T. R. ISTANBUL AYDIN UNIVERSITY INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE

NEW CULTURALISM AND A CRITICAL ANALYSIS ON POST-COLONIAL IDENTITY

Master's Thesis

Gülşen ERTÜRK

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. KEMALETTİN YİĞİTER

İstanbul -2012

T. R. İSTANBUL AYDIN UNİVERSİTESİ SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ İNGİLİZ DİLİ VE EDEBİYATI ANABİLİM DALI

YENİ KÜLTÜRLENME VE SÖMÜRGECİLİK SONRASI KİMLİK ÜZERİNE ELEŞTİREL BİR ÇALIŞMA

Yüksek Lisans Tezi

Gülşen ERTÜRK

Danışman: Prof. Dr. KEMALETTİN YİĞİTER

İstanbul -2012

CONTENT

ACKNOWLEGMENT	1.
ÖZET	11.
ABSTRACT	111.
INTRODUCTION	5
CHAPTER ONE	
RE-MAPPING COLONIAL DISCO	OURSE
1.1. Culture	7
1.2. Locating Culture throughout History	8
1.3. Colonialism / Post-Colonialism	11
1.4. Representations	14
1.5. Colonial Discourse and Identity Formation	17
1.5.1. African Representations	23
CHAPTER TWO	
COLONIAL SUBJECTIVATION	ON
2.1. Colonial Subjects	27
2.2. Language and Colonial Identity	34
2.3. Ethnicity / Race.	39
2.4. Hybrid Reality	43
CHAPTER THREE	
NEW CULTURALISM	
3.1. Subaltern	47
3.2. Decoding the Colonial Process	52
3.3. A New Consciousness in Post-Colonial Process.	56
CONCLUSION	
RIRLIOGRAPHY	63

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my advisor, *Prof. Dr. Kemalettin Yiğiter*, for his guidance, caring, patience, and providing me with an excellent atmosphere for doing my research. It is an honor for me to share this project with him as, he has always believed in me. The special thank goes to my helpful comrade, *Vuslat Aktepe* for the wise idea throughout the project. The supervision and support that he gave me truly help the progression of my thesis. My master really brought us together to appreciate the true value of friendship and respect of each other. Great deals appreciated go to the contribution of the special person, *Kubilay Yurduseven* whose support enabled this project to grow into a big potential and who will go on encouraging me with his great patience as an independent thinker in life.

Last but not least, I owe my deepest gratitude to my belowed family; *Mustafa-Gülten* and *Şule, Emre Ertürk* cheering me up and stood by me through the good times and bad. I am indebted to the directions of *my father* who supported me to develop my background in politics, sociology and literature, most of all, in life.

This program made me realize the value of producing a work based on 'man' as a new experience in emancipatory policies of life which challenges me every minute.

GENEL BİLGİLER

İsim ve Soyadı : Gülşen Ertürk

Anabilim Dalı : İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı

Programı: İngiliz dili ve Edebiyatı

Tez Danışmanı: Prof. Dr. Kemalettin Yiğiter

Tez Türü ve Tarihi : Yüksek Lisans – Haziran 2012

Anahtar Kelimeler: post sömürgecilik, sömürgeci söylem, ayrılıkçı politikalar,

kültürel kimlik, yeni kültürlenme

ÖZET

Bu çalışma öncelikle post sömürgeciliğin görünürde zıt kutupları olan ezenezilenini yakın perspektiften değerlendirmeyi amaçlamış, iç içe geçmiş kavramları kendi çelişkili kavramsallaştırmalarıyla birlikte ele almıştır. Birinci bölüm sömürgeci söylemin iç ve dış alanlarıyla birlikte, kültürel pratik ile sömürgeci deneyim arasındaki alanı görmek için onların kapsayıcı politikalarından zorunlu olarak bahsetmiştir. İkinci bölüm sömürgeci temsillerde kültürel kimlik oluşumunun etnik yapı, ırk, dil, sosyal durum ve melez kimlikler üzerinden şekillenen ayrımcı politikalarını çözümlemeye çalışmıştır. Son bölüm sömürgeci süreci alt kimlikler ve güç ilişkilerine odaklanarak deşifre etmeyi amaçlamıştır. Sonuç olarak çalışma tez boyunca 'yeni kültürlenme' olarak isimlendirdiğim yeni bir kimlik okumasının gerekliliğini ortaya koymuştur. Çalışma, Batıcı kimlik oluşumunu meşrulaştırma, etiketleme ya da inkar etme niyetinde değildir. Ayrıca yalın bir tarafsızlık da sergilememektedir. Her şeyden öte borçlu olduğumuz insanlığa hizmet etmeyi uman bir anlamlandırma sürecinde olma gayesindedir.

GENERAL KNOWLEDGE

Name and Surname: Gülşen Ertürk

Field: English Language and Literature

Programme: English Language and Literature

Supervisor: Prof.Dr. Kemalettin Yiğiter

Degree Awarded and Date: Master - June 2012

Keywords: post-colonialism, colonial discourse, discriminatory policies, cultural

identity, new culturalism.

ABSTRACT

This study primarily aimed to analyze post-colonialist seemingly polarized sides of the oppressor/oppressed from close perspectives and discussed related nested concepts with their own paradoxal conceptualizations. The first chapter of the research necessarily mentioned about the internalized areas of interior and exterior colonial discourses, additionally about their inclusive politics to see the space between what was cultural practice and what was colonial experience. The second chapter attempted to analyze schismatic tendencies based on ethnicity, race, language, social status and hybrid identities in colonial representations. The last chapter aimed to decode the colonial process focusing on sub-identities and power relations. Consequentially, it put forth the need of a new reading of identity labeled as 'New-Culturalism' (my conceptualization). It doesn't intent to legalize, label or deny the process of Western identity formation. It also doesn't reflect a plain objectiveness; above all, it aims to be in the process of sense-making that will hopefully serve to humanity to what we are indebted.

INTRODUCTION

This study primarily originated from the idea of relocating colonial literature as: the known as unknown or the unfamiliar as familiar and usual because "this literature was in the sense of a large body of texts sharing a topic, written in a similar time and place and in similar context, but also in the sense of a discourse, sharing literary conventions, citing similar sources, recycling information, accepted 'facts', anecdotes and images and drawing upon the same authorities"¹. Thus, the study will not discuss the colonial discourse as a superficial issue—which is solely based on novels or playsbut as a process that deconstructs, recombines and shapes the term politically, culturally, economically and most of all, literary.

All cultures take form according to their contrary cultures and share influences in their definition of cultural identity. In the new era, while the interpenetration of nations is discussed, it will be a faulty conceptualization to focus the colonial dialectics merely on the oppressed, Other, subaltern or dependency. It will impede us to see the whole picture. Literary works that will be analyzed in later chapters are solely one of the reflected sides of the field. Nonetheless, we are aware of the productive discursive power of the literary representations, that's why this research starts off right-minded and closely while touching on the colonized, black, Orient or hybrid. We aim to keep the same commonsense while analyzing or deconstructing Euro-centralist works.

Principally, the study will situate the debate in a wide cultural context discussing its importance as an historical condition. Post-colonialism in this sense will offer a political philosophy of activism that contests the current situation of global inequality by referring to theorists such as Frantz Fanon, Aime Cesaire and Jean Paul Sartre who manifested anti-colonial struggles of the past.

The rise of the hegemonic discourse determined the trajectory of societies, history or any of the grand meta-narratives derived from the Enlightenment philosophy as a base to the colonial approach. In this respect, primarily the works of Joseph Conrad,

5

¹ Anders Ingram "English Literature On The Ottoman Turks In The Sixteenth And Seventeenth Centuries", 2009, Doctoral thesis, Durham University. Available at Durham E-Theses Online: http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/86/, (26.01.2012), Abstract.

Rudyard Kipling and W. Shakespeare will mirror the stereotyped identity formation of the West. Post-colonial theory which is regarded as a means of defiance by which any exploitative and discriminative practices, regardless of time and space, can be challenged by post-colonial intellectuals (who will also be questioned in later chapters). Following, particularly Homi Bhabha, Edward Said, Gayatri Spivak with their focus on migrated, hybrid positionalities and sub-identities are used as references in developing the argument for the formation of cultural identity and for the rise of new period labeled as 'New-Culturalism'. All these representations and theories create an interest which has to be dealt with before researchers can apply the post-colonial theory in their fields.

CHAPTER ONE

RE-MAPPING THE COLONIAL DISCOURSE

1.1. Culture

Culture, identified by colonialism underwent a transformation during colonial relations. The colonized culture partially emancipated from its own history and disguised to another matrix. Culture, in respect of its anthropological nature has had to take colonialism in and absorb it. Historically, for the cultures discussed, exploitation had to go parallel with the cultures it colonized to make them transform to adaptable social forms. As a recreating process is aforementioned and it will eventually reproduce itself via the Other. Culture, in short, is a transformation process embracing not only the colonized culture but also all cultures. "All culture is originally colonial. Every culture institutes itself through the unilateral imposition of some politics of language."²

In our day, intercultural relationships influence the whole world allowing to the existence of new groups. The world is girded with an expansive information system with the development of cultural consumer models. Cultural practices in this sense might be derived from the processes of re-conceptualization rather from their origin. As a methodology, the term 'post-colonialism' comes into play at this point by examining identity formation, colonial discourse, land (metaphorically) ,briefly men's and women's role, subjectivity, hybridism, its relation with culture and hopefully creating the 'new man'. Within this very relationship, the following chapter will not attempt to distinguish culture from colonial practices or offer to term re-colonial essence. But, the study will tempt to demonstrate how cultural hierarchy is located into colonial codes and is attached to all discourses created by the bourgeoisie. This unconscious assimilation is at the very heart of colonialism and post-colonialism which dare to educate subjects. However, it should be known that "Liquid-modern culture, unlike the culture of the nation-building era, has no 'people' to 'cultivate' ³ Bearing this in mind, the chapter

² Jacques Derrida, Monolingualism of the Other or the Prosthsesis of origin, Stanford Uni. Press,1996, p. 39.

³ "... It has instead the clients to seduce. And unlike its 'solid modern' predecessor, it no longer wishes to work itself, eventually but the sooner the better, out of job. Its job is now to render its own survival permanent – through

will elucidate culture as a term, the conditions reconfigured by it, its dynamics, the relationship between consciousness and culture and culture's extending over tyranny. Various forms of exploitation will be analyzed in later chapters and it ultimately will reveal a new perception of culture.

To comprehend the position of culture in interaction with consciousness in literary works and its configuration as hegemony, the socio-politic forms of tyranny should primarily be analyzed in the system of their relationship with materialist processes in literature –these are colonialism and imperialism. In their historical background, the hierarchy steps fictionalized by the West, the transformation of Anglo-Saxon cultures, their relationship with the subaltern and hybrid identities in their intersection with consciousness and first steps for the construction of a new culture will create the infrastructure of this chapter.

1.2. Locating Culture throughout History

As well as a wide spread and multi purposed use of culture throughout history, in the abstract it was principally began to be discussed for a socio politic need that served to the bourgeoisie as a new narrative in late Middle Ages and early Modern Age. The concept of culture was shaped and ensued after bourgeoisie's declaration of sovereignty which compulsorily caused rapid changes in social, philosophical, and intellectual fields.

The dominant effects of cultural embodiment in which the perception of bourgeoisie got off the ground was firstly based on theological factors. Peasantry who was dependent in nature obeyed to new emergent rules because of having concern, suspense and fear to survive. The abuse of the transcendent eased cultural elements to transform the formation of the colonized identity. What was determinant here was the unpredictable nature of peasants (who created the feudal infrastructure during middle Ages) in relationship with 'their' own lands. The peasant who shattered his existence in the hands of the aristocracy contradictorily destroyed his master's existence as well.

temporalizing all aspects of life of its former wards, now reborn as its clients." Quoted from Ian Gur-Ze'ev, Diasporic Philosophy and Counter-Education, The Netherlands, Sense Publishers, 2010, p. 196.

Theological factors were far more significant than any other thing that shaped cultures. Such a cultural transformation naturally was accordant with material productions. The colonial mind benefited from theological perception in the formation of cultural identity creating a fixed social structure that ought not to change the social order related to it. The bourgeoisie which targeted power and rationalized itself as a dynamic class was aware of the necessity to squirm out of the old modes of production and the world-order perspective accepted as constant. Because it had to reckon with practices that were created by these forms and it was also recreating these forms. Additionally, the ruling class ought to reorganize practices that were suitable to society's existing mode of production and thus declared the universality of the situation over such practices during mostly the renaissance. In this context, the definition of culture served as a tool and a label of the bourgeoisie between the 14th and 16th centuries. During this period which laid the foundations of the 18th Enlightenment era. culture based on humanism was enunciated as an unalloyed and natural area of humanity and was released from all kinds of civilized productions such as the church and the religious doctrines. At this point, being a step between the Middle Ages and Modern ages in the West, renaissance that centered man, was a road towards Enlightenment. As the individualism of Protestantism and humanism of renaissance were not dependent on any externality, the new culture inspired by them was mentalist and based on free thought.

Even though Rousseau and many other philosophers correlated culture with matter, it was still regarded as a spiritual/moral engagement in the Enlightenment era. The concept of culture degraded to a cognitive field and became vague throughout the period. The attempt to surpass the civilized man-who was shaped under feudalism-required making terms with current boundedness. The new man could have reckoned with the concepts of civilization that was dominant in the search of a new culture and its objective and subjective basics. Rousseau and other philosophers of the Enlightenment era analogically put the natural man against the civilized man who was identified with feudalism. They strongly criticized their institutions of civilization (art, science and their productions) while seeking culture on the basis of education which stood against alienation effects of the natural man and its natural instincts. Rousseau in *Emilie*⁴ states

_

⁴ Jean Jacques Rousseau, Emile or On Education, NuVision Publications, LLC, 2007.

that culture and its civilization products have paralyzed the natural man; therefore he suggests recreating them with instructors. The function of culture in this connection is degraded to 'education' for some philosophers -Rousseau, Kant, Hegel- of the Enlightenment era. As Rousseau's blame of devolution is not on the man but on the products of civilization, it is well understood that artists, intelligentsia, politicians, instructors are responsible for the civilized-degenerated man. Kant, instead of regarding the primitive natural man, he attributed to the civilized man. The principle Kant propounded-that man can educate and liberate himself throughout his historicity -is our connection to how a new definition of culture is derived throughout this study: Culture becomes a man-made term in this conceptualization. The problem, there, was to create the conditions of liberty and self-education. Culture was, in this case released from material processes and was targeted to an achievable destination within human mind. The other result derived from this definition is hierarchy which is the point that will provide an intersection to the colonial mind. Human mind that is the constructor of culture and its access to pre-determined targets determined the position of hierarchy. In other words, culture was possibly determined within the root of axiological approaches in the Enlightenment Era. Man was targeted to an obsolete destination and the new culture-identified with bourgeoisie-might be classified with the bourgeoisie itself and with differences among social structures.

Following these inferences, it should be reminded that Hegel's 'absolute' was re-determining the borders of culture and the bourgeoisie position of mind in a system of hierarchy. The classifications to reach the absolute which was witnessed in Kant and Hegel were expounded with the limitedness of the ascribed social structure. In other words, culture became a process of determining material conditions itself rather than being their production. It was the basis of humankind's cognitive evolution and at the same time, its process. The roots of a class society and a colonial based way of departure could, in a sense be derived from the intentions of Rousseau who attempted to make education and culture attaining the level of advanced cultures.

By this way, in Anglo-Saxon cultures which possessed imperial policies, culture degraded to an axiological and ethnologic basis. It was the source of hierarchic relations and antinomies in society and was regarded semantically as equivalent to civilization. The crucial point where colonial practices and culture relate to each other is the determination that would later on form a basis for the civil society's legalization of

its colonial pillage. The axiological approaches and its hegemonic codes drew up a cultural background in Anglo-Saxon literature. The civilized nations, their 'obligation' to bear civilization and present it to the non-civilized emerged in colonial works for the first time.

1.3. Colonialism / Post-Colonialism

"It is not the head of a civilization that begins to rot first.

It is the heart." ⁵

(A.Cesaire)

Colonial discourse will primarily be analyzed to locate the effect of colonialism upon the identity formation. Afterwards, the chapter will attempt to set light to strategies that decivilize the colonizer and the colonized and the system they have been wrapped up. At the very beginning, it should be noted that the problem of colonization is by no means an African issue, but a worldwide practice, a concern of the whole world.

Although colonies gained nominally independence years ago, they can no longer reverse the colonial process and its effects. Colonialism of today (by the name of neocolonialism) embodies a more insidious feasibility, being an 'acceptable' form of imperialism. It has transformed to a show of force without responsibility. Neocolonialism, post-colonialism and colonialism as merely 'processes' do not bear sharp contrasts in between themselves, on the contrary they are all triplet policies that widen the gap between the richer and poorer nations of the World. They serve to the operation of capitalist countries' system. However, it is obvious that a social collapse is inevitable; by this means, if it is gradual enough, the collapse would possibly serve to shift our fatal customs that have killed millions of people so far.

Colonial powers reconfigured societies politically, economically and culturally, implanting their ideas and institutions in their colonies. Thus, mapping the historical

_

⁵ Aimé Césaire, Discourse on Colonialism, New York and London, Monthly Review Press, 1972, p. 9.

background of the colonial process will contribute to have a healthy analysis especially on the cultural and social aspect of this work.

Colonization dates back to ancient times but modern colonization began in the 15th century when Portuguese and Spain first raided the African villages and enslaved people as part of their personal belongings. It involves the pursuit of power and prestige, especially by European powers in Africa, Asia, and the Americas. This colonization process includes the British Empire's expansion of its profits to the Wales, Scotland and up to the New World. It expands so large that it gives rise to the saying "The sun never sets on the British Empire," reflecting the number of time zones under their jurisdiction and the fact that it was always daylight in some part of the empire. (In the first place it should be stated that the central focus will be on the hegemony of the United Kingdom that possessed the most expansive colonial empire). Discussing the period in its historical process will lead the study to explore the roots of the colonial mind.

The kings of the Crusades, the renaissance, the reform and feudal system and their will of power have all contributed to pave the way of colonialist dominant classes. Capitalist forms of productions are labeled as the over-determination of the colonial processes. In this context, classical colonialism as the flourishing bed of capitalism first gazed on the New World's people and overseas. The new world was being shaped pursuant to the European feudal system. Once plantations had been built, activities basically mining began in colonies. During the 17th century, on account of Europe's going through an economic crisis shifted the approach of colonialism. The import of precious metal caused a high inflation in Europe and led to the economic collapse of landlords. The period that later on would serve to the North European companiesparticularly Dutch and English- began glossily with it. The economic crisis during the 17th century created mercantilist ideology in countries that stepped forward towards raw material sources to protect themselves from the panic. Initially, colonialists gravitated to Iberian Peninsula and South America colonies. The trade of sugarcane and slaves created the infrastructure of colonialist system in Europe. Increasing foreign influence in Africa at the end of the fifteenth century became a global perception that slavery was a legitimate and necessary tool of political-military and economic expansion. But in the mid-19th century in spite of being the backbone of colonialism for centuries, slave trade ended. That ushered a new age in human history.

Intellectual equality developed later on and it did not suit with the free market mentality. With the influence of French revolution in the late 18th century, slaves in Haiti revolted against their French masters and dismissed their owners from their lands. Mercantilist economy gave way to the principle of free market. In the pre-capitalist period early 19th century, England as a pioneer state was determined to settle the codes of capitalism. After 1870s, the period was in tendency to imperialist strategies of nationstates, instead of empires which prospered by means of colonies. (We may name this period as neo-colonialism without emphasizing colonial stages unnecessarily). French colonies in America and the East lost by France in 1815, Brazil's liberation against Portuguese in 1822 and England's loss of 13 colonies in North America were proofs of a historical reversal those days. Intend of colonialism was far from the civilizing mission that was ascribed to it. It is nowadays known that neo-colonialism or colonialism of modern-day became a crucial arena of national government to actualize their real policies overseas. To exemplify it: In Africa, proprietary right of lands and precious metal were vested merely to English citizens, thereby, they easily ruled the native society politically. Financial gains became far more precious than values of the Enlightenment era any more. In such case, they began to emphasize the concept of 'universalism' and the cultural and local values of the countries chosen as a market. Attendantly, the colonialist nations put up nationalism against globalization to make more profit in their colonies. Once colonized nations were precluded to establish their own industries, the distinction of today's developed and underdeveloped civilizations have emerged. However, surely the backwardness of communities is grounded on their external dependencies. Thus it is a fallacy to describe the colonial period quantitatively because it is impossible to measure the cruelty it has caused but the ways in which it moved can be analyzed to avoid the reemerge of the cruelty.

The following literary representations will therefore question whether colonial discourse and post-colonialism are specifically first-world, male, privileged, academic and institutionalized discourses that classify and survey the Other in the same measure as the actual modes of colonial dominance seeks to dismantle. Additionally, they will attempt to determine the relation of colonial practices with culture to create a new reading of cultural formation.

1.4. Representations

Joseph Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* in this context tallies with the hegemonic approach as above mentioned and culture-education relationship, moreover it clearly reveals material profits of the colonialists. His work tries neither to form basis nor criticize the colonial logic. Conrad's representation of Africa does not bear a different meaning than other writers. People of that world is odd, disguised of animal properties and identified with an uncanny darkness alike their skin. It means that Conrad cannot flee from general judgments despite positioning himself out. The Other is again uncivilized, evil alteration of the civilized, a mediator of European desires and in some readings, an image of the imperialist self. Shortly, the initial representations were often the antithesis of what was civilized –the civilized was always Europe.

A highly regarded novel in the Modernist pantheon, James Joyce's *Ulysses*, similarly represents a superficial Euro centralist perception of the East.⁶ The character in *Ulysses*, John Wyse in the following quotation authorizes English colonialism giving a scourge in their hands:

— That's your glorious British navy, says the citizen, that bosses the earth.

The fellows that never will be slaves, with the only hereditary chamber on the face of God's earth and their land in the hands of a dozen gamehogs and cottonball barons. That's the great empire they boast about of drudges and whipped serfs.

- On which the sun never rises, says Joe.
- And the tragedy of it is, says the citizen, they believe it. The unfortunate yahoos believe it.
- ---They believe in rod, the scourger almighty, creator of hell upon earth, and in Jacky Tar, the son of a gun, who was conceived of unholy boast, born of the fighting navy, suffered under rump and dozen, was scarified, flayed and curried, yelled like bloody hell, the third day he arose again from the bed,

⁶ James Joyce, Ulyses, Vol 9. London, Penguin, 1992, p. 128-137.

steered into haven, sitteth on his beamend till further orders whence he shall come to drudge for a living and be paid.

— But, says Bloom, isn't discipline the same everywhere. I mean wouldn't it be the same here if you put force against force?⁷

Bloom's response to Wyse proves the English Colonialist approach. The Occident remained incapable because of the uncontrollable Other. In this context, West attempted to civilize exotic lands but the East constituted an impediment to it. Joyce could not put an end to the East-West contradiction reinforcing the general perspective.

Similarly, the colonized periphery was a hybrid formation for Rudyard Kipling. He had a family which he could clearly carry the traces of Western cultural embodiment. As new group of English-Indian family, Kipling and the community which he belonged seemed to absorb the native elements of his own nation. Kipling expressed that he was dreaming in English in his autobiography 'Something of Myself' ⁸ Having a profile of a cultural hybrid, Kipling bowed the knee of the White Man and melted his own cultural existence in the colonialist country. India where he defined as his own land was incommensurate, thus Kipling chose to be protected under the English culture. "If Kipling regarded India as succumbed infelicitously to imperialism, there could be a conflict. But he didn't. For Kipling, the best destiny of India was to be ruled by England."

Rudyard Kipling's *The White Man's Burden* has importance for an analysis of a centre-periphery perception. Kipling under the determination of the Enlightenment era's codes of the new culture feels that he belongs to the new bourgeois culture. In *The White Man's Burden*, the perception of colonialism and its hierarchic determination clearly find its expression:

"Take up the White Man's burden Send forth the best ye breed--Go bind your sons to exile To serve your captives' need;

⁸ K.C. Belliappa, The Image Of India in English Fiction. B.R. Publishing Corparation, Delhi, 1991, p.23.

⁹ My translation, from Edward Said, Kültür ve Emperyalizm, Hil Yayın, İstanbul 1998,p.229.

15

⁷ Joyce, 1. Press, London, Penguin, 1960, p. 315-316.

Take up the White Man's burden-The savage wars of peace-Fill full the mouth of Famine
And bid the sickness cease;
And when your goal is nearest
The end for others sought,
Watch sloth and heathen Folly
Bring all your hopes to nought;

When the lines of the poem are analyzed, it is obvious that Kipling reflects a Euro centralist view by metaphors of non-Western nations as childlike and devil. From his inferences, the responsibility of the White Man is to rule and compel other nations to absorb Western way of life in the new world order. Labeled as cultural imperialism, it emerges as the metaphor of depreciatory to the cultural tradition of non-Western peoples.

A Euro centralist new culture and its cultural identity are coded themselves in colonial literature. Throughout colonialism, colonialist nations build their identity and existence related to the perception above mentioned. This inference is significant to have a departure while analyzing the selected works. As it will be detailed in later chapters of this study, the above determination will be taken as a starting point in the pursuits of a new culture.

Culture as discussed through its positioning in literary works espouses to the center of the subject and vanishes in the subjectivity of the subject. The stirring cultures of the colonized nations were marginalized, packed and put up in time. With reference to Said, the 19th century writers did not write on the East (the East is the center literature of colonialism) but spoke instead of it.(the East here represents the literature of all Others). (My emphasis). Locating the notion of culture as such will be a reference to colonialism and this will serve to find the traces of colonial identity coded in literary language.

In a sense, colonial literature emerged before the independence of colonized nations. The concept of culture found a hierarchic meaning after interrelating with the new emergent class; the bourgeoisie, and it caused a Eurocentric decoding in the above

-

¹⁰ Rudyard Kipling, The White Man's Burden. Complate collection of poems by Rudyard Kipling, 2011, http://www.poetryloverspage.com/poets/kipling/white_mans_burden.html, (05.02.2012), p.1.

¹¹ Edward Said, Diacritica, Fall, 1977, p. 43-44.

representations. Thus, it should be stated that literature is not detached from philosophic background and it enters into a consistent process with the infrastructure of the society. By this inference, the educational role of culture necessarily prompts the man of letters to be positioned in the center and directs other's perceptions by their writings. In this context, the vague approach of Conrad, the quest of Joyce to form his aristocracy over the Orient and ultimately the reshaping of Kipling as a hybrid and the White man's civilizing mission in his representations unite three of them in common.¹²

This was again the position of the instructors of the Enlightenment era. The role of academia was absorbed within the definition of culture. Their mission to 'educate' was relevant with the economic needs of the ruling class.

The meaning attributed to culture was so powerful that it even exercised influence over the Marxist writers who deprecated the bourgeoisie as a class and the hegemonic relations in terms of their economic and socio-cultural contents. A Marxist writer Christopher Caudwell while retorting to the new culture of bourgeoisie in *Studies and Further Studies in a Dying Culture* portrayed the intensity of the country dances as bizarreness-that is a kind of otherness, yet he could not elude from the stereotypes.

The basis of the colonial discourse and the formation of identity were primarily sought in the definition of culture as a departure. Until these lines, the study propounded the necessity of creating a new cultural perception and thereby refining it in post-colonial literature. The new definition is expected to be relieved of its previous hegemonic determinations and aims simply to ground on 'man'.

1.5. Colonial Discourse and Identity formation

While craving up post-colonial literature, we should note that it is obvious to consider culturally and politically reconstructed maps in post-colonial literature to be

17

¹² Ian Almond, Tales of Buddha, Dream of Arabia: Joyce and the Images of the East, İstanbul, 2002, vol.57, no:1.

¹³ Lewis S. Feuer, Marks and Engels: Basic Writings on Politics and Philosophy, London, Fontana Boks, 1971, p. 489.

¹⁴ Caudwell C., Studies in a DyingCulture, Monthly Review, New York, 1971.

able to interpret the field complete and overall. Right after analyzing Western representations of the colonized, this chapter will offer an insight into the colonial literature of the 'Other', through African representations that will hopefully satisfy a need in post-colonial literature.

Orientalist studies may stay out of post-colonial literature as well as going parallel with them. However, it would be beneficial to theorize the field with -preferably -Edward Said, Homi Bhabbha, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Michel Foucault and theorists who deemed complex relations necessary. Because we foresee that post-colonial literature and their conceptualization about the identity formation on the 'Other' in Orientalist studies, in some extent, work in association.

Forming cultural studies outside the Western modernist definition and remembering that modernist West is not universal and singular require to analyze the field in multi stressed perspectives, that is; it is creating new discourses by transforming and by being not limited on a single space. In this sense, while creating the image of East-West, Edward Said set a discourse which he defined around a power related source and power relations (that is what he borrowed from Michel Foucault). Said's 'Orientalism'- though being criticized for focusing merely on Western literary works- is substantial to fill the gap of collaborating Orientalism and (post) colonialism. Said, in his essay *The discourse of the Orient* states that, "The Orient was almost a European invention, and had been since antiquity a place of romance, exotic beings, haunting memories, landscapes, and remarkable experiences" The Orient, stressed by his references in Orientalism is a Western fiction.

"As opposed to the idealization of Orientalism as a scholarly or scientific thinking about the Orient in the nineteenth century, Said criticizes on Orientalism as a Western phenomenon which can function in Western literature as a mode of thought for defining, classifying, and expressing the presumed cultural inferiority of the Islamic Orient. In other words, it is a part of the vast control mechanism of colonialism, designed to justify and perpetuate European dominance". 16

-

¹⁵ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin, The Post-Colonial Studies Reader, 2. Edition, London, Routledge, 2006, p. 24-25.

¹⁶ Kamil Aydın, Turkey as Represented in English Literature of the time, Atatürk University, Erzurum, Ph.D. thesis completed at University of Warwick, 1994.

By examining such contested spaces, multiple intentions on how a Western culture represents a non-Western culture in its own writings will be explored, since there seems to be a correlation between discourse and politics, more broadly between discourse and culture, which is manifested in any attempt by one culture to talk about another. However, it would be insufficient to seek the colonialist discourse solely in Orientalist works as Orientalist fiction doesn't include solely producers of colonialist discourse ¹⁷.

Orientalism is often critized to emphasize the West-East contrast and further polarize the opposite poles by some scholars. "But the concept of Orientalism is not given; it is created. It is not formed, but posits itself in itself; it is self-positioning"¹⁸. It cannot be mentioned about a pure Orient but sub-identities considering differences primarily on a historical and geographical base.

"Discursive performativity appears to produce that which it names, to enact its own referent, to name and to do, to name and to make ... [g]enerally speaking, a performative functions to produce that which it declares" ¹⁹. When colonial discourse is analyzed in the light of Western representations, the reader comes across with intented directions that problematize the process of identity formation. To throw some light on these directions, works reflecting Euro-centrist perception should primarily be analyzed in terms of historicity.

The historical process goes back to Columbus with narrations about the Indians represented as 'discovered' by him. The Westerns, travelling abroad encountered with 'people from other lands' for the first time. The image was like what they had imagined before about the images of Others based on foregone representations. Their exploration adventure went parallel to the images they had carried with themselves. The (mis) perception mentioned in the works fed phantasms and contributed to the recreation of the discourse based on creating binary opposites. The Other was the orient, the African,

Africana, Vol.6, Uni.of Toronto, Toronto, No 2, August 2003.

¹⁷ We do not claim that all discourses are colonialist but we may well argue that all kinds of colonial relations mirror power relations in different ways; Michel Foucault's power relations will be examined in later chapters related to it. ¹⁸ Mustapha Marrouchi, the New/Old Idiot: Re-reading Said's Contributions to Post-Colonial Studies:Philosophia

¹⁹ Butler, p.107.

the Indian, the female... The Other could be anyone who reflected differentness on the benefit of power relations.²⁰

Orientalism is a way of imagining, emphasizing, exaggerating and distorting differences of mainly Arab peoples and other cultures as compared to that of Europe and the U.S. It often involves seeing the Oriental cultures as exotic, backward, uncivilized, and at times dangerous. In the work, "It also tries to show that European culture gained in strength and identity by setting itself off against the Orient as a sort of surrogate an even underground self."²¹ Examples of early Orientalism can be seen in European paintings and photographs and also in images in the 19th and early 20th centuries. These paintings, created by European artists of the 19th and early 20th centuries, depict the Arab World as an exotic and mysterious place of sand, harems and belly dancers, reflecting a long history of Orientalist fantasies which have continued to permeate our contemporary popular culture²² With streaming images of mainly Islamic discourse spread around the world, the message the audience is being sent is that Muslim people as Others are unstable religious fanatics. Today, one would think Orientalism to be a thing of the past, but this is not so in an era of globalization. Western perceptions of the East continue to be skewed by the media. This leads to the reinforcement of old stereotypes, fears and biases that the average Westerner has, of countries in the 'East'. These ingrained perceptions can be indiscernible to people it reaches until they travel to an 'Eastern' country and experience it at first-hand. Hence such representations are not solely 'historical' interest; such colonial processes continue to haunt the boundaries of contemporary identities both socially and culturally.

The binary opposites are positioned in between themselves; the East is tamed, oppressed and dominated by the West and eventually is reconfigured with this reality. The perception -in most of the works- was supported by misjudgments and stereotypes and these representations made travesty of the objective reality based on 'man'. The shadowing continuously has caused an inconsistent impact on the formation of cultures throughout the history of man and public perceptions have continued to feed it. Conversely, we should particularly aim to avoid reinforcing the bipolar antinomy of the

-

²⁰ Foucault at this point, is an indispensable reference to analyze the mechanism by which systems of power are maintained. Later chapters will focus on how these mechanism work for the benefit of the ruling class.

²¹ Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, p.25.

²² A recent example to this fixed perception is the movie "James Bond" which is nowadays being shooted (Spring, 2012) in Istanbul. The film crew did block off the passing of women who weren't turbaned around the movie set to feed the Oriental image of the East. Western media's treatment of Islam and Muslim are cultivated a skewed 'Orientalist' view of Turkey in general.

Orient and the Occident. By reason of the unknown producer of the discourse, the discourse shows a tendency to universalization, interpenetrating into the structure of language and cultural and moral codes. Thus, it would be faulty to seek the universally coded knowledge merely between the relations of the colonizer and colonized. The fictioned knowledge is both within and without these relations. Humankind should be constantly aware of the fact that throughout history until it is presented to us; the knowledge coded is already disunited, characterized and intertwined.

A second point that has influenced identity formation so far is the reinforcement to create an 'Anti-discourse'. Anti-colonial discourse is generated by colonized people while the Islamic discourse is built up by Muslims living in the colonial motherlands. It led Muslims to call upon religious elements as Anti-Christian metaphors. A point that attracts attention is that the Islamic discourse was greatly embraced in Muslim countries more and more it was based on irrational, nonscientific and dogmatic backwardness by the West. For this reason, haplessly Islamic issues have been overstressed by the Orient while forming an anti-discourse. ²³

Islamic discourse, created based on social relations, nowadays is reprocessed in the light of international relations as Anti-Islamic discourse was produced. It goes through questioning processes which adds an addition, an alternative course of reading to the East/West polarized colonial literature.

Another notion of identity formation arises from the learning of 'social roles' that are based on 'marked differences' in our conceptual scheme of the colonized. The form of identification emerges from practices diversified based on ethnicity, race, language or origin. Differentiation is eroticized on the native/oriented female and especially, grand narratives bring exoticness forward. However, 'difference' may serve to a multidimensional and complex perception semantically because it equally embodies discursive, politic and economic relations that are what we need to recapitulate

²³ For further reading on Islam within a colonial discourse and ideology, see Said, Edward, Covering Islam: How the media and the experts determine how we see the rest of the world Vintage Books, 1997,p.200 .For further information on mapping the field of colonial and Oriental discourse cultural and sexual difference in the discourse of Orientalism see Meyda Yeğenoğlu, Colonial Fantasies: Towards a Feminist Reading of Orientalism London and New York: Cambridge UP, 1998.

On the location of binary oppositions historically and Islamic fundamentalism challenging the West see Mutman, Mahmut Orientalism, Hegemony and Cultural Difference and Under the Sign of Orientalism: the West vs. Islam

frequently. Nowadays, this image has changed in some extent: The native turned to a mirror reflecting the face of the colonizer in Western representations. The fictional representation of the native has unified both the signifier and the signified combining them to each other. The inter-subjectivity mentioned is fed with symbolic marginalization. On one side, the presence of the Other is inter-depended on the presence of his/her invader and his/her position as a master, on the other side quite paradoxically; the presence of the colonizer as an absence becomes depended on the oppressed. They have both fetishized each other and are continuously in a dialectic relationship. Honestly, the colonial subject can never be fixed to a concrete sheer position contrary to general view. Importantly, there is no universally applicable, discursively neutral definition of identity. It is an ongoing process that will never form itself entirely, even after death. This textually stated discursive field is made possible from its praxis, so definitely it cannot be claimed that it is principally the creation of textual criticism.

It is impossible to consider the literary products unattached to history of humanity. Post-colonial studies, a late developed field of study, have made the presence of anti-colonial discourse inevitable in the context of literary works. Especially, as stated in this study, English novels, poems and plays are directly related to the colonizer's needs, their creating a field of Euro-centrist practices by trivializing the native literature or native symbols.

The Tempest, an epic play by William Shakespeare built up figures that embodies the master-slave relationship, materializes it. Colonial figures start to be applied as the symbols of the whole will. As is the case with all types of discourses intended to be created, the formation of the Other will reserve shattering effects inside. In colonial discourse, the Other will damage to the role of its master in different ways. That's why it will perpetually be limited and recreated by the colonialist. This experience harbors risk and struggle intermittently but continuously. As it is the case in the play, the will of the colonialist in *The Tempest* collapses against its Other time to time. Thus, it is hard to claim that Shakespeare's work declares colonial victory but mostly it may be a boundary text which functions as a radical binary discursive field.

While producing strategies of political imposition, *The Tempest* leads to generate contradiction and destruction via its characters.²⁴

A second colonial representation which embodies a binary interpretation is Robinson Crusoe by Daniel Defoe. Robinson, the colonialist metaphor of the play, is stalemated in the discourse of Otherization that is created by him. 25 The trivialization process of the colonial subject does not include merely the transnational colonized but also embraces all the Other en masse. Crusoe, as interpreted a man of economy, acts as a colonizer dominating everyone he encounters on the island, including 'animals.' They exist all for his economic advantage. Crusoe constructs an English kingdom, forecasting imperialism on the island. However, Robinson's Christian doctrine and his silencing of the subaltern voice he aims to disseminate, contradict with the material profit he dreams to derive. And it reveals his pure Euro-centric philosophy in his encounter with the non-Western peoples. From hence, this analysis implies that the process of colonization embodies the potential of including the master-slave condition wholly, what is more than the marginalization of the colonial subjects in the motherland. In other words, as the process of trivialization takes also the master in, it can stand out amongst its subjects and position itself on top of power relations. At this juncture, it is hard to make out which sides of the master/slave relationship lose in value because of the autochthonous smoke screen as a perfect metaphor for the process of colonization in the text.

1.5.1. African representations

Colonial ideology was premised on the idea of a dichotomous relationship between European modernity and African tradition. To set the pace, some African representations reflecting their existence despite the history of being colonized will be analyzed from their own aspects. Many African intellectuals and writers throughout much of the 20th century sought to address this ideological construction and its implications for the construction of post-colonial politics, society and identity. Though their approaches differ in some extent, these novelists recognize the condition of

_

²⁴ William Shakespeare, The Tempest, Rpt in William Shakespeare: The Complete Works, Ed. Peter Alexander, London, Collins Clear Type Press, 1989, p. 363-364.

²⁵ Defoe, Daniel. Robinson Crusoe, Retold by Pauline Francis, United States, Windmill Books, 2009.

alienation as a problematic one, regardless of the potentialities it may hold. Africans educated along the Western model saw literature as a means with which to combat against the racist colonial discourse. That was where native Africans could go into their cultural values and elements wholeheartedly against colonial powers. The agents affecting the African culture and their identity formation have been a history of oppression and cross-cultural interaction.

English sailors were obsessed on the idea of cannibalism when they first travelled to South Sea Islands. Men from other lands were those who ate human flesh in their mites. On the perception of cannibals, their manner is manifested as clearly as possible by the Natives as below:

"The Hawaiians' was based on the pragmatics of common sense. Here were a ragged, filthy, half-starved bunch of people arriving on their island, gorging themselves on food and asking questions about cannibalism. Since Hawaiians did not know the British inquiry was a scientific hypothesis, they made the pragmatic inference that these half-starved people were asking questions about cannibalism because cannibals themselves and might actually eat the Hawaiians. If the British could ask what seemed to the Hawaiians an absurd question-whether they ate enemies slain in battle- it is not unreasonable for the Hawaiians to have made further inference: that since the British had slaughtered so many Hawaiians, it is they who ate their slain enemies."

Discourse as seen above is not the reality of everybody. As stated in advance, discourse's creating a practice is not as comprehensible as its verse and it seems quite ironic and challenging. Aforesaid conceptualization of the native/orient/black in this study is not solely an external Other but is an area of freedom for 'power'- a Foucauldian element, and represents its multi directional power.

Colonial writers or producers ascribed English as a universal language while creating a colonial discourse. The colonized artists willingfully chose to produce perform art and express their cultural richness in the colonial language. This study can easily foresee that they constitute an inharmonic balance being both companion and spy

_

²⁶ Ania Loomba, Colonialism-Postcolonialism, Routledge, London, New York, 1. edition, 1998, p.102.

in their common way-and that is a historical paradox which reveals itself in divers and dangerous contours. Reflecting a cultural, literary and ideological movement, the Negritude Movement led by French-speaking writers ²⁷, (these names are not those who simply write in the colonial language) as an example has maintained a dignified stance against French Colonization and manifested their black consciousness through literary works. Especially in poems, the Africans embraced their past and called into being as in the following examples:

Here's an example from a native writer, David Diop's poem "Africa.":

Africa, my Africa
Africa of proud warriors in ancestral savannahs....
Is this you, this back that is bent
This back that breaks under the weight of humiliation
This back trembling with red scars
And saying yes to the whip under the midday sun.....
That is Africa your Africa
That grows again patiently obstinately
And its fruit gradually acquires
The bitter taste of liberty. 28

African writers' hostility or partnership with English Language is sometimes found voice in representations as desperate, anger or possibly as a call as above exemplified. The reader discerns a disturbance witnessing a compromise verdict between the writer and the colonial language. Yet in the context of the poem, the native literature does not serve to function as a medium that reveals "despairs and hopes, the enthusiasm and empathy, the thrill of joy and the stab of pain..." but also a nation's history as it moved from "freedom to slavery, from slavery to revolution, from

-

²⁷Négritude is a cultural movement launched in 1930s Paris by French-speaking black graduate students from France's colonies in Africa and the Caribbean territories. These black intellectuals converged around issues of race identity and black internationalist initiatives to combat French imperialism. They found solidarity in their common ideal of affirming pride in their shared black identity and African heritage, and reclaiming African self-determination, self-reliance, and self-respect. The Négritude movement signaled an awakening of race consciousness for blacks in Africa and the African Diaspora. This new race consciousness, rooted in a (re)discovery of the authentic self, sparked a collective condemnation of Western domination, anti-black racism, enslavement, and colonization of black people. It sought to dispel denigrating myths and stereotypes linked to black people, by acknowledging their culture, history, and achievements, as well as reclaiming their contributions to the world and restoring their rightful place within the global community. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/N%C3%A9gritude,05.02.2012

²⁸ Closepet Dasappa Narasimhaiah,quoted in Narasimhaiah, 153, African English Poetry: Some Themes and Features, 3 May 2002, http://www.postcolonialweb.org/africa/jvrao5.html, (12.12.2011), p. 10.

revolution to independence and from independence to tasks of reconstruction which further involve situations of failure and disillusion". ²⁹

The cultural confusion and the disturbance are well articulated by Mabel Segun in a poem from African Literature as following:

Here we stand Infants overblown Poised between two civilizations Finding the balance irksome.³⁰

In order to destroy the African stereotypical images of their country, African writers such Chinua Achebe considered the colonial as languages as mere tools or means to achieve their objectives and projected their African world view via them. As literature reflects people's social, political, and cultural situations, it seems that the unconscious attitude of writers took effect in their writings, being a mixture of love and hatred, acceptation and rejection which clearly were manifestation of struggle with the language. As it is the case in Achebe's work, Anthills of the Savannah that is about national histories and their realizations. The national identity becomes prominent in the heart of African societies throughout the novel. While Achebe articulates the processes of his characters' alienation, he narrates the characters' subjectivity carefully. Instead of Western representations that are written in plural narrations, he is refuting the idea of labeling a whole nation. Anthills of the Sanannah, in this respect, explores several Western and African colonial binaries and dislocates the concepts based on class and social status as it reflected on his two characters; Agatha and Beatrice:

> "It was Agatha's habit to cry for hours whenever Beatrice said as much as boo to her; and Beatrice's practice to completely ignore her. But today, after she had deposited the used plates in the sink, Beatrice turned to where Agatha sat with her face buried in her hands on the kitchen-table and placed her hand on her heaving shoulder. She immediately raised her head and stared at her mistress in unbelief. "I am sorry, Agatha. "The

-

²⁹ Bellur Krishamachar Sundararaja Iyengar, "(Iyengar, 15)", African English Poetry: Some Themes and Features, 3 May 2002, ph. 4. http://www.postcolonialweb.org/africa/jyrao5.html, (12.12.2011).

Mabel Segun, "Quoted in Povey, 39", African English Poetry: Some Themes and Features, 3 May 2002, p. 15. http://www.postcolonialweb.org/africa/jvrao5.html , (12.12.2011).

unbelief turned first to shock and then, through the mist of her tears, a sunrise of smiles." ³¹

Achebe uses similar descriptive techniques in order to create a certain tone of characters and their shared socioeconomic context. The work eventually becomes an acknowledgment of a colonial history that cannot be erasable.

As a last African representation, Mukunzo Kioko, an oral historian portrays a bitter tableau of the exploitation they experienced as below:

"Our fathers were living comfortably. They had cattle and crops; they had salt marshes and banana trees. Suddenly they saw a big boat rising out of the great ocean. This boat had wings all of white, sparkling like knives. White man came out of the water and spoke words which no one understood. Our ancestors took fright; they said that these were *vumbi*, spirits retured from the dead. They pushed them back into to the ocean with volleys of arrows. But the *vumbi* spat fire with a noise of thunder. Many men were killed. Our ancestors fled. The chiefs and wise men said that these *vumbi* were the former possessors of the land. From that time to our days now, the whites have brought us nothing but wars and misery."³²

At the last analysis, subjectivation is affected through discursive practices in all of the representations, and understanding the performative becomes an important tool for understanding the constitutive effects of these discursive practices. Rather than discussing whether post-colonialism is an emancipatory revolt genre literarily or just a periodical explanandum, this chapter is aware of going through anti-colonialism as primarily trying to absorb it. The conceptualization does not possess something or does not belong to somebody. It is powerful since it embraces all humanity. It is complex, gloomy and resistant.

_

³¹ Chinua Achebe, Anthills of the Sanannah, p.169-170.

³² Mukunzo Kioko, Hochschild, Supra, p.15-16.

CHAPTER TWO

COLONIAL SUBJECTIVATION

2.1. Colonial Subjects

This chapter will demonstrate how selected colonial writings are conveying a complex process of subjectification that would not be given justice, were we only to analyze it as an opposition between colonizers and colonized, between Europeans and Africans, between dominating authority and dominated subalterns. Rather, the study is conscious about the existing politics in every subjectification. As stated throughout this dissertation, the complexities of identity created by discourse were contextualized in order to be analyzed sensitively. Furthermore, this contextualization must not be solely justified through theoretical models of individualism, post-modernity and postcolonialism as implied in many modern studies of identity. External factors that contribute to the ways in which communities and individuals within those communities negotiate their allegiances, or what is often referred to as identities constitute the background of the chapter. "When themes and categories developed in one historical context, such as a region of the colonial world, are reused elsewhere in the service of different social arrangements and political tactics, there is an inevitable process of displacement and reformulation, Thus, this chapter focuses on the displaced and reformulated subjectivation of the colonized in whole but throws a light to many factors that contribute to identification as a process in certain representations.

Judith Butler built subject formation, arguing that "subjectivation is neither simply the domination of a subject nor its production, but designates a certain kind of restriction in production"34. Foucault accordingly emphasized processes of 'subjectivation'35, whereby individuals are made subjects through their everyday

³³ Timothy Mitchell, Questions of Modernity, America, Minnesota Press, 2000, p. 7.

³⁴ Deborah Youdell, Impossible Bodies, Imposible Selves: Exclusions and Student Subjectives, Netherlands, Springer, 2006, p. 44.

³⁵ Thomas R Flynn Sartre, Foucault and historical reason. Vol. 2, A poststructuralist mapping of history. Chicago : Univ. of Chicago Press, 2005, p.144-145.

functioning as transistors (and resistors) in the circuits of knowledge via the from below productive power of governmentality, which imposes particular laws of `truth'. 36

This analysis underscores the necessity to be precise about what we mean with "processes of subjectivity". What do we refer to, are they practices or representations? Does it merely refer to the verbal discourse?

At an initial assessment, studying processes of subjectivation means applying an integrated approach about/on how economics, law enforcement, literature, medical practice, the physicality of our surroundings such as buildings (as stated in Foucault's discussion of prisons as panopticons) affect active subjects in a range of differentiated interactions with the colonial agents. The need of evaluating the colonized's anticolonial resistance as madness or anomaly has been carefully situated in Western presentations and colonial discourse. However, the validity of psychoanalytically coded knowledge should be often questioned. What is frequently doubted in this field is that whether colonial psychology and psychoanalytic emphasized the differences between the colonizer and the colonized and created a pathological definition on the area. It is problematic to figure out whether colonial approach has created its valid reasons through scientific decoding.

Frantz Fanon, using psychoanalysis and psychoanalytical theory to map out the dependency and inadequacy the Black people experience, diagnosed the inferiority of Black subjects and discovered related indications in their minds. Fanon states that effective disalienation of the black man entails an immediate recognition of social and economic realities ³⁷ The native who loses his/her cultural recognition embraces the cultural codes of the colonizer. Fanon, in his work, argues that Lacanian and Freudian analyses that a preoccupation with individual neurosis is no substitute for analysis of the social situation of Black people in a White World. He refers to Lacan's mirror stage as historical and economic realities come into the picture. More forcefully, he insists that "the dreams had nothing to do with the dependency complex." ³⁸ "The discoveries of Freud are of no use to us here. What must be done is to restore this dream to its proper time, and this time is the period during which

³⁶ Citation of Foucoult in Simon Springer ,Environment and Planning D: Society and Space, New Zealand, Volume 28, 2010, p. 931-950.

³⁷ Frantz Fanon, Black Skin White Masks ,Pluto Press, 1967, p. 10-11.

³⁸ Ibid, p.161-162.

eighty thousand natives were killed." As he notes people's dreams are dreams of running, escaping, jumping- dreams of freedom.

A Western literary representation, Conrad's Heart of Darkness narrates the conflict between non-Western cultures and modern civilization. The notes of Fanon related to the work of Conrad are clearly portrayed over Conrad's characters who exhibit the possibilities for isolation and moral deterioration in modern life.

Kurtz as the symbolization of Europe in the novella gets richer as he colonizes Congo, he depends more and more on power as he gets wealthier and enacts nonhumanly as he depends on power. Kurtz -a representation of the Western mind- goes mad as he digs the 'darkness'. 40 What is reflected in the work is not merely an internal journey range between indigenization and maddening. It is going through the heart of darkness, the heart of being and the heart of disappearing. The dark continent of Africa is reflecting the light after Western settlers step on the land in most of the representations. While reading the following lines of Marlowe- the intermediary character of the story- the reader feels the darkness such as a pilgrimage towards light:

> "...you lost your way on that river as you would in a desert, and butted all day long against shoals, trying to find the channel, till you thought yourself bewitched and cut off for ever from everything you had known once-somewhere-far away-in another existence perhaps." 41

The work of Conrad is a psychological journey in Congo, most of all in his heart rooted in his contradictions between two civilizations. The vital doubt was whether what the Europeans were doing to the land was a good thing or not; he doesn't necessarily know, so he chooses not to deal with that reality. The reality becomes the naked darkness itself.

The analysis of these Western representations resemble to each other as the European is oversimplified to an individual context while, ironically, the colonized community is stigmatized corporately in most of Euro-centered works. This multi-

⁴⁰ Joseph Conrad, The Heart of Darkness, Forgotten Books, Logan, Iowa.,Perfection Form, 1980, p. 101-107.

⁴¹ İbid. p. 44.

stigmatization eliminates the particular differences in the colonized community and creates merely colonized masses. From the narrations of the book, it is witnessed that oppressed communities are named with certain equations (such it is detailed in Aime Cesaire: Christianity=civilization, paganism=savagery)⁴² These Western made equations include the degradation of various recycled colonial symbols and ideas.

There are no doubt useful and even necessary 'values', but do they constitute civilization? Is not civilization, above all else, progress in human personality? ⁴³ When civilization is analyzed as a concept, it seems that it includes all the complex and cross-colonial networks from technological developments and colonial constructions to colonial resistance. Networks intersect each other at their spaces to form a civilization.

To plan the social structure, the need of an individual based analysis would be a lack without regarding the mechanism of societies. Thus, another point this chapter stresses is that the analysis of events' formation is based on 'societies' more than it is based on the 'individuals'. Since, the social mechanism organizes the ideology, politics, culture and directly the colonial identities.

Colonial history has affected the concerns of other fields, from economy to military; and gender as a 'marginal' category is not beyond them. So while analyzing one field (such as gender), the colonial corpus should not be limited, it should explore all aspects of oppression through their practices to see the lurking position of the discourse explored without homogenizing the field. This chapter does not stress that colonial discourse is directly gendered (at least it requires another kind of functional praxis to be analyzed) but; it is evident that gender will contribute to the post-colonial field when analyzed in the light of gender- stressed works. Gender displays a parallelism to the colonial field as a supporter in colonial representations when to discuss in its historical context. Post-colonial feminism is a universal field based on complex and multi identities, not only consisting Western feminists but all women of the world. The problem is more sophisticated than gender, ensued from intersecting identities and creating new and specific conceptualization of identity formation.

_

⁴²Aimé Césaire, Discourse on colonialism, Translated by Joan Pinkham. This version published by Monthly Review Press: New York and London, 1972. Originally published as *Discours sur le colonialisme* by Editions Presence Africaine, 1955, p.2

⁴³ Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, p.91.

As it is clearly seen in post-colonial identity, gender is similarly grounded on Eastern-Western polarization. Western feminists are generalized as being progressive and scientific while Eastern women are identified as static and traditional such as the classical polarization. Marginalization consists not only 'Other women' of the third world countries but also all the colonial identities affected by the exploitation process (whether of their own free will or by internalizing the colonization process). What is disregarded about the field has been the change of the post-colonial women and the cultural and local parameters that have made transformation inevitable. The colonized subject has had to form a precipitate identity embracing typical and anti-imperialist values and attendantly, Western way of thinking.

Early on, the image of colonial woman in literature was sharing very similar references such as: America's being introduced as a nude virgin, female gendered images of continents or black women paintings waiting to be conquered and Africa. They were portrayed as they were in need of a masculine power and it caused them to be presented as meta narratives. The female body that is portrayed in these works symbolizes the whole continent. The over-conscious elements serve to the field as well as the connotations of subconscious phantasies and desires. Hy this means, the relationship between otherness and gender is renewed continuously. While this representation is passive, paradoxically the colonized woman is exposed to a double pole assessment. That is:

- 1- Barbarian, libidally directed, object of desire
- 2- Colonial imagery provoking the admiration of white woman and white man, source of womanly phantasies⁴⁶

While interpreting the representation of the colonial connection, it may be defined as a network based on both sides' free will and mutual profit. However, free will can be evaluated differently related to the colonized. Things people think that they

⁴⁴ See the Oriental hareem that reflects solely one phantasm of Gendered discourse in Oriental/Colonial works.

⁴⁵ To add more on the issue, we claim that generally, the common perception of the woman is faulty however this study stresses especially on the misperception of the black/Orient woman. Despite being criticized, Gender as a very complex issue to be probed is considerably limited but not excluded in this study while analyzing colonial discourse.

⁴⁶ See Arabian Nights to see how the book played a decisive role in shaping the view of the Mideast Islamic world in the minds of people in the European world.

want are the creations of hegemonic relationships which make them such as they want freely. This form of power applies itself to immediate everyday life which categorizes the individual, marks him by his own individuality, attaches him to his own identity, imposes a law of truth on him which he must recognize and which Others have to recognize in him. It is a form of power which makes individuals subjects. There are two meanings of the word subject: Subject to someone else by control and dependence, and tied to his own identity by a conscious self-knowledge.

"Both meanings suggest a form of power which subjugates and makes subject to the problematic frame of identity complexifies among eternal branches of power and the imperialist culture continues reinforcing the other identically from different ways." 47

That is; the subject of another culture acts, but she/ he acts within the limits of subjection. "I will call subjectivization the procedure by which one obtains the constitution of a subject, or more precisely, of a subjectivity which is of course only one of the given possibilities of organization of a self-consciousness."

After all of these analyses, we are still doubtful of claiming the colonized is perfectly constructed. "Since the subject is never entirely built by power, it is not formed completely to be built continuously" It can be derived from the inferences above that the subject accepts his/her subjectivation freely recognizing her/ himself through his subjection. Regarding what Althusser indicates that "there are no subjects except by and for their subjection" These determinations and practices are embedded in social rituals directed by ideology. He argues that the ideology constitutes and transforms the individual as a subject. Hence, "subjection is neither simply the domination of a subject nor its production, but designates a certain kind of restriction in production."

⁴⁷ Michel Foucault quoted in Stuart Hall, Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices, London : Sage Publ. Book , 1997, p. 55.

⁴⁸ Michel Foucault, Politics Philosophy Culture, 1. Basım, Great Britain, Routledge, 1988, ph. 253.

⁴⁹ Judith.Butler: The Imperialist Subject, Journal of Urban and Cultural Studies, 2.1.1991.

⁵⁰ Louis Althusser, Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses, New York, *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*, Monthly Review Press, Translated: from the French by Ben Brewster, 1971, p.169.

⁵¹ Judith Butler, The Psychic Life of Power, California, Stanford Universty Press, 1997, p. 83-84.

At the final analysis, it should be remembered that the world is anymore a site of sophisticated terms such as post-modernism, globalization, search of identity, centerperiphery and migration. Most of them are the direct results of some quarters which are in search of new markets due to the resource depletion the humanity has caused. For this reason, some researches, Zygmunt Bauman and Stuart Hall, have implied that the search of self-identity is futile for people. Because social, political and economic conditions are not grounded on solid basis and it may be discussed that such terms became almost meaningless due to the inconstancy and mobility of all fields of life. As Hall identifies; the formation of identities and the articulation of it are continuously in motion due to the reconfiguration of political conditions, power balance and personal biographies. Thus they will always remain fragmentary, neither gained nor lost. Identity can never come to an ideal form, being not matured. The identity is gendered, reformulated, reconfigurated, subjected to a process of subjectivation. Thus, "the search of identity becomes an illusion, yet it can be developed employing certain strategies under certain circumstances." 52

2.2. Language and Colonial Identity

Discursive analysis has broadened the colonial field and covered all bases with its branches. Yet, it still gives priority to language. Language is not just a communication tool, consisting of sounds but is going phenomenon directly shaped with human experience and parallelly formed with it. Language is the imitation of real life -written or oral-; in this circumstance, it is a tool reflecting the processing of power. Colonial language, as a tool has a transcendental function and content, infiltrating to the cultural codes and standards of the colonized society till it causes the changes needed. As it is stated in *Post-colonial Studies Reader*:

"The first contender for the 'ownership' of meaning is language, commonly held to embody or contain meaning either

_

⁵² Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." Colonial Discourse and Post-colonial Theory: a Reader. Ed. Patrick Williams and Chrisman. London, Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1994, p. 392-401.

by direct representation or in a more subtle way by determining the perception of the world, 53.

The works written and published in English Language started very early in India or South Africa compared to other countries. That was the direct relation of their being colonized, their being directed to use the colonial language that carried many other images, knowledge, cultural elements and practices with. All these components could easily process the society and inherently cause inevitable changes in the society.

"While it is quite clear that language is more than a 'reproducing' instrument for voicing ideas', for what do thoughts or ideas look like apart from their expression in language? The same objections can be applied to the idea of language as the 'shaper' or 'programmer' of ideas. Such ideas are still inaccessible apart from language. To possess a language is to possess a technique, not necessarily a quantum of knowledge about the world."

It will be quite appropriate to mention about the linguistic metaphors applied in colonial works. Being multi-associative, colonial metaphors bring an abstract harmony to the language. Colonial elements in literature change to a poetic shape and get themselves free from the severe and traumatic authenticity of colonialism in a fictional and ambiguous frame. However, while the metaphors may reflect an escape of the concern of the colonized writer who writes in the colonial language, it may also turn to a reverse stronger profile. If one comes to remember the metaphor of 'elephant' in *Heart of Darkness*, he/she would see that it symbolizes wilderness, showing more than the greed and brutality that lie under the noblest imperial ideals. Allegorizing the elephant, the wilderness as a journey of individuation, Conrad reflects a mirror in which one can see the darkness in his/her heart. The ivory of the elephant is an unreality on what colonialists build their existences, metaphorically a collective consciousness of a whole continent and a metaphor that drags into darkness.

⁵³ Ashcroft and Griffiths and Tiffin, p. 279.

⁵⁴ Ibid, p. 280.

As a matter of fact, if we are to analyze the effect of language in colonialism, we have to start from the language which the bourgeoisie speak in colonial countries. It is frankly the colonial language—both intellectually and academically. Britain as an example has followed side policies to popularize the linguistic performance in the schools of South Africa and more the spheres of the languages influence broadened, more the political control increased. Because of the middle and upper class's speaking the colonial language to prove their social existence caused colonial power to create a suitable environment for surrounding its branches everywhere. Discussing the relation between language and education, it is well understood that the native languages became barren due to the elite writers and educators' not having produced in their own languages. "This is first of all a psychological dependence" (my emphasis) Phillipson analyzes and critizes neo-colonialist way of promoting the dominant language (mainly English) multi-purposely as such: 56

- English is best taught monolingually ("the monolingual fallacy");
- the ideal teacher is a native speaker ("the native-speaker fallacy");
- the earlier English is taught, the better the results ("the early-start fallacy");
- the more English is taught, the better the results ("the maximum-exposure fallacy");
- if other languages are used much, standards of English will drop "the subtractive fallacy" ⁵⁷

The colonization process is to be justified in every respect and at all points, so inadequacy and dependency are transferred to the individual with all its sense-making and connections. Merely in this way, dependency may/would settle on a stable ground with its invisible nets. Colonial codes invigorate not only in the semantic structures of the colonized language, but also in all the realities encircling the language. It consists of artistic and academic performance in the colonial language and expressing enthusiasm,

⁵⁵ Philip G. Altbach, Servitude of the Mind? Education, Dependency and Neo-Colonialism, Comparative Education, Edited by P. G. Altbach, R. F. Arnove & G. P. Kelly, New York, Macmillan, 1982, p. 3-14.

⁵⁶ Robert Phillipson, Linguistic Imperialism, 6. Press, New York, Oxford University Press, 1992, p. 46-47.

Robert Phillipson, Linguistic Imperialism, Vikipedia, 25.05.2012, p. 1. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Linguistic imperialism, (03.01.2012).

excitement or grief via it. We may consider them as dynamites blasted on the ground of nations. They all lead to cultural colonization that has always accompanied with diplomatic colonization.⁵⁸

Another point that should be considered is the 'neutralization' effect of the English language. "Neutralization is a linguistic strategy used to unload a linguistic item from its traditional, cultural and emotional connotations by avoiding its use and choosing an item from another code." In such contexts, then, the power of neutralization is associated with English in two ways in the colonial process. First, "English provides- with or without 'mixing'-an additional code that has referential meaning but no cultural overtones or connotations. Second, such use of English develops new code-mixed varieties of languages. They transform to crossbreed languages that are coded to the cultural codes of societies but aren't possessed entirely by any of them. It can be easily deduced from the inferences above that artificial codes built by English Language have created sub-identities. This formation is built on two bases. The first one is in the guise of globalization, penetrating into the cultural codes of the society and introverting and transforming them. The second one is building totally new codes (These codes are precisely materialistic codes/ standards such as the "American Dream")

The selected examples below will reveal the effect of linguistic colonialism on the structure of a culture. Edmund Spenser in *A view of the state of the Ireland* defined Irish as barbarian Scythian who needed to be exterminated and was clearly supporting the racial superiority of the British nation ⁶¹ English colonial power changed even the names of places in Ireland and quite easily penetrated to the area of Irish culture. "It hath ever been the use of the conqueror to despise the language of the conquered, and to force him by all means to learn his" ⁶² Spenser while discussing on the relationship of language and identity, powerfully states that for "the speech being Irish, the heart must needs be Irish" ⁶³

⁵⁸ Ibid, p. 47.

⁵⁹ Braj B. Kachru, The Alchemy of English: the Spread, Functions, and Models of Non-Native Englishes, 2. Press, New York, Illini Books Edition, 1990, p. 9.

⁶⁰ Kachru, p. 10.

⁶¹ Henry Washbourne, The Works Of Edmund Spenser With Observation On His Life And Writings, 1. Press, London, Blackfriers, 1970, p. 480-500.

⁶² Ibid, p, 498.

⁶³ Ibid, p. 499.

Shakespeare's *Othello* ⁶⁴may be studied in two ways related to the discourse of marginalization and colonizer-colonized relationship. The first conception is as it is read by some to encourage racism in course books, the second one is a more progressive and transnational approach of reading.

Othello as the black character of the play is displaced and discovered by himself appropriating his own identity. Being a displaced Other- a sub-identity in the play, Othello speaks, quite bitterly, without being heard as following:

"Soft you; a word or two before you go.

I have done the state some service, and they know't
No more of that. I pray you, in your letters,
When you shall these unlucky deeds relate,
Speak of me as I am; nothing extenuate,
Not set down aught in malice." 65

His utterance remains silent with his approval of the colonizer dominance. His (un)consciousness does not let him speak loud voiced. He does not consider that one day, time will reverse itself (as it always did: Desdemona's father, laboring Othello to explain his backstory). Othello- the subaltern, the exotic, the Moor the black man in cross-breed marriage with a white woman- possesses complex and troubled motivations being self-contrasted and hybridized.

While analyzing serfdom and colonial reality, a second example to be considered would be Shakespeare's *The Tempest*. The historical character Caliban, as a cultural signification through the work is always interpreted based on the readers intentions. Caliban, who is positioned in hierarchy, social progress, control, slavery, is exposed to thick description for some critics.

The 'monster' of the play, Caliban learns English in return for his help and comradery to Prospero. The language he learns paradoxically turns the direction of their relationship to a master-slave network. Caliban realizes that language is both a trap and a way to liberty at the same time, telling the following words: "You taught me language

⁶⁴ William Shakespeare, David M. Bevington, Barbara Gaines Othello: Bringing the Shakespeare Page to Life, Sourcebooks, Inc., 2005.

⁶⁵ Ibid,p.Act IV, Scene II., p.353.

and my profit on't/ Is, I know how to curse" ⁶⁶ In the Tempest, the slave Caliban utilizes language as a weapon against his master.

Language is a permeant structure and the pollution is attributed to the colonial language. Compared to Shakespeare's Caliban, Aime Cesaire's Caliban, in his adaption named *A Tempest*, uses the language primarily for liberty. Cesaire's Caliban rejects his name in the play and prefers 'x' rather than the name given by his master indicates clearly the contributive exploitative function of the language. The colonial language in the work of Cesaire is rejected by his character so it becomes an impact against the colonialist function of the language. Identically, colonial borderlines, just as colonial identities, have slippy bordered conceptualizations as above seen over the heroic characters.

To put it bluntly and connect to agenda; while analyzing language, as the primary element of neo-colonialism, where we ought to position being educated in the colonial language, its need as the imposition of center-periphery relations. Are all these intended policies of colonial powers to increase the dependency of colonial countries or simple adaptations to a new world order?

2.3. Ethnicity / Race

In the colonial context, the `visualization of difference' was not only a means of defining particular kinds, but also of marking the differences of subjects. The category of 'indigenousness, ethnic, race' or 'colonized' refers to a wide range of different social groups. Before we consider some of the sociological facets of race and ethnicity, we have to analyze how they interwoven with other dimensions of social stratification.

Many issues were problematized associated with the collection of diverse groups that were never under the same rule until the arrival of colonialism and the nation-state system. It caused clashes between political cultures. For example, Britain chose a specific ethnic group to be in power in one of the African countries. This led to

⁶⁶ Shakespeare, p.363,364.

feuding among the rest of the tribes and ethnic groups because they all believe they should be the elites.

White settlers starting to migrate to South Africa built their economies on overseas and dominated on their local politics. The superiority in time led to bring forth early racism in the region. White settlers became so powerful that they started to expel the natives from their own lands, except the Afrikaaners who were half-European and half-African. (Among settlers, there were few women so it caused the settlers to experience cross-breed marriages) At times, the colonialist government supported the Black Africans who wanted to be commemorated as elites; eventually it caused discrimination among the whole continent.

The misrepresentations whether they are identified linguistically or psychoanalytically are not independent from ideology in a historical context. Reinforcing the differences among people raised the questions of race and ethnicity at that time. In the 18th century, the ideology of race was invented by the Occident. Assumptions on race and ethnicity were dialectically based on the relationship of economy and exploitation⁶⁷. Ethnicity on the other way is a thoughtful issue that reflects the fragile side of the post-colonial studies. The origin of the word ethnic comes from the word 'goy' that refers to someone who is non-jewish. ⁶⁸. Its connotation is 'heathen' in English Language, that is 'irreligious'. Following this, ethnicity as a term came into being within the scope of cultural differences while race was originated being based on biological differences. This chapter will attempt to propound what course ethnicity and race have followed in their journey through time? A glance on 19th century Western science may be a good departure to conceptualize the problematic field. The Eurocentrist science self-interestedly classified world nations as inferior and superior according to their own characteristics and capacities.

Ethnic groups may refer to a minority or a majority in a society. The ethnic group is categorized according to the connection between biological inheritance and culture. It is implied by many that the ethnic origin is one of the indicatives to determine much of cultural identity. Where as many other thinkers ensure emphatically that race and ethnic origin are not deterministic in the construction of cultural identity. Biological

⁶⁷ Loomba, p. 139.

⁶⁸ For further study on the role of "ethnicity" in American literature; See Warner Sollors, Beyond Ethnicity Consert And Descent in American Culture, New York, Oxford University Press, 1986.

race and culture do not share the same roots. Regardless of their skin color, body shape, and other presumed racial features, people diversify due to their cultural pattern profile and societies/ideology they were born in. Race and ethnic discrimination were not biologically proved differences, but cultural creations of some authorities. For instance, "the African American woman is far more similar culturally to her European American neighbors than to the West African woman from Senegal". ⁶⁹ One of the world races, the Mongoloid does not share the same characteristics and follow the same cultural practices with all the Mongoloids of the world. In this context, race cannot be counted as pre-determination about cultures.

A striking work of Fanon reverberated that the colonialists asserted their thesis on Algerians' frontal-cortex being underdeveloped scientifically during the colonization of Algeria. Scientists at that time declared that Africans were making use of their frontal lobes far less than the Europeans. ⁷⁰ Following this determination, it can be inferred from Fanon's evidences that all inferior values were attributed to the Other, the colonial subjects were made to believe scientifically that they had limited cortical capacities in all the institutions they were interacting with.

Despite being widely discussed, the notion of race does not have a catch-all characteristic. Rather, it is monosemic. Early the 20th century, American and European genealogists made call for racial cleaning to avoid some generating factors such as migration and hybridity (first and foremost as an example to the issue is Nazi's anti-Semitic genocide) The emphasis here skips the ethnic identity and primarily relies on race. Race, in this conceptualization ascribes a narrower and inflexible meaning, even portrays a more negative meaning than ethnicity. Ethnicity represents societies that have a relation by which they are identified based on non-static parameters such as historical origin, religion, language, class structure and geo-politic (which embodies a broader explanation than race).

The differences in societies are marked through varied cultural carriers in any colonial society. Cultural carries are learned- behavior codes, although they may not be necessarily absorbed. As cultural shapers turning from passive to active, they can additively embrace groups of people, ostracize them and reproduce discourses on them. They are surely directed by hegemonic relationships.

⁶⁹ Copyright by Dennis O'Neil, July 05, 2006, p. 7., http://anthro.palomar.edu/ethnicity/ethnic_1.htm, (13.02.2012)

The ethnic, as the indigene did, had to transform himself/herself with the hybrid reality. Instead of disguising a single meaning, the concept naturally allows relocating itself and reorganizes the field within the relations. The new consciousness created by the hybrid identity has found its meaning in the concept of ethnicity by means of eliminating the subject-object duality. Ethnicity as cultural identity (and as a slippy cultural shaper), in some instances may be optional for the individual. "It is extensive for a white American coming from an origin of Europe to identify with his/her ethnic roots. In a way, this selection is continuous. They can adopt their ethnic characteristics or just amalgamate to the American society as they would like to be."

An interesting determination of Aime Cesaire on a racist discrimination is the example of Hitler. It may change the steady point of view about the Euro-centrist perception of the Other. Hitler, as a white man, hid himself as being identical to the white man. This analysis dealt big blow to the colonist logic originated from the European stereotype perception of the Other. "Both the subject and the object becomes the white man in this dehumanization." ⁷² Considering this matching, where are we to locate ourselves and our ethnic origin or where do we come from? "We begin to conceptualize matters of identity at the very time in history when they become a problem" If these problematic borders are clearly subjects of an over-determination, then where we ought to locate hybrid identities-such as a dago, a mestizo? If "the center itself is marginal", isn't the stereotyping about the Other superficial? Thence the match done by the colonialist for identifying its position becomes equally falsifying. An equation cannot be correct on one part and incorrect on the other part.

"I is not a unitary, culture has never been monolithic, and more or less is always in relation to a judging subject. Differences do not exist between outsider and insider-two entities-, they are also at work within the outsider or the insider-a single entity" ⁷⁶

⁷¹ Glazer, Nathan, and Daniel Patrick Moynihan. Beyond the Melting Pot: The Negroes, Puerto Ricans, Jews, Italians and Irish of New York City, Cambridge, MIT Press, 1963, p.17-35 (*my emphasis*)

⁷² Suren Pillay, Anti-colonialism,post-colonialism and the New Man:Politikon, May 2004: vol. 31: p. 91-104.

⁷³ Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, p. 194.

⁷⁴ A dago comes from an Italian-Spanish origin. A mestizo is an Indian-American cross-breed.

⁷⁵ Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, p. 189.

⁷⁶ Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, p. 189.

2.4. Hybrid Reality

People nowadays witness societies in fluctuation caused by global migration, this gives rise to identity, knowledge and identity explosion concordantly. The search of mobility and flexibility fall into a need of re-interpreting social structures urgently. Since; the formation and social disintegration of cultural groups have increased perceptibly.

With reference to Homi Bhabha; the post-colonial man can never totally release himself from the effect of colonialism. The hybrid identity reflects the Other's identity wholly, yet such composite cultures are innovative in terms of re-interpreting the existing cultures and demolishing the limed and fixed ones. Furthermore, Bhabha indicates that hybridized or migrated people question and compel cultural conceptions of both nations co-acting between the aforesaid cultures more than others. This eventually leads destroying the stereotyped forms of cultural patterns. This inference associates with Zygmant Bauman who had already focused on the ally (the inward-Oriented) and enemy (the outward) which the polarized state of affairs both unite and separate equally⁷⁷. Similarly, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak states that the Other is a problem of memory and will always hide itself behind human consciousness. Bauman's foreigner and Bhabha's intercultural discomfort the settled codes of cultures stepping out of black-white way of thinking. All these combined efforts have constructed the essence of multiculturalism during the 1980s. Rather than questioning being an Other or not, the matter here is whether the 'seemingly Other' of its own identity will be able to appear in the common ground with everybody (released from clash of civilizations)

The process of colonialism witnessed divers encounters of cultures through acculturation during history (although it was not experienced humanly at 'most' times). Despite having not approved intercrossing in different degrees, the practice of colonialism contributed to the inevitable existence of hybridity. Whether in the colonizer country as a colonized or directly in the colonized country, the contact reconfigured the relations between the native population and the foreigners. The colonial practice made these new roots spread omnidirectional. The 'epistemological Other' tousled cultural identity formation in its historical process and redirected the

⁷⁷ Zygmunt Bauman, Liquid Times Living in an Age of Uncertainty, Cambride, Polity Press, 2007.

understanding of terms such as race and ethnicity in the post-colonial field. Imperial ideologies have emphasized ethnic differences throughout history; however they could not avoid genetic modification in their society. The colonial logic tried to refrain from genetic and intellectual hybridity because the hybrid identity reflects somewhat the colonialist itself; however the colonial needs exactly its contrary. It abstrusely draws a line between itself and the colonized being unaware of what happens on the other side of the border. Anyway it does not deal with it in real. The line loses its profoundness in time, becomes indistinct and the colonialist mindset is obliged to condone the crossbred communities resultant from the colonial reality. It cannot be mentioned about purity anymore, the hybrid identity undertakes a multi-metaphoric understanding, unsettling West-East, black-white poles (though not totally). The hybrid from now on has a new identity achievement in the balance sheet of colonialism. "To tell the truth we have to trap the appearances with quotation marks. We are not what we are said to be." ⁷⁸

It has been applied to crossbreeding for various reasons in colonies. Although the notion of hybridity has been applied as a policy to shatter the colonial nations, it has sometimes converted to a self-conscious movement in favor of the colonies: It was anticolonial resistance. Although hybrid subjects band ideal customs borrowed from the colonialists and the strategies typical to their folk, they may display a national resistance. (During the 1960s, Latin American and Caribbean activists against French colonization can establish precedents to the issue). Despite the fact that hybridity pertains to the colonialist, it still leans on the concrete reality of the colonized nation. It generates into its nation systematizing within its borders. There is no belonging anymore⁷⁹, but a cultural identity that is not specifically African, American, Caribbean, or British, but all of these at once, a culture whose themes and techniques transcend ethnicity and nationality to produce something new and, until now, unremarked. This 'double valence' is what Bhabha endorses as:

"The non-synchronous temporality of global and national cultures opens up a cultural space - a third space-where the negotiation of incommensurable differences creates a tension peculiar to borderline existences. Hybrid hyphenations emphasize the incommensurable elements as the basis of

⁷⁸ Cited in Susan Sellers, The Helene Cixous Reader-Helene Cixous, London, Routledge, 1994, p. 15.

⁷⁹ See Paul Gilroy's "The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double-Consciousness, Harvard University Press, 1993" which challenges the practices and assumptions of cultural studies, the interaction of diasporic cultures and also complicates and enriches our understanding of modernism.

cultural identities" ⁸⁰ "...no culture is full unto itself, no culture is plainly..not only because there are other cultures which contradict its authority, but also because its own symbol-forming activity, ...always underscores the claim to an originary, holistic, organic identity." ⁸¹

In the process of assimilation to the new culture in which she/he lives, the hybrid identity experiences a tension between belonging to the colonized/migrated culture and being an outsider, between being and not being. "Hybridity thus makes difference into sameness, and sameness into difference, but in a way that makes the same no longer the same, the different no longer simply different."

Yet, for reasoning out hybridity properly, the organizational structures which groups piggy in the middle lean on may additionally be analyzed. Hybridity in patches gets closer to other kinds of colonial productions such as diaspora experience and migration which also create explicit alienation. Consequently, these crossings share a common consciousness that approaches them to the collective consciousness before colonization. On return to a past culture, Stuart Hall indicates that ⁸³:

"It is not a mere phantasm either. It is something - not a mere trick of the imagination. It has its histories - and histories have their real, material and symbolic effects. The past continues to speak to us. But it no longer addresses us as a simple, factual 'past', since our relation to it, like the child's relation to the mother, is always-already 'after the break'."

After all these inferences, it seems that the pre-colonial condition can never be truly native again. Colonial history is the history of inequity of old identities but the new period in which we are in is consisted of hybrid cultures and identities that will be formed continuously. All hybrid subjects live different experiences according to their own ethnicity, gender, sexuality and social class; but their identities are more complex

⁸⁰ Hybridity, "Signs Taken for Wonder" from <u>The Location of Culture</u>. New York, Routledge, 1994, p. 208.

Bhabha on Multiculturalism, cultural diversity and cultural difference from Identity: Community, Culture, Difference. Ed. JonathanRutherford. London: Lawrence & Wishart, 1990, p. 210.

⁸² Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, p.158-161.

⁸³ Loomba, p. 152.

to be homogenized. Since each Self uses different strategies to explore and negotiate multiple codes depending on his/her situation in a cultural context.

CHAPTER THREE

NEW CULTURALISM

"Colonialism is a system and we are all murderers." 84

(J.P. Sartre)

3.1. Subaltern

Subaltern studies, originated primarily in South Asian Studies early the 1980's, aimed to rectify the elitist world of view found in most of the academic colonial works. As witnessed in colonial representations, the subaltern (the term primarily comes from the writings of Antonio Gramsci) constitutes a subordinated identity in terms of class, gender, race, language and culture as analyzed in above chapters. The subaltern consists of Indians, Arabs, Africans, Chinese and many Others who abandon their own experience in favor of someone else's which is more relevant. The concept of Subalternity as a rethinking process of history underwent various shifts throughout history, although yet all subalterns share a common (not exactly same) subordination in its various forms. In the decades of 80s and 90s, many thinkers such as Ranajit Guha, Dipesh Chakrabarty Partha Chatterjee, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Gyan Prakash made notable contributions to the field to decode that subordination. 85 Subaltern Studies as a way of resituating historical research addresses its concerns on the problem of elite and the subaltern. The strategies clarified in previous chapters from a range of examples will ease to situate subaltern studies in sociological and cultural terms to speak of its praxis.

Discrimination is basically conceptualized in the field of sub-alternity. That is: It includes practices of violence against third world countries in terms of physical

⁸⁴ Jean-Paul Sartre, Colonialism and Neocolonialism, Taylor and Francis e-Library, 2005, p. 29.

It is necessary to note that the rise of the subaltern historiography in the decade of the 1980s conceded with that of the Dalit Movement. This movement questioned the basic assumption of Brahminism as well as various historical schools. Including the subalterns, historians have noticed that 'subaltern studies' is used as a blanket term for communities inside it. But each of these communities under this massive all inclusive umbrella possess a different vision of hi Subaltern school as elite or non-Dalit. For example, Gandhi was the voice of the Dalits inspite of not being a Dalit himself. Ambedkar and Mayavati are the Dalits articulating the protest of Dalits.

segregation, economic exploitation as well as the use of cultural shapers such as language, religion and politics. The assimilation strategies may be exemplified as concentrating on, not surprisingly, colonial middle classes which are often educated in colonial power-centered schools. The ruling class instills a "bourgeois-rationalist conception of knowledge" through such an educational system. This is what they see as a universal feature of all human existence. Moreover, there always existed elitist historiographies or writers who could never put the subaltern's conditions appropriate. They couldn't go beyond the general limitations that were characteristic of their historiographical schools. Yet, the national culture which is not Western could more or less attempt to re-inscribe, co-opt, and rehearse neo-colonial imperatives of political domination, economic exploitation, and cultural erasure.

The Western discourse based on the representation of the Natives as societies in need of being civilized, lost in barbarity and wilderness created xenophobia, Otherization or a monster discourse that served to a bipolar discursive field in the post-colonial area. In the discourse mentioned, the reason to stretch far away to Africa or America was not represented as a Western greediness but was represented as their desire to civilize Others. The monster becomes not just an Other in the representations but displays a site of a multi-formed power. With reference to what Foucault claims, it can be deduced that the colonized may display resistance-a resistance that incorporates productivity in) against the oppression but the dominant power injects its own quiddity to the colonized and neutralizes that resistance. The colonial subjects can neither be productive nor resistant anymore, they are no more than docile bodies. ⁸⁷ Already marginalized, those bodies have already become abnormal. All other institutions serve to reinforce the colonialist discourse. The function of colonial medicine, for instance, serving to the bottom-up relations or the institutionalization of the English Language and Literature particularly in India or South-Africa are relevant examples to the field.

At this juncture, Foucault's truth-power-discourse triangle has enlarged the colonialist discourse and made people question 'discourse' which creates subjects through knowledge. Discourse, on the other hand is created by power and this discourse follows our acceptance of the 'reality', which we are presented. In the

⁸⁶ Rakesh Batabyal, Communalism in Bengal, 1. Press, New Delhi, Tejeshwar Singh for Sage Publications India, 2005, p. 36.

⁸⁷ Michel Foucault, Dicipline And Punish: The Birth Of The Prison, 2. Press, New York and Canada, Random House, 1995.

simplest sense, the identity of the Self is created by the media (for example), and then his/her world view becomes limited to those of individuals as presented 'role models'. We are all made to think that third world countries need our support to maintain their existences. The discourse that 'We' are role models creates a hierarchical classification system among people. This is printed to our conscience thus we begin to privilege ideas of what is normal or good.

A bash of the colonial field has been to create the culture of middle-class elite bourgeois. The privileged sub-identities-who are directly the creations of the colonial hegemonic relations reflect a desire of the Other and share close similarities in their colonized identities. In hegemonic relations with the Other, the process proceeds in favor of the colonialist by letting through a 'precarious' identity of the colonized. From the inferences above, for neocolonialism of our day, it can be said that it has reduced generating Cartesian duality such as barbarian/modern, brutal-civilized -though not given up totally- and succeeded in transforming itself against the reductionist approaches of the 'New World'. The inequalities the colonial system imposes become more condoned and acceptable under the head of 'common culture, common values'. Each element possessed by the capitalist system ought to become integrated tallied up with it. If the capitalist transformation fails, the system externalizes the colonized object and its sphere of influence. The aforesaid redeployment occurs unconsciously from the subaltern. Sub-identities recode themselves thinking that they act with their own free will in power relations. Spivak suggests 'being enlightened learning from below to change the state affairs on behalf of the subaltern'. "Sub-identities needs to be educated to learn the wave of the torn fabric in unexpected ways, in order to suture the two, not altering the gender policies from above".88. Without the pedagogic attention otherwise, post-colonial studies and post-criticism will be condemned to keep in the field of "epistemic violation". 89 And thus, the subaltern will never be able to re-inscribe its position in society reclaiming a non-western process of cultural identity.

The subaltern and sovereign subjects have affected the field powerfully. ⁹⁰ Spivak connects the conceptualization with imperialism such as it is analyzed in Said.

⁸⁸ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Righting Wrongs, In Other Asias, London, Oxford; Blackwell, 2008, p. 40, 263.

⁸⁹ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, A Critique of Postcolobial Reason, United States of Amerika, President and Fellows of Harvard College, 1999.

⁹⁰ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Can The Subaltern Speak, Rosalind C. Morris (edt), New York, Columbia University Press, 2010.

The colonialist set hands to third world countries by creating a colonial subject, marginalizing the black/the Orient in his own land and alienating them. The third world becomes a signifier that allows us to forget the 'worlding'. In the passage below, imperialism is portrayed as a 'worlding' process that attempts to disguise its own workings so as to naturalize and legitimate Western dominance:

"If these 'facts' were remembered, not only in the study of British literature but in the study of the literatures of the European colonizing cultures of the great age of imperialism, we would produce a narrative in literary history, of the 'worlding' of what is now called 'the Third World.' To consider the Third World as distant cultures, exploited but with rich intact literary heritages waiting to be recovered, interpreted, and circularized in English translation fosters the emergence of 'the Third World' as a signifier that allows us to forget that 'worlding,' even as it expands the empire of the literary discipline". ⁹¹

The subaltern or the sub-identity of Spivak however bear a problematic path. Such as it is portrayed in Foucault, Spivak portrays a problematic formation of the subject's identity. To remember Foucault's focus on continuous power, it should be noted that "some discourses have shaped and created meaning systems that have gained the status and currency of 'truth', and dominate how we define and organize both ourselves and our social world", whilst other alternative discourses are marginalized and subjugated, yet potentially 'offer' sites where hegemonic practices can be contested, challenged and 'resisted'. He has looked specifically at the social construction of madness, punishment and sexuality. In Foucault's view, there is no fixed and definitive structuring of either social (or personal) identity or practices, as there is in a socially determined view in which the subject is completely socialized. Rather, both the formation of identities and practices are related to, or are a function of, historically specific discourses. An understanding of how these and other discursive constructions are formed may open the way for change and contestation. 93

⁹¹ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Marxist, Feminist, Deconstructionist Benjamin Graves , Brown University, Posted: May 30, 2008, p. 269.

⁹² Robin Usher, Richard Edwards, Lifelong Learning: Signs, Discourses, Practices, Springer: The Netherlands, 2007, p.72.

⁹³ Michel Foucault, "Foucault", August 1996, ph. 5., http://www.massey.ac.nz/~alock/theory/foucault.htm, (11.11.2011).

We have to specify that Foucault's predicament of the resistance he defined as continuous perpetuity against fixed power resemblances Spivak's predicament about revitalizing the subaltern. Spivak stated that the subaltern cannot speak or what he/she speaks is what power speaks via him/her. It causes to passivize the active intersection between power and discourse. In this positioning, the subaltern -that is already marginalized- is made visible on the historic and hierarchic pyramid. On the other hand, the meta-narration made through the end notions of post-structuralism continues to serve to the Euro-centrist mentality.

The fact that the subaltern cannot speak or will not speak complicates the negated sub-identities and restrains *un pas au dela* ⁹⁴ (the step beyond cross-border) of the subject. The thing that will change the situation seems 'hybridizing the politic discourse'. That is; the double subaltern must possess double consciousness in terms of changing what is on power. Because,

"Change may only happen when a new counter-discursive element begins to receive wide attention through the means of communication. If you are within the discourse of the South during the time of slavery, as a slave you will only understand yourself in the terms that this discourse allows. In other words, the slave (often) believes and conforms to the picture that this discourse draws of him or her. Naturally, the master 's free will is just as much curtailed. Change requires the possession of the means of communication, of self-representation. Note: a discourse is never totally "pure;" it will always contain some measure of counter-discursive elements."

The decrease of differences between the colonizer and the colonized has appeared in the theorization of H. Bhabha. His metaphors of 'migrated' bear a resemblance to his metaphors of the colonialist in terms of marked the differences. Above all, Said's exile's, Bhabha's hybrid/migrated and Spivak's subaltern are all border-crossed concepts that dislocate the subject (geographically, culturally and conceptually). They all challenged and revised as well as extended the work of their mentors and developed new strategies in a diverse range of critical theories.

⁹⁴ The term belongs to *Maurice Blanchot in* Gayatri C. Spivak, Yeni Madun Sessiz Bir Mülakat, çev. Ebru B. Yetişkin, Toplumbilim Postkolonyal Söylem özel sayısı, İstanbul, Bağlam Yayınları, 2010.

⁹⁵ Michel Foucault, "Discourse or Power/Knowledge", Michigan State University, p. 5. https://www.msu.edu/~comertod/courses/foucault.htm, (11.11.2011).

3.2. Decoding the Colonial Process

Under the cover of civilization, imperialism and naturally capitalism have transformed man to meta within an updating data process. It processes the Self by providing justification at first. Then the process naturalizes, normalizes the transformation and the system is interiorized. Herein, it is difficult to expect that the identical field of the colonized is fixed. As Homi Bhabha refuses, the field is not homogenous. The object/subject, being out of place⁹⁶ and a means of transnational capitalism, begins to falter between it and other identities. By doing so, the system, creating plural identities in its entirety but also fixed identities in terms of its place constitute an impediment to create a class consciousness. It may be named as forms of subjective agency; this is what Gayatri Spivak defines on the basis of subaltern .The exploitative system reproduces the colonial subjects creating difference by means of imitation. However, the authenticity the colonizer creates is an illusion. The pretended mutation redenominates the dominated subjects. The naming process shows parallelism with the conceptualization of capitalism, hegemony and their zones of influence. For this reason, a bone to pick is not to focus on the differences between the opposites but to analyze the hiding conditions of hegemony, power or the colonizer. While analyzing the current conditions, interpreting the third world countries independent from interrelated factors such as racism, migration and the oppression they are exposed to, will pose a danger to singularize the articulated forms of communities or at least to disregard the situation. Moreover, the subaltern or sub-identities should be discovered directly, not from their (mis)representations or mediators. We do use the word 'discover' because sub-identities act in a fluctuant manner. The power-knowledge system makes these identities contribute to the field of their own accord and agreement, and awards their contribution in such a manner that they become more and more assimilated willingfully. If not properly understood, the subaltern and its role will never be discovered in such case.

The concept of culture and the contour meaning it got during the Enlightenment Era has been analyzed so far. We discussed the hegemonic codes that were directly derived from the needs of the bourgeoisie and colonial practices that went parallel to it

⁹⁶ Edward W. Said, Out of Place, 1. Press, New York, Vintage Books, 2010.

in history. Without separating colonial periods decisively, we discerned that the hegemonic character of modernization reproduced itself via literature which it was relating with identity and culture. Post colonialism in this context necessitates reidentification. As culture was determined at the Enlightenment Era, the formation of identity couldn't be reproduced alike it. While the bourgeoisie of the Enlightenment reproduced itself over the Other's identity based on modernism, the discourse of the meta-narrated identity that redefined itself over Hegelist determinist history foresaw a progressive history of Hegel. This narration determined an absolute progress as a provision of human existence. The meaning the Anglo-Saxons ascribed to culture as 'mission of civilization' was to possess now and the future. If a common progress of world cultures were to be discussed, then the first going to other countries had to be legalized for their attempt to civilize the Others. Until now, identities have transformed and hybridized. The necessity now is a search of a new cultural definition that locates itself through the literary discourses.

With reference to Spinoza on his legitimatizing, "if I know the truth and if you are ignorant, to make you change your thoughts and ways is my moral duty; refraining from doing so would be cruel and selfish." Modernism in which the hegemonic discourse warranted itself in terms of colonial practices didn't tolerate any radical or different structure within its scope. Intolerance to other cultures was defined as a duty to others. The first reaction to such a Meta narration was an intervention against the monolith nature of the Other and was reproducing the subjects.

Post-modern discourse put post modernism and post-colonial determinations against determinations of culture/civilization. However, this embodied a danger that would be later on revealed. Steven Best and Douglas Kellner⁹⁸ praised writers who led our ways in to the jungle and labyrinths of postmodernism (these names were Foucault, Derrida, Baudrillard, Habermas, Lyotard and many others). Writers were praised because they weren't indigenized in their mission of civilization/ colonialism. This is where we perceive the danger. As modernist discourse constructed its identity on a unitary form, from its reflection, it equally built Other's identity-that is post-modernist identity- on an integrated structure. The role of the post-modernist discourse on recreating the identity of others becomes ambiguous in this context; relevantly, colonial

 $^{^{97}}$ Zygmunt Bauman, Intimations of Postmodernity, London, New York and Canada: by Routledge, 1992. p. 9.

⁹⁸ Steven Best and Douglas Kellner, Postmodern Theory: Critical Interrogations (Communications & culture), 1.edition, New York, The Guildford Press, 1991, p.213-216.

practices could not go beyond legitimatizing themselves and forming other's identity on a counter base to the center. Post-modernist discourse embodied some problematic opposition against Modernism. (That is why Lacanian psychoanalysis was located against post structuralism, Kristeva censured post modernism and Derrida did not prefer using the problematic concept of post modernism in his writings.) As it is discussed that we are in a Post-modernist era, it makes us to classify periods such as antiquity, premodern, modern, postmodern. However, Post-modernism reflecting this time and age does not refer to it but possibly a common sensivity against the existing status quo. 99

As it is discussed above, Post-modernism and Modernism are not completely in a contradictory relation. Additively they cannot reflect classified identities in chronological order. What makes us distinguish between Post-modernism and Modernism is reserved in the same roots. They both needed to determine borders to form the identity of the Other. But there is no Other within or without itself. As ethnocentrist emphasis on center is derived from the edge of this center, the object (the edge) becomes the point we see the center. Post modernism in this context does not take us out of modernist discourse but refers to the varieties of modernism. Post-modernism will remain in some extent modernist, being a part of it.

After all these analyses, people lost their trust to meta-narrations. That is not a plain distrust but it is obligating everybody to progress and do a list of things. But it was reserving an effect of emptiness for Modernists. It was stated by Lyotard in his same work that modernism should have been post-modernist firstly. If people did not bring order to the world, it could not order itself and that was the mission of humanity in this chaotic world. Modernists found the roots of their civilization mission from these inferences. Post-modernist discourse in spite of struggling against class divisions and Meta narrations becomes as problematic as it, that is; it has restrained the identity of the Other to a vicious circle despite seeming to give a second chance to alternatives. Post-colonial in this context has not created a new discourse but attempted to analyze and resolve what is already in the existing philosophy. It seems that was a Post-modernist mission against the center-periphery contradiction, approving the Western civilization mission and locating against the periphery. That is why Post-colonial discourse that is articulated in Post-Modernism falls into the danger of creating another center reproducing another Otherness.

⁹⁹ For futher study on Post-modernism see Lyotard, J.-F. (1992). The Postmodern Explained: Correspondence 1982-1985,p. 76.

It should be reminded that the period defined as Post-colonial does not reflect a 'post' within its definition, such independent processes reinforce the discourses they are opposed to. Post-colonial that is expressed as an antinomy against colonial practices focuses on the independent subjects. However, it seems that colonial subjects fixed in the Modernist fictions such as state, nation lost their liberties. Because by using the tools legitimized by the center, colonial subjects became more dependent on the center. This eventually would create a new but again center-dependent identity.

Transnational policies of capitalism in monopolar reality of the world and the expansive flexible production system have dragged the migrated other to the heart of the center. It entailed to redefine both the center and the periphery (if there exist). After the 1980's, cultural studies that intended to relocate identities were emerged with primarily this need. As the current situation of the historicity is based on capitalist organization, post-colonialism appeared as an opposition to the identity formation of the periphery that absorbed the codes of the center. However, the problem became later the existence of a center. If there is any belonging (no matter whether the colonizer or the colonized possess it), then, it will dislocate to one another. Identity, repeatedly, is not possessed but is formed. Post-colonial identity formation as an irony of history has not been located beyond multiculturalism. In a global era in which national boundaries cannot realize themselves, the bourgeoisie create the transnational field over migrated identities and multiculturalism. Post-colonial discourse in this respect was replaced with the work of Spivak A Critique of Postcolonial Reason who was offering a new reading of postcolonial thought in terms of philosophy, literature, history, gender and cultural studies 100 After the 2000s and so far, post-colonialism continues to serve as a tool for increasing the possible alternative thoughts against retarding effects that enables selfexistence. This process embodies the colonization of thought and decolonizing it at the same time. Thus we find acceptable to remind that the state of affairs of the theory has become independent from the starting will. By reason of limiting post-colonial thought with the history of colonized nations, the narrow point of view restricts ways of struggle and their alternatives against the inequalities that capitalism imposes over progress, civilization and development. Yet post-colonialism is to be considered for the critical thought on nationalism, power-knowledge and gendered discourse and separating power from global wealth. Furthermore post-colonialism may help find the answers of that

¹⁰⁰ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak: A Critique of Postcolonial Reason (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1999.

who profits from the intellectual production and to whom it serves and how? In order to analyze the new order of neo-colonialist way of capitalism, the disengagement and perpetuity with economics should be determined locally. These will provide opportunity to analyze the conjuncture avoiding falling into the trap of global organization's progress and improvement paradigms. The opportunity will lead people find the essence of man without mediators, translators, representatives who distort meaning in a false consciousness.

"Independence is not a word which can be used as an exorcism, but an indispensable condition for the existence of men and women who are truly liberated, in other words who are truly masters of all the material means which make possible the radical transformation of society." ¹⁰¹

3.3. A New Consciousness in Post-Colonial Process

"What then is truth? A mobile army of metaphors, metonyms, and anthropomorphisms: in short, a sum of human relations which have been poetically and rhetorically intensified, transferred, and embellished, and which, after long usage, seem to a people to be fixed, canonical, and binding. Truths are illusions which we have forgotten are illusions - they are metaphors that have become worn out and have been drained of sensuous force, coins which have lost their embossing and are now considered as metal and no longer as coins." 102

For us, the truth Nietzsche questions is not the humanism of the Enlightenment Era, but it requires discovering it with an inward intervention which:

"...is not a way of consolidating and affirming what 'we' have always known and felt, but rather a means of questioning, upsetting, and reformulating so much of what is presented to us as commodified, packaged, uncontroversial, and uncritically codified certainties, including those contained in the

¹⁰¹ Fanon, The Wretched of the Earth, p. 310.

Edward W. Said, Joseph Conrad And The Fiction Of Autobiography, New York, Columbia University Press, 2008, p. 15-16.

masterpieces herded under the rubric of 'the classics.'...The intellectual's role is dialectically, oppositionally to uncover and elucidate the contest I referred to earlier, to challenge and defeat both an imposed silence and the normalized quiet of unseen power wherever and whenever possible', 103

We haven't discovered for the first time that culture is an interactive relation of man-man and man-nature in time and space. It is also not new to claim that identities are formed according to the hegemonic codes. Creating a new way of thinking manages on an objective base that may be acceptable at a related timeframe (being suitable for more people). All fictions on culture and identity conclude that cultures undoubtedly are not hierarchic determinations. Culture is now accepted that it does not come from a unique origin. It is hard to mention about a single genealogy of the world history as well- if there is a common world history to be discussed.

A superiority of a culture on another can only be the expression of ethnocentric deviancy. Inner dynamics of cultures such as value, belief, morality can be codes of culture and identity. But the time they begin to presuppose any hierarchic determination and expose fear (it comes artificially, it cannot be mentioned of a natural cultural fear), they directly transform to nations' mission and responsibility. Identity would thus be instituted in responsibility. 104 The European responsibility would be 'avant-garde' to civilize, reconfigure, unite and disunite, and create an oppressed identity of the Other. The responsibility of humanity reflects the sense of definitiveness of Derrida. 105 All identical predeterminations are to be released from provisions. The individual can never adopt any identical essence. The new form of culture is not Oriental, neither Occidental, ethnic or simply humanist. It entails a process of relocating ourselves before creating a new humanist culture that includes the whole planet. Man ought to change the order of Western philosophy to become a human. The order does not start by replacing the Other with European thought. We don't need a monster. Jacques Derrida in The Other Heading answers to the question of Europe's heading itself. He uses the metaphor of 'ship' that heads off to a destination. This voyage is what he describes as the European cultural identity which navigates towards a certain ideal. The cultural voyage of Europe

¹⁰³ Edward Said. Humanism and Democratic Criticism. New York: Columbia University Press, 2004, p. 28, p. 135.

Jacques Derrida, The Other Heading: Reflections on Today's Europe, Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1992, p.52.

Jacques Derrida, Voyous, Paris, Editions Galilée, 2003, s. 60.

is often interrupted by Eastern directions, what he calls as 'the other heading.' That is, any new European community must respect all the different ethnic and national groups that are now asserting their own identities, claiming their right to have their "headings" acknowledged. 106

"Whether it takes a national form or not, a refined, hospitable or aggressively xenophobic form or not, the self-affirmation of an identity always claims to be responding to the call or assignation of the universal. There are no exceptions to this law. No cultural identity presents itself as the opaque body of an untranslatable idiom, but always, on the contrary as the irreplaceable inscription of the universal in the singular, the unique testimony to the human essence and to what is proper to man." ¹⁰⁷

New-Culturalism that is propounded in this study focuses on 'man', simply man. When for the first time, Goethe uttered 'world literature' (weltliteratur), the world was not ready enough to get the drift of it or could not pad the meaning inside. Goethe was influenced by the Persian literature, but his words couldn't become systematized at that period of time. But at the reality of the present time, dismiss of national borders, the existence of transnational corporation, migrations where identities are scattered around, announce the time to make sense of Goethe's concept. Persian literature didn't identity itself as an Other at that time, for it wasn't identified an Other as yet. It was merely Iran.

In this respect, a suggestion of a new culture here is not an unscientific departure for creating new identities; it is not a revolution, either. It is articulating influentially what the current situation of the world system seeks for the benefit of itself and what currently is acceptable. This new reading is not defining an already defined culture and identity, it deliberately pays no attention to the fabricated concepts-such as center or other. Creating the new man requires a higher logic, a self-reliance that will address civil actors to identify the necessity of the production. Now, it is not only a question of creation anymore, but a question of living itself.

¹⁰⁶ Jacques Derrida, The Other Heading, 2012, The Other Heading Study Guide, ph. 4. http://www.enotes.com/other-heading-salem/other-heading, (23. 03. 2012).

Derrida, Voyous. p.26.

"...I am (we are) all the more national for being European, all the more European for being Trans-European and international; no one is more cosmopolitan and authentically universal than the one, than this 'we' who is speaking to you." 108

¹⁰⁸ Derrida, The Other Heading, p.48.

CONCLUSION

"It may be argued that the past is a country from which we have all emigrated, that; its loss is a part of our common humanity" (S. Rushdie)

"The map-maker, the translator and the travel writer are not innocent producers of text. The works they create are part of a process of manipulation that shapes and conditions our attitudes to other cultures while purporting to be something else". ¹¹⁰ Even though its legal tools and practices have changed, colonial networks still operate the economic field, political, ideological, religious, and cultural spheres. Neocolonialism via these producers (Discourse is also a produced production) constantly provides enormous profits as it did before. Now it is time to produce a 'new man' who will decide for freedom. It is time to awaken a new consciousness.

This study realistically analyzed 'the available colonialism' via its invisible practices and its concern to create a cultural identity. It specially avoided locating colonial power on a high base and dragging the general situation hopelessly to a blind alley. The first chapter discussed a writing of a history based on hegemonic determinations, exploring the Enlightenment philosophy. It attempted to outline the relationship between culture and colonial networks. Furthermore, the first parts discussed Oriental/Occidental discourse to comprehend its influence on the identity formation. The first chapter hereby, concluded that the colonialist at a historical condition created the limitations of independence, and questioned whether at another historical condition another man could transcend those conditions.

The second chapter primarily analyzed the works of Western representations. It equally developed some thoughts on the identity formation of the Other in African Literature. Estimable writers, such as W. Shakespeare, J. Conrad, J. Joyce, R. Kipling were products of their time. Thus, the Other was not a simply Other in their works, but was also reflecting a continuous will of power. Racism, stereotyping, ethnocentrism or

¹⁰⁹ Salman Rushdie, Imaginary Homelands: Essays and Critism 1981-1991, London, Penguin Books, 1991, p. 12.

¹¹⁰ E. S. Shaffer, Comparative Criticism The Communities of Europe, 1. press, 1993, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, p. 43.

discrimination were discussed in perspective of scope. The chapter concluded that all representations were fixed in a network that reproduced its other in a dialectic way. The Other was unexpectedly always deconstructed by being constituted by its Other in a dehumanized society.

This third chapter maps out possible strategies to read directly the identity of the Self without centering the identity. It aimed to form a self-location, without a 'them', an 'us' and an 'I'. New-Culturalism is thus constituted as a consciousness which has inkling on a future which is coded primarily in literature, then sociology, ideology, politics and in any discursive aspect of life. It is what Fanon articulates as:

"National consciousness, which is not nationalism, is the only thing that will give us international dimension. National consciousness acts as the coming-to-being, the condition of possibility of for a new humanity, a self-awareness of itself as Self, which can then take its place among others 'fully-man'."

Colonial nets surrounded all the cultural, social, economic and politic relations. This is a spider web. When you break the base connection, the net can continue its existence until the second connection releases the one on the base. This will be the result of a process- a process of an internal intervention. It is the result of a struggle, more powerfully it is the result of labor to release the base connection. The other connections dependent on will be automatically released of themselves and the same network will never be created with the same connections anymore. It will already be unraveled. Decolonization is, above all, to unravel this complicated net braided in mind and logic and thus, 'come-into-being'.

¹¹¹ Fanon quoted in Suren Pillay, p. 100.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources

- Gur-Ze'ev, Ian. Diasporic Philosophy and Counter-Education, The Netherlands, Sense Publishers, 2010, p. 196.
- Rousseau, Jean Jacques. Emile ya da Eğitim Üzerine, İstanbul, Say Yayınları, 2009.
- Césaire, Aimé. Discourse on Colonialism, New York and London, 1972,
 Monthly Review Press, p. 9.
 - Joyce, James. Ulyses, Vol 9. London, Penguin, 1992, p. 128-137.
- Almond, Ian. Tales of Buddha, Dream of Arabia: Joyce and the Images of the East, İstanbul, vol.57, no:1, 2002.
- Rattans, Ali and Sallie Westwood, Irkçılık Modernite ve Kimlik, 1. Basım, İstanbul, Sarmal Yayınevi, 1997.
- Caudwell, C. Studies in a DyingCulture, Monthly Review, New York, 1971
- Marrouchi, Mustapha. the New/Old Idiot: Re-reading Said's Contributions to Post-Colonial Studies:Philosophia Africana, Vol.6, Uni.of Toronto, Toronto, No 2, August 2003.
- Aydın, Kamil. Turkey as Represented in English Literature of the time, Atatürk University, Erzurum, Ph.D. thesis completed at University of Warwick, 1994.
- Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin, The Post-Colonial Studies Reader, 2. Edition, London, Routledge, 2006, p. 25.
- Yeğenoğlu, Meyda. Colonial Fantasies: Towards a Feminist Reading of
 Orientalism London and New York: Cambridge UP, 1998.

- Mitchell, Timothy. Questions of Modernity, Amerika, Minnesota Press, 2000, ph. 7.
- Foucault, Michel. Politics Philosophy Culture, 1. Basım, Great Britain, Routledge, 1988, p. 253.
- Bhabba, Homi K. Interrogating Identity: The Post colonial Prerogative, in *Anotomy of Racism*, Goldberg, David. Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1990, p.193.
- Altbach, Philip G. Servitude of the Mind? Education, Dependency and Neo-Colonialism, Comparative Education, Edited by P. G. Altbach, R. F. Arnove & G. P. Kelly, New York, Macmillan, 1982, p. 3-14.
- Phillipson, Robert. Linguistic Imperialism, 6. Press, New York, Oxford
 University Press, 1992, p. 47.
- Kachru, Braj B. The Alchemy of English: the Spread, Functions, and Models of Non-Native Englishes, 2. Press, New York, Illini Books edition, 1990, p. 9.
- Shakespeare, William. "The Tempest." Rpt in William Shakespeare: The Complete Works, Ed. Peter Alexander, London, Collins Clear Type Press, 1989, p. 363-364.
- Washbourne, Henry. The Works Of Edmund Spenser With Observation On His Life And Writings, 1. Press, London, Blackfriers, 1970, p. 480-500.
- For further study on the role of "ethnicity" in American literature; See Warner Sollors, Beyond Ethnicity Consert And Descent in American Culture, New York, Oxford University Press, 1986.
- Fanon, Frantz. The Wretched Of The Earth, New York, Grove Press, 2004. p. Preface.
- Pincus, Fred L. and Howard J. Ehrlich, eds. Race and Ethnic Conflict:
 Contending Views on Prejudice, Discrimination, and Ethnoviolence, United States of America, Westview Press, 1999, p.50.

- Pillay, Suren. Anti-colonialism, post-colonialism and the New Man:Politikon, May 2004: vol. 31, p. 91-104.
- Glazer, Nathan, and Daniel Patrick Moynihan. Beyond the Melting Pot:
 The Negroes, Puerto Ricans, Jews, Italians and Irish of New York City, Cambridge,
 MIT Press, 1963. p. 17.
- Cited in Susan Sellers, The Helene Cixous Reader-Helene Cixous, London, Routledge, 1994, p.15.
- Batabyal, Rakesh. Communalism in Bengal, 1. Press, New Delhi, Tejeshwar Singh for Sage Publications India, 2005, p. 36.
- Foucault, Michel. Dicipline And Punish: The Birth Of The Prison, 2. Press, New York and Canada, Random House, 1995.
- Wrongs, Righting. In Other Asias, London, Oxford; Blackwell, 2008, p.
 263.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. A Critique of Postcolonial Reason, United States of Amerika, President and Fellows of Harvard College, 1999.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. Can The Subaltern Speak, Rosalind C. Morris (edt), New York, Columbia University Press, 2010.
- The term belongs to *Maurice Blanchot in* Gayatri C. Spivak, Yeni Madun Sessiz Bir Mülakat, çev. Ebru B. Yetişkin, Toplumbilim Postkolonyal Söylem özel sayısı, Istanbul, Bağlam Yayınları, 2010.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. Marxist, Feminist, Deconstructionist Benjamin Graves, Brown University, Posted: May 30, 2008.
 - Derrida, Jacques. Voyous, Paris, Editions Galilée, 2003, p. 60.
- Said, Edward W. Out of Place, 1. Press, New York, Vintage Books, 2010.
- Said, Edward W. Joseph Conrad And The Fiction Of Autobiography, New York, Columbia University Press, 2008, p. 15-16.

- Lewis S. Feuer, Marks and Engels: Basic Writings on Politics and Philosophy, London, Fontana Boks, 1971, p. 489.
- Youdell, Deborah. Impossible Bodies, Imposible Selves: Exclusions and Student Subjectives, Netherlands, Springer, 2006, p. 44.
- Citation of Foucoult in: Simon Springer ,Environment and Planning D: Society and Space2010, Volume 28, New Zealand, p. 931-950.
- Loomba, Ania. Colonialism/ Post-colonialism, 2. Edition, New York, Routledge, 2005.
 - Conrad, Joseph. The Heart of Darkness, Forgotten Books, 2008.
- Butler, Judith. The Psychic Life of Power, California, Stanford Universty Press, 1997, p. 83-84.
- Althusser, Louis. Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses, New York, Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays, Monthly Review Press, Translated: from the French by Ben Brewster, 1971, p.169.
- Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." Colonial Discourse and Post-colonial Theory: a Reader. Ed. Patrick Williams and Chrisman. London, Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1994, p. 392-401.
- Rushdie, Salman. Imaginary Homelands: Essays and Critism 1981-1991, London, Penguin Books, 1991, p. 12.
- Sartre, Jean-Paul. Colonialism and Neocolonialism, Taylor and Francis e-Library, 2005, p. 29.
- Shaffer, E. S. Comparative Criticism, Volume 15. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1993, p. 43.
- Conrad, Joseph. Lord Jim, 13. Press, Verdana, Read How You Want,
 2008.
 - Joyce, James. Ulysses, Forgotten Books, 2008.

- Defoe, Daniel. Robinson Crusoe, Retold by Pauline Francis, United
 States, Windmill Books, 2009.
- Ashcroft, Bill. Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin, The Post-Colonial Studies Reader, 2. Edition, London, Routledge, 2006.
- Fanon, Frantz. The Wretched of the Earth, tr by Richard Philcox, 1.Edition, New York, Grove Press, 2004
- Fanon, Frantz. Black skin, white masks, tr. by Richard Philcox. New York, Grove Press, 2008.
 - Edward Said, Orientalism, New York, Vintage Books, 2003.
- Foucault, Michel. Power Knowledge Selected Interviews and Other Writings, New York, Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1990.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty, Poststructuralism, Marginality, Postcoloniality and Value.in Twentieth Century Literary Criticism, ed. Das, Bijay Kumar. 5. Press, New Delhi, Atlantic Publishers and Distributors, 2007. p. 352-360.

Secondary Sources

- Edward, Said. Culture and Resistance: Conversations with Edward W. Said, Interviews by David Barsamian, 1. Press, London, Pluto Press, 2003.
 - Edward Said, Diacritica, Fall, 1977, p. 43-44.
- Power, Politics and Culture: Interviews with Edward W. Said, ed. Gauri Viswanathan, New York, Pantheon, 2001.
- Edward, Said. Covering Islam: How the Media and the Experts Determine How We See the.
 - Rest of the World, London, Vintage, 1997.
- Foucault, Michel. Madness and Civilization, United Kingdom, Routledge, 2005.

- Foucault, Michel. The history of sexuality, An introduction, tr by A Sheridan. Vol 1. London, Allen Lane, 1978.
- Gramsci, Antonio. Selections from the Prison Notebooks. New York, International Publishers, 1971.
- Young, R J C. Colonial desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race. London, Routledge, 1995.
- Forster, Edward Morgan. A passage to India, India, Dorling Kindersley, 2006.
- Bhabha, Homi K. Cultures in Between. Questions of Cultural Identity. S.
 Hall and P. Du Gay. London, Sage Publications. 1996.
- Mongia, Padmini. Contemporary Postcolonial Theory, New York, Arnold, 2003.
- Achebe, Chinua Anthills of the Savannah, Johannesburg, Heinemann Educational Publishers, 1987.
 - Achebe, Chinua. Things Fall Apart. New York, Anchor Books, 1994.
 - Dirlik, Arif, The Postcolonial Aura, Boulder, Westview Press. 1997.
- Césaire, Aime. Discourse on colonialism, tr by Joan Pinkham. New York, Monthly Review Press, 1972.
- Memmi, Albert. The Colonizer and the Colonized. trans. Howard Greenfeld, Boston, Beacon Press, 1991.
- Anderson, Benedict. Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Rise of Nationalism, London, 1982.
- Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." Colonial Discourse and Post-colonial Theory. Ed. Patrick Williams and Laura Chrisman. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1993.p. 392-403.

- Hall, Stuart. "Who Needs 'Identity'?" in Questions of Cultural Identity. Ed. Stuart Hall and Paul du Gay. London, Sage, 1996. p.1-17.
- Gilroy, Paul. Postcolonial Melancholia. New York, Columbia University Press, 2005.
- Best, Steven and Douglas Kellner, Postmodern Theory: Critical Interrogations (Communications & culture), 1.edition, New York, The Guildford Press, 1991, p.213-216.
- Young, Robert. Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race.
 London, Routledge, 1995.
- Young, Robert. White Mythologies: Writing History and the West.
 London, Routledge, 1990.
- Blanchot, Maurice. Michel Foucault tel que je l'imagine, Montpellier, Fata Morgana, 1986.
- Césaire, Aimé. Cahier d'un retour au pays natal, Paris, Présence Africaine, 1971.
- Dépestre, René. Bonjour et Adieu à la Négritude, Paris, R. Laffont, 1980.
- Derrida, Jacques. "La différance" in Marges de la Philosophie, Paris, Les Éditions de Minuit, 1972, p. 3-29.
- Mbembe, Achille On the Postcolony, Berkeley, University of California Press, 2001.
- Kipling , <u>John A. McClure</u> and Conrad, the Colonial Fiction, Harvard, Harvard University Press, 1981.
- Attridge, Derek. The Cambridge Companion to James Joyce, United Kingdom, Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Joyce, James. A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man, Hertfordshire, Wordsworth Editions Limited, 2001.

- Ray, Martin Joseph Conrad. Memories and Impressions An Annotated Bibliography, New York, Editions Rodopi B.V. 2007.
- Urgan, Mina, İngiliz Edebiyat Tarihi IV, İstanbul, Altın Kitaplar Yayınevi, 1991.
- Chakrabarty, Dipesh. Provinvializing Europe: Postvolonial Thought and Historical Difference, New Jersey, Princeton University Press, 2000.
- Chatterjee, Partha. The Nation and Its Fragments: Colonial and Postcolonial Histories, New Jersey, Princeton University Press, 1993.
- Parry, Benita. Postcolonial Studies A Materialist Critique, USA and Canada, Routledge, 2004.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. Liquid Times Living in an Age of Uncertainty, Cambride, Polity Press, 2007.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. Intimations of Postmodernity, London, New York and Canada: by Routledge, 1992. p. 9.

Internet Sources

• Ingram, Anders. "English Literature On The Ottoman Turks In The Sixteenth AndvSeventeenth Centuries", 2009, p. Abstract. Doctoral thesis, Durham

University. Available at Durham E-Theses Online: http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/86/, (26.01.2012).

- Segun, Mabel. "(Quoted in Povey, 39)", African English Poetry: Some Themes and Features, 3 May 2002, ph. 4, 10, 15. http://www.postcolonialweb.org/africa/jvrao5.html, (12.12.2011).
- Copyright by Dennis O'Neil, July 05, 2006, ph. 7. http://anthro.palomar.edu/ethnicity/ethnic_1.htm, (13.02.2012).
- Biswas, Amrita. Research Note on Subaltern Studies, July-December 2009, p. 1. http://www.inflibnet.ac.in/ojs/index.php/JLCMS/article/viewFile/44/42, (23.02.1012).
- Kipling,, Rudyard. The White Man's Burden. Complate collection of poems by Rudyard Kipling, 2011, p.1.

 http://www.poetryloverspage.com/poets/kipling/white_mans_burden.html, (05.02.2012).
- Phillipson, Robert. Linguistic Imperialism, Vikipedia, 25.05.2012, p. 1. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Linguistic_imperialism, (03.01.2012).
- Foucault, Michel. "Foucault", August 1996, ph. 5, http://www.massey.ac.nz/~alock/theory/foucault.htm, (11. 11. 2011).
- Foucault, Michel. "Discourse or Power/Knowledge", Michigan State University, ph. 5. https://www.msu.edu/~comertod/courses/foucault.htm, (11.11.2011).
- Jacques Derrida, The Other Heading, 2012, The Other Heading Study
 Guide, ph. 4. http://www.enotes.com/other-heading-salem/other-heading, (23. 03. 2012).