

# LISANSÜSTÜ EĞİTİM ENSTİTÜSÜ

# HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT PRACTICES IN GAMBIAN PUBLIC SECTOR: NPM OR WEBERIAN

# **Aja JAWNEH**

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Gonca BAYRAKTAR DURGUN

MASTER OF ARTS THESIS
DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL ADVANCED EXECUTIVE

**APRIL 2019** 

# HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT PRACTICES IN GAMBIAN PUBLIC SECTOR: NPM OR WEBERIAN

# **Aja JAWNEH**

# MASTER OF ARTS THESIS DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL ADVANCED EXECUTIVE

# ANKARA HACI BAYRAM VELİ UNIVERSITY GRADUATE SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

AJA JAWNEH tarafından hazırlanan "Human Resource Management Practices in the Public Management or Weberian: The Gambia As A Case Study" adlı tez çalışması aşağıdaki jüri tarafından OY BİRLİĞİ / OY ÇOKLUĞU ile Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi Lisansüstü Eğitim Enstitüsü Amme İdaresi Anabilim Dalında INTERNATIONAL ADVANCED EXECUTIVE (AMME İDARESİ-İNGİLİZCE) Bilim Dalında YÜKSEK LİSANS TEZİ olarak kabul edilmiştir.

# Danışman:

Anabilim Dalı, Üniversite Adı

Bu tezin, kapsam ve kalite olarak Yüksek Lisans Tezi olduğunu onaylıyorum/onaylamıyorum

Baskan:

Anabilim Dalı, Üniversite Adı

Bu tezin, kapsam ve kalite olarak Yüksek Lisans Tezi olduğunu onaylıyorum/onaylamıyorum Profile Taliksek Bilisans Tezi olduğunu

Bu tezin, kapsam ve kalite olarak Yüksek Lisans Tezi olduğunu onaylıyorum/onaylamıyorum

Pol. Po. A. Argon Akosenu

Tez Savunma Tarihi: 26 /04/2019

Jüri tarafından kabul edilen bu tezin Yüksek Lisans Tezi olması için gerekli şartları yerine getirdiğini onaylıyorum.

Prof. Dr. Figen ZAİF

Enstitü Müdürü

## **ETHICAL STATEMENT**

I hereby declare that in this thesis study I prepared in accordance with thesis writing rules of Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University Graduate School Of Education;

- All data, information and documents presented in this thesis have been obtained within the scope of academic rules and ethical conduct,
- All information, documents, assessments and results have been presented in accordance with scientific ethical conduct and moral rules,
- All material used in this thesis that are not original to this work have been fully cited and referenced.
- No change has been made in the data used,
- The work presented in this thesis is original, or else, I admit all loss of rights to be incurred against me.

Aja JAWNEH

30./04./2019

Alub

# ETİK BEYAN

Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi Lisansüstü Eğitim Enstitüsü Tez Yazım Kurallarına uygun olarak hazırladığım bu tez çalışmasında;

- Tez içinde sunduğum verileri, bilgileri ve dokümanları akademik ve etik kurallar çerçevesinde elde ettiğimi,
- Tüm bilgi, belge, değerlendirme ve sonuçları bilimsel etik ve ahlak kurallarına uygun olarak sunduğumu,
- Tez çalışmasında yararlandığım eserlerin tümüne uygun atıfta bulunarak kaynak gösterdiğimi,
- Kullanılan verilerde herhangi bir değişiklik yapmadığımı,
- Bu tezde sunduğum çalışmanın özgün olduğunu,

bildirir, aksi bir durumda aleyhime doğabilecek tüm hak kayıplarını kabullendiğimi beyan ederim.

Aja JAWNEH

30/04/2019

# GAMBIYA' nin KAMU SEKTÖRÜNDE İNSAN KAYNAKLARI YÖNETİMİ UYGULAMALARI: YENİ KAMU YÖNETİMİ VEYA WEBERYEN (Yüksek Lisans Tezi)

# Aja JAWNEH

# ANKARA HACI BAYRAM VELİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ LİSANSÜSTÜ EĞİTİM ENSTİTÜSÜ Nisan 2019

#### ÖZET

Gambia 'nın sivil hizmet sektörü, Sahra-altı Afrika, Latin Amerika, Asya ve Karayipler 'in gelişmekte olan ülkeleri arasında, verimli, performans odaklı ve sorumlu bir geleceğe doğru yönlendirilmeye teşebbüs etmiştir. 1980 'lerde Dünya Bankası tarafından uygulanan yapısal ayar programı. Gelişmiş ülkelerin sivil hizmet sektöründe reform stratejileri üzerinde modellenmiş, bu Yeni kamu yönetimi hareketinin somutlaşan etmektir. Bu programın reform stratejileri, bu ülkelerin insan kaynaklarının veya kamu sektörünün personelinin vatandaşların taleplerine ve memnuniyetine etkili yollarla ve ekonomik olarak verimli bir şekilde gerçekleştirildiğinden emin olmak için geliştirildi. Etkili. Yapısal ayar programı, Kuzey 'in gelişmiş ülkelerinden politika difüzyon veya transfer olaydır. Yeni kamu yönetimi hareketinden kaynaklanan reform stratejileri, Ingiltere ve Yeni Zelanda gibi OECD ülkelerinin kamu sektörünün genel ve insan kaynakları yönetimi uygulamalarında kamu yönetimi sistemini önemli ölçüde değiştirdi. Örnekler. Bu çalışmada, Gambian kamu sektöründe, uygulamaların yeni kamu yönetimi ile birlikte olup olmadığı veya Weberian insan kaynakları yönetimi sistemini takip eden insan kaynakları yönetimi uygulamalarını araştırıyor. Çalışma yüksek olasılık uygulamaları Weberian personel yönetim sistemine karşı daha fazla yalın olacak olduğunu kanıtlar bu yana ulusal kalkınma planı belge 2017 of Gambia hükümetinin vurgulanmıştır bekliyor.

Bilim Kodu : 111623

Anahtar Kelimeler : Yeni KamuYönetimi, InsanKaynaklari, Kamusektörü

Sayfa No : 39

Danışman : Prof. Dr. Gonca BAYRAKTAR DURGUN

# HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT PRACTICES IN GAMBIAN PUBLIC SECTOR: NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT OR WEBERIAN

(MA Thesis)

# Aja JAWNEH

# ANKARA HACI BAYRAM VELİ UNIVERSITY GRADUATE SCHOOL OF EDUCATION April 2019

#### ABSTRACT

The Gambia's civil service sector is among those of the developing countries of Sub-Saharan Africa, Latin America, Asia and the Caribbean that has been attempted to be steered towards an efficient, performance-oriented and accountable future through the Structural Adjustment Program implemented by the World Bank during the 1980s. Modelled on reform strategies in the civil service sector of the developed countries, these are to be embodied in the New Public Management movement. The reform strategies of this program were devised to making sure that these countries' human resources or personnel of the public sector perform in efficient ways to the demands and satisfaction of the citizenry and in a way that it is economically efficient and effective. The Structural Adjustment Program is a phenomenon of policy diffusion or transfer from the developed countries of the North. Its reform strategies emanated from the New Public Management movement that significantly changed the public administration system in general and human resource management practices of the public sector of OECD countries such as Britain and New Zealand for examples. This study as a result, explores the human resource management practices in the Gambian public sector as to whether the practices are in-line with New Public Management or follows the Weberian human resource management administration system. The study expects with high probability that the practices will lean more towards the Weberian Personnel Management system since evidence of it has been highlighted in the National Development Plan document of 2017 of the government of The Gambia.

Science Code : 111623

Key Words : New Public Management, Human Resource management, Public sector

Page Number : 39

Supervisor : Prof. Dr. Gonca BAYRAKTAR DURGUN

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

I would thank God first and foremost for providing me with the ability and strength throughout this journey. I would like to thank my parents for their love, motivation and prayers.

I would furthermore like to thank my current supervisor, Prof.Dr.Gonca Bayraktar Durgun for her help and understanding for the final touches on this work. I am indebted and very thankful to my former supervisor, Hasan Engin Sener for his thorough guidance and support from the start to the end of this work.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page		
ÖZETiv		
ABSTRACTv		
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTvi		
TABLE OF CONTENTS vii		
LIST OF TABLESix		
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONSx		
CHAPTER ONE		
1.1. Introduction1		
1.2. Objectives of The Research		
1.2.1. Main objective		
1.2.2. Sub-Objective		
1.3. Research Methodology		
CHAPTER TWO		
Literature Review		
2.1. New Public Management, theoretical background, NPM and Civil Service Reforms in the Developed Countries		
2.1.1. New Public Management5		
2.1.2. The point of emergence of NPM6		
2.1.3. Why did the NPM emerge?6		
2.1.4. The Traditional Public Administration System		
2.1.5. Weberian Bureaucracy		
2.1.6. Point of practice		
2.2. Personnel Management and Human Resource Management		
2.2.1. Recruitment System		
2.2.2. Performance management		

2.2.3. Promotion		
2.2.4. Compensation/ Payment System		
2.2.5. Industrial Relations		
2.2.6. Training and Development		
2.2.7. Institutional setting		
2.2.8. Summary		
CHAPTER THREE		
HRM in the Civil Service of the Gambia		
3.1. Human Resource management reform in the Gambia's public sector through the SAPs		
3.1.1. Civil service and personnel problems in the 1980s		
3.2. HRM: The Case of the Gambia		
3.2.1. Findings		
3.2.2. Analysis: is the HRM practice in the public sector of The Gambia Weberian or NPM?		
3.2.3. Conclusion		
REFERENCES35		
CURRICULUM VITAE39		

# LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
Table 1.1. Summary of the characteristics of the Old Public Management (Weberian) and New Public Management	25
Table 1.2. from table 1.1, summary of the human resource management of the Gambia under the old public or Weberian personnel management system.	32

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

The abbreviations used in this thesis are presented in below with explanations.

Abbreviations	Explanation
NPM	New Public Management
OPM	Old Public Management
PSC	Public Service Commission
SAPs	Structural Adjustment Programs
PM	Personnel Management
HRM	Human Resource Management

#### **CHAPTER ONE**

#### 1.1. Introduction

It is over three decades since the Structural Adjustment Program (SAP) assessment of The Gambia showed and established that deficiencies in the human resource management practice of The Gambia's public sector civil service of the country needs fixing. Reform measures by the international organizations such as the World Bank in collaboration with The Gambia government, were devised and funded for the fixing of the said deficiencies. However, HRM practice in the public sector of the country still has after such a long time, many and critical deficiencies for better performance of the civil service sector. The World Bank February 2010 Report "Improving Civil Service Performance", stated that "the legal and regulatory framework which governs the management of the civil service is outdated" (p.57), and that the PSC<sup>1</sup> acts less of a regulatory body by not overseeing the HR practices of departments, to acting more like an "executive" body, governing over 'operational' and trivial issues such as 'individual appointment management'. The newest National Development Plan of the new 2016 regime or government has alluded to this; "lack of performance management system, inadequate programming capacity generally low pay and pension scales has led to low productivity which was further worsened by politicized recruitment and promotion processes and sparse conduct of capacity gaps assessments" (2017, p. 197)

Since such strides through the SAP "in reforming public sector human resource management has been associated with politicians and management reformers seeking to implement aspects of NPM in an effort to enhance efficiency" (Battaglio&Condney, 2009, p. 689); it is important that an academic research is done to establish if after such reform strides, the HRM practices are still in line with the reform principles. The Human Resource (HR) practice in the public sector of The Gambia has attracted scanty and less attention from academicians and or other researchers. Where it attracted attention, research was mostly done by international organizations such as the World Bank which does narrowly focus on only 'what' questions, as to what the sector's problems are and what solutions are being devised and supposed to be done in order to strengthen the sector in a more

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Public Service Commission. It is mandated with (i) making provisions for the overall management and efficiency of the public service; (ii) reviewing terms and conditions of the service; (iii) reviewing General Orders and Regulations; and (iv) prescribing standards for entry and promotion examinations (World Bank, February 2010).

efficient and effective way. Academic research has never been done about the philosophies or the principles behind these reform directions.

As a result, this study seeks to investigate from the lens of the NPM if the HR practices of the public sector civil service of The Gambia, is in line with the New Public Management principles or with the default, the Weberian Public Administration system? In the contents to follow until the end of this paper;

A literature review will be made of the NPM, NPM- led civil service reforms in the developed countries; HRM in relations to the NPM and the Weberian public administration system. A general brief look will be done at the Structural Adjustment Program assessment of The Gambia but with a specific focus on the HRM practice. Following this will be an analysis of the HRM system of The Gambia from the data collected to establish if it is in fact in line with the NPM or Weberian Public Administration system.

# 1.2. Objectives of The Research

# 1.2.1. Main objective

1. To explore and analyze if the human resource management practice in the public sector of The Gambia is Weberian or New Public Management?

# 1.2.2. Sub-Objective

2. To trace the historical civil service reform of the Gambia from the Structural Adjustment Program

# 1.3. Research Methodology

This paper as has been highlighted, seeks to venture into an explorative research in trying to highlight the philosophies and principles behind the civil service reforms in terms of HRM practices in the public sector of The Gambia.

As a result, the qualitative case study research design was employed. The Gambia is taken as a case. The Case study research design is not akin to qualitative research only however it is rather "considered by some researchers as part of the qualitative research method and as such it is a type or a method" (Starman, 2013, p. 30).

Essentially this research relies heavenly on official documents of the government of The Gambia and international organizations such as the World Bank with regard the subject and as a result are descriptive of the phenomenon in question here.

The official documents of the World Bank and the Personnel Management Office of the government of The Gambia provides the information with regards the types of research strategies that were devised and implemented and the respective problems that demanded them. And as well as the arrangement and structure of Human Resource (Personnel Management) institution and sector.

#### **CHAPTER TWO**

#### **Literature Review**

# 2.1. New Public Management, theoretical background, NPM and Civil Service Reforms in the Developed Countries.

This section seeks to highlight the intricacies of the civil service reforms in the developed countries as a result of the emergence of NPM as a public management discourse that led to changes in the nature of the state, the economy and the relationship within them as well as importantly for this study, the nature of public sector administration practice of the civil service and personnel. The section in a row, will first seek to provide some general information on the NPM, when it started to surface, why it surfaced and its importance theories with relevance to the civil service. Then management discourse inspired influence and effects on two countries of the developed world civil service or HRM; Britain and New Zealand will be briefly highlighted. This will especially help to show the policy transfer situation of civil service reform strategies from the developed countries to the developing countries as undertaken by the World Bank through the civil service reform programs in the developing countries of the structural adjustment programs.

# 2.1.1. New Public Management

When it was announced, the term "New Public Management" (NPM) was a new and loose term and concept (Hood, 1991), although its characteristics weren't as new as the term itself. Greuning, G. (2001, p. 2) cites that the "NPM characteristics have been in practice in the past and it was only later that academics unified the common characteristics into this now concrete term; NPM" (Dunsire, 1995, p. 21). NPM is a label "academics have given to this series of the public management reforms (Pollitt, et al., 2007). "It was important to have coined it under some generic label. The analogy is with terms such as 'new politics', 'new right', and 'new industrial state', which were invented for a similar reason" (Hood, 1995, p. 94). Since then the term has come to identify, and represent a series of public management styles, methods and programs aimed at reforming the organization and processes of the public sector in order to make it more competitive and efficient in resource use and service delivery (Promberger & Rauskala, 2003, p. 1; Hood, 1995, p. 94).

It is usually difficult to discern the exact particularities and important details of the history of the NPM after reading many of the literatures with regards to timelines as to when the NPM started surfacing, and the time that it stood its ground as a commanding force in public management discourse. As a result, the next sub-section will briefly highlight 'the point of emergence" of the NPM. And the rest will follow in a logical sequence in order to clearly establish the nitty gritty of the NPM.

# 2.1.2. The point of emergence of NPM

The point of emergence of NPM perspective seeks to highlight the time around which that it started surfacing. This is important in order to distinguish it from the time that the trade had its solid ground and had a commanding right and influence.

There seems to be consensus that the NPM paradigm started surfacing in the arena of public management discourse in the 1970s or during the late 1970s (A. Larbi, 1999; Barzelay, 2000; Greuening, 2001, p. 2).

# 2.1.3. Why did the NPM emerge?

The NPM "attempts to correct the shortcomings of the traditional public organizations in efficiency and service delivery" (Hood, 2000, p. 1);

"It refers to the failures and inadequacies of the public sector performance over time, and locates the problems as lying in the nature and processes of public sector activity and public administration. Centralized mechanisms of accountability (of the traditional public sector organizations), are all problems which the NPM sought to tackle" (Promberger & Rauskala, 2003, p.1).

These failures and inadequacies are said to lie in the "scale, scope, and the method of government of the public sector" (Islam, 2015, p. 143). The traditional approach as a result, came to be seen and considered on a massive scale as inefficient, and "a liability" undermining performance and demotivating individuals (Poor & Afghad, 2013, p. 256).

On a more comprehensive level, the NPM paradigm has emerged to "put forward a different relationship between governments, the public service and the public" (Islam, 2015, p. 141).

## 2.1.4. The Traditional Public Administration System

The traditional public administration was "influenced by the ideas of Weber through much of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. A model of bureaucracy based on the twin principles of hierarchy and meritocracy" (UNDP, 2015, p.5). Proponents of the NPM "regularly railed against bureaucracy in arguing to the NPM reforms (Gregory, p. 221);[it] is pictured as ruling the pre-NPM earth (Politt, 2003, p. 32). The NPM "has presented itself as an alternative to the traditional bureaucratic way of conducting the public's business (Gregory, p. 26).

### 2.1.5. Weberian Bureaucracy

The word 'bureaucracy' has come to acquire a negative connotation. This seems to be even the trajectory of the title of this paper. Today, it is not considered complimentary to label an organization 'bureaucratic" (Jain, 2004, p. 2). However in its own right, the model of bureaucracy came about as "part of a wide-ranging bureaucratic reform in the United Kingdom and Prussia in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century to over-turn patrimonial systems of administration where patronage and favoritism characterized and prevailed over government decisions and public appointments" (UNDP, 2015, p. 5). Its characteristics include hierarchy, chain of command, rules and control etc.

"Leaders were recognized and obeyed for subscribing to values of logic, efficiency and reason. Such organizations functioned on the basis of 'legitimately' derived laws, rules and regulations. And laws, rules and regulations derived their legitimacy from the consistent, disciplined, rationalized and methodical calculation of optimum means to given ends. Weber posited that bureaucratic action was typically oriented towards solving problems and that bureaucratic decision-making was guided by the objectives of efficiency, calculability and predictability. Consequently, decisions were more rational because they were made 'without regard to persons', i.e. were immune to personal, irrational, and emotional aspects" (Jain, 2004, p. 2).

The Weberian bureaucracy from a practical organizational and institutional perspective renders; "the civil servants with pensions, security of tenure and obligation to non-partisanship. The organizational type is hierarchical with ministerial departments and structures, allocated specified tasks and competencies, recruited by examination and promoted by some form of 'merit' including seniority" (Page, 2003, p. 488).

# **2.1.6.** Point of practice

Governments in many western countries decided in the 1980s that the traditional administration was no longer up to the task of modern government. As a result, they looked to the private sector to define a new management approach in which a lot of politicians decided to package a series of reform measures that would be known as NPM" (Pollitt, 2003, p. 32).

In the early 1980s these governments were confronted with slow economic growth, large public sectors that resulted in high level public expenditures and increasingly educated and demanding citizens who were discontented with the quality of government services. It is also accounted that they were also worried about efficiency of countries like Japan and other emerging Asian countries. So bureaucracy was stooped as the enemy of; freedom, creativity and efficiency (Pollitt, 2003, p. 33). The NPM has been implemented in most western and OECD countries like New Zealand, Australia, Canada, etc. (Gruening, 2001; Keating, 2001).

# 2.1.7. NPM and civil service reforms in developed countries

NPM draws (for the case of the civil service and management issues) its intellectual inspiration from public-choice theory and agency theory (Ferlie, 2017:1; Andrews et al., 2013; Bach &Bordogna, 2011, p. 2281). The two theories are useful in showing why and how to institutionalizing accountability and performance in the civil service sector.

**Public-choice theory**- The Public choice theory is a sub-specialty of economics (Islam, 2015, p. 143). It implores the "rational actor" and or rational choice economic model to the political science field of studies and government or in another word, non-market decision making arenas (Hill, 1999; Ed. Rowlins, & Schneider, 2004; Butler, E. 2012). The first

name of the public choice journal before being named as such in 1968 was "Papers in Non-Market Decision-Making" (Hill, 1999, p.1).

The public choice tradition is then a "political economy theory"; concerned with the nature of governments and as well their investment; it represents a radical implication for the theory of public administration" (Vincent& Elinor Ostrom, 1971, p. 205). In this way, public choice is "a way of studying politics"; involving the application of the methods of economics to the study of politics and, in particular, requiring and being back-up by the assumption of self-interested behavior" (Collins, et. al., 2006, p. 80).

With its rational actor assumption of the human being, bureaucrats, (politicians, political parties and even voters) are argued to be motivated by their own selfish interest rather than the 'public interest' (Islam, 2015, p. 143) and therefore will do everything to preserve it at the expense of the economy and efficiency. With the voting system, "voting and legislation are processes in which individuals pursue their own often conflicting interest. There is no communal public interest" (Butler, 2012, p. 26).

**Principal-agent theory-** the Principal-agent theory (PAT) is concerned with the economic analysis of relations between principles and agents. And it is used to shows how political executives should engage the public service. Principal-agent relationship is structured by a means of a contract that specifies what the principals want and how the agents are going to be rewarded economically by their principals (Barzelay, 2000, p. 190).

The PAT "encapsulates a tradition of rational choice modelling, in which some actors, the principals uses whatever actions are at their disposal to provide incentives for some other actors, the agents, to realize the goals that the principals prefer" (Gailmard, 2012, p. 1). The theory sees the modern firm as "not run by owners but by salaried managers" (Klein, 1999, p. 465). The importance of a firm or a corporation lies in the contractual arrangements between its principals and its agents.

These incentive mechanisms on one end, contains that contracts should be based on formulation of measurable outputs. And they should be based on agreeable terms between the agents and the principals. Also rewards should be based on "compensation on the

outcome" (Klein, 1999, p. 645) to make sure that the agents work towards the desired goals.

# 2.1.8. NPM-Led Civil service reforms; the case of the UK and New Zealand

The wage bill as a result of an expanding number of civil servants also led to the undertaking of civil service reforms in the New Zealand and the UK. About 88,000 civil servants were working for a population of 3.3 million people in the New Zealand case while the civil servant in the British public sector multiplied three-fold in 1976 (Das, 1998, pp. 90 & 101). Consequently downsizing the civil service kicked start with the civil service reforms. That happened for example in the British case by transferring some civil servants to the private sector or making some leaving the service altogether with some compensation packages (p.103).

From the perspective of the principal-agent theory mechanism of institutionalizing and making explicit performance indicators, the institutional structure for human resource management of these two countries came to be headed by a chief executive and departments and these senior officials were provided clear performance standards based on which they are assessed at a specific interval. And compensation and tenure of office is determined by the result of the performance. For example senior executive earned bonuses for good performance appraisal in the case of New Zealand (Das, 1998, p. 93).

## 2.2. Personnel Management and Human Resource Management

Personnel Management (PM) and Human Resource Management (HRM) are two terms that have been used interchangeably (Svetlik et al., 2007, p. 37; Isaiah, 2012) but others see HRM as a successor to PM. For example "debates existed in the 1980s and 1990s concerning the advent of the HRM terminology and how it might threaten to be different from its predecessor, PM" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 2). This study believes HRM is an evolutionary developmental product of PM. PM over time was challenged, critiqued and consequently transformed into HRM now; "HRM first emerged as a clearly defined concept in the mid-1980s as a natural development of PM" (Isaiah, 2012, p. 7; Svetlik et al., 2007). The term "has been commonly used for about the last ten to fifteen years. Prior to that, the field was generally known as "personnel administration" (Chukwunoso, 2013,

cp2). However governments of some states still have their human resource management offices named as Personnel Management Office. The Gambia is an example of this.

As a result, this section in here attempts to dilate on the history of how the concept of Personnel Management evolved into that of Human Resource Management practices and what this evolution means and entails for the difference of NPM human resource management system and the Weberian personnel management.

PM generically, from a practice and academic perspectives started with the appearance of new professional specialists responsible for personnel services such as recruiting, training, remuneration etc., (Svetlik et al., 2007;ed. Boxall et al., 2007); record keeping (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 20). "Frequently, a new staff position was created to administer these activities, called a 'welfare secretary,' and women or social workers were often appointed; the impetus behind welfare work was an amalgam of good business, humanitarian concern for employees, and religious principle" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 20).

From an academic perspective, (Svetlik et al., 2007, p. 36) cites, "consultants started offering specialized and technical services, research began and first academic degree in PM started to be first issued in France in 1947 (Legge, 1978).

From a historical perspective with regards to the time when PM started to emerge, literatures and authors have that PM (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 20) cites, started, "and grow out of the emergence of industrial welfare work. Starting in the 1890s, a number of companies started to provide a variety of workplace and family amenities for their employees such as lunch rooms, medical care, recreational programs, libraries, company provided housing (Eilbirt 1959; Gospel 1992; Spencer, 1984).

Others have traced it from the period of World War one. For example "the concept of traditional PM can be traced to the post ww1 'welfare tradition' of concern for the basic needs of employees-" (Fleming, CPMR Discussion paper 16, p. 8; Oldfield, 2006). The First World War cites Boxall et al., (2007, p. 21) "had a great impact on the development of human resource management functions throughout the industrial" (Eilbirt 1959; Kaufman, 2004a). During the First World War, "personnel development increased due to government initiatives to encourage the best use of people. In 1916 it became compulsory

to have a welfare worker in explosive factories and was encouraged in munitions factories" (Chukwunoso, 2013, p. 3). The war production during the time led to "greatly stimulating the pressures to rationalize management and achieved higher production. War production led to work related problems of higher turnover rates, wage pressures etc. cited from (Lichtenstein & Harris 1993) labor strikes and the active organization of unions with the Bolshevik Revolution in Russia led to the concern for labor problems in other countries and as a result companies expanded welfare services" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 21).

Personnel management continued from the time above to be influenced by approaches and theories such as Taylor's scientific management theory, and by Human relations school such as that of Maslow, Elton etc.

After some time, came the HRM movement; "the concept of HRM, as a new strategic approach to the management of people, evolved in the early 1980s (Fleming, CPMR Discussion paper 16, p. 8; Oldfield, 2006).

The emergence of the HRM movement or HRM itself is part of the bits and pieces that made up of the body of the NPM. One of "the major impact of NPM is the transformation of human resource process. Key NPM principles emphasizing market-based values, incentives and individual behavior provide the guiding platform for HRM reforms hence the convergence towards private sector practices has occurred" (Sakdiyakom & Voravivatana, 2015, p. 128).

The rise of NPM "movement signified a rejection of traditional models of HRM in the public sector; the establishment of a more assertive managerialism in conjunction with tighter control of resources, forms of marketization, and changes in organizational structure ensures that the burden of adjustment was placed squarely on the workforce" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 485). "the analysis of NPM theory and practice has shown that a special attention should be devoted to HRM changes as NPM is based not on a traditional personnel management but on an advanced HRM system" (Sakalas&Vienazind, 2010, p. 418).

HRM "for employers and managers, provides the platform for managerial initiatives, freedom to manage and increased autonomy. It represents a dramatic shift in compensation

and pay determination in terms of industrial relations, rewards based on performance (Oldfield, 2006) etc.

The HRM-NPM movement seeks to link strategic concerns of the overall organizational to the human resources available in the organizations. This "has been attempts (believed) to 'depriviledge' the employment conditions of public workers and there has been a degree of convergence between the employment practices in the public sector and the private sector" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 486).

Nonetheless Fleming (CPMR Discussion paper 16, p.8) eloquently summaries the distinguishing factors that leads HRM to a different path from PM. HRM has a strategic component to it. It seeks to explicitly and consciously link personnel management to corporate strategy. It seeks to harness employee commitment rather than their compliance. This is believed, can be done through an integrated HR policies (reward, appraisal, selection and training etc.). And finally perhaps, unlike PM which is mainly the area of specialists and operational officers, HRM is owned by line managers as a means of aiding integration and coordination.

Generally strategic roles associated with HRM cite Poor and Afghad (2013, p. 256) have "been focused on activities that will have long time implications such (apart from the development of integrated HR strategies already mentioned), involvement in organizational strategic decision making and managing organizational change. Administrative roles (associated with the PM system), on the other hand, are regarded as routine, reactive and tactical tasks associated with operationalization of HR policies (Boxall & Purcell, 2015).

The section 1.3 dilates on the difference approaches to human resource or personnel management practice with regards, compensation, industrial relations, performance management, training and development and institutional arrangements.

# 2.2.1. Recruitment System

Here, instead of looking at the process of the recruitment process; the recruitment process provides the organization with a pool of potentially qualified job candidates from which

judicious selection can be made to fill vacancies. The aim is to highlight on the aftermath of the recruitment process in terms of how long the recruited persons are supposed to work; the condition of the duration of the work; permanent or contractual job systems.

There exists in the old public administration system 'career-based' employment system. In this system, "civil servants usually are hired at the very beginning of their career and are expected to remain in the public service more or less throughout their working life" (OECD, 2004, p. 4). Within the career-based system, "work in the civil service has traditionally a high level job security or even jobs for life" (Bourgon, 2008, p. 2); "entry into the civil service requires passing competitive exam or pre-entry training provided by government training institutes. Promotion to a higher grade is depended on the acquisition of new qualifications" (OECD, 2004, p. 9).

Basically, "permanent employment traditionally is the norm in many public service settings, with much greater jobs security than private sector. This has changed significantly since the late 1980s" (OECD, 2004, p.3). With the NPM reform program, this changes. Bourgon (2008, p. 3) cites; "with NPM, employees were expected to come and go and temporal employment terms were raised as ideal" (Bourgon, 2008, p. 3). Therefore within the NPM-HRM system, the use of performance appraisal, performance-related pay as shall be dilated on soon, determines basically the duration of stay of employees in their job portfolios though in practice not in all the public sectors of many countries, but some OECD countries.

#### 2.2.2. Performance management

Performance management might have its root in the goal setting theory of motivation. The theory postulates that, and "based on hundreds of studies, the major finding of goal setting theory is that individuals who are provided with specific, difficult but attainable goals perform better than those given easy, nonspecific or no goals at all; and under the right conditions, goal setting can be a powerful technique for motivating organizational members" (Lunenburg, 2011, pp. 1&2).

Performance management serves many purposes and could take many different forms. Performance management systems "support pay decisions, promotion decisions, employee development and reduction in force" (Pulakos, 2004, p. 2). One all too common instrument of performance management is the performance appraisal scheme; "a positive aspect of a performance appraisal scheme-lead to opening a constructive and regular dialogue between superiors and subordinates on the activities of the organization and the role of each individual in the attainment of such objectives" (Cardona, 2007, p. 6). However; "performance management typically includes performance appraisal and employee development" (Pulakos, 2004, p. 1).

The performance appraisal mechanism "seeks to provide an accurate and reliable data about the job-holder and they are used for the basis of promotion" (Ruderman&Ohlott, 1994, p. 13). Unsatisfactory performance in an employee's job is tantamount to no promotion and vice versa (p.26). Performance appraisal systems are not an end in themselves, they serve other purposes such as pay determination, promotion, training needs assessment etc.

The old public administration PM in terms of say promotion and pay determination does not make a significant and essential use of the performance appraisal systems in an actual sense. For example "traditionally the entire collective of the employees got the same pay despite their performance and pay was incremental which is believed to aid a sense of complacency on the part of the employees on their performance on the job" (Oldfield, 2006, pp .4&5).

The above is not the case within the NPM-HRM system. With the contractual systems of employment, performance appraisal plays a more critical role in promotion and pay determination as have been highlighted in the New Zealand and Britain case for especially the senior civil servants.

Literatures have however cautioned a careful use of performance management systems to ensure they do not lead to pathologies. They are "likely to die of (their) own lack of purpose and weight" (Pulakos, 2004, p. 2).

Different performance appraisals should be used for different purposes at a time. For example, the performance appraisal instrument used to determine for instance pay and compensation cannot be suitable for an appraisal to find out about training and

developmental needs of employees for example. Employees would not be comfortable to show their weakness in order to have training, mentoring and development opportunities and assistance if they could lose out on a bonus pay for instance.

Other cautions Pulakos (2004) highlights that should be critically taken with performance management systems are that they should also account employees for collaboration with other employees within the organizational as only individual effort is not enough to drive organizational success. Certain individuals might score very well on individualized performance appraisal systems but are not cooperative in group works and projects. Feedback that generates from such appraisals must be given within a close proximity to the time they have been conducted or else they shall effect little change. For example "research has shown that for feedback to have the most value, it needs to be given in close proximity to the event" cited from (Wexley, 1986).

Performance appraisal endeavors can also run the 'danger' of very strictly and narrowly concentrated on the outcomes of goals that they lose sight of situations that might be beyond the individual employees and so punish them unfairly (ed. Boxall et al.,2007).

Finally performance management as a whole on the part of both the managers and the employees can be challenging which can lead to the defeat of the whole existential of the endeavor. For example in extreme and rather unfortunate cases;

"managers are reluctant to provide candid feedback and have honest discussions with employees for fear of reprisal and damaging relationships with the very individuals they could count on to get work done, employees feel that their managers are unskilled at discussing their performance and ineffective at coaching them on how to develop their skills" (Pulakos, 2004, p. 1).

#### 2.2.3. Promotion

Promotion policies determine the ascension of employees of an organization, public or private, to higher ranks within the job ranks existing in the organizations in which they work.

Promotions serve many purposes at different times and in different situations. The reasons why managers promote employees according to Ruderman and Ohlott (1994) study of 64 promotion decisions in three different 500 companies include subtle reasons such as diversity and equity issues, developmental etc. However these are accompanied or mainly guided by individual abilities, intelligence which embodies the ability of decision making, efforts, personality and achievement.

Substantially promotions, "are significant rewards that employees get in an organization and are also significant determiners of career advancement.; promotions further serve as signal to communicate the strategic value of organizations" (Ruderman&Ohlott, 1994).

Promotion and performance are squarely related. Promotions lie on the belief that employees will do well in their future performance for the organization and as a result it relies on performance appraisals etc. (Ruderman&Ohlott, 1994).

The promotion system within the traditional public administration system is rather not vigorous and dependent on the performance of the employees to qualify them the ascension to the top ladder of the job rank. For example; "seniority and length of services (are) the basis of career advancement" (Cardona, 2007, p. 1).

Within the NPM-HRM system, promotion is based on the performance of the employee with the aid of personal appraisal system mechanisms.

# 2.2.4. Compensation/ Payment System

The compensation or the "payment system refers to how employees are paid in the manner in which compensation is distributed" (ed. Boxall et al.., 2007, p. 345).

Unlike the NPM HRM reforms, the old public administration PM regarding compensation has not been a system contingent on performance. With the old public administration Prior "the 1980s, majority of the civil services in OECD countries had salary systems which reward job position regardless of the performance of the position holder" (Cardona, 2007, p. 1). This "traditional job-based pay systems have been structured so that pay is attached to the jobs that employees perform. While there may be pay adjustments associated with performance, pay is largely determined by the value of the job one holds. Thus large pay

increases occur primarily as a function of progressing up the hierarchy into the different job positions" (ed, Boxall et al.., 2007, p. 354). The pay or compensation system in the old public administration era has been summarily guided by "equality, seniority and educational skills" (Abner et al., 2017, p. 141).

The NPM reforms on compensation system took the form of a business-like structure; "in contrast to job-pay structures, person-based pay structures attach pay to individual employee's skill, knowledge, or competencies" (Ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 354). Specifically, pay is instead conditioned on performance.

Efforts to introduce performance related pay in the civil service of the public sectors surfaced in the 1980s and 1990s in some OECD countries (Cardona, 2007); "One of the by-products of NPM has been the resurgence of interest in performance related pay" (Perry, L. et. al.,). PRP is a "compensation scheme where an employee's pay is partially or wholly contingent on performance" (Abner et al., 2017, p. 141).

Performance-Related Pay (PRP), "PRP was seen as a means to establish tighter control on the pay bill by reducing across-the board pay increases and annual increments and instead targeting pay increases at high performance (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 477). (Boxall et al., 2007, p. 477) cites; "PRP is a political objective in demonstrating that public sector workers are not unaccountable and only receive pay increases linked to performance" (OECD,2005); "traditional pay systems were seen as weak tools for the management of employee performance" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 477).

There has not been any absolute application of PRP across all levels of government employees. And there were countries that were active on the path while others were not very enthusiastic, but however gave it a try. "At the forefront of adopting various types of PRP related pay schemes were the Netherlands, New Zealand, and the UK. Austria, Australia, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Norway, and Spain have also made moves in that direction; for a long time Canada and the US have had PRP for the senior public service officials and middle managers" (Cardona, 2007, p. 2). These governments Boxall et al., (2007, p. 477) cites "many including in Canada, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Sweden, the UK and the USA adopted PRP in some form from the 1980s. France, traditionally viewed as unreceptive to NPM ideas has been experimenting with PRP for top

level civil servants in six pilot ministries since 2004 (OECD, 2005). In some countries such as Austria and Spain, the traditional lifelong employment system has not been totally replaced by contractual employment system. However in 1995 lifelong employment in Austria for the senior public servants was replaced by contractual employment systems. In Spain a transformation of the legal framework of public service employment was in sectors like national airports and ports, was replaced by contractual employment forms from statutory employment (OECD, 2004, p. 7). Senior managers in the UK health sector were recruited on short term contracts (ed. Boxall et al.., 2007, p. 476).

PRP ideas have been influenced by "a number of theoretical perspectives (which) have been used to explain and understand the mechanisms by which monetary rewards can may positively influence individuals and group performance chief among which are expectancy theory (Vroom1964), goal-setting theory (Locke 1968), reinforcement theory (Skinner, 1969) and agency theory (Jensen & Meckling 1976). Another theory, cognitive evaluation theory (Deci & Ryan, 1985) has been used to challenge the basic assumption that pay positively impacts employee performance" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 346).

Expectancy theory "is a cognitive process theory of motivation that is based on the idea that people believe there (exists) relationships between efforts they put forth at work, the performance they achieve from the effort, and the rewards they receive (therefrom)" (Lunenburg, 2011, p. 1).

The reinforcement theory is the oldest theory of motivation. The theory focuses on environmental factor, stimuli that influence behavior of individuals. There is the concept of positive and negative reinforcement; positive punishment and negative punishment. Positive reinforcement uses the reward system; monetary bonuses, promotion etc. when an employee meets the desire job target. Negative reinforcement is used to enforce what employee will not like when a particular job objective or target has not been met by him or her. Positive and negative punishment aim at decreasing undesired behaviors; they aid in adding or removing stimuli to eliminate a particular behavior or behavior pattern of employees.

Notwithstanding PRP has alongside positive effects, some negative effects and also some uncomfortable consequences.

Firstly individualizing pay may lead to less motivation for employees to work collectively and in collaboration when necessary and the process might be politically hijacked. For example, "focusing on rewarding individuals does not allow enough recognition of the collective and collaborative efforts to address cross departmental challenges and performance rewards could be susceptible to political influence and make public servants too responsive to the government demand. For example in Australia, the concern over excessive responsiveness has led to the recent abolition of performance pay schemes for department secretaries" (Bourgon, 2008, p.6). (ed. Boxall, et al.., 2007, p. 476) cites "there is a danger that countries which have moved from career-based systems for civil servants have encountered negative consequences in terms of a loss of collective responsibility and a unifying culture" (OECD, 2004a, p. 3).

Secondly, the Cognitive Evaluation Theory (CET) a sub-theory of self- determination theory (Ryan, & Deci. 2000, p. 70) challenges the model of the self-interested homo economicus on which PRP is fundamentally based that rewards such as cash compensation will lead to more performance that this may lead to the reverse effect; less performance (Weibel et al.,).

The cash compensation system relies on or reflects the extrinsic aspect of motivation. That certain thing can be devised from the external of the employee such as bonuses to increase and motivate his or her performance on the job. While the CET accepts that fact, it however extends the argument to the importance of the intrinsic motivation system. Employees would not always be extrinsically motivated. Things that threaten or undermines employees' sense of competence, control and freedom research shows, such as "negative performance feedback, threats, pressured evaluation, and imposed goals" (Ryan & Deci, 2000, p. 70) etc. do diminish intrinsic motivation which is equally crucial to work performance.

Another issue that might also challenge the efficacy of extrinsically monetary compensation is associated with the concept of the "Price Effect" (p.12). Employees will be calculative of whether the increment in times of what they would earn extra is worth their increased effort. PRP schemes that are low or do not commensurate to the value and worth of the employees will not work; and as a result PRP schemes should then also be dependent on a sufficient amount of resources to be embarked upon.

However optimists of the PRP system assert that "the fact that the experience with PRP in the public services has not been satisfactory should not lead to the conclusion that there is an inherent impossibility of keeping civil servants accountable for their performance. What perhaps has been the mistake is the somewhat blind importation on to the public service of techniques developed in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century in mass production industrial setting" (Cardona, 2007, p. 4).

#### 2.2.5. Industrial Relations

Industrial relations within the employment industry concerns how issues such as work conditions, pay, employee welfare, as well as the nature of employment is being negotiated. It can be shortly "defined as the relations between employees and management". What industrial relations does in the relationship between employees and the management is that it defines; "supervision, direction, planning and coordination of organizational activities with minimal human effort and function by taking into consideration the safety of employees" (Kumar Das, 2015, p. 3) and organizational success and efficiency.

The industrial relation industry includes agencies or actors such as trade unions, employer organizations and the state. The significance of this practice of industrial relations includes that it "promotes industrial democracy, can contribute to optimum use of scarce resource, promote economic growth and development, enactment of sound labor policies and discourages unfair practices on both the part of management and unions" (Kumar Das, 2015, P. 7).

Within the old public administration and PM era, "traditionally public sector industrial relations were highly pluralistic with a collectivist approach. Trade unions were accepted as having a legitimate role in the employment relationship and a significant role in the decision making process. There was a high level of means of determining pay and conditions with a highly centralized collective bargaining machinery resulting in standardized, regulated terms and conditions" (Oldfield, 2006, p. 2).

For example, "following the 2<sup>nd</sup> world war, Britain has embarked on a period of economic growth fueled by the reconstruction efforts and American aid through policies such as the

Marshall plan. This period saw an incorporation of trade union into policy making circles as part of a tripartite relationship. Trade unionists such as Ernest Bevia had held senior cabinet post during the war and trade unions 'emerged from the 2<sup>nd</sup> world war with considerable prestige" (Kirkland, 2017, p. 56). Events such as the "winter discontent of 1978-79 in England provides good example of pay negotiation by various trade union organizations through strikes. Examples the Winter Discontent includes trade union activities of The Ambulance strike of 1979,

However the events of the "winter discontent" were not only periods or times wherein the trade unions were involved in government policy making, but the importance of these period is that they were central to narratives which blamed the trade unions for wider economic problems" (Kirkland, 2017, p. 54). Generally before the start of the blame on trade unions "there existed during this period a greater acceptance of TU movement and in particular its members. Both Labor and Conservative party were too eager to secure at all costs the largest possible proportion of TU votes" (p.58). "throughout the 1970s, perceptions of the trade unions changed, in part due to the perceived crisis in the British economy" (p.60).

It was only around "the late 1970s (that) saw the emergence of a right-wing meta-narrative which describes the 1970s as a period of economic turmoil and social unrest. This "myth" of the 1970s, generated by the political right, replaced the left-wing narrative of a myth of the 1930s, the key narrative in the legitimization of the post-war settlement and the welfare state. In doing so, this right-wing narrative emphasized the role of the trade unions in generating economic and social problems" (Thomas, 2007).

This New Right "a fraction of the conservative party, which involved Thatcher and her government, sought to continue to blame the trade unions for the economic problems of the 1970s-linking problems of inflation with a narrative of an overly powerful TU movement" (P. 65).

For example, "the emergence of Thatcherism had a dramatic effect on the development and direction of public sector industrial relations and much of this continued under the 'New Labor'. Thatcher was suspicious of trade unions as having in general too much power and 'ruling the country' and that the public sector trade unions were regarded by her as holding

the country to ransom and the real payments distorting the economy, increasing public sector expenditure and denying managerial authority"; Thatcher was elected on a popular anti-union vote" (Oldfield, 2006, p. 3).

As a result, the NPM enfolded in this New Right narrative and ideology; "seeks to decrease the importance and remove similar automatic and collectivist criteria in determining pay increases and promotion in favor of more differentiated, flexible and individualize mechanisms; less principled support for trade unions, in a context of strengthened managerial prerogatives in HR matters" (Bach &Bodogna, 2011, p. 2285). This "emphasis for managerial prerogative has implications for employee voice with the potential to erode trade union influence. A noteworthy example of this approach occurred in the UK when, the conservative government announced in 1984 that; 4,000 at GCHQ (Government Communication Headquarters) could not retain their trade union membership" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 477).

In turn as a result of the above, "in principle, TU membership and a commitment to trade unionism is not compatible to an HRM agenda, which is essentially unitary in approach and anti-union" (Oldfield, 2006, p. 8); "HRM has been (seen as an alternative to trade unions representation and communication with workers" (Svetlik et al., 2007, p. 36).

## 2.2.6. Training and Development

Generally "the objective of training is to ensure that all employees have and maintain the requisite competence to perform at work" (Boxall et al., 2007, p.328). With regards how such trainings are offered, "Organizations may provide training and development internally, externally or in combination to make a competent workforce" (p.325).

Trainings and skill development can take different forms.

"trainings and skills development comprises a broad range of activities and arrangements, including formal and informal training traditional class room courses, cooperation with universities, competence mapping, special introductory training for newly recruited people, mentoring and the use of new technologies in training such as E-learning" (United Nations, 2013, p. 4).

Training and development of employees has to do with the concept of competency. Competence is "the ability to perform work tasks to a certain standard and its opposition is 'not yet competent', implying scope for learning and development to achieve the necessary standards, rather than 'incompetence' which has no such developmental association" (ed. Boxall et al., 2007, p. 333).

The training and development of employees "has emerged as a major educational enterprise over the past 3 decades. In the 1970s, it became more popular and much talked about. In the 1980s greatest use was for management training and skills" (Somasundaram, 2004, pp.850&851). This period is HRM related. Training and development is crucial in with ever-changing environment, innovations and technological advancement. Employees have to keep up with the set of skills and knowledge needed to cater or counter them; investing "in people like any other capital investment is necessary for better returns in the future" (Itika, 2011, p. 14).

From the "traditional personnel management philosophy, training and development of employees was quite often seen as a cost (rather than an investment) that should be avoided" (p.14)

#### **2.2.7.** Institutional setting

The question of institutional setting of the HRM is important because it can enable or deter almost all of the HRM practices in the way it is intended to be. It encompasses the concern with the "size and the relationship of organizations. Within the organizational structure should national governments centralize clusters of activities or decentralize and use related mechanisms like devolution and subsidiarity?" (OECD, 1997, p. 11).

Personnel management within the old public administration system has been centralized and is still centralized within a significant number of governmental or public sector institutions. "The traditional HR approach...controls HR practices through a highly centralized structure". For example "in Denmark HRM reforms has remained largely centralized in the Danish public administration. Pay and terms and conditions for example of employment instead of being negotiated at respective ministries and department levels

in a delegated system, are negotiated between the one central ministry of finance and the trade unions" (Fleming, CPMR Discussion paper 16, p. 37).

Fleming (p.26) cites for example during the 1980s in UK "there was decentralization of HR decision making to departments and agencies culminating in the production of a new civil service code (Cabinet office, 1996) to replace the previous set of personnel policies. These included that certain decisions pertaining to the "amount and grading of posts (excluding senior civil service posts), terms and conditions including remuneration, allowances, expenses, performance and promotions, holidays and hours of work. Also the prescription of the qualification for appointment of home civil services with some exceptions, are delegated to ministers and office holders in respect of their own departments".

It is believed and argued Fleming (CPMR Discussion paper 16, p. 13) cites that "the structure of large bureaucratic organizations in which there is often a 'powerful centralized personnel function', may diminish the capacity of line managers to take on responsibilities for HRM" (Armstrong 1997).

#### **2.2.8. Summary**

Table 1.1 summaries the difference between NPM HRM and Weberian PM practices as they have been highlighted in the section above.

 $\begin{tabular}{ll} Table 1.1^2. Summary of the characteristics of the Old Public Management (Weberian) and New Public Management \\ \end{tabular}$ 

	Old PM	NPM
Recruitment	Career-based	Contractual-based
Performance	Not significant	Significant
Compensation	Non-performance pay based	Performance pay based
Promotion	Non-performance based	Performance based
Training and Development	less important	Important

 $^2$  I created the table to show and summaries from the literature review on the difference between personnel management and HRM for a quick and easy view understanding.

Retirement	Carrier based	Performance-based
Industrial Relations	Union-based	Individual-based
Responsibility/Accountability	Rules	Performance

#### **CHAPTER THREE**

## **HRM** in the Civil Service of the Gambia

# 3.1. Human Resource management reform in the Gambia's public sector through the SAPs

This section highlights the nature and the specific areas of personnel or human resource management reforms implemented in the civil service sector of the Gambia.

## 3.1.1. Civil service and personnel problems in the 1980s

The Gambia is one of the smallest countries in Africa with a population of 1.9 million people (Sanyang&Camara, 2017). The country borders with the Republic of Senegal on its northern, southern and eastern side, while in the West, it has a 48-kilometer-long opening onto the Atlantic Ocean (Sanyang&Camara, 2017). After independence from Britain in 1965, The Gambia has three regimes from 1965 to 1994, from 1994 to 2016 and from 2016 to now. Economic growth in the country is driven by "mainly the agricultural sector (22.5% of GDP in 2016) and the tertiary sector (66% of GDP), including tourism (30.3% of GDP)" (Nshimyumuremyi, 2018, p. 2). The agricultural sector constitutes the biggest employer in the country while the tourism sector is the biggest earner of foreign exchange (p.2).

The Gambia got according to the "report and recommendation of the president of the international association to the executive director on a proposed development credit of SDR of (US\$5.0 million and 11.5 million) for a structural adjustment program, August 4, 1986).

The civil service of the country like that of New Zealand and Britain grew extensively. The civil servants doubled in numbers between the years 1975 and 1983. In order to reduce the civil service wage bill, employment reforms took the forms of two retrenchment programs where some civil servants were permanently exited from the service. Filling of vacancies at the time was frozen and a salary increment was undertaken in order to attract and or retain the skillful of the employees (Das, 1998).

#### 3.2. HRM: The Case of the Gambia

The Gambia's "legislative framework for human resource management in the public service is captured in the 1997 Constitution and the Public Service Act 1991, the Public Service Commission Regulations 1994, General Orders 1994 and the Code of Conduct of The Public Service Commission provides the detailed regulations for civil service management" (World Bank, 2003, p. 22). This section highlights the HRM practices of the public sector of The Gambia as they have been stipulated in the official civil service and HRM related government documents. And will provide the answer to the research question whether the HRM system in the public sector of The Gambia is NPM or Weberian.

## **3.2.1. Findings**

## Recruitment System

When a person gets employed to a 'pensionable post' he or she is being held "on a year probation on which his or her promotion decision is based. After successfully and satisfactorily completed the probation year as confirmed or certified by the head of department, confirmation in his or her new appointment shall be automatic, subject to physical fitness" (Public Service Commission Regulations, 2013, p. 20).

There is the 'Permanent Civil Servant' status in terms of employment contracts and duration of work from first entrance into the civil service employment system.

## Performance Management

Employees who go to work late for ten minutes onwards "should be reported to the permanent secretary for appropriate disciplinary action. Thus this requires that permanent secretaries and heads of departments to have Attendance Registers" (Public Service Commission Regulations, 2013, p. 35).

In the quest for the performance of the civil servants, "if, as a permanent civil servant, an officer had attained the age of 50 years and his or her work performance was considered unsatisfactory or below standard, the head of department or permanent secretary could

submit a case to the personnel management office for his or her compulsory retirement" (The Code of Conduct for the Civil Service, 2013, p. 13).

"after confirmation of appointment, the officer's performance and conduct shall be annually evaluated through the regulation completion of an appropriate performance appraisal instrument which shall be submitted by the head of department or permanent secretary to the personnel management office for appropriate action" (The General Orders for the Public Service of The Gambia, 2013, p. 9).

However these disciplinary measures mentioned above are seldom applied "due to reluctance by managers to instigate them" (World Bank, 2003, p. 24).

## **Promotion**

Promotion as stipulated in the Public Service Commission Regulations document (2013) is defined as "the conferment upon a person in the public service of a public office to which is attached a higher salary or a higher salary scale than that attached to the public office to which he or she was last substantively appointed" (p. 3).

The criteria most essentially taken for the promotion decision of the public service employees is seniority. Evidence of this is that in a case where the Head of department has selected an employee for a promotion opportunity who happens not to be the most senior personnel within the department should provide reasons as to why. In that case "detailed reasons shall be given of such person in that same department over whom it is proposed that the person recommended should be promoted" (Public Service Commission Regulation, 2013, p. 13). Merit and ability are also stated to be taken account of in the promotion decision making.

#### **Industrial Relations**

Industrial relation in The Gambia is union-based. Unions however have not been active during the past 22 years in negotiating pay and work condition. This has however changed with the change of regime in December, 2016.

Teachers in the entire regions of the Gambia have on 5<sup>th</sup> February, 2018 on a sit-down-strike for demands including "increment in salary, full payment of double shift allowance, for teacher trainees to benefit from hardship allowance, to put an end to late pay of allowance and issuing identity cards to teachers like other government institutions" (http://foroyaa.gm/teachers-on-sit-down-strike/)

## **Training And Development**

Training of the civil servants is conducted by the nation's Management Development Institute (MDI) (The Code of Conduct for the Civil Service, 2013, p. 3).

Training and development opportunities are also available through scholarship awards; scholarship or training awards may be granted to enable an officer to obtain a professional, technical or academic qualification other than university degrees, diploma or equivalent qualifications. The courses for these scholarship and training awards are based on the approval of the Personnel Management Office and the Office of the President. (The General Orders for the Public Service of The Gambia, 2013, p. 32).

"Training accountancy and audit staff is the responsibility of the AG and Auditor General respectively. However, the PMO hold the training budget for all staff training, centrally.

## **Institutional Setting**

The institutional arrangement for the HRM issues is centralized. The Public Service Commission has the mandate and authority to preside over "all matters" comprising the appointment, promotion approval of training opportunities, confirmation of appointment, transfer of employees and the issuance of disciplinary action (Public Service Commission Regulations, 2013, p. 8). The head of department of ministerial agencies 'may' attend while the commission decides on the above issues in cases that the decision is not about him or her, but the head of department has no right to "on any such matter".

Certain powers concerning; "appointment, confirmation of appointment and promotion to and within the services are being conferred on the head of department for instance the Fire and Rescue Service agency, with respect to officers from category v-I<sup>3</sup> and in respect of persons temporarily employed and those on a month to month appointment" (Public Service Commission Regulations, 2013, p. 16). For all other ministries in terms of such delegated authority, "all appointments from Grade one (1) to two (2) shall be delegated by the Public Service Commission to Heads of Departments, Ministries and Agencies subject to adherence to prescribed criteria stipulated in the specified rule books. To further show this subtle case of delegation is that appointment, promotion and disciplinary measures are being delegated to the permanent secretary of the ministry of Basic and Secondary Education over teachers from grades 6 to 8" (The General Orders for the Public Service of The Gambia, 2013, pp.7&9). However this power and authority bestowed on the head of department can in certain situations be ceased. For example;

"Whenever in these regulations any power, function or duty is imposed or conferred upon any head of department, that power, function or duty may at any time be exercised by the head of the public service, or by the permanent secretary on his or her on his or her instructions or on his or her behalf, and in such a case the head of department, on being informed that the head of the public service, or the permanent secretary, as the case may be, is to exercise that power, function or duty in respect of any particular matter, shall not himself or herself exercise, or shall cease to exercise, as the case may be, that power, function or duty in respect of that particular matter and any such case shall forthwith be reported to the commission" (Public Service Commission Regulations, 2013, p/ 33). "The Public Service Commission (PSC) is established under section 172 of the constitution" (The General Orders for the Public Service of The Gambia, 2013, p. 4).

# 3.2.2. Analysis: is the HRM practice in the public sector of The Gambia Weberian or NPM?

Table three summaries in a brief manner from the findings section thereby establishing the answer to the research question whether the human resource management practices are NPM or Weberian. Overwhelmingly almost all of the practices are of the Weberian personnel management administration system.

<sup>3</sup>Salary grades 1 to 11 and above (The General Orders for the Public Service of The Gambia, 2013, p. 6)

-

Tenure of office after recruitment is for life until in the case of senior officials of the age of 50, forceful retirement is possible. The availability of performance appraisal instruments are mentioned in the official documents but as this is only done at a year interval and the fact that the head of the respective department cannot take action, the efficiency of it is very doubtful. There is not mention of pay based on performance even for the senior officials. That makes the evidence that officials follow more of rules than show outputs of work. Training and development has not been included in the table because this study could not establish whether it is significant or not but the fact that the centralized personnel office has to approve who goes for training could be problematic.

Table 1.2. from table 1.1, summary of the human resource management of the Gambia under the old public or Weberian personnel management system.

	Old PM
Recruitment	Career-based
Performance	Not significant
Compensation	Non-performance pay based
Promotion	Non-performance based
Industrial Relations	Union-based
Responsibility/Accountability	Rules

## 3.2.3. Conclusion

This study has explored the human resource management practices in the Gambian public sector guided by the research question whether the practices are in-line with the New Public Management Human Resource Management or the Weberian Personnel management system. It had the expectation that there was a high probability that the practices will be leading towards the Weberian personnel management system because of some already existing evidence pointing to it in the most recent 2017 National Development Plan of the government of the country as it points out some of the deficiencies still present in the sector.

The study then explored the difference between the New Public Management human

resource management system and the Weberian personnel administration. In order to establish and answer the research question, which one of them the HRM practices of the public sector of the Gambia, is in-line with, the study outlines the practices according to the official documents of the government.

The official documents show as of the moment the HRM practices are of the Weberian personnel management orientation. Recruitment into the job positions is accompanied with almost a lifetime work guarantee. The personnel or civil servants ascend through the employment ladder in times of promotion with little regard to their performance in the previous position. Compensation and or pay is attach to job position rather than performance at it.

There has been recent realization on the side of the government that such situation needs to be tackled towards efficient performance and accountability. However that as this study finds out could only be possible if lack of political will and commitment and the allocation of resources to the sector are not being repeated on their side as the previous government. This study in conclusion has laid the foundational for perhaps more rigorous and critical research as to the efficacy of such reform strategies in the context of the Gambia. And

what should be done to get reform programs right and effective in the future.



#### REFERENCES

- Aidan R. V & David L.W. (1999). "Inefficiency in Public Organizations". International public management journal 2(1): 1-24. Elsevier Science Inc.
- Amutan, K. (2014). "A Review of B.F Skinner's Reinforcement Theory of Motivation".
- Andrews, R. et al., (2013). "Public Sector Reform in the UK: Views and Experience from Senior Executives". Coordination for Cohesion in the Public Sector of the Future (COCOPS): www.cocops.eu
- Ayee, J. (2008). "Reforming the African Public Sector: Retrospect and Prospects". Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa, Dakar, Senegal
- Bach, S. &Bordogna, L. (2011). "Varieties of New Public Management or Alternative Models? The Reform of Public Service Employment Relations in Industrialized Democracies". The International Journal of Human Resource Management, Vol. 22, No. 11, 2281–2294; Routledge Taylor and Francis Group
- Badie, B. et al., (eds) (2011). "International Encyclopaedia of Political Science". SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Battaglio, P. & Condney, S. (2009). "Reforming Public Management: Analysing the Impact of Public Service Reform on Organizational and Managerial Trust". Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, Inc. Oxford University Press
- Behn.R. (2003). "Why Measure Performance? Different Purposes Require Different Measures".
- Bourgon, J. (2008). "The Public Service of 2025-Themes, Challenges and Trends: Human Resource Management Trends in OECD countries".
- Boxall, P. et al., (2007). "The Oxford Handwork of Human Resource Management". Oxford University Press, New York
- Buchanan, J.M. (2003). "Public Choice: Politics without Romance".
- Cardona, F. (2007). "Performance-Related-Pay in the Public Service in OECD and EU Member States". SIGMA; Support for Improvement in Governance and Management
- Christoper, H. (1991). "A Public Management for all Seasons?" Public Administration Vol. 69.Royal Institute of Public Administration ISSN 0033-3298 \$3.00
- Dart, R. (2004)." BeingBuisness-like in a Nonprofit Organization: A Grounded and Inductive Typology". Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly, vol. 33, no. 2, 290-310
- David G. M (1999). "The New Public Management and its Critics". International Public Management Journal, 2(1):90-111. Elsevier Science Inc.
- Eamonn, B. (2012). "Public Choice A Primer". The institution of Economic Affairs.

- Emile K. et al., (2007). "The Ethics of New Public Management: Is Integrity at Stake?" Public Administration Quarterly.
- Engida, T. & Bardill, J. (2013). "Reforms of the Public Sector in the Light of the New Public Management: A cases of Sub-Saharan Africa". Journal of public administration and policy research Vol 5(1) pp.1-7
- Fakhrul, I. (2015). "New Public Management (NPM): A Dominating Paradigm in Public Sectors". African journal of political science and international relations, vol. 9(4),pp.141-151.
- Ferlie, E. (2016). "The New Public Management and Public Management Studies". Oxford University Press
- Gailmard, S. (2012). "Accountability and Principal-Agent Models". Oxford University Press
- George A. L. (1999). "The New Public Management Approach and Crisis States". UNRISD Discussion Paper NO.112
- Gernod, G. (2001). "Origin and Theoretical Basis of New Public Management". G. Greuning/international public management journal 4. 1-25.
- Hill, P. J. (1999). "Public Choice: A Review". Faith and Economics-Number 34-pages 1-10
- Isaiah, S. (2012). "Human Resource Management and Organization Achievement".
- Islam, F. (2015). "New Public Management: A Dominating Paradigm in Public Sector". African Journal for Political science and international relations; Vol 9(4)pp. 141-151
- Itika, J. S. (2011). "Fundamentals of human resource management Emerging experiences from Africa". African Public Administration and Management series, vol. 2, African Studies Centre P.O. Box 9555 2300 RB Leiden
- Jain, A. (2004). "Using the Lens of Max Weber's Theory of Bureaucracy to Examine E-Government Research". Proceedings of the 37<sup>th</sup> Hawaii international conference on system science
- James, M.B. (2003). "What is Public Choice Theory?"
- Janita, S. (2015). "Agencification as a Strategy for Implementing Public Policy in Trinidad and Tobago".
- Jannatul, F. (2016). "Organization Theories: From the Classical Perspective". International journal of business, economics and law, vol.9, issue 2.
- Jannatul, F. (2016). "The Journey of New Public Management: An Analysis". International journal of business, economics and law, vol.11, issue 2.
- Jussi, K. (2007). "Agency Theory as a Framework for the Government-University Relationship". Tampere University Press and the author: Finland.

- Kempe, R.H. (2001). "The New Public Management: Context and Practice in Africa". International public management journal4, 119-134
- Kirkland, C. (2017). "The Trade Union Crisis of 1976-1979". SPERI Research & Policy, DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-59238-1\_2
- Kuperous, H. & Rode, A. (2010). "Latest Trends in Top Public Management in the EU". EIPA Scope
- Larbie, (1999). "Overview of Public Sector Management Reform". United Nations Research Institute for Social development, Discussion paper 112, updated 2003.
- Leslie, A.P. (2009). "The OECD and Global Public Management Reform".
- Lunenburg, F. (2011). "Expectancy Theory of Motivation: Motivating by Altering Expectations".international journal of management, business, and administration volume 15, number 1, 2011
- Lunenburg, F. (2011). "Goal-Setting Theory of Motivation". International journal of management, business, and administration volume 15, number 1.
- Maravelais, C. (2003). "Post-Bureaucracy-Control through Professional Freedom".
- Michael, K. (2001). "Public Management Reforms and Economics and Social Development". OECD.
- Mohs, R. (1988).Structural Adjustment Programs in Sub-Saharan Africa".North-South Relations, Bonn.
- OECD Headquaters (2004). "Trends in Human Resource Management Policies in OECD Countries". Paris
- OECD, (1997). "In Search of Results- Performance Management Practices" PUMA; ISBN 92-64-15574-0
- Ohllot, P. & Runderman, M. (1994). "The Realities of Management Promotions". Centre for creative leadership, North Carolina
- Oldfield, C. (2006). "Blurring the Divided: The Changing Nature of Public Sector Employment and Industrial Relations". EGPA conference Milan 6<sup>th</sup> -9<sup>th</sup> September 2006
- Page, E. (2003). "Farewell to the Weberian State? Classical Theory and Modern Bureaucracy". ZSE 4/2003
- Perry, J. et al., (-). "Back to the Future? Performance-Related-Pay, Empirical Research and the Perils of Persistence". Indiana University Bloomington
- Polidano, C. (1999). "The New Public Management in Developing Countries". IDPM Public Policy and Management Working Paper no. 13: Manchester, UK

- Politt, C. et al., (2007). "New Public Management in Europe". Published: October 2007 in Management Online Review, www.morexpertise.com
- Promberger, K. &Rauskala, I. (2003). "New Public Management- An Introduction from the UK Perspective". A 6020 Innsbruck, Austria
- Public Service Regulation Commission, (2013). Personnel Management Office, Banjul
- Pulakos, E. (2004). "Performance Management- A Roadmap for Developing, Implementing and Evaluating Performance Management Systems". SHRM Foundation, United States
- Robert, D.B. (1998). "The New Public Management Paradigm and the Search for Democratic Accountability". JAI Press Inc. International Public Management Journal, 1(2): 131-164.
- Ryan, R. & Deci, E. (2000). "Self- Determination Theory and the Facilitation of Intrinsic Motivation, Social Development and Wellbeing". The American Psychological Association, Vol. 55, No. 1, 68-78
- Sakalas, A. & Vienazindene, M. (2010). "New Public Management and the Conceptual Upheaval of Human Resource Management". Laisves av. 55, Lt- 44309, Kaunas, Lithuania
- The Code of Conduct for the Civil Service of the Gambia, (2013). Personnel Management Office, Banjul
- The General Orders of the Republic of the Gambia, (2013). Personnel Management Office, Banjul.
- UNDP (2015). "From Old Public Administration to New Public Service; implications for public sector reform in developing countries". UNDP Global Centre for Public Service Excellence #08-01, Block A, 29 Heng Mui Keng Terrace, 119620 Singapore
- Weibel, A. et al., (2009). "Pay for Performance in the Public Sector-Benefits and Hidden costs". Journal of public administration; Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory Advance Access

## **CURRICULUM VITAE**

#### **Personal Information**

Surname, Name : JAWNEH Aja

Nationality : Gambian

Date and Place of Birth : 01/01/1991 Banjul

Marital status : Married

Phone number : 05522579506

E-mail : ajawneh2@gmail.com

#### **Education**

Degree School/ Program Graduation Date

M.Sc. Ankara Haci Bayram Veli 2019

University/International Advanced Executive

B.A.

## **Professional Experience**

Year Place of Work Position

Foreign Language: English, Turkish, Deutsch

**Publications -**

Hobbies Watching News and Television, taking a walk, reading and exercise

.



