ISTANBUL OKAN UNIVERSITY INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF DUBBING STRATEGIES IN THE DRAMA SERIES "SAB 'AT TAYYİBŪN" (YEDİ GÜZEL ADAM)

Muna Hamed Saleem ASENWAR

THESIS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF TRANSLATION STUDIES

ADVISOR

Prof. Dr. Mehmet Hakkı SUÇİN

ISTANBUL, May 2019

ISTANBUL OKAN UNIVERSITY INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF DUBBING STRATEGIES IN THE DRAMA SERIES "SAB'AT TAYYİBŪN" (YEDİ GÜZEL ADAM)

Muna Hamed Saleem ASENWAR (142003001)

THESIS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF TRANSLATION STUDIES

ADVISOR Prof. Dr. Mehmet Hakkı SUÇİN

ISTANBUL, May 2018

INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF DUBBING STRATEGIES IN THE DRAMA SERIES "SAB'AT TAYYİBÜN" (YEDİ GÜZEL ADAM)

Muna Hamed Saleem ASENWAR (142003001)

MASTER THESIS TRANSLATION STUDIES PROGRAM

Date of Thesis Submission to Institute:

Date of Thesis Defense: 24.05.2019

Advisor: Prof. Dr. Mehmet Hakkı SUÇİN

Other Committee Members:

Prof. Dr. Alev BULUT

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Cemal DEMİRCİOĞLU

ISTANBUL, May 2019

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to take this opportunity to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Mehmet Hakkı Suçin, for his aspiring guidance, constructive criticism and friendly approach throughout the course of my research. His doors were always open to all my questions or confusions.

I especially appreciate his guidance in terms of offering references and using his connections to put me in contact with the right people. Thus, allowing me to create my own primary sources and add valuable content to this work.

Having said this, I must mention the generous hospitability of Rasim Özdenören and his collaboration. I thank Daniel Abdulfattah for his ample time and informative discussion. He has indeed enriched my thesis beyond my expectation. I especially thank Bedir Dabbağoğlu from Seyr Ajans for allowing me such a close examination of their work.

My thanks extend to the Assoc. Prof. Dr. Cemal Demircioğlu and Prof. Dr. Alev Bulut for being members of my thesis committee, and enriching my work with their valuable feedback and challenging discussion.

Here I must also remember the late Abdulkadir Abdelli who was the first to encourage me to enter this discipline. His loss is a bond rupture in the Turkish Arabic relations.

Finally, I must express my most profound gratitude to my parents, and my life partner, for their unfailing support and encouragement. Their stance by me at my weakest times is a real treasure. Any success I have ever achieved is nothing but a testimony of their unconditional love and support.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	.iii
SUMMARY	.vi
ÖZET	vii
SYMBOLSv	⁄iii
ABBREVIATIONS	.ix
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 2: INTRODUCTION TO AUDIOVISUAL TRANSLATION	3
2.1. The Emergence and History of AVT	3
2.2. Theoretical Framework Within TS	5
2.3. Types and Modes of AVT	8
2.4. Dubbing: The Process and the Constraints	11
CHAPTER 3: AUDIOVISUAL TRANSLATION IN THE ARABIC SPHERE	15
3.1. Literature Review	15
3.2. Audiovisual Practice in the Arab World	18
3.3. Analysis of AVT Norms in the Arab World	20
3.4 The Rise of Dubbed Turkish Drama Series in Arabic Media	23
CHAPTER 4: THE CASE STUDY (YEDİ GÜZEL ADAM)	28
4.1. About Yedi Güzel Adam	28
4.2. Analysis of Norms and Process of Dubbing in <i>Yedi Güzel Adam</i>	31

4.3 Analysis of Dubbing Constraints in <i>Yedi Güzel Adam</i>	33
4.4. Analysis of Dubbing Challenges in <i>Yedi Güzel Adam</i>	40
CONCLUSION	55
REFERENCES	59
CURRICULUM VITAE	63

SUMMARY

A DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF DUBBING STRATEGIES IN THE

DRAMA SERIES "SAB'AT TAYYİBŪN" (YEDİ GÜZEL ADAM)

This thesis investigates and analyses the strategies used in the dubbing of the Turkish drama

series Yedi Güzel Adam into Arabic, from the perspective of Descriptive Translation Studies

and Polysystem Theory. It starts with mapping out the reality of Audiovisual Translation in

the Arab World to give an insightful idea about the common audiovisual translational

practices into the Arabic language, and the established norms behind them. It also extends

further to explain the linguistic, cultural and economic reasons and constraints that lie behind

forming these norms. In relation to the case study, constraints of dubbing are explored based

on Chaume's dubbing constraints framework. Besides, some dubbing challenges are detected

based on the obvious fault-lines in the final translated version. Finally, interviews are held

with the translation and dubbing agency to give an insight on the process and technicalities of

AVT of Turkish drama series in the Arab region generally, and the audiovisual material under

study in specific.

Keywords: Audiovisual Translation, dubbing, Polysytem Theory, Turkish drama, Arabic

media.

Date: 10.5.2019

vi

ÖZET

"SAB 'AT TAYYİBŪN" (YEDİ GÜZEL ADAM) DİZİSİNDE DUBLAJ

STRATEJİLERİNİN BETİMSEL ÇÖZÜMLEMESİ

Bu tezde, Türk televizyon dizisi Yedi Güzel Adam'ın dublajında kullanılan çeviri stratejileri,

Betimleyici Çeviri Araştırmaları ve Çoğuldizge Kuramı açısından incelenmiştir. Öncelikle

Arap dünyasındaki görsel-işitsel çeviri uygulamalarının durumu ve zaman ile oluşan öncül

normlar araştırılmış, öncül normların oluşumunda rol oynayan dilsel, kültürel ve finansal

faktörler değerlendirilmiştir. Çalışmada örnek olay incelemesi, Chaume'un ortaya attığı

dublaj kısıtlamaları zemininde incelenmiş, söz konusu dublajlı dizideki belirgin çeviri

kayıpları ortaya çıkarılmıştır. Söz konusu dizinin dublaj sürecinin işleyişi ve teknik

meselelere ilişkin değerlendirmelerin yapılması amacıyla da örnek olay olarak seçilen dizinin

çevirisini ve dublajını yapan medya ajansı ile görüşme gerçekleştirilmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Görsel-İşitsel Çeviri, dublaj, Çoğuldizge Kuramı, Türk dizileri, Arap

medyası.

Tarih: 10.15.2019

vii

SYMBOLS

TRANSLITERATION SYSTEM FOR ARABIC

Throughout the thesis, the IJMES system is used for the transliteration of the Arabic words and texts. This applies to Arabic terms, names of drama work, as long as they are not known in the world with their translated names in English. It also applies to the target texts obtained from the case study. Transliteration system is not applied to the names of Arabic companies and institutions, which are rather introduced with their proper names and original spellings.

Consonants

Arabic Letter	Transliteration	Arabic Letter	Transliteration
۶	,	ط	ţ
ب	b	ظ	Ż
ت	t	ع	· ·
ث	th	غ	gh
5	j	ف	f
ح	þ	ق	q
خ	kh	[ك	k
7	d	J	1
ذ	dh	م	m
ر	r	ن	n
j	Z	ۿ	h
س	S	و	W
ش	sh	ي	y
ص	Ş	š	a
ض	d	ال	al-

Vowels

Vowel Type	Vowel	Transliteration
	ی or ا	ā
Long	و	ū
	ي	Ī
Doubled	_ يّ	iyy (final form ī)
	- هُ وّ	uww (final form ū)
Diphthongs	−َ و	au <i>or</i> aw
	_َ <i>ي</i>	ai <i>or</i> ay
	ó-	a
Short	ć -	u
	ò_	i

ABBREVIATIONS

TS: Translation Studies

DTS : Descriptive Translation Studies

TL : Target Language

TT : Target Text

SL : Source Language

ST : Source Text

MSA : Modern Standard Arabic

AV : Audiovisual

AVT : Audiovisual Translation

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

In the last one and half decade, the Arab World witnessed the rise of the phenomenon of the dubbed Turkish drama series. This phenomenon, which evoked great interest in the Turkish language and culture, became the spotlight of the major Arabic TV channels. While entertainment TV channels competed in providing as much Turkish drama series as it possibly could, news channels dedicated some of its broadcasting time to analyzing the new trend and trying to discover the motives behind it with great suspicion.

Despite this, the phenomenon is still unexplored in academia, with only a few references in limited works, and zero number of dedicated research.

Therefore, this thesis opts to study the birth of this phenomenon and question the driving forces behind it, by studying the changing dynamics in the Arabic production based on the testimonies from within the field of dubbing production, and in relation to the Polysystem Theory.

It also expands to investigate the backstage of the dubbing houses, to give a clear picture of the process and practice of dubbing in the Arab World, in terms of the technologies used, the components of the production line, and dubbing problems.

The thesis presents *Sabʿat Tayyibūn*, the Arabic dubbed version of the Turkish drama *Yedi Güzel Adam*, as a case study to investigate the professional practice of dubbing into Arabic.

The choice of this drama series is not arbitrary. It was selected for being a multidimensional production, based on a true story, and carrying a semi-documentary nature. Another unique feature of the series is being loaded with literary quotations from the modern Turkish literature. These two elements pose an extra challenge for the translator. Therefore, it gives us an opportunity to expand our study for the translator's decisions from different dimensions and in a more challenging environment.

Being restricted in time and access, the research is limited to the first four episodes of the lengthy drama *Yedi Güzel Adam*, making around 7 hours of audiovisual material, presented in 8 episodes of *Sab 'at Tayyibūn*.

Regarding the case study, the thesis aims to describe the constraints and challenges of dubbing, and discuss the translator's choices and decisions, in the light of Translation Studies theories.

For the study of dubbing problems and dubbing quality in the case study, the thesis builds on Chaume's framework of dubbing constraints, which organizes the quality assessment of dubbing from different aspects beyond the linguistic perspective.

Moreover, the thesis questions the boundaries of translator's freedom against the preliminary norms, and focuses on the translator's behavior when the context requires breaking the dictated set of norms.

This work consists of four chapters. The introduction sets the goals of this study. The second chapter explores the history and emergence of Audiovisual Translation (AVT) and its position within the discipline of Translation Studies (TS) and explores the potential of studying AVT under the umbrella of Descriptive Translation Studies. The Second chapter also introduces different types of audiovisual translation, with great focus on dubbing for its relevance to our study. Finally, it presents Chaume's dubbing constraints framework, prior to its application to our case study in the fourth chapter.

The third chapter is dedicated to mapping the field of audiovisual translation in the Arab World, both in terms of academic research and professional practice. It discusses the established norms of dubbing and the reasons behind their evolvements. It also analyzes the rise of Turkish dubbed drama in the Arabic region and reveals the untold story of this initiative.

The fourth chapter applies the knowledge accumulated from previous discussions to the case study. It tracks the preliminary norms of dubbing in the drama series under study. It also evaluates the dubbing constraints based on Chaume's framework and the techniques of dealing with them, with examples. It also detects some unique challenges on the verbal level, which do not fall under Chaume's framework. These challenges are presented and discussed with examples.

Finally, the conclusion sums up the findings of this study and suggests few guidelines for dealing with the prominent issues of dubbing that appeared in the case study.

CHAPTER 2: INTRODUCTION TO AUDIOVISUAL

TRANSLATION

This chapter starts with exploring the history and emergence of AVT as a sub-branch of Translation Studies. It investigates the position of AVT within the discipline of Translation Studies and discusses the potential theoretical framework provided by the theories of descriptive translation studies.

It also introduces the reader to different practices of audiovisual translation by classifying, comparing the different modes of AVT, and giving a brief understanding of their respective mechanisms in practice.

In its second part, this chapter paves the way for a better understanding of the Audiovisual Translation in relevance to the case study. It gives a review of the situation of AVT in the Arabic academia, and in the international academic literature where the Arabic language is one of the translational language pairs.

2.1. The Emergence and History of AVT

The technological revolution that started in the last century with the invention of the radio, television, and computer, changed the face of the world in many ways. It ended the era of paper-restricted mass communication and opened the door widely for a speedily progressive mass multimedia notion, that succeeded in replacing the printed materials with audiovisual ones. Audiovisual content could easily win the hearts of viewers, as it proved itself easier, faster, more credible, entertaining, and engaging with sounds and images. Not so long before we started feeling ourselves surrounded by screens of every size and type, which established the new reality of images' ubiquity in the modern world.

The dramatic rise in the production of audiovisual materials, and their cross-cultural nature in a globalized economy-driven world created a natural need to translate those materials to introduce them to new markets, think of the film industry, advertisements and TV shows, etc.

Technical developments which have changed paper-oriented society towards media oriented society have also made Audiovisual Translation the most dynamic field of Translation Studies. (Orero, 2004)

However, the pace of change has not been that fast within the academia of Translation Studies. Until recently, practices of dubbing and subtitling used to fall short of being "translation proper" in the eyes of the academic sphere of TS (Translation Studies). It used to be referred to as a type of "adaptation", rather than translation. This position was mostly justified by the restrictions imposed on such modes of language transfer, due to its dependency on the visuals.

This approach stymied the emergence of -what we call now- the Audiovisual Translation (AVT) as a branch of TS and resulted in keeping it ignored and away from the academic discussion. Unfortunately, it also gave a good excuse to justify less qualitative and inadequate linguistic transfer in such practices as they were not accepted as translation academically but accustomed with the loose and indefinite term, adaptation.

On the other side, voices from within TS field, like Mayoral Asensio advocated for more dynamic notion, to catch up with the technological developments and new rising needs. The definition of the object of study in Translation Studies is not the definition of a natural process that assumes an unchanging nature; rather it is the definition of a technological process that continually evolves and changes. Our role is not to close the door on new realities but to favor and encourage them. We need open definitions that can be modified both to envelop new realities (sign language interpretation, multimedia, text production), and to get rid of those that have ceased to be useful and necessary. (Asensio, 2001a)

This opinion is also shared by Fotios Karamitroglou, who argues that:

The heart of the matter lies in our conceptualization and definition of translation. If we accept Toury's definition of translation as "any target language utterance which is presented or regarded as such within the target culture, on whatever grounds" (1985:20) and we extend it to cover audiovisual translation as well, we can easily accommodate audiovisual translation within the broader realm of Translation Studies. (Karamitoglu, 2000)

Mayoral Asensio, and other researchers like Kelly and Gallardo, introduced the term "restricted translation" to refer to such language transfers. For them, restricted translation is "the case in which the text is only one of the components of the message, or when it constitutes only an intermediate stage for a speech read aloud or dramatized". Or as Bartina and Espasa put it: "situations in which the text to be translated is part of a more complex communicative event which attempts to convey a message by various means, such as pictures, drawings, music, etc."

However, the term was opposed by many researchers who argued that this term "should not be used to imply that there is anything that can properly be called unconstrained translation". They argued that different types of translations are simply "constrained in different ways and by different factors" (Zabalbeascoa, 1997)

Therefore, it has not been until the late 1990's that the term of Audiovisual Translation appeared and gained acceptance as an umbrella to systemize the study of such modes of translation. The term has a simple and direct connection to the very nature of its content, and is capable of accommodating different types of audiovisual content that might come in the future, compared to limited terms suggested before, such as "film translation" and "screen translation".

Audiovisual translation, despite its short history compared to other rooted types of translation like legal and literary translation, witnessed a dramatic growth both in practice and interest. This can be explained by the market demand and the expansion of the field practically.

And yet, the attention given to the Audiovisual Translation in academia is still considered insufficient to satisfy the needs. Diaz Cintas, claims:

A clear paradox exists which emphasizes the surprising imbalance between the little research on audiovisual translation and its enormous impact on society. In numerical terms, the translation carried out in the audiovisual realm is the most important translational activity of our time. Firstly, because of the high number of people, it reaches, mainly through television. Secondly, because of the large quantity of translated products which cross over to other cultures: documentaries, films, news, debates, concerts, television series, etc. Thirdly, because of the immediacy of its reception: television, cinema, DVD. (Díaz-Cintas, 2004)

Therefore, the volume of literature written to discuss AVT is increasing recently. The big challenge for scholars is to position the new field within the discipline of Translation Studies and its theories and with relation to other fields, such as media, cinema, and film production.

2.2. Theoretical Framework Within TS

It is quite difficult to talk about a fixed theoretical framework of AVT under Translation Theory, for two reasons. First, the time factor plays a big role in the development of such theoretical studies, and AVT is still considered "a virgin area of research" (Delabasita, 1989). Secondly, most of the academic achievements related to AVT focused primarily on the techniques, special needs and characteristics of audiovisual translation as a

practice rather than its theoretical base. In other words, the focus was given to the process of translating audiovisual materials, not to the translation as a product or concept.

This can be related to the fact that old professional world of audiovisual translation focused solely on the technicalities of synchronization and neglected other factors when it comes to assessing the overall quality of translation.

However, some good efforts are made to bridge the gap between theory and practice, which seems to be the most concerning issue for all scholars of Translation Studies, and not only for AVT. Most importantly, Jorge Diaz Cintas makes significant strides in his paper, In Search of a Theoretical Framework for the Study of Audiovisual Translation, which aims, as he says:

to analyze the validity and functionality of a series of concepts that have been articulated within the theoretical framework loosely known as Descriptive Translation Studies (DTS) and apply them to the field of audiovisual translation. (Diaz Cintas, 2004)

Cintas, in his work, tries to challenge the fact the DTS, in its core, refers almost exclusively to literary translations. He tries to explore some of Translation Studies' concepts and expand them to fit and benefit AVT. To achieve this, he builds on the point made by Holmes, the father of Descriptive Translation Studies, as he stated in his book:

The ultimate goal of the translation theorist in the broad sense must undoubtedly be to develop a full, inclusive theory accommodating so many elements that it can serve to explain and predict all phenomena falling within the terrain of translating and translation. (Holmes, 1994;73)

Cintas opens the eyes on a great potential to study AVT with the lens of Polysystem theory. He sees that Polysystem allows us to take the study of AVT away from a mere linguistic perspective, to a more socio-cultural perspective, by highlighting the impact of social and cultural factors in the translation-related decisions and choices. He also sees an opportunity for "shift of interest that departs from the study of translation as a process, translating, in order to center on the analysis of translation as a product, translation.". This allows us to focus on the positioning and functioning of the translation in its new existing system in the target culture.

Karamitroglou, states clearly in the introduction of his book, "I believe that audiovisual translation both demands and deserves to be treated within the framework of the Polysystem approach.". He elaborates further by quoting "audiovisual translation seems to be particularly dominated by a strong sense of norms as a result of the impact of mass media on the broader public and the fact that 'viewers are creatures of habit". (Ivarsson, 1992)

The notion of norms, introduced by Toury can be undertaken under the scope of Polysystem. Where the translated work is part of a system of other similar translated or non-translated works interacting with other systems of relevance. Thus, a translated literature is evaluated within the system of other translated and original literature in the target culture, while the literature of the target culture is interactive with different socio-cultural, economic and political factors. This can open the study of translation to countless fields and possibilities, instead of keeping it restricted to the linguistic element.

Basically, the theory aims to explain the translational phenomena in the light of norms. The concept of norms is originally derived from the social sciences and is applicable for translation studies. Norms in the field of translation can be understood as the behavioral patterns and choices that are considered right, adequate and appropriate in a specific target culture, and develop from being preferences into performance instructions and pressing expectations that govern the whole translation project.

Norms are classically divided into two groups; preliminary norms and operational norms. Preliminary norms or (initial norms) are the general strategies and directions prior to the start of the actual translation, including the choice of what to translate and the mode of translation. The translation initiator conveys these norms to the translator and expects him to follow. The translation initiator (the production house, or TV channel in our case) lays down its expectations from the translator, sets some guidelines to his work, and explains its own reservations. These reservations can be of political, ideological, or linguistic nature, or related to the usage of some terms and refrainment from others.

Operational Norms, on the other side, are the actual decisions taken by the translator during the process of translation. It can be seen as the translator's way of adjustment between adequacy (loyalty to the source text) and acceptability (fulfilling expectations of target culture).

The notion of norms has been of a great benefit and contribution to the discipline of translation studies, and more specifically for the understanding and development of AVT. Due to the lack of autonomy and the nature of teamwork in the production of AVT, compared to literary translation, "certain normative behavioral patterns could be observed more easily if the researcher focused on the analysis of products that have been marketed, say, by a given TV channel or distribution company" (Cintas, 2004). Moreover, the influence of established norms is expected to show more force into the field of AVT for the same reason.

2.3. Types and Modes of AVT

Audiovisual Translation (AVT) is an academic term used to refer to the interlingual transfers of materials that constitute of two inputs; audible (acoustic) and visual, hence the name. This definition is mostly accustomed by the translation of movies, drama series, and TV shows, but it also includes translations of advertisements, comics, and theatrical plays, and other types. It also includes the two macro-modes of audiovisual translation, captioning; such as subtitling and surtitling, as well as revoicing; like dubbing, voice over, free commentary, and simultaneous interpretation of films, etc.

Bartrina & Espasa explain further the scope of audiovisual translation, arguing that:

The specificity of audiovisual translation consists in its mode of transmission, rather than in the topics it covers. In audiovisual texts, there is semiotic interaction between the simultaneous emission of image and text and its repercussions for the translation process. One characteristic of audiovisual texts is its redundancy: oral and written messages are conveyed with sound and image. Bartrina & Espasa (2005:85)

Bearing in mind the rapid expansion of audiovisual material in the world of mass communication and image dominance, the definitions are kept open to any upcoming form of translatable material that addresses the audience through two channels, acoustic and visual.

In his article The Turn of Audiovisual Translation, Chaume starts his paper by stating that:

Audiovisual translation is an academic term that covers both well-established and new ground-breaking linguistic and semiotic transfers like dubbing, subtitling, surtitling, respeaking, audiosubtitling, voice-over, simultaneous interpreting at film festivals, free-commentary and goblin translation, subtitling for the deaf and the hard of hearing, audiodescription, fansubbing and fandubbing

Throughout his article, he elaborates on the techniques and process of each of these modes of AVT and classifies them into two main macro-modes of audiovisual translation; captioning and revoicing. According to Chaume, revoicing refers to the modes based on recording and inserting a new soundtrack and subsequent sound synchronization, such as dubbing, voice-overs, simultaneous interpretation of the film, free commentary, fandubs and audiodescription for the blind and visually impaired. While captioning is the term given for the modes based on a written translated or transcribed text inserted on or next to the screen where the original text is shown, within which falls subtitling, surtitling, respeaking (live subtitling), fansubbing, and subtitling for the deaf and hard of hearing.

AVT modes, for Chaume, are the technical means used to perform or present the linguistic transfer of an audiovisual text from one language to another. They are referred to as AVT types by researchers. Despite the big amount of research carried out in the field of AVT

recently, no consensus has been reached regarding the number and classification of modes. Subtitling for the deaf, and dubbing for blind and visually impaired are still debatable, as some argue that these types do not include translation in the traditional sense. However, we decided to present Chaume's classification in this paper, aiming for simplification and inclusiveness.

As the main and most popular modes of AVT nowadays are subtitling, dubbing and voice over, it is important to be able to make a distinction between these three terms.

Dubbing falls under the macro-mode of revoicing, which -despite the lack of consensus on its scope- technically includes a range of oral language transfer and different levels of synchronization between target-language soundtracks and on-screen images.

Dubbing is one of the most common practices of AVT in cinema and entertainment material in the modern world. The term is well known to almost every common person. However, in the academic field of AVT, it denotes the "re-recording of the original voice track in the target language using dubbing actors' voices; the dubbed dialogue aims to recreate the dynamics of the original, particularly in terms of delivery pace and lip movement." (Luyken et al. 1991). It also requires a higher level of the lip and kinetic synchrony and complete deletion of the original soundtrack. These two characteristics set dubbing different from voice over.

As voice-over is another popular sub-mode of revoicing, used mostly in rendering official statements and conversations in documentaries and news bulletins. It is made by "broadcasting the audio track with the recording of the original dialogue at the same time as the track with the translated version" (Chaume, 2013). The sound engineer lowers the volume of the original soundtrack after a couple of seconds of the start of utterance, to allow the translated soundtrack to overlap and be heard clearly along with the original one in the background throughout the scene. This technique is mostly used to give a sense of the credibility of the translation, as the viewer can still overhear the original soundtrack.

Subtitling, on the other hand, is a captioning mode of AVT. It is, basically, incorporating a written text in the target language translation of the audible channel at the lower side of the screen, where the original material is being shown with the original soundtrack. This mode of translation is very popular in films and cinema industry, as well as settings that are more formal.

There has been some paradox and debates on dubbing versus subtitling, both in the academia and between professionals of both practices and entertainment sector, as well as between audiences.

Subtitling is subject to some restrictions related to space it should occupy on the screen, and can be criticized for creating a visual distraction. While dubbing is considered the most expensive and time-consuming mode of AVT. It is "up to fifteen times more expensive than subtitling" (Luyken et al. 1991), due to the high technology it requires, and the involvement of so many professionals in the process of production, as we will see later. It is however preferred in the film and entertainment industry due to the high level of convenience it gives to the audience, compared to subtitling.

Dubbing allows viewers to watch without dividing their attention between the events on the screen and the written translation. It also carries high potential for easy domestication of the material, not only due to the absence of the foreign soundtrack, but also the chance to manipulate the original text by replacing the source culture references with their functional equivalents in the target culture, without risking a clash between what is heard in the original soundtrack and what is read in the subtitles.

However, this is only one side of the picture. On the other hand, dubbing, in the long run in a specific target culture, means repetitiveness of the same dubbing actors' voices in different works, which ends up being irritating for the audience. One other common complaint about dubbing is when the quality of production and last finishing of the dubbed soundtrack fall short from satisfying the audience, for different reasons, which we will discuss under the title of dubbing constraints.

Therefore, the professional field of AVT has been and is still divided between subtitling and dubbing. Until the 1990s, the landscape of AVT showed geographical division of countries between subtitlers and dubbers (Luyken et al, 1991), depending on their preference based mostly on economic, linguistic and political reasons. Dubbing was forested by some European fascist regimes to maintain a single linguistic reality in the country and achieve linguistic uniformity (Agost. 1999). Dubbing enables censorship and removal of inconvenient materials and references that disturb these regimes and clash with their political doctrine. On the other hand, subtitling "thrived in a group of rich and highly literate countries with small audiovisual markets, and bilingual communities, as well as in other states with lower literacy rates but much poorer economies, for whom other forms of audiovisual translation were unaffordable" (Perez-Gonzalez, 2009).

Later on, we witnessed a series of shifts and changes in the global preferences with the "dubbing countries moving towards subtitling, subtitling countries beginning to dub" (Chaume, 2013). Yet, this analysis helps us understand the role played by economic, linguistic and political factors in the choice of AVT mode. These findings will help us

analyze the situation of AVT production in the Arab World, especially in the context of the Turkish drama series, as we will see in the third chapter.

Understanding the differences, advantages, and disadvantages of subtitling and dubbing, it is easier now to relate the mode choice with the functionality and desired effect on the target audience. The coming sections will focus more on dubbing-related discussions given the topic and scope of this study.

2.4. Dubbing: The Process and the Constraints

The process of dubbing has been a subject of focus for many types of research that tried to understand the preliminary and operational norms and strength and weakness points of such practice, in search for new techniques and methods to improve it. The research has shown a wide range of norms changing from one country to another, or even between different producers in the same country. However, the general picture of the stages of dubbing can be described as the following:

Initially, a film or a program is selected by a distributing company which then proceeds to decide whether the material shall be dubbed, subtitled or remain untranslated. If dubbing is selected, then the next step in the process is to hire a studio specializing in the field to supply voice-actors and technicians to get the job done. Today all of this is generally done by a single studio. The distributors can also supply a list of preferences for the dubbing in terms of dialogue, voice actors and such. A copy of the original version is given to the translator or translators and they may also be supplied with the post-production script to aid them in their task. While or after the main body of the translation is done the translation goes through a timing and lip-movement check where corrections are made to ensure that it does not deviate too much from the original. This process can also involve the dubbing director and the selected voice actors, and if so then considerable changes may be made to the original translation. (Zabalbeascoa 1997:335)

The process of dubbing carries a crucial role in creating an adequate and acceptable AV product. Many dubbing failures and gaps can be found deeply rooted in the unsystematic or lacking dubbing process. The lack of cooperation and interaction between the components of this teamwork can result in translational errors and lack of cohesion and coherence in the final product.

Given the length of dubbing process, the multiplicity of its stages and their dependency on each other as well as the high number of people and professions involved in it, it can be said that the process of dubbing is a very complex one. It is a process controlled by many limitations and constraints, which can make the whole process very overwhelming. This intensifies the need for a systematic approach to spot the common constraints as a first step to deal with the elephant in the room.

Prior to the consensus of using the term Audiovisual Translation, this type of practices was called "constrained translation", in reference to the limitations imposed on it by the visuals. Shortly before the term proved to be very problematic, as it proposes that all other types of translation are free of constraints, which is wrong, according to many scholars. However, the term "constraints" kept playing an important role in the study of AVT.

The main constraint of AVT lies in the fact that the text to be translated does not exist in isolation from the visuals on screen. "Audiovisual translation is just a modality of translation of special texts where two narrations, which use two different channels of communication, the acoustic channel and the visual channel, take place at the same time, forming a coherent and cohesive text, a third multidimensional unit." (Chaume, 1997). This means that these two interrelated channels merge and complete each other. In fact, the viewer of the audiovisual content receives the messages of both channels synchronously.

On the other hand, "Translators are commonly used to simple modes of discourse. Thus, their attention is mainly paid to the verbal message itself." (Chaume, 1998). Here lies the puff point of the constrained nature of AVT. Translators need to no longer deal with the text solely, in isolation from what happens on screen. They rather need to let their translation overlap and harmonize with the visuals to recreate the cohesion between the two narrations (acoustic and visual) as it existed in the original material.

Given the fact that visual channel cannot be manipulated, changed or altered in the AVT, the visuals enjoy natural superiority over the text, or as put by (Chaume, 1998): "In our texts the visual narration cannot be manipulated, so translators will have to find isotopic solutions in the verbal subtext, where they are allowed to manipulate." He stresses: "Audiovisual translators have to be conscious of the way cohesion operates between both narrations. Coherence in their final product has to be established by good use of the different cohesive elements that will give a definitive roundness to the translation. Translators must not forget that the visual narration is at the top of the hierarchy". His point can be better explained with examples from our case study in the later chapters.

In his paper, Textual Constraint, Chaume collects and classifies a wide range of possible constrained situations a translator is likely to face during the translation of AV material. He categorized these constraints into four sections as following:

- **1- Formal Constraints:** Formal constraints consist of different types of synchronizations, such as:
- <u>a- Lip synchronization</u>: matching between the lips' movement of the speaker on the screen and the target text read by the dubbing actor. The purpose is to make the audience feel

as if the speaker on the screen is uttering in the target language, or to minimize the gap between the visual and acoustic as much as possible, especially in short close-up shots.

<u>b- isochrony</u> (syllable synchrony): matching the length of translated utterances to the length of utterance by the speaker on the screen, from the instant they open their mouth to speak to the instant they shut.

<u>c- kinetic synchrony:</u> matching the target text to the movements, body language, and gestures done by the speakers on the screen, timely.

Generally, synchronization has been given way too much importance by the professionals in the past. It was considered the main measure of the quality of dubbed material. However, nowadays, synchronization is given a less predominant place by critics and professionals, with the emergence of other important factors. Chaume states that "any analysis of audiovisual translation mainly centered on synchronization is necessarily poor." (Chaume 1998). He suggests that the required level of synchronization may vary from one material to another, depending on the genre, audience expectations, and other elements. Chaume suggests that the translator should find solutions for these constraints in the verbal subtext.

- 2- Content constraints: Content synchrony is defined as "matching the semantic content of the original and dubbed script versions closely" (O'Connell, 2007). In other words, it is, according to Alkaadi, "related to a good translation or writing of the script into the target language" (Alkaadi, 2010). This type of constraints is seen when the process of translation comes with losses or changes in the meaning of the original text. It can be due to the restriction of synchrony that the translator needs to shorten a sentence or compromise a part of its meaning, as translations are commonly longer than their origins. It also can happen because of a wide cultural gap between the source and target culture, which requires the translator to tell or clarify more in his translation. It might happen during the changes after translation, by editors and adaptors. A common and most complained reason is the poor translation that results from a poor pay for professional translators, lack of training, and language incompetence.
- **3- Texture constraints:** refers to "those coming from the interaction between verbal and visual subtexts. The sum of both subtexts is something more than a mere sum total of two sets and depends on the use of certain cohesive resources which give the final product a distinct coherence" (Chaume, 1998). Therefore, the translator may need to add things which did not exist in the original text to fill the gaps and guarantee that both visual and verbal contents complete each other.

4- Semiotic constraints: those constraints coming from both the microsigns, like the symbolism of a specific color or object in a specific culture, and the macrosigns, like normative behaviors and generic constraints. (Chaume 1998). In these cases, the translator is supposed to decode these constraints, explain them smartly, within the area he can play in, the verbal narration.

These constraints pose serious issues to the smoothness of the translation process. Therefore, they require a high level of creativity and talent by the translator. They also allow the translator to manipulate and turn away slightly from the original text if that serves to create a coherent product.

In the fourth chapter, we will discuss some examples of these types of constraints from our case study and evaluate the translator's techniques of dealing with them. However, some dubbing issues and difficulties detected cannot be classified under any of the groups of Chaume's framework. Therefore, they will be presented as "challenges".

The next chapter will be focusing more on the theoretical and professional status of the AVT in the Arab World, as to introduce the non-Arab readers to some sociolinguistic features of Arabic language and the way they interact and affect the practice of AVT into Arabic.

CHAPTER 3: AUDIOVISUAL TRANSLATION IN THE

ARABIC SPHERE

This chapter gives a literature review of the academic research that dealt with the issues of audiovisual translation for the Arab audience, and dubbing into Arabic language. It also spots the light on some special characteristics of the Arabic language, and Arabic sociolinguistics, and the way they restrict and govern the audiovisual translational choices into Arabic. It also tracks the history of audiovisual translation into Arabic and analyses the established norms and the way they have changed and shifted throughout the history in alignment to changing factors.

Furthermore, it deliberately discusses the rise of the dubbed Turkish drama series in the Arab World, by putting this notion in its social, economic and cultural context. It also investigates the start of the journey of the Turkish dubbed drama in the Arab World, by interviewing the *O3 Productions*, known to be the architect of the big boom of Turkish drama in the Arab World. The interview reveals the pillars of this success story and discusses the recently emerging initial and operational norms, some of which are game-changers.

3.1. Literature Review

The field of Audiovisual Translation succeeded in gaining solid ground in academia in the last few years and presented itself as an interdisciplinary field with openness and interaction with the closely related Film and Cinema Studies, Sociology, Media and Cultural Studies. Recently, Audiovisual Translation entered some distinguished western universities as a specialized and distinctive program at the postgraduate level. Different conferences and publications are dedicated to understanding and developing this field by examining its linguistic, technical, and cultural reflections.

However, the Arabic academic sphere has not yet coped with the changes, with only a handful number of academic research to address this practice in the Arab World, despite its complexity that reflects the complexity of Arabic sociolinguistic scene. The majority of this literature comes as the fruits of academic study at western universities. While the University of Hamad Bin Khalifa in Doha-Qatar is the only academic institution in the Arab World that offers a Master degree in Audiovisual Translation. With the academic absence comes the

neglect of the field at a larger scale, with no specialized conferences, or authoritative translators' bodies in the Arab World to train practitioners or spread the general knowledge of the special treatment of AVT.

Moreover, there has been some uncertainty regarding the terminology of AVT in the Arabic language. While the term "al-tarjama al-sam'iyya al-baṣariyya" (audible visual translation) is the commonly used term in academia to refer to the field of AVT, no consensus has been reached yet in referring to other terms as voice over, voicing, subtitling and subtitler. The struggle with Arabic terminology seems to raise less concern than it is supposed to, as researchers tend to write their researches, papers and dissertations (including this one) in English, not Arabic. The dependency on the English terminology is still noticeable in the conferences and professional discussions.

Darwish in his paper, "Voice Translation between Acting and Communication in Arabic Satellite Television" (2006), introduces the term Voice Translation "al-tarjama al-ṣawtiyya" (voice translation) as a term to accommodate voicing and subtitling of any foreign language voice on TV channels. He states that he aims to clear the confusion of definitions and applications of modes of Voice Translation. However, he falls in the direct mistake of confusing the term "al-tanṣīṣ" (subtitling) with "al-tarjama al-naṣiyya" (textual translation). He keeps on using both the terms interchangeably throughout his paper. He also suggests the word "imtiṭā" (as in riding a horse) for the voice-over. However, the usage of the suggested term could not reach beyond his own paper, possibly due to its antiquated nature that makes it difficult to create a semantic connection with a modern technical term. Darwish's paper is restricted to AVT in documentaries and news shows, and it fails to present a wider view of the common practices of his time.

On the other hand, one of the comprehensive efforts to evaluate the Arabic literature on AVT is done by Gamal, in his papers "Audiovisual Translation in the Arab World: A Changing Scene" (2007), and "Audiovisual Translation in the Arab World: Mapping the Field" (2014) published in the Arab Media & Society Journal. Gamal gives a bird-eye view of the common practices of AVT in the Arab region, pointing out the strengths, norms, and gaps. He adopts a wide understanding of the concept of AVT, by accommodating websites' translation and online advertisements.

He points out the English-dominancy over AVT, which reflects in two ways; firstly, with the shortfall of studies in which English is not one of the pair of languages under discussion- a case witnessed worldwide, and very applicable to the Arabic production. Secondly, he points out the lack of studies on AVT from Arabic into English opposed to the

other way around. The latter carries great importance as a step to improve the quality of the less popular, and reluctant Arabic reproduction of audiovisual material in other languages.

The importance of Gamal's works lies in its inclusiveness and ability to reach the fault lines in the Arabic production and consumption of AVT, despite the regional or local differences. He points out the major hurdles in the research of AVT in the Arab world; such as the lack of AVT manuals, the issue of local dialects and lack of reception studies. Gamal dedicates most of his work to capturing the scenes of AVT in different Arab countries individually, like Egypt, Tunisia, Syria, Saudi Arabia, Lebanon, and Qatar. He also wrote for "Developing a Theoretical Framework for Audiovisual Translation in Egypt".

The majority of AVT academic papers and postgraduate researches tends to focus on minor issues in the audiovisual translation from English into Arabic, such as censorship policies, swear words, etc., and deals with the issue from a cultural or linguistic perspective.

"Issues in the Subtitling and Dubbing of English-Language Films into Arabic: Problems and Solutions" by Alkadi, is one of the good examples of such works (Alkadi, 2010). In his paper, he investigates the familiarity of AVT practitioners with translation models and theories. He also discusses the restriction of MSA as the sole choice for subtitling and its effect on the transfer of dialectical English utterances. His study discusses some practical issues such as censorship and humour. Finally, he dedicates a chapter to discuss whether dubbing can potentially replace subtitling, with satisfactory solutions to some obstacles like dialects transfer, humour, and swear words.

Alkadi brings to the surface the critical discussion of the usage of Modern Standard and Colloquial Arabic languages in audiovisual translation, as an issue specific and of high importance to the Arabic case. He also touches upon the boom of Turkish drama series in the Arab World.

The boom of Turkish drama in the Arab World has been discussed widely on TV channels, news and articles. However, no academic dissertation has yet been written to discuss this matter inclusively. Or as Abdulkadir Abdelli -one of the brightest literary and drama translators from Turkish into Arabic- puts it "the broadcast of the first couple of (dubbed Turkish drama series on Arabic channels), created a huge bustle in the major Arab news channels like Aljazeera and Alarabiya. Many related articles have been written based on the author's subjective views. None of which reflected a prior knowledge of the matter. Despite the unprofessional nature of most of these writings, they attracted bigger attention from the Arab audiences" (Suçin, 2018).

3.2. Audiovisual Practice in the Arab World

As for the practical field of AVT in the Arab World, it is quite difficult to trace the development of AVT in the region, due to the restricted amount of literature written in this regard. However, it can be said that Arabic speaking countries used to be classified as mere "subtitlers", before the late emergence of dubbing into Arabic, which came into reality with many hurdles on the way in the early 1970s. Tracing back the history of dubbing in the Arab countries, Maluf states that the very first media dubbing experiment was done in 1963 by a Lebanese radio production house *Al Ittihhad al Fanni*, for *Radio Liban*, as an adapted voice over for BBC radio episode Jane Eyre (Maluf, 2005). The success of the project was "modest", as described by the producers. This experience shares some elements with AVT in its modern definition but still falls short of being a proper example, due to the lack of visual content in the radio medium.

Later on, the practice shifted to the television screen, with the dubbing of children cartoon series, *Sindibad* (1974), and *Zena W Nahoul* (1975). The production house *Filmali*, based in Lebanon, dubbed the cartoon movies into Modern Standard Arabic, which proved to be the ideal choice, for educational reasons and more acceptability and proliferation in the market. The success of these examples led eventually to dubbing more cartoon movies and established for the norm of dubbing cartoon series and children programs into Modern Standard Arabic.

It is understandable how cartoons can naturally pave the way for the start of dubbing as an acceptable practice in the AV market. Children-oriented materials are based on common basic themes with less challenging cultural elements for the translator, and a lower level of lip-synchrony required due to the nature of pictures and easiness of satisfying the little audiences. These factors played an important role for an easy successful start for dubbing.

In 1991, the same production house, *Filmali*, dubbed the first Mexican drama series into Modern Standard Arabic, to be broadcasted at the private Lebanese Broadcast Corporation (LBC). The series was a hit that led to the start of a new trend of Mexican and Brazilian drama series in the Arabic speaking countries, with the dubbing of 11 series in 8 years. Most of these series share the same theme of love and romance in a relatively conservative or bearable environment for the Arab audience. In the later years, the trend started to fade, as the audience started to grow tired of the irony of hearing Standard Arabic from the mouths of characters carrying ridiculously foreign names. This era waved farewell to AV audience, leaving a heritage of too many jokes and funny remarks about this irony.

Many attempts to utilize the success of dubbed Latin American series and extend the practice to American Hollywood movies and series failed to gain acceptance, especially in action movies. Although dubbing is advantageous to action movies as it frees the viewers' eyes from sticking to the subtitles and allows a better follow of the speedy events on the screen, it contradicted the norm and seemed as if it is forcing the Arabic identity on the unfamiliar genre. Or as said by Nicholas Abou Samah, the pioneer of video dubbing in *Filmali*: "Arab heroes do not use curse words. They don't jump on a moving train, slide down a window and machinegun 10 criminals." (Maluf, 2005).

That is why Alkadi believes in the relationship between the genre of AV material and its dub-ability into Standard Arabic. He stresses that:

Dubbing into Arabic, especially Standard, may have more to offer with history, social and romantic plots. The reason is that such genres may sometimes have common ground with Arab culture and may sound more realistic than action films especially that they talk about human relations (hatred, love, envy, etc.). Therefore, when such characters speak Arabic, they sound acceptable and convincing. This could be one of the reasons for the success of Mexican and, nowadays, Turkish romantic soap operas dubbed into Arabic. (Alkadi, 2010)

He supports his point with examples of success stories of some historical movies dubbed into Standard Arabic, such as Kingdom of Heaven (2005), Brave Heart (1995), Lord of the Rings (2001), Troy, etc. It is worth mentioning that throughout the history of Arabic drama production, the usage of Modern Standard Arabic was restricted to historical movies, such as *Al-risāla*, *Rabī* '*Qurṭuba*, '*Umar bin al-Khaṭṭāb*. Therefore, Arab audience feel more familiar with standard Arabic on screen in such context. This fact explains the success of dubbed historical drama into MSA and comes to support Alkadi's point of view.

The world of dubbing in the Arab speaking countries continued to flourish in cartoon movies and children programs while fading in other genres. As production houses refrained from dubbing to avoid the MSA, as such dubbing products turned -with the passage of time-into a laughing stock for the audience.

However, a turning point occurred in 2006, with an unprecedented notion of dubbing Turkish drama series into Syrian dialect, which came as an escape from the old dilemma. The following section will investigate deeply the start and success factors in this notion.

The success of Turkish drama series dubbed into Syrian dialect opened the doors for producers and TV channels to invest in more dubbed audiovisual material into local dialects. Within few years, we witnessed the rise of Bollywood movies dubbed into Syrian and sometimes Kuwaiti and other dialects. This comes in addition to dubbing some cartoon series and Turkish comedy series into Egyptian dialect.

The notion of Korean movies and drama series started at a later stage. They appeared both subtitled and dubbed to Syrian dialect and MSA, respectively.

However, none of the dubbing pairs mentioned above received the celebration and liking the Turkish drama-Syrian dialect pair has received. Most of the audience refers to the cultural gap between the source language and dubbing dialect when asked to explain their preference.

The following section investigates deeply the reasons behind the failures and successes witnessed in the Arabic journey of Audiovisual Translation as well as the formation of norms.

3.3. Analysis of AVT Norms in the Arab World

The changes in the Arabic audiovisual translation journey in the last decades show two main dilemmas continuously governing the choice of translation mode and final production. These two dilemmas are; weighing the options between subtitling and dubbing, and the restrictions of MSA and colloquial dialects. The norms of AVT in the Arab World is studied under the light of these two dilemmas.

Dubbing vs. Subtitling in the Arabic Audiovisual Production

Talking of translation policies and norms, it is impossible to avoid the classical question of dubbing versus subtitling, which is the topic of many academic types of research in the last decades.

In his paper titled "The Turn of Audiovisual Translation. New Audiences and Strategies", Chaume tracks the latest changes and developments in the AVT market and the shifts between dubbing and subtitling. He argues that "Dubbing countries are moving towards subtitling, subtitling countries are beginning to dub...", before he reaches a conclusion that "The simple classification of countries into dubbers and subtitlers has been a useful but superficial description, it no longer reflects today's more complicated audiovisual reality". (Chaume, 2013)

This is very true in the Arabic case, as explained in the previous section; dubbing entered the audiovisual translation production in the Arab World known traditionally as a "subtitler". However, both practices are subject to different factors related to the special

characteristics of the Arabic language and Arabic cultures. This section aims to explain these factors.

It is important here to remind that the usage of MSA on screens is mostly restricted to news programs, documentaries and children programs, as well as the historical drama series. Local dialects are used in the production of local movies, drama series, and tv shows. MSA is mostly absent from the normal daily-life, except in formal situations and settings. However, people can easily speak, understand and communicate in standard Arabic, as it is the language of literature and educational system in most Arab countries. On the other hand, Arabs from different geographical regions might have a problem understanding other dialects of relatively far regions, especially if that dialect is of a lower cultural effect on the Arab region.

Therefore, the maximum localization can be achieved when the audiovisual material is translated into the local dialects. However, in the case of subtitling, this proves to be impossible. Karamitroglou argued that dialects, which have not already appeared in a written form in printed materials, cannot be allowed to be used in subtitles (Karamitroglou, 1998). The reason is that dialects, which are rarely seen in written form, cannot be visually recognized and read easily.

Therefore, the only Arabic language version used in subtitling is Modern Standard Arabic, as spoken dialects and expressions have not gained acceptance in the written form, but rather mostly seen as threats to the purity of Arabic tongue. Therefore, the usage of Arabic dialects in subtitling is completely invalid and out of question.

It is significant how production houses in the Arab world seem to have made their stance clear regarding the subtitling of English movies and drama series. Almost all the English language movies and TV series are screened subtitled in MSA on the main Arabic TV channels. Keeping the original soundtracks untouched, the producers could meet their audiences' preference to enjoy the artistic nature of the work and utilize the fun time for language acquisition. Wide range of Arab audiences does not feel the need to look at the subtitles due to their proficiency in English, as a second language. It is also true to say that the high rate of English proficiency in the Arab World could not have been possible without the sustainability of subtitling as a mode of translation of English audiovisuals on most TV channels.

English movies and drama series attract the most sophisticated audience who are likely to be more critical, demanding and difficult to satisfy with dubbing, in terms of lipsynchrony and character synchrony.

On the other hand, "A further significant trend is noted in the dubbing of Latin American and Turkish soap operas in subtitling countries such as Greece, Morocco, Egypt, Jordan, and other North African countries. In the Arab-speaking countries and Greece, the first dubbed versions of this highly popular genre immediately put these soaps at the top of the audience share ratings, indicating that maybe dubbing has an economic future in these countries". (Chaume, 2013)

In fact, the situation is not as complex as it seems. English language is familiar to the Arab ear, as a second spoken and desired language, while Turkish and Brazilian soundtracks (Indian and Korean later) are to add more foreignness to the final product.

Known for its lengthy nature and romantic plots, the Turkish drama series attract more attention within the female and teenager audiences who are more likely to prefer the convenience of dubbing and value the smoothness of dialogue over other elements. Or as put by Diaz Centaz, about the popularity of dubbing in Greece (1999): "The innovation (dubbing) was extremely popular among housewives who could carry on with their chores and follow the plot on the screen without having to be stuck to the television set in order to read the linguistic exchange".

However, the tendency towards dubbing of Turkish drama seems to have come from even a deeper root; It is the golden opportunity to utilize the cultural and linguistic elements shared between Turkish and spoken Syrian Arabic -discussed in the next section- and which can be reflected only in the audible form. Therefore, choosing to present the work in the Syrian dialect means, by default, choosing to dub over subtitling as the mode of translation. This point will be discussed further in the next section.

Modern Standard Arabic vs. Syrian Dialect for Dubbing Turkish Drama

As a result of a centuries-long interaction between Turks and Arabs, many linguistic and cultural elements have kept transferring and moving back and forth between Turkish and Arabic. Common proverbs, expressions, social concepts, and behavior patterns are obviously noticeable for people of both nations at every level of interaction nowadays.

These similarities preserve their presence highly in the spoken dialects of the relatively close geographical region primarily (Syria, Iraq) as well as Egypt, the cultural center of the Arab world in the last centuries. This reality showed itself as an ideal opportunity for the AV translators to render the dialogues easily into realistic, localized, and natural dialogues that fit in the target culture, more effortlessly.

As Anderman suggests in his paper, Drama Translation: "The availability of a particular dialect in the TL may also provide a welcome opportunity for a successful transfer of sociolects in the SL text, which are normally difficult to capture in translation." (Anderman, 2012). This is the case in the dubbing into Syrian dialect, which has no problem rendering the act of a women knocking on the (wooden) table to express her liking of something/someone and protect them from the evil eye, nor the request of another woman to do so, as this cultural expression is available in both Turkish and Syrian cultures. Such similarities are of higher value if they already reflect on both the visual and audible channels of the AV material. Thus, the translator can easily escape a possible contradiction between visuals and translation. Such events might attract the attention of the audience, and make the final product more familiar and belonging.

More examples of cultural, linguistic and dialectical similarities will be shown in the coming sections.

The massive success and popularity of first examples of Turkish drama series dubbed into Syrian Arabic, upgraded this choice into an established norm. Later, other works were dubbed in Moroccan dialect but stayed restricted to the Moroccan local TV channels and failed to gain popularity and acceptance in the wider Arab audience pool.

Syrian dialect continued enjoying its superiority due to many reasons. First is the long history of Syrian drama production and its upper hand in the Arab world, and the resulted familiarity of the dialect to almost all Arabs due to the popularity of the Syrian drama production. Second is the initiative of the Syrian production houses that pioneered and entered this field.

To be precise, the massive success of dubbed Turkish Drama series in the Arab World is not a coincidence or an expected event of luck. It can be rather described as a result of the deliberate study of the market and a group of smart strategic decisions, which will be discussed in the coming section.

3.4 The Rise of Dubbed Turkish Drama Series in Arabic Media

To study the first spark and beginning of the journey of Turkish drama in the Arab World, I have interviewed Mr. Daniel Abdulfattah, a previous regional director of the *O3 Productions*, which introduces itself as the "first company in the world to introduce Turkish drama outside its homeland and into the Arab territories" (Abdulfattah, 2018). *O3*

Productions has three offices in Dubai, Istanbul, and Cairo. The interview with Abdulfattah was held in Ankara-Turkey.

Based on its study of the viewers' taste and preferences, the Middle East Broadcasting Center (MBC), known as the largest and most influential private media empire in the Middle East & North Africa (MENA) region, decided in 2006 to produce dubbed Turkish Drama series in collaboration with Sama Productions and *O3 Productions* and screen them on its main channel MBC1.

The decision came at a time when Arabic drama production, especially Egyptian, was witnessing a decline, due to the repetitiveness of scenarios and plots, lack of creativity and novelty. The Arabic production at that time can be described as too down to earth for an audience longing for something new, fresh, and fairytale-like. The political and economic tensions in the Arab World gave more realism and gloom to the Arabic drama production, while ironically intensified the audiences' need for an escape from the harsh reality. This gap between audience expectations and Arabic production led MBC to think outside the box.

Another crucial factor that directed MBC to this decision is the financial element. Lately, the Arabic drama production witnessed a massive rise in expenses and suffered from a severe imbalance in the budget distribution. In some cases, more than 50% of the whole production budget used to go for buying the main star actor/actress, which is a critically high rate. The explosive increase of satellite channels number heated up the battle between TV channels to catch up higher ratings and larger folks, especially in the high drama season, the month of Ramadhan. Arabic drama production was growing to be strictly season-based, with dozens of 30-episodes drama series flooding satellite channels during Ramadhan, and then repeated endlessly throughout the year with lower value of advertisements and rates (Abdulfattah, 2018).

On the other hand, the Turkish drama series' copyrights were irresistible with a cost next to nothing. The first deal between MBC and Turkish production house, Avşar, was a package of 18 drama series and around 20 movies, which sounds like a very brave step form MBC in invest in such a big chunk of work in the start. However, asked about the risk factor in the deal, Abdulfattah stressed that the deal was purely risk-free. He mentioned that the whole package consisting of about 2000 episodes costed no more than 105 thousand dollars, less than the cost of one drama episode in Turkey nowadays.

The financial element is also stressed by Abdelli who confirms that the "team was having no other goal but reaching their financial ambitions" (Suçin,2018). It can be said that

MBC took the Turkish drama as a highly fruitful and profitable business and was determined to make it a new success story.

Alexandra Buccianti shares the same vision: "The mastermind behind this phenomenon has been the MBC (Middle East Broadcasting Center) media empire, a combination of Saudi capital and Middle Eastern know-how, and a success story that started in the 1990s with the birth of a private Arab media field". (Buccianti 2010)

The first dubbed drama series screened on MBC Çemberimde Gül Oya {Iklīl alward} in 2008, did not create the expected boom, which led the channel to work more on the marketing and presentation. The second and third series; İhlamurlar Altında {Sanawāt aldhayā'} and Gümüş {Nūr w Muhannad} can be called a real hit. Despite the lack of rating figures, we can say that these two drama series gained massive popularity and became the talk of every common person in the street. It is reported that many cities and capitals of the Arab world were deserted during the show time. MBC sustained the success of this trend with tens of other dubbed Turkish drama series in the following years. It is worth mentioning that by the time of screening the first dubbed Turkish series, six other series were fully dubbed and ready to meet their audience on MBC channels, according to Abdulfattah.

In the following years, the popularity of Turkish drama attracted other Arabic TV channels, like Dubai TV, and Rotana TV. The competition started between Arabic channels to buy the best Turkish drama production, which raised the costs of copyrights, so steadily.

Most critics attribute the success of the Turkish drama in the Arab World to the usage of Syrian dialect. This decision was suggested by the well-known Syrian producer and owner of Sama Productions Adib Khaer. On Sama Art Productions website, Adib Khaer is introduced as "A key player and a pioneer in the dubbing field" as he "introduced new trends in dubbing to the region, especially with the Syrian dialect that became widely popular in the Middle East region." The idea behind this decision was to preserve the natural entertaining and light mode of the language of drama, according to Abdulfattah. Syrian dialect was already growing in popularity with the rise of Syrian drama series as a competitor to Egyptian drama. Abdelli confirms that "in 2004, the young engineer and TV producer Adib Khaer proposed his project of dubbing Turkish drama series to MBC channel. His target was profitable. He wanted to benefit from the success of Syrian drama and the popularity of modified Syrian dialect". He adds: "MSA in non-historical drama plots was a barrier between the audience and the work. While the popularity of Syrian dialect encouraged this tendency" (Suçin, 2010).

However, it cannot be said that Syrian dialect is the sole reason behind the popularity of Turkish drama. When asked about the reasons, Abdulfattah pointed out the critical role played by the influential MBC group in reshaping and directing the taste of the viewers, and creating a public opinion in favor of the new trend. While the first screened drama series *Çemberimde Gül Oya* went unnoticed, MBC realized the need for better marketing campaigns and presentations and started connecting the famous stars of Turkish drama with the Arab World through visits, tours, and interviews, etc.

This is not to deny that the Arab audience liked the Turkish drama for the very essence of its own characteristics. Abdulfattah, elaborates on this point in a previous interview:

Many elements added to the success of Turkish drama in the Arab world, such as the shared values between the Turkish and Arabic societies, the appealing Turkish music, the beautiful sceneries, and different video shooting techniques. Add to this that Turkey was the center of attraction in the Middle East, especially in terms of media and culture. Arab audiences loved Turkish drama as it was a new discovery. The beauty of sceneries, beautiful lady actresses, handsome actors, magnificent palaces and luxurious commercial areas all added to the attraction of Turkish drama in the eyes of Arabs. Another important element is the closeness in terms of culture and society structure. As in Turkey, you can see mosques, ladies wearing headscarves, and many other cultural elements similar to those in the Arab speaking countries. In Turkish drama, you can also see similar cultural traditions and religious rituals, like *Ramadhan* and *Eid-Adha*. (Abdulfattah, 2018).

Some might add that the shared history and recent political factors played a role in creating curiosity around Turkey. The rise of the Justice and Development Party, known for its Islamic and conservative background, evoked curiosity about Turkey in terms of society and culture. This raised more questions, and captured the attention of both the intellectuals and the commoners. The notion of Turkish drama brought again to the surface the old debates of Turkish-Arabic shared history and traditions, the issue of national states and Islamic caliphates.

Some see the Turkish drama series craze in the Arab World as a tool of a wider "soft power" strategy to influence the Arab public opinion and open the door for Turkey to play a more active role in the Middle East region. The notion of dubbed drama series is harshly criticized by Syrian journalists at most, according to Abdelli. Some accused those behind the Turkish dubbed drama to be agents of the enemies of the Arabic Ummah, or trying to spoil the Arabic taste, or distort the Arabic and Islamic culture (Suçin, 2018).

Later on, the political influence on the Turkish drama took a different turn. In 2013, several Egyptian TV channels launched boycott on Turkish drama series, to protest against the Turkish stance opposing the military coup in Egypt, against Mohammed Morsi. Channels

like AlHayah, Al-Nahar, Al Kahera Wal Nas stopped airing Turkish drama series and justified this move by the need to "put some pressure on Ankara". Egyptian channels did not deny that the step was costly and can result in "huge losses" for them. (McArthur, 2013).

Later on, and amidst the high political tension between Turkey and some Gulf States, led by UAE and Saudi Arabia, MBC channel decided to stop airing the Turkish drama series, and deleted all the relevant content from its websites, in a sudden and unexpected move. The tension that escalated due to the split of positions on the Muslim Brotherhood and Arab Spring is seen as the reason behind the boycott, although not announced officially.

This comes as a good example of how the extraliterary factors, as named by Even-Zohar, play a vital role in the issue of selecting translation projects and deciding what to be and not to be translated. The changing conditions of target culture Polysystem decide the centrality and desirability of a translated work.

When asked about the process of dubbing and production in *O3 Productions*, Abdulfattah said that a group of five to six translators used to work on translating one project (drama series). Translators used to work in-bound, and translate directly from the video, without dealing with a written transcript of scenario in the original language. The workload distribution of the translation material between translators was based mostly on the distribution of characters. As every translator used to translate one or few characters to maintain the same tone of the character throughout the project. Translators were asked to adjust their translation to guarantee the highest level of lip-synchronization.

The translated text then goes through editing and proofreading process, along with scenario adjustments, if needed. Scenarists used to express their opinions regarding the evolvement of events in the series and suggest minor changes in the dialogues to create better consistency in the characters and better coherence and cohesion in the storyline. Abdulfattah claims that the changes undergone for Mehmet's character in *Gümüş* can be taken as a case study, in this regard. The purpose of these changes is to align the characters' behavior with the expectations of the Arab audience.

Prominent roles in the drama series used to be given to famous and talented Syrian actors for dubbing, which gave the dubbed version a professional dimension and localized cinematic effect.

CHAPTER 4: THE CASE STUDY (YEDİ GÜZEL ADAM)

Building on the accumulated knowledge from the previous chapters, this chapter studies the dubbing constraints and challenges, and evaluates the translator's decisions and techniques. It starts with identifying the source material and the motives behind selecting it for dubbing. Based on that, it assesses the quality of the final product, and questions its ability to fulfill the purpose of production.

4.1. About Yedi Güzel Adam

Yedi Güzel Adam (Seven Good Men) is a Turkish TV series, produced by Pusula Film in 2014 for TRT1, the first national Turkish television channel, founded in 1968. TRT (Turkish Radio and Television Cooperation) is an official entity that is currently linked to the Presidential Communication Department. Therefore, it represents the official media face of the country, through its political, ideological, and cultural alignments. TRT aims to "enhance and develop the national culture and education" within Turkey and "introduce the country and state in every field to the world through the international broadcast" as stated on its website.

Yedi Güzel Adam comes in 39 episodes in two seasons. Each episode is around 100 minutes long. The story of the series is inspired by the real story of seven Turkish poets and figures of the modern Turkish literature. Those characters are presented in the drama series with their real names to introduce their life and love for literature to the audience. TRT1 introduces the series on its website as follows:

"Yedi Güzel Adam tells the story of great-hearted poets who got to meet in a Kahramanmaraş college in the 1950s and never departed since then. The series that spots the light on the life events in the 1970s takes its name from the term introduced by Cahit Zarifoğlu in a poem that carries the same title. This series introduces the audience with these poets and their firm stance in life. It shows the audience how poems are revived in the lives of their poets. Basically, this series introduces the Yedi Güzel Adam who shined like stars in their era and allows the new generation to meet with that critical era and its literature, culture, and ideology".

The referred *Yedi Güzel Adam* (Seven Good Men) are a group of Turkish poets, writers, and intellectuals known for their Islamic conservative yet revolutionary school of thought. They advocated for a reconciliation with the Islamic heritage deeply rooted in the Ottoman Islamic history of the nation under what is considered strict secularism in the

Turkish Republic then. However, they were known for their moderate stance during the political instability and street violence that took over the country in the 1970s, due to the conflicts between the left and right wings, and military coups.

TRT1 summarizes the story of *Yedi Güzel Adam* within its political and ideological context, as tensions escalated during that time. It stresses: "they decided to fight with their pens against the events of the conspiracy that led to the execution of Adnan Menderes, the prime minister then", known for his conservative school of thought, and "they struggled against the transformation of the political crisis in the country into an armed conflict. Erdem, Cahit and Zehra tried to keep their students away from the events in an environment where political views evoked violence in high schools".

Although *Yedi Güzel Adam* is controversial as a term with no specific source to tell us the names of those seven poets referred to by Zarifoğlu in his poem. Most sources include Erdam Bayazıt (Uraz Kaygılaroğlu), Cahit Zarifoğlu (Baran Akbulut), Rasim Özdenören (Mertcan Sevimli), Nuri Pakdil (Kemal Uçar), and Alaadin Özdenören (Orhan Kanalp) in the term. Drama-oriented sources add Ali Kutlay (Çağtaş Tekin) and Sait Zarifoğlu (Fatih Murat Teke), with respect to other famous literary figures who had less appearance in the series, like Sezai Karakoç (Fatih Murat Teke), Necip Fazıl Kısakürek (Kenan Bal), and Akif İnan (Yiğit Çakır).

As mentioned before, all the literature figures are represented in the drama series with their real names. The characters were designed to resemble the real figures in terms of their personality traits. During the gala organized before the first screening of the series, which was attended by the Minister of Culture and Tourism then, Ömer Çelik, TRT General Director, İbrahim Şahin, stressed that the series should introduce these poets and carry a beneficial value to the public.

The presence of these literary figures in the series, and their vital role in the Turkish modern literature and their rich production are not the only reasons to describe the drama series as a "heavily literature-loaded" one. Rather it is the employment of literary quotations and poem verses that are nested in the normal dialogues between characters in every episode that made the *Yedi Güzel Adam* a unique type of production. It is a rare example of how literature can be merging in the conversations of our daily life and yet sound so natural. It also shows how literature can possibly function and be gelled in a different type of entertainment material in mass media, like drama series.

This technique allows the audience to experience and taste literature -like never before- as a living being, a production of the moment, and within a known context. Whether the literary works quoted are easily recognized by the audience or not, the effect it has on the overall atmosphere of the series is undeniable.

Trying to draw the fine line between fact and fiction, I interviewed the Turkish writer Rasim Özdenören, in his house in Ankara. He confirmed that TRT contacted him before launching the project, which was meant to be a documentary film picturing the life of Erdem Bayazıt (Özdenören, 2017). On a later stage, the producers decided to change the project from a documentary into a drama series, wishing to attract and involve a wider range of audience. Özdenören expressed his disappointment about the series. He argued that it does not reflect his life truthfully. He pointed out some chronological errors occurred in the events of the story and claimed that he lost interest in watching the series after the first couple of episodes.

Özdenören celebrated the success of *Yedi Güzel Adam* but stressed that it should be taken as a mere work of fiction and drama, and not as a representation of the lives of him and his fellow poets and writers.

Moreover, Özdenören was not informed about the translation of this work into Arabic. He said that TRT did not contact him regarding the matter, and he was shocked to hear from us about the dubbed version after years of screening it on *TRT El Arabia*. He also expressed his doubts regarding the quality of the translation of literary texts and poems used in the drama series. When asked if he expected TRT to contact him and other fellow poets and writers to guarantee the translation quality of literary quotations, he complained that his contact with TRT occurred only once during the whole course of production of the drama, some of his suggestions and objections related to the series were not taken into consideration. However, the drama series in its original Turkish version starts with the sentence "*Nuri Pakdil ve Rasim Özdenören Değerli Katkılarıyla*" means: "with appreciation to the contribution of Nuri Pakdil and Rasim Özdenören".

Two years after the drama series was viewed on TRT1 Channel, the *TRT El Arabia* (a sister channel) started screening the Arabic dubbed version of the drama series. However, the decision to present the work to the Arab audience was not abrupt. The General Manager of TRT Group then, İbrahim Şahin, is quoted in 2014, questioning the profitability of selling the work to the Arab World. In 2016, *Sab 'at Tayyibūn* was finally on screens for Arab audiences. The work is not translated to any other language or screened on any other channel apart from TRT, as to our knowledge so far.

4.2. Analysis of Norms and Process of Dubbing in Yedi Güzel Adam

This section deals with the preliminary norms adopted by the production house *Seyr Ajans* to produce the dubbed version of *Yedi Güzel Adam*, for the *TRT El Arabia* channel. The information in this section is based on an interview with Badreddin Dabbağoğlu, the Director of the Arabic division in *Seyr Ajans*, which has undertaken the translation and dubbing of *Yedi Güzel Adam* into Arabic (Dabbağoğlu, 2018).

Discussing the preliminary norms, it is beneficial to start by introducing the initiator of this translation project, *TRT El Arabia*. In 2010, the TRT group launched its Arabic TV channel to address over 350 million viewers in the Arab World. The channel dedicates its full time to introducing Turkey in terms of culture, history, politics, traditions, arts, etc., to the Arab audiences. The nature of its programs varies between news shows, documentaries, dubbed and translated Turkish drama series, and entertainment programs.

Drama series constitutes an important part of *TRT El Arabia*'s streaming. Most of the drama series selected for dubbing for the Arabic channel is originally produced for TRT and owned by the group in the first place. One of the main production houses in coordination with *TRT El Arabia* is *Seyr Ajans*, which carries out 80% of *TRT El Arabia*'s dubbing production.

Seyr Ajans introduces itself as an "agency for dubbing and production services". It was established in 2009, and has its head office in Ankara, along with two other branches in Syria and Egypt. It provides dubbing and production services in different languages, with a wide network of translators and voice actors.

The purpose of the interview with Dabbağoğlu was to investigate the initial norms that governed the course of production of $Sab'at\ Tayyib\bar{u}n$, the dubbed version of $Yedi\ G\ddot{u}zel\ Adam$.

Starting from the choice of work to be dubbed, Badreddin said that *TRT El Arabia* is mostly interested in presenting the Arab audience with drama series that carry two special characteristics; (1) conservative; to show the conservative face of the country which appeals the Arab audience, and (2) introductory to Turkey, either from cultural or historical aspect. *TRT El Arabia* suggests some projects for dubbing and discusses with *Seyr Ajans* the latter's suggestions and recommendations for projects that suit the Arabs' taste and preference. However, the choice must not go beyond the two mentioned constraints.

While TRT El Arabia prefers the conservative set of values, family bonds and historical events in its production for Arab audiences, other channels like MBC select more westernized, modern production, sometimes with sexually charged scenes. Despite the

objecting voices that raise amongst the conservative segment of the Arab societies, this type of drama attracted more attention and raised the roof for the local Arabic production as well.

TRT El Arabia is said to be highly selective regarding what to broadcast for its Arab viewers. As in some cases, it refuses to present the Arab audiences some of its own programs and drama series which were originally made for the Turkish channels. The dubbing of Yedi Güzel Adam was suggested by Seyr Ajans and accepted by TRT El Arabia channel.

TRT El Arabia gives Seyr Ajans a brief guideline regarding the language of transfer, mostly Syrian dialect for modern drama series. No more conditions or instructions are given to the agency, as the long experience between both parties made the conventions predictable for Seyr Ajans. This applies to the usage of terms in controversial issues, as Seyr Ajans adopted to align with the channel's policies, and the wider country's policies, known to those who are in the field, although never written in manuals.

The need for censorship is very minimal, as the projects are selected carefully to be conservative in nature and suitable for the target culture contentually. No censorship occurred in the dubbing of *Yedi Güzel Adam*, as confirmed by *Seyr Ajans*. However, in some other drama series, censorship of politically charged dialogues occurred in few scenes.

Generally, the process of translating and dubbing goes as following; TRT sends the audiovisual material to *Seyr Ajans* office in Ankara, which employs freelance transcribers to fully transcribe the dialogues in the Turkish language. The transcript is then sent to a freelance translation director, based in Istanbul, who distributes the load of work between five to six freelance translators within a network of translators, based in Istanbul. The freelance translators do their translation tasks separately, based on the transcript. Then their translations are collected by the translation director and sent back to Seyr offices in Ankara. *Seyr Ajans* does not deny that in some projects, the transcript is solely sent to translators, without the visual material. Seyr Ajans confirms that this is how the process is carried out for most of its documentary programs and denied further knowledge about the way the work is carried out in Syria branch.

The dubbing of drama series, especially in the Syrian dialect, is carried out at the agency's office in Syria. The whole process of editing, synchronization is carried out in Syria, where a whole team of voice actors and editors is based. *Seyr Ajans* selects the dubbing actors from a wide pool of actors. A program is used to match the voices of dubbing actors with the original actors seen on screen. Finally, the final product is sent back to their office in Ankara.

After the project is sent to *TRT El Arabia*, it goes through linguistic and technical supervision, to make sure that the final product is free of errors and mistakes, both in terms of language and presentation.

Hoping to obtain more information about the dubbing process in Syria offices, we tried to reach the contact information of the translation director or translators of the drama series under study. However, reaching the translation team was not possible, even with the help of the production agency. The name of the translator appears as Nafn al-Ūbrī in the closing credits. It is not known for us whether it is a proper name or a nickname of the translator.

It is no exaggeration to say that the process of dubbing is far from being ideal. While the ideal environment for dubbing is that which guarantee the highest level of interaction and cooperation between its components, the picture drawn above seems too geographically scattered to produce qualitative and competitive dubbing. As both, depending on freelance translators who have no opportunity to meet each other, and the geographical barrier between translators and quality assessment department make it impossible to talk about interactive teamwork.

Regarding the feedback related to translation and dubbing quality, *Seyr Ajans* pointed out the difficulty of measuring viewers' satisfaction with the dubbed material. This comes due to the lack of direct contact between the production house and the audience, who mostly do not associate what they watch with the name of the dubbing house, nor they care about the technicalities of the work. *Seyr Ajans* also claimed that the unavailability of their work on social media and Youtube prevents them from reaching audiences' comments and remarks.

4.3 Analysis of Dubbing Constraints in Yedi Güzel Adam

In this section, we will explore the dubbing constraints to evaluate the translator's decisions and their effect on the quality of the final product. This section is based on Chaume's model of textual constraints. Chaume's framework focuses on the interaction between visual and verbal modes, the most critical point that makes audiovisual translation different from other types.

1- Formal Constraints

Being the clearest and most noticeable element in determining the quality of dubbing, in the eyes of the viewers, synchrony carries an important weight for dubbing houses as much

as for the audience. Nothing is more annoying than watching a dubbed audiovisual material where the audio mismatches the visuals. Therefore, finding good solutions to guarantee good lip-sync and kinetic synchrony is of vital importance for the production houses working in this field.

Seyr Ajans, like many Arab production houses, use "Tazmeen System" for synchronization. It is a complex program, designed by the Syrian producer Nabeel AlDakkak, in 2006, to be used by dubbing studios and dubbing actors. The idea of this program is to replace the printed scripts with a script on the screen (can be called smart subtitles), where the dubbing actor can both read his line and see the visuals on screen, most importantly the body gestures and lip movements of the original character. Therefore, the program helps the dubbing actor to adjust his reading to suit the visuals much more than the old techniques of reading from a paper or repeating after a second dubbing actor.

We can refer to the script on screen as "smart subtitle" because it gives dubbing actors a notification on when to start reading their line, and how fast they need to go. This keeps the process of recording the audio in a flow and allows higher accuracy in the synchronization. It also helps both the dubbing actors and dubbing director to accurately detect when the sentence needs to be shortened or lengthened to fit the original, with special time indicator for that purpose.

The system is said to be a great time-saver. It can save four times the production time compared to the traditional ways. However, it is important to clarify that smart subtitling is only one component of the program. Other components can manage the whole course of dubbing production, by giving a report about the number of characters and voices appearing in the original material whether a film or lengthy drama series and the length of each character's role. This is of vital importance for distributing the roles between the dubbing actors and managing the whole course of production without the need of going through the whole work in the start.

a- Lip Synchrony

It is never possible to achieve perfect synchronization in dubbing between two languages carrying two different phonetic systems. Therefore, the established norm is to pay special attention to the lip-synchrony in short-shots and close-up scenes. Luckily, such scenes are obviously rare in *Yedi Güzel Adam*. Lip synchrony is of vital importance for the word that is pronounced separately and not within a long utterance, for instance; the names of characters (especially when vowels are prolonged for calling) and some basic words like, yes,

Thus, characters' names are mostly replaced with Arabic names that sound no, etc.

phonetically similar. This trick is a lifesaver for dubbers when these names are uttered

separately or not within a longer utterance.

As many common Turkish names are of Arabic origins, many names in Yedi Güzel

Adam are common and kept the same, such as a Karim, Zehra, and Emine. On the other hand,

the name of the main character, Erdem, is kept the same, despite its nonexistence in Arabic,

while Kahraman, a name of no existence in Arabic, is changed to Omran. Partially similar

names, like Cahit, although not used much in Arabic, are also kept without change.

Unexpectedly, another partially similar name, Rasim is changed into Basim. This

leads us to think that translating names in Yedi Güzel Adam is not dealt with systematically

nor with much attention. Especially that the characters represent real Turkish authors and

poets. Changing the name of Rasim Özdenören to Basim is both misleading and unnecessary.

Another element in Yedi Güzel Adam poses a big challenge for lip-synchronization;

the stuttering character, Kahraman or 'Imrān in the dubbed version. Kahraman is a student

with a speech disorder and difficulty pronouncing the initial sounds of some words. A lot of

focus is put on his problem and the way it affects his social life. He is called Kekec, the

stuttering, by some of his peers. In some scenes, he is stuck for a few seconds trying to

pronounce a sound. And as the viewer is focusing on Kahraman's efforts to create a sound,

the movements of his lips and mouth are top priorities in the scene. Therefore, the translator

and dubbing actor need to guarantee the highest level of lip synchronization possible, by

trying to choose words that share the same initial sounds or similar to the Turkish original

text.

Example:

In the conversation between Erdem and Kahraman, in the first episode:

Source Text: First Episode, 0:48:28 – 0:49:05

Nasılsın Kahraman?

(1A) B,bb, bb, bbb, benimle konuşmuyorlar!

Olur öyle bazen arkadaşlar arasında.

(1B) Yya bbbir daha hhh, hhhhiç kkko kkkoonuşmazlarsa?

35

Target Text: Second Episode, 00:04:05 – 00:04:4

-كيفك يا عمران؟

Kīfak ya 'Imrān?

"How are you, Imran?"

(1A)

- ممم ممما حدا بيحكي معي!

Mm, mm, mma ḥadā biḥki maʻi

"Nobody talks to me"

بتصير هيك أحياناً بين الرفقات

Bitṣīr ḥēk aḥyānan biēnir-rif'āt.

"Sometimes it happens between friends"

(1B)

-بببلكي أبداً مممم ممما حكوا معي؟؟

Bbb, bb, balki abadan mm mmaa ḥaku ma i?

"What if they would never talk to me?"

The translator and dubbing actor paid good attention to the issue. Kahraman appeared trying to pronounce a word starting with the labial sound B twice in the (1A and 1B) examples. The translation was adapted by choosing a word starting with another labial sound M in example (1A), and a word starting with the same labial sound B in example (1B). However, the lip synchrony was not achieved in the middle of a sentence with the difference between the sound H in the ST and the M that appeared in the dubbing- example (1B).

However, the scene can be said successful in terms of lip-synchrony. As viewers are more likely to notice the synchrony and asynchrony at the start of the utterance or after very long stuttering in the middle of the statement.

b- Isochrony

Isochrony is achieved to a high level, thanks to the new Tazmeen System. It can be said that the utterances in the dubbed version are matching the length of utterances in the original, to a comfortably good level. This type of synchrony is more important to the viewers than the lip-synchronization.

Another important factor that plays a big role in the high level of isochrony in the work, is the overlapping of scenes and camera shots. A good example can be seen in the first episode, when Erdem comes back to his home, to meet with his mother, sister, sister in law and nephew. It is noticeable how the characters' voices are heard a few seconds before they come on screen in the original scene. This type of montage gives more flexibility and ease to the work of dubbing actors and editors.

c- Kinetic Synchrony

This type of synchrony is of vital importance. Matching body movements, gestures and characters' reactions with the dubbed translation is important to produce a natural scene. The failure in achieving that can be terrible. The audience certainly does not want to see a character opens his eyes in shock (in the visual mode) before a secret is revealed (verbal mode), nor a few seconds after it. However, scenes which require kinetic synchrony are limited and easier to detect, which makes it manageable. The calm and classical style of the drama series under discussion and the slow and subtle movements of the characters makes the kinetic synchrony an easier task during dubbing.

2- Content Constraints

A content mismatch is detected in many places in the dubbing, not because of the constraints imposed by the visuals, but as a result of the poor understanding of the original text. Therefore, more examples of content mismatch will be discussed deliberately in the coming sections.

Example:

In his first appearance in the series, the Turkish poet, Necip Fazıl Kısakürek, played by Kenan Bal, is seen traveling in a taxi cab. He reads a few verses of a poem to the taxi driver who sits next to him. And the following dialogue takes place between them:

Source Text: Third Episode 01:06:30 – 01:07:55

-Beyim ne güzel okudunuz şiiri. Kimin bu?

- -Boşver kimin olduğunu. Biz okuduk biz duyduk, bizim oldu.
- Ben çocukken şiirleri uydururdum beyim. Babam bir kere kızdı. Ne işin var şiirle sözle. Okulunu bitir işine gücüne bak dedi. Ondan sonra bir daha yazmadım.
- -Baban doğru söylemiş. Şairin ne okulu bitiyor ne de derdi. Şair kelimelere çobanlık eder. Heybesi şiirle gezer.

Target Text: Seventh Episode 00:15:00 – 00:16:25

- الشعر اللي قاته حلو كتير لمين هالشعر؟

Al-shi'ir illi ultu hilw ktīr. Lamīn hash-shi'ir?

What a nice piece of art you have read. Whose is it?

- الشعر اللي قلتلك إياه واللي إنتا هلاً سمعته. لإلى.

Al-shi'ir illi iltillak iyāh w illi inta halla' smi'tu.. lailī The poem I've just read and you've heard.. is mine.

Ana bizamanāti kunt aktub shiʿir. Baʿdīn abī allī shū biddak bihal-maskhara? khalleş dirastak w rūḥ shūf shighlak, w baʿdīn ma ʿidit katabit bnūb.

- In the old days, I used to write poems. Then my dad said: "What would you do with this nonsense. Finish your studies and get a job". Since then I did not write.

Abūk ma'u ḥa' ya ibnī. Esh-shā'ir ma bikhalleş drāstu kil ḥayatu. Esh-shā'ir bīkūn huwwa ra'il-kalimat w shi'ru huwwa illi bia'ṭīh il heiba.

- Your father is right, my son! A poet cannot finish his studies his whole life. The poet is a shepherd for his words. His prestige is derived from his poetry.

A loss of meaning occurred in this dialogue. The poet in the TT sounded so arrogantly proud while attributing the poem to himself. However, the ST conveys a different meaning. The poet conveys a deep message, by saying that the real ownership of a poem is to those who read it, listen and appreciate it.

Later, a wrong choice of the word *maskhara* -bullshit or nonsense in Arabic- made the poet sound as if he confirms and agrees to the statement which described poetry as bullshit and waste of time.

Such contextual mistakes are unjustified and unforgivable, in a drama series meant to celebrate literature. It also involves misrepresentation of the character in a cinematic sense as well as the poet Necip Fazil Kısakürek, in reality.

Big changes in the content of one scene can cause character asynchrony and reflect on that character's perception in the following scenes. Every scene is meant to give the viewer an impression of the character or reveal some aspects of his personality. In other words, the essence of the drama production is based on the viewers' ability to collect clues and making impressions and opinions of the characters in the story. It is of vital importance to convey these clues and render the meanings of characters' acts the way they appeared and were received by the source audience.

3- Texture Constraints

Texture constraints are those coming from the difficulty of making the audible and visual subtexts sound coherent and cohesive. This is the case when the audible translation shifts away from the visual narration to some noticeable level. In our case study, we can consider the examples discussed under the title "the shifts between spoken and literary use of language" good examples of the way this problem sounds like. However, as we will see in those examples, the cause of the problem does not originally lie in the source material, but in its improper translation. Therefore, the examples will be discussed thoroughly in relation to their cause in the coming section.

4- Semiotic Constraints

The relative closeness between the Turkish and Arabic cultures reduces the difficulty of rendering the meaning of symbolism, macrosigns and microsigns. Below is one of the examples.

Source Text: First Episode, 1:28:00 – 1:29:48

Target Text: Third Episode, 0:07:45 – 1:09:33

Silent Scene

Arab audience can easily understand why Naciye felt upset when she received a gift from her fiancé, Erdem Beyazit, a couple of days before their marriage. The gift box that carries a coat and a silky scarf, is a subtle message of his desire to make her adopt an Islamic outfit style by wearing the headscarf. Naciye, received his message immediately, and her reaction toward the gift was far from pleasant, as she changes dramatically. She sends him back the engagement ring with a farewell letter. The episode ends there with high tension, leaving the audience in suspicion about the future of their relationship and love story.

The Arab audience, and those close to the Islamic culture, can easily understand the situation and find Naciye's reaction reasonable. However, if the target audience is far from the Islamic culture, it would be difficult for them to understand how a gift can end a relationship this way. That is because the symbolic meaning of the scarf is not present in those cultures, and it is hard to extract the message from a scarf that typically has different usages away from being the Islamic headscarf.

Luckily, in this example like many others, the translator does not face any difficulty rendering the meaning, due to the closeness between the source and target cultures.

4.4. Analysis of Dubbing Challenges in Yedi Güzel Adam

Having discussed the dubbing constraints that arise from the mismatch between audible and visual modes, it is important to remember that audiovisual translation, like other types of translation, can be challenging for the translator on the textual level. Therefore, the analysis of audiovisual translation should not be restricted to the relation between the visual and the verbal subtexts but must include a discussion of the verbal-verbal relationship.

As in our case study, there are two elements that affect the quality of the translated product. These elements result from the wrong treatment of the verbal mode. The following is a discussion of these elements with examples.

A) The Shifts between Spoken and Literary Use of Language

As mentioned in the introduction, Yedi Güzel Adam is a series highly loaded with

literary quotations from well-known published books and poems. Characters use these

quotations as if they were uttered there for the first time in a specific social situation and

within a specific context. This means that literary content in the series serves both functional

and artistic purpose; functional as it is an integral part of the discussions, used to make a

point, put an argument, express position, or even as a sarcastic remark, and for its artistic

value, as literature is the center of appreciation and main theme and entertainment source

upon which the series is built.

While the shifts between the spoken and literary use of language sounded quite natural

in the source text, this element formed a challenge for the translation. Bearing in mind that

the Arabic language has a bigger gap between spoken dialects and formal literary language

than the case in Turkish, it can be understood how challenging this element is for the

translator. It is common for intellectuals and literary figures in the Arab World to be in favor

of the standard Arabic and tend to use it more frequently in their daily life. This fact is not

reflected in the Arabic version of the series, which raises the question of dialects and their

social associations.

The series does not fulfill the audience desire and expectation of hearing sophisticated

conversations between the poets and writers in literary Arabic or MSA. The language they

use does not associate them with a higher educational level or make them stand out. Rather, it

causes some discomfort and fake-like effect when they suddenly shift from the colloquial

language to the highly literary quotations they utter within dialogues.

Moreover, this challenge of code-switching showed itself as a serious problem in

some scenes where real confusion occurred between standard Arabic and spoken dialect. The

following are a few examples:

Example 1:

In this scene, Emine is learning to read from a children textbook narrating the

traditional short story of "Cin Ali". She reads a letter by letter slowly and with difficulty.

Source Text: Second Episode, 1:00:25 – 1:00:50

- Cin Ali topaçla kırbacı alacak. Çok....

41

Target Text: Fourth Episode, 00:34:13 – 00:34:37

-بعدين، الجنى لما جاب الكرباج، البلبل على كتير فرح. تمام.

ba'dīn iljinnī lammā jāb ilkirbāj, il-bulbul 'Ali ktīr firiḥ. Tamām.

Then when the demon brought the whip, the nightingale Ali was very delighted.

Okay.

It is widely known and accepted that children textbooks —and the vast majority of printed books— are written exclusively in Standard Arabic. However, unexpectedly, the dubbed voice of Emine in the target scene comes in Syrian dialect. This severe clash between the visual and acoustic modes of the scene can only occur if the translator was dealing solely with the written script without paying attention to the visuals.

There is hardly any way to justify the translator's decision in this scene if we assume that he is fully aware of his own choice. The problem in this scene can be overlooked by the editor of the scene due to its shortness – few seconds. However, the second example shows a serious systematic problem in dealing with dialects

Example 2:

A more obvious example in the same episode is the scene of Cevat holding "Kürk Mantolu Madonna" novel for Sabahattin Ali, and reading the quotation "Acaba bunlar neden yaşıyorlar! Yaşamakta ne buluyorlar?" translated into Syrian dialect. The visual and acoustic modes are mismatched, as the spoken dialect is not expected to come out from a published literary book suggested by the teacher of Turkish Literature, especially if we consider the general literary taste and the type of publications. It is important to remind here that colloquial Arabic has not gained acceptance in the written form, nor in literature. It is often seen as a threat to the purity of the Arabic tongue. It is also important to note that such quotations as the last example above are supposed to add literary value to the scene and introduce these pieces of literature as such to the audience.

Source Text: Third Episode, 1:11:53 – 1:13:19

Ne zaman kendimle baş başa kalsam, Raif efendinin saf yüzü, biraz dünyadan uzak, buna rağmen bir insana tesadüf ettikleri zaman tebessüm etmek isteyen bakışları gözlerimin önünde canlanıyor.

Halbuki o hiç de fevkalade bir adam değildi. Hatta pek alelade, hiçbir hususiyeti olmayan, her gün etrafımızda yüzlercesini görüp de bakmadan geçtiğimiz insanlardan biriydi. Hayatının bildiğimiz ve bilmediğimiz taraflarında insana merak verecek bir cihet olmadığı muhakkaktı. Böyle kimseleri gördüğümüz zaman çok kere kendi kendimize sorarız: "Acaba bunlar neden yaşıyorlar? Yaşamakta ne buluyorlar? Hangi mantık, hangi hikmet bunların yeryüzünde dolaşıp nefes almalarını emrediyor?"

Fakat bunu düşünürken yalnız o adamların dışlarına bakarız; onların da birer kafaları, bunun içinde, isteseler de istemeseler de işlemeye mahkûm birer dimağları bulunduğunu, bunun neticesi olarak kendilerine göre bir iç âlemleri olacağını hiç aklımıza getirmeyiz.

Target Text: Seventh Episode, 00:20:27 - 00:20:50

يمكن من الناس اللي صادفتن لهلاً في شخص أسر عليي بشكل كبير. ومع إنه مرت شهور مش عم بئدر إتخلص من هالانطباع. لأني كل ما بئعد لحالي بيخطر على بالي وش السيد رئيف الصافي، هالزلمة اللي عايش بعيد عن الدنيي. بس لما يشوف أي حدا ندامه بيبتسم بوشه. مع إنه ما كان هالإنسان المميز. حتى إنه كان شخص متل كل الناس. يعني زلمي عادي ما عنده أي شغلة خاصة بتميزه عن بقية الناس. بس بحياته أكيد في شغلات نحنا ما بنعرفا. بتخليه متمسك بالحياة وعم يناضل منشانا. ولما منشوف هيك ناس، فوراً منسأل حالنا، يا ترى هدول ليش عايشين؟ وشو بيشوفوا بهالحياة؟ وأي منطق وأي حكمة بتخليون يمشوا على هالأرض ويتنفسوا متلنا؟ ولما نفكر متل هيك بنكون عم نشوف الناس بس من برا. وما بيخطر على بالنا، إنه في إله راس وجواته دماغ. ومن واجب هالدماغ إنه يضله يفكر. وبنهاية هالحكي منتفرج عليهون من برا وما بتخطر على بالنا الشغلات اللي من جوا.

Yimkin min al-nas illi şadaftun lahalla' fī shakhis assar 'alayyi bi shakil kbīr. W ma' innu mara'at shhur mish 'am be'dar itkhallas min halinţiba'. Li-annī kil ma bi' 'ud laḥali byekhţur 'ala bāli wesh ilsayyid Ra'īf ilsāfi, halzalami illi 'ayesh b'īd 'an ildinī. Bas lamma yshūf ai ḥada iddamu biyebtisim biwishū. Ma' innu ma kan halinsān ilmumayyaz. Ḥatta inno kan shakhis mitil kil ilnās. Ya'ni zalami 'adī ma 'endu ayya shaghli khassa bitmayzu 'an ba'iyyit ilnas. Bas biḥayatu fī shaghlāt niḥnā akīd ma bna'rifhā. Bitkhallīh metmassek bihal-ḥayā w 'am ināḍil minshāna. W lamma menshūf haīk nas fawran mnis'al ḥalna ya tarā hadūl leysh 'ayshīn? W shū bishūfū bihal-ḥayā? W ay mantiq w ay ḥikmi bitkhallīyūn yemshū 'alā hal-ard w yitnaffasū mitilnā? W lamma nfakkir mitil hayk binkūn 'am nshūf ilnās bas min barra. W ma biyikhtur 'ala bālnā innū fī ilū rās w juwwatū dmāgh. W min wājib hal-dmāgh innu yḍallu iyfakkir. Wibnihāyet hal-ḥakū mnetfarraj 'aleyhun min barrā w ma btikhtur 'alā bālna ilshaghlāt illi min juwwa.

Back Translation of the Target Text

Maybe a person I came across has affected me a lot. Although many months have passed since then, I still cannot undo the impression he left on me. Whenever I sit alone, the face of Ra'eef Alsafi comes to my mind. This man who lives away from the world. But when he sees anyone he smiles. Although he was not a special person. He was even a man like any other. An ordinary man who does not have anything special to make him stand out amongst others. But in his life, there must be some other things which we do not know. Things that make him hold on to this life, struggle for it. Whenever we see such people, we ask ourselves and wonder why do such people live? What do they see in this life? Which logic, which wisdom makes them walk on this planet and breathe like us? When we think like this, we only see these people from the outside. We even forget that they have heads and brains inside. These brains have to keep working. At the end, we keep looking at them from the outside, and we forget the things inside.

Provided above, respectively, the original text as appeared in the original scene and quoted from the novel, and the target text that appeared in the dubbed version of the scene in Syrian dialect as the character is reading from the book.

The problem of this translation goes beyond the wrong choice of register and extends to over-simplification and loss of argument. It can be said that content synchrony is lacking in the scene. Especially if we consider the functional role of this quotation as a turning point in the personality of the character towards more affiliation with literature. While the clues of that change are seen visually on his face as he proceeds in reading the book, and in the following scenes.

Content asynchrony is also present in the translation, as the writer's voice in the Arabic version sounds arrogant and looking down on the "ordinary people" questioning why do they "exist and breathe like us?!".

Example 3:

This scene marks the opening scene of the drama series. It shows a bus full of passengers traveling between cities. The bus driver turns on the radio to listen to the news broadcast. As we hear the following:

Source Text: First Episode, 00:03:15 – 00:04:00

Antalya'da her yıl düzenlenen Altın Portakal Film Festivalı'na derece ile giren filmeler belirlendi. Bu yolda sanatçıların halkla bütünleştiği festivalde Ömer Lütfi Akad Düğün filmini en iyi film birinciliği aldı. Ömer Lütfi Akad'ın en iyi yönetmen ödülünü kazandığı festivalde Hakan ... en iyi erkek oyunucu, ve Nihal en iyi kadın oyuncu seçilerek.. . Başbakan Bülent Ecevit'in Cumhurbaşkanına istifası sunmasından sonra buzulan CHP-MSP koalisyonu.. siyasi araçlar sürerken.. piyasaların kısa sürede toparlanamayaçağının görüşünde birleşiyor.

Target Text: First Episode, 00:00:10 - 00:00:55

مهرجان البردئان الدهبي اللي عم ينظم في أنطاليا هادا الشهر رح يكون غير شكل. لأنه هاي السنة رح يكون من بين الفنانين اللي رح ييجوا على المهرجان المخرج الكبير أمين لطفي. وإدارة المهرجان رح تسلمه جائزة أفضل مخرج لهالسنة. ورح يستضيفوا الممثل هاكان والممثلة خو.... جائزة أفضل ممثلين. وطبعاً رح يكون بمهرجان البردئان عروض حلوة كتير ورح يشارك فيها كل الضيوف ورح تتوزع الجوائز على كل الفائزين كمان. المهرجان رح يضل تلات ايام. وبالنسبة للعروض رح يكون في منها بالليل وبالنهار.

Mahrajān ilbird'ān ildahabī illi 'am yunazam hāi ilsene raḥ ikūn gaīr shekel. Liannu hai ilsene raḥ ikūn min bīn il-fannanīn illi raḥ yījū 'ala ilmahrajān ilmukhrij al-kbīr Amīn Lutfī. W idārit il mahrajān raḥ tsalmu jā'izit afḍal mukhrij lahalsana. W raḥ yestaḍīfū al-mumathil Hakan w al-mumathila Kh.... jā'izit afḍal mumathilīn. W ṭab 'an raḥ ikūn bi mahrajān il ilbird'ān 'urūḍ ḥelwi ktīr w raḥ ishārik fīha kil-leḍyūf w raḥ tituazza' iljawā'iz 'alā kil ilfā'izīn kamān. Ilmahrajān raḥ iḍal talāt ayyām. W bilnesbe lal-'urūḍ raḥ ikūn fī minhā bil-līl w bil-nhār.

Back Translation of the Target Text

The festival of Golden Oranges -which is arranged in Antalya this month-, will be so special. Because this year, the famous director, Amin Lutfi, will be amongst the artists to attend the festival. The management of the festival will give him the prize of Best Director of the Year. The festival also will host the actor Hakan, and the actor Kh... Best Actors prize. Exciting shows and activities will be held during the festival for all guests to participate, and prizes will be given to all winners. The Oranges festival will last for three days. Shows will be held during the day and nighttime.

The piece of news on radio introduces the story of The Golden Orange Film Festival,

which is the first and most popular cinematic event in Turkey, arranged annually since 1964.

The Arabic translation presented the name of festival as "Mahrajān Ilbird'ān Ildahabī" and

"Mahrajān Ilbird'ān" instead of "Mahrajān al-Burtugāla al-Dahabiya" which is the proper

name of the festival known in the Arab World and in Arabic news bulletins. The translator

also dropped the word "film" from the festival's name, which made the festival type

undistinguished. He also referred to it as "the golden oranges festival" and "the oranges

festival", instead of dealing with it as a proper name.

Overall, choosing the colloquial language over the MSA for delivering the news

bulletin and giving a colloquial name for the events show lack of adaptation between

language and context, and cause a loss of a term that carries a cultural value.

The above-mentioned examples, amongst others, show real confusion between the

literary and colloquial languages. The translator failed to adjust the register and tone of

utterance with the context, which resulted in a mismatch between the acoustic and visible

channels in the dubbed drama and cause a massive loss of the literary value of the drama

series, which is the core of the production.

Having a standard guideline of translating the drama series into Syrian dialect is not

supposed to restrict the translator in choosing the register that suits the situation based on the

target culture or ban him from using other alternatives when needed.

It is also important to mention that the translator omitted the part related to the

political content. The political reference in the opening of first episode functions as an

indicator of both time, and political context upon which the story is placed.

B) Translation of Literary Texts and Quotations

As mentioned in the introduction, *Yedi Güzel Adam* is heavily loaded with literary

quotations, some of which pose a challenge for the translator. Below are some examples of

the way the translator deals with such scenes.

Example 1:

Source Text: Fourth Episode, 01:30:00 – 01:30:52

Tahir olmak da ayıp değil Zühre olmak da

hattâ sevda yüzünden ölmek de ayıp değil, bütün is Tahirle Zühre olabilmekte

yani yürekte.

46

Meselâ bir barikatta dövüşerek meselâ kuzey kutbunu keşfe giderken meselâ denerken damarlarında bir serumu ölmek ayıp olur mu?

Tahir olmak da ayıp değil Zühre olmak da hattâ sevda yüzünden ölmek de ayıp değil.

Target Text: Tenth Episode, 01:10 – 01:55

الطهر ليس عار

والخسة ليست عار

حتى الموت بسبب الحب ليس عار

إما أن تكون طاهراً أو خسيساً فهنا الأساس (يشير إلى قلبه)

حين تحارب على الجبهة

أو حين تذهب للعلم برحلة

ويخترقك شبح الموت بوهلة، عندها سينتفي عارك

الطهر ليس عار والخسة ليست عار

حتى الموت بسبب الحب ليس بعار

Al-Ṭuhru laysa ʿār

W al-khissatu laysat 'ār

ḥatta almaut bisabab al-ḥub laysa ʿār

Imma an takūna ṭāhiran aw takūna khasīsan fahunā alasās

Hīn tuḥaribu 'ala aljabha

Aw ḥīn tadhhabu lil 'ilmi bireḥla

W yakhtariqak shabaḥ al-maut bi wahla, 'indahā sayantafī 'āruk

Al-Ṭuhru laysa ʿār, w al-khissatu laysat ʿār

ḥatta almaut bisabab al-ḥub laysa ʿār

Back Translation of the Target Text

Being pure is not a shame

Nor is being despicable

Even dying for love is not a shame

Whether pure or despicable, what is important is basically here. (points at his heart)

While fighting on the front,

Or while going on a journey for knowledge,

And the specter of death pierces you, then your shame is cleansed.

Being pure is not a shame, nor is being despicable

Even dying for love is not a shame

Despite its popularity and central role in the Turkish modern literature, this is not the first time that Nâzım Hikmet's masterpiece "Tahir ile Zühre" suffers from inadequate translations into Arabic. Rather, it has turned into an exceptional example of failed and non-adequate translation between Turkish and Arabic, known for years. I personally remember hearing about it in almost every conference and seminar I attended as the topmost example of improper translation, which leads one to wonder; is there any translator in this field who does not know the story of Tahir and Zühre!

According to the ancient story, well known in the Turkish folk culture, Tahir and Zühre are heroes of a fiery love story. Zühre is the only daughter of an ancient Padişah. While Tahir is the sole son of one of his *Vezirs* (ministers). Tahir and Zühre shared a great love for each other. When they reach the age for marriage, the mother of Zühre opposed their bond and used her magic to turn the Padişah against Tahir. Tahir is forced into prison and yet does not give up his love. Under torture and bad treatment, he gives his own precious soul for the love of Zühre. Zühre hears the news from prison and loses her mind. She ends up dying from her grief at Tahir's grave. This story has different versions and is one of the most popular love stories in the Turkish folk culture.

Sadly, the translator who provided the Arabic translation for the dubbing has obviously no prior knowledge of the poem nor the story behind it. A short research of the poem on the internet or asking a Turkish friend could have guided the translator to a proper translation effortlessly and without even the need to refer to literary resources. The failure of doing so puts the translator's techniques and competencies under question. It also raises questions about the support provided by the dubbing agency, and their inability to put the translator in contact with literary consultant, given the nature of the project.

We cannot also refrain from questioning the role of dubbing director who did detect a problem in a poem defending "being despicable" and calls for no shame for that.

This all shows multiple deficiencies along the chain of production. It is a shared

responsibility between the designer of the production line, translator/s, dubbing actors,

dubbing director and quality analyst to avoid such vital mistakes.

Example 2:

The new literature teacher, Adil Erdem Beyazıt, makes his first interaction with

students in the classroom. During his first class, the stubborn, literature-hater, and arrogant

student Cevat faces him. After a few minutes, Beyazıt conveys a subtle message to Cevat,

through the verses of Nacip Fazil's poem, which leaves him confused and speechless. The

Teacher uses the language of literature to show some sense of superiority in the argument,

leaving the student feeling lacking.

Source Text: First Episode, 38:00 – 39:00

Seni dağladılar, değil mi kalbim,

Her yanın, içi su dolu kabarcık.

Bulunmaz bu halden anlar bir ilim;

Akıl yırtık çuval, sökük dağarcık.

Necip Fazıl

Target Text: First Episode, 35:35 – 36:00

ألم يطردوك يا قلبي

ترى الأمكنة فقاعات

وكل ما حولك يتبدد

العقل لزوال والفكر تشتت

نجيب فاضل

Back Translation of the Target Text

Didn't they abandon you, my heart?

You see the places as bubbles.

49

Everything around is fading.

The mind is to demise, the thought is distracted.

Comparing the original poem and the one in the Arabic version, it is difficult to find a connection between both -except for some common words-, which leads one to think that the translator decided to replace the original poem with another one of his own. The translator's choice can be discussed in terms of its fulfillment of the argument in the context of the scene.

However, what makes the translator's choice a bad one, is being followed by attaining the poem to the Turkish poet Necip Fazıl Karakürek. Introducing the poem as Necip Fazıl's makes such replacement unacceptable. If the drama series aims to introduce the poets and their work to the Arab viewers, then a higher loyalty to the original text is expected. If this is not the case, then the dubbing editor can basically omit the part of mentioning the name of the poet at the end of the scene or replace it by any possible filler.

We must remind that a good translation is identified by its position on a scale where adequacy and equivalence are at the opposite ends. A compromise in the equivalency can be justified if it is the sole solution to achieve a much-needed level of adequacy. However, if high levels of both adequacy and equivalence can be achieved at the same time, then the compromise on one of them is unjustified.

Example 3:

This scene marks the first appearance of the character resembling the poet Necip Fazıl Kısakürek (1904-1983), referred to in the drama series, as well as in the Modern Turkish literature, as the *Üstad*. The viewer does not know yet that this old wise man is Kısakürek himself, nor the taxi driver does. With his steady and deep voice, Kısakürek starts reading the well-known poem "*Gurbet*", while the taxi driver is listening.

Source Text: Third Episode, 1:06:30 – 1:07:45

-Dağda dolaşırken yakma kandili,

Fersiz gözlerimi dağlama gurbet!

Ne söylemez, akan suların dili,

Sessizlik içinde çağlama gurbet!

Target Text: Seventh Episode, 00:15:27 – 00:16:25

سرت بالجبال دون قناديل

لكن عيناى أتعبتهما الغرية

المياه تجرى بصوت دون دليل

لكن دليلي أسكتته الغربة

Sirtu bil-jibāl dūn qanadīl

Lakin 'aynāya at 'abathumā alghurba

Al-miyahu tajrī bişawtin dūna dalīl

Lakin dalīli askatathu al-ghurba

Back Translation of the Target Text

- I wandered in the mountains without lights.

But my eyes are tired of homesickness.

The water is flowing with sound with no guide.

But my guide is silenced by my homesickness.

This scene is discussed in the previous section, as an example of the lack of content and character synchrony, with a negative representation of one of the main heroic characters.

Again, the translated piece of the poem shifted away from its original meaning. The poetic music and rhythm is also lost in the translation. If these poems are to be attributed to their authors, then a higher level of loyalty to the original text is expected. As it is unlikely to accept such a translation in a literature book, it should not be accepted in a semi-documentary drama series that represents the poets with their original names, and with their real-life events.

It can be concluded that the attention paid to the literary content in the drama is insufficient. The translation of literature requires a different treatment. Charging a professional translator with higher knowledge of Turkish language and modern literature is a necessity for smooth and proper delivery of the poems' meaning in literary language.

The inability to deal with the literary content of the series extends to the translation of some literary terms, as in the following example:

Example 4:

Source Text: Third Episode, 00:30:40 - 00:36:36

- -Fuzuli'yi sordu. Tabii biz yapamadık.
- -Fuzuli! (writing down) Başka?
- -Edebi akımlar da sordu.
- -Edebi akımlar! (writing down)

(Flashback)

-Hoca kesin Divan Edebiyatından soracak.

(Back: The teacher dictates the exam questions to his students in the classroom while they write down the questions)

-Soru Bir: Roman türü Türk edebiyatına ne zaman ve hangi eserle girmiştir?

Soru iki: Aruz vezni ile serbest vezin arasındaki farkları örnek vererek açıklayınız.

Soru üç: Ziya Paşa'nın Terkib-i Bend'i hangi şiir türüne girer. Nedenini açıklayınız.

Target Text: Seventh Episode, 00:17:23 - 00:22:35

- سؤال عن الشعر بس أنا ما عرفته
 - وغير هيك؟
 - سؤال عن الأدبيات -
 - سؤال عن الأدبيات!

(عودة بالزمن للوراء)

- أكيد رح يسألنا أسئلة من الأدب الديواني.

(عودة بالزمن: الأستاذ يملي الأسئلة على الطلاب بينما يكتبون الأسئلة على ورقة الامتحان) - السؤال الأول: النمط الروماني بالأدب التركي إيمتي وبأي قصيدة دخل؟

52

- السوال الاول. اللمط الروماني بالانب اللركي إيمني وباي قط اتنين بدى تشرحوا الفرء بين النمط المقيد والحر مع مسال تلاته طريقة تركيب زياد باشا من أي نوع من الشعر مع شرح طبعا

- -Su'āl 'an il-shi'ir. Bas anā mā 'riftū.
- -W ghaīr haīk?
- Suʾāl ʿan il-adabiyyāt.
- -Akīd raḥ yis 'alnā as 'ila min il-adab il-dīwanī.

-il-su'āl il-awal: il-namaṭ il-diwāni bil-adab il-turkī imtā dakhal w biay qaṣīda?

itnīn: biddī teshraḥū il-farq bīn il-namaṭ il-muqayyad w il-ḥur maʿ misāl.

Talāta: ṭarīqat tartīb Ziyād Pashā min ay nūʿ min il-shiʿir maʿ sharḥ ṭabʿan.

Back Translation of the Target Text

- -A question about poetry. I could not answer.
- -What else?
- -A question about literature.
- A question about literature.

(Flashback)

- -He must ask us about the Divani literature.
- -The First question: Explain the Roman type of Turkish literature and how and in which poem it entered to literature.

Two, explain the difference between the restricted and the free types with examples.

Three, which type of poetry is Ziyad Pasha, explain.

In this scene, we can detect multiple issues. Firstly, the translator failed to find the right equivalents for the literary terms mentioned in the ST like *edebi akımlar* (literary movements), *roman* (novel), *aruz vezni* (aruz prosody), *serbest vezin*, despite their existence in the target culture.

Secondly, the translator failed in translating the special terms of Turkish literature like "Divan Edebiyati", which is an important type of Turkish literature that appeared under the influence of Islamic culture and Arabic and Persian languages starting from the 13th century. Therefore, the translator missed an opportunity of introducing a very important meeting point between the Turkish and Arabic literature. The term "Divan Edebiyati", although not known

to the Arab audience, can be introduced shortly in the form of a question to make this connection. For example, referring to it with the word *Aruz* ('aruḍ) can be sufficient to convey the type of literature it is.

Thirdly, the translator omitted the names of Turkish poets and replaced them with general concepts, as with the name of *Fuzuli*, one of the important figures of classical Turkish literature. This resulted in a big reduction of the literary value of the scene and detached the viewer from the theme of the drama series.

Finally, the translator made a wrong choice of the register in dubbing the teacher's voice dictating the questions of the written exam in the classroom. A written exam, dictated by a literature teacher cannot be but in standard language, MSA in our case. However, we again hear the teacher dictating slowly for the students in colloquial Syrian dialect. This creates an obvious clash between the visual and audible modes.

It is so unfortunate to witness a short but valuable scene shift completely -and in many ways- away from its own value.

CONCLUSION

The process of Audiovisual Translation is a complex one, with enormous elements playing role in the quality and presentation of the final product. These elements range between the linguistic, cultural, technical, logistic and financial ones. Therefore, an analysis of such a practice could never be less complex.

This complexity can be traced back to the nature of the Polysystem theory, especially when it is applied to the Arabic context. From one side, the polysytem theory opens up the research of translation in relevance to multiple elements in the target culture. And once you have an indefinite and less homogeneous target culture under study, the scope and complexity of research is multiplied; as we have seen with the Arabic scene with multiple linguistic variants and diverse cultures. This problem can be identified as one of the drawbacks of the Polysystem theory as it does not help define the boundaries of the research.

However, this study aimed to give a bird's eye view of the map field where these elements interact closely in the production of one drama series *Yedi Güzel Adam*, as a sample of other relatively similar productions.

The study demonstrates the preliminary norms and investigates the way they govern the choice of work to be dubbed - based on the social, linguistic, political, and financial motives- as seen in the interviews with employees from *Seyr Ajans* and *O3 Productions*. It also shows how the choice of the translation project, translation guidelines, and the translator's choices are linked to the policies and visions of the production house.

It explains how the initial and operational norms of translation are both established and changed throughout history in society. It shows how linguistic and educational preferences drive the AV industry in the Arab World, and yet are driven and shaped sometimes by big companies that have the money and power to tailor the audience's taste to open up a new business as we have seen with the success story of *O3 Productions*.

Moving further to the practice and process of dubbing, the study builds on Chaume's concept of constraints, to organize the study of the problems tackled during the process of dubbing. It discusses the new technical programs used in the Arab World to ease and fasten the management of lip-synchronization, isochrony, and kinetic synchrony. It assesses the quality of synchronization in the case study in light of the technology used.

It is right to say that despite the newness of the tendency towards dubbing in the Arab World, the industry and practice of dubbing have witnessed a big success, especially in the technical and cinematic matters, such as synchronization. Luckily, the dubbing of Turkish drama was born from within the industry of Arabic drama production, and not outside it. This gave dubbing a more solid ground and a haven to start and flourish, building on the experience and reputation of years-long success. The success gave direction to the future of dubbing and established new norms in the industry.

This study also points out the importance of content matching, and texture and semiotic harmony in the final product. It shows examples of how most of the translation problems occurred in these fields. This result breaks the old taboo of evaluating the dubbed project based solely on synchronization.

Despite the inclusiveness of Chaume's framework, encompassing the linguistic, technical and cinematic aspects of dubbing, some faults in the final product were left uncovered by his framework. Surprisingly, these fault lines were the most obvious, striking, and uncomfortable for the receptor in the first place. Therefore, it was impossible to leave them undiscussed, and the urge was felt to present them in this work, under the name of "Challenges".

Some of these challenges are derived from the special nature of the Arabic language and the way it is used in media production. Being aware of the risks of expanding the study beyond its scope, I felt the need to pave the way to the discussion of these matters, to make the examples more relevant and clearer for the non-Arab readers. This study showed how a good choice of variation of the Arabic language can make the dubbed product more appealing and acceptable in the target culture. On the other side, a wrong or outdated choice is the one that deems the dubbing "unrealistic, foreign" despite its equivalency and loyalty to the source text.

The second source of these challenges is related to the nature and special characteristics of the dubbed material. The right classification and understanding of the AV material are important for making the initial decisions and following the initial norms correctly. If more attention is paid to the documentary and literary nature of *Yedi Güzel Adam*, the dubbing team can make better decisions to cater to the factual and the literary aspects in the series.

For example, a Turkish literature specialist can help in detecting the literary texts and references in the series. The translation of literary content can be assigned to a translator with

previous experience with such texts. Characters in the series can be classified into different groups based on the level and variation of the language they use and be translated by different translators in order to keep the dialogue tone realistic and resembling the character's social and educational background. Understanding the type of material and comparing it to similar local products of relatively similar characteristics can give the dubbing team a clue on how the final product should be like.

One of the good examples that come in mind is the Syrian drama series, "al-Taghrība al-Falastīniyya" (2004). This masterpiece created a big boom in the Arab World and is an exceptional example of delivering smooth shifts back and forth between Palestinian Bedouin accent, Palestinian villagers' accent, modern standard Arabic, and literary Arabic with a wide range of colors in between, to resemble the educational and intellectual backgrounds of the characters. Such delivery could make the characters of dubbed *Yedi Güzel Adam* rounder and deeper.

Therefore, it is important to take any dubbing project as a whole – as a reproduction of unique audiovisual material. The general guidelines of the initiator of the dubbing project or the standard norms should not limit the translators' choices. The initiator of a dubbing project can be fooled by a new trend in dubbing and set his rules against the general interest of the project. Therefore, a margin of freedom should be given to the dubbing team to choose what is best.

This positive interaction between the components of work can be hindered in cross-border projects. As the initiator, production house, and translators can be geographically distant, as we have seen in our case study. Therefore, communication should not be compromised, as the cost of such fundamental mistakes can be very pricey.

The translation and production agency must guarantee the translators' full access to the original audiovisual material, despite of the geographical constraints. The audiovisual material cannot be minimized to a written script in the source language. This can only result in catastrophic clashes between the visual and audible narrations in the final product. It is important to remember that the logistics, communication, and accessibility between the components of translation work is one of the most essential determinants of the quality of the translated product.

Although this study is based on descriptive approach, it is essentially part of the researcher's job to point out the fault-lines of the translated work and investigate the possible reasons behind them. Therefore, academic research can suggest and propose different ways of

dealing with the text, and contribute to the development of translational practices. The overlapping role of the academic research and practitioners of translation in the professional field should continue. Researchers should be able to provide simple guidelines and suggestions, taking role in shaping the initial norms of the field. While translation and production agencies should provide translator and workers with the minimum knowledge of the principles of audiovisual translation.

REFERENCES

- Abdulfattah, D., (2018), Personal Interview, (05.02.2018), Ankara, Turkey.
- Agost, R., Chaume, F., y A. Hurtado (1999) "La traducción audiovisual". In A. Hurtado (coord.) Enseñar a traducir. Madrid: Edelsa. 182-195.
- Alkadi, T., (2010) Issues in the Subtitling and Dubbing of English-Language Films Into Arabic: Problems and Solutions. Ph.D. Thesis, Faculty of Arts and Humanities, University of Durham, Durham, England.
- Anderman, G., (2012). "Drama Translation". In Baker. M, & Saldanha. G., (eds) Encyclopedia of Translation Studies. Routledge, NewYork. 92-95.
- Arab World. Transnational Broadcasting Studies, (15). (arabmediasociety.com/a-potential-untapped-why-dubbing-has-not-caught-on-in-the-arab-world/)
- Bartina, F., and E.Espasa. 2005. "Audiovisual translation" In M.Tennent (ed.), Training for the New Millennium. Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 85.
- Bartrina, F., Espasa, E., (2005), Audiovisual Translation. Training for the New Millennium. Pedagogies for Translation and Interpreting, John Benjamins Publishing Company, Amsterdam/Philadelphia, 83-100.
- Buccianti, Alexandra (2010), "Dubbed Turkish Soap Operas in the Arab World: Social Liberation or Cultural Alienation?" Arab Media & Society, March 30.
- Chaume, F., (1997) "Translating nonverbal communication in dubbing". In Poyatos, F. (ed) Nonverbal Communication and Translation. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins: 315-326.
- Chaume, F., (1998) "Textual constraints and the translator's creativity in dubbing". In Beylard-Ozeroff, A, J. Kralova and Moser-Mercer, B. (eds) Translators' Strategies and Creativity. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

- Chaume, F., (2013). "The Turn of Audiovisual Translation: new audiences and new technologies", In Translation Spaces 2 Journal, John Benjamin Publishing Company, 105-123.
- Dabbağoğlu, B., (2018). Personal Interview, (05.02.2018), Ankara, Turkey.
- Darwish, A., (2006) "Voice Translation between Acting and Communication in Arabic Satellite Television". Translation Monitor Online Journal. 3 Volume.
- Díaz-Cintas, J. (2004). Subtitling: the long journey to academic acknowledgment. The Journal of Specialised Translation, 1, 50-68.
- Diaz-Cintas, J., (1999). "Dubbing or Subtitling: The Eternal Dilemma". In "Perspectives Studies in Translatology". Routledge Publishing. Issue:7. 31-40
- Díaz-Cintas, J., (2004). In search of a theoretical framework for the study of audiovisual translation, In Benjamins Translation Library Journal, 56 Volume. 21-34.
- Gamal, M., (2007) "Audiovisual translation in the Arab world: a changing scene". In Translation Watch Quarterly. Vol. 3, Melbourne.
- Gamal, M., (2014) "Audiovisual translation in the Arab world: Mapping the field". In Translation Watch Quarterly. Vol. 4, Melbourne.
- Holmes, J. S. (1994). Translation Theory, Translation Theories, Translation Studies, and the Translator. A: Holmes, James, 93-98.
- Ivarsson, Jan. (1992). Subtitling for the Media: A Handbook of an Art, Transedit.
- Karamitroglou, F. (2000). Towards a methodology for the investigation of norms in audiovisual translation: The choice between subtitling and revoicing in Greece (Vol. 15). Rodopi.
- Karamitroglou, F., (1998). A Proposed Set of Subtitling Standards in Europe. Translation Journal, Vol. 2, No. 2.
- Et la Luyken, G., Herbst, T., Langham-Brown, J., Reid, H. & Spinhof, H. (1991).

 Overcoming language barriers in television: dubbing and subtitling for the European Audience. Manchester: European Institute for the Media.

- Maluf, R. (2005). A Potential Untapped? Why Dubbing Has Not Caught on in the
- Mayoral Asensio, Roberto (2001a), "Campos de estudio y trabajo en traducción audiovisual", in Miguel Duro (coord.) La traducción para el doblaje y la subtitulación. Madrid: Cátedra, 19-45. ----- (2001b) Aspectos epistemológicos de la traducción. Castellón: Universidad Jaume I.
- O'Connell, E., (2007). "Screen translation". In Kuhiwczak, P. & Littau, K., (Eds), A Compensation to Translation Studies. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Orero, P. (2004), Audiovisual translation: A new dynamic umbrella. Benjamins Translation Library, 56, VII-xiii.
- Orero, P. (Ed.). (2004). Topics in audiovisual translation (Vol. 56). John Benjamins Publishing.
- Özdenören, R., (2018) Personal Interview, (05.02.2018), Ankara, Turkey.
- Perez-Gonzalez, L., Baker, M. (ed.) & Saldanha, G. (ed.), 2009, The Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies. 2nd ed. London & New York: Routledge, p. 13-20p.
- Suçin, M., (2018) Abdulkadir Abdelli, Turkey in My Eyes: Culture, Literature, Translation and Arts. Abdelli, A., Turkish TV Drama and its Influence on the Arabic Society., Istanbul, Maysaloon for Printing, Publishing and Distribution.
- WEB_1, (2018), Daniel Abdulfattah, The New Arab News Web Site, https://www.alaraby.co.uk, 02.02.2018.
- WEB_2, (2013), Rachel McArthur, The Gulf News Web Site, https://gulfnews.com, 22.08.2013.
- WEB 3, Yedi Güzel Adam, TRT1 Web Site, www.trt1.com.tr.
- WEB 4, Görevlerimiz, TRT1 Web Site, https://www.trt.net.tr/Kurumsal/Gorevlerimiz.aspx.
- WEB_5, Yedi güzel adam: Bir Türkiye hikayesi, Yeni Şafak Web Site, <u>www.yenisafak.com</u>, 27.04.2014.

- Zabalbeascoa, P. (1997) "Dubbing and the nonverbal dimension of translation"- In F. Poyatos (ed.), Nonverbal Communication and Translation. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 327-342
- Zabalbeascoa, P. (1997). Dubbing and the nonverbal dimension of translation. Benjamins Translation Library, 17, 327-342.

CURRICULUM VITAE

Personal and Contact Information:

Nationality: Jordanian

Address: Atakent mah., 221.sok, Bosphorus City, 19/70. Küçükçekmece – İstanbul/Türkiye.

Phone Number: 0090 5070297003

Educational Background:

2009-2014: B.A. in Turkish and English Languages and Literature, Foreign Languages Faculty, University of Jordan, Amman/Jordan.

Work Experience:

2017-2019: International Office Expert at Ibn Haldun University, Istanbul/Turkey.

2015-2017: Translator and News Editor at Daily Sabah Newspaper, Istanbul/Turkey.

2016-2016: Lecturer for the Media Translation Courses at Okan University, Istanbul/Turkey.

2014-2015: Translator and Column Editor at Yeni Şafak Newspaper, Istanbul/Turkey.

2012-2014: Legal Translator and Editor at Istanbul Authorised Translation Office, Amman-

Jordan.

Language Skills:

Arabic: Mother Tongue.

English: C1 Level. IELTS band 7.

Turkish: C1 Level. TÖMER C1.