CONTEMPORARY EDUCATIONAL VALUES OF TEACHERS' ACADEMY
FOUNDATION AND THEIR TRANSMISSION TO TEACHING PRACTICES IN
TURKEY

MEHMET ÇAĞATAY BABACAN

BOĞAZİÇİ UNIVERSITY

2014

CONTEMPORARY EDUCATIONAL VALUES OF TEACHERS' ACADEMY

FOUNDATION AND THEIR TRANSMISSION TO TEACHING PRACTICES IN

TURKEY

Thesis submitted to the

Institute for Graduate Studies in the Social Sciences

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Educational Sciences

by

Mehmet Çağatay Babacan

Boğaziçi University

2014

Contemporary Educational Values of Teachers' Academy Foundation and Their Transmission
to Teaching Practices in Turkey

The thesis of Mehmet Çağatay Babacan

has been approved by:

Assoc. Prof. Fatma Nevra Seggie   ....

(Thesis Supervisor)

Prof. Yasemin Bayyurt   ....

Assoc. Prof. Özlem Ünlühisarcıklı   ....

August 2014

ABSTRACT

Mehmet Çağatay Babacan, "Contemporary Educational Values of Teachers' Academy Foundation and Their Transmission to Teaching Practices in Turkey"

This study concentrates on the definition, importance and purposes of education and aims to determine the values standing out within the scope of education concept. Concept of learning which mostly takes place within discussions of education is also mentioned and then the discussion moves to adult education and adult learning.

Different models of adult learning are mentioned in the study and then the discussion moves to a study of new values in education. In this regard, new perspectives within the scope of the concepts of teaching and learning are emphasized and an analysis of the new values is made. The importance of the leadership the school administrators will execute at schools and teachers will make in the classrooms is emphasized as an integral part of those new values. The qualities that the new generation of administrators and teachers are expected to have are also mentioned in this context.

Definitions of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and the functions of NGOs are analyzed in the study and examples from the NGOs in the field of education are given. After mentioning the leading values in this field, what kind of contributions the NGOs can provide in the implementation of those new values are discussed.

Teachers' Academy Foundation (TAF) is studied in methodology chapter and the data obtained from the interviews with three groups of participants are analyzed through the method of content analysis. The information about TAF activities, design of the programs and the trainers is involved in the study.

In the interviews I have tried to obtain information about TAF activities and to determine the values standing out in those activities within the scope of two research questions.

In the findings of the study, the values standing out from participants' answers and the comparisons among different groups of participants take place.

TEZ ÖZETİ

Mehmet Çağatay Babacan, "Öğretmen Akademisi Vakfı'nın Çağdaş Eğitim Değerleri ve Türkiye'deki Öğretme Uygulamalarına Aktarımı"

Bu çalışma eğitimin tanımı, önemi, amaçları üzerine durmakta ve eğitim kavramı kapsamında öne çıkan değerleri tespit etmeyi hedeflemektedir. Bu çerçevede eğitim tartışmaları içinde mutlaka yer alan öğrenme kavramına da değinilmekte buradan yetişkin eğitimi ve yetişkin öğrenmesi tartışmalarına geçilmektedir.

İlerleyen bölümlerde farklı yetişkin öğrenme modellerine değinilmekte ve bunu takiben eğitimde yeni değerler incelemesine geçilmektedir. Bu çerçevede öğrenme ve öğretme kavramları kapsamında yeni bakış açıları vurgulanmakta ve yeni değerlerin incelemesi yapılmaktadır. Yeni değerlerin ayrılmaz bir parçası olarak, okul yöneticilerinin okullarda ve öğretmenlerin sınıflarında gerçekleştirecekleri liderliğin sözkonusu yeni değerlerin uygulamaya geçirilmesinde taşıdığı önem vurgulanmaktadır. Yine aynı çerçevede, yeni nesil idareci ve öğretmenlerin sahip olmaları beklenen niteliklere de değinilmektedir.

Çalışmada sivil toplum örgütü tanımları ve bu örgütlerin fonksiyonları incelenmekte ve eğitim alanında faaliyet gösteren sivil toplum örgütlerinden örnekler verilmektedir. Bu alanda öne çıkan değerlere değinildikten sonra eğitim alanında bahsedilen yeni değerlerin uygulamaya geçirilmesinde sivil toplum örgütlerinin ne gibi katkıları olabileceği tartışılmaktadır.

Metodoloji bölümünde vaka olarak Öğretmen Akademisi Vakfı (ÖRAV) incelenmiş ve bu çerçevede 3 grup katılımcıyla yapılan görüşmelerde elde edilen veriler içerik analizi yöntemiyle analiz edilmiştir.

Çalışma içinde ÖRAV faaliyetleri ve programların dizaynı ve görev yapan eğitmenler hakkında bilgiler yer almaktadır.

Yapılan görüşmelerde iki araştırma sorusu çerçevesinde ÖRAV faaliyetleri hakkında bilgi edinilmeye ve bu faaliyetler içinde öne çıkan değerler tespit edilmeye çalışılmıştır.

Çalışma bulgularında katılımcıların cevapları çerçevesinde öne çıkan değerler ve gruplar arasında karşılaştırmalar yer almaktadır.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my father, Mustafa Galip Babacan

CONTENTS

TABLES

ABBREVIATIONS

TAF   : Teachers' Academy Foundation

MoE   : Ministry of Education

EADP : Educational Administrator Development Program

CHAPTER I

1. INTRODUCTION

Education is a very complex concept including many ideas about various walks of life, people at different age groups, philosophy, discussions, and arguments all claiming to offer the best solutions. All these discussions, thoughts have continued to exist for thousands of years starting probably from ancient times, even before Christ and continue throughout the history (Platon, 2010, Cicero, 2013, More, 2011, Nizamü'l-Mülk, 2011, Montaigne, 2010, Rousseau, 2011).

Those ideas, practices which may be considered as the first steps of education in those times were very different from each other in terms of location, content and styles of application. In that sense, it can be stated that education is a general name for all those ideas and practices. Either, we cannot argue that education always has to be formal. During all those years, thinkers, philosophers produced many ideas, offered new solutions, wrote books on human behavior, meaning of life, and what must be done for a better life and so on. What have been said so far do not have to be strictly about education by formally pronouncing its name.

What is education then? Maybe before education, schooling and teaching should be discussed. Teaching is conveying of information from one person to another, from one who knows to another who does not know (Sanver, 2013, pp.103-112). This transmission is a one-sided activity. And if this kind of knowledge is somehow institutionalized, if it has been transformed into a doctrine, then that one-sided

transmission may lead to dogmas, memorization, and consequently will encourage not thinking, not questioning and accepting without doubt.

Here we should also discuss another concept, scientific knowledge. Scientific knowledge is the rational and empirical knowledge that binds upon reasoning and experiment. Those two qualities provide verifiability and objectivity of the scientific knowledge, that is, its independence from all other factors except the object that one tries to know.

Education is a two-sided activity, one side being the trainer and other side the trainee. Education, being different from teaching, is the demonstration of the path of knowledge to the "trainees" by the one who has gone through that path before (Sanver, 2013, pp.103-112). This is a two-step process. First step is the demonstration of the path which includes participation of the two sides. In the second step, only the trainee is included and it is the phase where there is thinking on what is demonstrated and internalization resting upon all these.

Consequently, the main goal of education is not the teaching of certain existing information, as contrary to many people's suppositions. Learning is a natural output at the end of any education process but the real goal of education is to jazz up intellect and consciousness, to teach thinking and to start an inquiry process as a result. If an education institution cannot provide all these due to any kind of reason, this means it cannot reach its goal in reality, even if it transmits certain knowledge and teaches how certain duties are performed. It cannot reach its goal because everybody learns something. One learns himself/herself, learns at home, at work, and so on. Animals can also learn. Life, in fact, is being a student. Education does not

only include getting information but it is a mental formation that teaches how to evaluate what has been learnt.

When education is being discussed, one should also mention about learning. It is not easy to find a universal definition of learning that is agreed upon by everyone. The subjects like what learning is and how we learn have long been contentious. Our knowledge about learning has been systemized mostly by theoreticians from field of psychology (Tusting and Barton, 2011, pp.15-39) and that knowledge has been developed mostly in the context of children's learning in formal education system. Learning in general social perception also associates with "school and studying practices." School-related connotations regarding learning depend on the implicit assumption that learning can only exist during the period of school days/childhood. Within the frame of that assumption, it cannot even be thought that the concept of "adult" can stand together with the concept of learning and education (Resnic, 1987, pp.13-20).

Studies that have been carried out in the field of adult education have a special position in the process of passing the limited horizon that is mentioned; because those studies provide contribution to handle the subject of learning in a wider frame with the emphases that learning is a lifelong process, and learner, goals of the learner, social context and practices are important elements not to be neglected.

Most of our behaviours, ideas and beliefs have been learnt and those learnings have taken place during our experiences out of formal education in our lives. When we take learning as a lifelong process out of school, adult learning theories and approaches come out. It is necessary to note that literature on adult education is relatively limited as compared to wide accumulation of knowledge on child learning

and development. Most of the literature on adult education has been formed on questioning whether adult education has specific qualities that have to be distinguished from the disciplines that study learning at schools.

When we talk about schooling, although it seems we are basically talking about teaching and learning, there are also many important values expected to be transfered. Those contemporary values are at the core of all the processes within the context of education. Today, what schools are expected to do is to raise young people who are creative, energetic, and who can think globally and move locally. Schools have to educate young people who have recognized the dynamics of change and who can easily adapt to changing conditions and can even undertake the leadership of that change.

Nowadays, education is expected to teach how to learn (Tusting and Barton, 2011, pp.56-74) rather than just transmit the existent knowledge, make the learners able to understand, interpret and apply basic concepts, earn problem solving skills and acquire the habit of scientific thinking. But here it should also be stated that scientific knowledge is not absolute. What seemed true yesterday may not be true today and what is known as true today may be discovered not be true tomorrow. It doesn't have much meaning to teach scientific knowledge as unchanging universal laws.

Since knowledge changes very fast in modern times, regardless of how much information one has accumulated, it becomes insufficient or invalid in 3-5 years. That is why, schools have to educate individuals who have learnt how to learn and think. It must be understood that knowledge is acquired in order to produce new knowledge.

Next, it must be stated that in contemporary education, authority flow at schools has to become less hierarchical. Also, leadership has become to be associated with being successful at what is being done rather than using position power. Over control in school management has replaced with giving more authority and responsibility to teachers and other personnel. This approach leads to a new structure and model that highlights human component and emphasizes collaboration.

It has become an indispensable factor of quality in education that the teacher is the leader in the classroom rather than being a clerk responsible from following the curriculum, and the manager is the facilitator rather than just being the executor of legislation.

1.1. Statement of the Problem

Considering the fact that we are formulating the future of country by our decisions on educational policies, the importance of the subject is better understood. By making decisions today, we are changing and establishing our future because the children of today are the adults of the future. That is why, we have to educate young students in the best way we can. They must get the most contemporary values in the world today regardless of the political identities of the governments. Those nations who have managed to establish that structure at schools today will be the leaders of the future world.

It is often claimed that schools mostly transfer knowledge to students but they do not cultivate their skills. Then it is suggested that teaching techniques should be

devised in such a way to teach how to learn rather than just make transfer of knowledge, to enable to understand, interpret and apply basic concepts and to give problem solving skills and scientific thinking.

Education develops and changes its nature in line with changing times, nations and values. In that fast changing environment, state schools may not be able to deliver most contemporary values and may focus on more traditional values probably due to large number of students. In fact although it's the schools that must function as the driving force of modernism, due to financial and physical limitations, they might even become obstacles in the accomplishment of that aim.

Education is a continuous process, it starts with teachers (Knowles, Holton and Swanson, 2005, pp.73-113), then moves to students, but it has also a cyclical nature, and teachers must continually update themselves in order to be able to stay up-to-date. Today, accumulation of information is very fast. What a person knows today becomes insufficient or out of fashion in 3-5 years. That is why, the most important duty of schools is to educate individuals who have learnt how to learn and think independently.

It should also be stated here that the purpose of education is not to classify or eliminate students but to give them the opportunity to be the best of what they can potentially be (Sanver, 2013, pp.102-103). This is an obligation rather than a need. Basic human rights also make it necessary to provide education to everybody in line with their abilities and interests.

Being able to stay up-to-date and get the best of one's potential are among the contemporary values we have been mentioning. Teachers have a very important role for that aim. Since teachers are the leaders in their classrooms, they become role

models for most of the students and students get many values from their teachers. This statement shows how important teacher education is.

Teachers and school administrators are the accumulators of that value transmission process (Sunnari and Rasanen, 2000), that is, they already have to adapt and internalize those values themselves so that they can share them with the students and learners. Sometimes formal teacher education may not be sufficient for that aim. In that case, NGOs come into play and they transmit those modern and contemporary values to teachers by means of various activities and by providing the atmosphere where there is interactive learning. The ultimate aim in those efforts is to load teachers with those values so as to make them transfer their knowledge to their students.

The strongest man is the one who has learnt how to learn. If an education system has managed to do that, it is the most efficient one.

1.2. Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this qualitative study is to describe the contemporary values in education and explore the ways how NGOs contribute to the transmission of those values. In my study I focus on Teachers' Academy Foundation (TAF) (Turkish abbreviation ÖRAV), as a good and representative example. TAF is an NGO with the financial support of Garanti Bank. It basically makes seminars to teachers at state primary schools in order to equip them with modern teaching techniques and be the educational leaders in classroom. Additionally, TAF also makes Educational

Administrator Development Program (EADP) seminars to state school principals in order to improve them in terms of educational administration. In this study I try to understand the philosophy, principles and practices in TAF courses and the values they concentrate on.

1.3. Research Questions

- What are the contemporary values in education?
- How can an NGO contribute to the transmission of those values?

1.4. Significance of the Study

Today, values that are considered contemporary are the ones which eventually make a person an individual, able to stand alone, that is, able to think, learn, decide, work, and live independently (Özden, 2010, pp.55-65). Significance of the study comes from the viewpoint which basically concentrates on learning how to learn (Knowles, Holton and Swanson, 2005, pp.18-34) in line with that basic philosophy rather than on dealing with routine bureaucratic applications. It is the sine qua non of that philosophy again to bring out the intellect and consciousness, teach thinking and start an inquiry process rather than just teaching the existing information. This new approach aims to get the best of what an individual can be. It also emphasizes the right of free choice of every individual after equipping him/her with all possible

means to make his/her decision. This is an aim hard to reach, but one that is worth struggling; although if you cannot reach, you get closer.

To be able to reach that aim, one tool may be NGOs. Their being relatively independent, financially and intellectually, enable NGOs produce new ideas and then formulate them in line with contemporary values required in modern times. In addition to that, NGOs also contribute to expansion of those values into society in various ways.

NGOs (Narasaiah, 2007, pp.12-32) may help policy makers on the grounds that they put light on the mission, vision, the way the values are given in those programs, what the students get from those programs and how new educational reform models should be designed.

From the experiences of NGOs, other NGOs perceive those examples as cases to be studied and use to produce their own findings. While making studies, they interact among themselves. From that interaction, a synergy may exist to create bigger and better results. Following that, other institutions out of education may also be inspired to give support to education.

Consequently, educators may benefit from these values, reshape their courses and use those principles while developing the curriculum at schools. It is clear that the students will be the ultimate beneficiaries at the end of all those efforts. If the students can internalize those modern and contemporary values, then the society as a whole will be affected positively.

In this study TAF Foundation takes an important part with its operations. It shows modern education techniques and values to teachers and leadership examples to principals in almost every school in Turkey without any payment. In this way it

helps modern concepts and principles outspread in Turkey and help those personnel become close friends and share their knowledge and experiences with each other. These are representative examples of contemporary values in modern education. Garanti Bank, on the other hand, makes an example of modern financial institution that shares what it gets from the society with the members of that society again.

CHAPTER II

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

In this part, we will be going through the literature on education, training, learning, adult education and various models in this field.

2.1. Education and Social Change

Education is the process of making desired changes deliberately in the behavior of an individual through his life (Eskicumalı, 2003). It is an inevitable phenomenon that those changes that take place in the behaviour of individuals will affect the society as a whole (Ertürk, 1975, p.12). Recently, this is one of the reasons why many scientists from various fields, politicians and managers believe that societies will go through a process of change via education.

Everything is changing in modern times. One thing that is not changing is the reality of change itself (Ozankaya, 1977, p.26). Innovations follow change. Innovation is a definite change that is planned beforehand, it is not something accidental, it is a desired and planned activity (Bursalıoğlu, 1975, p.1). Innovation is a planned change.

In this way, it is seen that concepts such as change and innovation are synonyms with the concept of development, politicians like to use in some way. Progress is economic development and change (Thant, 1962). Today, making societies with limited facilities and human resources move towards contemporary civilization level from a sphere of underdevelopment can only be done by planned changes. However, no development plan will be successful unless the staff who will design those plans and the managers who will transform those plans into work are not brought up. Education stands at the heart of innovation (Kaya, 1984).

Education has begun to be considered as the most profitable investment with the understanding of its importance in development in 1960s. Following that, adult education, pre-job and on-the job training have become fields that expansive studies have been carried on (Aytür, 1970, p.191).

The relationship between education and democracy shows that the societies developed in terms of education can perpetuate liberal democracy vigorously and coercive governments and military interventions are in force in underdeveloped societies in terms of education. Education, in fact, evokes consciousness for democratic living in a free society, emancipates it and secures that the society participates democratic living effectively (Voleman, 1966).

Education has two characteristics. First, education socializes individuals in order to make them accommodate to the norms, values and bodies of the society. This is natural in many ways. Because the schools as institutions of the state transmit the dominant culture to new generations. Normally, nobody expects the schools to stand against the social values and institutions of the society.

Moreover, cultural reproduction is a good thing if the existing culture and institutions are democratic, open to change and development. In fact, there is no other way to ensure the continuance of the society apart from cultural transfer and re-production.

Second, education has the capacity of vaccination of a spirit to study and question the long-accepted truths. In other words, education has the capacity to carry the human brain from the obsessions of today and the past. Education has also the potential to make people question the dominant values and the norms in the society and the power to stand against the social limitations, and produce solutions out of the existing system. Modern education system can provide opportunities for freedom and an interrogation process that will lead to being strong even with a limited autonomy and independence. That is why, education system has both conservative and liberal sides.

If the meaning of social change is the basic structural changes in the society, that result can be inferred from the discussion above: Socio-economic and political factors, but not the education, play the primary role in the social change process. Socioeconomic and political factors are the real actors of social change. Education, without any doubt, is a necessary and very important factor in social change process.

As Dewey said (1937), education is an important institution that evokes social change, accelerates and concludes it by disseminating the necessary knowledge, skills and values for the changing socioeconomic and political conditions. For instance, in a period when changes take place rapidly and radical structural changes happen (like a post-revolution period); education builds the structures in harmony with the new social structure and new thoughts by changing the old cultural and

ideological structure and ideas. For example, in Turkey, traditional educational system has replaced its place with modern secular education system after radical socio-economic and political structural changes, and the new education system has supported the new changes and made efforts to reinforce them. Education studies, analyses, and suggests an alternative to the existing system by playing its liberal role even when there are not any revolutionary changes in the society.

There are different ideas regarding the contribution that education provides to society. There are some examples below that can help us understand what is being spoken in educational circles.

In Egitim-Sen Trade Union meeting in November 2006, their leader Ahmet Gündoğdu said;

"Education causes a direct increase in the earnings and efficiency. More production can be made with the educated and qualified work power. That work power can use science and technology as leverage. Since welfare of nations depend on what value their citizens add to global economy with their knowledge and skills, all countries have to make the investments that will develop the education and skills of individuals.

The engine of development is the increase in efficiency, and the most important indicator of efficiency increase is the education level of the workforce and the society. Pace of development increases proportionally in nations which provides especially the primary and secondary schooling to their people.

Another important goal is to increase the welfare and life standards of teachers. This is more important than any other technological investment in schools. There is nothing on earth that can substitute the communication and relationship between the teacher and the students. Technology is very important but teacher and teaching techniques come before technological investments."

In the same meeting, Müsiad General Chairman Ömer BOLAT expressed those ideas:

"Education and economy are an inseparable whole. In this regard, qualified workforce who both understands and can apply technology is required who can produce high quality products and service. This kind of demand stands out more than ever.

Unemployment is one of the most important problems of our country. Most of the unemployed population is composed of unqualified components. While there is an extreme search for specialized workforce in many sectors and many regions in our country, in many other regions, unemployment of unqualified workforce stands out as a serious problem. Therefore, importance of vocational education increases day by day. Unfortunately, vocational and technical education institutions founded to cultivate the qualified workforce that industry needs have not developed decently yet."

The general chairman of Anavatan Party at that time, Erkan Mumcu, expressed those ideas:

"Here, we have been talking about change of paradigm. Presenting an education system focused on individual while there is a noble notion of human, as a model for our education system is just memorization. Our notion is human. The base of notion of education in Turkish comes from "bowing", wrapping". Its original in Latin is 'educe'. It is the same with the concept 'education' in English. It means "bowing, giving form, giving shape". However, human being does not need that. Individual does not need that, either. The notion and system of education is totally wrong and inhuman. Since it is wrong, we cannot get any results. The goals of that system are positivist in various ways. For instance, to produce qualified workforce in postindustrial society. On the contrary, the goal of human beings to exist on earth is not just being workforce. Accordingly, we can put the notion of learning instead of education, but the notion what I will suggest to you is "growth" or "discovery". What is right is that.

Dear Musiad chairman, the goal of education is not to produce workforce. The workforce requirement of industry is not the problem of education. And what is to be done is not generalizing the vocational high schools but only liberalizing human beings and presenting as many choices and facilities as possible to free people. It is to be able to present the chance to choose. Education is delivering facilities on the way to discover oneself and complete one's own growth. The remedy for that is not channelizing people in categorized educational institutions in certain directions. It is inhuman. It is inefficient. It is waste. Consequently what it will serve is producing the cheap workforce that West Hegemony searches for.

The new paradigm that education looks for must be liberalizing the human being. You say that the curriculum is in a search that seeks individual, this is very wrong.

You must firstly abolish the university entrance exams. Then you will give unlimited chances to people. You will bring equality. Students will see that they will have the chances to get education convenient for their aptitudes and orientations, to get the opportunities for learning as they develop themselves. That is the point."

Finally the President of the Board of Education, Hüseyin ÇELİK expressed those ideas:

"If you build the best schools, and donate those schools with the most advanced technological products, bring the best curriculum and the books, they will

constitute the three legs of education. That is, you may have the best car in the world, but if the driver is not competent, that car will not be suitable for your aim. Here the most important component is the teacher. Teacher is the one who will apply the curriculum, bring seriousness to education, establish democratic understanding, create loving, tolerance, and diversity."

Those ideas make up the trivets of the subjects such as education, the requirements of education, components in education, teacher, role of the teacher, educational administration that form the ultimate goal of our study.

2.2. Training and Learning

Training is something done to others (Rothwell, 2008, pp.3-5). It "pushes" knowledge, skills, and attitudes that are essential to successful work performance. Training changes individuals so that they can get better work results as quickly as possible. It's a short-term, individually oriented change strategy intended to improve a worker's job performance. Learning is something that individuals do on their own. It's a "pull" strategy. Learners "pull" knowledge, skills, and attitudes from others so that they can be successful.

In fact, learning may be as natural for human beings as breathing. Research by Allen Tough (1971) revealed that the typical adult undertakes learning projects to solve real-time work or life problems.

Since learning is about mastering useful knowledge, skills and attitudes to achieve results, it's central to organizational and individual success. Neither organizations nor individuals can adapt to change if they lack the requisite

knowledge, skills, and attitudes. As a result, learning is a very important means to the end of performing.

In recent years, much attention has been focused on demonstrating the impact or the return-on-investments in training. But less attention has been focused on demonstrating the impact or return-on-investments in learning. One reason may be that measuring the value of learning may be more daunting than measuring the value of training. Participation in training can be identified. It is easy to count how many people are sitting in training seats or are logged into online training. And if the training is planned, it is easy to see what people have been taught to do by consulting the measurable instructional objectives.

But learning is not always as obvious. Much learning is informal and it basically comes from experience. Although learning has an important impact on performance, the measurement difficulties are apparent, and it is clear that individuals and organizations usually become more efficient and effective as they gain experience. It is the learning that stems from experience that makes them more efficient and effective. There seems to be little doubt that learning can and does have an impact on organizational and individual performance.

2.2.1.   How Learning is Defined?

According to the online edition of American Heritage Dictionary, *learning* has three main definitions. First, it can mean "the act, process, or experience of gaining knowledge or skill." Second, it can mean "knowledge or skill gained through

schooling or study." Third, it can mean "behavioral modification, especially acquired through experience or conditioning." Knowledge is generally understood to mean facts, information, and concepts. Skill refers to know how, that is, practical awareness of how to do something. Attitude is a general disposition of feeling, positive or negative, about something and is closely aligned to opinions and beliefs. Much training is geared to changing what people know (knowledge), what they can do (skills), and what they feel or how they feel (attitudes).

Wikipedia defines learning in a more robust way than the dictionary definition in the previous sentences. It is the "acquisition and development of memories and behaviors, including skills, knowledge, understanding, values, and wisdom. It is the product of experience and the goal of education. Learning ranges from simple forms of learning such as habituation and classical conditioning seen in many animal species, to more complex activities, such as play, seen only in relatively intelligent animals."

Those definitions may seem inadequate to capture the nuances of complicated human processes. Many rhetoricians have defined learning differently, but in spite of all those definitions, understanding of learning process remains incomplete. According to Hergenhahn and Olson (1997), "learning refers to a change in behavior potentiality, and performance refers to the translation of this potentiality into behavior" (p.5). In short, learning gives individuals the potential to get results. But performance is the actual realization of that potential.

2.2.2. Learning and Adult Education

It's hard to find a universal definition of learning accepted by everyone. Subjects like what learning is and how we learn are always open to discussion. Our knowledge on learning is mostly systemized by rhetoricians and practitioners in the field of psychology and that knowledge is mostly developed in the context of children's learning within formal education system. In general social perception, learning calls for "school and studying practices." School related connotations related to learning rests upon the implicit assumption that learning can only take place at school and in childhood. In the frame of that assumption, it cannot even be thought that the concept of "adult" can stand together with concepts like learning and education. This type of understanding that reduces learning to school-related practices limits us to conceive learning and its importance in our lives. The studies carried out in the field of adult education has a special position in order to get over that mentioned limitation, because those studies make contribution in handling learning in a wider frame with their emphases that learning is a life-long process and goals of the learner, social context, and the practices are important elements not to be neglected in learning process.

Most of our behaviours, ideas and beliefs are learnt and those learnings have been getting realized in our lives out of formal education. It is not possible that an understanding which takes education as equal to school system to guarantee the right of education to all society in a country like Turkey where educational inequalities take place intensively. Then, we have to differentiate learnings that take place out of

school. Resnick (1987), claims that learning is made general at school whereas it is contextual out of school.

When we take learning as a life-long process out of school, adult learning theories and approaches arise in front of us. It is necessary to note that the literature on adult learning is relatively limited as compared with the rich accumulation of knowledge on child learning and development. In fact, the subject of how adults learn and if they can learn or not is as old as man's history. Questions asking whether adults could learn or not were very widespread until 1930's. In 1928, the book Adult Learning written by Thorndike proved by scientific findings that adults could also learn (Duman 2000).

In this way a new period began that focused on adult education and learning. Merriam (2009) divides this near past into three periods. According to that, first studies on adult learning have focused on whether adults could learn, or not. Later on comes the period when adult educators begin to study how to differentiate adult learning from child learning. Finally, starting from the mid-1980's, adult learning theory has broadened by covering different approaches from the disciplines out of the field of adult education. According to Merriam, the contributions of those three periods separately make up the scenery of today's adult learning theories. It's very important to know those theories in order to understand the level the field of adult education and learning has reached today.

Adult Learning concerns how adults learn. In one sense, adults may be understood as "mentally mature" people. In a different sense, the word adult may also be understood to mean those who are beyond the traditional school ages of seven to twenty-one. They are usually employed (Tough, 1971, pp.39-49).

Children tend to be willing to listen to adults give the information that may not have immediate application. But adults have traditionally been regarded as being much less patient and much more prone to focus on immediate application. They want to know why new information is worth knowing and how to use it.

The term adult usually means someone who has reached maturity. There can be a difference between being mature and being of legal age. Legal age varies by culture and even by location. The key issue in legal age is the age at which an individual may enter into a contract.

An adult learner usually implies someone who engages in learning beyond the traditional age of school attendance. What is regarded as "traditional school age" can vary.

There are several important fallacies to address on adult learning. First, while adults may share some things in common, it is a mistake to generalize that all adult learners are the same. They are not. Second, while it is popular to point out generational differences in working and learning styles, there is too little empirical research to indicate differences among various age groups. Care must be taken in making sweeping generalizations about people, since the research to support it is not strong enough to do so with certainty.

As the adult educators often emphasize, learning for adults is related with their lives, their real problems and the subjects they are interested in or they need. In this regard, as adult educators, we can make learning-teaching techniques more effective if we have deeper and extensive knowledge about qualities of the learner, context of learning and process of learning itself.

2.2.3. Assumptions About Adults As Learners

Well-known author and theorist Malcolm Knowles stated that most adult learners are autonomous. Most of them want to take charge of their lives, their learning, and their careers. They are self-directed; they are willing to initiate their own learning efforts when they see the need to do so. As an example, adults become interested in learning about babies just before they become parents (Tough, 1971).

2.3. Models From Adult Education

Here we will be studying adult education and its characteristics.

2.3.1. Distinguishing Characteristics of Adult Learning

Most of the theories related with learning had been developed in the field of psychology till the beginning of 1970's. A great part of those psychology theories are general by nature, they mostly assume all individuals have similar learning processes regardless of their being children or adults (Tusting and Barton, 2006). The theories developed in the field of adult education are inclined to differentiate what the distinguishing characteristics of adult learning are.

Many books had been published at the beginning of 1970's drawing attention to the fact that the ways adults learn have distinctive characteristics and the studies and applications in adult education must reflect those attributes. Malcolm Knowles, in his book "The Adult Learner: A Neglected Species" (1973) had produced the main contours of the adult learning model which he named "andragogy" that included a set of basic assumptions.

According to Knowles, adults must know why they need to learn it before they begin to learn something. According to him, adults must move towards self-directed ego from dependent-ego perception. Additionally, adults have more accumulation of experience as compared to children and those experiences have different qualities. Their readiness for learning correlate with their social roles and duties related with their life phases. Adults are inclined to problem-centered learning rather than subject-centered learning and they move with an internal motivation rather than an external one.

According to Knowles, there is an opposite condition in the pedagogical model which he historically calls "teacher-centered education of children." This pedagogical model assumes that the learners must only learn what the teacher teaches and personality is mostly dependent rather than being self-directed. According to that, the experiences of the learner have a very little value and the teacher does not take those experiences into consideration in the context of classroom. Learners learn what the teacher tells them they need to learn, but not the subjects related with their lives. In this pedagogical approach, it is thought that the learners have an inclination for subject-centered learning and it is the best way to use external motivation to convince them for learning.

Knowles, in his early writings, makes a clear distinction between pedagogy which is appropriate for children and andragogy which is appropriate for adults. However, in the following years, it is seen he starts to accept that different teaching and learning techniques are convenient for different conditions. As a matter of fact, in certain contexts such as learners' entry to a new subject field, he stated pedagogical strategy is more convenient than andragogical strategy (Knowles, 1980). On the other hand, Knowles claims that andragogy uses pedagogical strategies only as a first step and learner will do everything possible in order to be responsible from his own learning. In addition to these, it is also necessary to state that Knowles had formed teaching principles from those learning theories mentioned.

Andragogy theory states why the individuals engage in learning and why we need to know why we must teach certain things in certain ways. According to that, we must support the development of self-directedness in learners, be ready to make use of their personal experiences when suitable, and be aware of their duties out of the learning context, their social roles and positions. We must relate learning with the real problems and the real subjects in their lives rather than subjects and skills disconnected from context, understand the motivations of individuals regarding learning, and respect.

2.3.2. Humanist Psychology

Knowles' model relies on humanist psychology theory for personal development. In humanist psychology, individual's potential for development and his desire are accepted as basic assumptions, and it is emphasized that individuals have an

unlimited potential for developing and self-actualizing themselves. Both Maslow (1970) and Rogers and Freibers (1994) assume that individuals have inherent drives towards growing and self-direction.

Carl Rogers developed his thoughts relying on his therapy studies for years. He structured his hypothesis around the only impetus in life which is known as "actualizing tendency". This tendency is the inherent drive that every living creature has and tries to make its existence reach perfection.

In his book "Freedom to Learn", he transferred this approach that takes individual into center to education institutions. Rogers sees learning as a process triggered by the learner and teacher (if there is any) functions only as a facilitator in that process. Basic role of teacher is to create a safe climate that will help learners discover themselves in order to make learning be possible and to support them to interact with others.

Maslow, in his work, produced a humanitarian development model including a hierarchy of needs that incorporates basic physiological needs with love, affection and self-respect requirements. Each of those basic needs has to be satisfied before identifying the next need in the hierarchy. There is self-actualization need at the top of the hierarchy. Maslow claimed that individuals will orient towards learning in order to self-actualize themselves when all the former needs have been satisfied.

Adult learning models stemming from humanist psychology state that individuals have an inherent motive for their personal development, this can be strengthened via education and it is necessary. One other important aspect of those models is that basic needs of individuals have to be satisfied before learning takes place especially in the context of adult language, literacy and basic arithmetic

teaching. It is impossible that a hungry, thirsty, sleepy, ill individual or one that feels himself marginalized or insecure can learn effectively, because those needs have priority. Consequently, those subjects are considered as basic parts of learning process. This is especially effectual where structured learning climate will make them feel insecure. Because learners in the field of adult basic education have social troubles and health problems, they have negative experiences regarding school and their former learning methods.

2.3.3. Andragogy Criticisms

Criticisms of andragogy emphasize that it is an ideal condition for adult learners rather than an adult learning theory, that is, it is more a perspective than a descriptive model. This approach states that andragogy can be applied to some forms of child learning, as well. This model rejects the importance of the context that adult learning takes place. Merriam and Caffarella (1998) referred to many empirical studies that test this theory and have mixed results.

Hanson (1996) who questions the requirement for a separate theory of adult learning, claims that there is a very little evidence showing an absolute difference between adult and child learning. Most theoreticians believe that the difference created by the accumulation of living as a result of rising age and increasing experience is not as important as the andragogy theory assumes.

The basic difference between child and adult learning in terms of context and culture is that the adult learning is generally voluntary. This means that adults

26

participate the courses in order to satisfy the requirements and desires they experience in their lives, normally not with an external manipulation.

2.3.4. Self-Directed Learning

Self-directed learning studies (Gibbons, 2014), in basic adult education emphasize self-motivation of the learners in participating education and state they have the capacity to enter self-directed autonomous learning. Accordingly, we must respect the autonomy and self-directedness of learner and perceive that as a resource to be drawn into classroom. Also, we must be aware of the fact that self-directedness stems from the interaction between the individual and the larger social context.

2.3.5. Learning How to Learn

One of the acquisitions of focusing on self-directed learning is the idea that adults can notice their own learning processes and consequently develop their thoughts regarding the ways to manage those processes. The concept of "learning how to learn" has become more popular as the policies that support lifelong learning develop. The leading theoretician Smith's (1983) primary emphasis is that adults actively make use of learning the cognitive processes thought to be taking place in learning and consequently can put them into practice. Smith (1983) in his book, "Learning How to Learn: Apply Learning Theory for Adults", combines a practical

guidance that settles a clear description of learning theory and learning to learn phenomenon into implementation forms in different contexts. These are self-education, group learning projects, learning in educational institutions, systematical learning via thinking about daily experiences and even learning through perceptions and dreams.

Smith talks about four distinguishing characteristics of adult learners. First, the orientation of adults is different than that of children since they themselves choose to take place in learning process and consequently the time they spend for learning is precious. Second, adults have the accumulation of experience that will form the basis for new learnings, and as a result of those learnings, the unique nature of the path that everyone chooses in his life becomes more specific to the person as he grows older. Third, different developmental duties wait adults at different points in their lives and education is needed at those transition periods. Lastly, adult learning is characterized by concerns and ambivalent emotions depending on their former negative school experiences, that is, with the conflicting condition of becoming a dependent student from being an autonomous adult, and other emotional difficulties. At the center of Smith's learning theory stands the hypothesis that adults have the capacity to take partial or total responsibility for their education and the intense personal nature of learning process.

2.3.6. Informal Learning

Studies on informal learning point out the necessity of noticing that learning may take place out of the classrooms and learning settings. According to that, a

relationship between the classroom and the other learnings has to be established. (Jeffs, T. and Smith, M.K., 2005). Sometimes, most of the learning in formal classrooms does take place out of the control of the teacher. It is an important step to accept that sort of learning as a valuable form of learning rather than reject it.

2.3.7. Transformative Learning

A defining condition of being human is that we have to understand the meaning of our experience. For some, any uncritically assimilated explanation by an authority figure will suffice. But in contemporary societies we must learn to make our own interpretations rather than act on the purposes, beliefs, judgments, and feelings of others. Facilitating such understanding is the cardinal goal of adult education. Transformative learning develops autonomous thinking (dlc, 2012).

2.3.7.1. Transformative Learning Theory

Mezirow defines learning as the process of using a prior interpretation to construe a new or a revised interpretation of the meaning of one's experience to guide future action. Furthermore, transformative learning occurs when there is a transformation in one of our beliefs or attitudes (a meaning scheme), or a transformation of our entire perspective (habit of mind) (Merriam, Caffarella and Baumgartner, 2007, p.133).

Mezirow's transformative learning is a ten step process with four main components, these are: experience, critical reflection, reflective discourse, and action. The learner has an experience. The learner then critically reflects; examines their own beliefs, goals, assumptions, etc. in relation to the experience. The learner

proceeds to take part in dialogue further examining the new thoughts, ideas that have come out of the critical reflection. This dialogue consists of gathering opinions of others, whether through one-on-one conversations or within a group setting. The final step is taking action based on this new level of learning and perspective (Mezirow, 1991).

Transformative learning is the process of effecting change in a frame of reference. Adults have acquired a coherent body of experience—associations, concepts, values, feelings, conditioned responses—frames of reference that define their life world. Frames of reference are the structures of assumptions through which we understand our experiences. They selectively shape and delimit expectations, perceptions, cognition, and feelings. They set our "line of action." Once set, we automatically move from one specific activity (mental or behavioral) to another. We have a strong tendency to reject ideas that fail to fit our preconceptions, labeling those ideas as unworthy of consideration—nonsense, irrelevant, weird, or mistaken. When circumstances permit, transformative learners move toward a frame of reference that is more inclusive, discriminating, self-reflective, and integrative of experience.

A frame of reference encompasses cognitive, conative, and emotional components, and is composed of two dimensions: *habits of mind* and *a point of view*. Habits of mind are broad, abstract, orienting, habitual ways of thinking, feeling, and acting influenced by assumptions that constitute a set of codes. These codes may be cultural, social, educational, economic, political, or psychological. Habits of mind become articulated in a specific point of view—the constellation of belief, value judgment, attitude, and feeling that shapes a particular interpretation.

An example of a habit of mind is ethnocentrism, the predisposition to regard others outside one's own group as inferior. A resulting point of view is the complex of feelings, beliefs, judgments, and attitudes we have regarding specific individuals or groups (for example, homosexuals, welfare recipients, people of color, or women). Frames of reference are primarily the result of cultural assimilation and the idiosyncratic influences of primary caregivers. Habits of mind are more durable than points of view (Cranton, 1997).

Points of view are subject to continuing change as we reflect on either the content or process by which we solve problems and identify the need to modify assumptions. This happens whenever we try to understand actions that do not work the way we anticipated. We can try out another person's point of view and appropriate it, but we cannot do this with a habit of mind. Points of view are more accessible to awareness and to feedback from others.

We transform our frames of reference through critical reflection on the assumptions upon which our interpretations, beliefs, and habits of mind or points of view are based. We can become critically reflective of the assumptions we or others make when we learn to solve problems instrumentally or when we are involved in communicative learning. We may be critically reflective of assumptions when reading a book, hearing a point of view, engaging in task-oriented problem solving, or self-reflectively assessing our own ideas and beliefs. Self-reflection can lead to significant personal transformations.

Critically explored assumptions may be in the autobiographical context of a belief, or they may be supporting a social, cultural, economic, political, educational, or psychological system. Transformations in frames of reference take place through

critical reflection and transformation of a habit of mind, or they may result from an accretion of transformations in points of view.

There are four processes of learning. Referring to the ethnocentric example, one process is to elaborate an existing point of view—we can seek further evidence to support our initial bias regarding a group and expand the range or intensity of our point of view. A second way we learn is to establish new points of view. We can encounter a new group and create new negative meaning schemes for them by focusing on their perceived shortcomings, as dictated by our propensity for ethnocentricity. A third way we learn is to transform our point of view. We can have an experience in another culture that results in our critically reflecting on our misconceptions of this particular group. The result may be a change in point of view toward the group involved. As a result, we may become more tolerant or more accepting of members of that group. If this happens over and over again with a number of different groups, it can lead to a transformation by accretion in our governing habit of mind. Finally, we may transform our ethnocentric habit of mind by becoming aware and critically reflective of our generalized bias in the way we view groups other than our own. Such epochal transformations are less common and more difficult. We do not make transformative changes in the way we learn as long as what we learn fits comfortably in our existing frames of reference.

In the models of adult learning that concentrate on its transformative potential, the critical thought of experience is taken as basis. Those theories basically perceive learning as a way of individual and social transformation.

Brazilian reading-writing educator Paulo Freire views learning at the center of social transformation. His work, Pedagogy of the Oppressed, has come out as a

result of his studies with the poor and socially marginalized people of Brazil. According to Freire, the role of education is to free people from systemic oppression.

Freire does not see education as something that the teacher brings into classroom with him and puts into the accounts of the students, that is, not as something that helps structural oppression to last and lead to social marginalization, that is, "banking concept of education." Instead, it is expected that the teacher commits his "class suicide" as an educator, then reincarnate by integrating with his students and consequently go beyond the boundary that separates him from his students (Taylor, 1993).

In summary, it will be incomplete or wrong to view learning as just an individual cognitive phenomenon or something that is fully controlled by the teacher while transferring certain program content.

<u>2.3.8. Summary</u>

We can summarize those findings as such below:

i.Adults have their own motivations for learning. Learners build their new learnings on existent knowledge and experience. They make learning convenient for their purposes and associate it with their goals. Learning goals of individuals are related with their real lives, activities and roles out of the classroom.

ii.Adults have a motive for being self-directed and autonomous learners. Learning is triggered by the learner and role of the teacher is to establish a safe environment for learning to take place.

iii.Adults have learning ability about their learning processes. They make use of the arguments on their learning processes. Adults can learn how to learn.

iv.Learning carries the properties of all real life events that people take different roles and take place in different ways. Humans learn by practicing and their participation can be supported by new methods.

v.Adults have reflections about their experiences and they build their experiences. Reflective learning comes into being when individuals face problems in their real lives and think about alternative solutions.

vi.Reflective learning is unique to individual because it exists within the complication of individual's own experiences. Most of learning is randomly and uniquely connected with individual. It cannot be planned in advance.

2.4. New Values in Education

The concept of value has different definitions (Özden, 2010). Because value that is a general and abstract concept is often used to express different meanings (Kuçuradi 2010). Value derived from "valere", a Latin word means "adopted, admired, overrated and upheld thing" or "a thing which is important and valid for human" (Aydın, 2003; Timüçin, 1994; Yıldırım, 2007). The value can be defined as "a fact believed, desired and used as a scale or as "a belief that shows individual and social preferences" (Akbaba-Altun, 2003; Aydın; Oktay, 2007).

Values education is a value development process (Acat and Aslan, 2012). An important question in values education is that which values should be taught (Dale, 1994; Lickona, 1993; Superka, Ahrens, Hedstrom, Ford and Johnson, 1976). There is no universal answer to this question. The more accepted answer is that views of students, teachers, parents and the other partners should be taken to determine the values taught in schools. The family has an important role in values education (Brynildssen, 2002; Özensel, 2003; Vess and Halbur, 2003). Important task of schools is to teach values, to discipline students and to contribute to moral and character development (Akbaş, 2007). Both the school and the parents are required to put more effort than before. Because the factors which affect the child's value system are diversified (Gömleksiz, 2007).

The purpose of transformation in education is to help new pictures exist in the minds that struggle to find solutions for the obstruction in education system.

Today educators seem to be making their jobs in the right way but it is hard to say that they are doing the right thing. It is the "effectiveness" problem that deserves to be emphasized. What makes a system effective is not that it does in the right way whatever it does but it must make the right thing.

The duty of schools is to bring up young people who have perceived the dynamics of change, who can adapt easily to changing conditions and who even have the capacity to lead that change.

Education system requires leaders at every step. When classroom teacher asks himself how much his style of explaining the subjects and presenting the lessons work in order to bring the behaviors in their students, this is a sort of leadership on the part of the teacher. Similarly, when a school administrator starts to search for

innovation, develops a new vision for the human profile that he desires to bring up at his school, this is leadership for him. In modern times, school administrators are required who have realized that it does not make a school either effective or efficient just by applying the rules and legislation well. Administration of schools have to be at the hands of leaders who settle a new vision for their schools and display that in the clearest way everyone at school can understand easily. School leaders are needed who have perceived management is not just using authority and power, and who have seen the reality that it necessitates working hard and taking responsibility.

New values necessitate leaving the hierarchical and bureaucratic structure that characterizes schools to a decentralized structure where professional control is dominating. This new paradigm anticipates some basic changes in "roles, relationships and responsibilities" in the structure of schools. Those changes can be summarized as follows:

- It has become an obligation that the flow of hierarchy at school to be less hierarchical.
- Leadership has started to be related to being successful in what is to be done rather than with position power.
- Over control in administration of school has replaced with delegation of authority to teachers and other personnel. This understanding has led to a structure that highlights human factor and cooperation more.

Administrator's being the facilitator of affairs rather than executor of rules and legislation and teacher's being the leader of his class rather than being a clerk responsible from carrying out the curriculum have become indispensable conditions of the quality in education. One of the factors that influences effectiveness and

efficiency at schools is that school administrators forget that rules and legislation is just a tool to carry out school business and transform that tool to a goal. Getting successful results in education and in administration of schools is left aside at schools where conserving the legislation is accepted as successful management.

The basic idea behind those concepts conceived as new values is the view that "everyone can learn and be educated." Existing schooling programs are established for the purpose of choosing the successful and the unsuccessful. There is a sort of elimination at all levels of education. Differentiation of students is made depending on their socio-economical background into schools and classes that promise different future economic, social and cultural success. On the other hand, new values assume everyone can learn and try to succeed that every student can actualize his capacity in the maximum limit. This means education programs will be rearranged to give everyone the chance for equal learning.

The goal in education is not to classify or eliminate the students but to give them the chance to be the best they can potentially be (Sanver, 2013). This is an obligation, not a requirement. Because basic human rights necessitate to educate everybody in line with their abilities and interests.

The assumptions that learning is to be focused on producing knowledge, not on storing it and to settle what is learned into real life by passing through the walls of the classroom are among the leading ideas in the process of reshaping the education system.

The change of beliefs in social structure (Özden, 2010); values and techniques lie at the center of its becoming a necessity to redefine the goal of education and working of schools. Those changes have created new paradigms. Paradigm can be defined as the sum of beliefs, values and techniques shared by the members of a certain group of people.

One can find out many new values, as the name suggests. Throughout the study those values have been getting mentioned, defined, explained and examples given. Here the basic principles behind those values are described briefly (Wheeler, 2010):

i. The pace of change is accelerating. The present speed of information based on new technologies has undermined traditional expert driven processes of knowledge development and dissemination. An example can be given from Google. In 2006, there were 2.6 billion searches on Google every month. That number of searches reached 31 billion in 2009. Radio reached an audience of 50 million in 38 years, TV in 13 years, the Internet in four years, Facebook in two years.

ii. Personalized Learning. It can be said that for the first time we are preparing students for a future we cannot clearly describe. We can ask a question: Is learning simply gaining knowledge or making connections? As the years have passed, a new learning concept has developed, called personalized learning. It can simply be defined as learning anytime and at any place.

We must also analyze some other concepts that emerge under that heading. When new values are being explored, those concepts are the leading elements:

- Distributed (cloud) computing

- Enhanced smart mobile technology

- Collaborative intelligent filtering

- 3D visualization and interaction

Within the discussion of new values, what Einstein had said should be remembered: "Imagination is more important than knowledge". In terms of new values, it can also be said we need diversity of thought in the world to face new challenges (Sir Tim Berners-Lee). The ratio of formal learning has dropped to 30% while that of informal learning has reached 70% (Wheeler).

iii. Self-Organized Learning: With personalized learning comes the concept of self-organized learning (SOL) where the students take responsibility for their own learning and put this into successful action. For successful SOL, the essential components are;

- Communication

- Reflection

- Collaboration

- Community

- Creative Tools

- Amplification

Don Tapscott (2013) tells "It is not what you know that counts anymore. It is what you can learn."

iv. Openness: Openness is a great value for making higher education great. There are many attributes of higher education. Some are physical; the campus and its classrooms, laboratories, and library. Those spaces are populated by people; students, faculty, and staff. Some are nonphysical. The activities of higher education are learning, research, dialogue, and reflection. Yet none of these attributes, alone, is especially distinctive. The most distinctive attributes of higher education today are its values. Jonathan R. Cole, in his 2009 book *The Great American University*, contends that twelve core values distinguish "great" colleges and universities (Oblinger, 2010):

- Universalism

- Organized skepticism

- Creation of new knowledge

- Free and open communication of ideas

- Disinterestedness

- Free inquiry and academic freedom

- International communities

- Peer review system

- Working for the "common" good

- Governance by authority

- Intellectual progeny

- Vitality of the community

Putting those values into action has catalyzed huge advances in science, technology, culture, and society.

Another important value is openness, a theme weaving through all twelve of Cole's values (Oblinger, 2010). It is a central pillar of the academic community due to its commitment to the free flow of information and ideas. This commitment to sharing is essential to scholarly discovery and innovation. It is also central to helping learners engage, absorb, and apply knowledge in order to advance personally and academically. Finally, this commitment to openness provides the foundation for leveraging resources, both within and among institutions, to strengthen the creation, transmission, and preservation of knowledge."

2.4.1.1. New Paradigms Concerning Learning and Teaching

The paradigmatic change in the tradition of making science and related to that, newly formed values about the nature of knowledge have caused changes in the processes of learning and teaching. The basic change in that regard is that the center of interest in the processes of learning and teaching has shifted towards learning. New findings in this field reveal that learning is as private as fingerprint, everyone's type, rate and capacity of learning is different, and everyone can learn more than he already knows if appropriate learning conditions are provided.

At the Supreme Council of National Education it was intensively expressed that schools mostly transfer knowledge to students but do not cultivate skills. In the conclusion report of fifteenth National Education Supreme Council it was advised that course subjects and teaching techniques should be arranged in a way "...to teach how to learn rather than transfer knowledge, enable students to understand the basic concepts, comment on and apply them, and to form the habit of scientific thinking and problem solution skills and behaviors."

Business world desires that schools produce graduates who have learnt how to learn. However, it is not sufficient for graduates to be successful in business life to have learnt reading and writing and to be loaded with certain knowledge. In the past, it was somewhat meaningful to be loaded with some knowledge and to memorize them like sacred texts when accumulation of knowledge was limited and the knowledge learnt almost didn't change any at all. Today accumulation of knowledge has been getting realized very fast. However much the knowledge acquired is comprehensive and valid, it becomes insufficient or totally invalid in three or five years as a result of accumulation of new knowledge. Therefore the most important duty in front of schools is to bring up individuals who have learnt how to learn and think.

2.4.1.2. Meaning of Equal Opportunity in Education

The equality of opportunity in education (Woessmann and Peterson, 2007) is to give the opportunity to individuals to realize their abilities and intelligence in the uppermost level. All developed countries search for the ways to provide education to every student in line with his abilities (Pop, 2012). This is also necessary for democracy as it is for education. Because it is not possible to perpetuate democracy in the nations composed of citizens who have not reached the competency to make their decisions themselves.

The development of our country and taking its place in contemporary world as a democratic society depends on the fact that every student uses his potential in the best way, not only in certain selected segments. Today, raising up of young people in the remotest corners or villages as enterprising, productive and making

their own decisions themselves becomes more important for individual rights, economy and democracy.

<u>2.4.2. Vision</u>

Vision is a tableau in our minds we have drawn with the meaning and reflection of the values we have (Baker and Tomlinson, 2013).

Vision development process starts with perceiving the existent situation as problem. Therefore it defines the situation we want to reach in the future and it is long-term. Vision starts at the point where the theory ends. New visions emerge when existing paradigms cannot solve the troubles we face with.

The vision that everybody shares wholeheartedly is a source of inspiration and energy. A vision developed as a result of learning-teaching processes, and moulding of new values about management and leadership with local characteristics and unique conditions of the school will trigger the passion that will enable everyone at school together with teachers and students to focus their energies to a common goal.

When previous models have been obstructed, it is useless to search for better, faster, richer of those models. This is the reason why the obstruction in our education system cannot be passed over. As the criticisms over the system have increased, richer, more diversified and faster curriculum (Anatolian Lycees, Science High Schools, Super High Schools) have been brought up, but a new vision could not have been drawn. That is, only the how question has been asked but what and why

questions have not been uttered. Vision reveals what has to be done. Why question determines the new goals.

2.4.2.1. Visionary Leadership

Leaders are the people who can also open up new horizons for their organizations (Patrick, 2012). For a new administrator, the best way to pass over the difficulties stemming from the conflicts among the teachers and the administration is to put up new goals at that school.

A successful school administrator is the one who can gather all the teachers at school around a common education vision. It is among the most important duties of school administrator to exhibit the teachers that education is bigger than the sum of individual activities of each teacher. It depends on the leadership of school administrator to unite the teachers around a vision of education that also comprises their opinions of education but which is bigger than theirs. Teacher should be able to see his/her role in that larger vision. Being a part of that larger vision does not weaken the teacher; on the contrary, it makes him stronger.

2.4.2.2. A New Vision of Education

Every educator has to question the purpose of education and the reason why the school exists and find his/her own answer. In addition to that, basic values about the structure of educational system and its action must be revealed (Conley, 1995).

Many school teachers and administrators have a vision in their minds related to education and school. Most of those visions in the minds of administrators are related with buildings and the equipment. For example, many administrators imagine a big school with a large courtyard, which has laboratories, library, and 25 students

in each class. Unfortunately, education programs, student profile to be graduated, level of success fall behind. It is natural for a school administrator to give priority to physical conditions working at a school which does not have a courtyard and classes with 70 students. However, school administrators who can satisfy basic requirements reasonably have to deepen their horizons. School administrator must know that the daily requirements of the school will never finish and he must not be smothered among that work.

2.4.2.3. Development of a Common Vision at School

A leader with a vision is not a person who forces everybody to accept his vision. The vision communicated hierarchically from above to below through commands is the official vision. Official vision does not excite people. It is the duty and the responsibility of the school administrator to create a common vision at school shared by all teachers, students and the staff. It is the duty of the administrator to mark a path that will excite everybody at school. The vision does not have to be the vision of the administrator, but it is his responsibility.

Visions that are shared cannot be established in hierarchical chains. Visions cannot be realized without people who do not dedicate themselves.

The first thing for a school administrator to develop a common vision is to create an atmosphere where the teachers can develop their own personal visions. Creating a common vision at school is the cure for daily problems. When teachers participate into the process of vision development, then that vision will be meaningful for them.

2.4.3. Nature of Knowledge and Goal of Education

We can look at nature of knowledge in terms of values and analyze values as traditional and new.

2.4.3.1. Traditional Values

Traditional values are the ones that have been widely in "use" for many years but don't mean much in modern times (Kernan, 1994). Here are some examples:

i. Knowledge is Definite: Scientific truths are absolute and not open to discussion. The people who hold this view believe the absoluteness of scientific knowledge because they have the tendency to see the latest scientific findings as the ultimate point that humankind can reach.

ii. Education is Given in order to Load Students With Knowledge: According to that thought, the goal of education is to store information in the minds of students. It is not expected from students to reproduce new knowledge by using the existing one; it is the job of scientists to produce knowledge.

iii. Knowledge is Acquired to Use in Future: The purpose of education is to make the student ready for future life. It is accepted that the knowledge learnt at school will guide the student throughout his life.

iv. Getting Informed Is Realized Through the Transfer of Knowledge: Scientific knowledge is formal knowledge. Student is in the position of receiver and teacher is the sender during the process of getting informed. It is a process that an authority transmits the knowledge to the ones who want it or who have to learn it.

2.4.3.2. New Values

New values are new as the name suggests (Quisumbing, 2001) and talk about what education ought to be or be a frontier that education should be able to reach. Some examples are below:

i. Scientific Knowledge is Temporary: Scientific truths and judgments are not absolute. Scientific knowledge is just one of the possible ones both as the kind and the point reached. There is one reality and scientific knowledge is a path to reach that reality. However, the results obtained are not viewed as reality. What once seemed true previously may not be true today; the truths of today may not be true tomorrow. It does not have any meaning to teach scientific knowledge as the unchanging laws of the Universe. On the contrary, student must learn to find his own truth among the other truths. Education has to be arranged in a way to produce knowledge rather than just transfer it.

ii. Knowledge is Acquired in order To Produce New Knowledge: This new understanding emphasizes that the student should reach his capacity to produce knowledge, just getting informed is not enough. The student is expected to interpret what he gets and give meaning to it. Classroom must be an environment where the students produce new knowledge as a result of their interactions with each other and their teachers, not a place where knowledge discovered by others is transferred to students.

2.4.3.3. Goal of Education

In this new era when the concept of information age arises, the most determining factor in education programs is "perpetuity of learning" principle. People in information society have to learn consistently. Therefore, the primary function of the

school must be "to enhance the learning capacity of the individual", but not to teach as much as possible. Another important development is the shining of "individual centered education" concept instead of "curriculum centered education." Creativity and intelligence of individuals are required in order to create free and liberal thought (Jones, 2012). Therefore the State must open up all the ways in all fields to the individual for liberal thought and creativity. Schools must aim at development of liberal and creative thought in the students both via their lesson contents and delivery of those contents, and their organization and administration.

2.5. Management and Leadership

The most basic problem for the administrator is knowing what to do differently in addition to making what has already been done more efficient.

One of the most important orientations viewed in the field of management since the beginning of twenty-first century is the diminishing of management layers and gaining importance of decentralized management.

2.5.1. Decentralized Management

What is the fundamental principle in the concept of School Centered Management is that "every decision related with education is to be taken at school." School Centered

Management can be thought as autonomy and participation to decision making (Bahr, 2007).

2.5.2. Goal-Oriented Management

Classical management mostly works in a problem-oriented manner. Many school administrators spend most of their time dealing with problems arising and looking for ways to live together with those problems. It is seen that most school administrators spend their time moving from one problem to another without finding any solution for those problems. The school administrator working in a problem-oriented manner does not put on his agenda his real duty, that is, raising up students. The administrator dealing with bureaucratic processes, discipline cases and cleaning equipments is stifled with that burden. What is more, problem solution becomes a goal itself in that perplexity.

All the processes at school have meaning as long as they contribute to the goal of producing qualified graduates. School's being organized and clean is meaningful as long as the students graduate with desired level of qualification. The school administrator is considered successful when he reaches that goal. When the students are not successful, none of the administrative processes have any meaning. This becomes possible only when the school administrator works as "goal oriented", not "problem-oriented." That is, the goal of producing "high quality graduates" must direct all the acts of the administrator.

2.5.3. Process-Oriented Management

Contemporary management approaches like Total Quality Management (TQM) propose that focusing on processes is necessary in order to reach goals.

The idea lying behind building most of Holy Japan Temples on hills hard to reach is that it is as important reaching there as worshipping there. In process-oriented thought system, the efforts of people beside whether they can reach their goals are very important. On the other hand, in the goal-oriented thought system, the efforts and hardworking of the individual have no value if the desired goal couldn't be fulfilled.

It is open to discussion how much an administrator contributes to development of education who does not deal with what the teacher does in the classroom but focuses on how many minutes before or after the working hours start the teachers come to school. It is a part of process-oriented management approach that the administrator be the helper and supporter of the teachers rather than to criticize them. An administrator who does not deal with anything other than the working hours cannot be a leader for the teachers.

A process-oriented administrator is the one who sees the efforts, abilities and the performance of the teacher, who evaluates them and who encourages the teacher to cultivate himself/herself (Farrar, 2006).

An administrator, by definition, has to deal with the results. However, successful administrators are the ones who work in a process-oriented manner while dealing with the results. Their questions are process-oriented. The criteria they put on

are both result and process oriented. Process oriented management is an approach which establishes the bridge between the process and the result. Process oriented management builds the bridge between the goals and the tools and helps people to see the greater picture free of prejudice.

2.6. Leadership

The reality that jobs are mostly information based necessitates all the workers process information continuously.

For instance, teachers have to follow both new scientific developments and the efficiency of education systems and new developments in the process of teaching-learning. In this regard, the duty of teachers does not have a frame that repeats itself constantly, but has a structure that is changing continually. This condition makes it an obligation that the teachers be the leaders who are energetic, have the ability to make decisions, can interpret the values of school and education, can manage themselves and take the responsibility of education and schooling. This means that the leadership expected from the school administrator emanates to the teachers. Consequently, the task of being the leader of leaders remains to school administrator.

Being the leader of leaders is harder than making leadership to teachers who have limited authority. The leaders of future will come out of the groups each of whose members has the capacity and authority for leadership.

2.6.1. Learning Leader

A situation becoming more and more prominent is that new forms of leadership will arise and leaders have to learn different types of leadership styles. As the pace of change increases, the only thing that is not changing will become the change and lifelong learning. The learning ability that is set high value on in the future will be the lifelong learning ability, not the ability to learn a new system. Lifelong learning ability will enable a person to redefine the reality continually. The future leaders will be the ones who can define the reality they have been in, in the best way (Ratcliffe, 2012).

2.6.2. What is Learning Climate?

Learning Climate is the psychological "feel" about learning in the organization (Tough, 1971). A fundamental principle of adult learning is that adults must feel psychologically "safe" to learn. Learning can be risky, since mistakes can be made during the learning process. Adults are less willing to make mistake than younger ones. They are thus generally more emotionally invested in how they perform in learning situations and in how others perceive them when they make mistakes.

Learning culture refers to the taken-for-granted assumptions about learning. Corporate culture can be defined as the sum total of acquired experience of a group of people. It is the acquired wisdom that results from work experience, successful or unsuccessful. From experience, people learn what they should do, how they should

do it, and what to expect from what they do. Assumptions based on that experience form the culture. Learning culture is thus formed by assumptions based on what approaches to learning work best or not so well.

2.6.3. School Leadership (Leadership of Tuition)

Products of education system effect society in many ways and education system is held responsible from the inadequacy in various parts of the society (Kaya, 1991). For this reason, education managers have to be educated continuously in the field of management not only on pre-service basis but on in-service basis, as well in order to maintain their success in playing the role of leadership and fulfilling their responsibilities. The fast changing conditions which necessitate new skills require the development of knowledge and abilities of education managers who have a great share in reshaping the future of the society and behaviors of individuals (Bellows, Gilson and Odiorne, 1962).

It has a critical importance that the teachers be well educated and have professional teaching abilities in order for students to be successful. However, although the number of teachers who are well educated in their field and devote themselves to their occupation is not low, many of them cannot be efficient professionally due to the inadequacy of their "organizational capacity." If the school managers cannot furnish the environment for teachers to focus on common points, the chance and the atmosphere to learn from each other, even the most brilliant teachers cannot be successful (Marzano, Waters and McNulty, 2005).

Teaching leadership in some sense is that the school administrator remembers the truth that the reason for the existence of school is to "achieve the growing of students." School, administrators, teachers are there to better train up the students. When student success cannot be accomplished, it does not mean much for school administrators to be security guards for rules and legislation.

School leadership generalizes the opinion that the primary location of school administrator is not his large official room, but the classrooms and the corridors. This brings a new understanding to school management. The primary function of school administrator is to make leadership to the process of schooling. When the administrator spends his time in classrooms and corridors, this will give the message of what is important at school to teachers and students.

At effective schools, most of the time of the administrator takes place in contexts of schooling. Schooling leader delegates some of the managerial work to his collaterals in order to deal more with the teaching-learning problems that he conceives as duty. He focuses all the activities at school on processes of teaching and learning which are the reasons for the existence of school.

2.6.3.1. Properties of Tuition Leader

There are various qualities that an administrator must have in order to perform effectual managerial behavior (Kaya, 1991) and to play leadership role successfully. Those qualities can be analyzed under two headings:

i. Personal Attributes: Education manager is generally at a middle level in the hierarchy of authority and has a constant relationship with the superiors and the subordinates. He puts the policies and plans developed at higher levels into action by evoking the subordinates via managerial actions both within and out of the

organization. By doing so, he also serves people and education of children in a certain environment, but his activities effect all the education system in country. His success depends on the relationships he carries out with the agents both in and out of the organization. Therefore school administrator has to be a trustable leader, a good organizator, an intellectual and skillful manager, an intelligent inspector and an active executive and viewer.

ii. Professional Attributes: The experiences that education administrators gain during their teaching and management periods and the knowledge and the skills they get in pre-service and in-service education form the professional attributes.

- Attributes Related with Experience: Managerial behaviours such as rewarding performance fairly and appropriately, operating discipline rules against mistakes but penalizing as little as possible, determining educational requirements and problems correctly, encouraging subordinates to express their ideas and proposals, giving practical orders, perceiving what the others want and help to realization of requests are among the professional qualifications related to the experience of leaders.

- Attributes Related with Educational Administration: Having sufficient amount of knowledge on organization and management theories, management principles, and ability to make use of that knowledge are mentioned among the professional qualifications of education administrators.

To summarize, the qualities of schooling leader are as follows:

o Fosters use of different schooling techniques.

o Supports professional development of teachers.

o He is the person whom the teachers turn to in case of problems in schooling.

55

- Exchanges ideas with the teachers on educational goals and schooling techniques.

- Often makes class observations.

- Has a clear vision of the rationale of the existence of school.

- Communicates with the teachers on subjects about teaching and learning.

- Regarded as the most important person with whom schooling can be discussed by the teachers.

- Often seen in classrooms and corridors in order to emphasize what is important at school.

- Often provides feedback to teachers about their performance in the classroom.

- Helps teachers in calculating and interpreting student success.

2.7. Learning Organizations

Learning organization means the ability of organizations to take lessons from experiences, to adjust to changing conditions and to gain a dynamic structure that can refresh itself. It is emphasized that organizations have the capacity to change their behavior forms as parallel to changing conditions, in other words, their learning capacity is similar to the living organisms that comprise them.

2.7.1. Making Leadership in a Learning Organization

The role of the leader is to make leadership to change in learning organizations. In an environment where everybody learns, leader is expected to lead new learnings. In this regard, leader is responsible from learning. In order for the leader to be able to furnish learning organization environment, he has to have ideas to lead the organization, to set up the infrastructure required for the staff for learning and be a model with his team for the other personnel.

2.7.2. Transformation Architecture

Education systems are criticized almost everywhere all around the world for staying behind the society. In general, schools, although in varying degrees, have a more conservative structure as compared to other social institutions in every country. This partly stems from the social responsibilities put on schools. Schools have to put new values onto new generations while transferring the existing cultural accumulation to them. In other words, educational institutions have a bilateral mission to preserve the dominant values in the society and to ensure the new values to be adopted at the same time. When educational institutions couldn't notice the social changes on time, they become conservative and exclude new values in order to preserve the existing ones. One other reason which leads to inefficiency in efforts for change in educational institutions is that the copying of change models from other institutions. Educational institutions which cannot lead the society have to take change models

from other institutions which have already actualized those models. For that reason, most of the trends that have entered education literature have business origins. Since those attempts are not suitable for the "unique structure of education", they cannot produce successful results (Williams, 2013).

It is necessary that the changes to be done in education system and working of schools have to come from the nature of education and unique conditions of schools. Therefore it is the most important point in education to give education leaders the opportunity and capacity for transformation architecture. Teachers feel disturbed from the conferences about change delivered by people who do not have any or have very little information about what they are doing. School administrators also experience difficulty in relating the models transferred from other businesses to their schools.

2.7.3. Creating Transformation Capacity

Cultivating students in accordance with the prevailing conditions of time and requirements of the society are the basic functions expected from schools. Since the cause of existence for schools are the students, the transformation to be done in education system has to aim at helping the students to learn better. In information society, it is expected from students to graduate from schools by learning to produce thoughts, causal thinking and using their minds.

In twenty-first century, the schools have to provide learning opportunities to students and prepare activities that will force their brains. General properties of that sort of activities are as follows:

- Forcing mentally

- Prompting to think

- Establishing cause and effect relationship

- Associating ideas and facts in various forms

- Emphasizing the importance of social values

2.7.4. Transformation Requirement

Change reminds the arrangements always made resting on the existing conditions/structure/system. Transformation, on the other hand, becomes compulsory when the existing values lose their validity, when existing structure does not lead to desired results. Development of a school model in line with the requirements of information society necessitates transformation in the education system.

The biggest obstacle in our country for transformation efforts is that people cannot see the authority in their hands as a result of the centralized management tradition. Everybody falls into despair as a result of the failures of centralized management. Consequently, many administrators cannot make use the opportunities in front of them.

School administrators will see that rules and legislation are not that big an obstacle when they put their efforts to raise the quality of education. When the school

returns to its actual task, that is, education, when everybody at school begins to concentrate on how to develop education and schooling, then the biggest transformation will actualize by itself.

2.7.5. Sustainability

The biggest barrier for transformation is the uncertainty that the change will bring up. Transformation brings uncertainty because nobody can know what kind of condition or result they will face with. Everybody feels an emotion of insufficiency since transformation will force everyone to do things they have never done before. The only harbour for people will be the status quo against the uncertainty and emotion of inadequacy that change will bring up. Therefore people will do everything they can in order to defend the status quo. Here comes in the transformation leadership of the school administrator. School administrator must put great effort to furnish sustainability at school.

Transformation will bring radical changes. However it is not possible get trust and loyalty of the teachers and the other personnel by fear. Transformation must be a process that everybody at school will experience jointly. Sustainability is a very important principle to be taken into consideration while implementing the transformation at school. Success of transformation depends on the ability of the leader to build a bridge between the old and the new. Transformation necessitates radical changes. New structure may require that some of the existing values, thoughts and forms of action be left. When transformation is entirely detached from former

situation, people will face difficulty in impersonating the new situation in their minds. Leader must remove that discontinuity.

School administrator must furnish sustainability by building a bridge from the point they are towards the point they aim to reach. To realize this, school administrator must put up new goals to be reached while appreciating the works of the former administrators. It will not bring it anything to the administrator to blame the former administrators. School administrator has to establish new vision on his own horizon, not on the failures of the former administrators (Orr and Sterling, 2001).

2.8. Non-Governmental Organizations - NGOs

Although we have been discussing education, at this point we have to talk about another concept, NGO, in order to better understand the efforts made to give support to education. Firstly, some definitions should be made:

A non-governmental organization (NGO) is any non-profit, voluntary citizens' group which is organized on a local, national or international level. Task-oriented and driven by people with a common interest, NGOs perform a variety of service and humanitarian functions, bring citizen concerns to governments, advocate and monitor policies and encourage political participation through provision of information. Some are organized around specific issues, such as human rights, environment or health. They provide analysis and expertise, serve as early warning mechanisms and help monitor and implement international agreements. Their relationship with offices and

agencies of the United Nations system differs depending on their goals, their venue

and the mandate of a particular institution (ngo.org, 2013).

A non-governmental organization (NGO), also often referred to as "civil

society organization" or CSO is a not-for-profit group, principally independent from

government, which is organized on a local, national or international level to address

issues in support of the public good. Task-oriented and made up of people with a

common interest, NGOs perform a variety of services and humanitarian functions,

bring public concerns to governments, monitor policy and program implementation,

and encourage participation of civil society stakeholders at the community level.

Some are organized around specific issues, such as human rights (unrol.org, 2013).

A non-governmental organization (NGO) is a citizen-based association that

operates independently of government, usually to deliver resources or serve some

social or political purpose. The World Bank classifies NGOs as either operational

NGOs, which are primarily concerned with development projects, or advocacy

NGOs, which are primarily concerned with promoting a cause.

NGOs have been partners of the United Nations since 1947. In accordance

with Article 71 of the UN Charter, NGOs can have consultative status with the

United Nations Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC). Their relationship with

entities of the United Nations system differs depending on their location and

mandate. For example, NGOs which have an information component can become

associated with the UN Department of Public Information (DPI) to help disseminate

information on the work and aims of the Organization. Many UN Specialized

Agencies operate their own accreditation programmes for NGOs which are relevant

to their area of work.

Numerous local, regional and international NGOs have played an essential role in national rule of law reform processes and at the global and international level. Some conduct research and analysis in the legal and other fields (e.g. sociology, economics) relevant to the rule of law. In many cases, they produce reports with policy recommendations, for use in their advocacy. NGOs often serve as early warning mechanisms and help monitor and implement international agreements. Others group professionals or other NGOs in specialized fields or professions into associations, networks or commissions with a view to exchanging knowledge and good practices, and facilitating the provision of rule of law assistance. Most non-governmental organizations in the rule of law field are engaged in some form of direct assistance or services, including advising on law-making and other forms of technical assistance, and/or fund and manage rule of law projects.

The International Standards Organization (ISO) is a non-governmental organization. As such, its standards are voluntary, but many of its member institutes are part of the governmental structures of their countries, and ISO standards have found their way into many laws.

Variations of NGOs include:

- BINGO (business-friendly international NGO or big international NGO); the Red Cross is one example of a BINGO.
- ENGO (environmental NGO); the World Wildlife Fund is one example of an ENGO.
- GONGO (government-operated NGO), by definition not an NGO but an organization created by a government to resemble an NGO to further some agenda.

- INGO (international NGO); Oxfam is one example of an INGO.

- QUANGO (quasi-autonomous NGO), an NGO which may have some governmental members; the ISO is one example of a QUANGO.

- RINGO (religious international NGO); the Catholic Relief Services is one example of a RINGO.

Other NGO acronyms include DONGO (Donor Organized NGO), TANGO (technical assistance NGO) and MANGO (market advocacy NGO).

The number of national and local NGOs worldwide that engage in such rule of law activities is vast but they can be categorized broadly by the type of organization.

i.Advocacy, Assistance and Pro Bono (for Public good) Services

ii.Associations and Commissions

iii.Centres of Excellence and Institutes

iv.Foundations

v.International Committee of the Red Cross

i. Advocacy, Assistance and Pro Bono Services

- Amnesty International is a worldwide campaigning movement that works to promote internationally recognized human rights for all. It undertakes research and action focused on preventing and ending grave abuses of the rights to physical and mental integrity, freedom of conscience and expression, and freedom from discrimination, within the context of its work to promote all human rights.

- ARTICLE 19 is a human rights organization with a specific mandate and focus on the defense and promotion of freedom of expression and freedom of

information worldwide. Its activities include advocacy and campaigning, research, legal analyses, drafting of model laws, and capacity-building.

- Avocats Sans Frontières ('Lawyers Without Borders' – ASF Belgium) is mostly made up of lawyers, solicitors and magistrates, aiming to contribute, completely independently, to the establishment of a just, equitable and united society, through advocacy and programmes in a range of countries.

- Global Rights is a human rights advocacy group that partners with local activists to challenge injustice and amplify new voices within the global discourse.

- Human Rights Watch is a worldwide, independent organization dedicated to defending and protecting human rights through targeted in-depth research and strategic, targeted advocacy.

ii. Associations and Commissions

- Altus is a global alliance established by 6 NGOs and academic centers around the world working to improve public safety and justice.

- American Bar Association (ABA) runs the ABA Rule of Law Initiative, non-profit program implementing legal reform programs in more than 40 countries in Africa, Asia, Europe and Eurasia, Latin America and the Caribbean, and the Middle East and North Africa.

- Comisión Andina de Juristas ('Andean Commission of Jurists') provides the Andean region (Bolivia, Colombia, Chile, Ecuador, Perú and Venezuela) with legal services in the public interest. Its mission is to contribute to the strengthening of the rule of law and democratic institutions to ensure respect for human rights.

- Commission on Legal Pluralism is an association of lawyers, anthropologists and other social scientists, representing all regions of the world and concerned with legal pluralism in both theory and practice. It issues newsletters, organizes international symposia, initiates and encourages of Regional Working Groups in different parts of the world, and organizes courses and summer schools in legal pluralism. Latin American Network on Legal Anthropology (RELAJU) is related to it and brings together anthropologists, lawyers and sociologists from and/or interested Latin-America, sharing an interest in the reality and the theoretical reflection on legal pluralism, both in societies with ethnic minorities and indigenous people and industrialized societies.

- Commonwealth Judges and Magistrates Association brings together judicial officers from over 68 jurisdictions, to promote the independence of the judiciary, advance education in rule of law, and disseminate information and literature on issues of legal process within the various countries comprising the Commonwealth.

iii. Centres of Excellence and Institutes

- African Institute for Capacity Development works towards poverty reduction in the African region through human capacity development.

- Australasian Institute of Judicial Administration is a research and educational institute working within and outside Australia to promote excellence in judicial administration by providing practical assistance and information to courts, tribunals and judicial officers.

- Carter Center's Human Rights Program undertakes a range of activities to strengthen civil, political, social, economic, and cultural rights and freedoms

enumerated in the UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights as the bedrock of peaceful and just societies.

- Centre for European Constitutional Law – Themistocles and Dimitris Tsatsos Foundation aspires to contribute to the promotion of democratic institutions and the welfare state under the rule of law through research and institution-building projects in more than 25 countries.

- Centre for Humanitarian Dialogue promotes humanitarian principles, the prevention of conflict and the alleviation of its effects through dialogue.

- Center for Institutional Reform and the Informal Sector (IRIS) at the University of Maryland, College Park, is a research and advisory center working to understand and facilitate economic growth and democratic development in developing and transition countries, focusing on the role of formal and informal institutions and rules by which individuals organize economic, political, and social activity.

iv. Foundations

- Asia Foundation is committed to the development of a peaceful, prosperous, just, and open Asia-Pacific region. Its Law Programs support Asian efforts to protect the legal rights of vulnerable groups; strengthen dispute resolution processes; and reform dysfunctional laws, policies, institutions, and practices.

- Carnegie Endowment for International Peace is dedicated to advancing cooperation between nations, promoting active international engagement by the United States and achieving practical results. Its Democracy & Rule of Law Program rigorously examines processes of democratization around the world and the United States, European, and multilateral efforts to promote political liberalization.

- Due Process of Law Foundation (DPLF) seeks to improve public policies related to the administration of justice, particularly in Latin America, and to promote the rule of law and the institutions and conditions necessary to strengthen respect for human rights in democratic societies.

- Ford Foundation is a resource for innovative people and institutions worldwide, with a view to strengthening democratic values, reducing poverty and injustice, promoting international cooperation, and advancing human achievement.

v. International Committee of the Red Cross

- International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) is an impartial, neutral and independent organization whose exclusively humanitarian mission is to protect the lives and dignity of victims of armed conflict and other situations of violence and to provide them with assistance. It was assigned by States parties to the four Geneva Conventions of 1949 and their Additional Protocols of 1977 and 2005 the mandate to protect the victims of international and internal armed conflicts.

2.9. Education NGOs

So far, I've mentioned about education, adult education, learning, monetary side of education, insufficiency of countries to provide education to their citizens. There is another point in the field of education which aims to fill the gap between state education and private education.

The educational field has been known as playing a major role in shaping contemporary society, mainly because it allows to conceptualize people's

surroundings as well as their interactions with those surroundings. However, as education intersects with politics, geography, and economics, educational outcomes become significantly different. Educational ideology is a product of culture and vice versa. In addition to these factors, the understanding of political economy's role in education is vital in understanding the variance of educational outcomes.

The language of education used by nation-states as well as international intergovernmental organizations, non-governmental organizations (both transnational and national), and agents of civil society (many of which belong to the aforementioned categories) contributes heavily to the self-identification of individuals. By understanding the language of each, we can reach a greater understanding of the multiple, conflicting, and overlapping educational ideologies employed across the globe. The issue of education on an international scale is also embedded in a complex framework of international relations which alters the effectiveness of those who employ the ideologies in a practical manner. Education NGOs differ in practice and ideology based on the previously mentioned factors. However, in the age of globalization, travel and communication have contributed to new ideas about individual identities in relation to a global - rather than national - community.

Many scholars argue that globalization, consisting of increased movement of people and goods across international borders, is contributing to the weakening of the nation-state because of the emergence of global regulatory organizations, global mass media, and the aforementioned global flow of populations (Spring, 2004).

Global regulatory organizations include the intergovernmental organizations that regulate the world economy, such as membership organizations like the World Bank and World Trade Organization, as well as other international organizations

such as the United Nations. These organizations operate within a context of global norms that are established, and laws that are passed, with the influence of non-state actors, or non-governmental organizations (NGOs). While global regulatory organizations focus on the establishment and enforcement of policies by exerting influence over the conditions of monetary loans, NGOs attempt to establish and enforce norms through exerting a certain sense of moral authority (Spring, 2004).

<u>2.9.1. Fundamental Differences in Approaching Education</u>

In his book about educational ideologies and their effects on global society, Akira Iriye categorizes all of those actors that operate outside and across national boundaries as members of a global community (Iriye, 2002). Although this does not greatly distinguish between international/transnational actors, other scholars have developed the term global civil society, including a network of NGOs that function in contrast to and sometimes competing with, the actions of nation-states. As the World Bank states on their website, "The emergence and growth of Civil Society over the past two decades has been one of the most significant trends in international development. The World Bank recognizes that civil society plays an especially critical role in helping to amplify the voices of the poorest people in the decisions that affect their lives, improve development effectiveness and sustainability, and hold governments and policymakers publicly accountable. Furthermore, the World Bank is the single largest external financier of education in the world, with "Education...at the heart of the World Bank's mission to reduce global poverty" (according to their own reports) (World Bank, 2002). The World Bank also adopts educational standards established by other international intergovernmental organizations, such as their

implementation of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)'s "Educational Sector Strategy", which establishes specific international targets for "primary education, adult literacy, and gender parity in basic education with the Education for All initiative" as well as the OECD's Development Assistance Committee goals" (World Bank, 1999).

Although many scholars, activists, and NGOs agree with targeting specific populations, they contest the motives of the World Bank based on their measurements of success. These members of civil society see the actions of the World Bank as emphasizing economic growth based on the pursuit of profits as well as the increase of consumption in developing areas, as favoring representative governments, and as supporting the privatization of educational systems (including private schools, charging tuition for government schools, and privatizing textbook production) (Danaher, 2001). Some critics, such as members of the antiglobalization movement, have gone as far as to say that the economic and environmental growth policies of the World Bank actually hinder educational development in many countries, and are, in fact, undemocratic based on the perpetuation of inequality (Spring, 2004).

2.9.2. World Citizenship

Boli, Loya, and Loftin state that globalization has had some positive benefits in their work on the concepts of global/world citizenship and civic society. According to them, the adoption by educators of the concept of a global society led to a growth in

the non-governmental (NGO) and non-profit sector; subsequently, the idea of a global citizen arose with the following characteristics:

- They know about and have contact with NGOs

- Their education orients them towards participation in NGOs

- They are people with higher education and they have the financial resources to travel

- World citizenship is more probable for people involved in social service activities and voluntary work

- World citizenship is more probable for people with a weak national identity (Boli and Thomas, 1999).

The idea of world citizenship has exploded because of recent advances in new information technologies such as the internet and its social networking sites; these provide "powerful, new opportunities to advocates to disseminate information and mobilize support" (Civicus, 1998). Furthermore, the increase in population movements and a surge in travel to world conferences (i.e. 1992 Rio Earth Summit, 1995 Beijing UN Conference on Women) has helped the operationalist relations between NGOs, further solidifying transnational networks of communication and thus, influence (Spring, 2004).

2.9.3. Human Rights Education

Human rights NGOs, the largest group of NGOs in global civil society, shift focus away from an allegiance to the nation-state, as proposed by Rousseau, to an allegiance to humanity (Keck and Sikkink, 1998). The 1996 Report of the United

Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights stressed the training, dissemination, and information efforts aimed at the building of a universal culture of human rights...through the imparting of knowledge and skills and the molding of attitudes and directed to:

i.The strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms;

ii.The full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity;

iii.The promotion of understanding, tolerance, gender equality and friendship among all nations, indigenous people, and racial, national, ethnic religious and linguistic groups;

iv.The enabling of all persons to participate effectively in a free society;

v.The furtherance of the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.

However, this report fails to address socio-economic inequalities, and is more ideological.

Teaches about:

- cultural differences, attempting to seek common ground for working for human rights
- human rights as the morality of a global civil society
- Rights based approach to adequate nutrition, shelter, health care, and employment) (Spring, 2004).

2.9.4. Environmental Education

- Speciesism

- Naturalism and Deep Ecology

- Humanism and Sustainability

- Indigenous Cultures

- Culture and Traditional Knowledge of Biosphere

- Spiritualism

- Ecotourism

2.9.5. Active Intergovernmental Institutions That Work in Education

- World Bank (WB)

- Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD)

- World Trade Organization (WTO)

- United Nations (UN)

- Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

- United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)

2.9.6. Important NGOs in The Field of Education

- Education Without Borders

- Say Yes to Education

- Civicus

- Canadian Human Rights Foundation

- Barnard van Leer Foundation

- Aga Khan Foundation

- Open Society Institute

- Agency for the Development of Women and Children (ADWAC)

- Association of Farmers, Education, and Traders (AFET)

- Youth for Understanding

2.9.7. Examples of NGOs in the Field of Education in Turkey

Education Reform Initiative – ERI (Turkish abbreviation ERG)

Turkish Education Foundation (TEV)

Human Resource Development Foundation – HRDF (IKGV)

Community Volunteers Foundation (TGV)

Turkey Education Volunteers Foundation (TEGV)

Foundation for Contemporary Living (ÇYDD)

Mother - Child Education Foundation (AÇEV)

2.10. The Factors That Influence the Performance & the Effect of Education-Focused NGOs

The research conceptual model includes some variables which are: Vision, organizational identity, experiences and capabilities, social capital, and environment. We presume that these variables represent some internal and external factors that impact on NGOs' performance.

2.10.1. Vision

Hogue defines vision as a clear picture of what can be; vision creates the focus of what collaboration can accomplish, fostering positive, creative and synergistic thinking. Hogue stated that ideally vision is created by all partners, and it should establish for partners the image of acting and working together (Hogue, 2000). As for Larwood, vision may also represent a pattern of organizational values that underlies a unique visionary pattern for an organization's future (Larwood, Falbe, Kriger and Miesing, 1995).

Building a vision is an intellectual task that requires a balance between action and reflection. Reason argued that action without reflection and understanding is blind; just as theory without action is meaningless; "it is the new way of thinking that preserve our civilization" (Reason and Bradbury, 2001).

Learning and reflection support NGOs to build their vision; Hara and Kling combine between learning and effectiveness; they stated that organizational learning is one important lens that helps us understand organizational effectiveness and organizational change (Hara, 2000).

As for Kaplan; objectives should be derived from the organization's vision; if members do not understand the vision, they are even less likely to understand the strategy intended to realize that vision; without understanding vision and strategy, members cannot adapt their work to contribute to effective strategy implementation (Kaplan and Norton, 2001)

Hogue argues that commitment and vision are double threads, overlapping and reinforcing each other. People with commitment demonstrate a spirit to make things happen; she considered that commitment is supported when each partner knows what to do, how to do it and when the work should be completed. For NGOs, one outcome is the creation of shared vision and shared ideas (Waddell and Brown, 1997).

Vision is a form of leadership in which a "visionary leader" may alter an organizational culture to bring others to understand, accept, and carry forward new plans for the organization, and vision plays a role in transformational or visionary leadership (Larwood, Falbe, Kriger and Miesing, 1995).

As a vision, some NGOs are engaged in long-term community development work, others provide short-term emergency relief in response to natural disasters (Lewis, 2001). So, vision is the resource of the current objective of each NGO, the temporary and short term goals, or long term and future goals. Therefore, the study attempts to assess to what extent the vision has an effect on the NGO individual performance, and to explore what kind of vision that helps NGO in directly contributing in education, or rather in building a shared vision and a community of practice between NGOs and with other stakeholders which may collaboratively lead to education reform.

The organizational identity unifies organizational members (Ashforth and Mael, 1989), and it has insight into the character and behavior of organizations and their members (Gioia, Schltz and Corley, 2000). Lewis defined NGOs as group of organizations engaged in development and poverty reduction work at local, national, and global levels around the world. NGOs can be large or small, formal or informal, externally funded or driven by volunteers, charitable and paternalistic or radical and empowerment-based, and one NGO might combine several of these elements at any one time.

Albert and Whetten define organizational identity as that which members believe to be central to enduring, and distinctive about their organization (Albert and Whetten, 1985). They describe organizational identity as the set of beliefs shared between managers and stakeholders about the central, enduring, and distinctive characteristics of an organization (Scott and Lane, 2000).

According to Wenger (1998); building an identity consists of negotiating the meaning of our experience of membership in social communities. As for Hogg and Terry; social identity base on intra-group interaction and processes; it is influenced by beliefs about the nature of relations between the in-group and relevant out-group (Hogg and Terry, 2000).

Values, beliefs, and meaning from the larger culture are embedded in identity. Internalization (or the culture in organizational terms) is the more salient, stable, and internally consistent character of an organization (Ashforth and Mael, 1989).

Gioia and others argue that organizational identity usually is portrayed as that which is core, distinctive, and enduring about the character of an organization. Scott

and Lane describe organizational identity as emerging from complex, dynamic, and reciprocal interactions among managers, organizational members, and other stakeholders.

On the other hand, identity influences how individuals interpret issues as well as how they behave toward them, organization's image and identity guide and activate individuals' interpretations of an issue and motivations for action on it. Those interpretations and motivations affect patterns of organizational action over time (Dutton and Dukerich, 1991.

Identity brings to the fore the issues of non-participation as well as participation, and of exclusion as well as inclusion. Our identity includes our ability and our inability to shape the meanings that define our communities and our form of belonging.

2.10.3. Experiences and Capabilities

Diversity in social practices produces substantial individual differences in capabilities. This could constitute an introduction to integrity between different NGOs, but that needs a dynamic capability in each organization to be competent with other organizations. Dynamic capabilities are often combinations of simpler capabilities and related routines which may be foundational to others (Eisenhardt and Martin, 2000).

Strategic decision making is a dynamic capability in which managers pool their various business, functional, and personal expertise to make choices that shape the major strategic moves of the firm.

Building the experience of NGOs in services of development requires review and regular factorization of prior experiences to refresh energy and result in a lesson being learned. As for Bandura, the cognitive factors partly determine which environmental events will be observed, what meaning will be conferred on them, whether they leave any lasting effects, what emotional impact and motivating power they will have, and how the information they convey will be organized for future use (Bandura, 1989).

The cognitive asset of each NGO represents the core of its capability that enhances or hinders its contribution to the community. As for Bandura, people tend to select activities and associates from the vast range of possibilities in terms of their acquired preferences and competencies; similarly, they activate different social reactions depending on their socially conferred roles and status.

2.10.4. Social Capital

Bourdieu defined social capital as "a sum of the actual and potential resources embedded within, available through, and derived from the network of relationships possessed by individual or social unit. Social capital comprises both the network and the assets that may be mobilized through the network" (Bourdieu, 1986).

Adler and Kwon define social capital as the resource that will create the environment in which different actors can move, communicate, and invest their efforts. Adler and Kwon consider social capital as the goodwill engendered by the fabrics of social relations that can be mobilized to facilitate action (Adler and Kwon, 2002).

One type of social capital is bridging views that focus on social capital as a resource inherent in the social network, tying a focal actor from one organization to other focal actors in other organizations. The other type of networking relates to the bonding views focusing on collective actors' internal characteristics. Putnam argues that bridging and bonding social capital can have powerful positive social effects (Putnam, 2000).

Fukuyama stated that social capital can be embodied in the smallest and most basic social group, the family, as well as all groups, the nation (Fukuyama, 1995). It includes both formal and informal civic groupings (UNDP, 2001).

Actors can create social ties, but the willing structure can enhance and invest these social ties that actors mobilize by creating new ties, and accordingly social ties create opportunities for social capital transactions.

Inherent personality traits mean that some persons are talented in building social capital; however, the continuity of social capital depends on social structure. Social capital sources lie in the social structure within which the actors are located; social capital is available as a function of actors' location in the structure of their social relations.

Social capital is created according to an essential feeling of trust and is a capability that arises from the prevalence of trust in a society or in a certain part of it; trust is inherited through ethical habits. A high degree of trust will permit a wide variety of social and participatory aspects of relationships (Makuwira, 2004).

According to Fukuyama, the acquisition of social capital requires habituation to moral norms of community and the acquisition of virtues like loyalty, honesty, and dependability, based on the prevalence of social, rather than individual, virtues.

Putnam states that social capital calls attention to the way in which our lives are constructed. If NGOs succeed in building social capital, that will affect the flow of information and make solidarity available to the actor. Putnam also states that social capital is close to "civic virtue"; social capital calls attention to the fact that civic virtue is most powerful when embedded in a dense network of reciprocal social relations. Again, this is the responsibility of organizations, if their structure is willing to invest the social capital that was built in creating these dense networks and discover their most powerful roles with communities and in the field of civil society that the nonprofit organizations are emerging of (Lewis, 2001).

Lesser and Storck stated that communities of practice serve as generators for social capital (Mazey and Rischardson, 2001). So, the current study represents an opportunity to discover the mutual influence between community of practice and social capital.

The study attempts to explore these factors and to explore to what extent they enable each NGO in its own individual performance. On the other hand, the research assumes that education-focused NGOs are working in the same climate, facing the same challenges, and having the same interests. These conditions of challenges, experiences, and individual performance may conduct NGOs to build together a "community of practice".

2.10.5. Environment

As for Edwards, the work of NGOs locates in the spaces that exist between communities and institutions of different kinds of legitimacy, accountability and other external relationships. They may keep a distance from the state and run their

projects parallel to those of the state, and interact closely with local government and play a strong role in local development, as they can play a role in helping certain population groups, or filling the gap in the state services, or pressing for a change in the national strategy (Clark, 2005).

Governments have an eminent role; they can open new doors for NGO activity or conversely bring a set of restrictions, or invite NGOs to have some roles with local communities. And as Lundy stated, NGOs can advocate a combination of government decentralization, devolution to local communities of responsibility for natural resources held as commons, and community participation (Lundy, 2002).

NGOs can form together and with school staff and group of interest at local level a community of practice. In community of practice, there will be multiple linkages and relationships of trust that connect the organizations involved; these relationships could be built through organizational leaders, or they could be built as institutionalized relationships with expanding activities, and for long-term partnerships (Waddell and Brown, 1997).

Community of practice is a group of professionals who share a common 'language of practice', a group of people dominated by specific field of skills and techniques (Lesser and Storck, 2001), who share a concern, a set of problems, or a passion about a topic (Wenger, Dermott and Snyder, 1998).

NGOs can learn and deepen their knowledge and expertise through apprenticeship, interacting, and mutual engagement on an ongoing basis. In this perception, communities of practice are the prime context over which the members of the group interact (Lesser and Storck, 2001), and in which they have mutual engagement, determine common sense, develop a tacit understanding that members

share, accumulate knowledge, and become bound by the value they find in learning together.

On the other hand, local community is seen as the appropriate body to carry out restoration and care, and is envisaged as being capable of acting collectively toward common interests, reconciling the conflicting interests (Leach and Mearns, 1999). Collaboration with communities and with the group of interest can hold countervailing sources of power and may become key players with other type of stakeholder (Mazey and Richardson, 2001).

With local communities, partners as individuals or entities, by working together can pool scarce resources, be considered, themselves, as a resource of information, support, and legitimacy in order to achieve a vision that would not otherwise be possible to obtain as separate actors working independently (Gajda, 2004). According to Wenger et al, communities are not confined by institutional affiliation; their potential value extends beyond the boundaries of any single organization.

In a relation with local environment, Lundy stated that NGOs are better placed for the task of fostering popular participation which includes articulating the needs of the poorest and most vulnerable groups. In their interaction with the local environment, NGOs may provide instruments which emphasize the participation of the poor (Clark, 2005).

That demands an inquiry about the different relations between NGOs, and with government, and the local communities to recognize its influence on the performance and effect of NGOs.

CHAPTER III

3.   METHODOLOGY

This study is qualitative in nature. Below, I will give information on why I have preferred qualitative research in my work.

Qualitative research is by definition exploratory, and used when we do not know what to expect, to define the problem or develop an approach to the problem. It is also used to go deeper into issues of interest and explore nuances related to the problem at hand.

I have thought it can help me to understand the feelings, values, and perceptions that underlie and influence behavior. It can also help me to identify needs of the persons concerned, to understand their perceptions of the values and messages. Qualitative research can also help me in studying emotions and attitudes in education of adults.

Field research is often used interchangeably with qualitative research to describe systematic observations of social behavior with no preconceived hypotheses to be tested (Rubin & Babbie, 1993). Hypotheses emerge from the observation and interpretation of human behavior, leading to further observations and the generation of new hypotheses for exploration (Burhanuddin, 2006). In studies of social processes of complex human systems such as families, organizations, and communities, qualitative methodology seems as the most appropriate research strategy (Reid, 1994). Qualitative methodology can also be helpful in gaining understanding of the dynamic processes, meanings, communication patterns, experiences, and individual and family constructions of reality (Daly, 1992).

Qualitative approaches also have the advantages of flexibility, in-depth analysis, and the potential to observe a variety of aspects of a social situation (Babbie, 1986). A qualitative researcher conducting a face-to-face interview can quickly adjust

the interview schedule if the interviewee's responses suggest the need for additional probes or lines of inquiry in future interviews. Moreover, by developing and using questions on the spot, a qualitative researcher can gain a more in-depth understanding of the respondent's beliefs, attitudes, or situation. During the course of an interview or observation, a researcher is able to note changes in bodily expression, mood, voice intonation, and environmental factors that might influence the interviewee's responses. Such observational data can be of particular value when a respondent's body language runs counter to the verbal response given to an interview question.

Qualitative research is inductive and aims to understand culture, process, events, meanings, and experiences within particular social contexts. The findings are bound to particular social and cultural contexts and are not generalizable to particular 'groups' and/or 'population'. Qualitative research does not aim to 'test' and/or 'prove' the researchers hypothesis. Hypothesis testing is primarily based upon the positivist paradigm; qualitative research is based upon interpretivism and constructivism.

I planned to make a research on adult education and a carry out a case study on Teachers' Academy Foundation (TAF). I made various face-to-face interviews, observed class interactions and tried to understand the concept behind all of those activities. I didn't have a specific hypothesis initially, my research is basically descriptive in character, and I aimed at showing what was going on at TAF. For those purposes, qualitative research seemed appropriate to me. Basically I will make content analysis.

3.1. Research Questions

We have two research questions:

- What are the contemporary values in education?
- How can an NGO contribute to the transmission of those values?

I conducted a pilot study and gave it to two participants (trainers at TAF). That former interview protocol can be seen in appendix A. After pilot study was carried out, by looking at the answers and comments given, I had made some changes, additions and omissions. The final form of the interview protocols existed in three formats, one given to officials working at TAF, the other given to teachers working at schools who had participated to the trainings that TAF delivers and the final form delivered to expert trainers in TAF. Those revised interview protocols can be seen in appendices B, C and D.

3.2. Context (Teachers' Academy Foundation-TAF)

The project "no limit for teachers/teaching" started in June 2008 with the protocol signed between Garanti Bank and Ministry of Education (MoE). The project basically aimed to contribute to the implementation of an educational model that thinks, questions and searches. The project made a quick start in April 2009 with a pilot study that more than 1.200 teachers and school administrators participated. Within the context of that project, 100.000 teachers, administrators and inspectors working at primary school level took voluntary in-service training on face-to-face basis and then virtual online courses without any payment in five years.

i. The Preparation Phase of the Project: 12 days training of the trainer and content development education were completed in January 2009 with Performance Learning Systems (PLS) that collaboration was made with in order to develop content of education. Team of trainers started working on developing the contents of 10 separate 90-minute trainings that would be implemented at schools. Pilot implications were held in April-May 2009 at primary state schools in İstanbul, Karabük, Bursa, Çankırı and Bolu that reflect the properties of state schools in Turkey with participation of 1.227 teachers and school administrators. Following the pilot study, revisions were made in educational content, participant files and educational management in accordance with the feedback. It was decided that the trainings would be made in the weekends as two and half day blocks (one session on

Fridays, whole day sessions on Saturdays and Sundays) and in their own physical settings at their own schools of the participants.

ii. Content: Educational content has been getting updated and developed continually under the light of the feedback acquired from field work.

"Learning Leader, The Teacher" Education Program:

Module A: Communication Skills

A.1.Introduction to Effective Communication

A.2.Effective Communication

A.3.Coping with Resistance

Module B: Classroom Management

B.1.Learning Leadership

B.2.Team Management

B.3.Continuity of the Flow and the Rhythm

B.4.Rules and Application Steps

B.5.Managing the Problematic Behaviors

B.6.Reinforcement of the Positive Behaviors

Module C: Measurement and Evaluation

C.1.Measurement and Evaluation: Basic Concepts

iii. How Are the Trainings Implemented? Voluntary schools complete their applications from the website of TAF (www.orav.org.tr). When minimum 80% of the

teachers and the administrators at voluntary schools declare in writing to TAF that they will participate trainings, then the school will become ready for the training. Accommodation and travel organizations of the expert and part-time educators are made in accordance with the number of applications in the location to be gone. Education materials and the files for the teachers who will attend to the training are sent to the school where the training will take place by TAF. Then the only thing for the attendee teacher to do is to be present at his/her school in the weekend where the training will take place.

One of the most important components of the trainings is "cooperation". For this reason, group work is one of the indispensable elements of the training. It is especially cared that every participant has the chance to work with each other during the training. Ball, clip, paper, rope, plasticine. Education bags are full of these. Teachers enjoy being child again through the activities shared and instructional games played. During the trainings, joyous chats are made at lunches and in coffee breaks. Successful participants fulfilling the face-to-face training get the certificates approved by TAF and MoE. Trainings continue as distance learning for one year by means of the user names and the codes delivered to teachers free of charge in eCampus, the virtual learning medium.

Measurement and evaluation work is given big importance as an indispensable part of the training process. For that reason, before face-to-face training starts, when the training finishes, after a while when the training ends and in later times, results of the work performed are analyzed scientifically through the questionnaires delivered to participants. The ideas of the students at schools where the trainings have been given are also evaluated as an indispensable piece of the research. Questionnaires are given to students before their teachers participate to the training and a certain period after they complete the training.

iv. Part-Time Trainers: TAF also gets Part Time Trainers in its Trainer Team amongst the persons working in the field of education and who want to develop themselves in the field of adult education in order to contribute to the development of their capacities. Increasing the colleague solidarity and contributing to establishment of professional learners society lie at the root of this practice that enables the project to reach larger groups.

TAF looks for those qualities in Part Time Trainers:

- o To have attended to "Learning Leader, The Teacher" seminars within the first project of TAF, "No Limit for Teacher/Teaching"
- o To have minimum five years of teaching experience at schools connected to MoE
- o Preferably having master and/or Ph.D degrees academically
- o Using information technologies
- o No limitation for travel
- o Adapting to flexible working hours
- o Having effective communication, critical thought, problem solving and presentation skills
- o Being leaning to team work
- o Preferably having experience on e-learning
- o Preferably having experience in adult education field
- o Preferably having attended to voluntary work before
- o Preferably knowing English

v.eCampus: One of the building blocks for the sustainability of No Limit for Teacher/Teaching Project is eCampus portal. The teachers who have completed their face-to-face trainings within the context of the project continue their trainings and interactions in eCampus via their user id and codes. e-Learning is defined as the educational and learning activities realized through internet technologies without any need to be present in the same location at the same time. In the first installation of eCampus, it was divided into three main parts by looking at the needs. The first part concentrated on socialization need of the teacher, second on the accessibility to the material that he will use at school and third on his personal development.

As of 2012, the trainers raised in e-trainer development program within eCampus started supporting their colleagues by voluntarily developing their own lessons. That program established to supply sustainability of eCampus has been developed by getting updated every semester.

3.3. Participants

I got names of the teachers who have participated to their courses from TAF. They firstly asked the teachers if they could share their personal communication information with me. And they gave the names of the teachers who have accepted TAF officials to share that information with me.

I got ten names; I firstly sent an e-mail to them giving information about what I've been doing with the attachment of the questionnaire. I mentioned I will call them later on to arrange time for an interview. For the ones whom we couldn't arrange time for an interview, we made the interviews on phone. I could only reach eight of those teachers. For the missing questionnaires, I asked two more names from TAF officials and made additional interviews with them. I also made four interviews with the expert trainers of TAF. Finally three interviews were made with TAF officials.

The names and identifying details of the participants have been changed in order to protect their anonymity.

There are basically three groups of participants:

- Teachers at schools (Teachers working at various schools and participating TAF seminars)
- Expert TAF trainers (Trainers who train school teachers)
- TAF officials (Officials responsible from management of TAF in general and making the organizations, providing finance and carrying out operations behind.)

3.4. Data Collection Procedure

I have collected data by using the questionnaires I have prepared. I have grouped the subjects into three: The first group is the TAF officials. I visited TAF headquarter in Bahçekapı and made my interviews there. Second group is TAF expert and part-time

trainers. Third group of participants is the teachers from various schools who have participated to the trainings.

I got names of the teachers from TAF officials. Before giving the names, TAF officials formerly asked the teachers if they could share their personal communication information with me. And they gave the names of the teachers who had given permission to TAF officials to share that information with me.

I got ten names, I firstly sent an e-mail to them giving information about what I've been doing with the attachment of the questionnaire. I mentioned I will call them later on to arrange time for an interview. For the ones whom we couldn't arrange time for an interview, we made the interviews on phone.

3.5. Instrument

I had prepared two research questions at the very beginning of my study:

- What are the contemporary values in education?
- How can an NGO contribute to the transmission of those values?

And to find answers to those questions, I had prepared interview protocols to be delivered to teachers, trainers and officials. (See Appendices B, C, D for those three interview protocols.) The interview protocol is basically composed of three groups of questions that can be seen below:

i. Please tell me about this organization and the work that it does.

- o Mission.
- o Goals and objectives.
- o Do you make any payments for this service? Does it have any cost for you?
- o How do you get this service? How do you reach to TAF?

The answers given for this group of questions are expected to give a general description of TAF and the activities carried out there.

ii. How would you describe your organization's major contributions?

- o How are TAF values transmitted to you?
- o Does any change take place in your behaviors at the end of that transmission process?
- o How?
- o Can you transmit those values to your students? How?

The answers given to this group of questions especially provide answers for the research questions I had prepared. Here, we try to understand what the leading values in TAF trainings are and how an NGO can contribute to transmission of those values to recipients. That is, we also get information about the target audience of TAF, their characteristics, expectations, strong and weak sides of the trainings.

iii. How and to what extent do you work with the following to accomplish your goals?

- o The business community.
- o Government.
- o Media.
- o Other NGOs.

This part of the interview protocol was only delivered to TAF officials and through the answers given for those questions, I expect to get information about external activities of TAF while performing its activities.

In the interview protocols, there are also demographic items in order to understand those characteristics of the persons taking place in TAF activities.

3.6. Pilot Study

I made appointments with TAF officials to make pilot interviews with two TAF trainers. Although at the beginning I had thought to send the interview protocols via emailing to a large number of teachers, the teachers I interviewed for pilot study suggested that I should make face-to-face or telephone interviews with the teachers.

93

For that reason I changed my plans and made face to face and telephone interviews with a limited number of teachers, TAF trainers and TAF officials. Additionally, I omitted the question asking about history of TAF since most of the teachers did not know much about TAF's history and the answers given to that question became repetitive. I consequently made some changes in the wordings of the questions and all of those changes can be seen above in the interview protocols delivered to different groups.

3.7. Credibility of Data

After preparing the interview protocols I sent e-mails to the participants and informed them about what I have been doing and the protocol content. I also told I will call them in a few days. Then I started calling the participants and tried to set a date and time for the interviews. For some of the teachers, since the schools were in scattered settlements (even out of İstanbul) and some of the teachers couldn't arrange their time for face-to-face interviews, I had to organize telephone interviews. For the rest of the participants, we mostly met in the schools the teachers work. Since tape recorder isn't used in the interviews, I read the notes I got to the teachers for the credibility of data and after they approved that, we continued. For some of the teachers I sent the written notes through emails and then got their final approvals.

3.8. Data Analysis

In this study I have preferred using content analysis, a qualitative data analysis method. Since I made qualitative inquiries, I preferred that data analysis technique would be congruent with the research design.

In content analysis, I need thematic data. To obtain that data, after completing the interviews and dictating what have been said on to the paper, I analyzed the words used by the participants. I printed out that data on the paper and then made a

study on each word in those explanations. That is, I tried to determine the most often repeated words in the sentences of that group of participants. After that, I cut each word on the paper and posted those words up to a big drawing paper in order to see and compare them. Followingly, I counted the frequencies of each word and tried to discover the themes and concepts hidden among those words. From those words, I tried to find out the leading values in TAF seminars.

CHAPTER IV

4. FINDINGS

In this chapter, I will be talking about demographic characteristics of the participants and description of TAF, activities and participants.

4.1. Demographic Characteristics of the Participants

Demographic characteristics of the participants and then the details of their professional background will be analyzed here.

Table 1. Profile of the Participants

	Position	Yrs of Exp	Age	Gender	Education	Department
		TEACHERS AT SCHOOLS				
	Position	Yrs of Exp	Age	Gender	Education	Department
ERKAN	Principal	14	35	M	University	Classroom Teaching
EDA	Classroom Teacher	9	31	F	University	Classroom Teaching
LALE	Psychological Councelor	11	33	F	Ph.D student	Counceling and Guidance
BURCU	English Teacher	14	36	F	M.A.	English Language and Literature
ZÜLAY	Classroom Teacher	10	31	F	M.A.	Classroom Teaching
ÇETİN	Principal	17	40	M	University	Public Administration
BELİZ	Academician	10	36	F	Ph.D	Educational Sciences
SUAT	Classroom Teacher	11	33	M	M.A.	Classroom Teaching
ŞÜKRÜ	Classroom Teacher	6	28	M	University	Classroom Teaching
DENİZ	Chemistry Teacher	6	30	F	University	Chemistry
		EXPERT TRAINERS				
	Position	Yrs of Exp	Age	Gender	Education	Department
YENER	Expert TAF Trainer	34	55	M	University	Classroom Teaching
VEDAT	Expert TAF Trainer	15	35	M	M.A.	Physics Teaching
ÖZLEM	Expert TAF Trainer	19	37	F	M.A.	Educational Sciences
MELTEM	Expert TAF Trainer	30	52	F	Ph.D	Sociology
		TAF OFFICIALS				
	Position	Yrs of Exp	Age	Gender	Education	Department
METİN	Operation Manager	7	32	M	University	Chemistry
NESLİHAN	Project Specialist	4	32	F	M.A.	Industrial Psychology
ATA	Portal Manager	10	34	M	University	Mechanical Engineering

i. Teachers at Schools: As can be seen in the above table, in "teachers at schools" group, there are ten teachers five of whom are classroom teachers, one counselor, one chemistry teacher, one from educational sciences and one school principal who is a graduate of public administration.

Among these teachers, Erkan has been working at this school for four months as a school principal. In 2011, when he was a coadministrator, they applied to TAF to get training due to the suggestions of a teacher who had got training from TAF formerly. After he got TAF training, he continued working with TAF and became a part-time TAF trainer, as well.

Eda has been working at this school for two years. This is the sixth school she has worked.

Lale is a psychological counselling and guidance graduate. Later on she got organizational behavior master's degree. For the time being, she is a Ph.D. student in management and organization. Besides she has participated to many domestic and foreign trainings.

Burcu has been a teacher for 14 years and this is her fifth school. She has been working at that school since August 2013. She says they initially got TAF training as school and followingly she continued courses and has become part-time TAF trainer, as well.

Zülay has been working as a teacher for ten years. This is her fourth school after working four years in Yozgat as a teacher, in R&D department of Denizli province MoE, and R&D department of Gaziosmanpaşa district MoE.

Çetin is 1994 graduate from Economic and Administrative Sciences Faculty, Public Administration Department. He has a different educational background from other teachers. This is the fifth school he has been working and this year is his fourth year at this specific school.

Beliz has a Ph.D degree and she has been working for ten years as an academician. She has been lecturing on pedagogical formation to education faculty students.

Suat has a master's degree. This is his fourth school and he has been at that school for three years.

Şükrü has been working in Siirt. This is his second school and he has been here for one year.

Deniz is a chemistry teacher at a state high school. This is her third school and she has been here for one year.

In this group, four of the participants are male and six participants are female. Their ages range between 28 and 40. The length of experience differs from six to seventeen years. All the teachers are university graduates and three of them have master's degrees and two have Ph.D. degrees.

ii. Expert Trainers: There are four expert trainers working at TAF. One of them is graduated from educational sciences, one from classroom teaching, one from sociology and the other from physics teaching.

Yener is a very experienced educator. He has 34 years of experience and he worked as a classroom teacher in primary schools and he worked in various education-based teams such as School Based Professional Development National Working Team and Teacher Competency National Working Team. He has been working in TAF as expert-trainer since 2008.

Vedat has been working in the field of education for 15 years. He was formerly an academician in Boğaziçi University, then he started working in Şişli Terakki Foundation as an Educational Technologies Specialist and after that he worked in Hisar Educational Foundation Schools as an Educational Technologies and Measurement & Evaluation Specialist. He has been in TAF for the last six years starting from the establishment of the Foundation.

Özlem worked in many different companies as education designer, educational technologist, education specialist and she has been in TAF for the last five years. She has not worked as a teacher. She formerly worked as a part-time trainer in TAF for two months, after that she became a full time expert trainer.

Meltem has an experience of 30 years as an academician. She has a sociology Ph.D. degree. She has also 12 years of experience in education faculty. She has been working since the establishment of TAF after she retired from university.

Two of the expert trainers are male, and the other two are female. Their ages range between 35 and 55. The length of experience differs from 15 to 34 years. One of the expert trainers is university graduate, two of them have master's degrees and one has a Ph.D. degree.

iii. TAF Officials: I have interviewed three TAF officials. One of them is graduated from chemistry, one from industrial psychology and the other is from mechanical engineering.

Metin is responsible from operations at TAF. He formerly worked in a bank and an insurance company. He has been working in TAF since 2007.

Neslihan is responsible from projects at TAF. She has a master's degree in psychology and she formerly worked in Koç University as a research assistant. She has been working in TAF for the last four years.

Ata is responsible from portals at TAF. He formerly worked as a teacher for seven years and he has been working in TAF for three years.

Two of the officials are male and one is female. Their ages range between 32 and 34. The length of experience differs from four to ten years. Two of the officials are university graduates and one has master's degree.

4.2. Interview Findings (Description of TAF, Activities and Participants)

In this part, I will try to understand what the participants think about research questions presented to them. Consequently I hope to make an extensive description of TAF, activities carried out there, what the participants think about TAF.

4.2.1. TAF Organization and the Work That It Does

This section tries to highlight the contemporary values in education in terms of TAF trainings and activities. In this regard I will focus on perceptions of the participants regarding mission, goals and objectives, payments and costs, and access in terms of TAF activities. I will firstly make this analysis in terms of three groups, that is, teachers, TAF expert trainers and TAF officials and then try to make comparisons among those groups of participants.

4.2.1.1. Mission

i. Teachers at Schools: In this group of teachers, it can be observed that certain themes arise out of interviews such as training, contribution, awareness, development and growth.

In the interviews almost all of the teachers mention reaching 100.000 primary school teachers as the most important goal within the framework of the project "No limit for Teacher/Teaching".

As different from the other teachers, Eda points out another perspective. She states "mission is increasing the collaboration among teachers by means of high-quality and more practical and need-focused activities."

Other teachers emphasize different aspects of the theme.

Lale, for example, talks about "raising innovative leader teachers open to learning and development."

Burcu puts an emphasis on "contributing vocational development of teachers, giving them a new perspective." Here I get similar comments regarding personal and vocational development of teachers from other participants. For instance, for Beliz, "providing teachers go through their knowledge in their academic field making them become open for growth and contributing their personal development" is the leading mission of TAF. Similarly, "contributing to the professional development of the teachers" is one of the most important statements Suat remembers from TAF trainings as the mission.

Zülay stresses the personal development of teachers. In her own words, mission of TAF is "contributing to the personal developments of teachers through in-service trainings. Within the framework of "No limit for Teacher, Teaching" project, there are two trainings. The first one is "Learning Leader, The Teacher" and the second one is "Solution-Focused Communication".

Some participants talk about the awareness levels of teachers. This word, awareness, is one of the most frequently pronounced words in the interviews.

For example, according to Çetin, "creating awareness on the part of the teacher, establishing a fellow feeling among colleagues at school and contributing their becoming more qualified." is one of missions of TAF activities.

Şükrü also talks about awareness. He says "we had thought everything was over when we were graduated from University. With the help of TAF trainings we have noticed we are unaware of the requirements of the modern times. We have been aware of our knowledge inadequacies as teachers."

And finally Deniz also stresses the concept of awareness. "By creating awareness, it enables us to feel what the students feel. It puts us into our students' shoes." Here we can see she also talks about empathy in some sense. She perceives empathy as one of the leading concept in TAF trainings.

ii. TAF Expert Trainers: In this group we can also see certain themes coming out. Training is one of those themes and there is a resemblance with the former group for that specific theme. There are also other themes such as children and investment. In this group, some sort of more technical approach to the subject can be recognized. Considering the experience level of expert trainers and that they play an important role in designing of trainings that sort of answers might be expected.

Yener, for example talks about mission as "reaching the children, giving support to the professional development of the teachers, providing them to be more competent in teaching, increasing their awareness, motivation and showing them they are valuable and valued. All trainings are school based." Here he talks about competence, motivation and giving value to teachers.

Vedat stresses "becoming a leading foundation for all the in-service trainings for teachers in the country in the following years." Here we can have an idea for the future of TAF.

Özlem states that "the most important thing to do is to provide personal development of the teachers and to be able to reach children." In this statement we can see the similarity with statements in "teachers at schools" group. Özlem talks about personal development of teachers as the mission of TAF.

Finally Meltem says "TAF was founded to invest in the future of Turkey because the best investment made for children is the one made in teachers." Here, we can see the ultimate goal in TAF activities is to reach children and they believe that teachers make up the path for that goal.

iii. TAF Officials: In this group, the concepts coming out are development, competence, children and those themes give the perspective of TAF officials.

Metin states "we are a Foundation that makes a difference for teachers, that gives priority for teachers' education and their development. We use all our sources for the accomplishment of that aim." Here it is understood that the priority is on teachers and TAF tries to contribute to the development of teachers, professionally and personally. But it is also understood that all those activities require sources since Metin emphasizes that point in his sentences.

Neslihan also talks about development of teachers as the mission of TAF. It can be seen in her own words, as well: "To support the teachers in Turkey in terms of vocational and personal development."

Finally, Ata again talks about children as the ultimate goal, very similar to Meltem in expert trainers group. As mission, he talks about "increasing the competency of the teachers for the utmost benefit of the children." From that statement, we can understand that TAF tries to reach and help children and sees the teachers as the route. For that purpose, they recognize they need to increase the competencies of teachers.

From that analysis above, it can be concluded that when one analyzes mission of TAF, he must talk about teachers, children, contribution, training and development concepts. There are similarities in three groups. On the other hand, in TAF officials group, we face with some "technical" words such as competence, vocational development in addition to those words. And we may state the mission of TAF is to contribute vocational and personal developments of teachers and children via trainings.

4.2.1.2. Goals and objectives

i. Teachers at Schools: Here the leading themes are teaching, helping and supporting, training, learning and classroom.

Teachers talk about TAF trainings and make comparisons with those of Ministry of Education.

Şükrü says "MoE trainings are insufficient. In TAF trainings we have noticed that the techniques and the theoretical information we have learnt here are applicable in classroom settings. Here, facilities for active learning and looking from the eyes of our students have been provided."

A similar statement was made by Erkan stressing the success of TAF trainings. He says "since this system is very different from the existing ones, it's very successful and the participants are so satisfied."

In Lale's statements, we can get details of that success in TAF trainings. She says "every project has different objectives. In "Learning Leader, The Teacher" Project, it's to be able to reach 100.000 teachers who have got training in communication skills, classroom management, measurement and evaluation, and also aspired for virtual training. Besides that, that project aims to raise part-time trainers." As can be seen, she talks about communication skills, classroom management, measurement and evaluation all of which are very important ingredients of successful teaching.

Starting from the end of 2013, the protocol between MoE and TAF ended and some teachers view that development as a chance to reach a greater number of teachers than 100.000. Eda states that as "since this protocol has ended, there is no limitation concerning the number of teachers to attend TAF courses. The most important contribution of TAF is colleague learning and sharing."

Helping and supporting the teachers, as an important goal for TAF and making the teachers conscious of their power and value can be seen in Burcu's words as "helping them to cope with the difficulties they face, giving value and importance to the emotions and ideas of people, helping the teachers to notice that the power is in their own hands in struggling with the problems, and supporting the teachers in the process of the development of the new generation."

Zülay, very similar to Burcu talks about vocational and personal development of teachers but she also emphasizes establishing healthy relationships with other

people out of school is very important for teachers. In her own words she says "helping teachers not only for their vocational developments but also for their personal developments and and showing them how to establish healthy relationships with people in everyday life."

In TAF trainings one other important theme coming out is increasing the communication and corporation among colleagues. In this way it is expected to increase the synergy at school. Çetin emphasizes that as "creating cooperation among teachers and groups at school and increasing the communication between the teachers and the administrators at school." In that sentence we also hear about administrators at schools. In all TAF trainings it was a prerequisite of MoE protocol until the end of 2013 that school principals had to participate the courses with the teachers at their schools and that shows the importance TAF gave to that communication between the teachers and the administrators.

Beliz also stresses personal development of teachers as one of the goals of TAF as "providing teachers go through their knowledge in their academic field, making them become open for growth and contributing their personal development, as well."

Some teachers stress the relationship between the development of teachers and development of a country and claim TAF trainings have that sort of function, as well. Suat puts that into his words as "raising teachers who contribute to the development of the country and help them develop themselves professionally and personally."

A different point of view comes from Deniz and she talks about the problems in the classrom and how the teachers will make leadership to solve them in

classroom setting. Some teachers also had talked about classroom management modules in TAF trainings but here Deniz emphasizes that as the goal of TAF. In her own words, she states it as "to enable us take early warning signals into consideration before problems exist and teach how we can organize them and make leadership to our classes."

ii. TAF Expert Trainers: In this group, we see themes such as teacher, children, capability, skill and project as the most frequently pronounced words while expressing the goals of TAF. Here, personal development of teachers, increasing the capability of teachers are similar goals mentioned by the teachers at schools group above.

Yener expresses his ideas regarding the goal of TAF by emphasizing needs and requirements of teachers. TAF uses virtual trainings as a continuation of face to face trainings and as a tool to make reinforcement for the themes studied in TAF classes. He states that as "preparing programs that will satisfy the needs of teachers. We are trying to do this both in face to face trainings and virtual internet-based trainings."

Özlem, as an expert trainer talks about the new project of TAF and the target audience at that project. Here we see TAF extends its boundaries from primary school teachers to high school teachers. In this way they will be able to reach a larger number of students, as well. Özlem states that as "we have new projects. In those projects we will also be working with state high school teachers."

Meltem again talks about development of teachers and she emphasizes communicative skills in this regard. As the goal of TAF, in her own words she sees "increasing the capability of teachers because we think it is that much better

accordingly when the professional capability and the communicative skills of the teacher get better."

iii. TAF Officials: In this group the most frequently pronounced words by the participants are teacher, trainer, training, children, education, seminars, workshops, method and competency.

Firstly, Metin talks about reaching as many teachers as possible throughout the country and in his own words, he states that as "100.000 teachers in 81 cities. We want to reach all the teachers who reach us. We never decline any teacher who comes to TAF. We have reached 79 cities until today." From that sentence, we can have an idea about the determinatedness TAF has.

From the teachers we had heard about the insufficiency of MoE trainings. TAF officials are aware of that and they try to make their seminars more enthusiastic and entertaining in order to keep attention at a higher level. Neslihan expresses that as "this sort of facilities is not widespread in our country. MoE makes some in service trainings but the teachers claim those trainings are not effective or efficient. There are locality problems in those courses and the trainers are inadequate. In TAF we are using workshop seminars and entertaining methods."

Here again we see a more technical jargon is being used by TAF officials. We had mentioned they have a higher level of experience and some have academic degrees. That technical jargon can be viewed as the reflection of that difference. Rather than making classical presentations, they use modern techniques. In this way learning and remembering capabilities of teachers increase.

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes goals and objectives in TAF, he must talk about teacher and teaching, trainer and training,

helping, supporting, projects, capability, children, education, seminars, workshops, and methods. And we may state the goals and objectives in TAF are helping and supporting the teacher and the teaching process via seminars and workshops and increasing the competency of teachers. In this way it is hoped to increase the quality of education and help the children as the ultimate goal.

4.2.1.3. Funding (Payments and Costs):

TAF meets the costs of participants regarding the trainings, their accommodation and travel expenses. To manage all these, it gets financial support of 15.000.00.-TL for the first five years and 3.000.000.-TL per year for the future. TAF officials also try to find financial support from individual and other corporate contributors.

i. Teachers at Schools: All the teachers give similar answers for that question such as "no cost on the part of the teachers attending the courses. TAF meets all the costs and expenses."

One participant expressed his ideas as "no cost for the teacher. TAF has delivered everything till writing materials and the pencils."

As different information, Beliz added that TAF trainings are delivered without any cost. But sometimes there are special seminars and although those seminars have no cost either, participants pay their own travel costs while coming to those seminars. She expresses her thought in her own words as "no cost or payment on the part of the teachers. Sometimes there are some seminars in Istanbul. People coming to participate those seminars afford their travel costs but seminars are delivered without payment."

<u>ii. TAF Expert Trainers:</u> Here, answers given by expert trainers are almost the same as those of the former group.

Özlem gave a similar answer to Beliz's. She also said "no cost for teachers. Sometimes there are some seminars in İstanbul. Those seminars are free but the teachers coming here pay their traveling expenses themselves."

<u>iii. TAF Officials:</u> Here in this group we see TAF officials talk about the money Garanti Bank donates as different from the other two groups' participants. While the participants in other groups mostly concentrate on whether they pay for the services delievered to them, TAF officials are aware of the necessity of the financial support to be able to carry out all those activities.

Metin expresses this as "Garanti Bank delivers 3.000.000.-TL every year. Besides that fund, we have corporate and individual contributors. Names can be seen on the web site."

Similarly, Neslihan adds it is a privilege for Garanti Bank, to give financial support to such an important project, a perspective no one has made a comment. She says in her own words that "no payment on the part of the teachers. On the other hand, this is very prestigious on the part of Garanti Bank."

Finally Ata states that TAF is responsible from providing the financial support for all the activities as "no funding on the part of the teacher. TAF creates its own funding for all the activities."

From that analysis above we can conclude that when we analyze funding and payments for TAF trainings, we must talk about cost and expenses, payments, teachers, funding, and Garanti Bank. And we may state that there is no payment on

the part of teachers participating to the courses and Garanti Bank and other corporate and individual contributors provide financial support for TAF activities.

4.2.1.4. Access to TAF

i. Teachers at Schools: In this part, I will try to understand how the teachers get informed about TAF and how they reach there. From the answers given in the interviews, the themes such as e-mail, telephone, call, friends, internet, intranet, and website, one can clearly understand that TAF and the participants use various communication tools and basically internet extensively.

From the answers, we also learn an 80% participation requirement for schools. For example Erkan says "when you reach TAF via telephone or e-mail, they get your contact information and return to you and give information later on. They require 80% of the teachers to participate the courses. Lists come and go. They get e-mail addresses of the teachers and send them the documents. TAF officials are very professional, functional and precise."

We also learn TAF sometimes used TV to be known to public. And we also recognize some participants are so much dedicated and they go very long distances to apply to TAF themselves rather than simply using internet and telephones. As in the case of Eda, she came to TAF headquarter in Bahçekapı from İzmit and she explains her experience as "I firstly saw TAF on TV commercials in İzmit. Then I went TAF headquarter in Bahçekapı and introduced myself to officials there. I have been working as a part-time TAF trainer. Last week I went to Doğubeyazıt/Ağrı for a TAF training." From that explanation, we also see some of the teachers are very much interested in the subject and they become part time trainers at TAF and work in the weekends for those trainings.

Lale concentrates on internet and telephone and she expresses that as "from web site and through the intranet system I can reach TAF. When necessary, I can call TAF headquarter."

In some examples, friends, other teachers from different schools, administrators may become effective in one's participating TAF trainings. In Burcu's case, we see such an example. She explains her experience in her own words as;

> "When I was working in İzmit M...S...Secondary School, one of the co-administrators was very much interested in research and development and he proposed us to participate to TAF trainings. When the school principal accepted this offer, we participated to the courses indeliberately. After we took TAF courses as school teachers, TAF sent an e-mail asking if we want to join their part-time trainer team. I firstly sent my CV, later on I had interviews with TAF officials and I have been a part-time TAF trainer since 2011."

From the answers given in the interviews, we understand teachers use internet and alternative recruitment web sites extensively. Since TAF uses modern alternative methods in the trainings devised, it also uses modern recruitment techniques, as well and it expects its potential participants and trainers to be using those modern communication channels. Zülay talks about that process in her interview and as we can see, it is a long process. She expresses it as;

> "I had prepared a CV in kariyer.net recruitment web-site and notices of compatible jobs were being sent to my e-mail address. One day I saw TAF advert and applied there. I passed the preliminary eliminations and I took an interview. After I passed those steps I got a one-week training of the trainer and participated to probationership courses five times. In the first one; I only made observation, in the second; I gave game prescripts. In the third one; I presented one module, in the fourth one; I presented three modules and finally in the fifth one I fully presented four modules (there were eight modules to be presented and we were two trainers). After fulfilling all of these steps I signed a contract. Training of the trainer course lasted for one week from nine o'clock in the morning till six o'clock in the evening. Sometimes it ran until nine o'clock in the evening. We have also virtual classes and virtual meetings to develop ourselves. During that process, one of the prerequisites was to have taken the "Learning Leader, The Teacher" training, since I had not taken it formerly, I took it before the interviews."

In some of the interviews I meet some part-time TAF trainers and from those teachers I can also learn about those processes part-time trainers use. Normally participants do not know about those processes since they come to class, listen to what the trainers explain and go back. That is why it is very interesting to hear about those details. Çetin, one of the participants in the interviews and one of those part-time trainers at the same time explains that process from his point of view:

> "One of the school principals among my friends had told they took TAF training. He mentioned about 80% participation prerequisite and following that we also applied to TAF. As a part-time TAF trainer, we also use a different system during our daily work. We point out the days when we will be available for delivering trainings in the TAF intranet system. TAF announces the programs one week before the trainings and we can see which school we shall be going. There are always two trainers and the first one makes the communication with that school, he gives information to that school via mailing and telephone calls. We explain which booklets to be hung up to walls for teachers to be informed beforehand. Box files are delivered by TAF officials by MNG cargo, one of our sponsors. As trainers we have also a trainer bag, which we bring ourselves. If we go by airplane, TAF buys the tickets, if we use buses, we firstly buy tickets ourselves and later on we get the payment back from TAF as refund of travel expenses."

Participants also state they had heard TAF trainings from their friends. They may have different aims in participating to the courses. One example comes from Beliz as;

> "I had a friend in expert team, I heard about TAF from her. I firstly participated trainings as an observer since I preferred being in the school considering that I am an academician and I've learnt a lot. It is necessary to fulfill five trainings before becoming a part-time TAF trainer. I have delivered eight trainings till today." She made use of TAF trainings as an academician at the university.

Suat also had heard about TAF trainings from one of his friends. Then, they participated to TAF courses as all the teachers in his school. He explains his experience as "I had heard from one of my friends and we also took trainings as

school in 2009. We applied through internet and they contacted with us later on."

Here again, we see they applied through internet.

In Şükrü's case, there is a different example and we see how TAF uses

alternative channels to be able to reach teachers. He explains his experience below:

"In 2011, there was an open contest of "Turk Telecom Vitamin, Teachers are Teaching". In that contest, I was among the first 50 teachers in the Turkish Language category. Those teachers had the right to participate TAF "The Learning Leader, the Teacher" trainings with their colleagues in the school they have been working. But, there was the requirement of minimum 25 participants and there were only 16 teachers at our school. I called my friends from other schools around and we took that training with 35 teachers. I have some friends still asking if that training will be made again."

Finally, there is another interesting case that shows the creativity of TAF in creating

route to reach teachers. Deniz, a young chemistry teacher at that time explains it:

"I took first TAF training when I was a candidate teacher in Sarıkamış/Kars. All the candidate teachers in the district had taken that training. TAF training was a part of candidate teacher trainings at that time. Recently there is the "Teacher's Chemistry" training and the District Directorship of MoE has sent a letter to all schools in Istanbul and voluntary chemistry teachers have participated those courses accordingly."

Here we see TAF makes cooperation with Ministry of Education offices in small

districts and make the trainings it delivers as a part of official trainings of MoE. In

this way they can broaden the range of teachers they can reach.

ii. TAF Expert Trainers: In this group, depending on their length of experience,

expert trainers have different experiences.

Yener, for example, states "I have been working since the foundation of TAF." Vedat expresses "I had seen the announcements of TAF and sent my CV via e-mail." Here we see again use of internet and e-mailing.

Özlem had heard TAF from newspapers. She states that in her own words as "I had seen a notice in Hürriyet IK newspaper. I applied and I was invited for an interview. I got training of the trainer courses."

Finally Meltem expresses she had noticed the congruity between her approach to education and that of TAF. She explains her experience as "I had retired from the university and I had 12 years of experience in education faculty. One of my friends had talked about TAF. Structured education was newly starting in those days and TAF was working in that direction. That is why I was interested and began working there."

iii. TAF Officials: For the former groups, we had asked that question to the participants as how they reach TAF, and how they get that service. But for TAF Officials group, a slight change was made since they were on the other side of the process, that is, the suppliers of service. For that reason, the question was asked as "who do you serve and how?"

Consequently, the answers given are slightly different than those of former groups. For example, Metin says they serve;

"Only the teachers and the school administrators in the state schools. Formerly we had only admitted primary schools, but today we also admit state high schools and university fourth class education faculty students. Solution-focused communication trainings have been devised for high school teachers in 2014. Those trainings last eight hours a day."

116

Here we see a new perspective. High school teachers also get accepted to TAF trainings and a new type of training, called solution-focused, is being devised for them.

TAF officials are conscious of adult education and its requirements. They can make the distinction between the teachers as adults in TAF trainings and students in regular classrooms. Neslihan expresses how she looks at that process:

> "We serve to the teachers, we have been delivering adult education training. Its dynamics are very different from that of children. We're delivering those courses to voluntary teachers. We have started delivering "The Learning Leader, The Teacher" seminars to high school teachers in 2014, as well. Voluntariness principal is very important. Adults learn something when they want to learn it. We have been working in classes of 20-25 teachers. We solve problems by our resistance breaking techniques when there are teachers who don't want to cooperate in classes."

Ata, another TAF official, emphasizes again the point that although they train teachers in TAF trainings, the ultimate target of those trainings are actually the students at schools. He states that point as "we serve to the teachers and the children. We contribute to their personal developments. We give support to teachers to make sincere and eager teaching to their students. Before TAF, I had believed teaching is an occupation, but now I have become a teacher. It's more than that."

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes access to TAF, he must talk about teachers, website/intranet/internet/email, participate, training, trainers, classes, adult education, adults, voluntariness, admit, deliver, serve, invite, interest, friend and interview. And we may state that when teachers want to reach TAF, when they want to participate to TAF trainings, they must know that those courses are voluntarily delivered, they can apply via internet and email, only the teachers are admitted and you can invite your friends, as well.

4.2.2. NGOs' Major Contributions For Value Transmission

In my study, I have tried to analyze how NGOs contribute to the transmission of values in terms of certain headings asked to the participants in different groups and make comparisons among the answers given.

4.2.2.1. How Are TAF Values Transmitted to You?

i. Teachers at Schools: In this group, the leading themes are solidarity, personality, awareness, education, training, development, growth, contribution, innovation and technique. Here, I see the teachers emphasize techniques that improve communication. For example, Erkan states, "collaboration, active participation, creativity, being open to innovation, asking questions, interrogation are the leading values of TAF courses."

Eda highlights teaching through learning side of TAF trainings. She expresses her ideas as;

> "Those values are volunteerism, brotherhood, friendship, affection, and being part of the team. As a trainer, you must internalize those values in order to be convincing and sincere during training. We try to teach through doing/living rather than reading from slides. We inspire the trainees that those activities are workable and practical. We transmit those values to them. We give examples from the techniques we use in our actual classes in order to struggle with the problematic behaviors in the classroom."

Some teachers focus on the contributions TAF trainings provide. Increasing awareness is the leading theme here and it leads to personal development, as well. Lale expresses her experience as "these contributions are awareness during the process of education, an innovative perspective towards education, using technology and accepting the other. Via symbols and sharing of corporate culture such as face to

118

face and virtual trainings, trainer manuals, booklets, e-seminars and feedback

processes." And, Burcu says "we cannot say these values are TAF's own values.

These values are the systemic information that has to be present in any educational

setting. Being a TAF trainer makes contributions to my personality and to my

network. I stroke up new friendships. There are so many "closed" persons. It's

inspiring to see the people trying to do something for education."

Şükrü also puts emphasis on awareness. He states that as;

"By increasing our awareness they have taught us that some of the techniques we
have been using in our classes may be wrong, for example, the measurement and
evaluation techniques, and the rewards we give to our students. They have done it
without making us notice what they have been doing. For instance, if the students
get used to being rewarded all the time, they don't study any more without getting
higher incentives."

With that increase in awareness, teachers notice individualities of students and they

start to make empathy with those students. Deniz talks about that point as "we

become aware of the individuality of each student in order to gain them. TAF

training manages this by putting us into students' shoes, making us think like our

students and creating an actual class atmosphere in the trainings."

In the interviews I also meet some part-time TAF trainers and learn what they

do, how they organize and how those processes work from their eyes. Zülay for

instance states that as;

"In the beginning I give my program to TAF and they can see when I'm available.
Depending on that, they inform me that I will be appointed in that specific
weekend. Sometimes I go to TAF headquarter in Bahçekapı. Giving feedback is
very important. This contributes to personal and vocational development of the
teacher. We also get coaching trainings in order to develop our coaching skills. We
observe each other with the other trainer throughout the day and give our
feedbacks at the end of the day."

Çetin, a school principal at the same time emphasizes the contribution of TAF

training to professional development. He also participates EADP program designed

for school administrators and he lays stress on some values that stand out in those

trainings. He states that as;

> "TAF has awesome contribution for my professional growth. Being part-time
> trainer also makes positive effect. It is also effective on my personal growth
> besides professional development. The other TAF project for school principals
> EADP - Educational Administrator Development Project also makes contribution
> to me. Those values are solidarity, sharing, learning camaraderie, colleague
> solidarity and fellow feeling. In trainings those values have been focused and
> delivered through applied examples."

Beliz talks about ethics and its importance in classroom settings. According to her

"these values are sort of teachings providing organization within the classroom

become better without harming the teachers' personalities in accordance with ethical

values. For example, teacher must learn not to take personally what is going on in the

classroom, or s/he must be careful not to side with a certain student in the

classroom." Ethics is one of the most pronounced words in business life but in

practice it does not work very often. In TAF trainings it is promising to hear that they

apply that theory into practice in classrooms.

Respect, discrimination, equality are important themes that shine in TAF

trainings. Suat states "being respectful for human rights, no discrimination on the

basis of sex, approaching everybody equally, privacy principle (what we talk in

trainings stay here) are important values that stand out and those values are

transmitted through applied games, discussions and interactions in the trainings."

ii. TAF Expert Trainers: For that question in the interviews the participants in the

TAF expert trainers group were asked about how they transmit those values to

teachers in the trainings. The difference in the wordings can be seen in the interview protocols above presented before. That is, the object of the question for TAF expert trainers is "the teachers" while it was "the students" in the former group.

In expert trainers group, we again see the ultimate goal is reaching the children. Yener states that as "TAF is nearly completing the process of infancy and we hope it will start walking in a short time. We are trying to reach the children and make profession of teaching become more valuable."

I also hear there are different types of trainings for personal and professional developments of teachers. These themes resemble what have been said in the teachers at schools group. Vedat tells;

> "There are three groups of trainings. First one is No Limit for Teacher/Teaching. The learning Leader, The Teacher Seminars has been continuing for five years. There is Educational Administrator Development Program – EADP. We emphasize team and group working and offer opportunities that will provide teachers a different point of view and develop themselves professionally and personally. eCampus is also the continuation of that work."

TAF tries to compensate the deterioration in learnings as time passes through using virtual education. Here he talks about eCampus which also helps for the reinforcement of what is learnt.

Özlem also puts stress on that point, as well. She emphasizes sustainability and using scientific analysis in order to make TAF trainings more valuable and "to the point". She states that as;

> "The most important value is the sustainability, that is, to be able not to leave the teacher after face to face trainings. eCampus is very important and helpful in that sense. Being open to innovation and development is another value we appreciate. We try to improve our trainings by delivering pre and posttests to teachers and students before and after the trainings. We do everything on the basis of scientific

data. The examples used in the trainings, the files we use are very detailed; they are prepared by stating the sources."

Finally in her interview, Meltem summarizes all what have been talked in this group. What she has said is as follows:

"At the very heart of it, TAF trainings are surrounded by human rights, rights of the children, the rights that have no discrimination of any sort and we expect those values to reflect on the lectures, talks and speeches of the educationalists. It is based on respect between us and the teachers here, and between the teacher and the students at school. Active learning is activity-based and student participation is as important as measurement and evaluation. Since two-day programs will not be sufficient, we design that program in a way to create maximum level of awareness. The documents delivered to teachers have properties that they can use when they return their schools."

iii. <u>TAF Officials:</u> In this group, the question was asked to TAF officials as how their work affects teachers as the object of those trainings.

TAF officials are mostly responsible from administrative and technical activities. For that reason, their answers have a more general characteristic. From those interviews, we try to understand the background of TAF, the core ideas behind the foundation of TAF.

Metin, responsible from creating funds for TAF activities says "we transmit those values during the trainings with our expert and part-time trainers. At the end of trainings, we observe we have chosen part-time trainers very well." He knows they spend so much time and money in the trainings of part-time trainers and he seems satisfied from the result.

Neslihan's explanations resemble some of the themes we have heard in the former two groups. She talks about awareness and being open to change and new ideas. She expresses herself as;

"The most important point is that the teachers do not make investment to themselves after they graduate from universities. They just try to do their best. Being a teacher is actually a state of ego. We delivered 20 hours of training to every teacher. The most important change we create is awareness. The teacher notices he may have deficiencies and he can also learn something from his colleagues."

Finally, Ata, the portal manager again talks about personal development but he adds that contributes to the development of schools in a wider perspective. He states that as "we not only give support to the development of individual teachers but the schools as a whole. We provide teacher solidarity, public spirit and support their interest towards students to increase."

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes how TAF values are transmitted to teachers, he must talk about education, training, trainer, course, teacher/educationalist, class/classroom, develop, development, growth, program, rights, support, children, students, work and eCampus. And when we talk about how TAF values are transmitted to teachers, it can be stated that TAF transmits values to teachers through the trainings and programs it operates, and in this way teachers grow personally and professionally. They can use what they learn in TAF courses in their classrooms and teach their students. Teachers can also use eCampus, the virtual training part of TAF after they complete their face to face trainings.

<u>4.2.2.2. Does Any Change Take Place in Your Behaviors At the End of That</u>

<u>Transmission Process? How?</u>

<u>i. Teachers at Schools:</u> Here the leading terms are training, classroom, student, module, teacher, eCampus, colleague, internalize, observe, skill, share, problems and change which give an idea at the beginning about what is taking place after TAF trainings.

Erkan makes a detailed explanation. He states that as;

"I made use of those trainings. I continued teaching for two more years following TAF trainings. Problems stemming from communication with some of the students expired. I learned not to exaggerate the problems. The relationships among the teachers also got better since we got the training with all the teachers at our school. We played the games at school we learnt at TAF training and our students enjoyed it. I saw smiling faces."

He talks about development in communication with the students and he adds it also works for the communication among the teachers. He expresses he can use the games in the classroom and these are all clear signs of behavioral change at teachers.

Awareness, colleague collaboration, sharing are themes frequently met in these interviews. There are many similarities in the answers among groups. Eda explains her experience as;

"I also worked in TEGEV. NGO values' being far from materiality highlights the voluntary side of this work. If I hadn't met with TAF, I would be giving lessons in my class only by interpreting the knowledge in the books and what I learned at the university. I would not be aware of the colleague collaboration and sharing. Learning from others, learning from our students, opening our acceptance window as much as possible, being purified from prejudices are very important values that TAF shares. I explain to my colleagues how to be able to stay at + / + position with the students."

Lale talks about development in communication and skills. Many teachers also talk they can use those skills in their professional and private lives. Lale states that as;

"I have internalized all the modules. I have been using them in my professional and family lives. I have gained experience in being open to communication, using body language, relationships with my colleagues, project structuring and maybe the most important of all, adult education. My adaptability and planning skills have increased."

In TAF trainings, one of the most important points is that the teacher must be open to learn from others, even from students. Burcu stresses that point as "you must want firstly, you must know how to approach, how to talk. Sometimes students can also teach something to us. Efforts in order to strengthen the communication become helpful."

Some teachers put emphasis on internalization of values in order to be successful. Zülay for example states that after TAF trainings there are behavioral changes but internalization is important. She expresses that as "yes, but you have to internalize those values in order to adapt trainings given at TAF to the classroom."

Çetin emphasizes the change in communicative skills but he is doubtful if "two-day training" can be so effective for more behavioral changes. He states that as "it is hard to observe that at the end of two-day training. I can observe that on myself since I got much training as a part-time TAF trainer. Especially behavioral changes took place in terms of communication skills."

There are different modules in TAF trainings. Beliz, an academician, explains that in detail. She says;

"For me, being in contact with the teachers professionally is very helpful. There is a classroom management module in the trainings. I can use in my own classes in the university what I get here in the trainings. Coaching training also contributes to

me academically and personally in communication skills. I've been lecturing on pedagogical formation to teachers in the university. Through TAF trainings we establish networks and for me it gives a chance to combine theory and practice together. Knowing people who come from field is very important for me. TAF has an effective organizational structure. Formerly there were 12 expert trainers but this number has decreased nowadays. There are 400 part-time trainers and 250 of them are active. This structure is very important."

Suat also emphasizes modules. He says "there are different modules such as communication, measurement and evaluation. Since there are applied examples in the trainings, we can use them directly in our classes."

In some questions in the interviews, some teachers had talked about sustainability of the acquisitions. Virtual training is very important to keep what is learnt. Şükrü explains that as;

"Especially in the first months after TAF trainings, the effect can be seen explicitly for me and my friends. But in the following months that effect gets weaker. TAF officials told us to keep The Learning Leader, The Teacher training files at our bedsides but I keep them in my library case and when I open the cover, I see the files there and remember that TAF training and remember my mistakes. I also use eCampus and I can ask my questions there and get answers. eCampus also feeds us positively."

Finally Deniz states TAF trainings help teachers change their way of looking life. She points out as "yes, it takes place. Especially when I was in Sarıkamış, I learned some things could always be done even in case of absolute impossibility. TAF trainings have managed to change our point of view."

ii. TAF Expert Trainers: For this group, there are some changes in the wordings of some questions in interview protocols. Trainers talk about the change of the teachers who participate to TAF trainings.

Yener tells teachers give feedback about the behavioral changes they feel. He expresses that as "yes, we see such changes in the behavior of teachers. We give questionnaires to teachers after the trainings and sometimes they give feedbacks themselves. They talk about the practices they use in their classes and tell they use the techniques in their classrooms they learn in TAF trainings."

Vedat states teacher responses may change from person to person. He says;

"In some teachers we observe behavioral changes. In 10% of the teachers it takes place immediately. In some of the teachers there aren't any behavioral changes. In the statistics we see those findings in the answers of the teachers and the students. We have reports published on these issues. Some teachers start behaving totally different after the trainings, some teachers change some of their behaviors."

Özlem thinks behavioral change is very fast. She emphasizes communicative skills and states he ideas as;

"Behavioral changes take place rapidly. Especially, the communication skills improve and we can even see it during the breaks in the trainings. In eCampus, in their blogs, teachers talk about responses their students give towards the words they use in their classes after they get TAF training. There are also some changes in classroom management and teachers turn back and give us feedback about these."

Finally Meltem has made a summary of what many teachers have expressed. In those trainings they aim at creating awareness rather than being able to make observable and permanent changes in behavior. She states that as "behavioral change takes place in a longer period of time. Here, we try to create awareness and awareness is the start of behavioral change. In one example, one of the teachers had told us that his students asked him if a flower pot had dropped onto his head when he returned school after TAF training."

<u>iii. TAF Officials:</u> For TAF Officials group, that question regarding behavioral change was revised as "How do you measure success (measurements and success)?" since they mostly focus on that part of the story as the administrators there.

They talk about measurement and evaluation processes they use. They state pre and post tests are given to teachers and students before and after the trainings. Metin states that as "we question it during measurement and evaluation processes. In school applications we give pre and post questionnaires to students before and after the trainings. In individual applications we can't use it."

Similarly Neslihan expresses her ideas as "we make measurement and evaluation studies on if the training is helpful or not, what about the performance of the trainers, etc. We ask questions to students randomly."

And finally I get a similar answer from Ata as "we use tests before and after the trainings given to teachers and the students."

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes change in the behavior of teachers at the end of TAF trainings, he must talk about training, teacher, student, communication, class/classroom, change, modules, diaries, internalization, understanding, listening, awareness, noticing, sharing experiences, perspective, participation, feedback, part-time trainers, feedback and behavioral change. And it can be stated that some sort of behavioral change takes place in most of the teachers, especially in the first months after the trainings. Teachers state they use the examples and games in their classes to teach the subjects better to their students and improve communication at school and in the classroom. Some teachers claim that one must internalize those values in order to be able to apply successfully. They say there are different modules in the trainings and state their awareness level

increases at the end of TAF trainings. On the other hand, as time passes, the positive experiences of TAF training tend to diminish, if the teachers don't use virtual trainings in eCampus.

4.2.2.3. Can you transmit those values to your students? How? Here the most frequent words met in the interviews are student, teacher, leadership, game, classroom, training, reflect, learn and problem. Here participants asked if they can transmit the values delivered at TAF trainings to the students.

i. Teachers at Schools: Erkan thinks he can do that. From his explanations, we can understand he uses the techniques he saw in TAF trainings. He talks about the behavior change in his students which is a sign of the answer to the question. He states that as;

> "I believe I can. We made oratorios, poem concerts in order for students to gain confidence and to encourage them to participate classroom activities and projects more. We have seen how much potential the so called "naughty" children have. We have also been nourished from the courses delivered through internet. I have seen that it reflects onto the students as the teacher improves himself. The contests and games at school helped us to gain the students with problem potential. We noticed every student is precious. Students began to come with new projects who once came to us with problems."

In addition to what Erkan has said, Eda focuses on leadership. She gives importance to leadership in the classroom and believes TAF trainings are helpful for that aim. She says that "I got "Learning Leader, the teacher" seminars at TAF when I became TAF trainer. Leadership in the classroom is very important. Sometimes we make use of the leadership of the students. We use those techniques in the process of taking the classroom leaders to our side."

Lale talks about being a role model for the students and she uses her training skills for that purpose. She expresses herself as "I can reflect my trainer skills to my students during my presentations. I think I have been a model especially in terms of communication and living together with the "different" ones."

Burcu actively uses the techniques she had seen in TAF trainings in her classroom. Empathy is one of the important themes standing out in TAF trainings. She talks about respect sentences to her students. In this way she believes she can transmit those values to them. In her words she says "I'm responsible from a class as the advisor teacher. I'm trying to make them become a team. I encourage them to make "respect sentences" to each other, to make them ask open ended questions to each other, to make empathy with each other such as asking questions "if that happens what do you feel?", etc."

Internalization of values by the teacher is one of the most important concepts we meet in TAF trainings. Zülay stresses that aspect in the interview, too and she explains that as "you have to internalize those values in order to adapt trainings given at TAF to the classroom. And we reflect them in our classes. In my school since the number of the students in the classroom is twenty, I can reflect those values easily, in that sense I feel myself lucky." From her explanation, we can understand that the number of students in a class is very important in order to be able to transmit those values. In a more crowded class, it would be harder, she thinks.

Çetin, although he does not work as a teacher, believes he can transmit those values to the teachers in the school he works. He focuses on listening and says he can solve problems easily after participating TAF trainings. He expresses himself as;

"Since I am a school principal, I neither enter classes nor deliver any courses. I can see I have positive impression on teachers. For example, when teachers or students come in front of me with problems, I can make more efficient listening. You can sometimes solve problems by just making efficient listening since the teacher can make solutions himself during that communication. We can also develop new ideas through group works with the teachers."

Beliz talks about sustainability as we have met that consideration in the former quotations. She emphasizes that although teachers learn many things in TAF trainings and use them in the classroom, they have to reinforce themselves in order to be able to sustain that effect. She explains he point of view as "I try to do so. People are affected positively in the trainings but it is hard to sustain continuity. Some teachers may be returning to their original configuration a few months later if they don't continue online trainings."

Suat concentrates on communication like Çetin. By virtue of increasing their communicative skills, they can establish good relationships not only with their students but with anybody else. He says "absolutely. For example, using positive statements to improve communication is very important and this is not limited only with our students. We can use it with the parents and with anybody."

Şükrü believes he can transmit most of those values to his students. To do that, he uses the techniques he learned in TAF trainings in his classroom. He states that as "yes, we can. We can use 80% of the games we have learnt in TAF trainings in our classes. We teach many things to students through those games. For example there is a game called "being in league with my friend" and it teaches students to move together. If you don't do that you cannot be successful in the game."

Like Şükrü, Deniz also believes she can do that in most of the cases. She focuses on classroom management module and she uses it in the classroom. She

explains her experience as "I cannot say it is done 100% but it has worked in group works in that how I organize my students, how I can evoke their interest. "The Learning Leader, The Teacher (LLT)" is a training program designed for primary school teachers, but I have concentrated on the classroom management part of that program and it has helped me."

ii. TAF Expert Trainers: In this group, teacher, student, valuable, classroom, internalize, change, understand, and transmit are the most often pronounced words in the interviews.

Here, the trainers make comments on if the teachers can transmit TAF values to their students.

Yener claims TAF trainings increase teachers' recognition of their values and that recognition reflects on their students, as well. He states that as "when the teacher perceives himself as valuable, then he sees the students as valuable, as well. Their listening and understanding skills increase and they listen and understand the students more."

Vedat also thinks that the teachers transmit TAF values to their students since they share their experiences with TAF expert trainers. He gives some examples as;

"The point is that those changes must reflect on the students. We hear from teachers when they share their experiences in the classroom with us and we can see such examples in the eCampus diaries that the teachers keep. There is an example of a teacher who involuntarily participated to the trainings at the beginning. This teacher started eCampus virtual training later on and he now mentions that in his class he uses the practices he has read in eCampus diaries that was written two years ago by another teacher. He does not complain from his students anymore. We can see from their classroom photos that his students have begun smiling. When we see students smiling, we understand some things have been changing."

Özlem talks about awareness, once more. "Teacher's awareness that he may not always be true is the starting point", she says. She explains her perspective as "we can see that in the questionnaires. To create awareness in the teacher is very important. His understanding that his perspective may not always be true, it may be necessary to change it is very important and most of our teachers notice that. We transmit those values to teachers and the teachers transmit them to their students."

In Meltem's interview, we again face with the themes awareness and internalization. She also stresses mutual learning. We can hear it in her words:

"I think the teachers can do that. But if you want to teach something, you must have internalized it yourself firstly. If you don't, you can't. If the teacher tries to change his behaviors with awareness, the students realize and notice that. The teachers have to internalize such values as respecting the student in front of him and respecting his ideas. They must accept learning something from their students."

iii. TAF Officials: In this group, the leading concepts are change, tests, teacher, student, trainer, behavior.

Since the participants in this group deal with administrative aspect of TAF, their comments are mostly based on their observations and results of measurements and evaluations they carry out.

All the three officials admit that the teachers can transmit TAF values to their students but one of them said the behavioral change may be less in the older teachers. Ata said;

"In eCampus, we get feedback from teachers and we can clearly see there is change in their behaviors. There are also some teachers who don't have any behavioral change, most of whom are very close to retirement. But there are many teachers who are influenced very much and we can see in their diaries in the web site and when we talk to them."

Metin points at the games that teachers use in their classes as a sign of transmitting what they have learnt. He states that as "yes, there are changes. The teachers tell us that they use the games we teach them in their classes while teaching math, for example. They may also use the seating order in their classes. That type of feedback comes to TAF through teacher diaries."

Neslihan also emphasizes awareness level of teachers and adds it is at the highest point in the teachers who have become part-time trainers, later on. She expresses that as;

"We make measurement and evaluation studies on if the training is helpful or not, what about the performance of the trainers, etc. We ask questions to students randomly. The findings delivered from the last tests show that the awareness level has increased, the teachers have started to listen to the class more and they try to improve themselves. Especially the teachers who have also become part-time trainers are the group who has created behavioral change the most. We choose ten teachers out of 100 to become part time TAF trainer."

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes if the teachers can transmit those values to their students, he must talk about students, teachers, leader, leadership, trainings, diaries, classrooms, internalization, understanding, listening and awareness. And we may state that when teachers try to transmit TAF values to their students as well, they must firstly internalize those values themselves in order to transmit them to their students. Some teachers say their students notice the change in their behaviors when they return their classes after TAF trainings. When the teacher perceives himself as valuable, then he sees the students as valuable, as well. They claim their listening and understanding skills increase and they listen and understand the students more.

<u>4.2.2.4. How And to What Extent Do You Work With the Following to Accomplish Your Goals? (Collaboration):</u>

This question takes place only in TAF Officials group interview protocol. That is why the answers given only refer to this group of participants.

<u>i. The business community:</u> The leading words that come out most in the interviews are sponsor, sponsorship, donation, program, project and design.

In the interviews, TAF officials mostly emphasize the importance of financial support for the maintenance of TAF activities without any interruption. In this respect, the concept of sponsorship stands out.

Metin also stresses that concept as "we get sponsorships from business community."

Although Garanti Bank is the main sponsor of TAF, officials try to find new supports from various sources. Neslihan gives another example as "on the basis of sponsorship and getting donations. For example, GP Morgan is the sponsor of Educational Administrator Development Program."

Finally, Ata also states the relationship of TAF with the business community is limited with sponsorships. He says, "it is mainly limited with sponsorships."

They consciously prefer the degree of that relationship to be limited at this level, in this way they believe they can move more independently. Ata also talks about their new project as "recently, there is a project called "Chemistry of Teaching/Teacher" and Dow Turkey applied to us and asked what they can do to improve chemistry classes of the teachers. We designed the project and they sponsored it." By means of that project, TAF could extend the number of teachers it can reach.

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes how TAF collaborates with business community to accomplish its goals, he must talk about sponsor/sponsorship, donation, program, project, apply, class, teacher, design, education, administration, improve, and development. And when we talk about how TAF collaborates with business community, it can be stated that TAF manages this collaboration on the basis of providing sponsorships and getting donations. It is a limited relationship. TAF basically designs the projects and the business community becomes sponsor for the appropriate program for their industry.

ii. Government: Here we see the words government, education, protocol, ministry, negotiation and agreement more often.

By virtue of the nature of the business TAF operates, they have to be in close relationship with the government, Ministry of Education, and local units of MoE in small districts. The target audience of TAF is the teachers at state schools, so it is necessary to establish those relationships.

In the interviews that can be seen. Metin expresses that state of affairs as;

"We incorporate with provincial directorships of ministry of education, and governors in order to get permission to deliver trainings at the schools they will give permission. Formerly we had signed a protocol with Ministry of Education and we didn't have to get individual permissions. But the protocol ended in 2013 and from then on we have been making separate negotiations to get permission."

Neslihan talks similarly. In her words, she says: "it is very hard to continue this business if you don't conclude an agreement with the government. Provincial offices of MoE and governorships are very important in that sense."

Ata, as different from the other two officials, says they have not much relationship anymore especially after the termination of the protocol with MoE in

2013. He states that situation as "almost nonexistent, very limited communication. We only visit them only to get permission to do something. Formerly when there was a protocol, we didn't do that either." But in this sentence, it can be seen that they still have to get permission from governmental bodies to conduct new trainings.

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes how TAF collaborates with government to accomplish its goals, he must talk about government, governors, directorships, permissions, education, ministry and protocol. And when we talk about how TAF collaborates with government, it can be stated that TAF incorporate with provincial directorships of ministry of education and governors in order to get permission to deliver the trainings at state schools. TAF officials state that it is very hard to continue if you don't sign an agreement with government and add that provincial offices of MoE and governorships are very important for that purpose.

iii. Media: Media, budget, agency, operation and support are the most repeated themes in this part of the study.

As a summary, it can be said that TAF almost has no relationships with media. Only Neslihan said "we don't have any budget for media operations. When necessary, we get that sort of support from the same agency Garanti Bank works with." additionally.

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes how TAF collaborates with media to accomplish its goals, he must talk about relationship, support, media, budget, operation, agency, bank and work. And when we talk about how TAF collaborates with media, it can be stated that TAF does not have any budget for media operations. They have almost no direct relationships with media.

When necessary, they get that kind of support from the same agency Garanti Bank works with.

iv. Other NGOs: We mostly meet with the words NGO, training, project, children, education and fund in this part.

Here, it can be understood that all NGOs have close relationships with each other and it is the same for TAF. From those close relationships, a synergy exists and every NGO makes use of it.

In NGO activities, they need many trainers in order to reach many people depending on the field of concentration and interest of that specific NGO. TAF basically provides training for adults and mainly training for trainers. This property o TAF makes it very important and precious source for the other NGOs since all of them require trainers.

In this respect, TAF basically provides training for the trainers of other NGOs and gets support from other NGOs in exchange. Sometimes they apply for certain projects together with other NGOs.

We can hear it from Metin as "sometimes other NGOs ask for support. Lastly, we have been delivering training to teachers within AKUT and they deliver search and rescue training to TAF staff in exchange for that. Sometimes we incorporate with universities in terms of certain projects."

Neslihan talks about congruence of goals while selecting the NGO to work with. She states "we work with NGOs whose vision and goals are congruent with ours in the field of youth, children and education. We try to create funds, make

applications for funds together. Sokak Çocukları Foundation, TOBB are examples of this sort."

Finally Ata expresses it again as "NGOs are the group we interact most. We talk to them on what we can do together. There are joint-projects, sometimes they make seminars for us, sometimes we give advises to them."

It seems cooperation with other NGOs will increase in the following years.

From that analysis above it can be concluded that when one analyzes how TAF collaborates with other NGOs to accomplish its goals, he must talk about training, project, children, education, fund, delivering, teacher, incorporate, goal, vision, seminar, work, youth, application and foundation. And when we talk about how TAF collaborates with other NGOs, it can be stated that TAF and other NGOs sometimes work together and help each other for cooperative projects. For example, TAF delivers training to trainers in that specific NGO and the other NGO gives support to TAF within its area of expertise in return. TAF officials also state they work with NGOs whose vision and goals are congruent with theirs in the field of youth, children and education. They try to create funds and make applications for funds together with the other NGOs. NGOs are the group TAF interacts the most. They talk together on what they can do together. When there are joint-projects, other NGOs sometimes makes seminars for TAF officials, and TAF officials sometimes give advises to other NGOs' officials.

CHAPTER V

5. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In this chapter, the findings of the study are discussed. In addition, conclusion and suggestions, limitations of the study and recommendations for future studies are provided.

5.1. Discussion

This study has basically examined the contemporary values in education and explored the ways how NGOs contribute to the transmission of those values. The population of the study is composed of three groups of participants; teachers at schools, Teachers' Academy Foundation (TAF) expert trainers and TAF officials. Participants in the teachers group were selected randomly from the list given by TAF. Expert trainers and the officials can also be said to be chosen randomly among the ones available at that moment due to the reason they are generally too busy with preparing and delivering seminars. Number of male and female participants is nearly the same in order to prevent gender bias. All the participants have different levels of experience and they are all university graduates and some of them have master's and Ph.D. degrees.

In the collection of the data from participants, qualitative research is preferred. The interview protocols delivered to groups basically included three questions and the data gathered from the interviews were analyzed with content analysis method.

The findings about the demographic characteristics of the participants are presented at the beginning of the findings chapter in order to get a full grasp of the participants. Below, the findings that come out of the interviews will be mentioned.

i. TAF Organization and the Work That It Does: In this section, findings considering the perceptions of the participants regarding the mission, goals and objectives of TAF are mentioned.

- o Mission

In "Teachers at Schools" group, reaching 100.000 primary school teachers is stated as a very important goal within the framework of the project "No limit for Teacher/Teaching". One of the teachers had told "mission is increasing the collaboration among teachers by means of high-quality and more practical and need-focused activities." Raising innovative leader teachers open to learning and development and contributing to vocational development of teachers, giving them a new perspective are some of the findings. Some teachers recognize the mission of TAF as providing teachers go through their knowledge in their academic field and making them become open for growth and contributing their personal development.

Some teachers believe that contributing to the personal developments of teachers through in-service trainings also helps to increase the awareness levels of teachers. This word, awareness, is one of the most frequently pronounced words in the interviews. One teacher had said "by creating awareness, it enables us to feel what

the students feel. It puts us into our students' shoes." That teacher perceives empathy as one of the leading concepts in TAF trainings.

In "TAF Expert Trainers" group, one of the participants perceives mission as reaching the children, supporting the teachers to be more competent in teaching, increasing their awareness, motivation and showing them they are valuable and valued. Personal development of teachers is also emphasized by most of the expert trainers.

In "TAF Officials" group, one participant had pointed out supporting the teachers in Turkey in terms of their vocational and personal development as the most important mission of TAF. Increasing the competency of the teachers for the utmost benefit of the children is one of the statements expressed by the officials.

o   Goals and objectives

In "Teachers at Schools" group, it is interesting to see that the teachers mention about TAF trainings and make comparisons with those of Ministry of Education.

They express their ideas as "MoE trainings are insufficient. In TAF trainings we have noticed that the techniques and the theoretical information we have learnt here are applicable in classroom settings. Here, facilities for active learning and looking from the eyes of our students have been provided." Some of them point out that the system at TAF trainings is very different from the existing ones, consequently it's very successful and the participants are so satisfied.

In teachers' statements, we can get details of that success in TAF trainings. One of them expresses in "Learning Leader, The Teacher" Project, the goal is to be able to reach 100.000 teachers who have got training in communication skills, classroom

142

management, measurement and evaluation, and also aspired for virtual training. They emphasize communication skills, classroom management, measurement and evaluation as the important ingredients of successful teaching.

Helping and supporting the teachers, as an important goal for TAF and making the teachers conscious of their power and value is expressed by many of the teachers in the interviews. They point out that vocational and personal development of teachers is very important but establishing healthy relationships with other people out of school may be more important for teachers. They claim TAF trainings support them in this respect, as well.

In TAF trainings one other important theme coming out is the increasing communication and corporation among colleagues. In this way it is expected to increase the synergy at school. Some teachers also point out that classroom management modules in TAF trainings are functional considering the problems in classrooms. They express that TAF trainings show the teachers how they should make leadership to solve those problems in classroom settings by enabling them take early warning signals into consideration before problems exist and teach how they can organize them and make leadership.

In "TAF Expert Trainers" group, we see themes such as teacher, children, capability, skill and project as the most frequently expressed concepts while expressing the goals of TAF. Here, personal development of teachers and increasing the capability of teachers are similar goals mentioned by the "teachers at schools" group above.

Trainers state that TAF uses virtual trainings as a continuation of face to face trainings and as a tool to make reinforcement for the themes studied in TAF classes.

It is stated preparing programs that will satisfy the needs of teachers is the most important goal. Increasing the professional capability and the communicative skills of the teacher is also expressed as one of the important goals of TAF.

In "TAF Officials" group, reaching 100.000 teachers in 81 cities and reaching all the teachers who reach TAF is the outstanding statement in the interviews. Also insufficiency of MoE trainings is expressed very often. TAF officials are aware of this fact and they try to make their seminars more enthusiastic and entertaining in order to keep attention at a higher level. Here again a more technical jargon is being used by TAF officials. These people have a higher level of experience and some have academic degrees. That technical jargon can be viewed as the reflection of that difference. Rather than making classical presentations, they use modern techniques. In this way learning and remembering capabilities of teachers increase.

ii. How Are TAF Values Transmitted to You: Here, the participants' views regarding the transmittance of values are dealt with.

In "Teachers at Schools" group, the teachers emphasize techniques that improve communication. Values such as volunteerism, brotherhood, friendship, affection, and being part of the team are mentioned frequently. It is stated that the trainer must internalize those values in order to be convincing and sincere during training. Teaching through doing/living rather than reading from slides is highlighted. Some teachers focus on the contributions the TAF trainings provide. Increasing awareness is the leading theme and it also leads to personal development. With that increase in awareness, teachers notice individualities of students and they start to make empathy with those students.

Ethics is another quality emphasized in TAF trainings. For example, teacher must learn not to take personally what is going on in the classroom, or s/he must be careful not to side with a certain student in the classroom. Respect, discrimination, equality are important themes that shine in TAF trainings. Being respectful for human rights, no discrimination on the basis of sex, approaching everybody equally, privacy principle (what have been talked in trainings, stay there) are important values that stand out and those values are transmitted through applied games, discussions and interactions in the trainings.

In "TAF Expert Trainers" group, the object of question is "the teachers" while it was "the students" in the former group. On the other hand, in expert trainers group, they are aware of the fact that the ultimate goal is reaching the children. One of the participants had stated that as "TAF is nearly completing the process of infancy and we hope it will start walking in a short time. We are trying to reach the children and make profession of teaching become more valuable."

The participants in this group emphasize sustainability and using scientific analysis in order to make TAF trainings more valuable and "to the point". They emphasize sustainability, that is, to be able not to leave the teacher after face to face trainings. eCampus is very important and helpful in that sense. Being open to innovation and development is another value appreciated.

In "TAF Officials" group, the question was asked as how their work affects teachers as the object of those trainings. TAF officials are mostly responsible from administrative and technical activities. For that reason, their answers have a more general characteristic. Despite that, there are resemblances regarding the themes they express with the other two groups. Awareness and being open to change and new

145

ideas and teacher's noticing that s/he may have deficiencies and can also learn something from his colleagues are among the themes mentioned in this group.

iii. Does Any Change Take Place in Your Behaviors at the End of That Transmission Process? How: In this part, findings regarding the changes, if there is any, in the behaviors of the participants after TAF trainings are analyzed.

Participants state the problems stemming from poor communication with students expire and they learn not to exaggerate the problems. They state the relationships among the teachers also got better since they got the training with all the teachers at their school. Awareness, colleague collaboration, sharing are themes frequently met in these interviews. The voluntary side of NGO work is highlighted. Learning from others, learning from students, opening acceptance window, being purified from prejudices are expressed as important values that TAF shares. The teachers state they use those skills in their private lives, as well. It is also stated that skills such as being open to communication, using body language, adaptability and planning skills have increased.

There are different modules in TAF trainings. For example, modules such as classroom management, coaching, communication, measurement and evaluation seem helpful for different teachers. Teachers use those skills in accordance with their weaknesses. Some of the teachers talk about the importance of the sustainability of the acquisitions. Virtual training in eCampus is very important in this regard to keep what is learnt.

In "TAF Expert Trainers" group, the trainers talk about the change of the teachers who participate to TAF trainings. They mention about the changes in the behavior of teachers. They state that the teachers tell them they use the practices and

techniques they have learnt in TAF trainings in their classes. The expert trainers also describe the differences in the behaviours of teachers. The behavioral change takes place differently, some teachers start behaving totally differently after the trainings, and some teachers change some of their behaviors. Briefly they state those trainings create an awareness in teachers rather than making observable and permanent changes in behavior. Since behavioral change takes place in a longer period of time, they try to create awareness and awareness is the start of behavioral change.

In "TAF Officials" group, the participants focus on measurement and evaluation processes they use. Pre and post tests are widely used and given to teachers and students before and after the trainings. Measurement and evaluation devices are used in order to determine if the training is helpful or not, whether the performance of the trainers is sufficient.

iv. Can you transmit those values to your students? How: In this part, the findings regarding the gist of the study, that is, if the students, the last recipients of that much work, can get those values effectively.

In "Teachers at Schools" group, the participants believe they can do that. They state they use the techniques they have learnt in TAF trainings in their classrooms. They encourage their students to participate in classroom activities and projects more. They express they have noticed how much potential the so called "naughty" children have. Making empathy with others is one of the values they underline in their classrooms after TAF trainings. Internalization of those values by the teacher and reflecting them in the classrooms is another theme very often expressed by the participants. The importance of effective listening and its utility in problem solving is underlined. Use of the games that have been taught in TAF

147

trainings are described as very helpful in classroom teaching. The teachers state they teach many things to students through those games.

In "TAF Expert Trainers" group, the trainers make comments on if the teachers can transmit TAF values to their students. They state that TAF trainings increase teachers' recognition of their values and that recognition reflects on their students. They also add the listening and understanding skills of the teachers increase and they listen and understand the students more. The trainers state they hear from teachers when they share their experiences in the classroom with them and in the eCampus diaries that the teachers keep.

Awareness is again stated here. Teacher's awareness that s/he may not always be true is the starting point, they say. The themes awareness, internalization and mutual learning are very often expressed by the trainers.

In "TAF Officials" group, the participants deal with administrative aspect of TAF and their comments are mostly based on their observations and results of measurements and evaluations they carry out.

All of the TAF officials believe that the teachers can transmit TAF values to their students but one of them said the behavioral change may be less in the older teachers. They state that the games the teachers use in their classes is a sign of transmitting what they learn. The increase in the awareness level of teachers is emphasized once more. In order to understand that, they make measurement and evaluation studies and ask questions to students randomly. The findings show that the awareness level has increased; the teachers have started to listen to the class more and they try to improve themselves.

<u>5.1.1. Summary of the Study</u>

In our study as the first concept analyzed, we concentrated on contemporary values in education. Some values arise as contemporary values, but we prefer using a holistic approach that includes basic concepts rather than only counting those values.

- What are the contemporary values in education?

Contemporary education is a combination of values. Those values are very important if contemporary education is intended. Today, values that are considered as contemporary are the ones which eventually make a person an individual, able to stand alone, that is, able to think, learn, decide, work, and live independently (Özden, 2010). Our study basically concentrates on learning how to learn (Knowles, Holton and Swanson, 2005) rather than on dealing with routine bureaucratic applications. It is the sine qua non of that philosophy again to bring out the intellect and consciousness, teach thinking and start an inquiry process rather than just teaching the existing information. This new approach aims to get the best of what an individual can be. In the table below, some of those values can be seen.

Table 2. Contemporary Values

Accelerating pace of change	Creation of new knowledge	Community
Personalized learning (Wheeler, 2010)	Free and open communication of ideas	Collaboration
Self-organized learning	Neutrality	Universalism
Openness (Oblinger, 2010)	Reflection	

Although those are the leading ones, we can also add other values derived from the answers given in the interviews. Those values can be seen in the table below. We had mentioned about those values in data analysis part above, under the heading "TAF Organization and the Work That It Does."

Table 3. Values That Emerge

VALUES	
Awareness	Training
Development	Teacher
Growth	Students
Teaching	Trainer
Helping	Contribute
Support	Learning
Development	Classroom
Growth	Teacher
Training	Project

As can be seen, increasing awareness, personal and professional development of the teachers and improvement in the learning conditions of students are the leading values derived in those interviews.

When contemporary values are analyzed, some concepts and themes also have to be mentioned. For example, temporality of knowledge is very important. Don Tapscott mentions about that theme as "It is not what you know that counts anymore. It is what you can learn." (Tapscott, 2013).

One of the other important concepts is decentralized management which means "every decision related with education is to be taken at school." School Centered Management can be described as autonomy and participation to decision making. In Educational Administrator Development Program (EADP) seminars that TAF organize, we can see that approach, that is, they explain school administrators that it

is very important to create a democratic atmosphere at schools where teachers can also contribute to decision making.

Some of the contemporary values come from management science. Process-oriented management is one of those contemporary values in education that comes from the field of management. Total Quality Management (TQM) proposes that focusing on processes is necessary in order to reach goals. In terms of educational administration, a process-oriented administrator is the one who sees the efforts, abilities and the performance of the teacher, who evaluates them and who encourages the teacher to cultivate himself/herself. Processes are as important as results.

This study basically concentrates on adult learning and education and what have been said so far is about adults. The theories developed in the field of adult education are inclined to differentiate what the distinguishing characteristics of adult learning are. Malcolm Knowles created a concept on adult learning which he called "andragogy" and it included a set of basic assumptions. Knowles, in his early writings, makes a clear distinction between pedagogy which is appropriate for children and andragogy which is appropriate for adults (Knowles, 1980).

According to Knowles;

- Adults must know why they need to learn it before they begin to learn something.
- Adults have more accumulation of experience as compared to children and those experiences have different qualities. Their readiness for learning correlate with their social roles and duties related with their life phases.

- Adults are inclined to problem-centered learning rather than subject-centered learning and they move with an internal motivation rather than an external one.

In TAF seminars those elements are taken into consideration during the preparation phase of seminars and later on during the presentation of courses. Another very important adult education theoretician, Brazilian reading-writing educator, Paulo Freire, views learning at the center of social transformation. Freire does not see education as something that the teacher brings into classroom with him and puts into the accounts of the students, that is, "banking concept of education." (Taylor, 1993). The assumption that learning is to be focused on producing knowledge, not on storing it and to settle what is learned into real life by passing through the walls of the classroom are among the leading ideas in the process of reshaping the education system.

- How can an NGO contribute to the transmission of those values?

The second question we are looking an answer for is how NGOs can contribute to the transmission of those values. In terms of value transmission, we see solidarity, personality, growth, human rights, and awareness. And we see programs, trainings, techniques, feedback and innovation are used for that purpose.

NGOs' being relatively independent, financially and intellectually, enable them produce new ideas and then formulate them in line with contemporary values required in modern times. In TAF example in our study, we see they firstly cooperate with international organizations such as Performance Learning Systems (PLS) in order to establish know-how and then adapt it into Turkish culture. In addition to that, NGOs also contribute to expansion of those values into society in various ways.

Again in TAF example, they make many seminars in almost all cities in Turkey without any costs on the participants. In this way, those contemporary values spread over the country through teachers and the final beneficiaries are the students.

NGOs (Narasaiah, 2007) may help policy makers on the grounds that they put light on the mission, vision, the way the values are given in those programs, what the students get from those programs and how new educational reform models should be designed. TAF cooperates with National Ministry of Education (MoE) while making seminars in state schools.

From the experiences of NGOs, other NGOs may perceive those examples as cases to be studied and use to produce their own findings. While making studies, they interact among themselves. From that interaction, a synergy may exist to create bigger and better results. Following that, other institutions out of education may also be inspired to give support to education.

In the table below, we can see the values taken from the answers given in the interviews with the participants:

Table 4. The Leading Concepts Coming out in Value Transmission.

	CONCEPTS	
	Solidarity	Program
	Personality	Profession
VALUE TRANSMISSION	Development	Feedback
	Growth	Project
	Training	Awareness
	Technique	Human right
	Contribution	Innovation
	Coaching	Friendship

NGOs can play an effective role in assisting the State to complement the public education system and to improve its effectiveness. NGO involvement in education increases the accountability of the schooling system to the beneficiaries. The NGOs can establish partnerships with the Government to share their models rather than create islands of excellence. In TAF case, we see this structure. TAF delivers seminars and courses for the teachers and administrators at state schools. The effectiveness of NGO action is best in evidence in the successful schooling of underprivileged children, communities in remote locations, and other children who face social barriers to education. NGOs can find out and accordingly suggest the respective authority that targeted actions are required for specific deprived groups, for instance, the urban poor, child workers or street children. NGOs can pioneer the concepts of the voluntary teacher and the alternative school to counter teacher absenteeism and to make appropriate education available for out of school children (Burhanuddin, 2006). In our study, voluntariness of teachers in attending TAF seminars, providing an indirect support for education of underprivileged children at rural schools support this thesis.

In TAF seminars, although training of teachers is under light, it is obvious from the findings in our study and in TAF research; students at schools benefit the most from the personal and professional development of their teachers.

i. Change in Behavior of Teachers and Students: In TAF trainings it is aimed to make a change firstly in the behavior of teachers and then in that of students. In our study we see that the following concepts come out during that process.

Table 5. Change in Behaviors.

	CONCEPTS	
	Training	Continuity
	Reflection	Modules
CHANGE IN BEHAVIOR	Leadership	eCampus
	Problem	Behavior
	Game	Internalize
	Communication	Colleague
	Classroom	Listen
	Awareness	Notice

Educators benefit from these values, reshape their courses and use those principles while developing the curriculum at schools. It is clear that the students will be the ultimate beneficiaries at the end of all those efforts. If the students can internalize those modern and contemporary values, then the society as a whole will be affected positively. In TAF case, teachers give answers confirming this statement as they use the games and examples they have learnt at TAF seminars.

In this study TAF Foundation takes an important part with its operations. It shows modern education techniques and values to teachers and leadership examples to principals in almost every school in Turkey without any payment. In this way it helps modern concepts and principles outspread in Turkey and help those personnel become close friends and share their knowledge and experiences with each other. These are representative examples of contemporary values in modern education.

Education develops and changes its nature in line with changing times, nations and values. In that fast changing environment, state schools may not be able to deliver most contemporary values and may focus on more traditional values probably due to large number of students. In fact although it's the schools that must function

as the driving force of modernism, due to financial and physical limitations, they might even become obstacles in the accomplishment of that aim.

Education is a continuous process, it starts with teachers (Knowles, Holton and Swanson, 2005), then moves to students, but it has also a cyclical nature, and teachers must continually update themselves in order to be able to stay up-to-date. Today, accumulation of information is very fast. What a person knows today becomes insufficient or out of fashion in 3-5 years. That is why, the most important duty of schools is to educate individuals who have learnt how to learn and think independently.

Being able to stay up-to-date and get the best of one's potential are among the contemporary values we have been mentioning. Teachers have a very important role for that aim. Since teachers are the leaders in their classrooms, they become role models for most of the students and students get many values from their teachers. This statement shows how important teacher education is. TAF seminars work for that aim, in those seminars, classroom leadership is one of the most underlined concepts.

5.2. Conclusion

In this study, we wanted to find out the contemporary values in education and how NGOs may contribute to the transmission of those values. At this point it is necessary to emphasize that teachers are very important considering they are the ones to improve our future. We had formerly mentioned that in the conclusion report of fifteenth National Education Supreme Council it had been advised that course subjects and teaching techniques should be arranged in a way "...to teach how to learn rather than transfer knowledge, enable students to understand the basic concepts, comment on and apply them, and to form the habit of scientific thinking and problem solution skills and behaviors." From that sentence we understand that a decentralized structure will prevail where professional control will be the dominating structure and hierarchical structures and position power will diminish in time. In all TAF seminars, this is the prevailing format and there is an open atmosphere with continuous interaction and participants learn from the experiences of others there.

In that new paradigm, teachers will be the leaders in classrooms while the administrators will be the facilitators of affairs. The administrators will be mostly responsible from creating a suitable learning climate. We had formerly mentioned that learning climate is the psychological "feel" about learning in the organization. One of the most important principles in adult learning is that adults must feel psychologically "safe" to learn. In TAF, besides seminars for teachers, there is also Educational Administrator Development Program (EADP) where school administrators participate. In that program, administrators learn how to establish that "safe" atmosphere at schools and how an effective school administrator must behave and manage school.

Adult education is one of the fast developing areas in education field. In terms of adult education, many people after graduating from university try to improve themselves mostly voluntarily and every year number of those people increases because business life develops rapidly and people recognize their education and skills become inadequate as a result of new developments.

At this point, comes a new concept, that is, who will train those people who are generally older than the "standard student." Most of the teachers graduating from education faculties get prepared for educating the students at schools at school age. They know their requirements, their developmental stages, and curriculum is designed for that kind of schooling.

When it comes to adults, there are neither any established standards, nor training centers. There are not many adult trainers, either. Here we can see there are many compelling conditions. Then comes the question of who will train the trainers of adults. Adult learners may be studying to improve their skills and qualifications for work, or to progress to further study, or they may have chosen to learn for their own personal development in their own time.

Adult learners have varied backgrounds and life experiences. They may be employed, unemployed, parents, homeless; the range is wide. They may have degrees or have left school early with few qualifications. Groups of learners therefore are not homogeneous in terms of background, age, past experiences of learning or current motivation to learn. Some will be in their twenties, others in their eighties.

At this point stands an NGO in our country, Teachers' Academy Foundation (TAF), established with the argument to train the teachers at all state primary schools. TAF aims to use those new values in education. At the very beginning they

got support from various international organizations and they adapted the data for Turkey. Initially, they had a core staff, later on they firstly trained part-time trainers and now those part-time trainers conduct most of the trainings in the field.

In this study I made interviews with ten teachers at schools, four expert trainers and three TAF officials for the interview protocols. Besides that, I also interacted with many other people, part-time trainers, one member of board of directors at TAF, and the general manager of TAF. I also participated some of the trainings carried out at some schools, in one university and finally the final presentation of TAF activities at SALT, the cultural center and the museum in Karaköy.

Throughout the study, I have been discussing the findings taken from interviews with three groups: teachers working at schools, expert trainers at TAF and officials at TAF. As a conclusion, I can say adult education is a vast area waiting to be explored. Although Ministry of Education organizes various seminars, they are not functional and effectual, as can be understood from the explanations of the teachers in the interviews. Considering the number of the teachers is very high, it is reasonable to expect aid from private sector. Here the support may come from NGOs each concentrated on various areas of education.

Teachers' Academy Foundation (TAF) is one of the most important NGOs in Turkey in this respect. It not only gives support to national education through the trainings they have devised but also helps to raise new trainers for adults through trainings of the trainer. Such attempts must be encouraged in order to increase the quality of education and consequently that of human staff in the country.

5.3. Reflections

This thesis is very precious for me for a variety of reasons. Firstly I wouldn't imagine I would dare to begin this master's program. I am 47 years old and 24 years have passed since I was graduated from Boğaziçi University in 1990.

I have been working as banker for years so it is even unbelievable for me to be able to finish that challenge. Some of my instructors are my friends from university years and some of them had been my teachers in those years, as well. I am sure it is their success to motivate me to continue and finish this program.

Especially in the field research and during this thesis, I had found the chance to know people who otherwise I wouldn't meet. I talked to many different people, learnt about their problems, and their points of view. Most important of all for me is I have met idealist teachers who try to make a change for children, for the nation, for the country. I have heard their ideas, goals, and hopes for future and I have become hopeful for our "joint" future.

Teachers' Academy Foundation has been trying to fulfill a very important duty: Preparing the future of a nation. I have known TAF officials, expert trainers and many others there. All of them are proud of what they have been doing and hopeful for the future.

The most important inference I can make is education is a lifelong process, regardless of one's age, level of education and gender. Adult education comes at that point and is there to train everyone who wants to improve himself.

5.4. Limitations of the Study and Recommendations For Future Research

Due to time and location limitations, I couldn't organize all the interviews as face to face interactions. Some of the interviews were carried out on the phone, and although I tried to ask all the questions and organize the best time appropriate for the participants, I believe face to face interview would be better for getting all the details.

Secondly, before carrying out the interviews, I had asked TAF officials to give me the names of teachers at schools who had participated TAF trainings. During the interviews, I noticed that some of those teachers at schools were part-time trainers at TAF in the weekends. The answers of those part-time trainer teachers and the "standard" teachers may differ since their points of views are somewhat different due to the trainings the former group participated.

In terms of recommendations, future researchers should keep those limitations above mentioned in mind at the very beginning and make the organization of participants accordingly. Secondly, TAF is a relatively new and fast developing NGO in the field of adult education. Considering the fact that both concepts of NGO and adult education are relatively new concepts in our country, it can be advised to follow up TAF during the following years to see the expansion of its activities. TAF is a very important organization to make studies in the field of adult education in Turkey. Other NGOs can also use TAF example as a model for themselves and design their curriculum and determine their target audience accordingly.

TAF officials are performing a very important and precious duty. At the very beginning, partly as a result of their Agreement with MoE, they had certain provisions regarding the number and percentage of the participants with regard to the total number of teachers at schools. After expiration of that Agreement, that sort of provisions have been abandoned. For future, my recommendation for TAF is making the participation as easy as possible in order to be able to reach as many teachers as possible. What they do is so important for the future of our country that it cannot be calculated by any financial means.

For teachers and school administrators, they have to attend all the seminars for their own good and for the good of their students. If possible, school administrators must encourage the teachers at their schools and support them as much as possible because all of them will benefit at the end. Maybe, school administrators should establish the first interactions with TAF Foundation.

Garanti Bank is the main sponsor of TAF. As a financial institution, their support for an NGO in the field of education is worth mentioning. Garanti Bank is also known with its former support and encouragement for many schools. They have recognized that as a duty and consciously deal with it. There are many large companies in our country and and they have large budgets for advertisement and PR activities. It can be recommended for those companies to sponsor NGOs in the field of education and education in general. By doing so they can both reach a large and conscious number of audience and invest in their future, as well, considering the students at schools today are the adults of tomorrow.

In this study, we mostly concentrated on contemporary and modern values. Those values are the ones inclined for more openness, democracy, freedom,

interaction, dialogue, equality, learning how to learn rather than memorizing and so on. Politicians dealing with education should take those components into consideration. For school administrators, using knowledge rather than position power and listening to teachers and students while making decisions can also be stated as the more popular and modern values in educational settings. Politicians who adopt those values are more likely to be longer standing and more successful as being harmonious with the Zeitgeist.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

PILOT STUDY

PILOT STUDY

Name :   Position :

Years of experience:

1. Please tell me about your background and how you came to work here.

 Prompt for:

   i.Education.

  ii.Experience.

2.Please tell me about this organization and the work that it does.

 Prompt for:

  i.History.

  ii.Mission.

iii.Goals and objectives.

 iv.Funding.

  v.Who do you serve and how?

3.How would you describe your organization's major contributions?

  Prompts:

   i.What is the effect of your work? How do you transmit TAF values to the
participants?

  ii.How do you measure success (measurements and process)? Is there any change in
the behavior of the participants at the end of that transmission process?

4.How and to what extent do you work with the following to accomplish your goals?

   i.The business community

   ii.Government

   iii.Media

   iv.Other NGOs

APPENDIX B

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL FOR OFFICIALS

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL (for officials)

Name :   Position:

Years of experience: Age:

Gender:

1. Please tell me about your background and how you came to work here.

 Prompt for:

   i.Education.

   ii.Experience.

2.Please tell me about this organization and the work that it does.

 Prompt for:

   i.Mission.

   ii.Goals and objectives.

  iii.Funding.

  iv.Who do you serve and how?

3.How would you describe your organization's major contributions?

  Prompt for:

   i.What is the effect of your work? How do you transmit TAF values to the
participants?

  ii.How do you measure success (measurements and process)?

 iii.Is there any change in the behavior of the participants at the end of that
transmission process? How?

4.How and to what extent do you work with the following to accomplish your goals?

  i.The business community.

  ii.Government.

  iii.Media.

  iv.Other NGOs.

APPENDIX C

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL FOR TAF TRAINERS

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL (for TAF trainers)

Name :   Position:

Years of experience: Age:

Gender:

1. Please tell me about your background and how you came to work here.

Prompt for:

  i.Education.

  ii.Experience.

2.Please tell me about this organization and the work that it does.

Prompt for:

  i.Mission.

  ii.Goals and objectives.

 iii.Do the teachers make any payments for this service? Does it have any cost for the teachers?

  iv.How do you get this service? How have you met/reached TAF?

3.How would you describe your organization's major contributions?

Prompt for:

  i.How are TAF values transmitted to the teachers?

  ii.Does any change take place in teachers' behaviors at the end of that transmission process?

iii.Can the teachers transmit those values to their students? How?

APPENDIX D

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL FOR TEACHERS AT SCHOOLS

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL (for teachers at schools)

Name :   Position:

Years of experience: Age:

Gender:

School:

1. Please tell me about your background and how you came to work here.

 Prompt for:

  i.Education.

  ii.Experience.

2.Please tell me about this organization and the work that it does.

 Prompt for:

  i.Mission.

  ii.Goals and objectives.

  iii.Do you make any payments for this service? Does it have any cost for you?

  iv.How do you get this service? How do you reach to TAF?

3.How would you describe your organization's major contributions?

 Prompt for:

  i.How are TAF values transmitted to you?

  ii.Does any change take place in your behaviors at the end of that transmission process?

    How?

  iii.Can you transmit those values to your students? How?

REFERENCES

1. Aber, John, et al. (2009). The sustainable learning community: One university's journey to the future. Durham, N.H: University of New Hampshire Press.

2. Acat, M.B. and Aslan M. (2012). A new value classification and values to be acquired by students related to this classification: edam.com.tr.

3. Adler, P. S. and Kwon, S. W. (2002). Social capital: Prospects for a new concept. *The Academy of Management Review*, 27 (1).

4. Akbaba-Altun, S. (2003). Eğitim yönetimi ve değerler. *Değerler Eğitimi Dergisi*, 1 (1).

5. Akbaş, O. (2007). *Türk milli eğitim sisteminin duyuşsal amaçlarının (değerlerinin) ilköğretim II. kademedeki gerçekleşme derecesinin değerlendirilmesi*. Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi. Ankara. Gazi Üniversitesi. Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.

6. Akira, I. (2002). Global community: The role of international organizations in the making of the contemporary world. Berkeley: University of California Press.

7. Albert, S. and Whetten, D. A. (1985). Organizational identity. *Research in Organizational Behavior*, 7.

8. Ashforth, B. E. and Mael, F. (1989). Social identity theory and the organization. *The Academy of Management Review,* 14 (1).

9. Aydın, M. (2003). Gençliğin değer algısı: Konya örneği. *Değerler Eğitimi Dergisi*, 1 (3).

10. Aytür, M. (1970). Kalkınma yarışı ve Türkiye. Ankara: Bilgi Yayınevi.

11. Bahr, K. (2007)., Training course on decentralized education planning in the sector of public sector reform: UNESCO-BKK. Mekong Institute.

12. Baker K. and Tomlinson, M. (2013). A new vision for secondary education: www.bloomsbury.com.

13. Bandura, A. (1989). Social cognitive theory. *Annals of Child Development*, 6: 1.

14. Barlett, Peggy and Geoffrey W. Chas. (2013). (Eds.). Sustainability in higher education: Stories and strategies for transformation. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

15. Bellows, R, Gilson and Odiorne. (1962). Executive skills: their dynamics and development. Englewood. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.

16. Boli, J. And Thomas G.M. (1999). (Eds.). National participation in world-polity organization. *Constructing World Culture:* Stanford University Press.

17. Bourdieu, P. (1986). The form of capital. In J. G., Richardson (Ed.), handbook of theory and research for sociology of education. New York. Greenwood.

18. Brynildssen, S. (2002). *Character education through children's literature*. Bloomington IN.: ERIC Clearninghouse on reading English and communication, Family Learning Association

19. Burhanuddin, Q. (2006). Role of NGOs in promoting education, conference on "Perspectives on Islamic Education in the 21st Century". India. www.academia.edu.

20. Bursalıoğlu, Z. (1975). Eğitim sisteminin yenilenmesi. *Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesinin Onuncu Yılına Armağan: 1965-1975.* A.Ü.Eğitim Fakültesi Yayınları.

21. Cicero. (2013). Yükümlülükler üzerine (De Officiis). İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, Hasan Ali Yücel Klasikler Dizisi, 1.Baskı.

22. Clark, J. (2005).The state, popular participation, and the voluntary sector. Development. *Critical Concepts in the Social Sciences* 23(4).

23. Cole, J.R. (2009) The great American university: Its rise to its preeminence, its indispensable national role, why it must be protected. NewYork.

24. Conkey, D.D. (1995). Are you ready to restructure? A guidebook for educators, parents, and community members: Corwin Press.

25. Cranton, P. (1997). Transformative learning in action: Insights from practice. San Francisco , CA: Jossey-Bass.

26. Dale, N.T. (1994). Values education in American secondary school (Online). Education Conference, Kutztown University, Kutztown. Retrieved on 10 January 2005, from
http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/13/d0/ 2b.pdf.

27. Danaher, K. (2001) (Ed.). Democratizing the global economy: The battle against the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund: Common Courage Press.

28. Dewey, J. (1937). "Education and social change", New Orleans Meeting of the John Dewey Society. New Orleans.

29. Duman, A. (2000). Yetişkin eğitimi. Ankara: Ütopya Yayınları.

30. Dutton, J. E. and Dukerich, J. M. (1991). Keeping an eye on the mirror: Image and identity in organizational adaptation. *The Academy of Management Journal*, 34 (3).

31. Earl R.Babbie, The practice of social research, Wadsworth Pub.Co. 1986, California.

32. Education and development. 2002. Washington, DC: The World Bank.

33. Eisenhardt, K. M. and Martin, J. A. (2000). Dynamic capabilities: What are they? *Strategic Management Journal*, 21 (10-11).

34. Ertürk, S. (1975). Eğitimde "program" geliştirme. Ankara: Yelkentepe Yayınları.

35. Eskicumalı, A. (2003). Eğitim ve toplumsal değişme: Türkiye'nin değişim sürecinde eğitimin rolü, 1923-1946. *Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, Cilt. 19. pp.5-8.

36. Farrar, D.E. (2006)., Process-based management: A winning strategy. Retrieved from omg.org.

37. Fukuyama, F. (1995). Trust: Social virtues and the creation of prosperity. London: Hamish Hamilton.

38. Gajda, R. (2004). Utilizing collaboration theory to evaluate strategic alliances. *American Journal of Evaluation*, 25 (1).

39. Gibbons, M. (2014). Self directed learning. Retrieved in Feb. 2014, from www.selfdirectedlearning.com. Personal Power Press International.

40. Gioia, D. A., Schultz, M., and Corley, K. G. (2000). Organizational identity, image, and adaptive instability. *The Academy of Management Review,* 25 (1).

41. Gömleksiz, M.N. (2007, Kasım). *Lise öğrencilerinin toplumsal değerlere ilişkin tutumları: Elazığ ili örneği*. Değerler ve Eğitimi Uluslararası Sempozyumu'nda sunulan bildiri. İstanbul. DEM.

42. Hanson, A. (1996). The search for separate theories of adult learning: does anyone really need andragogy? in Edwards, R., Hanson, A., and Raggatt, P. (eds.), *Boundaries of Adult Learning. Adult Learners, Education and Training Vol. 1*, London: Routledge.

43. Hara, N. (2000). Social construction of knowledge in professional communities of practice: Tales in courtrooms: Indiana University.

44. Hergenhahn, B., and Olson, M. (1997). Introduction to the theories of learning. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall. 5th Ed.

45. Hogg, M. A. and Terry, D. J. (2000). Social identity and self-categorization processes in organizational contexts. *The Academy of Management Review*, 25 (1).

46. Hogue, T. (2000). Community based collaboration: Community wellness multiplied: The Chandler Center for Community Leadership, a collaboration of the Oregon.

47. Larwood, L., Falbe, C. M., Kriger, M. P., and Miesing, P. (1995). Structure and meaning of organizational vision: The Academy of Management Journal, 38 (3).

48. Jones, K. (2012). What is the purpose of education. Retrieved from www.forbes.com.

49. Jeffs, T. and Smith, M.K. (2005). Informal education: Conversation, democracy and learning: Educational Heretics Press

50. Kaplan, R. S. and Norton, D. P. (2001). The strategy-focused organization: How balanced scorecard companies thrive in the new business environment: Harvard Business School Press.

51. Kaya, Y.K. (1984). İnsan yetiştirme düzenimiz: Politika, eğitim, kalkınma. Ankara: H.Ü.Sosyal ve İdari Bilimler Döner Sermayesi İşletmesi. Dördüncü Basım. Bölüm I.

52. Kaya, Y.K. (1991). Eğitim yönetimi, kuram ve Türkiye'deki uygulama. Ankara: Bilim Yayınları.

53. Keck, M.E. and Sikkink, K. (1998). Activists beyond borders: Advocacy Networks in International Politics. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

54. Kernan, J. (1994). Transforming and preserving education: Traditional values in

question: Educom Review. Volume 29. Number 6. www.educause.edu.

55. Kerry J.Daly, Jane F.Gilgün and Gerald Handel, 1992, Qualitative methods in family research, Sage Publication, Newyork

56. Knowles, M. (1973). The Adult Learner: A neglected species. Houston: Gulf Publishing Company.

57. Knowles, M. (1980). The modern practice of adult education. From pedagogy to andragogy. Eglewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall/Cambridge.

58. Knowles, M.S., Holton E.F. and Swanson R.A. (2005). The Adult learner. London: Sixth Edition.

59. Kuçuradi, İ. (2010). İnsan ve değerleri. Ankara: Türkiye Felsefe Kurumu

60. Larwood, L., Falbe, C. M., Kriger, M. P., and Miesing, P. (1995). Structure and meaning of organizational vision. *The Academy of Management Journal.* 38 (3)

61. Leach, M., R. Mearns, et al. (1999). Environmental entitlements: Dynamics and institutions in community-based natural resource management. *World Development*, 27(2).

62. Lesser, E. L. and Storck J. (2001). Communities of practice and organizational performance. *IBM Systems Journal*, 40 (4).

63. Lewis, D. (2001). The Management of non-governmental development organizations: An introduction, Routledge.

64. Lewis, H. M. (2001). Participatory research and education for social change: Highlander Research and Education Center. In P. Reason and H. Bradbury (Eds.), Handbook of Action Research: Participative Inquiry and Practice: Sage Publications.

65. Lickona, T. (1993). The return of character education. *Educational Leadership*, 51 (3).

66. Lundy, P. (2002). Community participation in Jamaican conservation projects. *Community Development Journal* 34(2).

67. Makuwira, J. (2004). Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and participatory development in basic education in Malawi. *Current Issues in Comparative Education*, 6 (2).

68.Marzano R., Waters, T. And McNulty, B.A. (2005). School leadership that works: From research to results. USA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

69.Maslow, A.H. (1970). Motivation and personality. Michigan: Harper and Row. Mazey, S. and Richardson, J. (2001). Institutionalizing promiscuity: Commission – Interest group relations in the European Union. *The Institutionalization of Europe*.

70.Merriam, S. and Caffarella (1991, 1998) Learning in adulthood. A comprehensive guide. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

71.Merriam, S. B., Caffarella, R. S., & Baumgartner, L. M. (2007). Learning in adulthood. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

72.Merriam, S.B. (2009). Qualitative Research: A Guide to design and implementation. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

73.Mezirow, J. (1991). Transformative dimensions of adult learning. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

74.Montaigne. (2010). Denemeler(Essais). İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, Hasan Ali Yücel Klasikler Dizisi, 20.Baskı.

75.More, Thomas. (2011). Ütopya. İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, Hasan Ali Yücel Klasikler Dizisi, 14.Baskı.

76.Narasaiah, M.L. (2007). NGOs and education. New Delhi. India: Discovery Publishing House.

77.Nizamü'l-Mülk. (2011). Siyasetname. İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, Hasan Ali Yücel Klasikler Dizisi, 3.Baskı.

78.Oblinger, D.G. (2010). Opennes: A core value for making higher education great: www.educause.edu.

79.Oktay, A.S. (2007, Kasım). *İslam düşüncesinde ahlaki değerler ve bunların global ahlaka etkileri*. Değerler ve Eğitimi Uluslararası Sempozyumu'nda sunulan bildiri. İstanbul: DEM.

80.Orr, D. And Sterling S.R. (2001). Sustainable education: Revisioning learning and change: Schumacher Briefings.

81. Ozankaya, Ö. (1977). Toplumbilime giriş. Ankara: Ankara, Siyasal Bilgiler Fakültesi Yayınları.

82. Özden, Y. (2010). Eğitimde yeni değerler. Ankara: Pegem Akademi Yayınları, 8.Baskı.

83. Özensel, E. (2003). Sosyolojik bir olgu olarak değer. *Değerler Eğitimi Dergisi*, 1 (3).

84. Patrick, M. (2012). Characteristics of visionary leadership: www.smallbusiness.chron.com.

85. Platon. (2010). Devlet(Politeia). İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, Hasan Ali Yücel Klasikler Dizisi, 20.Baskı.

86. Pop, D. (Ed.). (2012). Education policy and equal education opportunities: Open Society Foundations. www.opensocietyfoundations.org.

87. Public Advocacy: A cornerstone of democratic society. (May-June 1998). *Civicus World: Newsletter of CIVICUS: World Alliance for Citizen Participation.*

88. Putnam, R. D. (2000). Bowling alone: The collapse and revival of American community. New York: Simon & Schuster.

89. Quisumbing, L.R. (2001). The role of values education in the age of globalism and information technology: Korea Research Institute for Vocational Education and Training. www.unpan2.un.org.

90. Ratcliffe, M. (2012). What is a learning leader? Retrieved from www.mentormadness.edublogs.org.

91. Reason, P. and Bradbury, H. (2001). Handbook of action research: Participative inquiry and practice: Sage Publications.

92. Reid W., 1994. Reframing the epistemological debate. In qualitative research social work, E.Sherman and W.Reid, eds. , NewYork, Columbia.

93. Resnick, L. B. (1987). Learning in school and out. *Educational Researcher, 16*(9), 13-20.

94. Rogers C.R. and Freiberg H.J. (1994). Freedom to learn.New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

95.Rothwell, W.J. (2008). Adult learning basics, USA: ASTD Training Basics Series.

96.Rousseau, J.J. (2011). Toplum sözleşmesi(Du contrat social). İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, Hasan Ali Yücel Klasikler Dizisi, 7.Baskı.

97.Rubbin A. And Babbie E.R. (1993). Research methods for social work. Michigan: Brooks/Cole.

98.Sanver, M.R. (2013). Işığı arayanların hikayesi. Ankara: Anka Yayınları, Ankara.

99.Scott, S. G. and Lane, V. R. (2000). A Stakeholder approach to organizational identity. *The Academy of Management Review*, 25 (1).

100.Smith, R.M. (1983). Learning how to learn: Applied learning theory for adults, Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

101.Spring, J. (2004). How educational ideologies are shaping global society: Intergovernmental organizations, NGOs, and the decline of the nation-state. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

102.Sunnari, V. And Rasanen, R. (Eds.). (2000). Ethical challenges for teacher education and teaching. Oulu: Faculty of Eduction, University of Oulu.

103.Superka, D.P., Ahrens, C., Hedstrom, J.E., Ford, L.J., and Johnson, P. L. (1976). *Values education sourcebook; conceptual approaches, material analyses, and an annotated bibliography*. Colorado: Social Science Education Consortium, ERIC

104.Taylor, J.B. (1993). "Dicretion versus policy rules in practice". Carneige-Rochester Conference Series on Public Policy 39. Holland.

105.Thant, U. (1962). The United Nations developing decade. NewYork: UN.

106.Timüçin, A. (1994). Felsefe sözlüğü. İstanbul: *BDS Yayınları*

107.Tough, A. (1971). The adults' learning project: A fresh approach to theory and practice in adult learning. Toronto: OISE Press.

108.Turnet T.N. (2013). Qualities of visionary leaders: www.creativeleader.com.

109.Tusting K. and Barton D. (2006). Models of adult learning: A literature review. England: National Institute of Adult Continuing Education.

110. Tusting, K. And Barton D. (2011). Öğrenme kuramları ve yetişkin öğrenme modelleri üzerine kısa bir inceleme. Ankara: Dipnot Yayınları,1.Baskı.

111. UNDP. (2001). Egypt human development report 2001.

112. Vess, K.A. and Halbur, D.A. (2003). Character education: what councelor educators need to know. *ERIC/CASS Digest*.

113. Voleman, J. (1966). Education and political development. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

114. Waddell, S. and Brown, L.D. (1997). Fostering intersectoral partnering: A guide to promoting cooperation among government, business, and civil society actors. *IDR Reports*. 13(3).

115. Wenger, E. M., McDermott, R. and Snyder,W. M. (1998). Building communities of practice: A guide to managing knowledge: Harvard University Press.

116. Wheeler, S. (2010). New pedagogies for the digital age: University of Plymouth. www.slideshare.net.

117. Williams, D.A. (2013). Strategic diversity leadership: activating change and transformation in higher education. Virginia: Stylus Publishing.

118. Woessmann, L. and Peterson P.E. (Eds.). (2007). Schools and equal opportunity problem: CESifo Seminar Series.

119. World Bank Education: Education sector strategy. 1999. Washington, DC: The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank.

120. Yıldırım, G. (2007). *İlköğretim düzeyinde bir karakter eğitimi programı model önerisi ve uygulanabilirliği*. Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi. Ankara. Ankara Üniversitesi. Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü.

121. www.dlc.riversideinnovationcentre.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2012/10/Transformative-Learning-Mezirow-1997.pdf.

122. United Nations Rule of Law. http://www.unrol.org.

123. http://www2.uncp.edu/home/marson/qualitative_research.html

124. www.students.ou.edu.

125. www.equal-works.com.

126.www.nationalpost.com.

127.http://www.ngo.org.