden sonra, bu şeyler, gelişmeler, hepsi 70'lerden sonra olan gelişmelerdir. Yani 70'lere kadar hepsi faaldi. Ben üniversiteye giderken bunlar faaldi.

95 Onlarda bizim büyükler diyordu, onlardan beş ev vardı, bizden bir ev vardı. Bu göç edenler."

M: Kim Hıristiyan bilinir miydi?

Belliydi zaten. Bizden yüz ev, onlardan beş ev var. Ordaki mahalledeki insanlar oturduğu mahalleyi tanırdı.

96 Bizim tuzumuz biterdi onlardan isterdik, onların ekmeği biterdi gelir bizden isterlerdi. Akşam bizim eve gelirlerdi, babam onlara hikâye anlatırdı. Biz onların evine giderdik, onların bir radyolarını vardı tamam mı, eski radyo, yani onu çalıştırırlardı. Hiçbir farkımız yoktu.

Living with Christians for long time produced many habits including greetings religious ceremonies and bayrams, attending bayram meals, attending weddings, funerals and condolences, home meetings, attending picnics and Hıdırelles. However, apartment life restricted interrelations and intercommunication with among Muslims and Christians.

There are different narratives about giving responsible for Muslim neighbour's to keep an eye on their children by Christian families. There are some events protecting non-Muslims children from any bad treatment in the street and in the school. One of my non-recorded interviewees narrates:

> While my children was going to school, one of Christian neighbour wanted our child to protect their children from bad treatment or statements during walking to school and in school hours. Because some children treat bad or say bad things. Therefore, their mother entrust our children.[97]

Conversely, some interviewees narrated a distance to Christians that they are said by parents not to eat or drink in houses of Christians due to religious reasons. N2 notes:

> I have those. Women did not have but men have. Our grandfathers have, for example my grand grandfather used to visit Assyrian chiefs and vice versa. There is no such thing among women. We only had Assyrian sartorials that we used to go. As far as I remember, we did not even drink water at their place, since it was considered to be illicit. This is what we were taught, now, believe me that we now eat and drink together with these people.[98]

This quotation also reveals how the gender difference affects relations with Christians. Therefore while analysing narratives it is need to take into consideration the multicultural experience is not the same with respect to men and women. N2 also notes changes relations between women in time:

---

[97] Benim çocuklarım okula giderken bir Hıristiyan komşumuzun çocuklarına da göz kulak olurlardı. Okula giderken yolda ve okul içinde onları korurlardı. Bazı çocuklar kötü davranabiliyorlardı. O yüzden anneleri bizim çocuklara emanet ediyorlardı.

[98] Var var benim var. Kadınların yoktu, erkeklerin var. Dedelerimizin var, mesela büyük dedem, büyük Süryani başlarıyla çok gidip geliyordu. Kadınlarda yok. Kadınlarda sadece terzilerimiz vardı, terziler oluyordu Süryani, gidip geliyorduk. Ama ben hatırladığım kadarıyle kesinlikle onlarda su bile içmezdik, haram diye. Ya eskiden böyle öğretiyorlardı, şimdi inan ki bunlarla hep beraber yemek yiyoruz, içiyoruz.

There was not intimacy among women.[99]

In some interviews, some stated disturbing and uneasy events and behaviours to Christians.In many interviews, there is an expressing that there is not any religious discrimination. It is frequently heard sentence about "some unwanted events".

In the past, some disturbing events, disturbing behaviours was made, however...[100]

However, there is also examples to protect Christians from injustice behaviours stated in interviews. There occurred some abuse practices to Christians starting with 1955 in the city. However, it is accepted as abuse of "non-noble"s, due to that "noble" families knows each other and does not make any bad practices to them.

One of the frequently expressed in daily speeches about Christians that their non-visibility in political life. Except from political life, there could be partnership between Muslims and Christians in Mardin. While partnership in economical life, neighbourhood could be possible, taking part a political party or movement was not seen due to Christians' distance to political attendance in local and general level. Christians political attendance restricted with elections.

### 4.6.2. Relations with Kurds

There are some frequently used words to describe Kurds such as "feudal", "tribal", "less-cultured", blood revenge", "villager", "brute force, violence and terrorism". These uses could be evaulted as stereotyping of Kurds. While Mardinian Arabs speaking on them, there is a tendency to stress negative characteristic. While these are much more related with city culture, practices and life-style in the past, it is more related with brute force, violence and terror today. Some examples used associated to Kurds are:

The culture of the city is getting ruralized.[101]

---

99 Kadınlarla fazla samimiyet yoktu. Eskiden yoktu, daha sonra daha sıklaştı, daha birbirine gitme-gelme oldu.

100 Geçmişte bazı yanlış şeyler, yanlış davranışlar olmuştur ama...

101 Şehrin kültürü köylüleşmiştir.

There was generally blood revenge among each others.[102]

There was not blood revenge once upon a time. These are terror developed here afterwards.[103]

The violence in the region... or When PKK events started in 1984...[104]

Perceptions about and relations with Kurds differs according to their class and political positions. Looking at traditional class positions of Kurds, there were large landowner "agha"s, and landless or small land owner villagers in rural sites in the past. However, in the discourse about being Kurdish, it generally overlaps to villager as class position. It is expressed that there was closeness, partnership and marriage relations between big families of the city and agha of rural areas.

One of the critical points determining relations with Kurds is changing class positions of Kurds. As an example to emphasis class differences with Kurds, an Arap coppersmith stresses relations in his childhood:

There was not any problem here in the past. In the past, they were working as 'maraba' for our jobs.[105]

According to this quotation, relations was better within positions of the past when compared today's. Related to this, while Arabs were more educated and thereby employed as professionals in service sector and bureaucracy, Kurds were associated to more rural occupations, other rural practices and village lifestyle. In a different speech, a young Arab from large-land owner family expressed that:

In the past, they used to respect us, and were working in our patronage.[106]

In a non-recorded speech, a member of big family, tells how they used to surprise when come across with a Kurd in 1970s in big cities of Turkey:

---

102 Kendi aralarında kan davaları olurdu genellikle...

103 Bizim buralarda zamanında kan davaları yoktu. Bunlar sonradan buralara yerleşen terörler.

104 Bölgedeki şiddet... or 84'te PKK olayları başlayınca...

105 Burada bir sorun yoktu. Eskiden bizde maraba olarak çalışılırdı.

106 Önceden hürmet ederlerdi, himayemizde çalışırlardı.

> While we are in İstanbul for the University education, during these years, we ask ourselves as "What for is this Kurd in İstanbul?[107]

This sentence reveals how this is an unwanted situation for them about Kurds. However, their perceptions started to change with Kurds' settlement in the urban Mardin. The same informant adds:

> They received education too, they came to a level. But of course they are not at the same level with me.[108]

While capital owners sitting in the city centre moved to the big cities and foreign countries; village origin newcomers settled in the periphery of the city centre. This is the main population change tendency of the city since 1950s due to economical, political and security problems. First migration flow of Kurmanji-speaking Kurds to the city centre started with large landowner Kurdish villagers or members having low income of tribes in 1950s during Democrat Party's government. It occurred from both mountain villages and plain villages. It is a part of urbanisation process of the Turkey due to mechanization and introduction of tractor to agricultural activities starting with 50s. Migrations of mostly Kurd and Arab villagers to the city centre seriously started by 1960s, and continued in 1970s. These migrations started to affect relations between different groups and habits of living together in the old-town. During the process, Christians replaced by Kurd immigrants from villages in the urban Mardin. In a non-recorded interview, this demographic transformation is interpretad as:

> In the past, there were no Kurds in Mardin... Today, people, who will replace the ones that left Mardin, will not come from England or USA; they will come from villages, as they do everywhere. For example, I remember when the entire population in Kızıltepe and Nusaybin consisted of Arabs... This was 40 years ago.[109]

---

107 İstanbul'da üniversitede okurken, bu yıllarda, kendi kendimize sorardık, "bu Kürt ne arıyor İstanbul'da?" diye.

108 Onlar da okudurlar, belirli bir seviyeye geldiler. Her ne kadar benim kültürüm kadar değilseler de.

109 Eskiden Mardin'de hiç yoktu Kürt... Şimdi Mardin'den göç edenlerin yerine kim gelecek, herhalde İngilteltere'den Amerika'dan gelmeyecek, köylerden gelecek buraya değil mi? Yani bu sadece bizde değil. Mesela ben hatırlıyorum, Kızıltepe'nin tümü Arap'tı, Nusaygin'in tümü Arap'tı... Benim hatırladığım 40 sene evvel.

CA emphasis this population mobility comparing with out migration of Christians, and comings of Kurds as a cause of this migration:

> After sixties, a serious population decrease happened here. There is a village called Yalım here, it is a little town. People of this Yalım Village started coming to Mardin. Yalım is of Kurdish origin. When these people started coming to Mardin, they started treating unfairly to them. Especially the ones who had physical power, land owners, tribes started treating unfairly to Christians. And immigration trend started after 60s. There was no such thing until 60s. Everything started with the coming of these people. Due to one thing you do to a family started scaring other families.[110]

As a part of this understanding, there is tendency to think about some newcomer Kurd groups treated unfairly to some Christians. There is a prevalent tendency among established Arabs about Kurds that some of Kurds used brute force through their familial or tribal power especially with 1960s. In different speeches, it said that this way of behaviour includes possessing people's estate property by force, not paying any fee after buying a thing, and taking tribute. As a result, it is expressed that they bring forth "escape" of some Christian families because their having less power to resist. One of non-recored interviewee express:

> They caused to many people escape from Mardin. Thereby, these people left unwillingly.[111]

As reason of decrease in the number of Christian and some propertied Arab families, these changes became an important reason. On the hand, CA criticises the role of Arabs in this process by not protecting Christians from this behaviors:

> This immigration trend was of course the fault caused by one thing, by the Muslims' fault since they did not protect them, or they were afraid too, they did not embrace, if they did, things would have been different. But then it was the same for the Muslims. The same people, who made them immigrate, started haunting rich people among Muslims, unprotected rich people..

---

110 Şimdi altmışlardan sonra burada ciddi bir nüfus azalması oldu. Burada Yalım diye bir köy var, beldedir. Bu yalım köyü, Mardin'e gelmeye başladı. Yalım Kürt'tür. Onlar Mardin'e gelmeye başlayınca, başladılar haksızlık yapmaya bunlara. Özellikle bunlardan kaba gücü olan, ağalar, aşiretler, şeyler, bunlar başladılar Hıristiyanlara haksızlık yapmaya. Ve göç dalgası 60'lardan sonra başladı. 60'lara kadar böyle bir şey yoktu. Bunların gelmesiyle birlikte bunlarda şey başladı.  Bir aileye yaptığınız bir şey, bu sefer, diğer aileler de korkmaya başladı.

111 Birçok çok insanı kaçırtılar, istemeye istemeye gittiler.

M: How did this happen?

In the same way. For example, one gets his job done, but does not pay, borrows, but does not pay back. There is no such thing in Mardin. There were no things as bill or interest.[112]

As I observed and noted in different speeches, Kurds who migrated earlier generally adapted and integrated to social life and know speaking Arabic to communicate with established settlers. CA interprets why newcomers needed to learn Arabic:

There are some places in Mardin, for example there is a part of Diyarbakırkapı district, where Kurds live. There were such places, but were less in number. You could show their homes by pointing at. They were from the same place in general. There are people who came from Derik region. The thing is, there are some people coming from other villages, from the villages of Ömerli, meaning that there were people coming from immediate surroundings. Mardin has a characteristic, the people who came here adapted Mardin, its culture and lifestyle, within time. Kurds has a characteristic, all of them knew both Kurdish and Arabic.[113]

Migration from villages to the city centre highly increased in 1970s because of changing structure of land ownership. Until these years people chose Nusaybin and Kızıltepe to settle. (Aydın et al., 2001: 406). This demographic increase in 1960s and 1970s also were years of the region started getting more political (Aydın et al., 408). SN interprets the years before the September 12 in terms of the role of leftist Arabs on accepting Kurds in the city centre:

---

112 Bu göç dalgası önce Hıristiyanlar için tabi ki, şeyin tek hatası, Müslümanların tek hatası korumadılar, ya da onlar da korktular, sahiplenmediler, yani o zamanlar için sahiplenmiş olsaydı, yani ne yapıyorsun sen? Ama sonradan Müslümanlara da sıra geldi. Sonradan aynı şahıslar, bunları göç ettirenler, bu sefer Müslüman zenginlere de dadanmaya da başladı, sahipsiz zenginlere dadanmaya başladı.

M: Nasıl dadandı?

Aynı, aynı şekilde. Mesela, adam iş yaptırıyor, parasını vermiyor, borç alıyor, parasını vermiyor. Mardin'de böyle bir şey yok. Mardin'de hiç kimse senet sepet yoktu, faiz yoktu.

113 Şimdi genellikle bunlar, geldiği mahalle, Mardin'de belli yerler var, şeyler var, mesela Kürtlerin oturduğu Diyarbakırkapı mahallesinden bir bölüm var. Vardı ama çok azdı. Yani böyle kayda değer, hatta sayabilirdin evlerini, şu ev şu ev diye sayabilirdin evlerini. Onlar genellikle şeyden gelmişlerdi. Derik kesiminden gelenler var. Mesele diğer köylerden mesela Ömerli'nin köylerinden gelenler var, yani yakın çevreden gelenler vardı. Tabi zamanla onlar da, Mardin'in bir özelliği var, zamanla buraya gelenler daha önce, zamanla Mardin'e adapte oluyordu, yani kültürüne, yaşayış biçimine hepsine, diline. Kürtlerin biz özelliği var daha önce, hepsi hem Kürtçeyi biliyordu, hem Arapça'yı da biliyordu.

In the past, educated Arab youth supported Turkish left-wing politics. Leaders of many left-wing movements were Arabs. It is again Arab youth who keep these Kurds here. In 1974, obscure people created havoc and riots in many cities, like the events in Çorum, Malatya etc. Here, they had previously put to flight and silenced MHP (Nationalist Movement Party) supporters. The true conflict was between Islamists and left-wingers. One day, a Kurdish Islamist was killed in İnekler Marketplace. Some wanted to stir up trouble and anarchy, but could not achieve. Arab youth did not rise to the bait and they remained on the safe side… In 1974, Arabs and Kurds made peace. They struggled together. Before, Kurdish people could not settle in Mardin; so they could not get organized politically. In 1974, Arab socialists worked together with the youth. Kurds also contributed to this struggle.[114]

With 1984, during conflict process, a new migration flow experienced as forced migration of Kurdish villagers. Historically, coup de September 12 became a breaking point in cultural interrelations and political life. There were different leftist groups including young Arabs and Kurds together in the same political groups such as "Kurtuluş" and "Kawa". Their common struggle focused more on class inequalities, rather than cultural or identity demands. Starting martial rule in 1978, political associations were closed by the Government. After the coup de September 12, many members of leftist groups were arrested and prisoned in Diyarbakır Jail. The beginning of the "conflict era" as a new process in the history of the region is related with events experienced starting with the September 12. "Conflict process" is accepted as starting with 1984 military conflict between the Turkish Armed Forces and PKK to 1999 with the arresting of the PKK leader Abdullah Öcalan.

During the conflict process, much more Kurdish people settled to Mardin due to evacuation of their villages. This forced migration is the biggest migration flow to the city centre, and this situation also caused settlement problems, and new houses were started to be constructed in the perifery of the old-town.. They constructed "slum" districts grew in the margins of the city centre, today in districts under "New

---

114 Eskiden okuyan Arap gençleri Türk solundaydı. Çoğu sol hareketlerin lideri Arap'tı. Bu kürtleri de burada tutan Arap gençleridir. 1974'te birçok şehirde karanlıklar tarafından ayaklanmalar, kargaşalıklar çıkartıldı. Çorum, Malatya olayları vesaire. Burda daha once MHP'lileri kaçırmışlardı, susturmuşlardı. Esas çelişki ümmetçi ve solcular arasındaydı. Bir keresinde İnekler Çarşısı'nda bir ümmetçi (dinci, Kürt) öldürüldü. Bir olay çıkartılmak istendi, anarşi olsun istendi, ama onu başaramadılar. Arap gençleri bu oyuna gelmedi, daha temkinli davrandılar... 1974'te Araplarla Kürtler barıştı. Birlikte mücadele ettiler. Eskiden Kürtler Mardin'de yerleşmezler, yani siyasi örgütlenme yapamazlardı. 1974'te Arap sosyalistler gençler birlikte çalıştılar. Kürtlerin de bunda katkısı oldu.

Road" ("Yeniyol"). In daily discourse, "slum" ("varoş" and "gecekondu") are used by some of urban Arabs to describe these districts.

Forced migration from Kurdish villages to the margins of the city centre changed distribution of the demography in districts Kurdish migrants concentrated on to the margins of the city centre to settle. Relations with Kurds began to change with their settling to the margins of the city, and turned more on tension. This also restricted restricted communications with Kurds due to spatial difference. CA interprets what changes after 1984 with conflict process:

> In fact, it began after 1984, when actions of PKK began. Today, Mardin is a fragile city. Yes, nothing happened in Mardin, and PKK could not enter into city. People of Mardin did neither make concessions to Kurdish Hezbollah. Mardin never made concessions to deep state or counter guerilla. Consequently, none of them could enter into this city. For example, when you look at Nusaybin, in three weeks, it was dominated by Hezbollah, PKK and the state respectively. But Mardin was not deterred by any of these. Imagine; they tried to close the shops here, but could not. It is still the same; the people of Mardin never shut the shop. One or two persons closed their shops. And soon, they had to leave Mardin and go to somewhere else.[115]

On similar lines, N1 notes:

> Here, Kurds and Arabs get on very well with each other. (...) In the past, it was even better. I mean, now there is a political cause; people are distant; it was more sincere and friendly in those days.[116]

The sense of shared experiences since 1980s strengthens senses of solidarity and unity among especially displaced Kurds. Before 1980s, migrations of Kurds was mainly based on economical reasons and these people had settled to old city and margins. This situation provided new neighbourhood relations with Arab and

---

115 Asıl şeyden sonra başladı, 1984'te olaylar başlayınca, yani PKK olayları başlayınca. Şimdi Mardin hassas bir yerdir. Evet, Mardin'de hiçbir olay olmadı. PKK da şehre giremedi. Hizbullah'a da taviz vermedi Mardinli. Derin devlete veya ismi ne, kontrollega mı dersiniz, Mardin hiç taviz vermedi. Taviz vermediği için de buraya hiçbiri giremedi. Mesela bir Nusaybin'e bakıyorsunuz, bir hafta Hizbullah hâkimdi, bir hafta PKK hakimdi, bir hafta devlet hakimdi. Ama Mardin'de hiçbirine taviz vermedi. Düşünebiliyor musunuz, burada dükkânları kapatmaya çalıştılar, kapatamadılar. Halen öyle, mesela Mardin hiç kapatmamış, hâlâ öyle. Bir dükkân kapattı, iki dükkân kapattı. İkisi de bir süre sonra burayı, Mardin'i terk edip başka yere gitmek zorunda kaldı.

116 Kürtlen Arap burada çok güzel geçiniyor. (...) Şimdi vallahi eskiden daha güzeldi. Yani şimdi bir siyasi dava çıkmış böyle, mesafe bırakılmış, eskiden daha samimiyet vardı, daha dostluk vardı.

Christian city dwellers in the same districts. Before 1980s, relations between Arab, Kurd, or Mıhallemi villagers and city dwellers are mainly economic in the bazaar. People from different villages of Mardin came to the city centre to sell their agricultural and animal products. Due to this relation, the tradesmen of Mardin learned Kurdish language to communicate with these villagers.

Perception of "villager" ("gundi") and "urbanite" ("bajar") continued about displaced newcomers mostly settled in the margins. One of the informal informants notes about this issue:

> They continue habits of village. They live in like a village life in there... They have chickens and hen houses...[117]

This change in the demography reflects on political life and power struggle in Mardin. Political attendance of Kurds with 1991 elections evaluated as a new era in political life in Mardin, as SB states:

> After the elections in 1991, it is no more possible to talk about elections or democracy in Mardin. Why? Because disintegration took place; people began to take sides. Kurdish unions began to defend Kurdish identity; whereas there is another group that refuses the existence of Kurds. They are almost fifty-fifty in the society. This is what the politics are about now; Kurdish and non-Kurdish people. This is the same for local and general elections.[118]

SB continues interpreting how political choices changed with 1991 elections:

> In 1991, for the first time they took five of them from here, along with SODEP. Two of them were nominated as candidates. That day, the politics were born. Before, everyone was free and independent in choosing political parties; so, there was democracy.
>
> M: What was important back then?
>
> Political view was important; even more, affinity with the candidate was important. Promises and services were important. I mean, whatever is normally important everywhere was also important here. However,

---

117 Köy alışkanlıklarını devam ettiriyorlar. Orada köy hayatı yaşıyorlar. Tavuğu vardır, kümesi vardır...

118 1991 seçimlerinden sonra artık Mardin'de bir seçimden bir demokrasiden bahsetmek mümkün değildir. Neden, çünkü ayrışma oldu, artık saf tutmaya, faranjlaştı, bir Kürt faranjları, birlikleri var, Kürtlüğü güdüyor, bir de Kürtlükğü reddeden bir kesim var. Bunlar yarı yarıyadır. Siyasette artık budur, Kürt ve Kürt olmayanlardır. Hem mahalli seçimlerde bu böyledir, hem genel seçimlerde.

institutions of feudalism and sheikhdom were more influential back then on accumulation of votes at one person, compared to those days. Now such influence is broken. In the process of breakdown continues. It is now all about taking sides. I mean, for example, what am I to do with MHP? But I may be close to the point of MHP; the side for all of us is MHP. I say this in sorrow, because, we are excluded.[119]

The reason of this negative view for them is the political segregation based on ethnic identity, because demands of Kurds are new for Mardin's political agenda, and some Arabs think this as a exclusion. This distinction reflects on social life and relations between Arabs and Kurds in the city centre, and became an issue of "tension" between differents sides. Today, continuing displeasure on Kurds is not based more on their being Kurd; it is due to their increasing population in the city centre, their being rural-origin and its effects on city culture, their increasing attendence to economic life, their emphasis on Kurdish identity in a strong sense and politicisation of this identity and related right demands, their protestation to existing citizenship model and practices. Their position is not approving, rather protestation and resistance existing understanding of citizenship, rights. Therefore, there is thought that these Kurds are "segregationist".

While evaluating today's political life in Mardin, it is frequently expressed that there are two main political parties including Justice and Development Party ("AK Parti") and Peace and Democracy Party ("BDP"). BDP is also called as "Party of Kurds" ("Kürt Partisi") in daily use. Kurdish Movement and its political parties, has been accepted as an alternative and rival in political struggle in Mardin. It also transformed tribe oriented power struggles for Kurds. On the other hand, although there is a negative sense to political Kurds, some figures in this movement could be kept out. As cited in different interviews, Ahmet Türk and his family is generally

---

119 91'de ilk defa onlara SODEP'le birikte, buradan beş tane götürdüler, iki tane aday gösterdiler. O gün siyaset oluştu. Öncesinde siyasi partileri seçmekte herkes hür ve serbestti, yani demokrasi vardı.

M: Ne önemli oluyordu o zaman?

Siyasi görüş önemliydi, hatta adaya yakınlık önemliydi, vaat önemliydi, hizmet önemliydi. Yani normalde nerde ne önemliyse ,burda da onlar önemliydi. Fakat o zaman da daha etkindi ağalık ve şeyhlik müessesi, oyların bir yerde birikmesinde, o güne göre çok daha etkindi. Şimdi o etkiyi kırdı. Ve o kırılma hala devam ediyor. Orası iyi fakat artık saf tutma vardır. Yani aslında mesela benim MHP'yle ne alakalam olabilir. Fakat durduğum yer MHP'nin durduğu yerdir ve hepimizin safı MHP'dir. Üzülerek şey ediyorum. Çünkü neden, itildik.

liked due to their political past in Republican People's Party ("CHP") and beneficial jobs for Mardin.

### 4.6.3. Conclusion

Syriacs is as "other" by their religious belonging for Muslim Arabs. They are also much more Christian, or non-Muslim, rather than being ethnically Syriacs for Mardinian Arabs. Christians were also neighbour in settlement sites, "master", "partner" or "boss" in working places.

However, due to sharing the same religious belief with Kurds, categorisation is made in terms of class, culture and ethnic differences. Kurds were much more "villager" ("gundi") before their migration to the city for Arabs. It is more a class, culture, and lifestyle based categorisation. With their settlement to the city, this perception in some case got more stronger, or gain different emphasis. In this situation, they are village-origin newcomers for urbanite Arabs. However, some make a distinction is between Kurds migrated different areas starting with 1950s, for example from Yalımköy and Kabala, and displaced Kurds in conflict process. Furthermore, politicisation of Kurds especially after de coup September 12, and choice of Kurds in 1991 General Election turned this perception to more on ethnic difference among Arabs. This politisation of Kurds and their demands produced a sense of displeasure and worry among native Arabs. Among Kurds, in the past "tribe" was more referred, a sense of "nation", national consciousness or separate "community" developed as a based for strong sense of "us" during the conflict process. As interviews revealed that Kurds become as "the other" for Arabs due to Kurds' political expressions on ethnicity.

The relations with Christians are much more related with neighbourhood and spatial closeness. Therefore sharing place provides for Arabs to narrate many events, stories and ideas about Christians. However, it was not the same with Kurds due to not being shared space in the old-town. It was due to urban and village spatial distance with them. With migrations of Kurds to the city-centre, relations and possiblities of partnership or tension with Kurds normally increased. Therefore, while relations with

Kurds are increasing, relations with Syriacs is decreasing. Attending of Kurds to social, cultural, economical, and political life produced also a rivalry perception among native Arabs, because Kurds changed existing dynamics of political and power struggles in the city. These are the case of how identity perception shaped in the effects of spatial configuration.

While the inner space, home and related parts, is much more used by women, working space is for men. Therefore, women are constrained family commitments in the house, and men are constrained more on earning living in the working space. It is clearer in the old-town. As a result, relations between women belonging to different affinities was/is much more restricted due to that common used sites is restricted. There are some restricted events when compared with men's, house visiting in daytimes and evenings, some leisure acitivies. However, it is possible for men much more including working place, bazaar, and coffee houses. These sites provide more possibilities to meeting between Muslim and Christian men. Therefore, it cannot be said that density of intercultural relations and influence is same for both men and women.

The sense of community and ties between people is weak for Arabs. They are not strongly integrated. It is difficult to talk about a cohesion which is determining quality of being group among them. Moreover, the sense of community is strong among Syriac Orthodox. They are more strongly integrated based on Church belonging. They accept priest as leading person of the community in the city. It is also related with decreasing group size, and their sense of religiously minority. Degree of solidarity is strong and they have an internal cohesiveness. It is also more functional for them different from Muslims, because, while the main local Christian group is people belonging to Syriac Orthodox, local Muslims are ethnically differs as Arabs and Kurds. While this integrates Arabs and Kurds under the sense of religious belonging, this dissociates according to ethnic and class positions. This quality in a sense become a point of commonality as "religious brotherhood" ("din kardeşliği") or "Islam brotherhood". However, in a context class is prioritised, in a different context ethnicity is prioritised.

As a result, Arabs, Syriacs and Kurds easily communicate in different sites. However, possibilites and density for relations changes according to population, gender, and spatial configurations including shared places and old-town, new-town, and margins. This reveals how communication and relation is gendered and placed.

# CHAPTER 5

## PLACES OF LIVING TOGETHER IN MARDIN

### 5.1. INTRODUCTION

This part focuses on spatial dynamics of co-presence in Mardin and aims to understand relations between identity and transformation of the city space. In other words, it is about how identity is placed. This part evaluates "shared space" as a significant factor affecting people's identity formation. During the fieldwork "place" crystallized as a significant determinant of identity formation. I examine relations between identity and place in terms of not only discursive-narrative data, but also my observations on inhabitants' uses of place.

Identity could not be evaluated without taking into consideration of place. Ways of living together is possible in the shared place. Cultural, religious, ethnic, and class similarities and differences among people are produced and sustained in the place. Especially, these factors are spatial configurations including patterns of settlement and changes in the uses of different spaces for this study. The experience of living with diversity is related with geographical co-presence, or sharing unitary territory. Place as the site of living together provides or requires meeting each other, making everyday contact and relations with others. Shared space determines density of communications and relations between people Therefore configurations and changes in spatial uses influences people's identity understanding. New spatial settings provide new patterns of social interaction.

Living in a multi-ethnic and multi-religios site has potential to produce tolerance or, intolerance and conflict. In addition to the urban site of Mardin, there are different villages in which people of different ethnic and religious affinities living together.

According to living urban or rural site, there could be differences affecting identity formation and habits of living together.

Mardin urban space as a zone of co-presence provides different possibilities for inter-cultural relations and communication. These places of living together and sites of cultural interchange could be listed as:

- Patterns of settlement: mixed neighbourhood

- Mixed schooling: not faith/ethnicity/minority based schools

- Mixed working space

- Other shared spaces: street, cinema, picnics, Turkish bathroom ("hamam"), worship places (churches and mosques)

## 5.2. PATTERNS OF SETTLEMENT: MIXED NEIGHBOURHOOD

Today's Mardin as an urban area could be considered as four main parts in terms of way of settlement through constructing chronology: the old-town, the margins or outer suburb ("çeper"), "İstasyon" district, and the new-town.

### 5.2.1. Settlement in the Old-Town

The most important feature of the multi-ethnicity and multi-religiosity in the old-town is the mixed housing, contrast to compartmentalisation of districts based on religion or ethnicity belongings. Ethnically and religiously heterogeneity is not only also valid for only large urban area, but also within districts. Settlement of people belonging to different religions or ethnicities in the urban setting is mixed. It is also mixed in terms of class positionings. During the process, relations between people of different affinities were based more on habits of neighbourhood in these sites through spatial closeness. Contrast to religiously segregated housing type, mixed housing provided daily interaction and closeness between people belonging to different affinities.

Distribution and density of people of different belongings changes according to districts. While Muslims is much more in some districts; density of Christians was more than Muslims in different districts. Therefore, relations and interactions between Muslims and Christians were not the same in every districts. Under the protection of the "nation-system" ("millet sistemi") in the Ottoman State, Christians, Jewish, and Shemsi people shared same place to live. Distinctively, there were two districts which were named religiously "Yahudiyye" (Jewish) and "Shemsiyye" (for sun-worship) until 18th century. In addition to this, there is also a district mentioned as "District of Arabs" ("Arap Mahallesi") in local use, today. These distributions reveals us that Shemsi, Jew, Christian and Muslim population lived in the same districts. However, reasons and exact process how and why people of different religions spread to different districts is not known. It could be due to geographic restrictions. Today, during the fieldwork and in the interviews, the effects of mixed housing on people's identity expression and perception about others could easily be seen.

Mixed settlement produced close relations between neighbour families. One of the important interrelation and intercommunication source is the neighbourhood of families of different religions. Relations includes "bayram" greetings after religious ceremonies, inviting and attending weddings, funerals and condolences, house visits in evenings, visiting for sick call, serving meals to neighbours. The closeness with Christians is frequently expressed as:

> Due to living in the same place as one within the other, bayrams was greeted each other. However, now people living in the new-town do not know.[120]

Neighbourhood can be evaulated as two forms "house neighbourhood" ("ev komşuluğu") and "inner courtyard neighbourhood" ("avlu komşuluğu"). Neighbourhood was generally experienced as between close but separate houses, titled "house neighbourhood". In addition this, "inner courtyard neighbourhood" is told in interviews that there are very few cases in which Muslims and Christians

---

120 İç içe olduğumuz için bayramlar birlikte kutlanırdı, fakat şimdi Yenişehirdekiler bilmiyor.

settle in the common "büyût"• and thereby shares common inner court and toilet. Thereby an "inner court neighbourhood" formated. "Büyût" includes different "beyt"s sharing an inner court. People live in "büyût"s as familial.

Contrast to general close and positive relations between Christian neighbours, some negative understandings was also possible. It is told rarely, some people did not drink or eat anything because of the religious reasons. N2 states:

> While I was child, I remember, we were walking/passing that district in a fear. It is place Syriacs live in. We don't like.[121]

Lokking at distribution of people and possesion of houses, it could be observed that settlement in districts were generally based on familial. It could be also evaulted as a class based concentration, especially for big families, as stated in an non-recorded interview:

> Houses of big families was close each other, it is intervened. And anyone who are non did not enter to settle in it.[122]

The second quality of way of settlement is that concentration people from near class positions. It is related to importance of the being near to the bazaar and the main street. It is a sample of classed concentration in the settlement in the old-own, as cited in this quatation:

> Wealthy families settled the place near to the main road.[123]

There are also settlement areas in which lower classes people concentrated. There are poor urban areas, or parts in a district. There are also real estates of Mosque or Church Wakfiyyas to rent members of communities. Today also State, under Vakıflar Müdürlüğü, had houses to rent. For example, some Syriac families still continue to live houses of outbuildings of the Church as renter. One of the important

---

• In the Arabic, while "beyt" means a small and single house, "büyût" refers the aggregation of these small houses/rooms sharing a common inner court and toilet. In this "büyût", different families could be settled. (Noyan, 2008: 70).

121 Ben çok ufaktım, hatırlıyorum, ben, o mahalleden geçerken korka korka giderdik. Süryanilerin olduğu yerde. Sevmezdik.

122 Büyük ailelerin tümünde evler yakın, iç içe, dışarıdan kimse girmezdi.

123 Zenginler ana yola daha yakın yerlerde oturuyorlardı.

things affecting structure of a district is the change in the possession of the real estates.

Class differences could also be observed in inner parts and architecture of houses in the old-town. Houses of big and wealthy families were more big, complex and decorated. BK, as a member of leading family, states:

> For example, there is PTT in the Üçyol crossroad; it's the district of Şahtana family. There is Erdoba, houses around it, these are ours. Every big family had the best places.[124]

One of the informants says on his grandfather, and it could be accepted for other big families:

> He lived in a great, palatial house, which was very very large.[125]

These houses have more room including living units and service units, more storeyed, courtyards, and some specialised parts in the house. However, houses of people of middle and lower classes were more artless, undecorated or less decorated, and had less qualities and parts. Looking at uses of spaces, there is also a gender differentiation to manage. Service units "matbağ", including toilet, bath and kitchen in local Arabic, was managed by women. Cleaning, cooking, doing laundry, storeroom for seasonal foods, care of pack animals are under women's control. As gender segregation, the most important quality is "harem-selam" distinction to sit separately as men and women in Muslims houses, if the house have enough rooms to prepare in this purpose. In the place of Muslim, there is gender segregation as "harem" and "selam" as religious based segregation, and it is implemented in different religious or non-religious practices.

Furthermore, one of the expressed points related to possesion of real estates is places of summer vacation in Mardin. Big families also had bond-houses, gardens, and vineyards for summer vacations, such as "Zinnar" or "Kabala". SN notes:

---

124 Mesela PTT var ya üç yolda, o mahalle Şahtanalarındı. Erdoba var ya, o evler de bizim. Bütün büyük aileler en güzel yerlere sahiptiler.

125 Çok büyük bir evde yaşıyordu, saray yavrusundan bahsetmiş, o kadar geniş bir ev.

We had a garden in Kabala. All notable families here had such beautiful gardens in Zinnar. The plain over there was not that important.[126]

Today, many houses are in under in the deserted situation because of moving to the new-town or other cities. On the other hand, a different direction on development of Mardin is employed through new culture and tourism policy in recent years. Old Mardin was registered as SİT Field by The Culture Ministry in 1970s. This banned new construction and restricted restoration in the old-town. In the post-conflict process, a new culture and tourism policy for Mardin is employed. Related to the policy of developing a culture and belief tourism, a bid nomination for list of UNESCO World Heritage sites for the old-town as a whole named as Mardin Cultural Landscape (Biner 2007). Thereby, old Mardin added tentative list. However, as a part this attmept, a project titled Historic Transition Project is being employed to transform the city into what it was around in 1930s. During this process, the importance and value of houses, especially near to Main Street (1. Cadde) increased. In a new and low tendency is also to buy old houses of old big families by wealth foreigners to use them seasonal. Many houses close to Main Street restored as hotel or coffee. This process made the old houses more important than its history and buildings in the the new-town.

### 5.2.2. Settlement in "Margin"s

With beginning of increasing migrations from rural areas, these peasant origin and poorer people, mostly Kurds and Mıhallemis settled the city centre. It is the process of rurul-to-urban mobility within Mardin province. Kurds and other village origin families migrated in 60s and 70s generally settled to close side of or inner site of the old-town. Reasons of these migrations were due to economical problems and conflict situations, such as blood revenge and land friction, between families in the village. While it is generally said in interviews that some of them more easily adapted to the city life, however it does not contain Kurds coming with conflict process. For example, there is a tendency to learn Arabic to adapt, however Kurds migrated

---

126 Bizim Kabala'da bahçemiz vardı. Burada ileri gelen ailelerin hepsinin, Zinnar'dan böyle güzel bahçelerimiz vardı. Şuradaki ova pek önemli değildi.

during conflict process did not thought that. Kurds migrated in this process generally constructed margins of the old city. The settlement in the margins developed with migration of Kurds from rural areas of Mardin with conflict process and concentrated with forced migration in 1990s. It is the years of an increase in housing problems and, developing "informal settlements" as a solution by newly migrated families. This is called "slum" ("varoş") by some interviewees. SB notes about these newcomers:

> They are our fellow-towns men and women who migrated from village to the city. Mostly, they migrated from villages and "ilçe"s of Mardin. There are not almost people migrated from outside, in other words hinterland of Mardin.[127]

In these districts, concentration is more based on class and ethnicity differences. With the change in the structure of city centre, with the addition of new districts to the city, inter-ethnic relations and communication have changed. This population affected mostly the power relations in the city centre, and they generally could find and work low status jobs.

Established settlers' relations with displaced newcomers are restricted due to clear spatial segregation based on class differences between them. This segregation also overlaps with being Kurd, but lower-class Kurds, but not middle-class Kurds. Therefore, it could be evaulted as how ethnicity intersect with social clss.

### 5.2.3. Settlement in the New-Town

Land problems to make new buildings and problems of setting in the old-town bring forth a need to new land to settle. These geographical problems produced a new housing demand as noted by EK:

> People moved since difficulties were encountered due to house maintenance. Difficulty in settlement appeared, this is a small place. There, it has been much better.[128]

---

127 Köyden kente göç etmiş olan hemşerilerimizdir. Çoğunlukla Mardin'in köylerinden ve ilçelerinden gelmiştir. Dışarıdan, yani Mardin hinterlandından gelen hemen hemen yoktur.

128 Taşınanlar, zorluk hasıl olmuş diye, ev bakımından. Yerleşim zorluğu başlamıştı, dar burası. Orasının olması çok daha iyi oldu.

Therefore, a new urbanisation process has developed in the west side of Mardin, and apartment buildings started to construct in 1990s. Thereby, a new flow of demographic mobility within the city has experienced. People of the old-town started to move to these new flats in the new-town. Development of the construction of new apartment buildings produced new possibilities to live. It presents choices of a new lifestyle. Mixing of different ethnic and religious affiliations continued in the new-town, but this produced a segregation based on class differences. This made class difference more visible among settlers. While mixed settlement continues in the new-town, visibility of differences decreased. Thereby, intercommunication and interrelation is more restricted between neighbours. This differentiation reveals the significance of spatial nearness and the way of settlement.

Moreover, different from older settlements including the old-town and its margins, officials from different working fields, mostly Turks, chose official public houses ("lojman"). If there is not any "lojman" choice, today they choose to live in the apartment buildings in the the new-town. This produced a new segregation between natives living in the old-town and officials. Officials' choice of apartment blocks in the new-town restricts relations with natives different from neighbourhood relations as in the past in the old-town. It causes more isolated life from natives and less communication and relation with natives. It is the mixed neighbourhood that provides learning Kurdish from Kurd renters, or Turkish from Turk official renter for Arab women through dense interaction with spatial closeness. However, neighbourhood relations between natives and officials continued in the new-town in a less density when compared with old-town.

With the increase in variety of settlement possibilities, housing status and settlement place gained more importance as a reference point for different economic positions in people's identity expression. A determining comparison is made between the old-town and new-town by settlers. Shechter & Yacobi (2005: 184-5) interprets this dichotomy:

> ... created a split city, where different urban spaces represented binary oppositions: the 'old city' stood for 'tradition' and 'local' life, the new public

buildings, commercial centres, and residential neighborhoods created an urban iconography of the imported 'modern'

The sense of who could move to the new-town refers a certain kind of people, it is not possible for all. Therefore this move is accepted as a result of financial situation, and is perceived as an increasing in status. Moving from the old-town to the new-town is associated to lifestyle differences. In this respect, it is different from former migration flows due to economic or political reasons. In today's Mardin, the old-town represents traditional and urbanite values and customs, margins represent more traditional and rural values and customs, the new-town represents modern and urbanite values in settlers' mind. There are different symbols in life-styles that correspond to status change between the old-town and new-town. One of them is about meal. While cooking "cracked wheat" symbolizes the old-town; cooking "rice" refers to the new-town in women's mind. This reveals how this change in the place is perceived as a change in the status by women.

As an example of how class is placed, frequently stated perception is that "People who are in good financial condition moves to the new-town"[129]. To understand the role of financial situation, SE, lives in the old-town, states:

> That place is nice in winter. There is no need of using heating stove, there is radiator, why would not one, having money, go there? (…) The people that are financially insufficient stay where they are, and rich people go there.
>
> M: Would you ever think of going there if you had more money?
>
> Who would not. Would you stay here if you had more money? However, the houses here are healthier than those houses there.[130]

Today, settling in the new-town is perceived as more privileged by settlers. This made class position much more apparent in people's life and minds. It has being

---

129 Durumu iyi olanlar taşınıyor.

130 Orası kışın için iyidir. Sobadır bilmem ne yakmıyor, kaloriferlidir, parası var, niye gitmesin? (…) Durumu kötü olanlar zaten yerinde kalıyor, durumu iyi olan gider.

M: Siz hiç düşünür müsünüz durumunuz daha iyi olsa?

Ee, kim istemez. Durumu iyi olduktan sonra sen burada kalırsın? Ama buradaki evler ordan daha sıhhatlidir.

shaped as the place of a growing and spatially separating middle-class. CA notes about class differences between the old-town and the new-town :

> People stayed in upper-Mardin are (…) coming from villages and buying houses from Mardinians. Now they are mojority in old Mardin.[131]

On the other hand, there is tendency to stay in the new-town in winter seasons and stay in the old-town in summer seasons, it is due to the idea of "it is warm in winters, and cool in summers". However, some of dwellers if have a house good situation and comfortable could stay constantly in the old-town. There are different reasons staying in the old-town expressed in interviews. The reasons generally expressed finding stone-made buildings healthier than concrete buildings in the new-town. A wealthy interviewee expressed his idea on continuing settling in the old-town:

> I have an old structure house, like a mansion, I would not leave this and live in that small place. These houses are worthy of sultans.[132]

As an example of how place is gendered, the most determing expression is the reason of moving to the new-town. It is frequently expressed that settlement to apartment buildings in the new-town is much more related with women's demand. Due to difficulties in management of the house including cleaning, heating, comfort, usage of parts in old houses, an Arab interviewee expressed as: "It is women who established Yenişehir."[133] In a different comment, CA emphasis the role of women in choosing new-town:

> Women prefer, why, because families were crowded, in great numbers. Kitchen was outside, toilet was outside. Cleaning them was really hard, but now you see that the house is really nice, all are big rooms and kitchen is a small room. Meaning that one feels cold when steps outside. Here there is heating, there are no houses with heating in the upper part, in old buildings. This is women's choice.[134]

---

131 Yukarıda kalanlar genellikle, (…) Mardinlilerden satın alıp köyden gelenlerdir. Artık çoğunluk oldu.

132 Eski yapı bir evim var, köşk gibi, bunu bırakıp da o daracık şeye giremem. Bu evler sultanlara yaraşır evler.

133 Yenişehir'i kuran kadınlardır.

134 Kadınlar tercih ediyor, neden, şimdi aileler çok yoğundu, sayısı çok fazla. Mutfak dışarıda, tuvalet dışarıda. Temizlenmesi çok zor, ee şimdi eve bakıyorsun çok güzel, hepsi büyük bir oda, mutfak küçük bir oda. Yani kışın dışarıya çıkıyor üşüyor. Buraları kaloriferli, yukarıda kaloriferli ev yok, eski binalarda. Kadınların tercihidir.

126

Furthermore, demographical difference in the new-town is frequently expressed interviews. SB interprets new ethnic distribution in Mardin city centre:

> Approximately 30 percent of the population of Yenişehir has come from outside. People living in Yenişehir, who have come from the village and rural area, are rich, they can cover the expenses of living in an apartment building. And due to the events of closing stores (…) rapidly in primarily Nusaybin and Kızıltepe, a serious population is being formed here. Most of them are Kurds but they do not care about Kurdish nationality. The ones who care about Kurdish nationality stay there. The ones who come here do not care about Kurdish nationality or else.[135]

As a site of communication and for intercultural relations/communications, leisure places are coffee houses, cinema, picnic and recreation sites ("mesire yeri"). However, it is more home-centred social life today due to restricted number leisure spaces. Street as a part of districts provides friendship and playing games for children. It is a leisure space for children. However, mainly it was used by boys, because girls generally used courtyards of houses as emphasised in different interviews. Generally, boys with boys and girls with girls from different religions were played together, as cited in interviews. It was religiously mixed, but it was segregated by gender. Cinema and picnic areas were also used by women. Coffee-houses ("kahvehane") is the most used leisure place. Although coffee-houses has been used as ethnically and religiously mixed, it is only for male. However, there were samples used according to occupation differences. For example, there was jewellers' club, or stated by an an old coffee-house owner states:

> There was coffe-house of construction workers' coffe-house, kehve't el-Uffun.[136]

Today, in these coffee-houses, people from worker to porter, from unemployed persons to retired persons, could sit, cht, and drink tea and play games. On the other

---

135 Yenişehirin nüfusunun aşağı yukarı yüzde 30'u köyden gelme. Bu yenişehirde yaşayan köyden kasabadan gelenler, maddi durumu olan iyi insanlar, bir apartmanda yaşamanın giderleri karşılayabilcek olanlar. Ve hala büyük bir hızlı Kızıltepe, Nusaybin başta olmak üzere bu hadiseler, dükkân kapatma (…) böylece çok ciddi bir nüfus oluşuyor burada. Kürt fakat çoğu Kürtlüğü önemseyen insanlar değil. Kürtlüğü önemseyenler kalıyor orada. Yoksa buraya gelenlerin büyük çoğunluğu Kürtlüğü falan önemsemiyor.

136 Mesela inşaatta çalışanlar kahvehanesi vardı: kehve't el-Uffun.

side, new cafés in old and new towns are opened for youngs and tourists, who are generally from more educated and middle classes.

## 5.3. MIXED SCHOOLING

School provides a new modality to relationship and communication for co-presence and intercultural relations. As a site of intercultural communication and socialisation, schooling is ethnically and religiously mixed. It is due to lack of faith or ethnicity based schooling. With the "The Union of Education Law" (Tevhid-i Tedrisat) in 1924, schooling is standardised and united, and produced an ethnically and religiously mixed education system in state schools in Mardin. The absence of juridical and institutional arrangements based on ethnic or religious differences makes school site demographically mixed through "bringing together people from varied background" (Amin, 2002: 970). Therefore, schools are only demographically multicultural, but it could not be accepted as "multicultural education" because of absence of a "multicultural curricula". As religiously and ethnically mixed schooling, education process provides new friendship, new interaction site, and new influences with Christians, Kurds, and Turks.

Demographically mixed situation in schools could be accepted as a reflection of mixed neighbourhood. It provides school friendship in addition to neighbourhood friendship with the role in the socialisation. This provides continuing everyday contact in different sites, because relations generally continued after the school in the streets through playing different games. While primary level is near to mixed neighbourhood, it changes with lycée level bringing different children from different districts. However, there is tendency to emphasise that "We used not know whether there are Christians in the class, or not"[137].

In addition to religiously and ethnically mixed schools in Mardin, it is also mixed with gender aspect. Although there is gender mix in the schools, friendship concentrated as girls with girls and boys with boys among students: "There were

---

[137] Sınıfta, Hıristiyan olup olmadıkları anlamazdık.

Christian students in the class, boys and girls mixed"[138]. To understand the level of interaction at school, there were examples told in interviews fall in love with Christians. However, due to religious differences, they used to know that a marriage is not possible.

There was also a gender difference in schooling level. As some interviewees express that among women, illiteracy was more in the old-town. Due to getting married in early ages, girls could not continue advanced levels of education. This also restricted their attending to economical life, and continuing intercultural relations in afteryears during schooling process. It is also emphasised that this situation did not change according to financial situation of the family in the past.

Educational process is also related with employment opportunities, thereby affects people' class position more when compared traditional education in the madrasah as the institution. Traditional education breed educated class, prominent people ("ileri gelenler") of the city. Furthermore, "master and apprentice" ("usta-çırak") education in the bazaar provided to get occupation for natives. In the early years of Republic, established settlers, almost Arabs, had more chance to get educational experience and qualifications. Therefore, they were mostly employed in bureaucracy in Mardin. However, schoolisation was less among children of lower class established families. Situation of children of lower class their position restrict schoolings and continuing advanced levels of education, thereby getting a professional occupation, especially employing in the bureaucracy.

Schools are ethnicly and religiously mixed according to distribution of population in districts. It is also mixed by class differences. However, there is a class based differences associated to settled districs, old-town or new-town. Schools are also mixed by gender difference.

---

138 Sınıfta Hıristiyan öğrenciler vardı, kız-erkek karışık.

## 5.4. RELIGIOUS BUILDINGS AND GRAVEYARDS

Except for religious buildings and graveyards, buildings are common in the city. The segregation in worship places and graveyards is due to that these places have religious characteristic and functions. However, places without having any religious character generally were shared to use. Therefore, religious buildings is common used with Kurds as Muslims.

As a frequently used place, "public bath" could be used religiously and ethnically mixed due to absence of a special bathroom in old houses. There was only a small part in a room for "body ablution" ("gusül abdesti") in Muslims' houses. One of my interviewees, BC, expresses this closeness with Christian on the uses of the place:

> For example, when I was a kid, we were going to Turkish bath, I do not remember well since I was little, but I remember them coming and saying that these are Christian, do not treat them badly. Come 'ıhtié come, meaning you sister… They gave us food, orange, mandarine, thanks etc. There was such politeness. You see, we were using the same Turkish bath.[139]

Looking at distribution of religious buildings on the urban setting reveals diversity between old-town and new-town. While there are church buildings belonging to different sects of Christianity, there is not a church in the new-town. Therefore, it is not possible to hear a bell ringing of Churches in the new-town. Furthermore, churches used rotatively in every Sunday rituals due to population.

## 5.5. CONCLUSION

In this part, I examined the role of way of use place on identity formation for established settlers. This process could be evaluated as transformation, fragmentation, and disperse of the place in Mardin. Existing demographical structure changed, many migration mobilities was experienced, new districts including margins, İstasyon district, and the new-town developed with migrations,.

---

139 Mesela ben küçüktüm hamama gidiyorduk, mesela çocukken, yani böyle net hatırlamıyorum, baktım geliyorlardı, diyor bu hıristiyandır, bunlara eziyet etmeyin. Gel 'ıhti' gel, yani gel bacı sen… Bize yemek veriyorlardı, portakal, mandalina, sağol filan, yani böyle edep vardı… Bak aynı hamamda yıkanıyorduk.

Local experience of coexistence with religious, ethnic or linguistic differences produces new types of challenges about habits of co-presence or living together. This coexistence necessitates a shared space. Uses of shared space provide sites for intercultural interaction, cultural exchange, economic relations, and political and power struggles. Common historical togetherness of people of different cultures produces "moments of convergence as well as differentiation" (Baumann and Gingrich, 2004). In the process of creation, formation and maintenance of these commonalities and differences, different domains of identity can gain priority. While commonalities strengthen the sense of "us", differences strengthen the border with the "other".

The role of space and spatial nearness is more determining in convergences in shaping common customs and mutually participations and congratulations. They are collectively celebrated. While speaking on common events, people emphasis more on spatial nearness and neighbourhood. Moreover, it is related with familial closeness.

The mixed or shared character of city place was examined in terms of mixed neighbourhood, and mixed schooling, and mixed other places. There is not a clear spatial segregation in settlement and bazaar. However, there could were concentrations based on religious or family belongings. Except places of worship such as mosque, church/monastery, and synagogue in the past and graveyards, other spaces almost are shared and used in common for Muslims and Christians. Therefore, it could be called as mixed hosing, mixed working place, and mixed schooling. In this context, it is worth noting that it is "urban interculturalism" (Amin, 2002). The determining marker of identity formation is related with spatial co-presence through sharing same space and place providing interaction. Uses of a shared space and spatial closeness provide everyday interaction. Changes in the population of old-town refer also a change in class and ethnicity structure and way of settlement.

Emigration to outside of Mardin, immigration from rural places to urban place of Mardin, and inner-city mobilty from the old-town to the new-town changed

131

demographical structure of the city. Threfore, changes in uses of shared place and demographical mobility affected relations among the people. Compared to the new-town, the relations between Muslims and Christians were more concentrated and frequent due to spatial closeness in the old-town. It implies a transformation in way of housing and thereby types of neighbourhood. It produced a type of housing segregation based on class. It also changes interaction and contact sites, produces new settings, new patterns of habits in social interaction, new friendship possibilities and influences in identity representation. The relations with Christians decreased due to not being neighbour in addition to general decrease due to immigration. Therefore the difference has lost or less visible in the new-town.

The new-town could be evaluated as new process of urbanisation. The new-town setting produces new patterns of interaction, cultural interchange. It refers a new urbanisation including demographical, cultural and economic change, in addition to transformation in traditional city culture and habits of living together. For example, not only way of settlement changed in the new-town with multi-storey buildings, but also some buildings in the old-town have not constructed in the new city. The most determining difference is the church. With the new-town, visibility of Christians decreased via demography and symbols due to absence of church in the new-town and gongs of the church bell.

The new-town mainly based on class similarities; however some buildings are only family members. Moreover, familial ties could affect people's selection or construction of apartment. The city produced a new kind of mixed settlement. However, it is a homogenisation in different settlement sites as ethnically and class. With the new-town, class become more visible. Thereby, place is understod as a status marker between the old-town and the new-town including geographical position of the buildings, structure and features of houses. Move from old city to the new city is accepted as increasing in the status, and associated to changing living and consuming practices. The old-city and margins districts also reshaped according to class differences. Peripheral districts, outer suburbs, generally are the place Kurds, mainy political ones, lived in, political Kurds. While the new-city is ethnically

mixed, not ethnicised, it includes class inequalities, thereby it is classed. This way of settlement based on classed segregation, but not strong segregation, as a place segregation based on class, not ethnic. It is also ethnically mixed, but not visible as in the old Mardin. As an example of how place is ethnicised, and how ethnicity is placed.

It is the process of class-isation of the space, in other words, it is the classed space. This class-based territorial-isation changes habits co-presence with similarities and differences. Therefore, borders getting stronger based on class between people. Internal city mobility is more classed and gendered.

# CHAPTER 6

# SOCIAL CLASS DIFFERENCES AMONG MARDINIAN ARABS

## 6.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter aims to analyse social class as an intersecting category of identity. It is about the role of the way of earning living on the identity formation. It is material basis of identity formation. The focus is on how identity is classed, or "classed identity" rather than "class identity."

Social class is more related with property and employment relations. It includes people's role in the economic production (employment and occupational divisions), sources of income (salary and property ownership), and distribution of sources (inequality, wealth and poverty). Status includes the way of consumption and living (culture, attitudes, and life style). Sources of income and job opportunities differ to ethnic and gender aspects due to unequal access to resources.

In discourses of "tolerance" and "multi-culturality", inequalities based on class are generally neglected. This understanding neglects material inequalities within an ethnic or religious group. Therefore, how people from different class perceive and experience this "tolerence" and cultural diversity could not be taken into consideration. As a result, this means that people from different classes experience identity formation and cultural diversity differently.

Class and status positions take place in people's identity expression, and could be directly or indirectly mentioned in interviews. In addition to agents' expression, structural material or economical factors affect identity formation dynamics, because "The pattern of employment and the distribution of incomes are both important

structures that are shape our identity, as is the way we spend our incomes (our lifestyle)." (Mackintosh and Mooney, 2004: 81). Therefore, in order to understand the role of class in identity formation, it is needed to research on how other domains of the identification, e.g., how ethnicity is classed.

In order to understand the role of material and economic conditions in identity formation, Mackintosh and Mooney (2004: 80) explains which domains of class can be used to analyse

> The pattern of employment and the distribution of incomes are both important structures that shape our identity, as is the way we spend our incomes (our lifestyle). However, there is no simple causal link between what we have and do, and who we are. This is not only because there are other sources of identity besides work and income (...), it is also because the link between these economic structures and identity is mediated by representation (...). How we feel about our job (or lack of one) and our income depends on what others have and how others see us.

One of the questions we generally asked when we meet in the first time is that "What is it that you do?" (Woodward, 2004). This question is related with people's way of earning life. Doing a job or having different sources of income provides people's continuing of their life. Income provides people's earning living, basic needs, and material life conditions. It also provides getting housing, health, educational access, transportation, and affects people's lifestyle choices.

In this chapter, changes in work life, shifts in types of occupation and employment patterns, other sources of income, inequality in distribution will be evaluated as economic factors affecting the identity formation. Ethnic, religious and gender based differences affecting people's class positions and identifications will be focused in this study. It is due to idea that social class positions are not homogeneous in terms of ethnicity and gender.

## 6.2. EMPLOYMENT PATTERNS IN MARDIN ECONOMY

In addition to cultural diversity, Mardin is a city of economical differences and inequalities. As in the other cities, it also divided by economy based divisions including class and status. In Mardin case, class positions, inequalities and

opportunities are related with of urban goods and resources. Traditional class divisions are more related with land-owning, and agricultural production in the Mesopotamia plain, governmental jobs, trade, and traditional artisanship. In local economy of Mardin, types of occupations are limited with craft/artisanship, trade/commerce, and agriculture in the plain, service sector with bureaucracy and transportation, and tourism, restricted industry. While technological development transformed traditional way of artisanship and farming, changing political and administrative situation of Mardin transformed also trade and bureaucracy. It is a process of gaining space of professionalization. It is the process of "restructuring of the labour market" (Anthias 2001: 839). The most important change affecting economy of Mardin with the foundation of Republic is the border. Atik and Noyan (2009: 65) interprets effects of this change:

> Mardin which is dependent to Bağdat on the aspect of administrative division, and dependent to Syria through economical relations before the World War I; deprived of these zones as a part of these large trade centre due to the borders drawn in 1923 and Ankara Treaty . Therefore, suddenly, Mardin is turned to a province which going economical activities only one direction.

Border as one of the important change with nation-state also caused a "hidden economy" through "illegal trade" due to restriction of trade across border. This change affected more to powerful and wealthier families making cross-border commercial activities. Thereby, their trade potentials were highly restricted. In addition to this, an informality in trade between borders developed through smuggling for "lower classes". Aydin and et al. (2001:308) summarise changes in 1950:

> These changes in the economical structure affected reasons to live in Mardin, and with 1950s, migrations because of economical reasons started. %44 percent of the general population of Mardin is living in rural areas, and socio-economical structure is mainly based on agricultural production. Civil service is the second source of income for Mardin dwellers. Sectors of transportation and communication, industry, and building come after...

In the traditional economy, families generally have own occupations, therefore the name "father's occupation" was used. However, some express that they could not

leave their job due to its being "father's job" and not having any other knowledge or experience of a different occupation. Due to lack of gaining enough money to earning life, there occured a generational break during this process.

In time, trade sector continued in a decreasing role, state bureaucracy highly developed in the process of institutionalization of new nation-state, and an industrial sector developed late and restricted with food and cement. People were mostly earned their living or wealthy through artisanship, trade or agriculture. The role of artisanship, trade and agriculture in the local economy has changed during the process. The importance of traditional occupations weakened as a way employment, and lost its main place in the economical activity. Developing industrial production of hand-made products in the outside of Mardin reduced the role of small production of artisanship.

An industrialisation process did not develop until Cement Factory in 1975, and small production continued. Industrial production mostly based on food continued with the foundation Organized Industrial Zone. In Mardin, there are sectors including construction, agricultural machine, manufacturing machine, and chemical products, textile-clothing industries based on food, stone, and soil (TÜİK, 2011: X).

Spatially, different from traditional bazaar system, spaces of economical activities extended. Banks, new shops, and official buildings for governmental activities required separate places. It requires a shared place, working order, working hour and co-workers. This way of working produced a new sense of working different from own-job. Professionalization as a paid work gained more significant role in identity formation and position in Mardin. Main paid propfesional sectors in Mardin are official bureaucracy, industry and in recent years, tourism. As a result, these structural changes led to significant changes for settlers of Mardin, and bring forth immigrations of people of these occupations.

## 6.3. LOWER CLASS CONCENTRATIONS AMONG MARDINIAN ARABS

Different terms to refer lower classes are "subordinate classes", "subclasses", "manual classes". In addition these, "poor" (yoksullar) or "laborer" ("emekçiler") is

used in daily life. In "lower class", a separation between employed working class and unemployed underclass is also required. Occupations of lower class people could be manual and non-manual works, and casual employment rather than constant.

"Lower classes" connote propertyless-ness, low wages or very low paid work, and as a result insufficient income to cover basic needs. It is more related with troubles to cover basic needs. In generally, lower classes or poverty is about "people's experience of the daily struggle to feed and clothe a family on very little money, to keep them warm, dry, clean and safe, and to do this without getting into debt or getting into trouble." (Mackintosh & Mooney, 2004: 82). Accordingly, their focus is more on necessities of life than luxuries due to being poor or having low income is more determining for their life.

A poor person, man or woman, experiences and perceives cultural diversity differently, because, "Children grow, clothes wear out, appliances need replacing, school activities cost money, isolation gets worse because of lack money to socialize, and health and mental energy are undermined." (Mackintosh & Mooney, 2004: 82). It means limited sociability and interrelation through using difference in spaces including workplace, neighbourhood, school and leisure spaces. This situation produces different type of living culture, because, "Many accounts of the experience of poverty include the pain of social isolation: of not being able to afford to socialize with your peers. (...) Children can suffer particularly from limited access to a shared culture." (Mackintosh & Mooney, 2004: 84) Due to economic insufficiencies, people could not even continue their formal education. If it is remembered that schools in Mardin are an important site of intercultural communication, lower class people experience this lesser level in the school site due to low level of schooling.

Looking at how structural changes affected lower class people, the border is an important factor affecting their economic life . While Syria border restricted trade for big families, poor people had to make smuggling, as EK notes:

During school years, the commerce was almost set to zero. Nonetheless, some of our people would bring contrabands risking their lives and passing through these mines, and sell them, in order to live on.[140]

There are different causal works including labouring in farms and vineyards (as "ırgat"), labouring in consturction ("amele"), and porterage for underprivileged groups. "Farm labouring" in agricultural lands or farms of wealthier families was seasonal. One of the prevalent causal and oldest jobs is porterage in the urban site, because of physical characteristics of old Mardin, porterage seems to be constant in the future. However, in a time entering of much more donkey for porterage to carry goods, role and importance of porters decreased. As frequently expressed for the old-town "In past, there were not so many donkeys, porters were much more"[141]. About the situation of porters in past, SE, whose father was a porter, tells that this job was honorable and respected due to its difficulty and requiring body power, and during the process this status lost. SE narrates his family's life routine during his childhood:

> My late father was a porter. He worked during summer and winter, but there were not enough jobs in winter. He usually worked in summer and took six-seven cans of oil for his efforts. He prepared them for winter; since it was hard to find a job in winter.
>
> M: For what?
>
> For example, there was no work in winter; but foodstuff at home. He bought cracked wheat etc. in excess and bulk in summer in order to get ready for winter.[142]

Another prevalent causal job is "shop assistantship" in restaurants, coffee houses and bakeries. In these jobs, there is a concentration among settlers of "Deriyye district" ("Arap mahallesi" in local use) in addition to concentration of butcher and porter. This reveals a class-based concentration on some occupations in this district.

---

140 Şimdi okul yıllarında, ticaret sıfırlanmıştı aşağı yukarı. Fakat bazı insanlarımız geçimini temin etmek için kendini tehlikeye atıp bu mayınların arasından geçip kaçak mal getiriyor, satıyorlardı.

141 Önceden bu kadar eşek yoktu, hamallar çok daha fazlaydı

142 Bizim rahmetli babam hammaldı. Yazın çalıştığı zaman, yazın-kışın çalışırdı, kışın fazla iş yoktu. Yazın çalışıyordu, altı-yedi teneke yağ alıyordu. Kış için hazırlıyordu. Kışın iş olmadığı zaman.

M: Ne için?

Kışın misal iş olmadı, erzak var içerde. Bu işte bulgurdur, onları toptan yazın işte fazla alıyordu, kışın için.

Being lower classes brings forth working in different workshops including shop assistantship or apprenticeship during summers. Summer become a season for children to help their family in lower classes. For domestic services, wealthy families employed nanny ("dadı"), domestic servant ("yardımcı kadın") or handmaiden ("besleme kız") in their big houses. These jobs were only for women of lower clases..

In the past, as cited different interviews, villagers owning animal products including milk, yoghurt, cheese, and agricultural crops including vegetable and fruits used to come to the city centre to sell them to whole-sellers, departing in early hours from their villages by donkeys. This is frequently stated relations between villagers and established inhabitants. In the past, this relation was an important part of the economical life especially for people of lower classes. This provided also a ground to contact and to communicate with them. BC tells a story of own:

> The point is, in the past, at 4 in the morning, the porters went to work, shopkeepers went, bakeries were opened, donkeys came and woods and ropes on them were unloaded, then one went to a bazaar; now, they follow three ways, there is a great bazaar in there… There is also one in Diyarbakırkapı, one around Latifiye Mosque, there are many. All these men dismounted from their donkeys and mules, left the animals there in the bazaar, some bought sugar, some rice etc., and returned to their village. There is no more such a tradition today. Now, at nine or ten o'clock in the morning, they fill their car, two or three persons bring their goods and sell; then everyone leaves, unlike the past. Back then all market was full of people, porters and grocers at 4-4.30 a.m. … I mean, the 60-70% of shopkeepers opened their shops.[143]

As cited in interviews, some dwellers settled in geographically lower parts of the old city used to bread animals and grow some vegetables in their little gardens to contribute their life needs. This situation ended during the process and all needs started to be bought only from bazaar. BC interprets this change:

---

143 Eskiden mesele sabah saat şöyle 4, hammallar işte gidiyor, esnaflar gidiyoruz, fırınlar açılıyor, eski, çok aferdersin eşekler geliyor, kimi odun üzerine, kim ip üzerine, boşaltıyorlar, ondan sonra o hana gidiyor, şimdi burda üç yola gidiyorlar, orda çok büyük bir han var… Bir de şeyde var, Diyarbakırkapı'da var, o Latifiye Camisinin orda hanlar var, var var. Dükkânlarda hepsi iniyor, çarşının içinde, eşekler oraya koyuyorlardı, katırlar, kimi şeker alıyor, kimi pirinç alıyor, kim bilmem ne alıyorlar, gene köye dönüyorlardı, şimdi kalmadı artık. Şimdi saat onda, dokuzda, sekizde, arabasını dolduruyor, iki kişi üç kişi filan getiriyor satıyor, ondan sonra çekip gidiyor, eskiden öyle değildi. Eskiden 4'te 4 buçukta bütün çarşı böyle kaynıyordu, hammal, bakkal… Yani esnaflar yüzde 60'ı 70'i açıyorlar.

In the past, people were poor but rich. One made his own milk and meat. (…) As for me, I kept 2 sheep; we butchered them in fall, during September-October, and cut it into pieces. We hung them on the roof, separating each section for cracked wheat, beans, hodgepodge etc. Also in those days, the meat was corned and put into basket. We had chickens and Turkeys that gave us eggs.[144]

Settlement of people having a small income from rural areas starting with 1950s is refers the entry of Kurds into the local economy of Mardin. In time, these newcomers entered into service and trade sector. However, in the begining, they easily could accept lower salaried and difficult jobs as noted by CA:

On the other hand, there is terrorism, economic difficulties etc., upon which, the habitant understands there is no life to live in village, and he asks himself why to continue living there. Then he leaves the village for Mardin. He thinks of working as porter, carrying some stuff with a handcart; or even raking out snow from the roofs, in order to earn some living.[145]

Today's Mardin is much more "migrants' Mardin", because population of village-origin settlers, called as "non-Mardinian" by established natives, is in an important extent. As a result, this lead a decrease in agricultural activities due to voluntary or forced migrations from villages. CA interprets these changes:

There is nothing left in the villages; you cannot do agriculture, stockbreeding is over. I do not know whether it is a government policy; but people began to emigrate once stockbreeding was over. For example, there were admirable melon and watermelon fields in Mardin. There are no more today. I mean, stockbreeding activities are killed; whereas the income of these people depends on it, as well as on agriculture. So they were left shattered.[146]

---

144 İnsanlar eskiden fakirdi ama zengindi. Adam bak, sütü kendi yapıyor, etini kendi yapıyor. (…) Ben de mesela besliyorum 2 tane koyun, tam sonbahar, eylül-ekim kesiyorduk, ondan sonra hep parça parça yapıyoruz. Bu bulgur için, bu fasülye için, bu türlü için asıyor dama. Bir de eskide şeye, küfeye koyuyorlardı, tuzluyorlar koyuyorlar. Tabi tavuk var, hindi var bize yumurta veriyor.

145 Terör, ekonomi hepsi derken, hepsi derken bir arada, adam bir bakıyor ki, köyde hayat yok, yani ben niye burada yaşıyorum Mardin'e gideyim. Mardin'de hamallık yapayım, el arabasıyla bir şeyler yapayım, eskiden çok kar yağardı, karı atasam damlardan gene ben geçinirim ordan.

146 Köyde bir şey kalmadı, artık arazini ekemiyor, hayvancılığı bitirdiler. Devlet politikası mıdır, nedir, hayvancılık bitince insanlar göç etmeye başladı. Mesela Mardin'de çok güzel kavun karpuz tarlaları vardı. Yok, bitti onlar. Yani o hayvancılık öyle bir öldürüldü ki burada, geliri hayvancılıktır, tarımdır, mahvettiler bıraktılar.

New job areas extended with development of the "new city" settlements, including construction, work of doorkeeper, cashier or shop assistants in new shops. With the growing of the new city, the construction sector has been significantly developed. Although these sectors are ethnically mixed by workers, most of them are Kurds.

Today, people in lower classes use different words to describe their financial situations such as "economical impossibility" ("imkânsızlık"), "bad circumstances" ("durumsuzluk"), "poverty" ("fakirlik"), "we barely earn our life ("zar zor geçiniyoruz."), "restricted job opportunities" ("kısıtlı iş imkanları"), "Mardinian businessmen don't invest in their homeland.". One of the important topics that they generally complain is that source of income and job opportunities are restricted and unemployment is high in Mardin. There is tendency to emphasis how earning life is getting difficult in time. Some of critical sentences stated by people of lower class, Arab or Kurd:

> While less was enough to continue living in the past, we need much more today.[147]
>
> In the past, when you bought cracked wheat, meat, soujouk, orcik, and wood, everything is ok.[148]
>
> Living conditions got difficult & Earning life getting difficult.[149]

These quotations reveal how easy to earning life through less needs in the past. BC states today's conditions comparing with the past:

> Once upon a time in Mardin, during Ramadan, for example, I had my own shop and was coming from there. There was a single avenue. I entered in neighbourhood. And back then, nice scents came from each house. Thinking all these, I can't keep crying today; the old people like me do the same.[150]

To understand how lower class people perceive class inequalities in local langauge, SN notes:

---

147 Geçmişte daha az şey yetebiliyorken, bugün artık daha fazla şeye ihtiyaç duyuluyor.

148 Önceden bulgur, et, sucuk, cevizli sucuk, odun aldı mı, tamamdı.

149 Hayat şartları zorlaştı.

150 Eskiden Mardin'de, ramazanda, iş benim, mesela dükkândan geliyordum. Tek cadde vardı. Mahallenin içine giriyordum. İnan ki ramazanda, her evden bir koku geliyordu, o kadar hoş. Ben bazen ağlıyorum, benim yaşlarımda ağlıyorlar.

Poor people, labourers, porters, and tradesmen/craftsmen of Mardin say wealthy people as "çelebi" because of their annoyance to them.[151]

In today's Mardin, poverty is one of noteworthy situation which could be observed in streets of the old-city. People of lower classes are exposed to different troubles to earn their living including housing problems and qualities. Related to this demographic growing, an "informal settlement" also developed. With developing of new Mardin, class separation gained a spatial character. Established or newcomer settlers living in the old-town have more economic problems when compared with settlers of the new-town. To conclude, this difference illsustrates how settlement is shaped according to class position, and how place is classed in Mardin city centre.

## 6.3. MIDDLE CLASS CONCENTRATIONS AMONG MARDINIAN ARABS

To describe "middle class", "intermediate", "productive" or "working", and "service" terms is also used. "This fragmentation at the intermediate levels has been along the lines of organisational assets, educational assets and property assets." (Scott 2006: 58).

In Mardin, looking at sectoral and occupational distribution providing people putting in "middle", it could be mainly listed as: Artisanship (artisans and craftsmen), smalll-scale trade ("esnaf" or "tüccar"), workers in factories, officials in administrative and juridical bureaucracy, and drivers in transportation.

Artisanship and trade are accepted as urbanite occupations in traditional economy. Traditional economy was based on the bazaar system based on spatially speficied different professions. Urbanites of Mardin mostly did these occupations in classic economical structure. Artisans and traders are self-employed and have own small organisations. While artisans made small-scale production in their own workshops, traders sell goods in their own shops. Mardin as non-industrial city, the economy in the old city centre was based on self-employment in small workshops. It is a type of skilled occupation and based on people's crafts. The role of traditional artisanship decreased in the economical life with the increasing on industrial production. In this

---

151 Mardin fakirleri, emekçileri, hammalları, esnafı zenginlere kızdığı için, eşşeğe de çelebi derlerdi.

process in Turkey, although sources of economy altered considerably over the period, Mardin protected its traditional way of production for long time. A process of industrialisation did not developed until near times, and Mardin economy grew in a different way. Mardin stayed in more "peripheral" after changing trade roads and foundation of nation-state. Therefore Mardin as a non-industrial city lost the role and importance on the trade potentials in the region. In different interviews, it is generally stated sadly: hand-job occupations lost its importance and function, customers migrated and the classical bazaar system decayed. With developing the new city at the end of 1980s and starting migration to new city became the last stage in this process.

The system of "the master and the apprentice" ("usta-çırak") is the traditional way of job-training. Apprenticeship as a way and culture of profession training was prevalent in the previous generation in Mardin. With declining the role of traditional occupations in the economy, this training system lost its importance. In this system, a person from new generation starting with early ages used to enter to economical life, then learn skills of a job by making practices, and become a professional in a job field at the end. In this system, crafts are generally carried to new generations of the same family. Therefore, there was a familial concentration in traditional occupations. With declining in the traditional bazaar system, and gaining importance of modern schooling system, there did not stayed this way of profession learning. People started to prefer going modern schools to learn profession. Modern schooling system provides new way of working and professionalisation. This produced also a class mobility between generations, putting outside familial old.

In traditional bazaar structure, there was a stronger sense of solidarity sense among artisans and traders. They had own values, rules and norms as working etnics. For example, "master of bazaar" ("çarşı büyüğü" or "çarşı ağası") as refereeing used to solve disagreements and used to prevent conflicts. This also provided members a sense of belonging to their occupations in the bazaar. Economical bases of identity generally shaped in the traditional bazaar for people of middle class in Mardin. Dissociation of the bazaar system, and the role in the local economy lead to a

decrease in the status of artisans and traders. The traditional bazaar system produced also a culture and a way of shopping relations, however it is almost disappeared today.

Service sector is much more restricted with official occupations in public sector including Governership and Municipality. It includes administrative and juridical bureaucracy for natives. It is the main part of the professionalization in the employment in Mardin. Mostly urbanite Arab natives having educational qualifications, as educated middle-class, were employed in the official bureaus ("devlet dairesi") among natives of Mardin.

One of the leading sectors in Mardin is the transportation including "cargo" and "passanger" inter-cities and inner-city transportation. Transportation of passenger and goods as new occupational areas started with 1940s among members of some of the big families. Not only drivers and workers were ethnically mixed, but also owners were mixed by partnership.

Employment in service sector including education, university and tourism has been developing in recent years. Although, teachers and nurses are generally from outside of Mardin, many native people, Arab and Kurd, graduated as teacher in the Mardin Teacher Institute in 1970s. Tourism is expected to be to new sources of income for Mardinians in the post-conflict process. As a part of expectation to tourism, many hotels and cafes came into service and new souvenir shops opened in recent years. In the old city, some shops started to change for tourism. One of the symbolic example to reveal how this transformation effected in economic life is that while a shop in the 1st Street in the old-town works as fishmonger in winter months, it turns to a gift shop in summer months.

## 6.4. UPPER CLASS CONCENTRATIONS AMONG MARDINIAN ARABS

There are different terms refering upper classes including "higher classes", "privileged class" or "advantaged classes". Scott (2006: 59) gives details about higher classes:

> The advantaged classes are those who are involved in property and employment relations that give them ownership and control over large amounts of capital. Whether in the form of land, buildings, machinery or financial securities, property is the key to their power.

In Mardin, their sources of income were generally familial heritage and wealth is protected through generations. They are also accepted as "prominent families" in daily language due to their role on economic and political life. Big Arab notable families were effective in administrative and political life, cultural life, and also managed money and trade in late Ottoman area. However, this power of big families was tried to be restricted with an exile enactment in the early years of Mardin. This enactment was implemented for one or two years, and then some of them returned to Mardin (Aydın et al. 2001: 367).

Their main sources of income were international trade and farming in big lands of Mesopotamia Plain, as cited in interviews. Heads of big families and tribes are known that they controled key points in the economy, and kept control of big commercial potentials. They are propertied land estate in Mesopotamia plain, estates in urban Mardin and vineyard houses in mountainous areas. They were mostly big-land owners. Some of them also were also "agha of land" ("toprak ağası") or "agha of village" ("köy ağası").

Some of these noble or gentle families were entitled "zade" as an apparatus to their family name. They were accepted as nobles and elits ("eşraf"). The "upper class" in Mardin covered "çelebi" (gentlemen, big tradesmen, aristocrat, large landowners), "efendi" (educated class, bureaucrat), "ağa" (agha, big land owning, agha of tribe or land) in the local use of language. "Çelebi" and "efendi" were valid for urban site, but "agha" is for rural. Capital was concentrated in "çelebi"s or members of big Arab families in the urban setting, and Kurd aghas in the rural setting. With structural change in the economy, this division and these titles started lost its importance. According to one of my informants, HK from a "efendi" family, explains these uses:

> Here in Mardin, there is such a range of denominations that the way you address a family determines its level of living. "Çelebi", "effendi", and "ağa" all point out different levels in society. This is crucial… "Çelebi" signifies well-dressed persons with good manners. We may rather call them aristocrats.

"Efendis" are persons who are well informed and educated, who have participated in governmental positions and bureaucracy. As for the "Ağa", they are leaders of ashirets (tribes), with a certain power; that is how we distinguish them… You can even tell the differences looking at their dressing… With the foundation of Republic, however, the situation began to change since 1920s and 30s.[152]

These types of divisions were based on familial organization. This social division continued in following generations, if there any structural changes were occurred. Family background is one of the significant determinants affecting people's absence or accumulation of the capital. This accumulation of capital was obtained through large land or village owning in the upper Mesopotamia plain, and big trade. EK, as one the member of a big family, notes this situation:

Large families have dominated the key points. In this way, they have acquired lands. Once you have the land, you do not need to struggle. Now, they skim these lands. They still do the same.[153]

While mostly grain-agriculture ("hububat/tahıl") was made in the plain, it was viticulture ("bağcılık") in mountainous areas. Big families of Mardin were also owners of these big lands in the plain. N states:

In the past, we had lands in this Kızıltepe plain. Also we still have... I remember, in the past most of the people of Mardin had lands in there.[154]

Not only exile enactment, but also formation a frontier with Syria with the foundation of the nation-state decreased amount of income for big families. In addition to changing trade roots, this new border position changed with the economic relations with south of the Turkey and restricted to trade potentials and sources of

---

152 Burda Mardin'de öyle bir şey var ki, ailelere hitap ettiği şekil, ailenin hayat seviyesini belirliyor. Çelebi başkadır, efendi başkadır, ağa başkadır. Bu çok önemli… Çelebi, daima güzel giyinip güzel şey etmesini bilen kişiler, kalkıp oturmasını bilen kişiler. Yani aristokrat diyebiliriz bunlara. Efendi dediğin zaman, efendiler, tahsilli ve kültürlü, hükümette görev almış, bürokraside görev almış kişiler. Ağalar ise muayyen bir güce dayanaraktan, aşiret sahiplerine ağa denir, bunlara bu şekilde ayırıyoruz… Hatta ve hatta giyimleri bile ayrılır… Artık Cumhuriyetin kurulmasıyla 920, 30'lardan sonra değişmeye başladı.

153 Büyük aileler kilit noktaları tutmuşlar. Bu sayede arazi edinmişler. Şimdi arazi edinince, o zaman uğraşı gerekmez. Şimdiye kadar o arazilerin nimetini yiyorlar. Hâlâ yiyorlar.

154 Bizim arazilerimiz vardı, şu Kızıltepe ovasında. Zaten duruyor zaten... Eskiden ben hatırlıyorum, çok kişi Mardinlilerin arazisi vardı.

income. Instead, cross-border smuggling as a way of making trade, or "illegal trade" in official discourse grew, especially for lower classses. EK interprets:

> In the past, this city was a major commercial centre; these buildings date from those days. It was a center of trade, there were no frontiers. Since the frontiers are here and the train arrives in Diyarbakir, the commerce has almost stopped here. However, if the plain was appreciated, no such standstill period would be experienced; the lowlands were not put to good use as is due.[155]

With the participation of the inheritance from generation to generation, economical contribution to their life decreased. N, as one of the member a big family, interprets this change:

> In the past, my grandfather, father's of my mother, had 400 acre land, and he sold it before died. For instance, my father's father had 450 acre land too. After he died, this 450 acre land inherit to two persons, my father and uncle. My father died, we are seven persons, 200 acre land inherit to us. With every inheritance, land is becoming smaller.[156]

Due to getting smaller through inheritance to new generations, the economic benefits of the land decreased according to the family numbers. It is a reason of decrease in their financial situation, existing life style, and class position. In addition to this factor, mechanisation in the agricultural production with entering tractor to the agriculture became a reason to migrate big cities due to decreasing income. As a result, two way of developments occurred, farmers and traders in good circumstances ("hali vakti yerinde") settled in urban Mardin migrated to big cities to get more income; seasonal workers settled in urban Mardin looked for new job opportunities in Mardin or migrated to big cities; and villagers having low income possibilites settled in the plain migrated to urban Mardin and other cities;

Financial conditions of people living in city centre were normally affected by general conditions of Turkey. The most determining event is that the famine years during

---

155 Eskiden burası büyük bir ticaret merkeziydi, bu binalar o zaman yapılmış. Ticaret merkeziydi, hudut yoktu. Hudut geldiğinden beri ve tren Diyarbakır'a geldiğinden beri ticaret adeta durakladı burda. Fakat şeyin, ovanın kıymeti bilinseydi duraklama olmazdı, ova gereği gibi değerlendirilmedi.

156 Eskiden benim dedemin, annemin babasının 400 dönümü vardı, o ölmeden bir ay evvel sattı. Mesela babamın babası da 450 dönümü vardı, o öldükten sonra o 450 dönüm iki kişiye ayrıldı, o babamla amcam. Babam işte öldü, biz yedi kişiyiz, o bize geldi 200. Her şeyde miras küçülüyor.

2nd World War. EK narrates these years and express economic inequalities between settlers of urban Mardin:

> Mardin was in a decline period in the years we were born. My parents had 10 children; I was the seventh in the family. A decline had begun in Mardin. I saw the years 1941-42 that were years of dearth. In Mardin, people died because the lack of bread. The poorest could not find bread to eat, whereas the rich lived from hand to mouth. The habitants suffered this period of famine. I was 5 or 6 back then.
>
> MK: Who were the poor and who were the rich?
>
> You could scarcely see the rich, since their number was very limited. On the other hand, the poor were in majority. Non-Muslims were not that poor, they had escaped from this period of dearth; it was the Muslims who were oppressed the most.
>
> MK: Which Muslims?
>
> The poor ones.[157]

Due to unequal distribution of income in the city centre, many poor people died. This is the case how the same life conditions affect people according to class differences in an ethnic group. This reveals how ethnicity is classed, because while there were poor Arab families dying from famine, on the other hand, wealth Arab families belonging to big families succeeded to survive through their lands in the plain. EK continued:

> The poor ones... The big families were also in a better condition, they were able to take care of themselves. These families had acquired large lands on the plain here. As for the ones who did not possess any land, they perished. There were many poor people in our neighbourhood; a lot of people died of famine. Our family was in a relatively better shape; we brought wheat from

---

157 Doğduğumuz yılların Mardin'i gerileme devri yaşıyordu. Ailece 10 kişiydik yani, 10 çocuk. Bir ailenin yedinci çocuğuyum ben. Gerileme devri başlamıştı Mardin'de, kıtlık yılları olarak 1941-42 yıllarını yaşadım. Mardin'de bir ekmek uğruna ölen kişiler vardı. Yani ekmeği bulamayıp ölenler vardı. Çok yoksul olanlar ekmek bumlamıyorlardı, zenginler de kıt kanaat geçiniyordu. Millet bir kıtlık yıllarını geçerdi Mardin'de. Ben o zaman yaşadım kıtlık yıllarını, 5-6 yaşındaydım.

MK: Yoksul olanlar kimlerdi, zengin olanlar kimlerdi?

Zengin olanlar mahin, mahdut kişilerdi. Yoksul olanlar ekseriyetteydi… Gayrimüslümler fakir değildi, gayrimüslümler kurtulmuştu o kıtlık durumundan, ezilenler Müslümanlardı.

MK: Hangi Müslümanlar?

Fakir Müslümanlar.

the village and delivered to people, but we were not able to save them completely.[158]

One of the reasons decreasing amount of wealth for notable families was the Property Tax in 1942. It was collected not only from Non-muslims, but also from Muslims as expressed by EK:

They collected property tax from everyone. They invented a property tax, which caused my father a depression. We had a capital of 22,000 liras, but we had to give it away. We started from scratch here.[159]

Similar lines are also noted by SN:

My grandfather was a wealthy man; we knew the property tax was granted for non-Muslims; however we found that it was collected also from Muslims.[160]

Industrial production is limited with food; it's related with agricultural production in the Mesopotamia Plain. Industrial production entered to Mardin in 1975 with cement factory; however it was founded and managed by OYAK, as an official organisation. Then, more institutionalised way of industrial production started with foundation of Mardin Industrial Zone in 1992. According to Atauz and other (1994: 30; by Aydın et al., 2001: 413), the transformation occurred as:

They continue feudalism on land, but also in industry, through their ever growing commercial relations in the city. (…) These workers, who are stuck in between agricultural and industrial feudalism, are workers in capitalist terms. Most of them however, do not carry insurance, since they are not organized; many of them are too young, and their wages are much lower than in the organized sectors. (Aydın et al.: 2001)

In addition to owning of agricultural lands and villages in the Kızıltepe/Mesopotamia plain, big families also had real-estates in the city centre and vacation areas of

---

158 Büyük ailelerin de durumları iyiydi, kurtarıyordu kendini. Çünkü buradaki ovada büyük araziler edinmişti büyük aileler. Arazisi olmayanlar kıtlıktan helak oldu. Mahallede çok fakir vardı, ölenler çoktu, açlıktan ölenler çoktu bizim mahallemizde. Ailemizin durumu iyiydi, köyden buğday getirip dağıttık, ama kurtaramıyorduk tam olarak.

159 Varlık vergisini herkesten aldılar. Varlık vergisi çıkardılar. Varlık vergisinden babam büyük bir çöküntü yaşadı. 22 bin liralık sermayemiz vardı, tümüyle alındı. Biz buradan yeniden başladık.

160 Zengin bir kişiydi dedem, zaten varlık vergisi, gayrimüslimler için konulduğunu biliyorduk, meğer Müslüman kesimden de alınmış.

Mardin. They generally lived in big houses, a type of mansion houses in the city centre.

In order to understand the role of structural change in economic activites restricted life conditions of upper classes. The sentence "Due to that they could not find any job which is appropriate to their lifestyle..."[161] noted by HK illustrates the main reason of migration of upper classes.

## 6.5. ETHNIC AND RELIGIOUS RELATIONS IN THE BAZAAR

### 6.5.1. Partnership with Others

In this part, ethnic or religious distributions in occupations, and partnership between people belonging to different affinities are evaluated. With respect to occupations, ethnic or religious differentiations could be possible. However there is not a strict segregation, there was only a religious based concentrations on different occupations in the old bazaar system. The critical thing is that the production of goods and service is generally based on familial organisations. Therefore, it could be evaluated as also familial concentration. As cited in different interviews, while artisans were generally Christians, mainly Armenians; Arabs concentrated in the bureaucracy starting with early years of the Republic in the city centre. Christians concentrated on dentist, tailor, architecture, craftsman of stone carving and craft, filigree gold and silver, jewellery, watchmaking, silk weaving ("ipekçilik"). In an interview, it is said that "Non-muslims generally were artisanship, Muslims were traders." In another non-recorded interview, changes in the religious distribution in artisanship are explained as:

> In the beginning of the Republic, artisans were mostly Christians; only in copper-working is Muslim's job. In time, this changed. Today, they are almost Muslims.[162]

In a different interview, CA classifies Christians' occupations:

---

161 Yaşam biçimine uygun gelir getirecek iş bulamadığı için...

162 Önceleri, Cumhuriyet'in başında, zanaatkârlar hemen hemen Hıristiyanlardı. Sadece bakırcılar Muslümandı. Zamanla bu değişti. Bugün hemen hemen hep Müslümanlar.

These people are jewelers in Mardin, they are honest tradesmen. Jewelry, shoemaking, and filigree works are all present. I mean especially in these occupations, above all, they made wonderful shoes. (…) They were dentists; they were bonesetters.[163]

However, distribution of population in the bazaar changed as a result of population movements. In time, concentrations on various occupations have changed, more Arab Muslim new families, and newcomer Kurds and Arabs attended to trade and artisanship. Therefore, interrelations between people belonging to different religions in the bazaar has changed. Decreasing population the Christians due to out migration of Christians means also the "migration of experience and information". In interviews and informal speeches, effects of leaving of Christians on local economy are generally expressed and perceived this change negatively with its results to economic life. On the other hand, it not a replacement between Christians and Muslims, it also covers a replacement between deported Armenians and Syriacs in the begining of the century. It is frequently expreesed idea that Armenians teached occupations/crafts to Syriacs in the old bazaar system, before deported, as cited different interviews:

Assyrians; as they left the places and professions, Armenians replaced them. Armenians took these jobs, learnt the life from Assyrians, for example fine arts such jewellery, weaving, painting, leather trade, as well as trade.[164]

In the bazaar, there was "Christian master and Muslim apprentice" relations in different occupations. For example, today, many Muslim tailors expressed that their master was a Christian in happily sense. However, partnership, workshop neighbourhood, and shopping relations gradually are not possible due to decreasing population of Christians. On the other hand, these relations can be possible with Kurds due to their inccreasing population. In the case economical relations between Arabs and Kurds, an artisan expresses problemless-ness with their relations with Kurds as:

---

163 Mardin'de gerçekten bunlar kuyumcu, esnaflıkları, esnaflıkları çok sağlam. Kuyumcu, ayakkabıcı, bilmem şu anda, takı ne diyorlar, telkari. Yani özelikle bu mesleklerde, değişik mesleklerde de var ama, bunlar çok güzel ayakkabı yaparlardı. (…) Dişçiydiler, kırık çıkıkçıydılar.

164 Süryaniler; yer boşalttıkça, meslek boşalttıkça, bunu diyorum Ermeniler Süryanileri doldurdu. O işleri aldılar, hayatı onlardan öğrendiler, kuyumculuğu, efendim ticareti, dokumayı, boyayı, efendim municiliği, akla ne gelirse, güzel sanatlar.

There was not any problem here in the past. They used to work as 'maraba' for our jobs.[165]

However, with migrations of to city centre, more Kurds started to entering economic life through opening new shops, and they became a competitor to establieshed traders and artisans. The process and effects of transformation in the economic life is interpreted by EK:

It had a major influence, since the Non-Muslims took away great deal of wealth as leaving. How cannot this be influential? Then they took away artisanship and knowledge. In their heyday, we were in a better position than Gaziantep in terms of craft. Today, however, Gaziantep is in a more advanced position than us. Now there are large factories in Gaziantep. Gaziantep progressed, whereas we dropped behind due to departure of capital. Entire accumulation of capital left. Migrations from villages are weak in terms of both money and knowledge. It will take maybe 100 years for that these newcomers attain the level of the departed.[166]

Today the labour market is ethnically mixed with increasing participation of Kurds to the labour market in Mardin, and religiously much more homogeneous due to immigration of Christians. It is ethnically is more mixed between Arabs and Kurds, but religiously almost Muslims. When compared with the old-town, the bazaar in the new city is ethnically more mixed. Moreover, ethnically, in the new-town, the number of Kurds owning their self-job is higher due to construction of new bazaar structure. Many of Kurds are migrated from villages in the near past. In addition to this new mixing, the number and being known of Christians in the bazaar is less. It is due to general population in the city. In the new-town, women also participated in economical activities as salaried professionals with professionalisation of the labour market. Thereby, it is more mixed by gender differences.

---

165 Burada bir sorun yoktu. Eskiden bizde maraba olarak çalışılırdı.

166 Etkisi çok oldu, gayrimüslimler, çok muazzam servetler götürdüler. Etkisi olmaz olur mu? Ondan sonra zanaat götürdüler, bilgi götürdüler. Şimdi sanat olarak biz burada Antep'ten ileriydik, onların zamanında. Şimdi Antep bizden ileridir. Antep'te şimdi büyük fabrikalar var, bizde şimdi. Antep ilerledi, biz geriledik. Çünkü sermaye gitti. Sermaye birikimi gitti. Köyden olan gelen göçler, onlar hem para bakımından, hem bilgi bakımından zayıftır. Bunlar zamanla ancak, şimdi buradan göçenler ayarına getirmek için belki 100 sene lazım.

Partnership between Muslim and Christians families were also possible as cited in different interviews. Therefore, it could not be said that there is segregation based on ethnic or religious criteria to make partnership. EK notes:

> They made a lot of work together, such as agriculture. Then, commerce, and conveyance of goods, all together.
>
> M: Do such activities still exist?
>
> Yes, but less; due to decrease of population.[167]

On similar lines, CA states:

> My father made partnepship with non-Muslims for 20 years. We made work together. We made agriculture with C.A., he was one of the biggest trader in Mardin. (...) My father was shopkeeper, he was making yarn. WE made a work together with a family called Beyt-A..., maybe 20 years.[168]

In addition to partnership according to religious belonging, ethically Arab-Kurd partnership was also founded. N, as a driver, and a partner with Kurds in a bus company, reports:

> In bus business, I was partner with Kurds for 9 years. My life passed together with Kurds. I left studying when I passed to 2nd class in secondary school. I opened my eyes to world in Cizre, Şırnak, among the Kurds. I had a partner in Cizre; we bought a bus for business. And we two were not alone; he associated also with my three cousins. Everybody was content; they were not involved in any political issues. I mean, there are very enlightened Kurds, whom people get on really well in Mardin.[169]

---

167 Birlikte çok iş yapıyorlardı, ziraat yapıyorlardı. Ondan sonra, ticaret, bir yerden bir yere mal nakli falan birlikte.

M: Bugün var mı?

Var, az ama, nüfus azalmasından dolayı.

168 Benim babam yirmi yıl gayrimüslimlerle ortaklık yaptı. Birlikte iş yaptık. Ziraat işi yaptık, C.A. ile en büyük tüccar, Mardin'in en büyük tüccarlarından biri (…) Dükkancıydı, öyle iplik yapıyordu babam, iplikçiydi, Beyt-A.. denilen bir aileyle yirmi sene belki ortaklık yaptı.

169 Ben 9 sene Kürtlerle ortak oldum otobüste. Benim hayatımda kürtlerle geçmiş, yani ben Ortaokul 1'den ayrılmış, 2'ye geçtim bıraktım zaten, ben gözümü zire'de şırnak'ta açmışım, Kürtler arasında açmışım. Yani benim bir ortağım vardı Cizre'dede ben onla otobüsçülükte ortak kaldık, benle yalnız değildi, üç tane amcaoğlumla da ortaklık yaptı o adam, herkes memnundu, kesinlikle siyasi hiçbir işe karışmadı adamlar. Yani öyle münevver Kürtler var, yani çok güzel anlaşıyorlar Mardin'de.

In time, Mardin turned from a place of production of goods, artisanship as small production, in the traditional bazaar system more to a place of sale of goods. However, with growing of the new-town, labour market gained a new aspect. Branches of big corporations have opened and people tended to buy in these shops because of their amount of choice and cheapness of goods. While in the bazaar of old-town, the main way of employment was self-employment, salaried professionals increased with this type of shopping stores in the new-town.

### 6.5.2. Shopping Patterns

In this part, shopping relations between people belonging to different affinities are examined. As a tendency class distinctions were more invisible in daily life among members of the bazaar in the past. Transformation of the traditional bazaar structure and consumption patterns also altered this understanding, because traditional bazaar system produced a culture and a way of shopping relations, however it has disappeared. One of my informal interviewee, a tailor, narrated a brief story about shopping culture in the bazaar for the past:

> When I was a child, I and my father were doing some shopping for food. However, my dad did not put things in the transparent sachets, he preferred a string bag. I asked why to him. He replied as: If a person who could not afford to buy see, s/he may long for same thing. Or, if a pregnant woman see it, she long for...[170]

It is generally expressed that religious or ethnic belonging is not considered to do shopping. For shopping, people generally do not make any distinction through ethnic or religious differences. They could easily go Christians' shops, because the fee of goods is more determining for choosing of the shop. In a different interview, BC expressed the effects of changes in the bazaar system:

> In the past, at shopping, we entered into three or four shops next to each other, and bought something different from each one. This was 30-35 years ago. For example, we bought salt from one shop, rice from another, and parsley from a third one. We shopped with everywhere. No more. Now there

---

170 Ben çocukken, bir gün babamla çarşıda alışveriş yapıyorduk. Ancak babam saydam poşetlere değil, kapalı bir fileye koyuyordu aldıklarını. Neden diye sordum. Dedi ki, gücü yetmeyen vardır canı çeker, hamile bir kadın görür canı çeker.

are supermarkets, hypermarkets; once you are in, you cannot come off. You see? Small business owners, minor grocers are all dead; they cannot do business. This is loss of culture. Today, we no more see a villager taking his eggs, yoghurt, milk for trade; there is nowhere to take them to. (…) Some artisans went on anyway.[171]

On the other hand, due to that some occupations were concentrated among Christians, any other alternative was very restricted, such as jewelery. In addition to this, a Mardinian Arab could easily go to the shops of Kurds due to same reason. However, some Arabs think that there is a problem between Arabs and Kurds in economical relations. SB, while expressing that the main point is finding cheap and quality goods, how this situation changes in some cases:

The people of Mardin do not discriminate others for their origins, saying one is Kurdish, Arab, Muslim etc. They shop from whose goods are better; it is still the same. Nonetheless, we come upon racism lately.

M: What kind of racism?

I sense that Kurds are trying to expel Mardinians from the society. I don't know anything about that, I just smell it.

M: How do Kurdish people expel them?

Expelling means to restrict their life space.[172]

As my observation, relations as customer with Christians and Kurs also continue today. However, these relations weakened due to the decrease in the number of Christians. Today, relations with Kurds are increasing through their participation to the economical life.

---

171 Şimdi mesela biz alışveriş yaparken, şimdi diyelim ki, üç dört tane dükkân yan yana, her bi yerden hepsinden bir şeyler alıyorduk, eskide, şimdi değil. 30-35 sene önce. Mesele bir dükkânda bir tuz alıyorsun, öbür dükkânda bir pirinç alıyorsun, öbür dükkânda bir maydonaz alıyorsun. Hepsinden alışveriş yapıyorduk. Ama şimdi yok, artık market, büyük market, he ne giriyorsan çıkmıyorsun içinde. Anladın değil mi? Küçük esnaf, küçük bakkallar hep ölü, çalışmıyorlar. Kültür kaybediyor. Şimdi bir köylü mesela yumurtasına götürecek, yahutta yoğurdunu götürecek, yahut da sütü götürecek, nereye götürecek, artık yok, kalmadı. (…) Bazı esnaf gene devam ettiler.

172 Kesinlikle, bu Kürttür, bu Araptır, bu Müslümandır, güzel mal kimdeyse ondan alır, hala da öyledir, Mardinli böyledir. Ama son zamanlarda ırkçılıkla karşılaşıyoruz.

M: Nasıl bir ırkçılık?

Yani Kürtler sanki böyle Mardinlileri dışlıyor gibi bir hava seziyorum. Bir bilgim de yok, hava seziyorum.

M: Dışlamak nasıl?

Dışlamak şu şekildedir, hayat sahasını daraltmaktır.

Emphasis on class positions evolved from production the consumption. Frequency of shopping, the number of shops, and variety of goods has significantly rised in old and new towns. On the other hand, shopping patterns changes in old and new towns, because profiles of customers are distinctively different.

Who buy foods, clothes, and other goods in the the bazaar of the old-town, and who buy from big markets in the old-town? There is a class differences between customers of these two sites. For example, unmarked open "baby niaper" ("bebek bezi") is sold and can be easily found customers in the old-bazaar, however it is not possible in the old-town. This is not an expected demands for settler of the new-town. Compared differences between shopping stores of old and new towns, while there are many stores as branches of known brands and supermarkets in the old-town, it is not the same in the old-town. This illustrates how class-based spatial differences reflects on consume patters.

## 6.6. CONCLUSION

In this chapter, the role of class on identity expression of Arabs in Mardin was examined. It is the re-construction of class positions and relations in labour market. Existing class positions and identities is in dissolution process, because the working conditions, occupations, and sources of income has changed. The old structure and economical relations normally changed people's class-related identity understanding.

The bazaar also demographically changed during Turkey Republic. In the bazaar and labour market, while the number and role of Muslim, Arab or Kurd, increased; the number and occupations of Christians decreased. In different occupations, the number of Christian artisans or traders highly low when compared to the past in the old Mardin. With migration of Kurds from villages, they participated to economical activities, and entered to labour market different from established settlers. Thereby, the bazaar and labour market is religiously more homogeneous, but ethnically more mixed.

Old class structure was based on land and real estate "property" and own-employed in the traditional economy. Economical life turned to more professional and salaried.

157

The way of learning job has changed. Apprentice and master system lost its role and modern schooling gained importance to attend occupational life. Thereby, familial participation and continuation to occupation changed and the description "fathers' job" has lost. There is also a change in official job. Through increasing education level, Kurds much more employed in official jobs.

The change in the way of production also caused a "jobless-ness" among people who are a member of familial occupation and having a craft. The problem of joblessness is expressed as the main problem of Mardin for people. This problem is affecting people belonging to different religion or ethnicity in the same level. Urban gained importance as the site of working, village or agriculture based jobs lost importance. Emphasis on class positions evolved from production the consumption increased.

It is generally emphasized that it was easier to earn living in the past, because needs were limited and obtaining is cheaper and gods were generally to put and save in storerooms. Today, goods and needs are much more; however obtaining or buying is more expensive. "The amount which is enough to earn life" ("geçimlik") is much more today than the past. In the past, it had a practice of storing goods in the storerooms. Moreover, women of house used to make various preparations for winter season in the courtyards of old houses. It included drying vegetables such as tomato, making soujouk with grape and walnut (a sweet confection made of walnut-son a string dipped in a starchy grape molasses), grape molasses, dried grape pulp, olive, cracked wheat.

Comparing priorities of people of different class positions, while people from upper and middle class emphasize to cultural, historical, architectural, and touristic features of Mardin; poor people, Arabs, Kurds, and Syriacs, emphasize more on insufficiencies about earning their living. In addition to economical problems, Kurds, especially who experienced forced migration, emphasise more on cultural and political demands to the state. While people of lower classes or having restricted incomes expect politicians and Mardinian businessmen to invest in Mardin and provide new job opportunities; people of Middle and upper class expect more cultural developments on Mardin image. As an example, people of lower classes

generally support Sülayman Bölünmez. Because they think that he make useful things for Mardinian people, especially people having economical impossibility- help them especially for their health problems. It is the same he becomes a representative or not.

Spatially, a class based segregation crystallised with the new city. Growing a middle-class of professional and managerial worker accumulated in the new city to settle in flats.

Traditionally, more domestic and familial roles is given to for women, men have more working role and men's major role remains breadwinner. Motherhood and domesticity are overlapped. Women are responsible for domestic works and family obligations including care for children and elderly relatives, shopping, cooking, and cleaning. The roles of woman become "mother", "wife", "carers" and "domestic labourer" ('natural' roles of mothers and wives). Domestic work and family obligations are an unpaid employment for women. Therefore they are dependent on men on financial position.

The labour market and bazaar is traditionally gendered. There was not any job for women and no place for women in economic activities including artisanship, craftsmanship, or trade. Artisanship and trade was conducted by men. Women's participation to economic activities is highly restricted with minor level. Weaving ("dokumacılık ve iplikçilik") in the weaving loom, making some piece of seaming ("parça iş") at bottom floors of house. In the weaving loom, women used to make thread of yarn and handloom by women, as SN notes in an informal interview:

> Women was working in the grounds flour of their homes to make thread of yarn or handloom.[173]

In addition to preparations, including making soujouk with grape and walnut, drying vegetables such as tomato, etc., for winter season in the court yard

---

173 Kadınlar evlerinin altlarında iplikçilik, dokumacılık uğraşanlar vardı. Bir de bazı tek tük işlerde, bakkal filan.

The absence of women in the local labour market also related with economic restrictions in the city. However, professionalisation by education provides for women paid employment in developing service sector in Mardin. This eliminates the general pattern of segregation women in employment.

There is not an ethnicity based concentration within a class category. There Arabs, Kurds, and Syriacs from upper class. It is the same with middle and lower classes. Due to fewness of population, lower class concentrated on Arabs and Kurds. Tradesmen are mostly Arabs and Kurds, especially in the new city. Lower class people suffer from income and employment problems.

# CHAPTER 7

## CONCLUSION

In this thesis, the main question on how do Mardinians live together with differences. Living together with differences also refers to similarities, and "difference" cannot be thought without "identity". Accordingly, how people construct and use these differences and identities in the life become the main issue. It provides to focus on the formation process and dynamics of identity.

In developing literature on identity it is offered that identity could not be restricted with similarity, and also includes the difference. In order to emphasize difference, identity and difference were used each other in this study. I tried to understand and reveal how identification and differentiation process is constructed during individual life circles and structural changes. Identity is tried to be understand and analysed how, when and why expressions changes over time. Looking at which identity expressions are selected in particular places and particular times provides to understanding more the role of identity in daily life. In other words, it requires to focus on when, how, and why one identity expression is selected instead of not others. Through this way of studying identity, looking at people's identity response to changing circumstances provides to catch contextual and historical variations.

In recent years, there is an increasing tendency on theorising and studying on identity, ethnicity, and cultural diversity in social sciences. This tendency could be also observed in studies on Turkey. Different studies conducted on issues concerning issues of identity, ethnicity, citizenship, and cultural diversity in Mardin. Mardin is frequently discussed as a model in political and anthropological, and sociological fields due to its experience of living together with distinctive ethnic and religious diversity.

Settlers of Mardin from different ethnic, religious, class and gender positions share

the same geographical, political and economical conditions. While we are living in class-ridden, gender-laden, ethnicity-laden societies, we need to focus on how each domain is formed as separate and intersecting. It might be explicitly mentioned in identity formation narratives. However, it is needed to be considered the role of each domain as a point of reference in the analysis, because ethnicity, class or gender are intersecting domains of identity.

In the beginning of the study, I intended to understand and analyse dynamics of living together in the urban Mardin. Process of living in the field, and reviewing completed related studies on Mardin provided to think more on some challanges existing identity understandings and facilitates make use of new theoretical and methodological ways of studying identity formation, and cultural diversity. The critical point is that focusing only ethnicity or religion to make analyse cultural diversity and identity restricts our understanding of complexies and the effects of other dynamics. These differences cannot be restricted with cultural domains including ethnic, cultural or national affinities. We need also add other aspects as intersecting with the cultural domains. In other words, societies is not culturally diverse, besides socially and economically diverse.

In this study, I tried to understand and analyse expressions of identity in terms of intersecionality. Sources of identity are not only multiple, but also intersecting. As this study revealed that each dimension of identity affects differently to identification process. Through integrating interview and observation as data generation methods, narratives on identity and structural changes were tried to integrate in the analysis. There are different names referring to identity and neighbouring concepts in daily language. In order to understand and catch these, I needed to use ethnicity, class and gender together and as intersecting concepts, and methodologically to integrate observation and informal interviews besides recorded and structured interviews. In this thesis, there are three main findings.

The first one is the contextual uses of identity expressions. Belongings are so strong and determining in Mardin's culturally diverse social life to describe, to contact, to trust. However, how they express themselves, and perceive others changes according

162

to context. These expressions can include different domains of identity. Therefore, how formation of ethnic, class and gender identifications are intersected in the urban setting.

The emphasis is more on familial, cultural, and spatial belongings including the sense of Mardinian, the sense of city dweller, the sense of Arab. In the past, class and status related expressions was stronger, the significance of ethnicity increased in their identity perception in the course of time. Expressions changes according to particular place and particular time.

Compared to ethnic-sense consciousness, family and city belongings are stronger. They do not generally need to express of being Arab. While "the sense of Arabness", and "a sense of ethnic community" stayed weak, familial, cultural and class belonging are strong. Therefore, big family name and "natives of Mardin", or "Mardinian" were used much more. The reason is that a sense of shared past based on experience of living in Mardin with other ethnicities. Mardinian as a different identity expression than being Arabic is frequently used in outside. Relations with other Arabs are restricted with Arabs in terms of kinship in the other part of the border. However, familial belonging changes according to class difference as "asil" or "non-asil". "Asil" and "non-asil" in the inner urban place among established people, and "bajari" and "gundi" in the province were labels having class references.

Due to "rural" and "urban" differences, opposition between Arabs and Kurds cannot only be connected with ethnic differentiation. In the past, this differentiation had more class and lifestyle connotations; today it gained more ethnic meanings. Emigrations of urbanite locals and immigrations of rural people, Arabs, Mıhallemis, Syriacs, mostly Kurds changed the demographic structure in favour of rural origin people. Increase of Kurd population and growing of Kurdish Political Movement with 1980s transformed this antagonism in a more ethnic sense. Being destroyed of leftist and class based political movements with the 1980 coup d'état, by arresting members of different leftist groups, Arab and Kurd common political struggle, but not Christians, highly weakened or disappeared. Afterwards of the 1980 coup d'état, "Apocular" in daily language gained strength. Thereby, a political togetherness had

ended. As a result of this political change, starting armed conflict between the state and PKK in 1984, many people was displaced from their villages and some of them settled into the margins of Mardin. These internally displaced families concentrated on this space in the Yeniyol, called "varoş" by some established Arabs. Different from previous migrations of Kurds due to economical, blood revenge or land frictions, this one was a forced migration. These all changes altered Arabs' relations and perceptions about Kurds. The determining source of this perception is politicisation of Kurds and political demands based on Kurdish identity. In this process, while Kurds' demands focus more on cultural and political rights, Arabs do not make these types of demands. Therefore, natives of Mardin are reactionary to Kurds' increasing role in cultural, economical and political life of Mardin, and some of them finds political Kurds as segregationist.

Prominent families of Mardin were some big families. These noble or gentle families were mostly entitled as "zade". They were accepted as "eşraf" (noble or elit).. The "upper class" in Mardin covered "çelebi" (gentlemen, big tradesmen, aristocrat, large landowners), "efendi" (educated class, bureaucrat), "ağa" (agha, big land owning, agha of tribe or land) in the local language of Mardin. It is also the reshaping of class positions and relations in labour market in Mardin. Existing class positions and identities is in dissolution process, because the working conditions, occupations, and sources of income have changed. The old structure and economical relations normally changed people's class-related identity understanding.

Comparing priorities of people of different class positions, while people from upper and middle class emphasize to cultural, historical, architectural, and touristic features of Mardin; poor people, Arabs, Kurds, and Syriacs, emphasize more on insufficiencies about earning their living.

The results of this study reveal the importance of understanding and researching ethnicity ashistorical, relational/interactional, dialogical, dynamic, not as essentialised, fixed, bounded, ahistorical. This also includes not only conceptualise "ethnos" as only "ethnicity" or "ethnic group", rather as "ethnicised"., but also tries to find answers on how and when ethnicity intersect with gender and class. This

reveals also complexity of formation, or complex integration of different similarities or differences.

The results of this study indicate that demographic mobilisation and spatial changes are the main variables affecting intersecting dynamics of identity formation and living together. However, there is prevalent understanding of fixity about living culture, city culture, and identity expression.

Secondly, place is one of the significant determinants of the identification. Changes in place structures differed relations between people, and their identification process. It is the spatial co-existance in the urban landscape. It is the urban dynamics of the co-presence or living together. There was not a clear spatial segregation in settlement and bazaar in the old-town. There was a concentration on religious affinities, but there was not a religion based spatial segregation. Furthermore, there was a family and class based concentrations in districts of old-town. Except places of worship such as mosque, church/monastery, and synagogue in the past and graveyards, other spaces almost are shared and used in common for Muslims and Christians. Therefore, it could be called as mixed hosing, mixed working place, and mixed schooling. The institutional absence of religion or ethnicity based school makes this site as intercultural relations. In addition to this, mixed used of the bazaar produced workshop neighbourhood, partnership, appreciante-master training relations, and shopping relations.

Co-presence provides increasing commonalities, shared practices and values. Commonalities are generally the product of lived experience and sharing same location. This sameness is the product of lived experience and the commonalities of day-to-day life. It is a necessity of living with differences. In the old-town, spatial closeness is am important factor affecting relations and communication. In the course of the time, with effects of migrations to the city centre expanded of urban landscape. New-town as new urbanisation process produces new types of relations, habits and similarities among people. It is much more based on class and lifestyle difference. The new-town made class more visible when compared to old-town. It is also based on class segregation.

In this respect, field study revels how identity formation includes spatial characteristics. It is needed to add place aspect in the analysis of identity formation, and dynamics of living together. Patterns of settlement play a significant role in people's self-expressions and other-expressions. The reason is that spatial arrangements can provide close relation including neighbourhood, working place, leisure spaces.

Thirdly, changes in the demography normally changed existing social, cultural, economical and political life. It is the process of increasing of Kurd population, and decrease of Christian and Arab population in the city. There were main demographical mobility including: Moving from a city to another city, moving from rural to urban areas, and moving from old-town to new-town.

This overlaps to increasing of "non-asil"s, villagers, Kurds, and non-Mardinians in the city. This is understood as the reason of disappearing of Mardin culture. After 1980, ethnicity became more important for identity formation due to increase of the Kurdish population and political power. Demographical decrease caused a situation which limited ties and relations between established close families, Muslim or Christian. Decreasing population of Christians restricted intercultural relations with them. While majors of the city were Arabs and Syriacs in the near past, it is more Arabs and Kurds today starting with 1960s. Therefore, demographically, city centre is more Muslim.

Immigration of established settlers is perceived as collapse of culture and city values, and migration of craft and capital. The group size or population of the group determines their status in the city. There is tendency to understand becoming "minority" in the city. It is also a part of political and power struggles in their minds.

This study focused on dynamics of identity under nation-state form abstaining from historical or biological essentialism in the analysis, thereby trying to understanding historicality. Today we could not speak about the same cultural diversity and identity formation process. In the future, it will not be the same way. All structural changes affected the processes. Therefore, studying identity without taking into consideration

166

of demographic, economical, cultural and political transformation restricts understanding dynamics. It can prevent to understand that every identity expressions is related with some structural qualities, and shaped with the effects these structural domains.

In order to understand how this displeasure or tension signifies an ethnic meaning, it is also need to look, research and compare in different sites, especially villages, mixed villages, Midyat as different mixiation space. This study only focused on how this work in the local context and what are local dynamics and peculiarities in Mardin urban setting.

To conclude, Mardin is quite a suitable site for studying identity through culturally and socially diverse demography. It is also interesting to observe how important and functional belonging is in people's lives. The reason for this is co-existence with differences. However, I could see through three year living experience in Mardin that these differences are not equal. Some differences are not all of the same kind. Some are more pronounced than others, because, there are different stories, different memories, affecting different from the same life conditions, and will be different future. In such a complex site, decisions about which differences one should prioritize create difficulties in the evaluation of identities and differences. It is the reason of intersectionality. It is the question of how these divisions could be separated due to intersecting charactersitics.

There is a strong emphasis on the roots and originality of identities and cultures in Mardin. However, this is a part of the issue, because living together with similarities and differences is the issue of today. It is not an issue of the past. It affects people's lives today. However, references and meanings of similarities and difference are in a constant change process. Furthermore, similarities and differences cannot be not only restricted with ethnicity and religion, but also includes class and gender differences. Therefore, we need to focus on poeple, not on culture due to intersecting quality.

# REFERENCES

Abdelal, R., Herrera, Y. M., Johnston, A. I., McDermott, R. (2009). Introduction. In R. Abdelal, Y. M. Herrara, A.I. Johnston, R. McDermott. (eds.) *Measuring Identity: A Guide for Social Scientists* (pp.1-16). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Amin, A. (2002). Ethnicity and the multicultural city: living with diversity. Journal of *Environment and Planning*, 34, 959-980.

Anthias, F. (1998). Rethinking social divisions: some notes towards a theoretical framework". *The Sociological Review*, 3, 507-535.

Anthias, F. (1999). Beyond unities of identity in high modernity. *Identities*, 6(1), 121-144.

Anthias, F. (2001). The concept of 'social division' and theorising social stratification: looking at ethnicity and class. *Sociology,* 35(4), 835-854.

Atik, M. & Noyan, S. (2009) 1950 Mardin İli Monografisi. Ankara.

Atkinson, R. (1998). *The Life Stoy Interview*. London: Sage Pub.

Aydın, S.; Emiroğlu, K.; Özel, O.; Ünsal, S. (2001). *Mardin: Aşiret, Cemaat, Devlet*. İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı.

Barker, C. (2004). *The Sage Dictionary of Cultural Studies*. London: Sage Pub.

Baumann, G. (1999). *The Multicultural Riddle: Rethinking National, Ethnic, and Religious Identities*. New York: Routledge.

Baumann, G. & Gingrich, A. (eds) (2004). *Grammars of Identity/Alterity: A structural Approach*. New York: Berghahn Boks.

Benwell, B. & and Stokoe, E. (2006). *Discourse and Identity*. Edinburg: Edinburgh University Press.

Biner, Z. Ö. (2007). Retrieving the dignity of a cosmopolitan city: Contested perspectives on rights, culture and ethnicity in Mardin. *New Perspectives on Turkey,* 37, 31–58.

Brubaker, R. (2004a). Introduction. In R. Brubaker, *Ethnicity without Groups* (pp. 1-13). Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Brubaker, Rogers (2004b). Ethnicity without Groups. In R. Brubaker, *Ethnicity without Groups* (pp. 14-26). Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Brubaker, R. & Cooper, F. (2004). Beyond Identity. In R. Brubaker, *Ethnicity without Groups*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Buitelaar, M. (2006). 'I am the ultimate challenge' accounts of intersectionality in the life-story of a well-klnown daughter of moroccan migrant morkers in the Netherlands. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), 259–276

Bulaç, A. (2009a). Türkiye Arapları. Retrieved 5.12.2011, from http://www.zaman.com.tr/yazar.do?yazino=882094

Bulaç, A. (2009b). Dinler, mezhepler, kavimler, aileler. Retrieved 5.12.2011, from http://www.zaman.com.tr/yazar.do?yazino=940887&keyfield=6D617264696E

Caglar, A. S. (1997). Hyphenated Identities and the Limits of 'Culture'. In T. Modood and P. Werbner (eds). *The Politics of Multiculturalism in the New Europe* (pp. 169–185). London: Zed Books. Ppp..

Camps, V. (2010) Interculturality: Philosophical Perspectives. Retrieved April 21 2010, from http://www.cordobaintercultural.com/estilo/img/tabs/VictoriaCampsin.pdf

Cerulo, A. C. (1997). Identity construction: new issues, new directions. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 23, 385-409.

Çağlar, A. (2000). Tire'li kimlikler: teori ve yönteme ilişkin bazı arayışlar. *Toplum ve Bilim*, 84, 129-150

Choo, H. Y. & Ferree, M. M. (2010). Practicing intersectionality in sociological research: a critical analysis of inclusions, interactions, and institutions in the study of inequalities. *Sociological Theory,* 28(2), 129–149

Crenshaw, K. W. (1991) Mapping the margins: intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. *Standford Law Review,* 43, 1241-1299.

Davis, K. (2008). Intersectionality as buzzword: a sociology of science perspective on what makes a feminist theory succesful. *Feminist Theory*, 9 (1), 67-85.

de Fina, A., Schiffrin, D., Bamberg, M. (eds.) (2006). *Discourse and Identity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

De Vos, G. (1995) Ethnic pluralism: conflict and accommodation. In Romanucci-Ross & G. de Vos (eds.). *Ethnic Identity: Creation, Conflict, and Accommodation* (pp15–47). WalnutCreek, CA: Alta Mira Pp.

Ergun, A. & Erdemir, A. (2009) Negotiating insider and outsider identities in the field: "insider" in a foreign land, "outsider" in one's own land. *Field Methods*, 22, 16-38.

169

Erol, S. (2008). "La communication interculturelle entre la communauté Chrétienne / Assyrienne et la communauté Musulmane Le cas d'une ville pluriculturelle: Mardin [Hıristiyan / Süryani ve müslüman cemaatleri arasındaki kültürlerarası iletişim / Bir çokkültürlü şehir örneği: Mardin]. Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Merih Zıllıoğlu. İstanbul: Galatasaray Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Radyo Televizyon ve Sinema Anabilim Dalı.

Hall, S. (1992). The Question of Cultural Identity. In S. Hall, D. Held & T. McGrew (eds). *Modernity and Its Futures* (pp 273-325). Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hall, S. (2006). Who needs 'identity'?. In P. du Gay, J. Evans & P. Redman (eds). *Identity: A Reader*. London: Sage Pub.

Harrington, A., Marshall, B. L., & Müller, H. P. (eds.). (2006). *Encyclopedia of Social Theory*. London, New York: Routledge.

Jenkins, R. (1997). *Rethinking Ethnicity: Arguments and Explanations*. London, California, New Delhi: Sage Pub.

Jenkins, R. (2006). *Social Identity*. Routledge: London and New York.

Ken, I. (2007). Beyond intersection: a new culinary metaphor for race-class-gender studies. *Sociological Theory*, 26(2), 153-172.

Knudsen, S. V. (2006). Intersectionality – a theoretical inspiration in the analysis of minority cultures and identities in textbooks. In E. Bruillard, B. Aomotsbakken, S. V. Knudsen, M. Horskey (eds.). *Caught in the Web of Lost in the Textbook?* (pp. 61-76). Caen: IARTEM, Stef, Iufm. Pp.

Krekula, C. (2007). The intersection of age and gender: reworking gender theory and social gerontology. *Current Sociology*, 55(2), 155-171.

Kvale, S. (2007). *Doing Interviews*. London: Sage Pub

Lewis, G. & Phoenix, A (2004) 'Race', 'ethnicity' and 'identity'. In K. Woodward (ed.) *Questioning Identity: Gender, Class, Ethnicity* (pp. 115-151). London and NY: Routledge in association with The Open University.

Loveman, M. & Stamatov, P. (2004). Ethnicity as cognition. In R. Brubaker, *Ethnicity without Groups*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Ludvig, A. (2006) Intersecting voices in a female narrative. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), 245–258.

Mackintosh, M. and Mooney, G. (2004). Identity, inequality and social class. In K. Woodward, K. (ed.) *Identity and Difference* London, California, New Delhi: Sage Pub.

Malasevic, S. (2004). *The Sociology of Ethnicity*.: London, Thousands Oaks, New Delhi: Sage Pub.

Mason, J. (2004). *Qualitative Researching*. London: Sage Pub.

McCall, L. (2005). The Complexity of Intersectionality, *SIGNS: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 30(31), 1771–1802.

Oktem, K. (2005). Faces of the city: Poetic, mediagenic and traumatic images of a multi-cultural city in Southeast Turkey. *Cities*, 22 (3), 241-253.

Phillips, A. (2007). *Multiculturalism without Culture*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Phoenix, A. (2006). Editorial: Intersectionality. *European Journal of Women's Studies*,13 (3), 187-192.

Prins, B. (2006). Narrative accounts of origins: A blind spot of the intersectional approach. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), 277–290.

Schecter, R., Yacobi, H. (2005). Cities in the Middle East: Politics, representation and history. *Cities*, 22(3), 183-188.

Sarı, E. (2005). Kültür, Kimlik, Politika: Mardin'de Kültürlerarasılık [Culture, identity, politics: Interculturality in Mardin city]. Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Asker Kartarı. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü İletişim Bilimleri Anabilim Dalı.

Snow, D. A.; Oselin, S. S.; Corrigal-.Brown, C. (2005). In G. Ritzer (ed). Encyclopedia of Social Theory. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Pub..

TÜİK (2011). Bölgesel Göstergeler TRC3 2010 Mardin, Batman, Şırnak, Siirt. Ankara: TÜİK.

Wetherell, M. (2010). The Field of Identity Studies. In: M. Wetherell &T. Mohanty (eds). *The Sage Handbook of Identities* (pp. 3-26). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Pub..

Woodward, K. (1997). Concepts of Identity and Difference. In K. Woodward (ed.). *Identity and Difference* (pp. 7-50). London, California, New Delhi: Sage Pub.

Woodward, K. (2004). Afterword. In K. Woodward (ed.). *Questioning Identity: Gender, Class, Ethnicity*. (pp. 155-158). London: Routledge.

## APPENDICES

## APPENDIX A
## SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE OF INTERVIEWEES

Socio-demographical profile of interviewees is required to understand expressions cited in quotations better in their multiple dimensions. Moreover, this list is limited with taped interviews.

| | Name | Age | Sex | Occupation | Education | District of Birth | Settled Site |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | **N1 & N2** | 60 & 56 | M & F | Retired driver & housewife | High school | Savurkapı mah. / Old-town | Old-town & New-town |
| 2 | **DI** | 51 | M | Teacher | Education Institute | Medrese mah. Old--town | New-town |
| 3 | **SN** | 62 | M | Retired accountant | University | Şar mah. / Old-town | Latifiye mah. / Old-town |
| 4 | **EK** | 76 | M | Big trader | Sanat Okulu | Ulucami mah. / Old-town | Old-town & New-town |
| 5 | **SB** | 65 | M | Export merchant | University | Mişkin mah. / Old-town | Mişkin mah / Old-town |
| 6 | **HK** | 78 | M | Retired tradesman | Erkek Sanat Enstitüsü | Şar mah. / Old-town | Şar mah. / Old-town |
| 7 | **BK** | 62 | F | Housewife | Secondary School | Savurkapı / Old-town | Şar mah. / Old-town |

| | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 8 | **CA** | 63 | M | Lawyer | University | Şar mah. / Old-town | New-town |
| 9 | **BC** | 57 | M | Cook | Non-educated | Deriyye mah. / Old-town | Deriyye mah. / Old-town |
| 10 | **SE** | 35 | M | Baker (his father was a porter) | Primary school | Deriyye mah. / Old-town | Deriyye mah. / Old-town |
| 11 | **Ş1 & Ş2** | 59 & 65 | F & M | Housewife & Retired carpenter | Non-educated | Şar mah. / Old-town | Şar mah. / Old-town |

## APPENDIX B

## TEZ FOTOKOPİSİ İZİN FORMU

### ENSTİTÜ

| | |
|---|---|
| Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü | ☐ |
| Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü | X |
| Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü | ☐ |
| Enformatik Enstitüsü | ☐ |
| Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü | ☐ |

### YAZARIN

Soyadı  : Küçük

Adı   : Murat

Bölümü  : Sosyoloji

**TEZİN ADI** (İngilizce): Intersecting Identities: Context and Change in the Case of Mardinian Arabs

**TEZİN TÜRÜ**:  Yüksek Lisans X   Doktora ☐

1. Tezimin tamamından kaynak gösterilmek şartıyla fotokopi alınabilir. ☐
2. Tezimin içindekiler sayfası, özet, indeks sayfalarından ve/veya bir bölümünden kaynak gösterilmek şartıyla fotokopi alınabilir. ☐
3. Tezimden bir (1) yıl süreyle fotokopi alınamaz. X

**TEZİN KÜTÜPHANEYE TESLİM TARİHİ**: