T.C.
MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ
SİYASET BİLİMİ VE ULUSLARARASI İLİŞKİLER ANABİLİM DALI
ULUSLARARASI İLİŞKİLER(ING) BİLİM DALI

THE INSTRUMENTS OF SOFT POWER WITHIN TURKISH FOREIGN POLICY IN THE POST- COLD WAR ERA:

TURKISH INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT AGENCY (TIKA) AS A CASE OF TURKEY'S SOFT POWER APPLICATION

Yüksek Lisans Tezi

ESRA ERGUVAN

Istanbul, 2010

T.C.
MARMARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ
SOSYAL BİLİMLER ENSTİTÜSÜ
SİYASET BİLİMİ VE ULUSLARARASI İLİŞKİLER ANABİLİM DALI
ULUSLARARASI İLİŞKİLER(ING) BİLİM DALI

THE INSTRUMENTS OF SOFT POWER WITHIN TURKISH FOREIGN POLICY IN THE POST- COLD WAR ERA:

TURKISH INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT AGENCY (TIKA) AS A CASE OF TURKEY'S SOFT POWER APPLICATION

Yüksek Lisans Tezi

ESRA ERGUVAN

Danışman: YRD. DOÇ. DR. İBRAHİM MAZLUM

Istanbul, 2010

Tez Onay Belgesi

SİYASET BİLİMİ VE ULUSLAR ARASI İLİŞ. Anabilim Dalı ULUSLARARASI İLİŞKİLER(ING) Bilim Dalı Yüksek Lisans öğrencisi ESRA ERGUVAN nın THE INSTRUMENTS OF SOFT POWER WITHIN TURKISH FOREIGN POLICY IN THE POST- COLD WAR ERA: TURKISH INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT AGENCY (TİKA) AS A CASE OF TURKEY'S SOFT POWER APPLICATION adlı tez çalışması ,Enstitümüz Yönetim Kurulunun 19.07.2010 tarih ve 2010-14/19 sayılı kararıyla oluşturulan jüri tarafından oybirliği/oyçokluğu ile Yüksek Lisans Tezi olarak kabul edilmiştir.

	Öğretim Üyesi Adı Soyadı	**İmzası**
Tez Savunma Tarihi : 25.08.2010		
1) Tez Danışmanı :	YRD. DOÇ.DR. İBRAHİM MAZLUM	
2) Jüri Üyesi :	DOÇ. DR. AYŞEGÜL SEVER	
3) Jüri Üyesi :	DOÇ. DR. ÖZDEN OKTAV	

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

ABSTRACT

The world history has various periods in which tremendous changes took place. The Cold War was one of the most important periods in the world politics due to the complexity of the events and the characteristics of the political actors shaped by the bipolar structure of the world. Furthermore, the end of the Cold War was also of cardinal importance, since the 45 years of bipolarity and the block politics were replaced with a new period which has much different characteristics. With the end of the Cold War, new sets of relations among countries were established while new groups of threats also emerged. These new post-Cold War threats appeared to require new sets of solutions than that of the Cold War. In this context, the theory and instruments of soft power began to be discussed intensively and applied by a number of countries in addition to the classical hard power measures.

In line with these discussions, the main dimensions of Turkey's soft power capabilities and several instruments of soft power were elaborated in this thesis while observing the relations between Turkey and the regional countries during the periods of the Cold War and the post-Cold War as a continuum. Moreover, Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA) and the role of its projects implemented in several regions all over the world, are examined as the sources of Turkey's soft power. TIKA has several duties and responsibilities in the international development assistance community. The linkage between the concepts and sources of Turkey's soft power and TIKA's projects and their outcomes in the recipient countries is analyzed in the thesis in order to answer the question of whether TIKA has a role in wielding Turkey's soft power.

Key Words: Cold War, Post-Cold War, Soft Power, Development Assistance, Turkish Foreign Policy, Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA)

Advisor: Assistant Professor İbrahim MAZLUM

Page: 173

ÖZ

Dünya tarihi pek çok köklü değişikliğin yaşandığı çeşitli dönemi içermektedir. Soğuk Savaş dönemi de, iki kutuplu dünyanın bir sonucu olarak yaşanan olayların karmaşıklığı ve siyasi aktörlerin karakteristiği dolayısıyla dünya politikası açısından büyük önem taşımaktadır. Ayrıca, Soğuk Savaş sonrası dönem de, 45 yıllık iki kutuplu Soğuk Savaş dönemine oranla büyük farklar barındırdığından büyük önem arz etmektedir. Bununla birlikte, Soğuk Savaş'ın sona ermesiyle ülkeler arasındaki ilişkilerin boyutu değişirken, yeni tür tehditlerin de ortaya çıktığı gözlenmektedir. Dahası, bu yeni tür tehditlerin, Soğuk Savaş dönemine göre çok farklı çözümler gerektirdiği de ortaya çıkmıştır. Bu doğrultuda, klasik sert güç enstrümanlarına ek olarak, ülkeler tarafından yumuşak güç enstrümanlarının da tartışmaya açıldığı ve uygulamaya geçirildiği görülmektedir.

Yukarıda sözü edilenler ışığında, bu çalışmada Soğuk Savaş ve sonrasında Türkiye ve bölge ülkeleri arasındaki ilişkiler ve Türkiye'nin yumuşak güç güç kapasitesi ile enstrümanlarının temel boyutu incelenmiştir. Türk İşbirliği ve Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığı (TİKA) ve kurumun dünya üzerinde pek çok bölgede uygulanan projelerinin Türkiye'nin yumuşak gücüne katkısı araştırılmıştır. Yeni bir oluşum olarak, TİKA'nın uluslararası kalkınma yardımları toplumunda pek çok görev ve sorumluluklarının bulunduğu ortadadır. Bu sebeple, TİKA'nın Türkiye'nin yumuşak gücüne katkısının olup olmadığı sorusuna yanıt vermek amacıyla, TİKA projeleri ve bu projelerin yardım alan ülkelerdeki izdüşümleriyle Türkiye'deki yumuşak güç kavramı ve yumuşak güç enstrümanları arasındaki ilişki derinlemesine incelenmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Soğuk Savaş, Soğuk Savaş Sonrası, Yumuşak Güç, Kalkınma Yardımları, Türk Dış Politikası, Türk İşbirliği ve Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığı (TİKA)

Danışman: Yrd.Doç Dr. İbrahim MAZLUM

Sayfa: 173

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	The Asian Development Bank
AECID	Spanish Agency for International Development Cooperation
AfDB	African Development Bank
CARE	Cooperative for American Remittances to Europe
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CSCP	Caucasus Stability and Cooperation Platform
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
GAP	Güneydoğu Anadolu Projesi (Southeastern Anatolia Project)
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
IDA	International Development Association
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IMF	International Monetary Fund
JDP	Justice and Development Party (Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi)
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
OAS	Organization for American States
ODA	Official Development Aids
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
OEEC	Organization for European Economic Cooperation
OIC	Organization of the Islamic Conference
OPEC	Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries
Oxfam	Oxford Committee for Famine Relief
PPA	Participatory Power Assessment
RPP	Republican Peoples' Party
SALs	Structural Adjustment Loans
SIDA	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
SSC	The South-South Cooperation
TIKA	Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency
TRT	Turkish Radio and Television Corporation
UNDG	The United Nations Organization
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USAID	The U.S. Agency for International Development
WMD	Weapons of Mass Destruction

INTRODUCTION

World history is divided by several periods including numerous socio-political, economical and military relations and conflicts between countries. Although the written history of the mankind can be traced starting from the very early times, the 19th and 20st centuries can be differentiated from the other centuries by various aspects. With the rise of the nation states starting from the 19th century, different than the previous ruling party's attitude of establishing its source of legitimacy in relation with the religious assets, nation states preferred a more secular approach towards the governmental processes. Also shared cultural and political backgrounds backed by the common geography in which the citizens live, appear to be important assets of nation states. Additionally, the industrial and technological developments created numerous improvements and concerns in terms of economic and socio-political aspects. Furthermore, in addition to the numerous important developments in the 19th century, the 20th century and the early 21st centuries had witnessed several developments and events, as well. Two world wars followed by a long Cold War (which ended in 1989), major revolutions in Russia, China and Iran and many smaller upheavals in several regions, the advent of the nuclear age, unprecedented population growth, which, along with intensifying global industrialization as well as causing environmental issues which appear as global problems; can be listed as important cornerstones in the century.

As the two world wars played important roles in the evolution of the world structure and countries' foreign policy making, the Cold War era which had started immediately after the World War II was of primary importance. According to David S. Painter, "understanding the Cold War is central to understanding the history of the second half of the twentieth century."[1] During the Cold War the world was divided into two separate blocks as the Western bloc under the leadership of the USA and the Eastern bloc under the leadership of the Soviet Union. Although several events had taken place in the course of the 45 years-old Cold War era, the ideologies which have been supported by both blocs and the threat of use of nuclear weapons become the most important points of focus. Moreover, the world seemed to be divided into two in terms of its economic structure, since both blocs were supporting different processes for their economies.

---

[1] David. S. Painter, **Cold War: An Interdisciplinary History**, London: Routledge,1999, p.1.

Additionally, although no military conflicts were realized between the USA and the Soviet Union, both blocs were increasing their military expenditures in terms of conventional and nuclear weapons. In other words, the hard coercive power appeared to be the most important asset for the countries in the Cold War era.

Despite the importance of the issues that took place during the Cold War, the end of it was also one of the major issues of international relations. As the Cold War atmosphere was replaced with a new and comparatively different one beginning from 1991, referring Joseph Nye's sentences, "the tectonic plates have shifted and the world affairs transformed fundamentally."[2] As a result, new definitions with regard to the new transformations in the world, needed to be done. There were several debates done about the nature of the new post-Cold War era, since there was no more a bipolar system or super power rivalry as the USA versus the Soviet Union. Numbers of newly independent countries became the actors in the international arena with having problems of adjusting the processes after the Cold War and balancing their domestic environment. Nevertheless, as the ideological boundaries become invincible; new types of conflicts such as the ethnical and religious conflicts between the countries occurred and several regional wars took place. As a result of those wars, numbers of refugees and displaced people become the most important issue in the agendas of the countries. The issues of human rights violations as well as the domestic and foreign conflicts of those newly independent countries formed the most important points of attention during the 1990s. Besides the instabilities within the countries, the idea of global terrorism and the world wide terrorist networks prevailed, which are especially located in the territories in which the government authority was weak or does not exist at all. Additionally as a result of the rapid industrialization and modernization, the inequality of income between the developed and developing countries appeared which affect directly the lives of the people living in developing and under-developed countries. Global famine and diseases which affect hundreds of people also become another important issue which was started to be discussed especially after the Cold War. Also, most of the observers establish direct links between the poverty and the terrorism since the lack of the basic needs for living, may cause people become aggressive and open the influence of the terrorist organizations.

---

[2] Joseph Nye, "American Strategy after Bipolarity", **International Affairs**, Vol.66, No.3 (1990), p.513.

All those issues appeared to require different solutions than that of the Cold War. Although there was not a global nuclear crisis threat or the tension sourced by the bipolarity among the countries, governments started to consider those issues as the possible threats to their national security. In order to handle the new sets of threats, new sets of approaches were developed.

In addition to the hard –coercive- power, the second face of power, soft power, that leads attraction and shaping the preferences of a country become a point of focus in the agenda of the international relations. Although the term soft power is newly brought forward by Nye, the term has a historical background. The importance of attraction, as a complementary issue to military might, had always been an asset for the governments. Nevertheless, Nye, defining the term as "the ability to get what you want through attraction rather than coercion or payments"[3], readied the ground for soft power to point out a new approach towards the new security threats. In this thesis, Nye's terminology on soft power is followed as well as focusing on the post-Cold War era with regard to the changing environment and context of the world politics. Nevertheless, while considering Nye's soft power approach one should remember that, not all the states share the same soft power instruments. For instance, while the USA's soft power sources from its sound economic system, the level of their education system, and the nature of the politics in the country as well as the globally known assets like Hollywood and several world-wide brands, Japan may wield its soft power with the help of its technology and cultural heritage. All those instruments can be change depending on the characteristics of the country as well as the nature of the international political relations of the period.

As mentioned above, the main reason of especially focusing on the post-Cold War period is the changing international dynamics and their reflections on the regional politics. While the collapse of the Soviet Union was increasing the number of the international actors, the severity of the issues taking place in the world appeared to require an immense attention. Furthermore, the main reason of especially focusing on Turkey is the role it has been playing in its region due to its geostrategic location which also has doubled its importance as the regional affairs and the countries which have

---

[3] Joseph S. Nye, Jr, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, New York: Public Affairs, 2004, p.x.

leading roles or rising importance in their regions acquired a new emphasis after the Cold War.

In the above mentioned context, this thesis first intends to analyze the Turkish foreign policy after the Cold War based on its soft power capabilities, and then, Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA) as the case study; in relation with the general post-Cold War political structure.

The main research question of the thesis is whether Turkey has the capabilities to be a regional soft power. As the research activities deepened and Turkey's previously mentioned soft power assets were investigated in detail, the second research question of whether TIKA's projects contribution on Turkey's soft power gained importance. It can be argued from the outset that, TIKA's projects appear to be proper sources for winning hearts and minds due to their characteristics and direct relations with the people of the recipient countries.

In line with the main points of focus, two main research methods were applied in the research. The first one is the historical/descriptive research method. It began with examining secondary sources regarding the main structure of the post-Cold War period as well as the sources directly related with the nature and characteristics of the concept and instruments of power. Furthermore, while observing Turkey's soft power potential in its region, TIKA's contribution is elaborated by analyzing its projects and their implementation as well as the outcomes that are obtained from them. In this context the primary sources like the annual action plans of the Agency, the records and the articles as well as the news about the Agency's activities in several countries were analyzed. Finally, as a second research method, a visit to the agency has been paid and in-depth interviews with TIKA's personnel were done based on TIKA's contribution on Turkey's soft power capabilities in order to deepen the understanding regarding TIKA's projects and organizational structure. The notes of the interviews have been included under the related sections of the thesis which would also be very helpful to understand TIKA as a case study of Turkey's soft power application.

This thesis consists of four chapters. In the first chapter entitled as the Changes in the Conceptualization of Security in the Post-Cold War Era, mainly discusses the general profile of the International System especially in the post-Cold War era while establishing links with the Cold War years as well. Moreover, stemming

from the concept of power in general and in order to compare the characteristics of the power elements, I observed them under two main groups as the tangible instruments of power as geography, demography, economic instruments, institutions, military instruments and lastly the information technologies. In the second section, the intangible instruments of power as the culture, historical trajectories, ideology, diplomatic instruments and lastly the quality of the leadership were discussed. Finally the changing concept of security and the new concerns in the field were also discussed in relation with the rising importance of soft power specifically in the post-Cold War years.

In the second chapter Turkish foreign policy's major dimensions after the Cold War in relation with the political relations with the regional countries while mapping Turkey's capabilities in the international system as a regional country are observed. Turkey having a young and dynamic population more than 70 million includes equipped personnel both in public and private sectors, also harbors its importance by its tangible and intangible assets enriched by the variety of relations with its neighbors in a territory having links between the regions which have very different characteristics. In this context, Turkey's soft power assets as the democratic basis of the political structure, cultural affinities and historical background, economic structure and military capabilities are discussed in details by establishing the linkage between the situations with the regional countries, based on the soft power concept itself.

In the third chapter, in line with the new approach of soft power application, the role of the development assistance was discussed. While the history of the development assistance activities were overviewed, the actors involved in the activities and its relations with the concept of soft power were underlined in the chapter. Furthermore, the purposes of the aid activities in relation with the actors providing the assistance were discussed in detail. Although there are numerous actors in the development assistance community, the most important ones - the United Nations Organization, Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) and its the Development Assistance Committee (DAC), the United States Development Assistance Agency (USAID), Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH , Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA) and the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA)- were observed.

Lastly, in the forth chapter, the leading development assistance organization, Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA) was observed. Moreover, starting from the early activities of development assistance in Turkey and the role of TIKA within those activities were touched upon while looking into TIKA's project implementation and its outcomes in the recipient countries. By investigating the direct outcomes, it was aimed to analyze TIKA's role on wielding Turkey's soft power in its region and in the world in general. The main reason of focusing on TIKA's activities as the case study of the thesis is, the strategic importance of its establishment which can be considered as the *intersection point* of several events. As the developments in the post-Cold War era and the rising importance of the regional countries as the actors of the international relations present extreme importance starting from the 1990s, TIKA's establishment in 1992 directly underlined Turkey's determination towards the newly independent post-Soviet countries. Moreover, as TIKA expanded its area of project implementation by diversifying the fields of projects coming to the 2000's, it laid the ground for the discussions about the effectiveness of Turkish development assistances.

CHAPTER I

THE CHANGES IN THE CONCEPTUALIZATION OF SECURITY IN THE POST-COLD WAR ERA

1.1. THE GENERAL FRAMEWORK OF AND CHANGES IN THE INTERNATIONAL SYSTEM DURING THE POST-COLD WAR ERA

Since the social scientists do not have their laboratories, testing tubes, formulas prepared for the certain calculations or any other tool that can be used in the natural sciences, the analysis and interpretation of the events and the people having vital roles in these events may not be done simultaneously. The Cold War is also one of these events that was lasted nearly forty five years and affected all the countries in the world. Ample analyses and interpretations were done during the course of and after the Cold War and numerous writings were published about the characteristics of the era. In one of these writings, Bernard Baruch, who was an American financier and US presidential advisor, used the term Cold War for the first time in South Caroline on April 16, 1947.[4]

Essentially the Cold War was a period that was full of intense antagonism between the two superpowers of the world, the United States of America and Soviet Union.[5] Although writers and historians highly agree on the nature of "Cold War", and it has a clear cut ending as the Soviet Union declared their demise, the starting point of the period can be interrelated with various events. Soviets and the USA are the successive countries of the World War II which fought on the same line in the course of the war. As a consequence they also participated at the Postdam Conference. Nevertheless, the allied powers' policies after this conference and the new events that took place both in domestic policies of the countries and the international arena, dragged these countries to a very different situation that later would have been called as the Cold War.

---

[4] Gaddis, John Lewis, **The Cold War: A New History**, London: Penguin Press, 2005.
[5] John W. Mason, **Cold War, 1945-1991**, London: Routledge,1996, p. İx.

Despite the well known nature of the term Cold War, it might be considered as a "long peace" in that issues in the international affairs remained cold and did not turn into hot real wars."[6] Nevertheless, in contrast with normal peace conditions, apart from a critical conflict that was occurred between the superpowers which has been recorded as the Cuban Missile Crisis, ample regional conflicts also took place during the course of the Cold War. Apart from the conflicts between states which were either part of the Western Block and the Soviet block, an intense competition between the leaders of the both blocks was going on which had eventually turned into a zero-sum game that would make the states absolute winners or losers.

The end of the Cold War was one of the major events of the world politics. As well as the nature of this important event, the timing was also of great importance. Soviets, since the very beginning appeared to be a very different and complex structured administrative unit. Towards the end of the Cold War, Mikhail Gorbachev who came into power in Soviet Union in 1985 followed a different foreign policy than the previous secretary generals. According to him, if the Soviet people could be disciplined, they could overcome the existing stagnation in the Soviets. As a result, the idea of *perestroika* or restructuring and *glasnost* or open discussion and democratization; also created a very unusual environment in the Soviets in which the people started to criticize the current administration.[7] All these changes within the Soviet people created a high degree of unsatisfaction regarding their situation in the Soviets. Also, the current economic hardship within the Soviet Republics affected Gorbacev's point of view for the federation. According to him the Soviet control over an empire in Eastern Europe was costing too much and providing too little benefit for Soviets. Therefore, by the summer of 1989, it was observed that Eastern Europeans were given considerably more degree of freedom. This was followed by a series of steps taken for more independence and finally the federation had been terminated and a new era for the world politics has begun.

As the Cold War atmosphere was replaced with a new and comparatively different one beginning from 1991, as explained by Joseph Nye, "the tectonic plates

---

[6] Gaddis, John Lewis, **The Long Peace**, New York: Oxford University Press, 1987 cited in Michael W. Doyle and G. John Ikenberry, "Introduction: The End of the Cold War, the Classical Tradition, and International Change", Michael W. Doyle and G. John Ikenberry (eds**) New Thinking in International Relations Theory**, Colorado: Westview Press, 1997, p.2.
[7] Joseph S. Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts, An Introduction to Theory and History**, New York: Longman, 2007, p.135.

have shifted and the world affairs transformed fundamentally."[8] As a result, new definitions with regard to the transformations in the world emerged.

The end of the Cold War was an end not only for the Soviet Empire, but also a starting point for a very different set of international events to occur in international system. The type of the new system has yet to be defined. Many writers and academics wrote about the dynamics of the international system and world politics after the end of the Cold War. There are especially two important and most well-known articles written by Francis Fukuyama and Samuel P. Huntington. Among others, they dealt with the new era that needs to be redefined after the major international systemic change. In the summer of 1989, Francis Fukuyama published his article which titled as "The End of History". According to Griffits, Fukuyama, by this phrase, was referring to "the history of thought about legitimate first principles governing political and social organization."[9] Moreover, Fukuyama also stressed that at the end of the 20th century, "the combination of liberal democracy and capitalism has proved superior to any alternative political/economic system, and the reason lies in its ability to satisfy the basic drives of human nature."[10] Hence, the end of the Cold War and demise of the Soviet Union showed that communism as an ideology reached its peak and then lost its importance to serve as a leading source for the other countries.

There are both supporters and opponents of Fukuyama. Referring Nye's sentences, for instance, Cold War can also be described as the "*return of the history*", rather than the end of history. "The return of history means more normal circumstances in which a single ideological cleavage does not drive the larger conflicts in international politics."[11] So, in a world that was less driven by the ideology, the dynamics of the relations among countries also gained considerably high importance.

On the other hand, Samuel P. Huntington published his article in 1993, titled "The Clash of Civilizations", which was published as a book also. This article also becomes a well-known counter to Fukuyama's article. In line with the British historian

---

[8] Nye, "American Strategy after Bipolarity", p.513.
[9] Martin Griffits, **Fifty Key Thinkers in International Relations**, London: Routledge, 1999,p.69.
[10] Ibid. , p.69; For more information see: Francis Fukuyama, "The End of History?, **The National Interest** , Summer 1989, p. 3-18); Francis Fukuyama, **End of History and the Last Man** (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1992).
[11] Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts, An Introduction to Theory and History**, p.266.

Arnold Toynbee's views,[12] Huntington's article was based on the division of the civilizations into eight including the Western and Latin American, African, Islamic, Sinic, Hindu, Orthodox, Buddhist and Japanese. Huntington argued that the possible conflicts would likely occur between these civilizations in the future.

Although both of them gained a wide support from various sides, there was also a point which is common for both of them. The post-Cold War world was full of uncertainties and it was nearly impossible for one theory or point of view to become commonly accepted or fit all realities, due to the differences among the countries in terms of economics, politics and cultural characteristics; and the nature of the politics itself. In this context, the need for defining the nature of the post-Cold War world emerges. According to some, the world after the Cold War can be defined as a *multipolar world* since there are not only two blocks but a number of different countries having different characteristics.[13] Nevertheless, as Nye points out, the Post-Cold War era's multi-polarity may be misleading if it is compared with the historical analogy of the 19th century. During the 19th century, there were roughly five states having nearly equal powers, but after the Cold War, the countries should not be considered as equal since there were a lot of differences in terms of their power and capabilities.[14]

Some analysts predicted the world will be organized around three economic blocs-Europe, Asia and North America, while China, India, Brazil and Russia will also gain a larger economic power.[15] Nevertheless, as the technological changes occurred globally and the number of the non-state actors and the states that do not engage with a bloc increased; their capacity to balance the weight of these three blocs also increased.

Moreover, according to many analysts, the new world system after the Cold War should be defined in line with the characteristics of the USA. Analysts who support this view state that, the post-Cold War era may be defined as a unipolar structure, in

---

[12] Arnold J. Toynbee; abridgement of volumes I-IV by D. C. Someervell, **A study of history,** New York: Oxford University Press, 1947.
[13] John J. Mearsheimer, "Why we will soon miss the Cold War?", **The Atlantic** 266, August 1990 (also available in http://peace.concordia.ca/pdf/cold.war.pdf [03.07.2010]; John J. Mearsheimer, "Back to the Future: Instability in Europe after the Cold War", **International Security** 15, Summer 1990; Kenneth Waltz, "The emerging structure of International Politics", **International Security** 18, Fall 1993.
[14] Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts, An Introduction to Theory and History**, p.275.
[15] W.Bowman Cutter, "A New International Economic Order?", Robert L. Hutchings (ed), **At the End of the American Century: America's Role in the Post-Cold War World,** London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998, p.141.

which the USA being the hegemonic power. The USA's intervention to the Serbian occupation of Bosnian territories; the toppling of the Taliban regime in Afghanistan and lastly the toppling of the Saddam's Ba'athist regime in Iraq can be considered as the examples of the hegemonic character of the USA in military means and show how she plays a dominant role in shaping international politics.[16]

However, the USA's military hegemony did not match by other power elements. In the current international system, there are other actors that can be counted as possible rivals of the USA. While the EU and Japan can be considered as the economic powers as mentioned above; the USA is also being challenged by the other countries. As a result; the post-Cold War system structure can better be defined as a multi-layered system structure.

The multi-layered structure of the international system is also mentioned by Nye in his writings. According to him; the agenda of world politics has become like a three-dimensional chess game in which one can win only by playing vertically as well as horizontally. On the top board the classical military issues stand as the most significant field, in which the USA seems the only superpower with its global military reach. This board has a largely unipolar structure. However, on the middle board of the economic interstate issues, the distribution of power is multipolar and it is more difficult to talk about a mere superpower as in the military sector. Lastly, on the bottom board of transnational issues like terrorism, international crime, climate change, and the spread of infectious diseases, power is widely distributed and chaotically organized among state and nonstate actors.[17] Therefore, gaining influence in the current international system necessitates states to equally consider the three dimensions and power centers.

Aside the mentioned debates about the nature of the post-Cold War era, the fact that the Cold War was providing stability among the countries should be acknowledged. Even though there were numbers of Third World conflicts;"the economic struggles among the United States, Europe, and Japan were dampened down by common concerns about Soviet military threat, and bitter ethnic divisions were

---

[16] Ramazan Gözen; "Turkish Foreign Policy in Turbulence of the Post Cold War Era: Impact of External and Domestic Constraints", İdris Bal (ed) **Turkish Foreign Policy in the Post Cold War Era**, Florida: Brown Walker Press, 2004, p.31.
[17] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, p.4.

kept under tight lid of the Soviet presence in Eastern Europe."[18]   As the Cold War ended, these conflicts did not end, nevertheless, started to have different sources.[19] So, in order to investigate these sources different approaches regarding to these old conflicts and possible new ones should be developed. This necessitates analyzing the concept and instruments of power first.

1.2. THE CONCEPT OF POWER

The concept of power is a crucial one in the main agenda of International Relations since it has been preserving its importance ever since the politics had started to be discussed. Also, the frequency in the usage of the term in the literature shows its central place in the international politics. For instance, the actors performing policies in the international arena are generally referred to as superpowers, great powers, major powers, middle powers and small powers. Moreover, the terms of balance of power or power vacuum are commonly used in order to describe an international system.[20]

Although it is frequently used in the literature, the concept of power remains one of the most controversial terms.[21] Its controversial nature mainly stems from the fact that numerous political scientists, academics and politicians defined the term in very different ways.

In Realist International Relations Theory, power is one of the most important elements is used in order to explain the political behavior. According to John Mearsheimer, for all Realists "calculations about power lie at the heart of how states think about the world around them".[22] Also, the main point of foreign policy planning is to project and defend the interests of the state in world politics in relation with power. Moreover, the most important states appear as the ones which are also called as great powers, and according to the Realist Theory their struggle for power forms the essence

---

[18] Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts, An Introduction to Theory and History**, p.274.
[19] **Ibid**. , p.274.
[20] John M. Rothgeb, Jr, **Defining Power, Influence and Force in the Contemporary International System**, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1993, p.18.
[21] Kenneth Waltz, "Reflections on Theory of International Politics: A Response to My Critics", in Robert Keohane (ed), **Neorealism and Its Critics,** New York: Columbia University Press, p.322-24 cited in David A. Baldwin, "Power and International Relations", Walter Carlsnaes, Thomas Risse, Beth A. Simmons, **Handbook of International Relations,** London: Sage, 2005, p. 177.
[22] John Mearsheimer, **The Tragedy of Great Power Politics**, New York: W.W. Norton, 2001, p.12 cited in Brian C. Schmidt, "Competing Realist Conceptions of Power", Millenium: Journal of International Studies, 2005. Vol. 33, No. 3, p.523-549.

of foreign policy.[23] Nevertheless, in line with the above mentioned controversial nature of the concept of power, Realists also have different approaches concerning it and the main issues related with power. These issues may include: the strategies that are used by the states in order to acquire additional power, the ways of use of power to reach the desired ends and the measurement of power.[24]

According to Classical Realists, including Thucydides, Machiavelli and Hobbes, "the goal of power, the means of power, and the uses of power are a central preoccupation of political activity."[25] In this regard, international politics can be portrayed as "power politics: an arena of rivalry, conflict and war between states" which are defending their national interests and trying to ensure their survival among the other states.[26]

Neoclassical Realism also traces the same point of view about the term power. Morgenthau, as one of the leading neoclassical realists states that, "international politics, like all politics, is a struggle for power. Whatever the ultimate aims of international politics, power is always the immediate aim."[27] For Morgenthau, like Thucydides, this behavior of states is closely linked to the power-seeking nature of the human beings.

Neo-realism, on the other hand, "shifts the focus away from the laws of human nature and argues that the power-seeking behavior of states is a function of international anarchy."[28] According to the neo-realists, the absence of a "higher power" to ensure the peace among sovereign states would mean the *state of war.* Furthermore, according to Waltz, with whom the neo-realism is often associated with, mentioned "anarchy prevents states from entering into co-operative agreements to end the state of war."[29]

On the other hand, some other observers object to the Realists' emphasis on constant struggle and their highly conflicting, coercive, and military interpretation of the

---

[23]George Sørensen and Robert Jackson, **Introduction to International Relations,** Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001, p.68.
[24]Schmidt, "Competing Realist Conceptions of Power" , p.524.
[25]Sørensen and Jackson**, Introduction to International Relations**, p.68.
[26] **Ibid**. ,p.68.
[27]Hans J. Morgenthau, **Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace**, Brief Edition Revised by Kenneth W. Thompson, New York: Mc Graw Hill, 1993.
[28] Schmidt, "Competing Realist Conceptions of Power" , p.527
[29] **Ibid**. , p.527. For more information about Kenneth Waltz's writing see, **Man, the State and War**, New York: Columbia University Press, 1959

concept of power. According to their point of view, since power is located at the centre of the international relations, it may take ample forms. Moreover, Realists are also criticized due to the lack of an operational definition of the term power, despite the concept of power is placed at the centre of their theory.

While the role of power is a source of discussion, the nature of power is also of great importance. David Baldwin defines two traditions of power; the national power approach; which depicts power as resources, and the relational power approach, which depicts power as an actual or potential relationship."[30]

Robert Dahl, who was an influential advocate of the relational conception of power, made an almost world-wide accepted definition in order to clarify the term. According to him, power is the capability of, "A causing B to do something that B otherwise would not have done."[31] In this regard, "A" stands for the actor having or exercising influence, while "B" refers to the actor being influenced. So, because of the power that a certain actor has, it can reach the desired outcomes. Hence, power can be also defined as "the ability to influence the behavior of others to get the outcomes one wants." Since it has been used to change the behavior of other states, it can be called as "behavioral power" also.[32] On the other hand, if power is being taken into consideration with its effect on one's behaviors, one's preferences also should be known. Otherwise, the analysis may be misguided by the outcomes obtained.

Undoubtedly, certain countries have certain levels of influence. Influencing another country's choices also has relations with influencing country's capacities. Powerful countries, on the other hand, not only influence the choices of another country, but also influence other state's menus. In this context, this can be called "structural power" since it puts emphasis on actor "A"s capacity to influence the context or the environment in which actor "B" is making their decisions.[33]

---

[30] David A. Baldwin, "Power and International Relations", Walter Carlsnaes, Thomas Risse, Beth A. Simmons, **Handbook of International Relations,** London: Sage, 2005, p. 185.
[31] Robert Dahl, "The Concept of Power", Behavioral Science, 2: 201-15, 1957 cited in David A. Baldwin, "Power and International Relations", p.5.
[32] Bruce Russett, Harvey Starr, David Kinsella, **World Politics: The Menu for Choice**, Boston, New York: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2000, p.90.
[33] Susan Strange, "What About International Relations?", Susan Strange (ed), **Paths to International Political Economy,** London: Allen&Unwin, 1984, p.191.

Furthermore, there are various ways to change and/or affect one's behaviors. "You can coerce them with threats; you can induce them with payments; or you can attract and co-opt them to want what you want." [34]

The power resources also have significant roles in influencing a state. Moreover, proponents of the elements of national power approach, relates power directly to the possession of specific resources. While the tangible elements such as population, military expenditure, and GDP are included in the calculations of national power, the intangible elements such as the quality of the leadership, culture, ideology also can also be included in the calculations.[35] The possession of these resources may affect a leader to state that his/her country is powerful or not. These resources may include population, territory, natural resources, economic size, military force, and political stability among others.[36]

Power resources also have relations with power conversion. According to Nye's sentences, power conversion is "the capacity to convert potential power, as measured by resources, to realized power, as measured by the changed behavior of others."[37] Hence, knowing a country's power resources and its intentions to use these resources to convert its power pursuant to the country's objectives is very important. The existence of these resources is considerably important in order to identify what one is able to do and what one is willing to do. In this regard, the issue of credibility appears. In the first place, the party who is claiming to perform an action should also have to be able to carry it out. Secondly, there should be a certain willingness to carry out the mentioned action by considering all of its possible outcomes.[38] So, if a state has the intention of influencing the other state's behaviors, it should both have certain capabilities of power and willingness to fulfill its objectives.

Nevertheless, power resources always depend on the context. According to Nye, not all power resources create the same impact in all the environments. For instance, the tanks may not be very effective in swamps and due to the level of the technological developments uranium cannot be used as a power resource in the 19th century. Eventually as the technological developments were being fulfilled, the importance of industry and rail systems – making rapid mobilization possible -

---

[34] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, p.2.
[35] Schmidt, "Competing Realist Conceptions of Power", p.529.
[36] Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts: An Introduction to Theory and History**, p.60.
[37] **Ibid**. , p. 61.
[38] Russett, Starr, Kinsella, **World Politics: The Menu for Choice**, p.92-93.

increased. Additionally, as the industrial technology began to be applied to warfare, advanced science and technology had become particularly critical power resources. The beginning of these developments can be traced back to the nuclear age in 1945.[39] So, all these instances can be helpful to confirm that, the nature and the possible impact of the power resources may change depending on time, place and the objectives of the country which preserves these resources.

Although the impacts of the power resources may vary depending on certain points, the way countries' exercise power also has some limitations depending on the case and the nature of the opponent. Also, in order to get the outcomes that a country wants, it needs to adjust its way of exercising power. In this regard, while countries have the option to use *hard power* as the military power that is backed by high-technology conventional, nuclear or biological arms, they can also rely on *soft power* as a form of structural power, which can rest on comparatively non-military resources unlike that of the hard power. These soft power instruments can attract the other one's ideas or affect the other country's preferences about their foreign policy planning.[40]

As Nye pointed out, although soft and hard power are related they should not be taken into consideration as the identical tools. Nevertheless, despite both of them are used to realize a certain country's foreign and/or domestic policy objectives, the question of which one is highly preferable, is still being discussed in different platforms. In the current international relations atmosphere, non-governmental organizations, governmental organizations and also the states themselves nearly agreed on non-usage of force among group of countries[41] but the events showing the importance and necessity of usage of military force can be traced through the literature.

With reference to Nye, although soft power is being applied within the relations among the "postindustrial societies in an information age in which the democratic peace prevails, hard power is usually more important in industrializing and preindustrial

---

[39] Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts: An Introduction to Theory and History**, p. 62.
[40] **Ibid**. , p. 62.
[41] For more information see also; A. Michael Levi and E. Michael O'Hanlon, **Future of Arms Control** Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2004; Arms Control Association http://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets [05.02.2010]; John Mueller, "The Obsolescence of Major War", Robert J. Art and Kenneth N. Walts (eds) **The Use of Force: Military Power and International Politics**, (New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc, 2004), p.427-440; John Orme, "The Utility of Force in a World of Scarcity" Robert J. Art and Kenneth N. Walts (eds), **The Use of Force: Military , Power and International Politics,** New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc, 2004, p.456-471.

parts of the world".[42] So the discussion, about which are the most important resources of power today, appears as an important issue. While responding to this question, it should be acknowledged about the fact that the mentioned power resources are never static and they keep changing in today's world.

As the world becomes more integrated eventually, complex interdependence between countries is being strengthened in the current international arena. It can be argued that, "power is becoming less transferable, less tangible, and less coercive."[43] On the other hand, it is obvious that the transformation of power is still not over. Although the information technologies improve and the institutional power preserves its importance, it can also be argued that the military power is still highly applicable in the international arena. Nevertheless, when the events in the last decades of the 20th century and the first decades of the 21st century are observed, it could be stated that military power is not a first destination to reach. On many occasions, it is the final resort as long as all the other instruments are being used.[44]

In this context as John M. Rothgeb, Jr. also points out, as the new events have been taking place within the politics in the course of the history the understanding of power and how it is exercised is vital to comprehending international politics and to analyzing it properly.[45] Two key changes have occurred that have relations directly with power. The first one was concerning how countries define their goals and vital interests, and the other one underlines how resources are most appropriately used to exercise power. Regarding the first one, it has been noted that while the countries traditionally focused on achieving military and territorial security; a variety of new goals and issues are also followed and all these developments let to a new definition of what security means. These issues that are affecting the security perceptions were now not only the ones related to military issues but also the ones related to non-military issues such as epidemic diseases, drug trafficking, economic threats and so on. So, all these new threats require different responses other than or beside military tactics. Secondly, as those different responses began to be discussed in international politics, both tangible and intangible resources of power acquired considerably high degree of importance. Depending on the nature of the power elements, different levels of

---

[42] Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts: An Introduction to Theory and History**, p. 63.
[43] Joseph S. Nye**, Power in the Global Information Age**, London: Routledge, 2004, p.77.
[44] **Ibid**. , p.57-58.
[45] Rothgeb, **Defining Power, Influence and Force in the Contemporary International System**, p.17-27.

influence on politics can be observed. Because of this reason power elements become key determinants while defining a certain country's capabilities. In other words, they are a basic part of the overall equation that leads to influence. Sourcing from the general conception of the *Instruments of Power*" it is possible for us to identify these instruments as tangible or intangible.

1.2.1.   Tangible Instruments of Power

In this section, tangible instruments of national power, as geography and demography, economic instruments, military instruments, institutions and information technologies will be discussed in relation with their contribution on countries' both hard and soft power.

The national attributes of land mass and population are central elements of a state's national power capacity. Due to their readily measurable nature they can be included under the first group of tangible instruments. Although the mere existence of a large land mass or high population does not create a powerful state, their contribution to the states' power capabilities should be underlined. Due to their characteristics they will be overviewed separately.

Although, during the course of the history several wars took place and the boundaries of the countries change depending on the consequences of those wars, **geography** appears as one of the stable factors of national power. Nevermore, this instrument should not be understood as if its weight on the power analysis is also constant. Conversely, as the international conjuncture changes, the importance and weight of the constant variables may be affected by this process. The countries which are able to evaluate and revise their priorities in line with the changes in the international arena can also re-define their constant variables and use them for creating positive impacts.[46]

The use of geography as an element of international power is called *geopolitics.* In 1979, Henry Kissinger defined geopolitics as a method of analysis in relation with the current international system and the permanent national interests in

---

[46]Ahmet Davutoğlu, **Stratejik Derinlik: Türkiye'nin Uluslararası Konumu**, İstanbul: Küre Yayınları, 2008, p. 18.

the balance of power in those years.[47] Accordingly, the most important consideration of geopolitics is location. States increase their power to the extent they can use their geographical location.[48]

Countries are located in different areas of the world, having different kinds of geopolitical issues. Furthermore, the scale of a country's geographic lands is also important while evaluating its power capabilities. For instance, while a comparatively small country may be more vulnerable to being overwhelmed by a sudden military attack, larger countries on the other hand, may have a chance to survive from such a threat because of their lands being difficult to be conquered completely.

Moreover, there are also other different factors that may contribute to or detract from a state's power capabilities. Physical location (like America, which is located between two oceans), political location (in Poland's case, it can be observed that this country is located between hostile great powers, during the 19th and 20th centuries) and lastly climate (in Russia's case with extremely cold winters) can be observed as the examples of the importance of geography in a country's power capabilities. Furthermore, the physical distance between countries may directly affect the level of interaction. In relation with the nature of the historical context, the nature of the interaction, whether it is hostile of friendly, may also change.[49]

In addition to the geographical size, *demography* is also an important power asset for countries. However, since the ratio of a country's population may vary depending on the birth rate and mortality rate in relation with the wars, epidemic diseases and economical hardships demography is not as stable as the geography itself.

During the previous centuries, the size of the population was considered as a very important power asset. Although it did not lose its importance completely, as the power resources began to be re-interpreted in relation with the new developments and

---

[47]Geoffrey Sloan and Colin S. Gray, "Why Geopolitics", Colin S. Gray and Geoffrey Sloan (eds), **Geopolitics, Geography and Strategy**, London: Frank Cass Publishers, 1999, p.1.
[48]Joshua S. Goldstein, **International Relations**, New York: Longman, 1999, p.61.
[49] As an instance for the friendly interaction between neighboring countries, Turkish and Iranian case can be given. Turkey-Iran frontier had defined via the norms of the Kasr-ı Şirin Treaty in 1639 and no change was done since the signing of the treaty, and no conflicts were occurred sourcing from the frontiers. On the other hand, the conflict between Pakistan and India for Kashmir and the conflict between Armenia and Azerbaijan for Nagorno-Karabakh can also be given as examples of conflict-ridden relations between neighboring countries.

the thinking about the importance of a large population has also been revised. In modern times, the generalization of "the larger the population of a country the greater its power" seems to be misguiding. Nonetheless, since the population is still one of the most remarkable factors upon which the national power rests, and since the power of a certain nation is always relative to the power of others, the relative rate of the growth in the population deserves careful attention. According to Morgenthau, "a country inferior in size of population to its competitor will view with alarm a declining rate of growth if the population of its competitor tends to increase rapidly." The example of France and Germany is a valid case about this issue. During the period of 1870-1940 while the population of France is increased by four million, Germany reached an increase of twenty-seven million.[50]

Moreover, as well as numbers, the age, sex, and spatial distribution of a population and the quality of the human resources have to be considered in analyzing the place of demography in the power elements. For instance, it can be assumed that, the more people's capabilities have been developed by education or good health care, the better they can contribute to the economic, military and cultural bases of power of the states.[51]

Harold D.Lasswell and Abraham Kaplan defined a state's human resources as "enlightenment, as the extent of higher education and the access to specialized knowledge in science, engineering, and the professions."[52] In this sense, a certain state's military capabilities are also related with scientific knowledge which can directly be used for manufacturing modern weapons and establishing a powerful army. In order to reach to a certain degree, the financial resources also should have a backing role. It is obvious that wealthy countries have less difficulty while reaching all these goals because of their economic situations and levels of literacy.

Another aspect of a certain state's human resources is related with the wealth and well-being of the population. The points such as the level and frequency of people's access to the medical care, the level of the education system in the country and the level of literacy, average life expectancy and the common diseases by which

[50] Morgenthau, **Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace**, Brief Edition Revised by Kenneth W. Thompson, New York: Mc Graw Hill, 1993, p.141.
[51] Russett, Starr, Kinsella, **World Politics: The Menu for Choice**, p.95.
[52] Harold D. Lasswell and Abraham Kaplan, **Power and Society**, New Haven, Conn: Yale University Press, 1950 cited in Bruce Russett, Harvey Starr, David Kinsella, **World Politics: The Menu for Choice**, p.95.

the population affected most can be helpful in analyzing the wealth and well-being of the population. In this context, the ratio between the population of a country and the level of income play an important role in defining how many people have a chance to access the public services properly. Currently, it has become obvious that large populations sometimes create negative influence upon national power, especially if the income of the country is not enough to create survival for all members of the society. This has happened in some certain countries such as India, whose population is considerably high in contrast with its low incomes. As a result, the country's food supply did not keep pace with the increase in population and many countries like India faced with a threat of famine and with the need to take care of large masses of undernourished and diseased people.[53]

So, the problems of countries regarding their population characteristics play a negative role on their capacity of influence over other countries and directly on their national power elements. This is also same on the issues of geography. Geographic characteristics determine countries' physical existence and a country's potential to shape its geographic and population policies underline its efficiency in its relations with the other countries.

Beside geographic and demographic characteristics of countries; *economic instruments* also play important role on national power measurement. A state's economy is vital to its ability to wield influence in the international arena and world politics. The level, sources, and nature of a certain country's productive economy define the power of its economic instruments. Moreover, economic wealth can also be considered as a great advantage since it can be used to reach the cutting-edge technology, bargaining power in international organizations and so on.[54] As Walter Mead has argued, "economic power is sticky power; it seduces as much as it compels… A set of economic institutions and policies…attracts others into our system and makes it hard for them to leave."[55]

Moreover, importance of the other sources such as energy resources which include petroleum, coal, natural gas and sources that have critical importance for the

---

[53] Morgenthau, **Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace**, p.142.
[54] Robert J. Art, "The Fungibility of Force", Robert J. Art and Kenneth N. Walts (eds), **The Use of Force**: **Military , Power and International Politics**, New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc, 2004, p.6.
[55] Walter Russell Mead**, Power, Terror, Peace and War: America's Grand Strategy in a World at Risk** New York: Knopf, 2004, p. 25.

industrial capacity like uranium, cobalt and chromium for steel making should be underlined. All of them can be used by a state for development and gaining wealth. Also these resources can provide a great degree of self sufficiency for a state. A state which has self-sufficiency became less vulnerable in its attempts in the international arena.[56]

Since economic instruments are defined as components of tangible elements of power, some kinds of measurements are used that are effective in determining a country's economic size and performance. Calculating gross national product (GNP), forms the total values of all the final goods and services of a certain country that are produced during a whole year, gives very important clues about countries' economic structures.

In the real sense, the importance of GNP in economics is much more important. GNP per capita, in other words economic production relative to population, is one of the best indicators of economic development, since we can observe how well a state has mobilized and used its natural and human resources. Moreover, other important factors which indicate international economic power may be "the control of, or assured access to, vital natural resources, a major share of world trade and significant influence on international capital flows."[57]

In this respect, economic power stands as one of the most important power assets. It is also an important component of political power too as E. H. Carr mentioned.[58]

Considering the economic capabilities of the countries which make them "economic powers" in international arena, some certain types of economic power can be observed. First of all, there are the types of economic power related to "war potential" of the countries. "The focus is on a country's industrial capacity, the size and skill-level of its population, its degree of technological advancement, and the degree to which it is self-sufficient in food and vital raw materials."[59] All of these criteria become effective factors while considering a country's ability to prevail in a military conflict. In this respect, military and economic capabilities may interrelate, since most of the time it

---

[56] Art, "The Fungibility of Force", p.96.
[57] Ken Aldred, **Superpowers in The Post-cold War Era**, Hampshire: Palgrave Publishers, 1999, p.2.
[58] E.H.Carr**, The Twenty Years' Crisis**, New York: Palgrave, 1981, p.105.
[59] Spyros Economides and Peter Wilson, **Economic Factor in International Relations: A Brief Introduction,** London: I. B. Tauris & Company, Limited, 2002, p. 11.

is being observed that, highly industrialized states which have a considerably higher degree of economic sufficiency are the ones most likely to prevail.[60]

Secondly, there are those types of economic power that have not direct links to the war potential of a country but, have the tools which may provide an extensive source of international influence. While some countries have "financial power" which would pave the way to hinder or shape another state's investment plans, to support or undermine a certain state's currency; some of the countries have "production power" that is the ability to invest directly in different countries. Also, there are those countries which have "market power" that is the possession of a large and lucrative market. So, in order to achieve their goals countries may use one of these potentials depending on the scale of their objective and nature of their economic power. For instance, a country that has production power would threaten to prevent its firms from investing another country. Moreover, a country with market power could impose tariffs or quotas on different countries' exports, or may block or restrict the access of other countries to its large and lucrative market in the pursuit of its economic and political goals.[61]

Thirdly, there are those types of economic power that result from certain "structural" advantages which is "the ability to determine an agenda, shape the context and environment in which any decision is made, to determine opportunities or a range of choices."[62] In this context it can also be stated that this type of economic power has various connections with different factors including the business practices, consumption patterns, values, attitudes, the role of the financial institutions and the size of economy. [63]

Furthermore, *military instruments* should also be overviewed as another important set of tangible power instruments, which also has direct relations with the economic capacity of countries. Military capability is a crucial element of state power and because of this, most of the students, writers and critics of international politics have commented on the preoccupation with military force.[64] Also, "military power

---

[60] **Ibid**. , p. 11.
[61] Economides and Wilson, **Economic Factor in International Relations: A Brief Introduction**, p.12.
[62] **Ibid**. , p.11.
[63] **Ibid**. , p.12.
[64] See, E.H.Carr, **The Twenty Years' Crisis**, (New York: Palgrave, 1981; Robert Art and Kenneth Waltz (eds), **The Use of Force: Military Power and International Politics**, 5th edn. New York: Rowman and Littlefield, [1971] 1999; A. David Baldwin, **Paradoxes of Power,** New York: Blackwell, 1989; Robert E. Osgood and Robert W. Tucker; **Force, Order, and Justice**, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1967.

resides in the level and sophistication of the armed forces which a country is able to maintain."[65] Nearly every country has its own established military institutions such as their armies and the ministries of defense. Moreover, there are also some governmental organizations established by the states themselves in order to contribute the regional and global collective security.

Military instruments in general, appear as important elements which can also have potential of change and be adapted to the changing conjuncture of the international relations and also have great effects on economic, diplomatic and political decision making and orientation of the states.

Nye also puts emphasis on the term "Stockholm Syndrome", by relating the importance of the military (hard) power with attraction, which indicates the situation of "hostages who were initially coerced by their captors but in the constrained circumstances of stress and fear came to identify with their captors"[66].

Military capabilities which are used and revised by the states in line with the needs of their ongoing situations can affect a country's profile positively in the international arena and help to create economic/political influence.[67] For instance, the military capabilities of a country coupled with the perception that it is willing to use them, "was a vital backstop to the various diplomatic, political, economic, and other techniques that it might employ in conducting its foreign relations."[68]

In general, states assume that it is more desirable to be militarily powerful than militarily weak. Militarily powerful states have greater clout in world politics than militarily weak ones. Also, militarily strong states are less subject to the influence of other states than militarily weak ones."[69] Furthermore, when two or more countries had conflicting goals about which their governments and people felt strongly, the military resources generally determine the winner and the loser.[70]

The power of a state in military terms depends on many elements. First of all, military technology that a country is using is of great importance. Especially during the 20th century, four major innovations in the technique of war have occurred. The use of

[65] Ken Aldred, **Superpowers in The Post-cold War Era**, Hampshire: Palgrave Publishers, 1999, p.2.
[66] S.Joseph Nye, "Foreword", Yasushi Watanabe and David McConnell (eds), S. Joseph Nye (Foreword by), **Soft Power Superpowers: Cultural and National Assets of Japan and the United States,** New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc. 2008, p.xii.
[67] Davutoğlu, **Stratejik Derinlik: Türkiye'nin Uluslar arası Konumu**, p.28.
[68] John M. Rothgeb, Jr, **Defining Power, Influence and Force in the Contemporary International System,**, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1993, p.7.
[69] Art, "The Fungibility of Force", p.7.
[70] Rothgeb, **Defining Power, Influence and Force in the Contemporary International System**, p.7.

submarines in the World War I by Germany, the use of tanks in the World War I, by Britain the establishment of strategic and tactical co-ordination of the air force with the land and naval forces in World War II, by Germany and Japan and lastly the use of nuclear weapons for the first time in World War II by the USA, provided them a great degree of advantage since all these tools provided opportunity to protect themselves before their opponents use these tools. Besides, the levels of the technology used in warfare and the quality of military leadership have also exerted an important influence upon national power. Additionally, having a good level of technology in warfare and decisive and smart leaders with excel in the strategy and tactics that are appropriate to the new techniques of war are of cardinal importance. Moreover, while observing the power of a nation in military terms quantity of men and arms as well as their distribution among the different branches of the military establishment also matter.[71] Furthermore, some intangible factors like training, morale, and doctrine that affect a military's proficiencies in using its weapons and equipments also appear to be very important. "Such intangibles often have a major impact on a state's ability to take advantage of its weapons systems because they affect its military's skills in handling the weapons and integrating them with training and doctrine."[72] The quality of a military's weaponry is only part of the equation in providing military effectiveness.

As well as a well-run military, cooperation among militaries and training programs also play important roles for establishing transnational networks that enhance a country's soft power.

All the mentioned points characterize the military power of a certain country. Furthermore, throughout the history it is also observed that the events occurred in various environments between numerous actors also influenced the use of military capabilities. Until the 20th century, although there were many important events had taken place, the start of the World War II in a broader theatre compared with the previous world war and the end of the World War II by the use of nuclear weapons can be defined as the events which are of primary importance. Especially since 1945 a key element of military capabilities has begun to be understood as a state's nuclear arsenal.

---

[71] Morgenthau, **Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace**, p.136-139.
[72] Risa A. Brooks, "Introduction: The Impact of Culture, Society, Institutions, and International Forces on Military Effectiveness", Risa A. Brooks, Elizabeth A. Stanley (eds) **Creating Military Power: The Sources of Military Effectiveness,** Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press 2007, p.6.

Especially beginning in the 1960s and continuing in the 1980s, the nuclear capacity of the superpowers -that can help them to attack any point in the world- has been doubled. Besides, during the same period again, the technology of conventional weapons also improved and comparatively sophisticated conventional weaponry began to be used by states. [73]

On the other hand, eventually as both superpowers continued to gain as much power as possible, it became evident that, military power capabilities did not provide the same degree of strength and influence that they had during the Second World War. Taking the USA's situation in North Vietnam as an example of this issue, Vietnam, which is a militarily insignificant country compared with many countries of the world, was able to get over with the USA's military power. Moreover, the world's agenda during the 1970s included predominantly economic issues which also dramatically illustrated the new limits to authority derived from military power. Arab members of OPEC (Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries) imposed an oil embargo during the October War of 1973. As a consequence, the USA and various industrialized countries such as Japan and the countries in Western Europe which are heavily depended on oil in their economies, facing with a difficult situation which was directly created by militarily weaker countries.[74]

In this regard, the questions appear: "Why are some states, at some times, better able to form their basic material and human strengths into fighting power?" and "Why are some militaries able to make the most of their limited resources on the battlefield, whereas others perform poorly despite significant material advantages?"[75] As it can be traced via those examples, military effectiveness of states may also depend on their political cultures, social structures, and institutions. Therefore, the creation of the military power also has relations with the cultural and societal factors as well as the wealth, technology, and human capital.

Although military capabilities are one of the most significant assets of power as we can trace with the points mentioned above, their importance and frequency of usage should be considered in relation with the nature and characteristics of every

---

[73] Rothgeb, **Defining Power, Influence and Force in the Contemporary International System**, p.5.
[74] **Ibid**. , p.5.
[75] Risa A. Brooks, "Introduction: The Impact of Culture, Society, Institutions, and International Forces on Military Effectiveness", Risa A. Brooks, Elizabeth A. Stanley (eds) **Creating Military Power: The Sources of Military Effectiveness,** Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press 2007, p.1.

particular incident. According to Sun Tzu Wu who was a Chinese military theorist, "for to win one hundred victories in one hundred battles is not the acme of skill. To subdue the enemy without fighting is the acme of skill."[76] Stemming from those statements it can be stated that, the threat of use of force as well as the direct use of force; also helps to create influence over the other countries. In this context, governments may take the decision of deploying troops to a border or sending ships towards another country's harbor, in order to send a message. "The message can be ambiguous but nevertheless powerful, opening the possibility of violent clashes between armed combatants without closing the door to further negotiation between potential adversaries."[77]

Moreover, in addition to the military capabilities that lead countries for negotiations, there can be point out other elements which are also effective on countries' attitudes. In this context, it appears that, *institutions* occupy an important place in the world politics. Nevertheless the term "institution" is also in the group of terms that are not clearly defined. Thus most of the discussions have been going on without defining the term itself. For instance, while the United Nations and the World Bank being considered as institutions, there are also "the international monetary regime" or "international trade regime" which are included in the scope of the term. Furthermore the term institution has very different definitions depending of the nature of the institutions.

According to Robert O. Keohane, institutions can be defined as "persistent and connected sets of rules (formal and informal) that prescribe behavioral roles, constrain activity, and shape expectations."[78] Hedley Bull refers to "the balance of power, international law, the diplomatic mechanism, the managerial system of the great powers, and war" as "the institutions of international society."[79] John Ruggie discusses "the institutional framework of sovereignty".[80] Also, according to Krasner "institutions

---

[76] Sun Tzu Wu, The Art of War cited in Stephen J. Cimbala, **Coercive Military Strategy**, Texas: Texas A&M University Press, 1998, p.15.
[77] Cimbala, **Coercive Military Strategy**, p.167.
[78] Robert O. Keohane, **International Institutions and State Power,** London: Westview Press, 1989, p.3.
[79] Hedley Bull, **The Anarchical Society: A Study of Order in World Politics**, Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2002, p.97-196
[80] J.G.Ruggie, "Continuity and Transformation in the World Polity: Toward a Neorealist Synthesis", Robert O. Keohane (Ed), **Neorealism and Its Critics** (New York: Columbia University Press, 1986), p. 131-157.

are basically formal and informal rules and norms that generate other more specific entities or agents."[81]

Moreover, besides the specific definitions mentioned above, institutions in general "may refer to a general pattern or categorization of activity or to a particular human-constructed arrangement, formally or informally organized."[82]

In line with these varieties of definitions, there are also different kinds of institutions. According to Keohane's classification, the international institutions can be considered under three broad categories. In the first category, there are formal intergovernmental or cross-national nongovernmental organizations; which had been set and designed for a specific purpose by states. These organizations have bureaucratic structures that make them capable of monitoring activities. Secondly, international regimes are also in the scope of the institutions with explicit rules like the first group. Under the international regimes, governments accept to adopt particular sets of issues in international relations. Bretton Woods or Law of Sea regimes can be the examples for this category. Lastly, there are conventions which are informal institutions with implicit rules in order to shape the expectations of actors. These implicit rules pave the way for the countries to understand the others and coordinate their behavior accordingly.[83]

There are numerous discussions in the international and academic society regarding the importance of international institutions and the purposes of the participant countries in these institutions. In his well-known essay, John Mearsheimer developed an argument that "institutions have minimal influence on state behavior"[84] Nevertheless, despite this argument, the world seems to be highly institutialized with the countries having different objectives and possible gains which have links with these institutions.

Although the fundamental interests of the states are defined autonomously, international institutions appear to be very important for state's actions. "International institutions make it possible for states to take actions that would otherwise be

---

[81] Stephen D. Krasner, **Sovereignty: Organized Hypocrisy**, Ewing, NJ, USA: Princeton University Press: 1999, p.43.
[82] Keohane, **International Institutions and State Power,** p.162.
[83] **Ibid**. , p.3-4.
[84] John Mearsheimer, "The False Promise of International Institutions", **International Security**, 1994/95, p.5-49

inconceivable."[85] For instance, the United Nations Secretary-General's role as mediator between Iran and Iraq war of 1980-1988, or "appealing to nonproliferation rules in justifying a refusal to send nuclear reactor equipment to Pakistan" can be useful to underline the role of the international institutions.[86] The Office of Secretary-General of the United Nations has provided important mediating services over the past few decades, helping to end the civil war in Angola, and the insurgent struggle in Cambodia, and to negotiate the withdrawal of Soviet military forces from Afghanistan, as well. Furthermore, regional organizations, like Organization of American States (OAS), the Organization of African Unity (OAU), and the Arab League, as well as global ones, provide mediation and other peacemaking services.[87]

While states and other non-state actors play an important role determining the importance of international institutions, these institutions also have greater effect on countries' power capabilities. For instance, most of the European leaders describe the desire by other countries to accede to the European Union as a sign of Europe's soft power.[88]

Moreover, as the world becomes more integrated and countries appear to be more dependent to each other on the general basis, the complex interdependence as Nye's terminology was prevailed. As the multiple channels of interaction within the international society appeared and the hierarchy among issues was disappeared, military security lost its ground as the major dominating issue in the agenda. Different issues started to be discussed and these new points required different coalitions and ways of analysis.[89]

As the international political issues become more complicated, the need to form new coalitions occurred. Furthermore, the role and importance of the international institutions in political bargaining among states increased accordingly. In parallel with the roles of the international institutions in world politics, the roles and importance of

---

[85] Keohane, **International Institutions and State Power,** p.5.
[86] **Ibid**. , p.5.
[87] Louis Kriesberg, "Regional Conflicts in the Post-Cold War Era: Causes, Dynamics, and Modes of Resolution", Michael T. Klare and Daniel C. Thomas (eds) **World Security: Challenges for a New Security,** New York St. Martin's Press:1994, p.169-170.
[88] Martin Wolf, "Soft Power: The EU's Greatest Gift," Financial Times, February 2, 2005, p. 17 cited in Nye, "Foreword", Yasushi Watanabe and David McConnell (eds) , S. Joseph Nye (Foreword by), **Soft Power Superpowers: Cultural and National Assets of Japan and the United States,** New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc. 2008, p.xi..
[89] Robert O.Keohane and Joseph S.Nye, **Power and Interdependence: World Politics in Transition**, Boston: Little, Brown Company, 1977, p.24-25.

the countries in these institutions began to be discussed. It was stated that the structure and policies of international institutions are shaped by the dominant actors. Furthermore, USA's success at the end of the Cold War was related with the USA's existence and role in major institutions such as the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund and the General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs.[90]

Nevertheless, as the economically and militarily strong states become effective in the international institutions, comparatively weak counties started to form their own groups in these bodies and act in line with each others' actions. For instance, "the one-state-one-vote norm of the United Nations system favors coalitions of the small and powerless."[91]

Eventually, the one-state-one-vote norm provided them a degree of efficiency and positive effect on their soft powers in their regions and in the institutions. Hence, it can be assumed that although institutions have a number of roles in the international relations, they can be directly included in the elements of power of the countries.

Last but not least about the tangible instruments of power, we can touch upon the importance of *information technologies*. Despite the literal meanings of information and information technologies, these two terms mean more when they are taken into consideration in terms of politics and especially information as an instrument of power. Nevertheless, it can also be stated that "the changes that IT is bringing about in various aspects of life are often collectively called the information revolution." [92]

According to Nye, the world is still at an early stage of the current information revolution.[93] The reason he stated this is related with the current progress in the information technologies. According to him, today's so called information revolution is based on rapid modernization and the fast transportation of information within different communities although they are located in different places of the world. This progress in the information technologies had generated vital changes in the traditional bases of

---

[90] Walter C.Clemens, **Dynamics of International Relations: Conflict and Mutual Gain in an Era of Global Interdependence**, Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc: 1998, p.143.
[91] Keohane and Nye**, Power and Interdependence: World Politics in Transition**, p.35-36.
[92] Richard O.Hundley,Robert H. Anderson, Tora K. Bikson, C.Richard **Neu, Global Course of the Information Revolution: Recurring Themes and Regional Variations,** Santa Monica: National Defense Research Institute, 2003, p.xxiii.
[93] Nye, **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization**, p.81.

power and paved the way to new studies on power analysis.[94] Moreover as English statesman-philosopher Francis Bacon wrote approximately four centuries ago "information is power." Starting from the very first years of the 21st century, a large part of the society both within and among countries was able to access to the information easily.[95] Currently, this number has also develop and information technologies continue to improve each day with an extreme pace.

The level of information technologies also defines the level of *intelligence* of the countries. Basically, intelligence means "the ability to collect and analyze information" of a state which appears as an important intangible capability of a state. Especially in modern times, in which the international relations have been conducted in an atmosphere of uncertainty, any government with the help of the knowledge that is acquired through information technologies can reduce the uncertainty of the international environment.[96] In other words, if the governments have information about the other states' actions, they would have a chance to act and/or respond to them in a more decisive manner.

Aforementioned characteristic of information as element of power was used in many operations; such as "information gathering, terrorism, strategic warfare, symbolic raids, small wars, political and cultural warfare, economic warfare, operations other than war (OOTW), logistic support, interdiction, and in the direct support of conventional military operations."[97]

Specifically, the information that governments need may be discussed within three broad categories. First of all, as the states should be aware of both their and the other states' capabilities and goals, the first type of information is related to the goals, plans, and intentions of other international actors. The level of the knowledge about the other actors is directly related with the level of the information technology that a certain

---

[94] J.Ashley Tellis, Christopher Layne ,L. Janice Bially, **Measuring National Power in the Postindustrial Age,** Cambridge: Rand Corporation, 2001, p.5.
[95] Joseph S. Nye, **The Paradox of American Power, Why the World's Only Superpower can't Go It Alone** (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002) p.42.
[96] Karl W. Deutsch, **Models The Nerves of Government: of Political Communication and Control** (New York: The Free Press, 1966), p. xxvii. About intelligence failures see also: Richard K. Betts, "Analysis, War, and Decision: Why Intelligence Failures are Inevitable", **World Politics**, 30, 1 (1978), p.61-89; Richard K. Betts, "Surprise Despite Warning: Why Sudden Attacks Succeed", **Political Science Quarterly**, 95, 4 (1980-81),p.551-572.
[97] David J. Lonsdale, "Information Power: Strategy, Geopolitics, and the Fifth Dimension", Colin S. Gray and Geoffrey Sloan (eds), **Geopolitics, Geography and Strategy**, London: Frank Cass Publishers, 1999, p.145.

country possesses. Having the information on the actions or plans about the other countries, a state may feel more secure, since it may have a chance to react in a timely manner with the information acquired.[98]

Moreover, "second kind of information is the knowledge of other's military and economic strength, internal political situation and domestic unrest.[99] Acquiring the general information about a country regarding these fields by using readily available information sources; forms the basis of the technique of collecting this kind of information.

Last but not the least, another important type of information is feedback. As mentioned earlier, governments have some certain plans and actions about their foreign and domestic policies. Naturally, they also may have the desire to get information about the effects of their own decisions and actions in the international arena.[100] In this context, it can be said that, intelligence involves information's collection, analysis, interpretation, and storage besides information's transmission to top-level foreign policy decision-makers.[101] All these processes have an important link to the level of information technologies since a poor level of technology may not provide the best compilation of information due to the shortcomings of the system generally.

In previous centuries, governments also had several channels of communication as the level of the information technologies allows them a certain degree of power of communication and effect on their people. As time goes on, a number of improvements have been occurred and the information technologies made a great degree of progress. Nevertheless sometimes this progress was perceived differently by the people of these countries. Referring Nye's sentences, in the course of the second half of the 20th century, most people feared that the scope of the communication and developments in the current information revolution would create a

---

[98] Russett, Starr, Kinsella, **World Politics: The Menu for Choice**, p.103
[99] **Ibid**. , p.102.
[100]**Ibid**. , p.103.
[101] J.P.Singh, "Introduction: Information Technologies and The Changing Scope of Global Power and Governance", James N. Rosenau and J.P.Singh (eds), **Information Technologies and Global Politics,** New York: State of New York University Press, 2002, p.1-38; See also, Sandra Braman, **Change of State**: **Information, Policy, and Power**, Cambridge: MIT Press, 2007.

1984-like atmosphere which was dramatized by George Orwell in his famous book called *1984.*[102]

Undoubtedly, through central databases, government identification and surveillance become easier to manage, but, on the other hand, it is also observed that new political actors are being empowered by the information revolution too. As a consequence the distribution of power also seems to be changing within these actors. Some writers suggest that the role of the nation-state and the balances in the system could change as a result of these dynamics.[103] According to Deutsch, especially under the certain abnormal conditions such as the "conditions of crisis, emergency, revolution, war and extreme factional conflict", it may become more difficult to enforce the related agencies or provide and protect the flow of information. Moreover, it also becomes even more complicated to identify the loyal and reliable members of the staff.[104]

But on the other hand, since the pace of the technological developments is considerably high, the technology of encryption also evolved and created more free space for the users of these technologies. Additionally, the Internet also appears as a deep ocean including billions of pieces of information stored in real small processors which are open to public and accessible freely from every part of the world. As a consequence, the size of the Internet makes it difficult to be controlled by the authorities and "new information technologies have tended to foster network organizations, new types of community, and demands for different roles for governors."[105]

The issue of control also appears as an important point since it is directly related with the governments' capacity to establish control over their territories and all the processes that have been going on within these territories. For instance, the economical power of countries may affect them while they are characterizing their approach to the information revolution. It can be stated that richer nations can be defined as better positioned in terms of their developments than comparatively poorer

---

[102] Nye, **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization**, p.82.
[103] For more information see: Richard O.Hundley, " The Information Revolution is Affecting Mechanisms of Governance and Empowering New Political Actors", **Global Course of the Information Revolution : Recurring Themes and Regional Variations**, Santa Monica: National Defense Research Institute, 2003.
[104] Karl W. Deutsch, **The Nerves of Government: Models of Political Communication and Control,** New York: The Free Press, 1966, p. 157.
[105] Nye, **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization**, p.82.

nations. This issue is directly related with the group of people who are dealing with IT activities in a country. In other words, "the movement of talented, IT-trained people can be a useful indicator of a nation's IR posture."[106]

On the other hand, the knowledge on information technologies in the hands of individuals may also create a more complicated atmosphere concerning security issues. According to what Bankes and Builder suggest, "the power of information, in the hands of individuals, will come to be seen as a rival to that of the nation-state; that information can be used effectively to prevent war; or to wage it; and that information can be exploited to perfect or destroy entire societies." [107]

As a result, it can be argued that, information technologies in general appear as one of the most important power assets due to their world wide availability and easy-to-adopt nature to very different usages in the hands of the very different parties.

1.2.2.   Intangible Instruments of Power

In this section, intangible instruments of national power, culture, historical trajectories, ideology, diplomatic instruments and lastly the quality of leadership and prestige politics which can be also stated as reputation in international arena, will be discussed in relation with their contribution on countries' both hard and soft power.

Firstly, the importance of the *culture* will be overviewed in detail while establishing its importance in national power. Since it is a commonly used word, *culture* has always been a popular term having the capability of including various meanings under a single word. More specifically, culture has gained a considerably high popularity in the second half of the 20th century due to its capacity to serve a one of the key explanations for states' and other political entities' foreign policies. It was observed that observers, academics and politicians put forward their estimates on alliances of states or the conflicts between them, referring the term culture. Moreover, having knowledge on the host country's cultural characteristics became an obligation

---

[106] Richard O.Hundley, " Summary", **Global Course of the Information Revolution : Recurring Themes and Regional Variations,** p.xxix.
[107] Steve Bankes and Carl Builder, **Seizing the Moment: Harnessing the Information Technologies,** Santa Monica CA, 1992, p.3 cited in J.Ashley Tellis, Christopher Layne ,L. Janice Bially, **Measuring National Power in the Postindustrial Age**, Cambridge: Rand Corporation, The, 2001, p.5.

for diplomats and a government analyst in order to understand a state's anticipated behavior.[108]

Furthermore, culture has also affects on the decision makers in a state and due to these effects, a state's foreign policy behavior may directly be shaped by the cultural impacts. As a result, if culture appears as a predominant factor in a state's foreign policy decision making, elites may likely to behave in line with these points even though the action may became significantly costly to the state in a material or social way. [109]

The term culture lacks a working definition despite the emphasis which was put on the term itself. Since culture is a product of an organized process, it can be stated that it may encompass the factors of religion, ethnicity, history, and civilization. More specifically "culture may often means customs, that is traditional or characteristic activities that can be observed, such as tribal dances, religious rites, marriage practices, and so forth."[110] Culture is one of the most important essences that help to preserve the unity of a society.

Especially beginning from the second half of the 20th century, culture became a mainstream explanation in international relations theory on states' foreign policy preferences. Sourcing from the idea of each state is very different than the others, learning its culture, and particular historical experiences became highly important. Beginning in the 1990s, many works in mainstream international relations appeared in which a major role of culture in explaining the actions of states and other actors in the international system is underlined.[111]

In this period, many International Relations theorists considered culture as an independent variable and used it to explain the foreign policy choices of the states; such as the rationale of establishing alliances between states, use or non-use of weapons in a given situation or economic behaviors of the states.[112] In line with this issue, culture can be a tool of foreign policy due to its capacity to create impact on the

---

[108] Brenda Shaffer, "Introduction: The Limits of Culture", Brenda Shaffer (ed), **Limits of Culture: Islam and Foreign Policy**, Cambridge: MIT Press, 2006, p.1.
[109] **Ibid**. , p.2.
[110] Glen Fisher, **Mindsets: The Role of Culture & perception in International Relations**, Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press Incorporated, 1997, p.43.
[111] Shaffer, "Introduction: The Limits of Culture", p.7.
[112] For more information see: Samuel Huntington, **The Clash of Civilizations and the Remarking of World Order,** New York: Touchstone, 1997.

decision-makers of the government and on the objectives of the country. On the other hand, culture also may affect the leaders negatively and cause them to be as "prisoners of their own cultural rhetoric" which may affect the decision making.[113]

Considering culture as an important element of power, its determining role on governments' should be observed. Countries with their influential cultural characteristics may create considerably important effects on other countries. American culture may be taken as an example due to its catch-all nature within the world. Besides its strong military institutions and economic structure, American culture influences the whole world. More specifically, the educational system of the country and schools to where thousands of students keep coming every year for taking quality education, the globally known Hollywood film exporters and producers, and many other elements create influence in the world and make people be curious about American culture more and more.[114]

On the other hand, the cultural influences of a country on other countries are not always considered positively. While Tanner Mirrlees was defining cultural imperialism as the transmission of "American values, ideologies, and images around the world" he was putting emphasis on the negative outcomes of the issue.[115] In line with the aforementioned nature of the culture as an important instrument of power, Mirrlees also states that, due to the "unequal, and asymmetrical international production, distribution, and consumption of media and information, which largely flowed from the North to the South, from the American imperial core to the rest of the world" a high degree of cultural dependency also being formed.[116]

Furthermore parallel to the issues of culture, Samuel Huntington, in 1993, wrote an article titles as the *Clash of Civilizations*, which became a globally well-known study since it was mentioning possible conflict scenarios that would likely to occur between the eight *civilizations* in the world which are defined by British historian Arnold Tonybee, as Western and Latin American, African, Islamic, Sinic, Hindu, Orthodox, Buddhist and Japanese. According to his view, the conflicts that may probably be break

---

[113] Markus Fischer, "Culture and Foreign Politics", Brenda Shaffer (ed**), Limits of Culture: Islam and Foreign Policy,** Cambridge: MIT Press, 2006, p.27-28.
[114] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, p.33.
[115] Tanner Mirrless, "American Soft Power, or, American Cultural Imperialism?", Colin Mooers (ed), **The New Imperialists,** Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2006, p.199.
[116] Mirrless, "American Soft Power, or, American Cultural Imperialism?", p. 201.

out in the new world, after the Cold War, would base on cultural issues instead of ideological or economic concerns.[117]

The events taking place in the world politics showed that cultural characteristics may have effects in these events besides the other catalyses. But, while taking culture into consideration as an instrument of power of states, states should take other states' rhetoric seriously and craft policies in reaction to them in order to be successful in their attempts. [118]

Furthermore, *historical trajectories* as another set of intangible power instruments appear to play important roles in national power measurement. First of all, it should be pre-stated that the term history has a complex and disputable nature due to its different meanings and areas of use. Nevertheless, over the past decades, sociology, economics, geography and many other disciplines have been considered under the domain of the discipline of history.

History is also provides society and individuals with a dimension of longitudinal meaning over time and help to establish connections between what happened in the past, and what is happening in the present and what will happen in the future. In this regard since history may maintain a linkage between the past and present conditions of the countries, the relationship between politics and history also appears as an important point of focus.

Importance of the historical background of the countries also appears to be acknowledged by the governments since the historical trajectories may play significant roles for strengthening the national power and consolidate domestic stability. For instance, history has been used by the political parties in power or the opposition groups, in order to conceptualize the collective past of the countries due to the needs of the current governments and the social dynamics.

These processes may vary between re-emphasizing the glorious days of the past or re-writing the collective history of a nation by ignoring the certain events totally

---

[117] For more information, see: Samuel P. Huntington, **The Clash of Civilizations and Remaking World Order,** New York : Touchstone, 1998.
[118] Shaffer, "Conclusion", p.329.

and creating a new history for the nation.[119] This may have different reasons, nevertheless the most prominent ones appear to be "the intention to save political place of the power parties or to maintain unity among the people of the nation."[120] Either reason can be considered under the domain of domestic politics. For instance, in Nazi Germany, "history was utilized as a tool of social control in an attempt to sharpen the masculine, heroic history of the Fatherland and of the German *volk* (people)".[121] In this regard, the creation and perpetuation of the so-called national myths play a crucial role in order to re-write the national history. These myths also pave the way to strengthen the national consciousness. Moreover, each country has its own versions of heroic history, "interpreted to suit the apparent needs of the spirit of a nation".[122]

Besides, history can be also used in order to interpret and shape the weight of the states in the international relations and foreign affairs. Historical background and historical bounds of the countries can be useful to analyze the possible power capabilities and their current positions in the international arena.

Former historical bounds of the countries can be useful to create influence over other countries. The United Kingdom provides a good example of this …The idea of the Commonwealth of the United Kingdom supports the UK's influence in the international arena especially among the Commonwealth countries. Nevertheless, the question of "How an archipelago of rainy islands off the north-west coast of Europe came to rule the world is one of the fundamental questions of not just British but of world history."[123] This may have several reasons, such as basically financial and military muscles of Britain. Additionally besides those, a number of features of Britain may be listed which influence the countries that they had governed. This list may include "the English language, English forms of land tenure, Scottish and English banking, the common law, Protestantism, team sports, the limited or "night watchman" state, representative assemblies and the idea of liberty."[124] All these points affected the idea of commonwealth, increased the influence of British Empire over the other

---

[119] See: J.E. Hobsbawm, Nations **and Nationalism, since 1780** (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1990); Benedict Anderson **Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of the Nationalism,** London: Verso, 2006.
[120] Jeremy Black and Donald M. Macraild, **Studying History**, London: Macmillan Press, 1997, p.10.
[121] **Ibid**. , p.10
[122] Black and Macraild, **Studying History**, p.8.
[123] Niall Ferguson, **Empire: How Britain Made the Modern World,** London: Penguin Books: 2004, p.xi.
[124] **Ibid**. , p.xxiii.

countries in the world and strengthened the past historical bounds between those countries.

Russia forms another example in this manner. Shortly after the end of the Cold War, it was observed that, former Soviet republics started to refresh and preserve their ties with Russia after a short break of independence. Also, Russia defined these countries as "near abroad" and tried to establish relations with them. Deriving from these examples, it can be stated that former relations and bounds among countries may play important roles on countries' power capabilities.

As another example Turkey's historical trajectories also played important roles while Turkey's formation and the politics. Having the linkages between its neighboring countries based on the Ottoman Past presented advantages as well as disadvantages for the country's politics. Furthermore, importance of Turkey's historical trajectories' will be overviewed in the third chapter in detail.

Furthermore, in addition to the culture and historical trajectories, the importance of *ideology*, as the third intangible instrument, should be also underlined. The term ideology occupies an important place in politics. Despite its significance and importance, it lacks an operational definition. Various meanings and definitions of the term are found in line with the variety of ideologies. Ideology has generally been defined as "a set of closely related beliefs, or ideas, or even attitudes, characteristic of a group or community"[125] or it may refer to "a set of core beliefs and values which explained and justified the way in which countries and societies were organized and which ideally served as a common rallying-point for both political leaders and popular opinion within term."[126] In this context, political ideology can also be defined as "the set of ideas and beliefs that people hold about their political regime and its institutions and about their own position and role in it".[127] With this meaning, political ideology can sometimes be synonymous with *political culture* or *political tradition*.

Since ideologies have relations with political and social behaviors and actions, the influence that has been created by ideologies is also very important. In this context, observing the uses of an ideology may give us hints about its role for a state and its

[125] John Plamenatz, **Ideology,** New York: Praeger, 1970, p.15.
[126] Aldred, **Superpowers in The Post-cold War Era,** p.4.
[127] **Roy C. Macridis and Mark L.Hulliung, Contemporary Political Ideologies, Movements and Regimes,** New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1996, p.3.

power capabilities. First of all, one of the most important functions of an ideology is its ability to give legitimacy to a political regime and its institutions. By the help of the ideology, states shape and operate the political framework of the political regime and provide information to citizens regarding their rights, duties and responsibilities within that political regime. Furthermore, ideologies also play a role as the solidarity and mobilization provider and a unifying and integrating mechanism for the groups of people who follow these ideologies. Ideologies also can be used as powerful instruments during times of social distress and anxiety, since they are able to play a unifying role for the people. Moreover, the sense of identity that has been provided by ideology for people who share it brings a high degree of emotional fulfillment which would cause internal peace among the citizens of a certain country and lead them to share the same ambitions and goals regarding the country's objectives.[128]

According to Kevin Harrison, ideologies are associated with power structures and modern politics can only be properly understood by reference to the great ideological movements such as conservatism, liberalism, socialism, fascism, and so on.[129] The term of ideology acquired and preserved a high degree of importance both before and in the course of the Cold War due to the dynamics of the system. Ideological debate was an important part of the political life before the twentieth century, but it has influenced politics during the twentieth century in ways that are different from previous periods. Although the degree of a certain country's power resources and the area of influence depended on the tangible assets such as its military capabilities, economic resources and the technological improvements, the ideology that they had been supporting also had a greater role. In the course of the Cold War, specifically the ideological background determined the nature of the foreign relations in a general sense. The importance of the ideologies reached its peak especially during the Cold War while the world evolved to a bipolar structure, the USA on the one side and Soviet Union on the other side. A 'Third World' between the two, neither communist nor capitalist, progressively became the battleground for the ideological and military conflicts of the Cold War. Because of the dominant structure based on ideologies that they are supporting, most of the other countries preferred to follow one of these two superpowers. Nevertheless, despite the heat of the ideological

---

[128] Macridis and Hulliung, **Contemporary Political Ideologies, Movements and Regimes**, p.9-12.
[129] Kevin Harrion, **Understanding Political Ideas and Movements,** Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003, p. 136.

conflict a group of countries preferred to act outside the ideological sphere and considered themselves not aligned with or against the Western or the Eastern Block.

Furthermore, although the Cold War period was over and international relations began to sit upon new dynamics and issues, the power of ideology did not lose its importance. In other words, the end of communism as a political system in the Soviet space did not mean the end of the communist ideology. Considering other ideologies, we see the rise of, nationalism in Yugoslavia, tearing the state apart, in Chechnya, Georgia and other geographies of the former Soviet Union. Fascism began to rise again in many of the ex-communist nations of the Eastern Europe and gained new supporters in the Western Europe as well. Finally, as the new century begins, Islamic fundamentalism began to pose a massive challenge to the ideological assumptions of the West as well.[130]

The importance of the soft power can be acknowledged when all those points are taken into consideration. Although the conflicts in Yugoslavia, Chechnya, Georgia and many other regions in the world required hard power measures in the first place, soft power also hold equal importance. Peace-building activities including the development of social and administrative infrastructures, the improvement of the judicial system and law-enforcement structure do not correlate with the hard power applications. As will be mentioned in the following chapters, providing development assistance is also taken into consideration as a part of soft power policies. While providing those aids, the ideology of the donor countries is also transferred to the recipient countries by several processes. Since those aids create a positive understanding in the eyes of the people in the recipient country, the ideology that they have been following and other political structures and processes in this country appear to be a 'good example' or the 'point of attraction' for those people.

Furthermore, the importance of the ideology should also be underlined related to the issues of Islamic fundamentalism. As Nye points out, transnational terrorist organizations like Al Qaeda also holds a high degree of influencing capacity for extremists. Referring Nye's statements; "if the Soviet Union and Communism

---

[130] **Ibid**. , p. 147.

41

presented the most dangerous soft power challenges to the US in the Cold War era, today's greatest challenge comes from radical Islamist ideology and organizations."[131]

So, it should be assumed that the lack of or existence of a strong ideology affects the power capabilities and degree of influence of a country. As mentioned above, political ideologies are important assets of soft power since they pave the way for a more stable domestic atmosphere which would eventually help countries to adopt a more determinant and influencing political stance in their international relations.

Besides ideology, ***diplomatic instruments*** also appear as important intangible instruments of power while measuring national power. The quality and effectiveness of diplomatic instruments have directly related with the foreign policy.

As Paul Gore-Booth stated, "Foreign policy is what you do; diplomacy is how you do it."[132] Nevertheless, despite the variety of techniques for the implementation of foreign policy, diplomacy in modern times is not the only way to establish a foreign policy but one of the majors. Specifically, the foreign policy implementation depends on several techniques. Nevertheless, as Morgenthau pointed out, a nation without diplomatic expertise may achieve only temporary successes rather than long lasting relations.[133]

Diplomacy is one of the techniques which involve direct, government-to-government interactions that are processed by diplomats. The importance of diplomacy is hidden behind its unique nature, since it may be classified as the central technique of foreign policy implementation and stands as the mere direct technique. On the contrary, other techniques usually may be combined with diplomatic instruments in order to create influence on the other states. For instance, although military instruments had considerably important effect on another state, but that mentioned effect may be exploited or enhanced by the role of diplomacy.[134]

---

[131] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, p,95.
[132] Paul Gore-Booth**, With Great Truth and Respect**, London: Constable, 1974, p.15 cited in Bruce Russett, Harvey Starr, David Kinsella, **World Politics: The Menu for Choice**, Boston, New York: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2000, p.104.
[133] Morgenthau, **Politics among Nations: the Struggle for Power and Peace**, p.155.
[134] Leon P. Polluda, "Diplomacy the Missing Link in the Study of International Politics" D.S.McLellan, W.C. Olsen and F.A. Sondermann (eds), **The Theory and Practice of International Relations**, Englewood Cliffs, N.J. Prentice Hall, 1974, p.194-202.

Diplomacy has been passing through a considerable huge process of change since the first idea of establishing diplomatic missions in other countries was put forward. Despite the changing trend in the regulations, the main objectives still stand the same. The foundations of the modern diplomacy were laid during the 15th century in Europe. In the course of the very first phases of the diplomatic interactions, government-to-government relations were forming the biggest point of concern. Additionally, the qualifications of the diplomats, their legal and social status in the host country and the various points related with the nature of the diplomatic missions within the countries were also important. Nevertheless, since the end of the 17th century and beginning of the 18th century, the literature about the issue was begun to change as the idea of the residency of the diplomatic missions began to gain acceptance among the states. For instance, especially after the signing of 1648 Munster and Osnabruck Treaties by the European states[135], these signatory states also decided to put more emphasis on strengthening their relations in the basis of peaceful resolutions. As a consequence, diplomacy gained more political dimension in its conduct.[136]

In this context, in relation with its mentioned political nature, the central feature of diplomacy should be defined as *communication*. Communication was also one of the main objectives of the first diplomatic missions' establishment during the fifteenth century. Diplomatic missions within the territories of other countries serve as one of the most important channels of interaction due to their functions of maintaining and facilitating communication and reducing the risk of misunderstandings in the interstate communication.[137]

In order to fulfill the mentioned objectives, a government should have a good quality diplomatic service. This constant qualified and long-lasting structure depends on the historical traditions and institutions that were established in time.[138] Also, the configuration of states' administrative organs, the size of bureaucracy, political bodies and the structure of its diplomatic organizations are of great importance. Moreover, diplomatic missions should also be equipped with high-level technological capacities and qualified personnel in order to fulfill their duties and create additional advantage to

---

[135] The series of these treaties are referred as the "Peace of Westphalia".
[136] Temel İskit, **Diplomasi, Tarihi, Teorisi, Kurumları ve Uygulaması**, İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2002, p. 9-11.
[137] Leon P. Polluda, "Diplomacy the Missing Link in the Study of International Politicsi" D.S.McLellan, W.C. Olsen and F.A. Sondermann (eds), **The Theory and Practice of International Relations**, Englewood Cliffs, N.J. Prentice Hall, 1974, p. 194-202.
[138] Morgenthau, **Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace,** p.157.

the states compared with others. These additional advantages result from a government's skill in manipulating its resources to influence other states via diplomatic negotiation and bargaining. As the world becomes more integrated, having the capacity of influencing a state appears as one of the most important issues. Since military techniques are no more considered as the first resolution methods in modern times, the importance of *bargaining* as a method of diplomatic interactions between states has gained momentum and the political aspects of power has begun to be discussed.[139]

Moreover, diplomatic instruments that are employed by governments also have direct effects on a country's credibility too. Diplomacy has political, economical, strategic, cultural and moral bases. So, a country that is not sensitive towards these mentioned values may not be considered as a credible country in the international arena. Consequently, this fact also affects the level of influence of a certain country, as well.

Lastly, **the quality of leadership**, as the fifth intangible instrument, is also an important determinant on defining the power capabilities of a state. Specifically, the quality of the leadership of a country may be defined as the "political skill of a state's leaders and the number of the skillful leaders it has."[140] In this context, there is a need for defining the skilled political operators. By definition, they are the ones "who can operate well in different policy realms" due to their knowledge and proficiency in techniques of persuasion and influence. Because of their skills, qualified governors and leaders create advantage for their country.[141] Hence, the power of a nation has direct links with the quality of its government. Most of the time, the quality of the government determines the sources of strength or weakness of a certain state. [142]

A good government can only be established by capable leaders. Moreover, establishing the objectives of the foreign policy and the methods being used to accomplish them as well as constituting the balance between those objectives and the power available for those objectives' fulfillment, form one of the most important bases of power of a nation.[143] As a consequence, nations that are donated with the various power capabilities appear to have different levels of importance in the international

---

[139] Roger Fisher, Elizabeth Kopelman and Andrea Kupfer Schneider**, Beyond Machiavelli**, London: Harward University Press, 1994, p.73.
[140]Art, "The Fungibility of Force", p.7
[141] **Ibid**. , p.7
[142] Morgenthau, **Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace**, p.154.
[143] **Ibid**. , p.159.

arena in which various policies of countries are conducted and ample relations are established. Furthermore, as the traditional distinction between foreign and domestic policies tends to break down, social and political relations between countries gained importance. So, in line with this issue, governments are in need of gaining support of not only from the domestic population but also the public opinion of other nations in conducting their domestic and foreign policies.

In the light of these processes, the conduct of foreign policy in recent times is being handled not only by the "traditional weapons of diplomacy and military might but also with the novel weapon of propaganda."[144] For the British historian E. H. Carr, effective propaganda was a major tool for those seeking to exercise political power.

Although the recent democracies tend to "rely on the rule of law rather than the rule of men",[145] the importance of the quality of leadership is still a valid criteria for analyzing a state's power elements. Currently, establishing political communication between leaders or the public opinion of other countries and their own country is considered as an inescapable leadership responsibility for them. It recently began to be seen in the advanced democracies as a key test of political competence.[146] Additionally, the personality of the leader can also be considered as a critical point of soft power emission. Operating in global information space means that the leader of a country is permanently a world public actor. S/he is a processor of inflows of information and naturally decides whether these inflows constitute a threat to the symbolic enclosures of nationhood.[147]

Besides the importance of the democratic institutions and all preset procedures of the modern states, actors are especially important in times of crisis and uncertainty. According to the political psychological perspectives, a state's behavior in the international politics can be explained by numerous individual characteristics, such as, "a leader's personality and motivation, the way a leader perceives the situation [s\]he faces, the advisory systems a leader creates, or the way a leader reacts to

---

[144] **Ibid**. , p.164.
[145] Carnes Lord, **Modern Prince: What Leaders Need to Know Now**, New Haven: Yale University Press, 2004, p.1.
[146] Lord, **Modern Prince: What Leaders Need to Know Now**, p.180.
[147] Alan Chong, **Foreign Policy in Global Information Space: Actualizing Soft Power**, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007, p.60.

domestic political pressures" [148] The political behavior of the leader has also affects on the political stance and power capabilities of a state. Besides their political behaviors, their ability of persuasion on both their own people and other countries' people are also of great importance.

Another point which is linked with the quality of leadership is the reputation of a certain country in the international arena. Because of the fact that good governmental skills may also pave the way to become a reputable country in the world. Nevertheless, despite the obvious connection between the nature of the leadership and the reputation of a country, there are also many other issues that are effective regarding the issue.

The prestige of a state in the international arena can also be analyzed based on the successful foreign policies of the state. In this context, the notion of *credibility* also appears as an important term which can be discussed along with prestige. In order to gain prestige and credibility in the international arena, a government should both have the capacity to carry out a specific action and the willingness to do so.

Moreover, the ways of acquiring reputation depend of many ways and can be related with a number of issues. Also the reputation, depending on how it is acquired, may be classified as negative or positive. So due to the nature of their reputation, the power of the states sourcing from their prestige may be affected.

It should be stated that "governments compete with each other and with other organizations to enhance their own credibility and weaken that of their opponents."[149] While the state itself was the mere determining actor in the previous decades, currently governments need to compete with a "broad range of alternatives including news media, corporations, nongovernmental organizations, intergovernmental organizations, and networks of scientific communities."[150] Although reputation has always mattered in world politics, it becomes even one of the most important assets of power of a state in modern times, despite its fragile nature.[151]

---

[148] K. Andrea Grove, **Political Leadership in Foreign Policy: Manipulating Across Borders,** Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007, p.3.
[149] Nye, **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization**, p.90.
[150] Nye, **Understanding International Conflicts: An Introduction to Theory and History,** p. 253.
[151] Goldstein, **International Relations**, p.59.

The general profile of the International System in the post-Cold War Era is discussed in relation with the concept of power as the tangible and intangible elements of power are concerned. As mentioned, both the general International System and the concept of power has changed and acquired new dynamics after the end of the Cold War. In the next section, the concept of security will be observed with its links between the above mentioned points.

1.3. CHANGING NATURE OF THE CONCEPT OF SECURITY

During the Cold War the primary international security threat was a possibility of a nuclear war between the United States and the Soviet Union. With the fall of the Berlin Wall in 1989 and the dissolution of the Warsaw Pact, this threat suddenly lost its primary importance. However, although the ideological basis of conflict seemed to be deactivated, a multitude of new security threats, such as terrorism, the proliferation of weapons of mass destructions, civil war, and ethnic conflict prevailed.

As the Cold War order ended approaches towards both international relations and security issues were needed to be revisited based on the new security threats. Although some authors pointed out the need to reexamine the meaning of security already in the 1980s; the concept of security has become increasingly contested in International Relations theories especially since the end of the Cold War.[152]

There are very different perspectives provided by different political scientists and analysts on the *new thinking in security*. Nevertheless, at the heart of this debate, on the one hand, there are many analysts who argued in favor of *"broadening"* the neorealist conception of security to include a wider array of potential threats, ranging from economic and environmental issues to human rights and migration.[153] Also, there is another group of analysts who argue for *"deepening"* the agenda of security studies

---

[152] Stephen M. Walt, "The Renaissance of Security Studies", **International Studies Quarterly** Vol. 35, No. 2 (1991): p. 211-239; Emma Rothschild, "What is Security?", **Deadalus** vol.124, No.3 (1995): p.53-98; David A. Baldwin; "The Concept of Security", **Review of International Studies**, Vol. 23, No.1 (1997): p. 5-29.
[153] See; Richard Ullman, "Redefining Security", **International Security** Vol. 8 (1983), 129-153; Theodore Moran, "International Economics and National Security", **Foreign Affairs** Vol. 69 (1990/91),p.74-90; Brad Roberts, "Human Rights and International Security**", Washington Quarterly** Vol.13, (1990),p.65-75; Peter W. Singer, "AIDS and International Security", **International Security,** Vol. 44, No.1 (2002): p. 145-158; Thomas Homer-Dixon, **Environment, Scarcity, and Violence,** Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001; B.R. Allenby, "Environmental Security: Concept and Implementation**", International Political Science Review,** Vol.21, No.1 (2000): p. 5-21.

by moving either down to the level of individual or human security or up to the level of international or global security with regional and societal security as possible intermediate points.[154]

This broader and deeper understanding of security has become widely accepted not only in International studies, but also among policy makers. The field of international relations today includes an ever-increasing number of studies on environmental security, human security, and HIV/AIDS as a security issue. Additionally, corruption; criminal groups; private militias; insecure borders; smuggling and trafficking in weapons; drugs; contraband and people; illegal migration; proliferation of nuclear, chemical, and biological weapons of mass destruction (WMD) and global terrorism become the issues of security.[155] Nevertheless, despite this shift in the security perceptions, the older security threats and perceptions did not disappear completely as well.

For instance, as both the United States and Russia still retained between 7.000 and 8.000 nuclear warheads, the end of the Cold War did not mean an end to the nuclear conflicts. Nevertheless, due to the mutual trust based on the foreign policy imperatives of these two countries, the threat of a global nuclear exchange has decreased.[156] Terrorism on the other hand, gained a greater importance worldwide, especially after the September 11, 2001 attacks in the USA. It started to create a more tragic situation as the terrorists have the capability of accessing to the potential chemical, biological, and nuclear weapons of mass destruction.

On the other hand, there are also many other threats of infectious diseases like HIV/AIDS. These types of diseases do not recognize territories and appear as a threat to all human beings in the world. As of 2008, World Health Organization has reported that, 33.4 million people live with HIV/AIDS worldwide, the vast majority of whom are in low- and middle-income countries.[157] Moreover, global infectious

---

[154] See; Robert A. Rubenstein, "Cultural Analysis and International Security", **Alternatives**.13,(1988), p.529-542; Barry Buzan, **People, States and Fear** Second Addition, Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1991; Ann J. Tickner, **Gender and International Relations: Feminist Perspectives on Achieving Global Security,** New York: Columbia University Press, 1992; Roland Paris, "Human Security. Paradigm Shift or Hot Air?" **International Security**, Vol. 26, No.2 (2001), p. 87-102.
[155] Anne Aldis and Graeme Herd, "Managing Soft Security Threats: Current Progress and Future Prospects", European **Security.** Vol.13, (2004) p. 169-186, p.171.
[156] Elke Krahman, **New Threats and New Actors in International Security,** Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005, p.5.
[157] World Health Organization, Data and Statistics , http://www.who.int/research/en/ [01.07.2010]

diseases, such as HIV/AIDS, caused 2 million deaths worldwide in 1999 and 3 million in 2003.[158]

Also, environmental threats began to be considered as very important issues since the last century. Since nature is a common value for all the human beings and the countries of the world, environmental issues also become one of the most essential issues. It should be taken seriously that, environmental degradation poses a threat to the ecosystem or to the human beings directly and it transcends particular states and conceptions of national security.[159]

Furthermore, there are many common points of the current security threats as well. First of all they have higher probabilities. Although the nuclear threat was the primary security threat in the course of the Cold War, its probability was seen as considerably low. In the 20th century, there was only one instance which was the World War II, when nuclear weapons were employed in a military conflict. New threats such as terrorism, transnational crime, civil conflicts, and HIV/AIDS are much pervasive and probable. For instance, compared with interstate conflicts whose numbers have been relatively stable, civil conflicts are about five times more frequent and the number of the internal conflicts are in an increasing trend since the end of the Cold War. The statistical chance of any individual being directly affected by one or several of these threats during their lives today is considerably higher than the threats of nuclear war have been during the Cold War." [160]

Moreover, another critical common feature of contemporary security threats is the fact that they do not target states only; but also societies and individuals. The new threats such as civil wars, terrorism, and transnational crime, the proliferation of small arms, environmental issues and HIV/AIDS have transnational characters. In this respect, the world dominated by the sovereign states and the order established between them appear to be more vulnerable for these transnational threats which have the ability to cross national borders and be able to undermine the security provisions of the national states.

---

[158] UNAIDS, AIDS Epidemic Update 2003, Geneva: UNAIDS/WHO, 2003 cited in Elke Krahman, **New Threats and New Actors in International Security**,p.12
[159] Keith Krause and Michael C. Williams, "Broadening the Agenda of Security Studies: Politics and Methods", **Mershon International Studies Review**, Vol.40, 1996, p.229-254, p.233.
[160] Krahman, **New Threats and New Actors in International Security**, p.7.

So, "the nature of threats, risks, and challenges and those forces that generate them require a far broader concept of security and the tools necessary to achieve desired end-states."[161] In this case, all the traditional security arrangements, such as large standing armed forces and the protection of national borders may not be sufficient in the fight against transnational threats. Also, as the new threats appeared in the international arena which changed the nature of the concept of security; a new set of international actors who are providers of security also prevailed. Non-governmental organizations, private military companies and international regimes and organizations are the examples of these new actors. All these mentioned actors expanded their contribution to the several different issues especially starting from the very first years of the post-Cold War era. NGOs appeared to be the key actors in the provision of human security in the post-Cold War interventions in the former Yugoslavia, Somalia, and Iraq. Furthermore, as of the mid-1990s, private military companies had began to provide several military support services for national armed forces and international peacekeeping by the private military companies. Lastly, international organizations such as NATO and the European Union increased the number of their members by expanding towards the post-Soviet countries in Central and Eastern Europe and address a new range of security threats.[162] All these developments also underline that, states are not mere actors in the international arena and the military power is not the only attribute concerning the security issues both domestically and internationally.

As a consequence, it should be stated that, the general characteristics of the security perceptions have been changing and should be analyzed in relation with many other issues. The politicians, the military, and the general public are increasingly recognizing that crime, terrorism, environmental degradation, and infectious diseases are endangering not only individual but also national security. The concepts regarding the questions of "what is security" and "how it can be achieved" will need to be constantly reassessed in a continuously changing security environment in which the neat dividing lines between hard and soft power, civil and military actors also rapidly began to dissolve. So, in this respect, a far more flexible approach towards the security required to be established.[163]

---

[161] Julian Lındley-French, "The Revolution in Security Affairs: Hard and Soft Security Dynamics in the 21. Century", **European Security**, Vol.13, 2004, p.1.
[162] Krahman, **New Threats and New Actors in International Security**, p.9.
[163] Lindley-French, "The Revolution in Security Affairs: Hard and Soft Security Dynamics in the 21. Century, p.2.

1.4. RISING IMPORTANCE OF SOFT POWER AFTER THE COLD WAR

As the issues and the characteristics of the new era began to change, the forms and sources of power appear to evolve and transform accordingly. While the traditional definition of power refers to the military capabilities, the scale of the territory or the number of population, the shift which appeared after the Cold War, shed light on the different aspects of power. Therefore, the technological, educational and economic factors become significant in power analysis while geography, population and raw materials preserved their importance.

Although all of the above mentioned elements of power hold their importance in different degrees, this undeniable change in the sources of power affected the international system and the behaviors of the countries fundamentally. Especially, as the post-Cold War system prevailed, which includes heavy discussions regarding its nature, the ideological curtain that cuts the world into two disappeared and many countries especially in the post-Soviet territories declared their independence. The number of the international actors increased in a considerably high pace and these changes brought new uncertainties including religious, ethnic or nationalistic conflicts. In this context, "some trends in world politics suggest that it will be more difficult in the future for any great power to control the political environment. "[164] Furthermore these new characteristics of the new era also admitted by various politicians and academicians. As quoted from Nye's writings, even Henry Kissinger who has deeply-rooted belief in classical balance of power politics stated in a 1975 speech that "we are entering a new era. Old international patterns are crumbling…The world has become interdependent in economics, in communications, in human aspirations."[165] Although the world was still under the domination of the ideologies of the superpowers in 1975 in which the speech was made, the statements of Henry Kissinger tended to point out the future developments of the post-Cold War years.

Since the new international system includes such changes, the goals of countries have been affected by those issues. Although the major objectives of the countries include expanding their borders and becoming militarily active and strong actors in the international arena before and during the course of the Cold War; those

---

[164] Nye, **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization**, p. 70.
[165] **Ibid**. , p. 70.

objectives needed to be revised after the Cold War as the concept and sources of power were also shifted. Although the military remained the ultimate form of power, the use of force became more costly than it was in the previous periods. Some of the other instruments, such as "communications, organizational and institutional skills, and manipulation of interdependence" become more important. [166]

So, instead of using military forces and coercing other states via hard power elements; the second face of power, which leads attraction and shaping the preferences of a country become more important. According to Nye, "soft power is the ability to get what you want through attraction rather than coercion or payments. It arises from the attractiveness of a country's culture, political ideals, and policies."[167] So in this respect soft power is considered as a form of power— one way of getting desired outcomes, in other words; the power of attraction.

The main difference between hard and soft power rests on the variety of ways for obtaining the outcomes that a country desires. While hard power includes the ways of coercing or commanding a country via military force applications, soft power on the other hand include ways of attraction via values, culture or the structure of the governance of a country. Despite these definitions, Nye claims that both soft and hard powers are two sides of one coin and "sometimes reinforce and sometimes interfere with each other."[168]

Nevertheless, soft power also may have its limits. For instance, from time to time attracting another country via intangible elements of power may be considered as "cultural imperialism" as has been discussed in different studies. The main point regarding these statements may be exemplified by using American soft power concept. According to the supporters of the argument of "cultural imperialism", the discourse of American soft power usually refers to underlining of America's global hegemony by exportation of American cultural values via governmental agencies and corporate media. Furthermore, according to a point of view incorporating soft power into a governmental strategy may appear a difficult task to achieve.[169] The main reason

---

[166] **Ibid**. , p. 71.
[167] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, p.x.
[168] **Ibid**. , p.25.
[169] For more information see: Tanner Mirrless, "American Soft Power, Or, American Cultural Imperialism?", Colin Mooers (ed), **The New Imperialists,** Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2006, Janice Bially Mattern, **Why Soft Power Isn't So Soft: Representational Force and the Sociolinguistic Construction of Attraction in World Politics**, Millenium: Journal of International Studies, 2005 Vol.33, No.3

behind this argument underlines the long term affects and results of soft power. Results may often take a long time to appear and politicians and publics may expect to see the prompt return on their investments. Moreover, as Nye mentions, the instruments of soft power may not be fully under the control of governments. Governments appear to control the policies but culture and values that were embedded in civil societies also play important roles.[170]

Moreover, soft power appears as important as hard power since, in the long run, changing the preferences of a country would become more beneficial due to the fact that if a country changes its understanding regarding an issue, no military intervention would be needed to shape this preference by using hard power instruments. In this context, countries that are likely to be more attractive in postmodern international relations are the countries that have the capacity to frame issues, whose culture and ideas are the ones that have proximity with international norms, and lastly whose credibility in the international arena is strengthened by their values and policies. [171]

On the contrary, it should be also underlined that the hard power instruments still preserve their importance since many conflicts with complex natures in different regions of the world which still continue and in most cases, after a conflict had broke out, some levels of military applications would be needed to stabilize the environment. Also hard power itself may become a source of attraction since it may play a blocking role against a country right before it starts its action.

Despite these facts, the importance of soft security threats and soft power should not be underestimated. Soft security threats that were previously mentioned have the capacity to pose risks to the quality of life as well as economic well-being of the countries. A state's capacity to act and ability to make strategic decisions and functions of governance may be affected by these threats badly.[172] Considering the new era's full of uncertainties profile, the significance of soft power regarding these threats is once underlined. Hence, in order to be more effective, hard and soft power should be considered as equally important while analyzing the current trends in international relations.

---

[170] Nye, "Foreword", p.xiii – xiv.
[171] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics,** p.5.
[172] Aldis and Herd, "Managing Soft Security Threats: Current Progress and Future Prospects", p. 185.

Nye also mentions about the critics about the soft power concept who argue that Nye believes that American way of life is so attractive that others are predisposed to follow Washington's lead.[173] Regarding those comments, Nye clarifies his ideas by putting emphasis on the nature of the soft power. He claims that much of his writings have been to warn American policy makers about the fact that American attraction should not be considered as given.[174] Soft power of a country should be strengthened and wielded by enhancing the several instruments of the soft power. Also, due to the special characteristics of the countries, their soft power instruments should be also observed in line with the conditions of the countries.

In this context, Turkey's soft power assets, its historical, cultural, economic and political capabilities will be discussed in the next chapter.

---

[173] Richard Ned Lebow, "Power, Persuasion and Justice," **Millennium** 33, 3 (2005): 552.
[174] Nye, "Foreword", p.x.

CHAPTER II

TURKEY'S CAPABILITIES AND SOFT POWER ASSETS IN THE INTERNATIONAL SYSTEM

The international system consists of sovereign states. The states conduct their foreign policies by taking into account the general dynamics of the international system and foreign policies of other states. Based on their tactical maneuver capabilities within the international system, states can be categorized under four groups such as; superpowers, great powers, regional powers and small states. The strategic planning of the superpowers and their projections are usually shaped another superpower's actions. Within this framework, great powers' strategic plannings are mostly affected from the strategic and tactical actions of the superpowers. Furthermore, the regional powers have to consider both the actions of superpowers and great powers along with the general dynamics of the international system mostly set by them. The strategic flexibility of the regional or small powers can increase in the fields where the actions of superpowers and great powers intersect.[175]

The categorization mentioned above was observed in broad terms during the Cold War in which the bipolar system shaped the states' perceptions about their capabilities. The USA and USSR, as the superpowers of the bipolar world, were designing their foreign policy outputs in order to affect another one's planning and strategic weight within the system. Nevertheless, the great powers such as England, France, Germany, China and Japan defined a three-stage policy for themselves in order to strengthen their powers and improve their relative positions within the international system. Those three stages were first, being in line with a superpower whose policy practices do not harm theirs, second to strengthen their positions in the eyes of the superpowers by entering into alliances among themselves; and lastly, establishing relations with the regional powers, without disturbing the superpowers, in order to expand their areas of influence. On the other hand, regional powers such as,

---

[175] Ahmet Davutoğlu, **Stratejik Derinlik: Türkiye'nin Uluslararası Konumu**, İstanbul: Küre Yayınları, 2008, p.74.

Turkey, India, Brazil, Egypt and Argentina had to behave parallel with tendencies of the superpowers which include commonalities with their policies.[176]

In addition to the constellation of states forming relations with each other according to the major dynamics of the Cold War international system mentioned above, there were certain political, economic and security issues on the agenda of the states pursuant to the main framework of the Cold War era. As it is known, after the end of the bipolarity and the bloc politics of the Cold War era, a remarkable change was observed in the general contours of the international system in which states are acting accordingly. Additionally, traditional issues prevailing during the Cold War era have begun to be re-conceptualized according to the changing dynamics of the post-Cold War international order. Apart from them, some issues which were either non-existent or deliberately ignored during the Cold War era have entered into the agendas of the state and non-state actors.

"The changes in the international system opened up new opportunities and brought to the forefront new threats for Turkish foreign policy"[177] which make it necessary for Turkey to create a new political environment by leading Turkish decision makers to re-interpret its own position concerning the shift of power within the global political system.

The new balances emerged on the regional basis after the Cold War were very significant for Turkey since it is located in an area in which conflicts are sourced from differences and/or ethnic, religious, cultural diversities throughout the history of civilization. In this context, it can be assumed that Turkey played a key role in the developments in its region. Turkey's position endowed it with ample opportunities in its policies towards Turkish Republics and Middle Eastern countries, as well as a number of constraints and burdens in its relations with the countries that are located near to Turkey.[178]

Furthermore, like the other countries which have been directly affected from the new dynamics of in the post Cold War era, Turkey has been subject to tremendous

---

[176] **Ibid**. , p.75.
[177] Yasemin Çelik, **Contemporary Turkish Foreign Policy**, London: Praeger Publishers, 1999, p.xv.
[178]Gözen; "Turkish Foreign Policy in Turbulance of the Post Cold War Era: Impact of External and Domestic Constraints", p.35.

changes which can be considered as both positive and negative. The uncertainties concerning Turkey can be categorized under two levels.

At the global level, after the demise of the Soviet Union, the role of Turkey both in NATO and in the world politics in general is needed to be reinterpreted. While Turkey was at the forefront of the Western block against the Soviet Union its strategic importance stemming from this position seemed to be decreased as the Cold War order was terminated. Nevertheless, Turkey has begun to gain an upper hand in the region as the relations with the Post-Soviet countries' based on kinship have prevailed. Turkey's success in increasing its relations with these newly independent states in a short span of time strengthened the positive image of Turkey in the eyes of the West, especially the USA, compared with the relatively strict Islamic regime of Iran which was also trying to create similar sphere of influence in the same region. Moreover, on the other hand, Turkey has been developing its economic relations with the European Union throughout 1990s which eventually paving the way to the Customs Union with the EU.

At the regional level, Turkey enlarged its policies and initiatives into four proximate directions, namely the Middle East, the Central Asia and Caucasus, the Balkans and the Central and Eastern Europe. Turkey's historical and cultural ties with countries and peoples especially in the first three regions provide Turkey with the opportunity and responsibility to play the role of mediator in some regional conflicts and contribute to the regional peace and stability like the talks between Israel and Syria, Iraq and Syria, and the conflicts in Lebanon, Iraq and Bosnia Herzegovina.[179]

Turkey's relations with its neighbors appear to be in a changing environment depending on the characteristics of the region and the relations between regional countries. In this context, the relations between Turkey and the countries in the above mentioned regions should be comprehended in the framework of this environment. Although the details of the political relations between Turkey and its neighboring regions are of cardinal importance for understanding Turkish foreign policy, it is also impossible to mention all the aspects of the relations within the scope of this thesis.

---

[179] Özgür Ünlühisarcıklı, "EU, Turkey and Neighborhood Policies", **Turkish Policy Quarterly**, Volume 8, Number:3, 2009, p.77.

Currently, it is obvious that, due to its proximity to the world's most conflict-ridden places, Turkey's role in the international arena and in its region is taken into consideration by attaching a high degree of importance. Considering the dynamics in the neighboring regions, Turkey occupies an important place in its region. In addition to its geographic location and historical linkages with the other neighboring countries, Turkey's cultural identity as a modern national formation backed by the parliamentary democratic governance, secular constitutional structure and majority of Muslim population[180] also play important roles on wielding Turkey's soft power in its region.

While it had been defined as a "buffer state" during the Cold War era, Turkey seems to gain more important position during the first two decades of the new post-Cold War international order. The roles of geopolitics, modernity and democracy as well as the intention of exhibiting a more proactive foreign policy in the neighboring regions grant Turkey important leverages. The strength of those intentions is also directly linked with Turkish capabilities of soft power. Being aware of the fact that, "the strategic depth as well as the ability to enlarge the sphere of influence have required both soft power and hard power"[181] assets, it may be stated that the dynamics of continuity and change in Turkish foreign policy needs a deeper examination which has direct links with the evolution of Turkey's soft power capabilities.

In this context, in order to adopt a large scale foreign policy, first of all, it is needed for Turkey to establish peaceful relations with its neighboring countries. Nevertheless, according to Davutoğlu, problems that occur occasionally between Turkey and its neighboring countries may make those policies difficult to implement. For instance, it may be very difficult to implement an efficient Balkan policy while having conflicts with Bulgaria and Greece; or having tense relations with Georgia, Armenia and Iran at the same time may also negatively affect a multi-dimensional Caucasian policy. Also, like the other regions problematic relations with Syria, Iran and Iraq may affect Turkey's foreign policy making towards the Middle East.[182]

In order to positively change the axis of the relations with the neighboring countries and to lead the relations towards a relatively less-conflict ridden atmosphere, cooperation among the peoples of those countries especially in the economic and

---

[180] E.Fuat Keyman, "Turkish Foreign Policy in a Globalizing World", **Turkish Policy Quarterly**, Volume: 8 Number: 1, 2008, p.36.
[181] **Ibid**. , p.4
[182] Davutoğlu, **Stratejik Derinlik, Türkiye'nin Uluslararası Konumu**, p.144.

cultural fields, should be established besides improving the relations at the governmental level. For instance, while the escalation of conflicts between France and Germany during the previous centuries can be counted among the reasons of the two world wars in the 20th century, and the current relations between those countries within the EU dynamics highlight a different picture that is shaped by mutual economic and cultural cooperation backed by the political decisions as well.[183] In this context, in order to strengthen its role in the region, Turkish foreign policy should revise its relations with the neighboring countries in countries in a range of various aspects.

Furthermore, a number of non-military instruments pave the way to establish peaceful relations with the countries in the region. Expansion of transportation facilities as well as improving the conditions and the volume of the border trade can play important roles in wielding cooperation between Turkey and the countries of the region. Those policies also can help to improve Turkey's soft power potential in the region.

In accordance with Keyman's statements regarding the soft power capability of Turkish foreign policy, soft power capabilities of Turkey have derived from very different sources such as,

> its journey in modernity despite the continuing deficits in making itself multicultural, democratic and pluralistic, its political commitment to democracy, despite its deficit in making itself consolidated and deepened; its economic dynamism, despite its deficit in making itself and economy which is sustainable in terms of its success in human-development; and its proactive, problem solving and dialogue based good neighborhood diplomacy, despite its deficit in making itself also realistic and effective.[184]

Elements of soft power in Turkish foreign policy will be discussed in the next section by relating their degree of contribution on wielding Turkey's soft power and increasing the sphere of influence in its region.

In order to survive, develop and become a respected member of the international community, all countries try to use their resources in advance in a

---

[183] **Ibid**. , p.144.
[184] E. Fuat Keyman, "Turkish Foreign Policy in the Era of Global Turmoil" **Seta Policy Brief**, Brief No: 39, Ankara, December 2009, p.4.

maximum way and optimize their needs with their assets to create influence on the other states. As mentioned, these assets may be the geographical location of the country, the structure of the population or the will and the ability to manage the resources that they already have. Moreover, countries need to maintain long-term strategies and plans regarding their potential and existing capabilities. As the dynamics of the world politics keep changing, countries need to keep up with them and adjust their policies according to those conditions.

Considering those facts, it can be said that Turkey has young and dynamic population with more than 70 million includes equipped personnel both in public and private sectors. Another comparative advantage of country would be its assets in natural resources. As discussed in the previous chapters, the tangible and intangible assets in which population and natural resources are important dimensions make Turkey an advantageous country in its region. Also the capacity in forming diverse cooperative relations in the variety of its surrounding regions, having very different characteristics, adds Turkey another soft power dimension.

Additionally, Turkey's other comparatively important assets such as its political structure with its democratic credentials, its cultural affinities and historical links with the other countries in the region, its developing economic structure and its strong and rooted military establishment, grant Turkey a special place in the region. Those are important elements to analyze when discussing Turkey's soft power capabilities in its region.

This type of analysis should include additional dimensions built upon Joseph Nye's traditional terminology of soft power based on carrots and sticks policies. We may rather underline "some larger concepts of cultural affinity, historical companionship, geographical proximity, social imaginary and how all of these create a sense of belonging."[185]

Being the successor of the Ottoman Empire, Turkey has a very long history in the region and nearly all of its neighbors were included in the boundaries of the Ottoman Empire as it is mentioned. In addition to its Ottoman past, geography of Turkey plays a large role on strengthening its soft power. Turkey occupies a unique

---

[185] İbrahim Kalın, "Debating Turkey in the Middle East: The Dawn of a New Geo-Political Imagination" **Insight Turkey**, Vol.11 No.1, 2008, p.90.

space compared with the many countries of the world. As a large country Turkey is located in the midst of Afro-European's vast landmass; which would help it to be defined as a central country with multiple regional identities that "cannot be reduced to one unifier character."[186] Turkey, as being a country that is cognizant of its soft power potential and having the ability to operationalize and project the power that it preserves would affect the regional and global dynamics. While countries like Iran or Egypt can be defined in relation with one single region this issue becomes complex in Turkey's case. Turkey's diverse regional composition and the uniqueness of its geographic and cultural elements create for Turkey the chance of controlling, influencing and maneuvering in several regions.[187]

Furthermore, Turkey takes this chance and transforms it to more operational facts with the policies and projects pursued by different departments of the government. For instance, while scholarships were given to the students from different countries like Azerbaijan, Georgia, Mongolia and many more, there were given numerous military and diplomatic trainings to the people from abroad. Furthermore, Turkish television stations broadcast to the different regions of the world and capture the attention of the people in these countries. In the economic sector, active Turkish companies have a larger part in the trade relations especially in Azerbaijan's construction sector.[188]

Nevertheless, since Turkey's soft power is mainly dependent on Turkey's ability and will to solve its own problems, the crises and critical periods in Turkey's history affect Turkey's image negatively. Besides Turkey's domestic environment,[189] the politics in the region with its global extension, the ups and downs in the relations with the EU[190] and the atmosphere in the regions neighboring Turkey have effects on its form of soft power regardless of its foreign policy towards those regions.

---

[186] Ahmet Davutoğlu, "Turkey's Foreign Policy Vision: An assessment of 2007", **Insight Turkey**, Vol.10 No.1, 2008, p.78
[187] **Ibid**. , p.78.
[188] Çelik, **Contemporary Turkish Foreign Policy**, p.xv-xvi.
[189] For more information see Philip Robbins, **Suits and Uniforms: Turkish Foreign Policy since the Cold War,** London: Hursct & Company, 2003 especially Part II. Domestic Motivators of Turkish Foreign Policy pp.93-229.
[190] Atilla Eralp, "Soğuk Savaş Sonrası Dönemde Türkiye ve Avrupa Birliği" Alan Makovsky and Sabri Sayarı (eds) **Türkiye'nin Yeni Dünyası: Türk Dış Politikasının Değişen Dinamikleri**, İstanbul: Alfa Basım, 2002, pp.235-255.

The Middle East appears to be one of the most important regions in formulating Turkish foreign policy because of the seriousness of events taking place in the region and Turkey's involvement in them. Turkey historically locates itself in the Western world and adopts Western approaches in line with its secular structure, and because of that, the relations with the Middle Eastern countries had been conducted on a more distanced perspective. Nevertheless, the current party in power, namely Justice and Development Party, seeks the ways to establish more complex and diversified relations with the regional countries.

The current Turkish foreign policy planning regarding the Middle East is highly criticized by both foreign channels and domestic actors. According to those views in general, "Justice and Development Party attempts to widen and deepen the legitimacy and power of its Islamic-authoritarian governance in Turkey."[191]

Specifically, as mentioned before, there is a process of continuity in Turkish foreign policy which has effects on both domestic and foreign policy makings of the country. Adopting a Western approach in its foreign policy making is one of the elements of the continuity in Turkish foreign policy. Nevertheless, the recent processes in Turkish foreign policy based on the strengthened relations with the Middle Eastern countries, pave the way for the discussions about the characteristics of Turkey its foreign policy orientation. These discussions both within the Turkish academics, politicians and media as well as in their foreign counterparts collectively point out for a 'shift of axis' under which Turkey has been going and gradually "drifting away from the transatlantic system and heading towards its turbulent south and east."[192] However, Turkish official channels do not share these views. For instance the Turkish Prime Minister, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, mentioned about this point in his speech in October 2009, and he disagreed with the opinions regarding Turkey's shift of axis. Moreover, the Turkish President Abdullah Gül also pointed out on November 4, 2009, that Turkey is not shifting its axis on politics but moving simultaneously in every direction, towards East and West, North and South.[193]

---

[191] E. Fuat Keyman, "Turkish Foreign Policy in the Era of Global Turmoil" **Seta Policy Brief**, Brief No: 39 (Ankara, December 2009), p.6.
[192] Cengiz Çandar, "Turkey's Soft Power Strategy: A New Vision for a Multi-Polar World", **Seta Policy** Brief, Brief No: 38 (Ankara, December 2009), p.3.
[193] **Ibid**. , p.4-5.

Along with the discussions on the "shift of axis" regarding Turkish foreign policy, there are also various critics about Turkey's relations with the Middle Eastern countries interpreting some aspects of the current direction of the Turkish foreign policy under the term of "Neo-Ottomanism" that is turning its back on the West, and moving to East and which would also mean giving more primacy to religious-based cultural affinities and expanding its sphere of influence via reviving the Ottoman past. Those critics are posed by different channels. The opposition parties in Turkey, domestic and foreign journalists, and Turkish and foreign academics refer to Neo-Ottomanism commonly in their writings. Those critics underline the point that, although Turkey takes some steps in order to stabilize the unstable space in its neighborhood, those steps should not damage or harm the historical and institutional belonging affiliations to the West. [194]

On the other hand, Turkey also catches positive signals from the Middle Eastern countries because of its current approaches towards the region. For instance, for the Arab world and beyond, Turkey's soft power becomes a subject of discussion within academia, policy makers, experts, journalists and business people.[195] Turkey's potential to influence its region in terms of economics and culture creates a new perception of Turkey in which Turkey takes its place as the provider of security and stability not only for itself but for the whole region. [196]

In line with this ambition, Turkey has undertaken a series of mediation efforts in the Middle Eastern region and other neighboring regions as well. For instance,

> The AKP government has mediated in talks between
> Lebanese factions; between Iraq and its neighbors; between India
> and Pakistan; between Pakistan and Afghanistan; between Syria and

---

[194]See: Omer Taspinar, **Turkey's Middle East Policies: Between Neo-Ottomanism and Kemalism**, September 2008, http://www.carnegieendowment.org/publications/index.cfm?fa=view&id=22209; [19.12.2010]; D.Lesser, "Turkey's Ottoman Mission", **Financial Times**, 23 November 2009, www.ft.com/cms/s/0/af859474-d868-11de-b63a-00144feabdc0.html; [19.11.2009]; N.Fisher Onur, "Neo Ottomanism, Historical Legacies and Turkish foreign policy", **EDAM Papers**, 2009/3, 03.11.2009, http://www.gmfus.org//doc/Discussion%20Paper%20Series_Fisher.pdf; [04.03.2010]

[195]See: Paul Salem, **Could this be Turkey's Century in the Middle East?** , 29.10.2009, http://www.carnegieendowment.org/publications/index.cfm?fa=view&id=24067, [03.06.2010]; Stephen Kinzer, **Turkey leads the Muslim World**, 27.10.2009, http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2009/oct/27/turkey-muslim-world-leader-israel, [03.06.2010]; Marwan Al Kabalan, **Turkey is becoming a regional broker**, 07.10.2009, http://www.tehrantimes.com/index_View.asp?code=207291, [03.06.2010]

[196] İbrahim Kalın, "Debating Turkey in the Middle East: The Dawn of a New Geo-Political Imagination", **Insight Turkey**, Vol.11 No.1, 2008, p.83-96, p.90.

Israel; and between the Palestinian Authority and Hamas. It has risen the task in supporting the Annan Plan for a solution to the Cyprus issue in 2004. It has also pressed for a solution to the simmering Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. And, in the wake of the August 2008 war in Georgia, it has launched the Caucasus Stability and Cooperation Platform (CSCP), a regional platform bringing together Russia, Georgia, Turkey, Azerbaijan and Armenia.[197]

Not only, Turkey's relations with its neighbors in the Middle East but also its relations with the other neighboring countries in the Central Asia and Caucasus and Balkans, are also of great importance. Central Asian Republics have special links with Turkey. Except for the republic of Tajikistan which is a Persian-speaking country, all the other republics are Turkic in language and culture. Because of this proximity and linkages, the fact that Turkey's status as a "cultural magnet"[198] for these republics was preserved and even strengthened after the end of the Cold War era. Although Turkey's stance regarding the people living in those republics during the Cold War was cautious due to the Soviet Union's presence, the developments after the Cold War began to occupy a larger attention both within the Turkish public opinion and the government elites. Those issues catched a high degree of support especially in Turkish nationalist and religious press.[199] Due to Turkey's economic and political structure, the *Turkish Model* was forwarded as an ideal Muslim democracy, and a model of development especially for Kazakhstan, Kirgizstan, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan and Azerbaijan which are both Muslim countries in the region and having ethnic and linguistic ties with Turkey.[200] Because of the mentioned issues, Turkic Republics have been seen as significant areas for Turkey's soft power practices in the region. As mentioned by the Turkish political elites, "one of the objectives of Turkey towards Central Asia is strengthening relations and cooperation between brotherly countries. Besides bilateral relations, Turkey also attaches importance to regional cooperation."[201]

---

[197] Piotr Zalewski, "Turkish Foreign Policy: Telling Style from Substance," **Turkish Policy Quarterly**, Volume: 7 Number: 4, 2008, p.58.
[198] Graham Fuller, "Turkey's New Eastern Orientation", Graham E. Fuller and Ian O. Lesser with Paul B.Henze and J.F.Brown, **Turkey's New Geopolitics, From the Balkans to Western China**, Oxford: Westview Press, 1993, p.67
[199] **Ibid**., p.67-68.
[200] İdris Bal, **Turkey's Relations with the West and the Turkic Republics: The Rise and Fall of the 'Turkish Model',** Hampshire: Ashgate, 2000, p.5.
[201] Turkey's Relations with Central Asian Republics, http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey_s-relations-with-central-asian-republics.en.mfa , [11.11.2009]

Furthermore, the Caucasus region as well preserves high degree of importance regarding Turkish influence capabilities and soft power. As mentioned in the previous section, there were problematic issues especially with Armenia, but due to Turkey's "zero-problem with the neighbors"[202] policy by the current government, it was aimed the relations with the countries in this region to evolve towards a different platform. Hence, the changing nature of the relations has acquired greater importance in the discussions regarding Turkey's soft power capabilities in the region.

Moreover, the Balkans is another region around Turkey which has the Ottoman Past and a common heritage of culture and history. Due to this proximity between Turkey and this region, Turkish decision-makers attach high degree of importance, as we have seen in the other regions with regard to the developments in the area.

Furthermore, although there are various countries having different levels of soft power and influencing capabilities depending on their specific resources, having a global vision and ability to comprehend and interpret dynamics of the world politics appear to be very significant assets for the countries. This is the same for Turkey as well. The fact that comprehending the global issues within a main framework and interpret the outcomes in tune with its soft power capabilities would serve a very important ground for Turkey. Discussions about whether Turkey possesses this kind of global vision create a fertile ground for the analysis of Turkey's soft power. For instance, Soner Cağaptay in his article mentions about Turkish media and the active public regarding Chinese government's crackdown against the Uyghur Turks in China in early July 2009 and on the contrary its comparatively silent stance on the Tibet issue. According to him, Turkey should attach the same degree of importance for the events in order to become an influential and credible country in the world politics.[203]

On the contrary, Paul B. Henze states that

Turkey's geography subjects it to influence from all sides which it cannot escape. The great burst of economic, social, and political development which the country experienced during the 1980s

---

[202] Bülent Aras, "Davutoğlu Era in Turkish Foreign Policy", **Seta Policy Brief**, Brief No: 32, Ankara,May 2009, p.6.
[203] Soner Cagaptay, **Size Matters in Turkey's Shifting International Role**, Hurriyet Daily News, July 22, 2009, http://www.washingtoninstitute.org/templateC06.php?CID=1312 [18.01.2010]

has greatly improved its ability to cope successfully with the internal and external forces that impact upon it.[204]

During the 1990s and the first decade of the new millennium, the mentioned developments have been creating various chances for Turkey to gain the capacity to influence the regions near it and even more distant regions. So in this context, it should be stated that the circumstances under which Turkish foreign policy was reconstructed have a global nature and scope. Furthermore as Zbigniew Brzezinski also stated that the Turkish foreign policy most of the time was shaped under a "global turmoil" referring the nature of the Middle East, the Balkans, and the Caucasus as well as the effects of the global economic crisis, terrorism and global climate change regardless of any specific state.[205] A global set of solutions are needed because of the global nature of these challenges. Consequently, Turkey's active diplomacy, the so-called "strategic depth" in Ahmet Davutoğlu's terminology seems to have strong links due to its aim for having zero-problems with the neighbors.

As mentioned by several times, "Turkey is, all at once, a European, Middle Eastern, Balkan, Caucasian, Central Asian, Caspian, Mediterranean, Gulf, and Black Sea country." These multiple regional identities, as well as Turkey's historical and cultural legacy, pave the way to adopt a multilateral foreign policy.[206]

In addition to all the points mentioned above, especially four types of assets appear to be among the most significant points that need further elaboration in order to examine the details of the main subject of this study. All of them would help us to understand how to use these assets as the elements to strengthen Turkey's soft power.

---

[204] Paul B. Henze, "Turkey: Towards The Twenty-First Century", Graham E. Fuller and Ian O. Lesser with Paul B.Henze and J.F.Brown, (eds) **Turkey's New Geopolitics, From the Balkans to Western China**, Oxford: Westview Press, 1993, p.2.
[205] Z.Brzezinski, **The Choice: Global Domination or Global Leadership** (Newyork: Basic Books, 2004 cited in E. Fuat Keyman, "Turkish Foreign Policy in the Era of Global Turmoil" **Seta Policy Brief**, Brief No: 39 (Ankara, December 2009), p.10.
[206] Piotr Zalewski,"Turkish Foreign Policy: Telling Style from Substance," **Turkish Policy Quarterly**, Volume: 7 Number: 4, 2008, p.56.

2.1. DEMOCRATIC BASIS OF THE POLITICAL STRUCTURE

Turkey has a number of assets that can be considered in the context of soft power analysis. The democratic basis of the Turkish political structure is one of the most important assets. According to Ahmet Davutoğlu, the Minister of Foreign Affairs and a political scientist, Turkey's most important soft power asset is its democracy.[207] So, we can argue at the outset that when lacking a fully functioning democracy, Turkey may lose or damage its credibility and attractiveness. This, in return, may affect Turkey's soft power capabilities negatively. Furthermore, the internalization of democracy by the political actors, state elites and civil society actors both in their discourses and practices will provide a positive effect and also help the country to become stronger against the crises, polarizations and separations in domestic politics.[208]

In the course of the very first years of the republic, the early founders of Turkey considered establishing a democratic structure in Turkey as one of the most important priorities which should be fulfilled in advance. Kemalism, as the state philosophy of the new Turkish Republic, included the wishes "to shake off the spirit and policies of the Ottoman past. Ataturk's ambition was also to present the international world with a Turkey that would distinctly differ from the political structure of the empire." [209] In addition to Ataturk's ambition and the supportive ideas of the founding elite, the decision to transform Turkey into a democracy also had some foreign motivations. The international scene in the post World War II era affected Turkish policy planning. As the democratization processes all over the world prevail during the 1950s, the current administration of Turkey and the principles of the party in power (Republican Peoples' Party - RPP) needed to be revised.[210] As a consequence, the multiparty system was introduced in Turkey in 1946. Despite the military coups took place since then and the interruption in the multiparty system, the political system in Turkey and democratic basis of the country are preserved in general terms. Turkey was one of the earlier nation-states that wield for multiparty pluralist democracy. The beginning of the Turkish

---

[207] Davutoğlu, "Turkey's Foreign Policy Vision: An assessment of 2007", p.77-96.
[208] E. Fuat Keyman, "Globalization, modernity and democracy: in search of a viable domestic polity for sustainable Turkish foreign policy", **New Perspectives on Turkey**, no: 40, 2009, p.7-27.
[209] Ferenc A. Vali, **Bridge Across the Bosphorus: The Foreign Policy of Turkey**, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1971, p. 54.
[210] **Ibid**. , p. 64.

democratic odyssey cannot be dated any later than 1946, which should place Turkey in the same group of democratic states as Italy, Germany, India, Japan, Israel, and Greece. Furthermore, Republican Turkey was one of the first political systems of the world to extend socioeconomic and political rights to women in the 1930s[211]

As well as these mentioned issues, Turkey's political governance has been transformed over the past decades by the impacts of several issues such as the democratization process, developments in the relations with the European Union or the natural disasters such as earthquakes, and economic crisis.

Nevertheless, beginning from the establishment of the Turkish Republic, there were several periods having included political crises and instability in the governmental bodies of Turkey. Ersin Kalaycıoğlu defines those periods as "the periods of democratic governance, such as 1950-1959, 1963-1971,1973-1980,1987-2004, and the periods of one-party in disguise during 1946-1950, 1959-1960, military intervention and heavy-handed meddling into civilian, democratically elected governments during 1961-1963, 1971-1973,1980-1987."[212]

Aside from the periods of crisis or instabilities, Turkish political system still preserves a high degree of significance for its region consisting of a number of Muslim countries most of the political regimes of which cannot be listed as democratic. Having a majority of Muslim population with a secular system in a conflict-ridden geography, Istanbul, as mentioned by some analysts, "is not just a bridge between cultures but also between political outlooks."[213] In this context, Turkey's democracy can be considered as very important asset for Turkish foreign policy and its soft power.

Turkish officials had also followed policies which highlights these assets of Turkey. Especially immediately after the Soviet Union's dissolution, Turkey launched a new "Turkic Diplomacy" towards the Turkic republics with which the relations were frozen for a long time. Starting from 1991, teams of Turkish diplomats began to pay visits to capitals of each former Soviet republic and formal recognitions of those republics followed the process accordingly. Turkey became the first country to recognize Azerbaijan and the Central Asian republics. Furthermore, during 1991 and 1992, presidents of Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan paid visits to Turkey upon the invitation of the late president Turgut Özal.

---

[211] Ersin Kalaycıoğlu, **Turkish Dynamics : Bridge Across Troubled Lands**, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005, p.191-197.
[212] **Ibid**. , p.197.
[213] "A Tale of Two Cultures", al-Ahram Weekly, No.879 (10-16 January 2008) http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2008/876/re63.htm cited in İbrahim Kalın, "Debating Turkey in the Middle East: The Dawn of a New Geo-Political Imagination", p.89.

Turkey's initiatives were also supported in the international arena. The "Turkish model" which underlines Turkey's position as "the single and most advanced westernizing state in the entire Islamic world"[214] was considered to be a good example for the newly independent former Soviet republics. Turkey's political assets, like the presence of liberal, democratic and secular characteristics, played important roles in this process.[215]

Furthermore, in order to understand the role of the democratic basis of the political structure in Turkey's soft power practices, current processes of the government can be investigated as well. Starting with the Middle East, which has a special importance in the eyes of the Turkish decision makers and the public also, it can be traced considerably important developments. Especially election of the Justice and Development Party's (JDP)[216], created a positive atmosphere among the Middle Eastern intellectuals regarding Turkey.

For instance, according to Basheer M. Nafi, who is a senior research fellow at al-Jazeera Centre for Studies, both uneducated and educated Arabs have an admiration at Turkish economic growth and the political stability of the country as well as the influence of Turkey in the region. They consider JDP as a secular, conservative party that is led by factors with an Islamic background.[217] Furthermore, according to their understanding, the election of this party strengthened the democracy in Turkey and once again proved that Turkey's democracy practices are far from just window dressing.[218]

Nevertheless, due to the political backgrounds of the members of the JDP, a high degree of opposition inside and outside the parliament and the state institutions raised against the new power party of Turkey criticizing their Islamic tendencies and their "*secret agenda"* for dismantling the secular foundations of Turkey.[219]

---

[214] Duygu Bazoğlu Sezer "Turkey in the New Security Environment in the Balkan and Black Sea Region", Vojtech Mastny and R. Craig Nation (eds), **Turkey Between East and West: New Challenges for a Rising Regional Power,** Oxford: Westview Press, 1996, p.86.

[215] For more information see also: İdris Bal, **Turkey's Relations with the West and the Turkic Republics,** Hampshire: Ashgate, 2000.

[216] *Justice and Development Party* (AKP) was established by a group of younger members of the *Welfare Party* (RP)-*Virtue Party*(FP) elite, and had success at the last two elections (November 3, 2002 and June 26, 2007) in Turkey. Administrators of the party including the current Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, define their vision and mission by distancing themselves from their past Islamic revivalist records, and have been systematically arguing that politics and religion should be kept apart.

[217] Basheer M. Nafi, "The Arabs and Modern Turkey: A Century of Changing Perceptions", **Insight Turkey**, Vol.11 No.1, 2008, p.63-80.

[218] Meliha Benli Altunışık, "The Possibilities and Limits of Turkey's Soft Power in the Middle East", Insight **Turkey**, Vol.10 No.2, 2008, p.47.

[219] İlter Turan, "Unstable Stability: Turkish Politics a the Crossroads", **International Affairs,** Vol:83 No:2, 2007, p.320.

On the other hand, despite the critics against the JDP, the opinions in favor of the party's coming to power underlined the Turkish domestic politics during the 1990s. With the effect of the 10% national threshold in the elections, Turkey had to be governed by the coalition governments in those years since none of the parties managed to get the majority necessary the votes to form a single party government. The discords in the parties which form the coalition's governments most of the time caused instability or disagreements in the domestic politics of the country.[220] Opinions favoring JDP's coming to power stressed the fact that; after twelve years ruling by unstable coalition governments[221] JDP's rule would create a more stable domestic atmosphere which gradually turn the country to a more decisive actor in international relations and finally become a soft power in the region including the capacity to create influence among the other regional countries.[222]

As mentioned earlier, Turkey's democracy is a very important component of Turkish soft power capabilities. Transparency, the rule of law and political accountability in government are concerned as attractive qualities, both in the region and globally. Turkish government has processed a series of administrative procedures in order to provide transparency in a number of processes. Especially processes for providing access to information about regulations currently in force are consistent with the existing trend in democracies. As an example for transparency in the governmental practices are the practices of the ministries in publishing their draft legislations on their web sites. Furthermore the *Action Plan for Increased Transparency and Efficient Administration* in Turkey was approved by the Council of Ministers on January 12, 2002. Furthermore, broadcasting of the TBMM's plenary sessions by the Turkish Radio and Television Corporation (TRT)[223], the publication of draft and proposed laws and parliamentary control activities on the web site of TBMM[224] are other examples of the developments regarding transparency in Turkish politics. Additionally, in terms of the political accountability, one of the most important examples can be the Turkey's general elections practices which usually have been held in every four years. During the election campaigns, the performances of the political parties, the leaders of those parties and the deputies of the TBMM are being observed by the public and votes are

---

[220] Kalaycıoğlu, **Turkish Dynamics: Bridge Across Troubled Lands**, p. 149.
[221] **Ibid**. , p. 155-159.
[222] İlter Turan," Unstable Stability: Turkish Politics at the Crossroads", **International Affairs**, Vol: 83 No: 2, 2007, p.319.
[223] TBMM TV, http://www.tbmmtv.com/ , [02.04.2010]
[224] TBMM, http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/, [02.04.2010] TBMM Haber, http://www.meclishaber.gov.tr/develop/owa/haber_portal.giris , [02.04.2010]

given accordingly. Furthermore, the regular activities of the TBMM – written and oral questions, special plenary session requests, and the formation of inquiry and investigation committees – can also be considered as various forms of political control. Lastly, although it is written in the constitution of the Turkish Republic, Turkey is a state governed by the rule of law, its determination to strengthen the rule of law in the political practices and in public considerably increased in the process of complying with the Copenhagen Criteria after 1999.[225] In line with all the mentioned points above, "as a prospering county in terms of its political structure and current processes; Turkey's image is considered positively in the regions near Turkey. [226]

2.2 CULTURAL AFFINITIES AND HISTORICAL BACKGROUNDS

Modern Turkish Republic is a successor of the Ottoman Empire. Therefore, in order to understand the current dynamics of Turkey, its linkages with the Ottoman Empire and the impacts of the past events should be examined and taken into consideration. The Ottoman Empire was a state in which various ethnic and religious groups lived in close proximity. While Muslims were a large majority in all the Asiatic provinces and comparatively less population in the European provinces, most provinces had significant Christian or Jewish minorities.[227] The major non-Muslim religious groups in the empire were the Greek Orthodoxes, Gregorian Armenians, and Jews.

The Ottoman system based on religious separatism within a political unity. The Muslims were the groups who have the authority and political priority inside the empire. Nevertheless, non-Muslims were also given a high degree of religious freedom, in the framework of the *millet system*, under which the social and religious characteristics of the Ottoman Empire were organized. Despite the regulations of the *millet system*, the Ottoman Empire was still an Islamic state and Muslim groups were the undisputable leaders of the political life in the empire. Nevertheless, the relative economic freedom, which was given to the non-Muslim groups in the empire, was also

---

[225]The Republic of Turkey Ministry of Environment, **National Report Turkey**; World Summit on Sustainable Development, Johannesburg 2002, p.101-118.
[226] İhsan Dağı, "Editor's Note", **Insight Turkey,** Vol.10 No.2, 2008, p.3-4.
[227] Justin McCarthy; **The Ottoman Peoples and the End of Empire,** London: Oxford University Press: 2004, p.2.

affecting the economic prosperity of those peoples in the empire. It was observed that, especially in the nineteenth-century, non-Muslim groups in Anatolia, the Balkans and the coastal Syria were developed economically, whereas the politically priority-given Muslim groups were remained comparatively undeveloped in economic terms.[228]

Although the mosaic-like structure of the Ottoman Empire has become even more diversified with the new conquests during the 600 years-old history and a considerably high degree of cohesion among the peoples of the empire was observed, the Ottoman Empire also could not remain immune from the developments in the world politics, especially starting from the 19th century. Late 19th century was basically a period of time, starting from the *Tanzimat*, the period of reform and modernization initiated by sultan Abdülmecid in 1839 with the declaration of the *Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayunu*, and ending with the decline of the empire and establishment of the Turkish Republic. In the course of this period, a series of transformations and convulsions by the help of which the 600-year-old empire with territories stretching from North Africa across the Middle East to Europe, turned to a nation-state struggling for survival during in post-World War I era.[229] Despite the efforts of the Ottoman states people, the decline of the empire could not be stopped.

In the course of the decline of the Ottoman Empire, starting with the Balkans and followed by the Middle Eastern and other provinces' conquering their independences one after another, numerous wars and conflicts took place. As a reaction against the long Ottoman rule, those newly independent states did not want to proceed with the former Ottoman traditions, especially the Ottoman ideal of a state encompassing many ethnic groups. Although the ethnically and religiously diversified Balkans, the Middle East and Caucasus experienced a number of conflicts among each other through the history, the Cold War order seemed to have a temporary stabilizing effect since the ideology was the primarily important issue.

Currently, the group of countries which were once under the Ottoman rule forms the neighborhood of Turkey. The nature of Turkey's relations with those countries appears to be depending on the later developments and issues affecting the processes. For instance, while Turkey had a chance to establish close relations with

---

[228] **Ibid**. , p.218.
[229] Ebru Boyar, **Ottomans Turks and the Balkans: Empire Lost Relations Altered**, London: I. B. Tauris & Company, Limited:2007, p.4.

the former Soviet Turkic republics due to the ethnic bounds between each other; the relations with Greece, with whom a population exchange was done in the first years of the Turkish republic, may get tensed because of the Aegean Sea and islands and the Cyprus issue and then miraculously got softer and cooperative due to the effects of the 1999 earthquake in Turkey and Greece.

Stemming from those examples, we can assume that, the relations between Turkey and neighbors generally appeared on a floating environment. The nature of the relations was defined by the historical background that they have been sharing and the Ottoman Legacy that was experienced by nearly all of them. In this context referring Nye's terminology if "soft power is also about arousing interests, capturing imagination and causing admiration."[230], Turkey's cultural and historical heritage and Turkish society's characteristics may play a central role in increasing Turkey's soft power and help Turkey to become a central country in its region.

Nevertheless, although it was mentioned that Turkey may have a potential of creating a sphere of influence in the former Ottoman territories by the help of the past linkages with those countries, the differentiated mottos of modern Turkish Republic caused a break from the old traditions and relations. From the cultural-religious point, it may be stated that "Ottoman Turks formed the outstretched arm of Islam in Europe." during the Ottoman period. Islamic Ottoman Turks fought their way into Europe and especially during the first years of Turkey, cultural ties and relations with Islamic East were cut-off and they preferred to establish connections with European-Western civilization.[231] Although Turkey had followed this policy for years, eventually there appeared some changes and many more steps were taken towards the previously ignored regions.

As a very important region, the Middle East always has deep relations with Turkey. As mentioned in the previous chapter, most of the countries in the region have various issues with Turkey. In the early years of its establishment, the so-called Turkish model was so popular in Middle East among some leaders and intellectuals, as was the case in Iran. Turkey's resistance on accepting the post-WW I settlement which was tried to be imposed by the victorious powers - *the Allies* - of the war created a positive image in the eyes of the regional countries. Turkey's war of independence was closely

---

[230] Hakan Altınay, "Turkey's Soft Power: An Unpolished Gem or an Elusive Mirage?", **Insight Turkey,** Vol.10 No.2, 2008, p.59.
[231] Vali, **Bridge Across the Bosphorus: The Foreign Policy of Turkey,** p.48.

monitored by the intellectuals in the Middle East region.[232] Also, the extensive modernization steps that were initiated by the government aftermath the Independence War in Turkey doubled the importance of Turkey in the region.

Nevertheless, despite the positive image of Turkey that was created in the eyes of the countries in the Middle East region which also may be considered a soft power asset, the events took place in the Post-World War II and some certain limitations began to be realized. As Turkey began to define itself as belonging to the Western camp and distanced itself from the Middle Eastern region, relations with the neighboring countries seemed to be affected by those developments. In addition to the Turkey's joining in NATO, the recognition of Israel as an independent state in May 1949, by Turkey also had impacts on the relations. Consequently, as a result of the mentioned developments, Turkey's relations with the Middle Eastern countries seem slowed down. "Thus, during most of the Cold War, Turkey had a limited influence in the Middle East. Turkish foreign and security elites defined the region as unstable and conflict-ridden, and thus tried not to 'get drawn in to the Middle East swamp.' "[233]

Nevertheless, since the change of, the Cold War order, several fields of cooperation between the countries of this region and Turkey have been emerged. For instance, the improvement of of economic relations among Turkey and Arab countries based on the foreign trade applications can be counted as an important development. Moreover, due to the geographical contiguity, Turkey may become a passageway and a center for oil and gas distribution for Europe.

All these changes had a great affect on how Turkey perceives and evaluates the region. As a consequence, Turkey's role in the Middle East may shift to a more diversified and solid nature. Moreover, the decreasing importance of Arab nationalism in addition to the deepening political and economic crisis in the region caused the countries of the region to rethink about Turkey's role.[234] Especially considering Arab media's interest on Turkey, Turkey's cultural affinities attract the attention of the Arab people.

---

[232] Ervand Abrahamian, **Iran Between Two Revolutions**, Princeton, N.J. : Princeton University Press, 1983); Touraj Atabakı, "The Caliphate, The Clerics and Republicanism in Turkey and Iran, Some Comparative Remarks", Touraj Atabaki and Eric J. Zürcher (Eds.) , **Men of Order: Authoritarian Modernization Under Atatürk and Reza Shah**, London: I. B. Tauris & Company, Limited, 2004), p.44-64.
[233] Altunışık, " The Possibilities and Limits of Turkey's Soft Power in the Middle East", p.42.
[234] **Ibid**. , p.43.

For instance, Arab television Al Jazeera's second office in non-Arab territories is located in Ankara. Moreover, Turkish derby football matches from Turkey are being broadcasted in Arab countries and TV shows in Turkey have a great audience in most of the Middle Eastern countries such as Egypt, Iran and Syria in spite of the significant language barrier. All these programs seem to capture the imagination of the average Middle Eastern person with regard to the high-standard life. Additionally, Turkey recently established a new TV channel called TRT El Türkiye (TRT Arabic) that began broadcasting in the Middle Eastern region via Turksat, Nilsat and Arabsat satellites as of April 4, 2010. By the help of this satellite broadcasting technology, TRT El Türkiye can be watched on 22 Arab countries including 350 million people living in the Arab region. TRT aims to strengthen the Turkish image with the programs and shows via this broadcast [235]

Furthermore, according to Ibrahim Kalın, who is the former Director General of SETA, there is a considerably high degree of attention towards the Turkish soap operas. Most of the Turkish soap operas and TV shows dubbed into the Arabic language and attract the attention of the Arab people in different countries. Although from time to time, the religious officials in these countries may define these shows as "subversive" or "Anti-Islamic", Turkish cultural products are being accepted into the Arab people. [236] One of the most important reasons of this is, the fact that both Arabs and Turks, more or less, belong to the same Eastern cultural space shaped by common religion, history and destiny. [237]

When analyzing the nature of the relations was changed and more complicated series of dialogues between the countries of the region and Turkey were established after the end of the Cold War as already mentioned in the previous chapters The cooperation with the USA regarding Balkans was one of the most important issues in Turkish foreign policy planning. In this context, the stability of the Balkans appeared as one of the most important issues in the post-Cold War world politics. Balkans basically occupies the lands between Turkey and Europe, and it

---

[235] "TRT El Türkiye Yayında",04.04.2010,
http://www.trt.net.tr/Haber/HaberDetay.aspx?HaberKodu=1585f56c-a353-4a76-8808-b307c54c4c42 [09.04.2010]
[236] İbrahim Kalın, "Debating Turkey in the Middle East: The Dawn of a New Geo-Political Imagination", **Insight Turkey**, p.84; *see also* Turkish Drama Series Gain Popularity in Arab World, 27.04.2008, http://www.aawsat.com/english/news.asp?section=7&id=12568 [12.04.2010]
[237] Mohammed Noureddine, "Arab-Turkish Cooperation in the New Era"; **Insight Turkey**, Vol.11 No.1, 2009, p.50.

appeared to be an important factor in Turkey's agenda because of this geopolitical location. Besides the cultural proximity, also the Ottoman legacy in the region has been playing a greater role. In addition to these mentioned points there may be a variety of points which are of great importance in Turkish foreign policy and may help to strengthen the Turkey's role in the region. First and foremost, the Turkish-Muslim population in the region appeared as one of the essential factors that cannot ignored by the Turkish governments. Immigrants from the Balkans had been arriving in Turkey for centuries, most recently in 1989 when thousands of Bulgarian ethnic Turks fled to Turkey.[238] Also, Turkey, as a country which adopted Western point of view, has deep connections with its region and due to those connections its level of responsibility on the issues in the region is comparatively high.[239] Moreover during the Cold War years, the well-being and protection of minorities of Turkish origin, was one of the factors that shaped the Turkish foreign policy in the Balkans. So, ethnic Turkish and Muslim minorities living in Balkans have positive considerations about Turkey and managed to remain quite friendly towards the people in Turkey.

Furthermore, one of the most significant points in the relations with the Balkans and Turkey is the tendency of the Balkan states which seek to gain especially Turkey's support during their troubled political and cultural transformations. For instance, as Soysal mentions, during the Yugoslavia's dissolution, each party – Yugoslav officials, officials from Macedonia and Bosnia and Kosovo Albanians - which are included in the conflict, found it necessary to visit Turkey and negotiate the issue and seek its support.[240]

Passing two decades since the end of the Cold War era, it can be argued that, the importance of the Balkans did not diminished; on the contrary, this importance has been underlined by several developments and points of analyze. Turkish officials also stress the importance of Balkans for Turkey. The official Turkish foreign policy approach towards the Balkans can be summarized as follows; "developing relations to the highest level with the Balkan countries, with which Turkey has historic, cultural and humanitarian ties; enhancing the existing atmosphere of regional peace and stability;

---

[238] İlhan Uzgel, "The Balkans: Turkey's Stabilizing Role", Barry Rubin and Kemal Kirişçi (eds), **Turkey in World Politics: An emerging Multiregional Powe**r, İstanbul: Boğaziçi University Press, 2002, p.65
[239] Faruk Sönmezoğlu**, İkinci Dünya Savaşı'ndan Günümüze Türk Dış Politikası**, İstanbul: Der Yayınları, 2006, p.589.
[240] İsmail Soysal, **Balkanlar**, İstanbul: TOBIV, 1993 cited in İlhan Uzgel, "The Balkans: Turkey's Stabilizing Role", Barry Rubin and Kemal Kirişçi (eds), **Turkey in World Politics: An emerging Multiregional Power,** İstanbul: Boğaziçi University Press, 2002, p.87.

keeping the transportation connection of Turkey with Western and Central Europe open."[241]

Regarding the Caucasus region, Soviet sovereignty has been replaced by three relatively small and newly independent states in the Southern Caucasus: Georgia, Armenia and Azerbaijan. Except for Armenia, these two countries share an Ottoman past and both of them have some common attributes with Turkey including ethnicity, language, culture, and history.[242] Although Russia has considerably high significance in the region, the strong relations with Azerbaijan, the large number of the Caucasian people living in Turkey and the importance of the natural gas and other resources direct Turkey to consider chances to become an effective actor in the region. Especially, the relations with Azerbaijan have a different nature. Turkey shares very close linguistic, cultural and historical relations with that country, which would play a major role on Turkey's policies in the region. Also, Turkey became the first country to recognize Azerbaijan and other Central Asian countries. Moreover, unlike the mentioned relations with Azerbaijan; Armenia-Turkey relations have different angles. "Turkey recognized Armenia on 16 December 1991 and due to the difficult economic conditions it encountered after its independence, Turkey has extended humanitarian aid to Armenia."[243] Nevertheless the so-called genocide claims of Armenia against Turkey form one of the most acute fields of conflict. Despite considerably smooth relations with the help of the ideological and block politics barrier, these issues become apparent during the post-Cold War years; beginning from 1990s. Turkey, having the aim of stabilizing the region and become an influential actor took a number of steps for establishing relations between Armenia and Turkey; as well as between Armenia and Azerbaijan whose relations were mostly suspended because of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict. Furthermore, regarding Armenia's genocide claims against Turkey, Turkey proposed to establish a Joint Commission which will be comprised of Turkish and Armenian historians, as well as other experts entrusted with studying events during the demise of the Ottoman Empire. Aside from the Armenian relations, another regional country having positive relations with Turkey is Georgia. Turkey recognized Georgia after it declared its independence and Süleyman Demirel was the first Prime Minister

---

[241]Relations with the Balkan Region, http://www.mfa.gov.tr/relations-with-the-balkan-region.en.mfa [13.05.2010]
[242] Sezer, "Turkey in the New Security Environment in the Balkan and Black Sea Region", p.72.
[243] Turkey's Political Relations with Armenia, http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey_s-political-relations-with-armenia.en.mfa , [13.05.2010]

who paid a visit there. Beginning with the political recognition of Georgia by Turkey, the bilateral relations between both countries kept improving. In the framework of the cultural and historical linkages, Turkey attached a special importance to the cooperation with Georgia, concerning the return of the Ahıska/Meskhetian Turks to their ancestral lands.[244]

Turkic Republics in Central Asia also have historical and cultural bounds with Turkey. Although these countries were under Russian and Soviet dominance for decades and not having direct connection with Turkey, this centuries-old kinship was refreshed by the developments between these countries and Turkey. Turkey was the first country to recognize newly independent Central Asian countries and the first to open embassies. Turkey was also the very first country to send high-level delegations to these countries and the first to receive such high delegations from them. When those countries declared their independence, Turkey was a model for them as being a democratic country and having a population whose majority consists of Muslim people and also having a secular system at the same time. Turkey also had an intention for these countries to have a stabile and peaceful domestic atmosphere. As a supportive country, the USA also considered Turkey as a bridge between these countries and West in terms of socio-economic values. Nevertheless, since there was a considerably high degree of Russian influence over these countries Turkey had to include this factor in its calculations towards this region.[245]

Turkey began to take various steps, in order to become an effective and decisive country towards the region after 1992. In this respect, scheduled flights between capitals of these countries and Istanbul and Ankara were started.[246] Furthermore, in 1991, TRT established a TV channel called "TRT-Int-Avrasya" regarding the Central Asia. Afterwards, Avrasya TV (Eurasia TV)[247] and TRT Int were separated in order to diversify the broadcasting. The main objective of "Eurasia" TV channel is defined as broadcasting in these countries for communication between West and Turkic Republics. Furthermore, TRT Turk[248] also established as well as a news

---

[244] Turkey's Political Relations with http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey_s-political-relations-with-georgia.en.mfa , [13.05.2010]
[245] Sönmezoğlu, **İkinci Dünya Savaşı'ndan Günümüze Türk Dış Politikası**, p.730.
[246] **Ibid**. , p.734.
[247] Avrasya TV, http://www.avrasya.tv/s-anasayfa.html; [03.04.2010]
[248] TRT Avaz "Merhaba" Dedi, 21.03.2010,http://www.trt.net.tr/Haber/HaberDetay.aspx?HaberKodu=6640f875-aaa9-4ae9-9e9b-fe4e0a144379 , [04.04.2010]

channel and includes English new programs as well as Turkish ones. Like Eurasia TV, TRT TURK also aims to diversify the number of the Turkish broadcasting towards those regions and create a positive image regarding Turkey. Apart from these, "In 1992, Turkey pledged to admit 10.000 students from former Soviet republics into Turkish universities."[249] Also, a series of inter-governmental meetings were held between Turkey and the Turkic countries throughout 1992-1993. In this context, the first Turkish Language Speaking Countries Summit with the participation of Kazakhstan, Kirghizia, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan and Azerbaijan, was held in Ankara. Main issues discussed in this summit were related with the relations that would be established between Turkic countries. Also, they reached to a conclusion that, co-operation and acting in concert with each other would pave the way to become more effective in the international arena and help them to acquire a more decisive and influential political stance.[250] In this context, this summit was repeated on October 18, 1994 in Istanbul; August 28, 1995 in Bishkek; on October 21, 1996 Tashkent; on June 09, 1998 in Astana; on April 08, 2000 in Baku; on April 26, 2001 in Istanbul and November 17, 2006 on Antalya. Also, as mentioned, Turkish International Cooperation Agency (TIKA) which was set up in 1992 assigned an objective of providing technical assistance to Central Asian Republics. Currently although the scope of the TIKA has expanded, continuous support for Central Asian Republics is still one of the main objectives.

Lastly, in line with the above mentioned points, the territory where modern Turkish republic is located has been a center of attraction both during the Ottoman rule and also during the period starting with the establishment of the Turkish Republic. Due to this fact, when Turkey embarked on a successful nation-building process after the Ottoman Empire, it gained a high volume of immigration from the neighbors. "The effects of having diverse Caucasian, Balkan, Middle Eastern, Iraqi Turcoman and Anatolian elements, even in small groups, are seen in everyday life in today's Turkey, where diverse cultural elements meet under the umbrella of the Turkish state." [251] By the help of its geography, Turkey has a chance to harmonize all these elements.

Tourism is also another element that help Turkey's image to be more attractive. "What Hollywood is to America's ability to capture the imagination of ordinary

[249] Sezer, "Turkey in the New Security Environment in the Balkan and Black Sea Region", p.85.
[250] Bal, **Turkey's Relations with the West and the Turkic Republics**, p.91.
[251] Davutoğlu, "Turkey's Foreign Policy Vision: An assessment of 2007", p.79.

people around the world, tourism could be to Turkey in its region."[252] In 2007, the number of the tourists visiting Turkey was 23.340.911 and in 2008 this number increased to 26.336.677. As of 2008, Turkey becomes the eight country which attracts 25 million tourists.[253] Most of the tourists coming from different countries of the world choose Turkey for its environmental beauties and for the domestic atmosphere in which they enjoy regardless of their religion. This is especially valid for Iranian people who are experiencing comparatively strict living conditions. Turkey also appears to be an attractive country for Russian citizens as well. In 2007, 2.5 million Russian tourists visited Turkey, almost four times the number of American visitors[254]. In only the first six months of 2008, Turkey welcomed two million Russians. Both Ankara and Moscow encourage this trend. According to the memorandum of understanding signed in 2006 between the Turkish Ministry of Culture and the Russian Federation's Federal Agency for Culture and Cinematography, Ankara named 2007 the year of Russian culture in Turkey. Moscow reciprocated and declared 2008 the year of Turkish culture in Russia. On October 20, 2008, the Red Army Chorus and the Ottoman Army Military band (*Mehter*) gave a joint concert in the Kremlin.[255] This issue has a symbolic meaning for both countries, given that the Russian and Ottoman armies had clashed eleven times in major battles in the course of history. As can be traced via the Russian example, tourism may enhance the bilateral relations between countries.

2.3 ECONOMIC STRUCTURE

After declaring its independence as a consequence of a long War of Independence, new Republic of Turkey had to go through numerous processes in order to regulate the social, economic and political life of country. In this context, Turkey, starting from the very first years, defined a goal for itself, which was to achieve self-sufficiency in economic terms. This goal was also in line with the aim of the founders of Turkey to convert the country into a politically, socially, culturally, and economically Western nation. During the 1920s, even though social and humanitarian considerations were not very prominent, the objective of economic and technological

---

[252] Altınay, "Turkey's Soft Power: An Unpolished Gem or an Elusive Mirage?", p.60.
[253] Dünyada ve Türkiye'de Turizm,2007,
http://www.kultur.gov.tr/TR/Genel/dg.ashx?DIL=1&BELGEANAH=242656&DOSYAISIM=sonturizmraporu.
DOC , [17.02.2010]
[254] Ministry of Culture and Tourism of the Republic of Turkey, Ankara: 2009. Tourism Statistics,
http://www.kultur.gov.tr/TR/Genel/BelgeGoster.aspx?F6E10F8892433CFF2B81939FD5B60AFA136DF771
4D282500 [17.02.2010]
[255] "Mehter ve Kızılordu aynı sahnede", 13.10.2008, http://arsiv.ntvmsnbc.com/news/462158.asp ,
[03.03.2010]

progress was followed in order to strengthen the Turkish state as a political and military entity.[256] "During the 1920s, the aim of economic policy was to create conditions in which an indigenous entrepreneurial and business class could develop."[257] Nevertheless, there were some certain obstacles coming in the way of new Turkey such as, the devastating conditions of the country especially after the World War I and the War of Independence and the emigration of the non-Muslim groups of Greeks, Armenians and Jews who had dominated the business fields while the Turks were farmers and soldiers. [258]

In this context, it should be stressed that although Turkey was a newly founded country in those years, it should not be considered as immune from the rest of the world's economic problems and developments Especially after the declaration of the independence, Turkey could not remain out of the problems that were occurred as result of the *Great Depression* in the first half of 1930s. In order to isolate Turkey from the affects of the Great Depression and minimize the harmful impacts, protectionist policies as the temporary measures were adopted. In this context, it was observed that, the state, by the help of the *state economic enterprises,* was appeared to be the major driving force behind the economy. "Licensing requirements, quotas, tariffs, and other levies (and) surrender requirements on external receipts, foreign exchange allocations schemes, and voluminous and complex foreign exchange regulations"[259] were the regulators of the economic arena during those years. Furthermore, "several new or existing investment banks[260], which were organized as joint stock companies with specific industrial or economic objectives", were being managed under the governmental policies.[261] Nevertheless despite those regulations against the economic hardships, the difficulties sourcing from the events in the course of and aftermath of the World War II also created impacts on Turkey's economic structure.

---

[256] Vali, **Bridge Across the Bosphorus: The Foreign Policy of Turkey** p. 318.
[257] A.Dougles Howard, **History of Turkey,** Westport, CT, Greenwood Publishing Group, Incorporated, 2001, p.100
[258] Çelik, **Contemporary Turkish Foreign Policy**, p.7.
[259] Rüsdü Saraçoğlu, "Liberalization of the Economy", Metin Heper (ed) **Politics in the Third Turkish Republic,** Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1994, p.63.
[260] The Agricultural Bank to provide agricultural credit at the village level was taken over by the state in 1937. The Ottoman Bank which was owned by British and French interests was closed in 1931 and nationalized as Central Bank of Turkey. The Business Bank (Is Bankası) was formed in 1924 as a semi-public bank and The Turkish Industry and Mining Bank which was reorganized as Sumer Bank were given the mission of developing the Zonguldak coal mines. Lastly, Eti Bank was established in 1935 in order to develop the mining and power industries.
[261] Howard, **History of Turkey**, p.102.

Furthermore, in line with the developments in the world, Turkish government had to leave its statist policies aside and adopt a more free-market oriented approach for its economy. Consequently Turkey became a founding member of the Organization for Economic Cooperation (OECC, later OECD) in 1948 and was included in Marshall Plan. Politically, the rise of the Democratic Party (DP) had accelerated the pace of the free-market reforms in Turkey. During the first years of the DP in power, farmers were given cheap credits and high prices for agricultural goods were maintained. Also the investments for the machinery and infrastructure as well as the favorable weather conditions, caused a rapid increase in the agricultural production and affected the economy positively.[262] Nevertheless, as of the second half of the 1950s, positive developments of the first half of the decade were reversed and economic problems emerged. As a result, the tendencies of returning to the central planning in the Turkish economy appeared. In this context a State Planning Office, which would be in charge of formulating five-year plans for economic development was established. By the developments during 1960s, the economic structure of Turkey in the first years of 1970s seemed relatively positive. Nevertheless, 1973-74 oil crises which quadrupled the crude oil prices affected the economy in Turkey, same as in the other European countries. Impacts of this crisis created a high degree of economic hardship in the country. Although several steps were taken to minimize the effects of the crisis, the budget deficit, the rate of unemployment and the inflation rates seemed to be increased while coming to the 1980s. As of January 24, 1980, a medium-term structural adjustment program under the auspices of the IMF and with the support of the World Bank and the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) was adopted by the current government of Turkey. Although this structural adjustment program aimed "adopting free-market reforms, outward-orientation, deregulation, and the promotion of the private sector"[263], it could not have a chance to be implemented until the military coup of September 12, 1980. During the relatively strict period of time in 1980-1983, the January 24 reforms were implemented and they also appear to be intensified even after returning to competitive party politics in 1983. Generally it may be stated that, Turkish economic policy starting from 1980 has formed on the basis of "decontrol and openness, realistic exchange rates which have brought Turkish currency to practical convertibility, exports and decontrol of imports, competitiveness in

---

[262] Erik Jan Zürcher, **Modernleşen Türkiye'nin Tarihi**, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002, p. 325-328.
[263] Çelik, **Contemporary Turkish Foreign Policy**, p.11.

world markets- and consequently quality and productivity in industry, and privatization."
[264]

Especially starting from the end of the 1970s the economic relations with the Middle Eastern countries were accelerated, which appeared as one of the main regional markets that would be linked to the Turkish economy. In line with the geographical proximity, a growing inter-dependence especially between Iraq and Turkey emerged in the context of the oil pipelines. Furthermore, Turkish construction firms become prominent in most of the Middle Eastern countries as of 1980s. Also a significant number of labor forces were sent to those countries. [265]

Coming to the 1990s, Turkish economy seemed to be affected by the events taking place in the world especially in the neighboring territories of Eastern Europe in which the newly independent states were appeared. During the 1990s, while Turkish contractors, traders, and industrialists exploring opportunities in the newly independent former Soviet republics, including non-Muslim ones, as well as Western European countries, North America and Near Eastern countries. New contracts, investment agreements, and trade arrangements concluded done during this period. Much of this activity especially in post-Soviet and Turkic countries and Balkans, was backed up by Turkish Export-Import Bank which was organized in 1989 on the American pattern. Turkish Exim Bank provided credit and investment guaranties for the whole process.[266]

In addition to the above mentioned economic developments and practices of Turkey, Turkish climatical conditions and geography also serve an important source of potential for the economic efficiency of Turkey. For instance, since Turkey has also a chance to produce a wide variety of agricultural products and a capability to provide its food security, it had taken a decision to use its resources as optimum as possible during the first decades of the republic. Currently, a planned process under the management of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs has still been conducted regarding the agriculture.

[264] Paul B. Henze, "Turkey: Toward the Twenty-First Century",   Graham E Fuller and Ian O. Lesser with Paul B. Henze and J. F. Brown, **Turkey's New Geopolitics: From Balkans to Western China,** Oxford: Westview Press, 1993, p.14.
[265] Philip Robbins**, Suits and Uniforms: Turkish Foreign Policy since the Cold War,** London: Hursct & Company, 2003, p.209-211.
[266] Henze, "Turkey: Toward the Twenty-First Century", p.15.

In terms of economic relations with the Arab countries, citrus fruits and vegetables are included in the group of products that are being exported to different countries. In this regard, Southeast Anatolian Project (GAP) has a special importance which will make use of the region's abundant water with the favorable conditions, such as construction of a series of large dams and the installation of associated hydro-electric power plants. Due to its integrated structure, Southeast Anatolian project planned to be implemented in seven cities of Turkey which are Adıyaman, Batman, Diyarbakır, Gaziantep, Kilis, Mardin, Siirt, Şanlıurfa, Şırnak. Along with the establishment of hydro-electric power plants and irrigation schemes of the agricultural land in the Harran Plain; fulfilling the developments in the fields of agriculture, industry, communication, education, health and culture were also included in the main objectives of GAP.[267] Nevertheless, the implementation of the GAP also created a series of conflicts within the downstream countries in the region especially Iraq and Syria. Due to the complicated nature of the issue, these three states, Iraq, Syria and Turkey, formally came together and discussed the details of the issue by forming a Joint Technical Committee in 1982. "How to define the nature of the problem (waters of the Euphrates against the combined basins of the Euphrates and Tigris); the determination of the basic concept of who gets what (sharing versus allocation); the judgment of needs of the three riparian states (self-declaration versus objective assessment)"[268] formed the main points of discussion. Because of the political links of the issue, GAP preserved its importance among the three states.[269] The implementation of the GAP also expected to create positive impacts on the agricultural product export to the Middle East. Those economic relations would also pave the way for an enhanced set of political communication between the regional countries and Turkey. For instance, Philip Robbins in his book[270] refers the Mardin free zone, which has an introductory brochure written as "*Ortadoğu pazarına açılan kapınız*" which means a gateway to the Middle East markets and includes a map with arrows pointing to Iran, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Saudi Arabia and Syria.[271] As can be traced via those kinds of examples, it may be stated that unlike the period before 1970s during which the economic and commercial

---

[267]GAP'ın Genel Hedefleri, http://www.gap.gov.tr/gap/gap-in-hedefleri , [25.04.2010]
[268] Robbins, **Suits and Uniforms: Turkish Foreign Policy since the Cold War,** p.231
[269] Water issues present potential conflict between Turkey and the regional countries. In return to the Turkey's decision of construction of the Ataturk Dam, Syrian-controlled Bekaa Valley become a safe haven for the terrorist groups of PKK, ASALA and other violent Turkish Marxist groups such as the Turkish Liberation Army. For more details see: Fuller, "Turkey's New Eastern Orientation", p.55.
[270] Robbins, **Suits and Uniforms: Turkish Foreign Policy since the Cold War**, p.237.
[271] Mardin Serbest Bölgesi, http://www.mardin.gov.tr/turkce/ekonomi/ekonomimardinserbestbolgesi.asp , [26.12.2009]

factors were not so much considered as the affecting factors of the foreign policy decision-making those factors become prominent in the world and in Turkey as well as of 1980s. Additionally, since Turkey and the Arab world are geographically continuous, and "because it is possible to lay pipelines between Turkey and other Gulf countries and Egypt via both Syria and Jordan [apart from the pipelines between Turkey and Iraq], Turkey can become a passageway and a hub for oil and gas distribution for Europe."[272]

Furthermore, Turkish trade volume with the Middle Eastern countries is planned to be increased gradually. For instance, as an important regional country having high degree of instability in its domestic and foreign policy, the economic relations with Iraq are planned to be strengthened via various constructional projects as well as the other projects with the organization of Turkish Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges. It was stated that the trading volume that was realized as 5.5 billion USD in 2009, is expected to reach 20 USD dollars in the next two years, as the relations become more diversified.[273] Turkish Syrian trade relations also play important role in wielding Turkish efficiency in the region. Signing of the free trade agreement between Syria and Turkey in 2007 and signing of 51 individual cooperation agreements in December 2009 under the framework of High Level Strategic Cooperation Agreement that was signed between both countries on September 2009; appear as important developments. Furthermore, the establishment of a customs station on the Turkish- Syria border was also added to the agenda.[274]

As mentioned previously, as the importance of the economic practices in the foreign policy planning and foreign affairs, Turkey's stance regarding the issues began to evolve since the end of 1980s. Turkey started to take into consideration the general trade, the export of contacting services and specific areas of imports like energy imports in its foreign relations. Turkey also, noticed its potential in economy and took serious steps considering it. In this regard, a growing and stable Turkish economy can be considered one of the most important assets of Turkish soft power applications. Moreover, Turkey is quickly moving up to the economic fields. "Nearing a GDP of 700

[272] Mohammed Noureddine, "Arab-Turkish Cooperation in the New Era" **Insight Turkey**, Insight Turkey, Vol.11 No.1, 2008, p.45.
[273] "Irak ile ticarette hedef 20 milyar dolar" http://www.tobb.org.tr/haber_arsiv2.php?haberid=2732 [30.01.2010]
[274] "Suriye ile ortak sınır kapısı, ticareti kolaylaştıracak" 21.01.2010, http://www.tobb.org.tr/haber_arsiv2.php?haberid=2727 [30.01. 2010].

billion USD, Turkey is the 17th largest economy of the world and the seventh in Europe."[275]

As of 2002, the amount of Turkish direct foreign investment was 5.004.941.340 USD. 48.5% of Turkish direct foreign investments were related with banking and other financial investment fields; 28% of the investments with manufacturing industry and 14.2% of the investments with trade investments.[276]

Currently, Turkish companies and products can be found all over the world in different countries. Stemming from the economic data of 2002, 71,3% of the total investment amount of Turkey were invested in West European countries; 8,9% of them targeted to Central Asia and Caucasus; 3,9% of the investments were transferred to off-shore centers; 3,8% of the investments targeted to North America; 1,6% of the investments transferred to Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (TRNC); 0,7% of the investments were invested in Middle Eastern countries; 0,5% of them transferred to African countries; 0,3% of them targeted to Latin American countries and 0,1% of all the investments were invested in South Eastern countries.[277] Furthermore, total export volume of Turkey in 2006 was realized as 85 billion USD and total import volume was realized as 135 billion USD.[278]

Although there are several reasons for the Turkish countries to invest in different countries, the social, economic atmosphere in the host country and the legislation processes may have essential importance during the planning phase. Moreover, geographical and cultural proximity between Turkey and the other countries also play very important roles. Additionally, ethnical bounds also have greater determining importance on some occasions. For instance, the majority of the Turkish investments in Bulgaria are invested in Plovdiv (Filibe) in which the greater number of the Turkish people reside. The investments in Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan also have the same kind of tendency. Moreover, out of these mentioned countries, Azerbaijan can be considered as the closest Turkish country to Turkey in terms of geographic and social characteristics, and hence has a

[275]For further analysis see, World Bank, Data Catolog, http://data.worldbank.org/data-catalog [07.07.2010]
[276] Dr. Emin Akçaoğlu, **Türk Firmalarının Dış Yatırımları: Saikler ve Stratejiler,** Ankara: Türkiye Bankalar Birliği 2005 Yayın No:241, p.49.
[277] **Ibid**. , p.55.
[278] Turkish Statistical Institute, www.tuik.gov.tr , [29.05.2010]

special place.[279] Turkish companies' investments in Kazakhstan help to establish close relations between two countries. Most of the Kazak employees in this country also had an opportunity to attend the vocational trainings by Turkish companies and the most salaries in Turkish companies also recorded as twice as the local salaries in this country.[280] Those instances help to strengthen the image of Turkey in the eyes of the citizens of those countries.

2.4 MILITARY CAPABILITIES AS SOURCE OF INFLUENCE

Turkish armed forces had been preserving a high degree of importance due to its role on founding of the modern Turkish Republic. Moreover during the course of the history, it was observed that military forces went through a number of stages and transformations several times. As an example, entering the Korean War and joining into NATO had also effects on increasing importance of the military in Turkey.[281]

During the 1990s, importance of the military's role in politics increased. Although there were several issues, one of the most prominent ones is Turkey's new internal and external security environment which was become more complex after the end of the Cold War as the Soviet Union was dissolved. In parallel with the tendency in the world during the Cold War, Turkey also felt the threat of a nuclear war which would broke out between the two blocs. Nevertheless, as the Cold War order was terminated Turkey began to adopt a different point of view, regarding the world politics. This new point of view which is also not totally including the ethical or religious factors, based on cost-benefit analysis. In this respect, in order to balance the cost-benefit analysis, Turkish military capabilities may be very useful and may be effective while creating influence on the decisions of the other countries.[282] So, it may also be stated that Turkey having a strong military also has a chance to become an influential country and become a regional soft power.

If a comparison among the countries' military capabilities is made, it appears that Turkish army is the largest army in Europe and the second largest army in NATO

[279] Akçaoğlu, **Türk Firmalarının Dış Yatırımları: Saikler ve Stratejiler,** p.217.

[280] Türkiye - Kazakistan Arasındaki Ticari-Ekonomik İlişkiler, Türk Müteşebbislerinin Bu Ülkede Yaptıkları Yatırımların Boyutu ve Karşılaştıkları Sorunlar, p.93 http://www.yesevi.edu.tr/bilig/biligTur/pdf/29/4_29.pdf [30.01 2010]

[281] Çelik, **Contemporary Turkish Foreign Policy**, p.19.

[282] Sönmezoğlu, **İkinci Dünya Savaşı'ndan Günümüze Türk Dış Politikası**, p.483.

after the USA[283]. The scale of Turkish armed forces depends on several issues. As the Kurdish separatism and Islamic fundamentalism gained greater importance in Turkish domestic and foreign politics, the armed forces started to gain a more determining role considering the processes. Moreover, also the active involvement of some of the neighboring countries which were supporting the above mentioned issues had a role on threatening Turkey's stability as well as the general environment in the region.[284]

Turkey's military expenditure also should be observed in relation with those facts. Due to the geopolitical issues, Turkey's military expenditure was calculated as 8.9 billion USD in 2001 which exceeds that of Greece in the ratio of 35%. Syria's military expenditure was calculated as half of the Turkey's. Moreover, in comparison with Iran's military expenditure, it was seen that Iran's figures exceeds Turkey's in the ratio of 23%. Nevertheless, domestic security expenditures of Iran were also added to this number. On the other hand, Russia's military expenditure, as another country which was in conflict with its neighbors, was calculated as five times more than Turkey's. While applying those figures in the calculations in the gross national product, it was observed that Turkey's military expenditure was formed 4.9% of its GDP in 2001. Furthermore in the same year, Russia's figures were calculated as 3.6% of its GDP; France's figures were calculated as 2.6% of its GDP, Germany's figures were calculated as 1.5% and Italy's figures were calculated as 2.1% of its GDP.[285] Furthermore, in 2005, Turkey's military expenditure was realized in the ratio of 5.3% of its GDP which makes it the 16th country in the list of all the countries' military expenditures. Greece as a neighboring country used 4.3% of its GDP as military expenditure in 2005, while Russia's percentage was 3.9% and Germany's percentage was 1.5%.[286]

So, as can be traced by those comparative calculations, it appears that Turkish armed forces' role in Turkish politics cannot be analyzed without taking into consideration the regional facts. As well as Turkey, other regional countries also aware

---

[283] Gülay Günlük-Şenesen, **1980-2001 Türkiye'de Savunma Harcamaları ve Ekonomik Etkileri**, İstanbul: TESEV Yayınları, 2002, p.12.

[284] Gencer Özcan, "The Military and the Making of Foreign Policy in Turkey", Barry Rubin and Kemal Kirisci (eds), **Turkey in World Politics: An Emerging Multiregional Power**, İstanbul: Boğaziçi University Press, 2002, p.18.

[285] Şenesen, **1980-2001 Türkiye'de Savunma Harcamaları ve Ekonomik Etkileri**, p.12; according to the data of Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (SIPRI), 2002 Yearbook, p. 276-287.

[286] Central Intelligence Agency, **The World Factbook**, https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/rankorder/2034rank.html?countryName=Germany&countryCode=gm&regionCode=eu&rank=97#gm , [09.04.2010]

of this fact and shape their perceptions regarding the events taking place in their region.

Turkey's military capabilities have several impacts on Turkey's soft power. As mentioned previously, because of the scale of the armed forces of Turkey, even though they will not be used in a given conflict, they appear be very helpful on creating a perception in the eyes of the other countries that they would be defeated by the Turkish armed forces if they got into the conflict.

Furthermore, other issues regarding military capabilities and soft power should be underlined as well. In this context military cooperation and training agreements between countries can be another point of focus. Considering Turkey's situation, it can be seen that Turkey has several military agreements with different countries. As an example, Turkey signed military cooperation agreements with the countries such as Syria, Russia and Bulgaria[287] as well as Chile, Congo Republic, Qatar and Australia.[288] Additionally, Turkey provided military aids and donations to Albania, Macedonia, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. All those points would be effective on increasing Turkey's influence in the region in addition to its political, economic, cultural and historical assets.

---

[287] Türkiye'nin Bölgesel Güç Olması Yolunda TSK'nın Rolü,
http://www.diplomatikgozlem.com/haber_oku.asp?id=58 [23.05.2010]
[288] Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ile Şili Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda Eğitim, Savunma Sanayii, Teknik ve Bilimsel İşbirliği Anlaşmasının Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun, 04.04.2007, http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5616; [23.05.2010]; Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ile Kongo Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda Eğitim, Teknik ve Bilimsel İşbirliği Çerçeve Anlaşmasının Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun, 08.05.2007, http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5640, [23.05.2010]; Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ile Katar Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda Eğitim, Teknik ve Bilimsel İşbirliği Anlaşmasının Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun, 08.05.2008, http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5755; [23.05.2010] ; Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ve Avustralya Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda İşbirliği Çerçeve Anlaşmasının Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun, 14.04.2009, http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5853   [23.05.2010].

CHAPTER III

THE CONCEPT OF DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE
AND ITS RELATIONS WITH SOFT POWER

3.1 DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE IN THE INTERNATIONAL ARENA

"Development Assistance is a set of activities performed through the cooperation of various agencies and institutions in a wide range of activities from developing technical infrastructures in all sectors to the realization of the investments and the provision of financial support."[289] In order to provide development assistance to the developing and under-developed countries, most of the developed countries transfer their sources for fulfilling the requirements of improvements. Due to the increasing need in the world for development assistance, it can be stated that those aids play very important roles on development activities.[290]

As development assistance includes several sub-fields related with the needs and conditions of the countries, it can be stated that development assistance creates social and economic infrastructures through Technical Cooperation studies; improves investments through program support, joint or direct investments; provides financial support for development through credits, loans, export support and securities purchases; contributes to the normalization process in crisis regions through peace structuring efforts, provides solutions to emergencies and humanitarian issues through emergency and humanitarian aid, and implements international joint development efforts with the contributions made to international organizations.[291]

While observing the traditional aid framework, we can see a three-channeled structure. Citizens in rich countries pay taxes to their governments, some of which are used for development assistance. These rich country governments on-lend or grant money to poor country governments, who in turn implement programs and policies designed to accelerate development and reduce poverty. This mentioned framework appear to process effectively "when the public in rich countries is willing to have tax revenues spent on aid, when rich country governments have confidence in poor

---

[289] TIKA Turkish Development Assistance Report, Ankara, 2005, p.11.
[290] Ayla Barutçu, **Teknik Yardımın Politika, Uygulama ve Değerlendirilmesi**, DPT Uzmanlık Tezi, Ankara 1974, p.1 cited in Tayfun Atmaca, "Teknik Yardım Projelerinin Hazırlanması, Uygulanması, İzlenmesi ve Değerlendirilmesi",p.5.
[291] TIKA Turkish Development Assistance Report, p.11.

country governments to develop appropriate projects and programs and when poor country governments have the capacity to implement these programs so as to generate the desired developmental results."[292]

Although the history of providing aid to the others for development can be traced back the early stages of the history, the formation of a so-called development assistance community can be considered as a comparatively new issue. As the world has been restructuring and the changes were taking place by influencing national identities, challenging people and their social structures; the aid system was also going under a transformation. Today we live in a world of dramatic and accelerating change due to globalization, where more accessible communications and technology have rapidly transformed poor people's aspirations and awareness. So in order to understand the current situation clearly, the history of the development aid and the then-conditions should be observed.

Although the history of the development aid generally is being observed starting from the post- World War II years, the origins of development aid go back to 1920s according to Gilbert Rist. Rist mentioned that, between 1929 and 1941, "the League of Nations had responded to Chinese requests for assistance with the provision of some 30 technical experts in areas such as health, education, transport and rural co-operatives."[293] Following the war, assistance started on a much larger scale as the United Nations and its specialized agencies as well as the international financial institutions were formed.

Firstly, it can be stated that a line of continuity between the years of 1946 and 1960s can be observed.

> During this period, patterns of aid were affected primarily by recent memories of World War II and the success of post-war reconstruction in Europe; struggles for independence; the rise of the nation state, with colonial governments handing over formal power; dominance of the theory of modernization; and the paramount

---

[292] Homi Kharas, **Trends and Issues in Development Aid**, Washington: The Brookings Institution, Wolfensohn Center for Development Working Paper 1, 2007, p.1.
[293] Gilbert Rist, **The History of Development: From Western Origins to Global Faith,** London: Zed Books, 1997,p.65 cited in Janet Hunt, "Aid and Development", Damien Kingsbury, Joe Remenyi, John McKay and Janet Hunt, **Key Issues in Development** (New York: Palgrave MacMillan: 2004), p.67.

influence of the Cold War and the associated divided worldviews between communism and capitalism.[294]

For instance, starting from 1940s, Marshall Plan and UN system including World Bank provided foreign aids in the form of program aids for reconstruction of the war-torn economies of Europe and Japan after the World War II. Since the devastating effects of the World War weakened the economies and politics of the countries, those aids more focused on the normalization of the countries' domestic conditions as well as foreign affairs. During those years, USA appeared to be the single major donor which also makes the aid architecture simpler.

Coming to 1950s, as the Cold War between blocks started to be felt in a tenser environment, providing aids became as a field of competition between USA and Soviet Union. Food aids and project development aids were provided both by the USA and Soviet Union in order to improve the countries' conditions in their blocks and encourage other countries for joining their blocks. In this case, USA and Western European countries used aid as a tool in the Cold War, so did the USSR and China. Soviet Union preferred to provide technical aids for Eastern European reconstruction, but later turned its attention to other countries notably in Asia and parts of Africa as well. The USA was also providing development assistance for several countries in order to influence them politically and export the values of market economy and liberalism to those countries. In the course of 1960s, a more complex picture compared with the 1940s appeared since the number of both donors and recipient countries increased. In addition to major donors as the USA and USSR, Western European aid programs were also started as the European countries recovered from war and reached to a position to join the effort to assist developing countries. Hence, countries such as France and Britain launched major development assistance programs to their former colonies during the course of the decolonization of Africa and Asia.[295] In addition to those aid provider countries' actions, several associations also formed. The International Development Association (IDA) was established in 1960 in order to co-ordinate the aid providing activities and to provide a framework for burden sharing among rich countries as well as intermediating between rich countries and poor

---

[294]Caroline Robb, "Changing Power Relations in the History of Aid", Leslie Groves and Rachel Hinton (eds), **Inclusive Aid: Changing Power and Relationships in International Development**., Toronto: Earthscan Canada, 2004, p.22.
[295] Hunt, "Aid and Development", p.68.

countries. In this context, it was anticipated to establish bilateral relations between donor and recipient countries. When donors provide funds to IDA, the Association would be transferring and funding projects in developing countries and establishing a major "development relationship" with the Association and also establishing one "development relationship" with each recipient country.[296] The establishment of those kinds of bilateral programs focusing on productive sectors such as support to the green revolution and infrastructure, fastened and technical assistance to the countries were given.

Nevertheless, it was also stated that, development aids during those periods focused more on Northern governments' foreign policies than reducing poverty. Furthermore, according to the observations, in spite of the demise of colonialism and the rise of the nation states, Southern governments had limited power to control aid allocations.[297] Some groups of countries which have been given assistance were also chosen by the donors in order to create ideological influence. While the USSR was the major donor in those years in the Eastern bloc, other Eastern European countries, such as East Germany and Czechoslovakia, and later China were involved in the assistance for African countries such as Tanzania and Somalia.[298]

In the 1970s, the world witnessed two main oil crises of 1973 and 1978, which had significant impact on aid activities. As the Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC) increased the price of crude oil, there was a rapid accumulation of monetary reserves in OPEC countries. In response to the oil crisis, the oil producing countries in the Middle East and Arab-funded agencies as well as the World Bank and IMF became significant donors of development aid. Saudi Arabia in particular, appears as a very active donor and became the second largest donor of official development assistance, after USA in 1976-77. The majority of the development assistance from Arab countries was given to the African Arab and Muslim states. In 1974, the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) was established with the support of money from OPEC countries. It was one of the first development institutions to recognize the importance of small-scale agriculture.

---

[296] Homi Kharas, **Trends and Issues in Development Aid**, p.3; International Development Association http://www.worldbank.org/ida/ [27.04.2010]
[297] Robb, "Changing Power Relations in the History of Aid", p.22.
[298] Deepak Nayyer (ed), Economic Relations between Socialist Countries and The Third World, London: Macmilllan, 1977,p.4 cited in Janet Hunt, "Aid and Development", Damien Kingsbury, Joe Remenyi, John McKay and Janet Hunt, **Key Issues in Development,** New York: Palgrave MacMillan: 2004), p.67.

During 1980s, especially as of mid-1980s, a new type of lending was introduced – structural adjustment. In those years, the aid system was significantly affected by the emergence of the debt crisis as the consequences of the oil crises and it was recognized that structural adjustment entailed some negative impacts. This decade was marked by a shift in delivery mechanisms for aid: from the project lending approach of the past to policy lending by way of a major new aid agency instrument, structural adjustment loans (SALs). Structural adjustment loans were given to governments on the condition that certain reforms would be implemented. In addition to those issues, it was observed that the amount of aid provided by the USSR declined especially starting from the second half of the 1980s.

Coming to 1990s, the framework of the foreign aid projects had also changed as well as the political structure of the world. Three major events dominated development policy this decade: the end of the Cold War; the emergence of debt relief; and increasing political instability leading to more refugees and the increase in the number of displaced persons more than ever before. With the rise of the free market, many states lost some control over their economies and, in general, countries became particularly vulnerable to exogenous shocks, such as those associated with terms of trade. Problems such as poverty, weak governance practices especially in the newly independent post Soviet countries, environmental issues and gender inequalities began to be included in the agenda of the foreign aids.

Although many other issues have been added to the agenda, 2000s also include those points in foreign aid activities as well.[299] Especially in recent years "the goals of development have come to embrace the elimination of poverty in all its dimensions— income poverty, illiteracy, poor health, insecurity of income, and powerlessness."[300] A consensus is emerging around the view that development means increasing the control that poor people have over their lives, through education, health, and greater participation, as well as income gains.[301]

Conditions of the people living in the developing and least developed countries become as the number one priority for many donor countries and organizations. The

---

[299] Finn Tarp and Peter Hjertholm (eds), **Foreign Aid and Development: Lessons Learnt and Directions for the Future,** London: Routledge,2000, p.59-60.
[300] World Bank Staff, **A Case for Aid: Building a Consensus for Development Assistance,** Washington, DC: World Bank Publications, 2002, p.58.
[301] World Bank Staff, **A Case for Aid: Building a Consensus for Development Assistance**, p.58.

scale of the poverty challenge is described in the UNDP's annual human development reports as well.[302] According to those data, among the 4.4 billion people who live in developing countries, three-fifths live in communities without basic sanitation; one-third are without safe drinking water; one-quarter lack adequate housing; and one-fifth are undernourished. Fully two billion people lack access to electricity. More than 500 million people "earn their livelihoods in ecologically fragile and low-productivity areas.[303]

As the economic, socio-politic and environmental conditions of the world have been changing and the quantity and quality of the developed and under-developed countries' problems concerned; joint actions by the developed countries are needed for solving those issues. Although individually organized development assistance activities provide help to the countries, large scaled global problems such as global warming, famine or natural disasters require a more coordinated group activity. Additionally, uncertainty, complexity and dynamics of the entire aid system should be understood clearly in order to be effective. In this context, it should be examined the significance of cultural and political influences and the effect of the potential of well-placed individual agencies and leadership to maintain a systemic change as well. Furthermore, in addition to those mentioned issues several steps should be taken for increasing efficiency. First of all, the scope of the development cooperation should be broadened including not only development assistance but also trade, debt management, private investment and capital flows, private sector development, and access to technology. Secondly, cooperation among private and public sectors should be maintained since the previous strict government-to-government foreign aid activities do not function as they were before. Thirdly, a joint and trans-boundary approach towards the global threats such as drugs, terrorism, environmental change, illegal immigration and crime should be established and a set of corporate global solutions should be created. In this context, development assistance appears as an important asset for cost-sharing among countries.[304]

Although there is a high flow of assistance among the countries, efforts to reduce poverty may be undermined in recent years by epidemics, such as human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immune deficiency syndrome (HIV/AIDS), armed

[302] UNDP, http://hdr.undp.org/en/ , [03.04.2010]
[303] Entering the 21st Century, **World Development Report 1999/2000,** Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000, p.26.
[304] James Gustave Speth, **Toward Security for All: Development Assistance and Global Poverty**, Washington: Environmental Law Institute, 2002, p.7.

conflict, stagnant economies, and environmental degradation which threaten the sustainability of resources on which the poor depend for their livelihoods. Furthermore global economic crises also affect the assistance providing of the countries.[305] Since the aid system has been getting more complex by the increase in the actors and issues to be handled, there can be observed several other points that are affect or cause the assistance to fail. According to B. Mak Arvin, those points which affect may include;

> directing technical assistance toward incorrect or insufficient types of capacity-building while ignoring the importance of institutions; providing aid when recipients are in the throes of serious upheaval or open conflict; giving aid when countries are debt-ridden with no ability to put aid to good use; affording recipients little chance or responsibility in identifying or contributing to aid projects; and maintaining a commercial interest in the provision of aid, for example, as evidenced by the failure of donors to completely untie their aid.[306]

As mentioned above, the type and the amount of the given assistance to the recipient countries may change depending on the time frame and the then-conditions; hence, the purpose of aid may also change as well. According to Janet Hunt, the purpose of aid, or basically the reason of why countries give aid, can be explained with a range of interrelated values about what might be called an international social contract. Hunt states that there is a broad understanding amongst developed countries that, there should be a form of international assistance in order for the world to be a moderately equitable place for the countries and people. Some of the countries perceived a sense of responsibility, by following the process of decolonization for this purpose. On the other hand, some other countries preferred to assist less developed states to reduce their further decline and potential for instability. Nevertheless, "many donors also preferred to provide aid not only for humanitarian reasons, but to enhance their own economic and political interests, through encouraging their own exports, or shaping the economic policies or political persuasion of recipient countries."[307] Although Hunt defines purpose of aid under mentioned categories, while observing the

---

[305] **Ibid**. , p.3.
[306] B. Mak Arvin, "Introduction", B. Mak Arvin (ed) **Allocation of Foreign Aid and Economic Development: New Theoretical and Empirical Perspectives,** Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group, 2002, p. 15.
[307] Hunt, "Aid and Development", p.67.

current status of the development aid activities it can be seen that, those purposes appear to be intertwined due to the complex structure of the aid system and the needs and conditions of the recipient countries. Although either group of purposes are followed by the donors, it should be underlined that; development assistance began to be taken as a coordinated and planned activity and countries' national capacity and level of influence in the international arena appear to be defined in relation with their foreign aid providing capacity. In this context, a number of reasons for countries, such as economical, social, cultural and political drives, can be taken into account while providing development assistance.

In general, the main objective of these development assistance activities can be specified as to increase the use of the human resources and the other resources of the host countries; by sharing the sources and methods of the support provider countries. The main policy in the development assistance plans is to help the countries to develop their own self-sufficient system and become countries that do not need these aids in the future. Following this objective, development assistance projects should be well-targeted and implemented. So, it can be stated that "successful development assistance requires partnership with other agencies, including civil society, NGOs, and others, both domestic and external; and finally, the most effective development assistance will be catalytic, with effects that spread far beyond the original project or program."[308]

In this context, the role of the non-governmental organizations (NGOs) should be underlined as well since; the idea of providing aid through NGOs preceded most of the government initiatives. The NGOs' assistance activities can be traced to between First and Second World Wars, as the Red Cross was established as early as 1859 for helping the victims of war and conflict[309], while several Christian missions and charitable organizations were also providing assistance to the people who need. Furthermore, Save the Children which was founded on 1919 in order to help the child victims of the First World War;[310] Oxfam (Oxford Committee for Famine Relief) which was founded in 1942 during the Second World War in order to provide famine relief to victims of the Greek civil war[311] and CARE which was started by sending food parcels

---

[308] World Bank Staff, **A Case for Aid: Building a Consensus for Development Assistance**, p.153.
[309] Ian McAllister, **Sustaining Relief with Development: Strategic Issues for the Red Cross and Red Crescent,** London: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers: 1993), p.5; see also, Australian Red Cross Time Line, http://www.redcross.org.au/aboutus_history_timeline.htm [12.05.2010]
[310] Save the Children, Timeline, http://www.savethechildren.org/about/interactive-timeline/ [12.05.2010]
[311] History of OXFAM International, http://www.oxfam.org/en/about/history [12.05.2010]

from the USA to European countries in 1946[312], can be included in the groups of major NGOs.

Moreover, while mentioning about the objectives of the assistance provider and recipient countries; short term and long term objectives should be specified. Short term objectives of the technical projects include providing of the technical knowledge and specialized human sources to the countries all over the world which need support for development and forming prosperous conditions. Nevertheless, fulfilling the short term objectives may not be a source of solution all the time. Although the technical trainings and awareness-raising briefings that are performed for the authorized people coming from support providing countries, usually they may not be very effective due to the lack of supportive infrastructure in the host countries.[313]

Besides those short term objectives, we can mention about the medium term objectives which can be fulfilled or form between assistance provider and recipient country. For instance, in the course of the implementation of a technical project, several relations between technical support providing countries and the host country may develop. Those relations may have positive effects on the domestic markets of the countries. Also, cultural and social drives may play important roles. People getting trained in the support providing countries also get used to these countries' music, literature, fine arts, language, daily life practices and also the traditions and history. As a consequence, a remarkable degree of psychological familiarity occurs. Since those kinds of cultural and social bounds between countries may pave the way to an improvement in political and economical relations, these technical projects can form more advantages both for the support seeking and support providing countries in the long run.[314]

As mentioned above, besides the short and medium term objectives, long term objectives of the technical aid projects also very important. Although due to the shortcomings of the conditions in the host country which sometimes affect the short term objectives of the projects negatively, long term objectives generally focus on the activities that will be carried out on a longer period of time. Providing support for maintaining necessary infrastructure under which the technically trained personnel would work; improving the self-sufficiency level of the country and helping the host country for development may be included in the long term objectives of the technical

---

[312] CARE, http://www.care.org/about/index.asp [12.05.2010]
[313] Barutçu, **Teknik Yardımın Politika, Uygulama ve Değerlendirilmesi**, p. 4.
[314] **Ibid**. , p. 7-9.

aid projects.[315] Nevertheless, since no outside donor is able, or has the right, to compel a country for following the policies in order to promote development, recipient countries should also possess the development assistance and show intention for improving their conditions. Long term objectives can only be obtained via cooperation among donor and recipient countries that is strengthened by the strong will of the recipient countries. So, the countries must be committed to and involved in shaping development strategies and projects.[316]

In addition to the short, medium and long term objectives of the assistance providers in general, we can trace numerous assistance activities which were done for fulfilling specific objectives. Janet Hunt quotes from I. Bain and mentions about Japan's aid by calling it as the 'abuse of aid'. According to their statements, "Japan has used aid to leverage votes from small states to support its pro-whaling stance in the International Whaling Commission." Furthermore, Australian aid can be also given as an example in relation with the fulfillment of economic objectives via assistance. According to Bain, Australia was aiming to promote commercial objectives by supporting Australian experts to China.[317]

In terms of political use of aid, American examples can be given. As an example, William Ryrie relates the US amount of aid to Egypt was no less than 32% and aid given to Israel, a relatively rich country, was 8% of all American aid in 1991. Those figures seem considerably high compared with the amount of the US aid, which was only 3.6%, given to the whole sub-Saharan Africa.[318] Low amount aid for African countries during those years can be explained by concerning the US relations and expectations from the Egypt and Israel during those years.

Furthermore, the link between economic and social development and peace should also be underlined while mentioning about the organized development aid providing activities and objectives. According to the reports and data of several organizations, penury, hopelessness, inequity, and marginalization are often among the root causes of devastating conflict. "Millions of people are stuck in 'half war/half

---

[315] **Ibid**. , p. 5-6.
[316] World Bank Staff, **A Case for Aid: Building a Consensus for Development Assistance,** Washington, DC: World Bank Publications, 2002, p.53.
[317] I.Bain The China Country Program" in Patrick Kilby (ed) **Australia's Aid Program: Mixed Messages and Conflicting Agendas,** Melbourne: Monash Asia Institute and Community, 1996 cited in Janet Hunt, "Aid and Development", Damien Kingsbury, Joe Remenyi, John McKay and Janet Hunt, **Key Issues in Development,** New York: Palgrave MacMillan: 2004, p.72.
[318] William Ryrie, **First World, Third World,** New York: Macmillan, 1995, p.13.

peace' situations."[319] Numbers of people are killed during the conflicts and although peace deals are signed, the conflicts may not be solved accordingly. According to Oxfam data each year, almost 200.000 people are killed in wars, but almost as many as that number again may be killed in crime and other forms of armed violence.[320] In this context, development resources appear to be as important and essential components for supporting peace and stability. Moreover, it has been observed that "some of the most important actions in terms of peace-building in post-conflict situations have been projects that seek to promote greater employment opportunities for the demobilized and the disadvantaged, and programs to rebuild national capacity for good governance."[321]

In this context, the relations between foreign aid and national security should also be established. One of the most related examples for this linkage can be given in relation with the September 2001 terrorist attacks and the subsequent U.S-led war on terrorism policy. Sourcing from the corollary that, extreme poverty and government repression breed societal resentments and unrest that may be expressed through anti-U.S. or anti-Western political violence, including terrorism; the U.S.'s security orientation has been re-shaped with regard to those evaluations and the amount of the U.S. development assistance increased. As Steven W. Hook quotes from Moss and Standley, Iraq and Afghanistan not only consumed billions of U.S. military funds weekly for the next several years, but absorbed nearly all of the 8 billion USD increase in U.S. ODA spending between 2002 and 2005. Furthermore, other major increases in U.S. aid went to frontline states in the war on terrorism, including Pakistan, Turkey, and Jordan.[322]

Moreover, both linking with the national security and the donor objectives; promoting democracy via development assistance should be underlined. Besides the short, medium and long term objectives as well as the specific goals that are mentioned above, today almost all major donors state promotion of democracy as another major objective, in itself, of their aid programs. It may be stated that, "aid

---

[319] Conflict and Natural Disasters, May, 2009,
http://www.oxfam.org.uk/resources/issues/conflict/introduction.html [10.05.2010]
[320] **Ibid.** , [10.05.2010]
[321] Speth, **Toward Security for All: Development Assistance and Global Poverty**, p.6.
[322] Todd Moss, David Roodman, and Scott Standley. "The Global War on Terror and U.S. Development Assistance: USAID Allocations by Country, 1998– 2005. **Working Paper** No. 62(July),Washington, DC: Center for Global Development, 2005. cited in Steven V.Hook "Foreign Aid in Comparative Perspective: Regime Dynamics and Donor Interests" in Terry F. Buss (ed), **Foreign Aid and Foreign Policy: Lessons for the Next Half-Century,** New York: M.E. Sharpe, 2007, p.111.

programs are increasingly being justified in terms of their contribution to this goal. Furthermore, donors are becoming more selective in choosing aid recipients. Dimensions such as democracy and, more generally, practice of good government appear to be receiving more emphasis as a precondition for eligibility of aid."[323] Analysts put emphasis on the relationship between foreign aid and democratization. Their points of focus have also relations with short, medium and long term objectives of the development aid as well. First of all, aid activities and their potential to improve the education level of the citizens of poorer countries through improving access to schooling for children, increasing the literacy rate, and increasing the educational attainment of parents, especially mothers are emphasized by several analyses.[324] Furthermore, as the link between democratic regimes with the higher incomes per capita was underlined by several researches[325], we can reach a conclusion that "if aid increases income per capita in less developed countries (LDCs), then democracy may be positively affected". Moreover, aid, appropriately targeted at promoting civil society organizations such as a free press and supporting fair elections, can be conducive to democratization.[326] As a consequence, it may be stated that, aid effectiveness can be more easily obtained if recipient countries have democratic regimes.

3.2 DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE AND ACTORS

While mentioning the history of the aid activities and how they evolved during the different period of times and the purposes of those activities, we should also underline the different groups of assistance providers since those actors may shed light to the different approaches of assistance given.

Firstly, *The United Nations Organization* is one of the biggest supporters of development efforts. The UN Development Group (UNDG) unites the 32 UN funds, programs, agencies, departments, and offices that play a role in development. Established by the Secretary-General in 1997, the UNDG designs system-wide guidance to coordinate, harmonize and align UN development activities.[327] In order to

---

[323] B. Mak Arvin, Francisco Barillas, and Byron Lew, "Is Democracy a Component of Donors' Foreign Aid Policies?", B. Mak Arvin (ed) **Allocation of Foreign Aid and Economic Development: New Theoretical and Empirical Perspectives**, Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group, 2002, p. 171.
[324] **Ibid**. , p. 185.
[325] Robert J. Barro, **Determinants of economic growth: a cross-country empirical study**, Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1997; Sylvia Chan; **Liberalism, Democracy and Development,** Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
[326] Arvin, Barillas, and Lew, "Is Democracy a Component of Donors' Foreign Aid Policies?", p. 186.
[327] United Nations Development Group, http://www.undg.org [02.02.2010]

organize and perform development assistance, Millennium Development Goals were defined under the United Nations Development Programme in 2000. UN Millennium Development Goals include the set of goals that stress the cooperation among the donor countries, support receiving counties and other organizations that take part in the development assistance community. Millennium Development Goals consist of eight goals as eradicating extreme poverty and hunger, achieving universal primary education, promoting gender equality and empower women, improving maternal health, combating HIV/AIDS, Malaria and other diseases, ensuring environmental sustainability and developing a global partnership for development.[328]

First and foremost one of the mentioned millennium development goals is eradicating extreme poverty which includes the targets as halving, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than 1 USD a day. In addition to this issue, achieving full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people also appears another important target. Suffering from hunger is in the agenda, since malnutrition causes millions of deaths including children and adults. So halving, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger is also added as another target. Secondly, achieving universal primary education is included in the millennium development goals since girls do not have any chance to go to school in many countries of the world. Gender equality has also been added as another millennium development goal since women have been faced a high degree of discrimination in numerous fields of life such as education, work and acquiring property. Eliminating gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and in all levels of education no later than 2015 appears as a very important target. Furthermore, improving child and maternal health is also another important goal which has the target as reducing by two thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under-five mortality rate in developing and underdeveloped countries. Combating HIV/AIDS, Malaria and other diseases is another millennium development goal. In this context, the aims is having halted by 2015 and then reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS and Malaria as well as achieving, by 2010, universal access to treatment for HIV/AIDS for all those who need it. Moreover, ensuring environment sustainability is also another goal which has several targets to fulfill. Reversing the loss of environmental resources and integrating the principles of sustainable development into country policy and programs, halving, by 2015, the proportion of the population without sustainable access

---

[328] United Nations, Millennium Goals, http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/   [02.02.2010]

to safe drinking water and basic sanitation can be included under the targets of this goal. Lastly, one of the most important development goals is developing a global partnership for development. This last goal includes several targets which are related with addressing the special needs of least developed countries, landlocked countries and small-island states; developing an open, rule-based and non-discriminatory trading and financial system among recipient and donor countries; dealing with the debts of the developing countries and establishing sound policies for solution; providing affordable essential drugs to the developing countries in cooperation with pharmaceutical companies and enhancing the capacity to reach the capacity for reaching new technologies especially information and communications.[329]

Furthermore, several conferences and meeting have been held in order to contribute to the fulfillment of those goals and go through the new developments and issues. In this regard, between and March 18-22, 2002, UN International Conference on Financing for Development was held on Monterrey, Mexico. In this conference, the importance of eradicating extreme poverty, fulfilling sustainable economic development and sustainable improvement of the countries were also highlighted. Furthermore, in order to realize the Millennium Goals, the need of a new partnership between developed and developing countries was also emphasized. Stemming from the idea that each country has primary responsibility for its own economic and social development, the heads of State and Government who were gathered in Monterrey and made commitment of performing comprehensive actions for fulfilling the Millennium Goals. In this context, due to the important role of national policies and development strategies, the assistance receiving countries should also focus on their domestic development problems.[330]

Those mentioned targets appeared to cause donors to focus more closely on the quality and the effectiveness of aid and specifically its impact on poverty reduction. Furthermore, those goals are considered as important steps toward recognition of the need for a holistic approach. Nevertheless, as Rachel Hinton and Leslie Groves stated, despite the expertise and energies of the donors, the Millennium Development Goals may not be attained within the agreed time frame. In order to fulfill those targets, a far greater accountability and responsibility must be developed within and among all

---

[329] **Ibid**. , [11.05.2010]
[330] International Conference on Financing and Development, **Monterrey Consensus on Financing for Development,** (Monterrey, Mexico, 18-22. 03. 2002, UN: 2003),
also available in, http://www.un.org/esa/ffd/monterrey/MonterreyConsensus.pdf [11.04.2010]

actors, at all levels. This would be possible by focusing on the socio-political dynamics of aid and understanding development as a complex system.[331]

Besides the UN, the forerunner of *OECD* was the *Organization for European Economic Co-operation (OEEC),* established in 1947 to administer American and Canadian aid under the Marshall Plan for the reconstruction of Europe after World War II. Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) took over from OEEC in 1961. In order to contribute to the development of the world economy, OECD's focus has progressively broadened to include a growing number of other countries, in addition to its 30 members. It now shares its expertise and accumulated experience with more than 70 developing and emerging market economies.[332] Within the OECD, the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) was formed in order to meet the needs of the policy makers in development cooperation, and "evaluate performances of assisting countries comparatively, diffuse and promote the universal principles in foreign assistance (good governance, environmental sustainability, social development, and commitment to human rights).[333] USA, Germany, Australia, Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Greece, Netherlands, Ireland, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Japan, Canada, Luxembourg, Norway, Italy, the UK, Portugal and New Zealand are the members of *DAC*. Criteria for membership in DAC include being at the designated development level, not receiving development assistance, providing development assistance of 100 million USD or more, and having adopted the understanding of working globally at international level.

As belong to the common development assistance community, OECD also adopted same goals for development. In this context, in addition to the agreements after the Monterrey conference, Paris Declaration by OECD was also declared on March 2, 2005 in order to highlight the efforts for providing the effective development assistance and underline several principles. First principle is defined as *ownership* that includes the actions of developing countries for setting their own strategies for reducing poverty, improving their institutions and tackling corruption. Second principle is defined as *alignment* that refers the alignment of donor countries behind the development

---

[331] Rachel Hinton and Leslie Groves, "The Complexity of Inclusive Aid", Leslie Groves and Rachel Hinton (eds), **Inclusive Aid: Changing Power and Relationships in International Development**, Toronto: Earthscan Canada, 2004, p.3.
[332] OECD History, http://www.oecd.org/pages/0,3417,en_36734052_36761863_1_1_1_1_1,00.html [01.04.2010]
[333] OECD Topics, http://www.oecd.org/maintopic/0,3348,en_2649_201185_1_1_1_1_1,00.html [11.05.2010]

objectives and local systems of the assistance receiving countries. Third principle is *harmonization* which means the coordination among donor countries in order to simplify procedures and share information in order to avoid duplications. As a forth principle, shifting focus between developing countries and donors concerning the development results and measuring those results can be mentioned. The last principle can be counted as the *mutual accountability* meaning the trusted relations between donors and partners for obtaining positive results. [334]

In addition to the UN and OECD, we can mention about a second cluster of actors formed by donor governments and their various bilateral aid agencies such as: the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH, Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA), Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA).

USAID is the *United States Development Assistance Agency* that provides aids for different countries and regions in the world. USAID's history goes back to the Marshall Plan on the reconstruction of Europe after World War Two and the Truman Administration's Point Four Program. In 1961, the Foreign Assistance Act was signed into law and USAID was created as the principal U.S. agency on development assistance by US Administration's executive order. Currently, USAID is an independent federal government agency that receives overall foreign policy guidance from the Secretary of State. Sub-Saharan Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean, Europe and Eurasia, and the Middle East have been given assistance by USAID in the fields of economic growth, agriculture and trade; global health; and, democracy, conflict prevention and humanitarian assistance. USAID has field offices in different countries around the world that work in close partnership with private voluntary organizations, indigenous organizations, universities, American businesses, international agencies, other governments, and other U.S. government agencies. According to the USA data, USAID has working relationships with more than 3.500 American companies and over 300 U.S.-based private voluntary organizations.[335]

---

[334] Paris Declaration and ACCRA for Action,
http://www.oecd.org/document/18/0,3343,en_2649_3236398_35401554_1_1_1_1,00.html [31.03.2010]
[335] USAID; About USAID, http://www.usaid.gov/about_usaid/ [31.03.2010]

Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) was established in August 1974. JICA was established as an independent administrative institution under the law concerning the Independent Administrative Institution Japan International Cooperation Agency (Law No. 136, 2002). JICA aims to contribute to the promotion of international cooperation as well as the sound development of Japanese and global economy by supporting the socioeconomic development, recovery or economic stability of developing regions. [336]

As a development assistance provider organization, JICA identifies its missions under four main points as addressing the global agenda, including climate change, water security and food supplies, and infectious diseases, reducing poverty through equitable growth, improving governance, such as through reform of the policies and systems of developing country governments and achieving human security.[337] In order to fulfill those missions, JICA has a global network consisting of approximately 100 overseas offices that enable JICA to respond to the local needs.

Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH is also another international cooperation enterprise for *sustainable development* with worldwide operations. GTZ is a federal enterprise which was founded in 1975 as a company under private law. GTZ works for the German Federal government and other clients, public or private sector, national or international, such as the EU, World Bank or UN organizations and for private sector companies.[338]

According to GTZ, the concept of sustainable development is defined as "supporting economic growth for more prosperity in partner countries; ensuring equal opportunities for rich and poor, North and South, women and men and utilizing natural resources for the benefit of present and future generations." [339]

Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA) is a governmental agency providing technical assistance and funding throughout the world. SIDA channels its resources through NGOs, multilateral cooperation and the EU. SIDA currently works in cooperation with over 300 NGOs. By supporting over 2.000 projects in over 100 countries (over 20 of them are specially designated as target countries), SIDA seeks to create partnerships with companies, popular movements, organizations,

---

[336] JICA, About JICA, http://www.jica.go.jp/english/about/organization/ [22.04.2010]
[337] JICA, President's Desk, http://www.jica.go.jp/english/about/president/ , [24.03.2010]
[338] GTZ; who we work for; http://www.gtz.de/en/unternehmen/1732.htm , [28.03.2010]
[339] GTZ; Sustainable Development Concept, http://www.gtz.de/en/unternehmen/15534.htm , [09.04.2010]

universities, and government agencies for its development projects. SIDA is geographically focused on countries in Africa, Asia, Latin America, and Central and Eastern Europe. Increasing economic growth of the assistance receiving countries, helping to reduce the inequality between economic and social balances in the countries, helping to ensure the economic and political independence of the countries, helping to ensure democratic development in the assistance receiving countries and promoting gender equality are included in the main objectives of SIDA.[340]

The Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) is Canada's leading agency for development assistance which was formed in 1968 to administer Canada's official development assistance in Africa, the Middle East, the Americas and Asia. CIDA mainly identifies its missions as "managing Canada's support and resources effectively and accountably to achieve meaningful, sustainable results, and engaging in policy development in Canada, and internationally enabling Canada's effort to realize its development objectives."[341]

Lastly, *Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA)* is established on January 24, 1992 for implementing projects within a framework of improving cooperation and assuring development support and humanitarian aid. Detailed information about TIKA will be specified in the next chapter by analyzing its importance for Turkish soft power capabilities.

3.3 DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE AND SOFT POWER

The forms of power as hard and soft power have been discussed in the previous chapters in relation with the policies and capabilities of governments. Hard power, in general has been used for ages by a coercive instrument for governments. Nevertheless, soft power, although the term was mentioned by Joseph Nye, has a long history as hard power has as well. Soft power has several instruments like hard power which were mentioned in the previous chapters. In this context, as the history of the development assistance specified above, we can relate the development assistance activities with the countries' soft power capacity.

---

[340] Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, http://web.mit.edu/urbanupgrading/upgrading/resources/organizations/Sida.html and www.sida.gov.se , [23.04.2010]
[341] Canadian International Development Agency, About CIDA, http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/acdi-cida/acdi-cida.nsf/eng/NIC-5313423-N2A , [13.05.2010]

Nye defined soft power as the "power of attraction" which also means being able to shape the preferences of others.[342] While wielding soft power; hard power assets of the countries most of the time, do not included in the processes. So, in this context development assistance by several governments, intergovernmental organizations and non-governmental organizations appear to be as an effective tool for soft power due to their importance on winning hearts and minds. Additionally, national security professionals and political scientists tend to view foreign assistance as a 'soft power' tool designed to achieve diplomatic and strategic ends, often through an implicit bargain with the recipient government. Nevertheless, in contrast, development practitioners and economic officials tend to evaluate foreign assistance as a resource flow for poverty alleviation and development, implying that assistance should be allocated according to recipients' policy environment and needs.[343]

A linkage between development assistance and wielding soft power should be maintained by combining both perspectives for understanding the needs of the recipient countries, providing necessary assistance and functioning in line with the foreign policy goals.

While analyzing the development assistance community the key actors appear as non-governmental organizations (NGOs), bilateral donors, international finance institutions, national governments, regional and local governments and "poor people" who are the "client group" of poverty reduction initiatives. So, mentioning about the existence of soft power and influence, all the actors in the system and the outcomes of the assistance should be examined. Referring the outcomes of the assistance, the aid effectiveness issue should be underlined. Most of the assistance providers put emphasis on the issue since it has direct relations with the fact that whether the given assistance has created positive impact on the conditions of the people in the recipient countries and polish the image of the assistance provider country in the eyes of the people. Although majority of the assistance activity is run by the assistance provider

---

[342] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, p.4-5.
[343] Lael Brainard "A Unified Framework for U.S. Foreign Assistance", Lael Brainard (Ed), **Security by Other Means: Foreign Assistance, Global Poverty, and American Leadership**, Washington: The Brookings Institution Press, 2006, p.5-7

itself, the ownership of the recipient country's government plays important role for obtaining effective results from the given assistance. [344]

Besides the recipient country ownership regarding the assistance activity, provider country and organizations also provide several methods to observe the effectiveness and issues that need to be improved for fulfilling effectiveness.

In this context, *participatory power assessment* (PPA) appears as an important approach for understanding the dimensions of the poverty in the recipient country. PPA is a method to include "poor people in the analysis of poverty with the objective of influencing policy. The findings are transmitted to policymakers, thereby enabling the poor to influence public policy choices."[345] PPAs use participatory research methods to understand poverty from the perspective of the poor by focusing on their realities, needs, and priorities. European donors (including Denmark, Norway, Sweden, and the United Kingdom, which support the PPAs through trust funds and operational funding) began to emphasize the social dimensions of poverty and provided funding for many of the Bank's PPAs in Africa. In addition to the PPAs that are conducted in more than 60 countries, an equal number of PPAs have also been conducted with assistance from other agencies, including the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the Asian Development Bank (ADB), bilateral, and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs).[346] Besides participatory poverty assessments by mentioned actors, several aid organizations already use formulaic approaches for defining the needs of the countries and effectiveness as well. For instance,

> [T]he Millennium Challenge Corporation uses a relatively transparent formula to determine eligibility based on performance relative to the median for sixteen indicators measuring control of corruption, ruling justly, providing economic opportunity, and investing in people. (…) The World Bank employs another approach with its performance-based allocation system, which is based on country

[344] John R. Eriksson, **Toward Country-Led Development : A Multi-Partner Evaluation of the Comprehensive Development Framework,** Washington, DC: World Bank Publications, 2003, p.24-28
[345] Caroline M. Robb, **Can the poor influence policy? Participatory poverty assessments in the developing world** (Washington: The International Bank for Reconstruction and development/ the World Bank, 1999-2000), p.4.
[346] **Ibid**. , p.3.

policy and institutional assessments scores measuring sixteen policy and institutional components.[347]

Understanding the conditions and the realities of the recipient countries pave the way for developing further and more effective development assistance activities which would help to strengthen the soft power of the donor countries by creating a positive understanding in the eyes of the host countries' people and governments. Performing effective development assistance activities is important for different aspects as well. As mentioned by Lael Brainard,

> foreign assistance for development may be defined as an instrument, not an end for itself. Foreign assistance variously serves to advance national security, national interests, and national values. It works best when there is clarity about the strategic objective it is designed to serve and well aligned with the other instruments of state's power: military power, economic exchange, and diplomacy.[348]

As mentioned above, development assistance activities may be organized by several groups of actors such as intergovernmental organizations like the UN and OECD or donor governments and their various bilateral aid agencies such as the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH, Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA), Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA). Additionally NGOs also appear as another group of actors that are active on performing development activities.

Donor governments' bilateral aid agencies also help to wield the soft power for their countries via the activities that have been held by their staff. As an example, USAID's activities can be elaborated. As the USA's development assistance organization, USAID's activities have been published and specified in several media channels and organization's official web site as well. Additionally success stories, notes

---

[347] Lael Brainard "A Unified Framework for U.S. Foreign Assistance", Lael Brainard (ed), **Security by Other Means: Foreign Assistance, Global Poverty, and American Leadership,** Washington: The Brookings Institution Press, 2006, p.24.
[348] **Ibid**. , p.2.

and updates by the people who were on the field have been added to the web site for the public to underline the work that has been done by USAID in recipient countries. The comments by the people who were given the assistance also included in some of the stories such as those words of a Tajik man after getting the help by the USAID for surviving in winter: "I want to give my great gratitude to USAID for the support. My family will never forget this."[349] Political scientists also establish a linkage between the organization's activities and soft power. According to Nye, since the USA's image in the world especially in the Muslim countries started to decline, the images of U.S. soldiers battling in Iraq can be supplemented by images of America's military delivering relief to disaster victims.[350]

Additionally, aid agencies may also strengthen their soft power by establishing cooperation among other agencies due to the urgent need in the world because of the global problems such as terrorism, global warming, poverty or famine. In this context, with a budget size of estimated 10.3 billion USD, JICA is also one of the world's largest bilateral development agencies.[351] JICA prefers to provide support for African countries in addition to its support for the Asian countries. JICA's activities are also parallel with the Obama administration's special emphasis on the importance of international support for areas of conflict, such as Pakistan and Afghanistan. In this context, after being appointed special envoy for the Prime Minister of Japan to Afghanistan and Pakistan in March 2009, JICA President Sadako Ogata paid a visit to the United States and explained to U.S. government officials the results of aid to Afghanistan and Pakistan together with Japan's aid policies that are based on soft power.[352]

Most of the donors also support the soft power applications in first hand by providing development assistance. The relationship between development assistance and peace building activities are specified previously. In this context, Canada also took several steps by applying soft power instruments via CIDA's funding and administration for a peace building fund.[353] Furthermore, as the USAID, CIDA also published stories

---

[349] USAID, http://www.usaid.gov/stories/tajikistan/ss_tjk_donations.html [13.05.2010]
[350] S.Joseph Nye, Jr. "Rice Must Deploy More 'Soft Power'." *Daily Star*, January 25, 2005. ; also available in http://belfercenter.ksg.harvard.edu/publication/1386/rice_must_deploy_more_soft_power.html [13.05.2010]
[351] Facts and Figures, http://www.jica.go.jp/english/news/field/2008/pdf/081003.pdf [05.07.2010]
[352] JICA Annual Report 2009, http://www.jica.go.jp/english/publications/reports/annual/2009/pdf/02.pdf [14.05.2010]
[353] The Interational Development Research Center,"Swords into ploughshares: IDRC supports a new kind of peace process" , February 2009, http://www.idrc.ca/en/ev-136284-201-1-DO_TOPIC.html [14.05.2010]

from the field including the thanking messages from the people of the recipient governments in order to underline their relations in the field.[354]

Although governmental organizations have also included in the assistance providing activities, NGOs have been handling the majority of the activities. Especially as the importance of the NGOs within the world politics has been increasing gradually, the number of the fields that they operate increased as well, most of them being as humanitarian assistance, development assistance for poverty reduction, peace and security, human rights, the environment, national and international governance and accountability, and corporate social responsibility. The provision of international development assistance and humanitarian aid is certainly one of the areas where NGOs have become to play an increasingly important role especially immediately after the World War II. Currently, their importance should be underlined as Nye described non-state actors as forces that are becoming more and more powerful in the global information age, thus wielding soft power to an extent that cannot be ignored.[355]

Nevertheless, NGOs soft power capacities should be taken into consideration with their relationship with the state. For instance,

> certain NGOs pursue organizational missions that are compatible with the foreign policies of the state where they are based, while other NGOs and civil society organizations may be consistently critical of the activities of the state in a given field. Furthermore, a large number of international NGOs have gone beyond national boundaries in their attempts to influence an increasingly globalized decision-making system, which brings them to a level where they are bound to compete with various states in the realization of particular policy outcomes.[356]

As the NGOs can be observed based on their objectives, their fields of practice or their assets in terms of their budgetary and social network status, Abby Stoddard preferred to classify the NGOs under three categories as: religious,

---

[354] CIDA, Stories from the field, http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/acdi-cida/ACDI-CIDA.nsf/eng/JUD-52684956-H39 [14.05.2010]
[355] Nye, **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization**, p.81.
[356] Imata Katsuji and Kuroda Kaori "Soft Power of NGOs", Yasushi Watanabe and David McConnell (eds) , S. Joseph Nye (Foreword by), **Soft Power Superpowers: Cultural and National Assets of Japan and the United States,** New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc. 2008, p.263.

Dunantists, and Wilsonians. The religious tradition's basic tenet is compassion and service, and although they do not aim to proselytize in a direct way, they may have missionary works. Catholic Relief Services and World Vision are some present-day examples of NGOs that fall into this tradition. The second group, the Dunantists, is a group that can trace its origins to the vision of Henri Dunant, who started the Red Cross movement in the 1860s. Although the Red Cross itself is not usually considered an NGO, its humanitarian principles for helping people have been followed by the development assistance community. Today, Save the Children, Oxfam, and Médecins Sans Frontiéres (also known as Doctors without Borders) are considered as falling into this category. Lastly, third category, Wilsonians- named after American president Woodrow Wilson- have links with the governments and NGO relations. An organization that is introduced as a prominent member of the Wilsonian tradition is Cooperative for American Remittances to Europe (CARE), which was established in the aftermath of World War II by delivering food parcels (CARE packages) under the Marshall Plan for reconstruction of war-ravaged European nations.[357]

Due to their functions and relations with the government's objectives, the Wilsonian NGOs, may be considered as extensions of the state's interests. NGOs are called "partners" of states in humanitarian action and development. Taking into consideration the Wilsonian type NGOs, most of the donor countries viewed NGOs as "implementing partners" (the term still used by the UN agencies) in a relationship in which donors were the ones who made decisions as to what needed to be done while NGOs were the state's "agents" in providing services.[358]

As mentioned previously, NGOs can be effective "agents" of the state's soft power, especially when the state's objectives and foreign policy applications match with the organizations' objectives. Imata Katsuji and Kuroda Kaori who had analyzed the soft power capabilities of the NGOs, underline the example of UK government and DFID's (Department for International Department)[359] joining up and their jointly organized lobbying activities in the European Union, and within the other G8

[357] Abby Stoddard, "Humanitarian NGOs: Challenges and Trends.",Joanna Macrae and Adele Harmer (eds), **Humanitarian Action and the 'Global War on Terror': A Review of Trends and Issues,** London: Overseas Development Institute, In HPG Report 14, 2003, p. 25– 36.
[358] Katsuji and Kaori "Soft Power of NGOs", p.267.
[359] About DFIF, Who we work with, http://www.dfid.gov.uk/About-DFID/Who-we-work-with1/ [01.05.2010]

governments in the area of debt relief for the poorest countries and increase in the volume of aid.[360]

Furthermore, the roles and strength of NGOs have intertwined relations with soft power. If the roles and strengths of NGOs are fairly limited, NGOs' soft power would be rather weak. This may affect the soft power capabilities of the countries as well.

As it has been discussed in the current and previous chapters, the international political arena has been changing by affecting the actors and cases of the international relations too. In this context, the concept of development assistance is observed starting from its definition and historical evaluation as well as its relations with the foreign policy decisions and the soft power concept itself. Stemming from the idea that foreign aid has been considered as one of the most important foreign policy tools, it was also classified as an important soft power instrument. Therefore, in this chapter, several assistance providers such as intergovernmental organizations, donor governments' bilateral aid agencies and non-governmental organizations' structures and activities, and their connections with the soft power capacities are discussed.

In the next chapter, Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TIKA) will be analyzed departing from one of our research questions on whether it has contributions to Turkey's soft power and if so, at what level.

---

[360] Katsuji and Kaori "Soft Power of NGOs", p.275.

CHAPTER IV

TURKISH INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT AGENCY (TIKA) AS A CASE STUDY OF TURKEY'S SOFT POWER PRACTICES

4.1 DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE IN TURKEY

The general environment of the international relations especially after the Cold War is overviewed in the previous chapters, as well as the major tendencies in Turkish foreign policy and Turkey's soft power assets in relation with the countries in the region. Additionally, the concept of development assistance and Turkey's activities are observed while underlining its relations with the community of development. In this context, in order to understand TIKA's place in this framework, the historical background of Turkey's activities should be overviewed.

Development assistance has two aspects; *receiving assistance* and *providing assistance*. Turkey has been receiving assistance since 1940s and has begun providing assistance starting from 1980s especially in the food aid in 1985, and has continued and diversified the areas of assistance then on. Turkey as a growing donor first started its aid activities in June 5, 1985 by the State Planning Agency's decision to provide foreign aid to the Sub-Saharan countries in the amount of 10 million US dollars. First group of countries which were given assistance for capacity increasing included Gambia, Guinea, Guinea Bisse, Mauritania, Senegal, Somali and Sudan.[361]

Since it has began providing development assistance to other countries Turkey has been directing its activities, as a *strategic bridge* in order to help establishing and maintaining the link between developed countries and developing countries. Turkey, having the capabilities to fulfill the previously mentioned short term and long term objectives of development assistance, has also contributed many different countries and regions, by providing assistance.

Moreover, in order to be more effective in the field, Turkey's development assistance providing activities were institutionalized by the establishment of TIKA which

---

[361] Referans Gazetesi, "DEİK ile TIKA İşbirliğinde: Türkiye'nin Yardım Performansı Yükseldi", [07.12.2010]

an agency designed for development assistance instituted in 1992. While the first goal in the establishment of TIKA was helping the newly independent post-Soviet countries for their urgent needs; in accordance with the changing international conjuncture and Turkish foreign policies towards the region, TIKA's projects have broadened to include the Balkans, the Middle East and Africa in the recent years.

Turkey's development assistance activities are also closely related with the general objectives of Turkish foreign policy. As Turkey keep gaining political power over several regions, its capacity for foreign aids also increased in those regions. Nevertheless cultural, geographical, and historical ties still seemed to preserve their importance as well. For example, when the post-Soviet Turkic republics declared their independence at the beginning of 1990s in a new post-Cold War environment, Turkic identity was one of the prior identities attached themselves. Because of the above mentioned ethnical Turkish identity and historical commonalities inherited from the Ottoman Empire past as well as the religious bounds with those republics, Turkish officials had also urged to establish multi-faceted relations with these countries.

As outlined in OECD data, Turkey appears to be an active donor both in its region and in different regions. Currently, Turkey has the observer status in Development Assistance Committee (DAC). Although Turkey is a non-DAC country, it has met the criterion of providing development assistance of 100 million USD or more.[362]

The change in the level of Turkey's official development aids (ODA) depends on several factors. For instance, while the amount of foreign aids was in an increasing trend between 1991 and 1993, the financial amount of aid decreased in 1994. Additionally, it also seemed to be in a decreasing trend between 1995 and 2003. One of the most important reasons for this decrease is the two major economic crises occurred in 1994 and 2001. Since Turkish economy was affected negatively by those crises, there could not be provided a high amount of foreign aid during this period. Nevertheless, as of 2004, an increase in the development assistance was recorded in the data given to OECD by TIKA in April, 2005, as a part of its first assignment to report

---

[362] Non-DAC Donors reporting their aid to the DAC, http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/52/16/44376748.xls [05.07.2010]

Turkey's ODA periodically to OECD. Before this year, State Institute of Statistics was responsible from reporting these issues. According to this data, the amount of foreign aids provided in 2004 was calculated as 339.15 million US dollars[363]. The most important reasons in this increase are first, periodically reporting of the humanitarian aids that were provided after the earthquake in Pakistan and tsunami in South Asia; second, the launch of Turkey's new foreign aid campaigns in the Middle East and Africa; and lastly, reporting other Turkish organizations' foreign aids so as effectively prevented missing information.[364]

In comparison with the other donor countries, Turkey also appears as one of the prospering donors due to its foreign aid capacity. According to the OECD-DAC 2009 Development Cooperation Report, South Korea provided 699 million US dollars foreign aid in 2007 by increasing its amount of aid by 48.6% since 2006. With the mentioned amount of aid, South Korea becomes the largest non-DAC donor country. Turkey became the second largest non-DAC donor country with the amount of 602 million US dollars in the same year.[365]

Main beneficiaries of Turkish aid in 2007 were Afghanistan (USD 71.6 million), Kyrgyz Republic (USD 69.6 million), Iraq (USD 46.7 million), Azerbaijan (USD 36.2 million) and Pakistan (USD 33.5 million). Balkan countries, the Caucasus and Central Asia are the principal regions benefitting from Turkish aid. Nevertheless, Turkey's bilateral aid covers a wide geographic reach including Africa, the Middle East and the Far East.[366] For instance, while the amount of Turkish ODA for Africa was only 1.56 million US dollars, in 2007 total amount of assistance for Africa was recorded as 30.97 million US dollars.[367] Furthermore, Afghanistan, Iraq, Azerbaijan and Pakistan are the countries which were given the highest amount of Turkish development aids. Those countries receive 40% of all the Turkish ODA. 23% of all the Turkish ODA is given to Afghanistan and Kyrgyzstan. Those figures also underline Turkey's intention to improve

---

[363]Non-DAC Donors reporting their aid to the DAC,
http://www.oecd.org/document/2/0,3343,en_2649_34447_41513218_1_1_1_1,00.html [25.05.2010]
[364] Referans Gazetesi, "DEİK ile TIKA İşbirliğinde: Türkiye'nin Yardım Performansı Yükseldi", [07.12.2010]
[365] Non-DAC Donors reporting their aid to the DAC,
http://www.oecd.org/document/2/0,3343,en_2649_34447_41513218_1_1_1_1,00.html [25.05.2010]
[366]OECD Journal on Development: Development Cooperation Report, 2009, p.138
http://www.oecdbookshop.org/oecd/display.asp?K=5KZG160MNRF7&DS=OECD-Journal-on-Development-Development-Co-operation-Report-2009 [01.04.2010]
[367] Referans Gazetesi, "DEİK ile TIKA İşbirliğinde: Türkiye'nin Yardım Performansı Yükseldi", p.5, [07.12.2009]

its relations with Western Asia as well as its purpose on using the foreign aids for ensuring the regional stability.[368]

Furthermore, according to OECD's country performance data, Turkey is among the ten largest donor countries extending aid to 21 countries by average ODA volume between 2005 and 2006. Concerning the countries which were given development assistance by Turkey, developing countries were given the highest priority in technical aids. Eight of these 21 countries were in Central Asia and the Caucasus, seven in the Balkans and East Europe, five in the Middle East and North Africa, and one in East Asia. Turkey is one of the largest donors especially in the Central Asian Republics. Turkey becomes the top donor in Turkmenistan and Kyrgyzstan, the third donor in Kazakhstan and Azerbaijan and the tenth largest donor in Uzbekistan. As for five neighboring recipient countries; Turkey was one of the largest donors for three of them, the seventh for Syria, and the ninth largest donor for Lebanon. Also, it was one of the ten largest donors in seven out of ten recipient countries in the Balkans and Eastern Europe.[369]

Since the establishment in 1992, TIKA played a very important role for Turkey's development assistance activities by functioning as a coordinator agency. While providing assistance to the recipient countries, TIKA's activities also helped in underlining Turkey's image as a growing donor country in the world and strengthening Turkey's soft power by creating influence and positive awareness regarding it in the recipient countries' people. Nevertheless, a more detailed approach towards TIKA's structure and activities would be needed to establish its linkage with Turkey's soft power policies. In the next section, TIKA's historical background and the organizational structure will be overviewed.

4.2 TURKISH INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT AGENCY (TIKA)

TIKA was formed under the ordinance Act of 480 as an organization linked to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs based on a Council of Ministers decision on January 24, 1992 and published in the Official Gazette No: 21114 on January 27, 1992. On May 28, 1999, it was linked to the Republic of Turkey Prime Ministry. Act 4668 titled 'Law on the

---

[368] **Ibid**. , p. 5.
[369] TIKA Turkish Development Assistance Report, Ankara: TIKA, 2005, p.10.

Turkish Cooperation and Development Administration Presidency Structure and Duties' came into effect after publication in the Official Gazette No: 24400 on May 12, 2001.[370]

TIKA's organization consists of a president and two vice presidents who direct the functions of Personnel, Financial and Administrative Department, Education, Culture and Social Cooperation Department, Economic, Commercial and Technical Cooperation Department, Internal Monitoring officers and Legal Consultancy Offices.

TIKA's agenda of activities are set by the Coordination Committee, in relation with the fourth article of TIKA's establishment Law. The Coordination Committee meetings have been held at least once a year with the attendance of the officials ranking as deputy secretary or vice president; from Ministries of Foreign Affairs, Finance, Education, Industry and Trade, Commerce, Energy and Natural Resources, and Culture as well as officials from Undersecretaries of Treasury and Foreign Trade, State Planning Organization and TÜBİTAK. In addition to those officials, representatives from Turkish Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges, also attend the Coordination Committee meetings. The Coordination Committee defines TIKA's activities and priorities in relation with the foreign policy objectives of the government as well as by assessing the countries that will be given technical aid by taking into consideration their needs and development priorities.

Currently TIKA has coordination offices in 23 countries, including African, Asian and European continents. TIKA delivers development assistance to partner countries through its projects and activities. There are active coordination offices of TIKA in Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, Ethiopia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Mongolia, Senegal, Tajikistan, Ukraine, Albania, Bosnia Herzegovina, Georgia, Kosovo, Macedonia, Moldova, Palestine, Sudan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan. Development aid activities in these countries are mainly managed by these offices. Also, for those countries in which there is no active TIKA office, the nearest office in the region is responsible for the management of the development aid activities.

Program coordination offices have also several functions. Besides collecting and publishing information about the areas of the projects, they observe and control the flow of the processes in the field as well. These offices also maintain the communication between the officials of the countries that are receiving the aid and the

---

[370] About TIKA, http://www.tika.gov.tr/EN/Icerik.ASP?ID=345, [09.04.2010]

officials of the countries that provide the support. In this respect, TIKA's program coordination offices underline and highlight TIKA's existence and prestige in these countries. Since government and ministry officials are also aware of the importance of the program coordination offices, the Minister of State, Faruk Çelik, stated in 2010 that, they are planning to increase the number of the offices from 23 to 30 in line with the growing needs in the recipient countries.[371]

TIKA's program coordination offices are also instrumental in establishing relations between other donor countries in the region and Turkey. Establishing sound relations between donors is also underlined and prioritized in the Paris Declaration's *harmonization* principle which was set for increasing aid effectiveness.[372] In this context, TIKA's Ethiopia coordination office had took a step forward and joined the Development Assistance Group (DAG) which "was established in 2001 to foster information sharing, policy dialogue and harmonize donor support to Ethiopia in order to enable the country to meet the targets set in the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)."[373] Currently, DAG members are; African Development Bank (AfDB), Austrian Development Cooperation, Belgium Development Cooperation, CIDA, Denmark Embassy, DFID, European Commission, Finland Embassy, French Embassy, German Embassy, GTZ-Ethiopia, IMF, Indian Embassy, Irish Aid, Italian Cooperation, Japan Embassy, JICA, KfW, Netherlands Embassy, Norwegian Embassy, SIDA, Spanish Agency for International Development Cooperation (AECID), Turkish International Cooperation Agency (TIKA), UNDP, USAID and World Bank. By joining the DAG, TIKA's Ethiopia Coordination office also made a considerably important contribution for TIKA's and Turkey's prestige in the region.

Furthermore, under Act 4668, TIKA is assigned several duties and responsibilities. Defining needs of development and targets, as well as possible cooperation areas and assistance, preparing required programs and projects, developing economic, commercial, technical, social, cultural and educational cooperation, strengthening independent government bodies and supporting the efforts of the countries which are in the process of transition to market economy and

---

[371]TIKA 2009 Koordinasyon Toplantısı Yapıldı, 22.01.2010.
http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1357   [25.05.2010]
[372] Paris Declaration and ACCRA for Action,
http://www.oecd.org/document/18/0,3343,en_2649_3236398_35401554_1_1_1_1,00.html [27.05.2010]
[373] DAG Background and Structure, 30.01.2010,
http://www.dagethiopia.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=5&Itemid=29 [26.05.2010]

establishing cooperation in the areas of banking, insurance, international trade, finance and taxation are TIKA's main responsibilities.[374] In order to realize all these duties, TIKA deploys related experts in the countries.

TIKA's activities have several dimensions as organizing and supporting trainings for managers and state officials, preparing a "Turkic" dictionary, developing university curricular, and transferring Turkey's national program for the development of small-enterprise industrial sites to the Central Asian states. TIKA was also instrumental in creating the Eurasian Union of Chambers and Bourses as well as the News Agencies Union of the Turkish Speaking Countries. The organization also acts as the Turkish liaison to other international organizations that are active in the same areas and fields.[375]

Regarding TIKA's projects, a framework of improving cooperation and assuring development support and humanitarian aid should also be underlined. Despite the fact that TIKA's projects are dispersed on a wide spectrum, certain points can be specified such as establishing corporate structure in all sectors, improvements on agricultural and animal husbandry, infrastructure developments, improvements concerning the living standards and social developments, providing vocational training and employment, protecting monuments of joint heritage and culture, improvement of cultural relations and assisting in the teaching Turkish language as a part of capacity development.[376]

TIKA's projects which are implemented in several regions are also intended to improve the conditions in the countries. In this vein, implementing effective projects in line with the needs of the countries as well as strengthening peace and coordination among countries can be also included under TIKA's project implementation structure.

The countries which are defined as underdeveloped -mainly located in Africa and Middle East- have a large share in TIKA's projects regarding to solve the humanitarian problems. Moreover, more developed regions like Eastern Europe and Central Asia, the implementation of macro-projects helps to maximize cooperation

---

[374]Türk İşbirliği ve Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığının Teşkilat ve Görevleri Hakkında Kanun; 12.05.2010, http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/main.aspx?home=http://rega.basbakanlik.gov.tr/eskiler/2001/05/20010512.htm&main=http://rega.basbakanlik.gov.tr/eskiler/2001/05/20010512.htm [28.10.2009]
[375]Heinz Kramer, **Changing Turkey: Challenges to Europe and the United States,** Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2000, p. 111-112.
[376] About TIKA, http://www.tika.gov.tr/EN/Icerik.ASP?ID=345 [23.12.2010]

opportunities and paves the way for attaining system compatibility through a joint global understanding for development. According to TIKA's vision, global cooperation in this context can be easily facilitated by carrying the values and elements of cultural geography to universal dimensions. It is stated that TIKA mainly coordinates all of the activities and projects in line with the mentioned points.[377]

Furthermore, as the areas of activities have dispersed, the numbers of the countries in which projects have been implemented also increased. Although, for Turkey, close cultural, geographical, and historical ties in the first place play important roles, it has recently began to provide aid increasing gradually to almost all regions in the world such as Africa.

Considering the African context, "eradicating extreme poverty" appears as an important issue that fits the notion which is defined as the first goal of UN Millennium Development Goals. This goal is mainly based on the notion of halving, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than 1 USD a day. In this regard, the need of a highly organized and solid government appears for achieving sustainable development, improving human conditions by developing educational and medical systems, improving physical conditions by establishing proper sanitation systems, developing transportation, protecting common environmental and cultural heritage, and lastly supporting the private sector and public sector. In other words, both social and economic facilities as well as the political and environmental structures should be improved in order to eradicate poverty. Since they have severe problems in all the mentioned areas, African countries appear to be the top priority issue of the development assistance community. In this context, they have also gained priority in Turkey's development assistance planning as Turkey has attained progress on development cooperation activities. Additionally, the year of 2005 was declared as the "Year of Africa" in Turkey.[378] Although TIKA is a comparatively new donor in Africa since the first program coordination office by the Agency was opened in 2005 in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, several projects have already been organized and development assistance based on the Millennium Development objectives were given to many African countries. In this context, large scaled development assistance activities for African countries such as Benin, Butan, Cibuti, Republic of Congo, Gabon, Ghana,

---

[377] **Ibid**. , [23.12.2010]
[378] Afrika Yılı'na Etiyopyalı Başlangıç, 09.02.2007, http://www.radikal.com.tr/haber.php?haberno=212527 [18.04.2010]

122

Guinea, Kenya, Liberia, Madagascar, Mauritania , Mozambique , Nigeria, Ruanda and Tanzania began to be implemented. As a consequence, two more program coordination offices in Hartum, Sudan and in Dakar, Senegal were opened by TIKA in 2006.[379]

Moreover, TIKA underlines the importance of agricultural sector while taking the steps for eradicating poverty. In this context, TIKA planned the project of African Agricultural Development Program as well as establishing water sanitation systems for several countries. In order to improve the conditions in African countries, TIKA had planned a three stage training program under the coordination of Turkish Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs. Furthermore, it also participated in the comprehensive projects in 2008 such as Afghanistan Re-construction program and made contributions in the framework of Turkey's Action Plan for Africa. In the context of this plan, a number of co-operation activities with several African countries via NGOs were established.[380]

Besides Africa, the post-Soviet countries of Eastern Europe, with which the relations were frozen during the Soviet Union era, have also been in Turkey's development agenda for a long time. Several projects by TIKA were planned and applied in those countries in order to establish strong relations that would eventually help to maintain mutual trust among parties. Establishment of technical aids and projects in different countries were also planned to increase the relations between Turkey and those regions.[381]

Taking into consideration the possible social and political conflicts in these countries unless the proper transition plans are not processed, Turkey initiated a series of Technical Co-operation Activities regarding these countries. In the first place, projects in social and cultural fields were planned and implemented in these countries. In order to strengthen the communication, TRT began to broadcast throughout Turkic Republics; printing houses were established in order to increase the use of Latin alphabet and many officials from various sectors were trained in Turkey. Turkey made important contributions for these countries while they had begun to establish diplomatic relations with the rest of the world. In this respect, diplomats of these countries were

[379] Türkiye-Afrika Zirvesi Başladı, 14.09.2008,
http://www.cnnturk.com/2008/turkiye/08/18/turkiye.afrika.birligi.zirvesi.basladi/490738.0/index.html
[18.04.2010]
[380] TIKA, 2008 Yılı Faaliyet Raporu, p. 1.
[381] Atmaca, "Teknik Yardım Projelerinin Hazırlanması, Uygulanması, İzlenmesi ve Değerlendirilmesi", **TIKA Uzmanlık Tezi,** Ankara, 2004, p. 1.

also trained in Turkey. It appears to become a regular activity in Turkey. In this manner, "Young Diplomats Training Program" has been organized by TIKA for the young diplomats from different countries who have been invited by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Turkey.[382]

Along with TIKA's assistance activities in the regions of the former Soviet Union and the African territories, the Middle East region also takes considerably important amount of aid from Turkey. Projects have been planned and implemented in line with the needs and conditions of the recipient countries. In this context, while the transition to a market economy together with creating a working political and social atmosphere in the Eastern European countries after the Soviet rule appears as the most important goal. Countries in the Middle East, especially Palestine have different needs. Eradicating poverty, maintaining secure and war-free atmosphere and improving social and governmental infrastructure become more important in the Middle Eastern context.

In this context, it should be mentioned that TIKA's projects have direct links with the need and characteristics of the recipient countries. As it is done in the following section, elaborating the details, structure and the implementation of the projects are important for understanding the structure of TIKA and observing the concrete examples of the projects designed according to the needs of the recipient countries.

4.3   TIKA'S PROJECTS AND THEIR IMPLEMENTATION

While Turkey was a country which needs technical and social support from other countries during the Cold War, it transformed into a country which is capable of providing support to the other countries, due to the increase in its economic and political power mentioned in previous chapters. As of 1992, with the establishment of TIKA, Turkey's development assistance activities began to be planned and implemented with a more coordinated manner. In this section, the details about the structure of TIKA's projects their implementations will be overviewed in detail.

The projects of TIKA are generally initiated regarding the demands of the countries which need technical support from Turkey. These demands are mostly

---

[382] Genç Diplomatlar Eğitim için Türkiye'de, April 2007,
http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=737 [28.03.2010]

expressed by the countries in which there are established Turkish public and governmental bodies. The officers in these bodies collect demands and share this information with the related units in Turkey. After investigating the demands and calculating the cost-benefit analysis, related projects are initiated. Furthermore, some of the projects may also be initiated by the direct initiative of TIKA Administration. During the project evaluation phase, the diplomatic, economic and trade relations of Turkey with that country are considered in advance. Furthermore, while in the planning phase of the projects, the benefits of the projects and the conditions of the demanding country are also taken into consideration. Following the necessary investigations, projects begin to be implemented in line with the Project Planning and Implementing Regulations of TIKA.[383] The number of the countries to which development assistance are provided may change every year according to the countries' specific conditions and the capacity situations of TIKA. For instance, the number of countries to which Turkey extended its development assistance flows was 72, 88, 127, and 131 in 2004, 2005, 2006, and 2007, respectively. Furthermore, this number reached to 111 as of 2008.

By the help of these projects and activities, TIKA handles and organizes technical aid projects for the countries in need of support. Although TIKA designs various projects in different countries regarding the needs of those countries, projects can be specified according to their various fields. Based on the scope and specifications; projects can be categorized under three main groups as; *Developing Social Infrastructure, Developing Economic Infrastructure and Developing Production Sector*.

Based on the TIKA 2008 Annual Report, 79.53% of all the development assistance was given as to the projects under the category of Developing Social Infrastructure. Including the subfields of education, projects for accessing to clean water; improvement of administrative and civilian infrastructures, projects for Developing Social Infrastructure are given higher priority in UN Millennium Development Goals as well. 10.62% of all the development assistance were provided for projects of Developing Economic Infrastructure and lastly, 3.93% of all the development assistance were given in order to Develop Production Sector of the

---

[383] Proje Belirleme ve Uygulama Yönetmeliği, 28.08.2001,
http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Yukle.ASP?Tur=Dosya&ID=48 [28.03.2010]

countries.[384] Under those main categories, TIKA, as many other donor organizations, organize and implement its specific activities in several fields.

First of all, TIKA provides *equipment and supply aids* which include providing office stuff such as computers or food, medicine, vehicles for the use of the several agencies and all the other related materials that are listed based on the demands of the aid seeking countries. For instance, TIKA provided minibuses for the use of Baku Handicapped Children Agency in 2008. Furthermore, Tiflis İvane Cavakhisvili University Conference Hall was restored and necessary office stationary was provided by TIKA. Furthermore, TIKA has been working to improve the life conditions of disabled people as well. In Georgia, 220.000 people are recorded as disabled and several agencies in Georgia have been working to improve the conditions for those people. In this vein, TIKA created computer laboratories and a handicraft workshop in the agency in Georgia called, Birlik IA.

In addition to providing equipment and supply aids in several areas, TIKA's assistance in the *health sector* should also be underlined. Doctors who were sent with the initiatives of TIKA to Haiti in which an earthquake was took place and other African countries, cured 44.800 patients. Additionally nearly 37.000 patients having cataract in Africa have been operated by the Turkish doctors with the medical supplies and equipment provided by TIKA. It has also been organizing major development activities in health sector. Since Afghanistan has the highest mortality rate in the world, health sector in this country needs to be supported. More specifically, one of every five children dies before they are 5 years old and average life expectancy is 47 for men and 45 for women. Furthermore, there is only one doctor for every 7.000 people.[385] For this reason, TIKA has been working on hospital and clinic buildings as well as organizing vaccination campaigns and training medical staff in Afghanistan. As of 2007, the number of the people who had vaccine increased to 7.600 and the number of the staff who had received trainings is 154.[386] In addition to Afghanistan, several countries such as Ethiopia receive medical aid. For instance, in the first months of 2010, a group of

---

[384] TIKA **2008 Yılı Faaliyet Raporu**, Temmuz 2009, Ankara, p. 13.

[385] USAID Afghanistan, Health, 30.11.2009, http://afghanistan.usaid.gov/en/Program.28.aspx [18.04.2010]

[386] Musa Kulaklıkaya, " Kalkınma Yardımında Son Trendler ve TIKA", **Uluslararası Ekonomik Sorunlar Dergisi,** Sayı: 31, November, 2008, p.27; also available in, http://www.mfa.gov.tr/data/Kutuphane/yayinlar/EkonomikSorunlarDergisi/sayi31/Musa%20KULAKLIKAYA.pdf [10.12.2009]

doctors went to Ethiopia for sanitary control with the initiatives of TIKA and 5.500 patients were examined during five days.

Palestine is also another country which needs assistance in health sector. Because of the conflictious situation, the need for hospitals, medically trained personnel and the vehicles for the health services are very high. In this context, several projects have been implemented via initiatives of TIKA. While the medical trainings for the personnel were given both in Turkey and Palestine as well, 15 ambulances were donated to this country due to the need which appeared especially after the bombing attacks in Gaza Strip immediately after the December 2009.

As a consequence of those steps, Turkish humanitarian aid began to be perceived positively in those countries that would eventually help the formation of the positive understanding for Turkey. As well as the foreign responses in return for the Turkish aids in different countries, TIKA's projects also create a positive understanding for the Agency in Turkey. For instance, Marmara Health Association Platform gave the award of "The Governmental Organization of the Year" to TIKA because of its health projects in several countries. TIKA's Tashkent coordinator Dr. İhsan Çomak received the award on behalf of TIKA on March 14, 2010. [387]

Besides the equipment and supply aids, TIKA also implements *projects for promotion of Turkey* in order to establish cultural relations and increase the number of the people having information about Turkey. Turkish pavilions arrangements; opening exhibitions; inviting the top-ranking officials to give speeches about the activities of Turkey in different areas; issuing various publications about Turkish World and organizing programs including workshops regarding Turkish culture and traditions can be included in the promotion aids organized by TIKA.[388]

Different than the other kinds of projects, the possible future outcomes and gains as a consequence of these activities may not be calculated precisely. Usually these kinds of aids may help to create a positive understanding in the minds of the people living in these countries and this positive image of Turkey may influence the behaviors and choices of these people. Additionally, these kinds of aids may play a

---

[387] Marmara Sağlık Dernekleri Platformu'ndan TIKA'ya "Yılın Devlet Kuruluşu" Ödülü, 24.03.2010 http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1381 [28.03.2010]
[388] Atmaca, "Teknik Yardım Projelerinin Hazırlanması, Uygulanması, İzlenmesi ve Değerlendirilmesi", p. 38.

greater role especially in the countries in which there is a cultural proximity with Turkey. For instance, in order to strengthen the current relations with these countries, TIKA made efforts since 1992; such as restorations of Hodja Ahmet Yesevi Tomb in Kazakhstan; Sultan Sancar Tomb in Turkmenistan; Bridge of Konjic in Bosnia and Herzegovina; Sinan Mosques in Kosovo; Haci Giray Han Tomb and Zincirli Madrasah in Crimea and Suleyman Mosque in Syria. Also TIKA accomplished the Project of Mongolia Turkish Monuments and opened an exhibition about this in 2008. All these mentioned monuments and historical buildings have great importance in terms of Turkish identity and the individual histories of these countries. So, by paying special attention for them, TIKA and Turkey are trying to create a positive image in the eyes of these countries.[389]

TIKA schedules various sets of periodical trainings, under the framework of the *educational aid* projects, which are planned and coordinated in line with the needs and educational demands of the countries. Achieving universal primary education is also a goal included in the UN Millennium Development Goals as well. According to UNESCO's EFA Global Monitoring Team's data, nearly 72 million children are out of school, one in every five adults does not have basic literacy skills and many pupils have been leaving school without acquiring essential skills and knowledge.[390] In this context, it has been aimed to ensure by the UN that every child regardless of gender will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling until 2015. Within this aim, TIKA has been developing several projects for improving educational skills of the people in different countries. As of 2007, it was reported that 24.6% of all the official development aids by TIKA were transferred for the educational projects, while this ratio was realized nearly 14.8% for other donors. Several countries such as Afghanistan, Ukraine, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Albania, Macedonia and Palestine; can be counted as the main recipient countries.

Besides providing support for the educational system in different countries, TIKA initiated the Turkology Program in 2000. Turkology Program aims to strengthen the socio-cultural, commercial and political relations between Turkey and the countries in which a shared Turkic culture exists. In the framework of Turkology Program, several protocols were signed with the prominent universities in several countries. In line with the protocols, Turkology, Turkish Language and Culture Departments or Turkish

---

[389] TIKA, **2008 Yılı Faaliyet Raporu**, p. 2.
[390] **EFA Global Monitoring Report**, 2008, http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0015/001548/154820e.pdf [15.04.2010]

Cultural Centers are opened. Local academics and academics from Turkey give lectures in those departments. As of 2008, number of the countries with which the protocols for Turkology Departments in the universities and the Turkish Cultural Centers were signed was reported as 33. Afghanistan, Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Estonia, Palestine, Syria and Turkmenistan are some of the countries in which there are Turkology Departments in the universities or Turkish Cultural Centers.[391]

Besides contributing to academic studies in Turkology departments, TIKA has also been organizing summer camps by hosting groups of Turkology students from several countries. In 2009, 5th of those summer camps were organized and 96 students from 26 countries were hosted in Ankara. Turkology Summer Camps Projects aim to gather the groups of Turkology students from several countries in the common platform in Turkey whose cultural and historical characteristics are also underlined in those courses. They are deemed as important since learning a country's language, culture and socio-historical background help to create a positive awareness regarding this country in the eyes of the students.[392]

In addition to those academic training projects, vocational trainings in several fields as Tax Trainings, Accounting Trainings, Banking Trainings and Entrepreneurship Trainings have been organized by the initiatives of TIKA. Moreover, in addition to trainings of the Foreign Diplomats, OECD Private Sector Improvement Center and OECD Tax Training Center (OECD Özel Sektör Geliştirme Merkezi and OECD Vergi Eğitim Merkezi) also become systematically recurrent programs.[393] In addition to those mentioned above, some other vocational trainings in several fields were also given by TIKA both in Turkey and in different countries. For instance, groups of Georgian farmers were trained in Yalova (Ataturk Central Horticultural Research Institute) about the modern agriculture technologies. Additionally, groups of administrative officials of different countries have been trained in Turkey in line with their executive branches and duties. For instance, Nakhichevan Autonomous Republic's Health officials were trained in Turkey in 2008 by the initiatives of TIKA and Autonomous Republic Ministry of

---

[391] TIKA, **2008 Yılı Faaliyet Raporu**, p. 115.
[392] Turkology Students in Turkey, 11.07.2009,
http://www.trt.net.tr/international/newsDetail.aspx?HaberKodu=2e127994-cc48-4fa4-a085-f627b39a6380
[14.03.2010] ; 2009 Yaz Staj Programı'na Katılan Öğrenciler Sertifikalarını Aldı, 15.07.2009*,*
http://www.tobb.org.tr/haber_arsiv2.php?haberid=2500 [14.03.2010]
[393] Melih Tan Kodaloğlu, **TIKA Çalışma Raporu**, Ankara, 15 Nisan 2002.

Health. Moreover, Tiflis Municipality officials were given applied training in Turkey in the project planned by TIKA.

When the expertise and educational demands require long-term follow up processes, these demands may be planned and included under the steps of a technical aid project too. Strengthening the Statistical Activities; Improvement of the Local Administrations projects are examples of these kinds of projects. Additionally, planning feasibility reports and master reports regarding a country can also be included under the technical aid projects. For instance preparing the Turkmenistan Highway Master Plan, Crimea 1.000 Housing Feasibility Works are the projects that were implemented lately.

Additionally, providing experts for the related activities in different countries is one of the most common activities of TIKA in the scope of the *expertise aids*. Based on the needs and the demands from the countries that are seeking these aids, TIKA administration assigns several experts for these duties. Besides that kind of individual expertise aids, TIKA also provides a comparatively important level of support of expertise within the framework of UNDP Voluntary Expertise Program.[394]

Also as an extension of the expertise aids, a Talent Bank has been planned to be developed, including a roster of Turkish experts which will facilitate the provision of Turkish technical expertise in the global development assistant community. Development of Talent Bank is a part of the South-South Cooperation (SSC) project by UNDP and TIKA.

Driving from the motto that, sometimes developing nations may be in a better position than the developed donors on the occasion of helping less-developed countries,[395] UNDP plans to organize the network of the recipient and donor countries by assisting program countries in identifying, documenting and disseminating cutting-edge experiences in critical development areas, including through the establishment of a unified system and database of best practices.

In this context, in addition to the above mentioned areas of assistance given by TIKA, the cooperation between TIKA and other organizations such as OECD and UNDP should also be underlined.

---

[394] **Ibid**.
[395] Avni Aksoy's Speech in the Project Launch of UNDP/TIKA South-South Cooperation Project in 09.October.2008, Ankara, also available at http://www.undp.org.tr/basin_bildirisi/Avni_Aksoy_Speech.doc [27.05.2010]

The Project titled *Bridging South-South Cooperation and Emerging Donor Roles: Strengthening Turkey's Participation in International Development Cooperation* is jointly implemented by TIKA and *UNDP Turkey*, between March 2008 and March 2011 with the budget of 1.973.000.00 USD.[396]

This project aims to promote the leadership of Turkey's role as an emerging donor within the international development assistance community and to contribute the development of TIKA's capacity to increase the effectiveness of Turkish Development Assistance (ODA) in line with the principles of aid effectiveness.[397] Sebahattin Gazanfer, the Senior Project Advisor, had also stated in the project launch in 2008 that Turkey is becoming a very effective donor country due to its dual structure as the recipient and the donor country as well, since it can grow emphatic approaches for the other recipient countries' needs.[398] As TIKA President Musa Kulaklıkaya had stated in the same meeting, implementation of the project in the ownership of TIKA carries great importance to strengthen Turkey's participation in international development cooperation and emerging donor role through capacity building of TIKA according to Paris Declaration principles on Aid Effectiveness and to promote the leadership role of Turkey in the international community.[399] In line with the harmonization principle of the Declaration, TIKA establishes relations with the other donor countries. TIKA's administration sends several personnel as trainees to several agencies such as OECD and UNDP. Additionally a number of co-operation agreements were signed between TIKA and those agencies.

Furthermore, as of 2007, a set of trainings were organized in the OECD Ankara Multilateral Tax Center which has been established in 1993 based on Memorandum of Understanding between the OECD and the Republic of Turkey. Besides the OECD Ankara Multilateral Tax Center, there are four other OECD Multilateral Tax Centers which are located in Budapest, Seoul, Mexico City and Vienna.

---

[396] Bridging South-South Cooperation and Emerging Donor Roles, http://www.undp.org.tr/Gozlem2.aspx?WebSayfaNo=1439 [27.05.2010]
[397] Turkey: Capacity assessment and response help prepare Turkish Development Cooperation for expanding mandate, 13 January 2010, http://europeandcis.undp.org/cpr/show/E606C9DA-F203-1EE9-B54CED599932DB2E [22.03.2010]
[398] Sebahattin Gazanfer's Speech in the Project Launch of UNDP/TIKA South-South Cooperation Project in 09.October.2008, Ankara, also available in, http://www.undp.org.tr/basin_bildirisi/Sebahattin_Gazanfer_Presentation.ppt [27.05.2010]
[399] Musa Kulaklıkaya's Speech in the Project Launch of UNDP/TIKA South-South Cooperation Project in 09.October.2008, Ankara, also available in, http://www.undp.org.tr/basin_bildirisi/Musa_Kulaklikaya_Speech.doc [27.05.2010]

In general, costs of the OECD Multilateral Tax Centers are covered by the total budget composed of voluntary cash and in-kind contributions of the OECD member countries. TIKA contributes 130.000 USD every year to the OECD. The expenditures of the OECD Ankara Multilateral Tax Center are covered by in-kind contribution of the Turkish Revenue Administration in addition to the OECD allocation.[400]

Different events (seminars, workshops etc.) have been held at the OECD Ankara Multilateral Tax Center for a total number of 3.894 high-level tax officials from 43 countries since 1993. Additionally, TIKA has been organizing the Black Sea and Central Asia Economic Outlook-BSECAO Project in cooperation with the OECD Ankara Multilateral Tax Center.[401] Furthermore, the following examples for the coordination with UNDP and TIKA, Workshop on Strengthening the Role of the Civil Society in the Poverty and Social Impact Analyses, three staged HIV/AIDS Vulnerability Training [402] and Meeting on National Human Rights which was held with the initiatives of TIKA – can be given for the activities achieved in coordination with UNDP and TIKA.

Besides those joint activities with several international organizations, TIKA has also different groups of projects which are implemented in cooperation with several organizations in the country as well. As of 2008, TIKA began to carry out the Development Assistance Aids Capacity Program which is a main database of all the development aids provided by all the public offices and foundations in Turkey besides TIKA. All the aid provider bodies in Turkey and their amount and scope of educational aids and expertise aids and the programs are recorded to the Development Assistance Aids Capacity Program. With the help of this program 73 educational projects and programs, whose planning were done during 2008, were accomplished in 2009.[403] It should be underlined that more coordinated way of working between TIKA and the other public offices and aid providers would be achieved with this program.

Moreover, TIKA pays special attention towards the events which have global consequences such as global food problems, ecological change and global financial crises. In this respect, TIKA attended the Third High Level Forum on Assistance

---

[400]OECD Ankara Multilateral Tax Center, http://www.gib.gov.tr/index.php?id=264 [12.04.2010]
[401]Karadeniz Ekonomik İşbirliği (KEİ), http://www.dpt.gov.tr/PortalDesign/PortalControls/WebContentGosterim.aspx?Enc=51C9D1B02086EAFBF69CEF5F299AE5B4 [12.04.2010]
[402]**HIV/AIDS Bölgesel İncinebilirlik Çalışması**, http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=858 [12.04.2010]
[403] TIKA, **Türk İşbirliği ve Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığı 2008 Yılı Faaliyet Raporu**, Temmuz 2009, Ankara, p.2.

Efficiency as the representative of Turkish Republic, which was organized in order to measure and define the improvements and steps taken since the Paris Declaration, TIKA also participated in the Meeting on Development Aid Committee Directorate (DAC) which is organized by OECD annually and in the UN Conference on the Least Developed Countries.[404] The issues that were discussed in those meetings help TIKA to comprehend and develop the projects regarding the needs.

Besides the global issues mentioned above, peace building activities in different regions of the world may need an extra emphasis due to their both local and global nature. As the number and severity of those conflicts increased, international development assistance community also took this issue into consideration as a number one priority and began taking several steps for establishing the atmosphere of peace especially after the religious and ethnic conflicts The majority of those conflicts emerged especially after the end of the Cold war as the ideological curtain disappeared between the countries. Stemming from the statements that poverty, poor governance and illiteracy may foster terrorism and other conflicts, the notion of development assistance gained a wider meaning and attention. Especially after the 9/11 terrorist attacks in USA, several countries have began to take the issue of development assistance into consideration seriously as they noticed the importance and influence capacity of those aids.

Peace building activities can be performed in various methods. Those activities usually start immediately after the conflict has ended and include capacity building activities, activities for creating social cohesion and transformation and improvement of conditions in the country. In this context, humanitarian aids and development assistance activities by donor countries play important roles on the establishment of peace. In cooperation with the several organizations of donor countries, TIKA has been making important contributions in peace building activities. Afghanistan appears to be one of the primary countries that receive this kind of assistance from TIKA as well as the other donor countries in an environment that has been organized by ISAF.[405]

---

[404] **Ibid**. , p. 2.
[405] Musa Kulaklıkaya, " Kalkınma Yardımında Son Trendler ve TIKA", **Ekonomik Sorunlar Dergisi**, Sayı: 31, p.19, also available in, http://www.mfa.gov.tr/data/Kutuphane/yayinlar/EkonomikSorunlarDergisi/sayi31/Musa%20KULAKLIKAYA. pdf [10.12.2009]

Furthermore, the issue of *capacity development* appears as a very important target for TIKA which needs to be fulfilled both for the organizational structure of the agency itself as well as for the infrastructure in the recipient countries. As mentioned previously, Turkey provides development assistance via establishing and/or repairing civil and governmental buildings as well as providing economic assistance and helping to strengthen the administrative skills of the countries. Although Turkey provides those aids for improving the conditions in the recipient countries, long term affectivity of those aids is directly related with the personnel working in the institutions. In this context, the need for trained personnel is valid nearly for all sectors. In relation with this issue, the importance of capacity building emerges. For instance, medical aids were provided to Afghanistan where the infant mortality rate is too high because of the uneducated health staff and the insufficient sanitary conditions. Additionally, a midwifery training school which would be very helpful to obtain normal conditions for women giving birth, was also opened. From this perspective, capacity building appears as not only a need in health sector, but also an indispensable requirement to save lives. In addition to the capacity building activities in the health sector, several training programs and courses are being organized in other sectors as well.

The concept of development assistance as well as TIKA's structure and project implementation are discussed in detail. Having information about TIKA and its activities appear to be very important in order to understand TIKA's role on wielding Turkey's soft power. Stemming from those points, TIKA's projects' and whether they can be considered as source of Turkey's soft power will be discussed in the next section.

4.4 TIKA AND PROJECTS AS SOURCE OF TURKEY'S SOFT POWER

In the recent decades, Turkey, gives a considerably high importance for building trusted multilateral relations between the actors in the region and the world in order to be a regional power and contribute to the global peace. Because of the peculiar characteristics of the region, the countries and people of this region had to get in touch with each other by taking into consideration the socio-cultural and historical ties among them. Turkey as a regional country also shares the same heritage. "Being placed in the hub of the Balkans, Caucasus, and the Middle East, that is, the three

most volatile regions of the World, and connected to all of them through history, ethnicity, religion, and socioeconomic ties renders Turkey a valuable asset in managing the conflicts of those areas, or a potential liability for world peace."[406] As the successor of the Ottoman Empire, its relations with its neighbors were affected by past conflicts or loyalties. In this context, one of the areas of continuity in Turkish foreign policy underlines its Western stance which has been adopted by Turkey since the first years of the independence. Within this framework, Turkey has been considered as a bridge between East and West. Moreover, the Turkish population whose majority consists of Muslims also has a high degree of importance on concerning the relations with the people in the Balkans and the Middle East. Additionally, the Turkic relations were also strengthened departing from the ethnic proximity between Turkey and those republics after the end of the Cold War.

Moreover, strategic routes, very important energy resources, sharp socio-cultural differences between groups and the problems of political transformation in some countries accelerated the potential conflicts in the region. Hence, Turkey maintained a very peaceful and conciliatory but also decisive political stance towards the countries of the region to provide its security, to increase its effect and to able to preserve its historical legacies at the same time. Departing from these, Turkey has an important potential to become a soft power in its region.

Turkey sees itself as an actor which has various responsibilities in its region. Building strong multilateral relations, working with other regional countries in regional crises and taking effective roles in their solutions, providing aids for the developing countries and supporting them in social and economic fields, strengthening multiculturalism and cooperation between countries, providing humanitarian and technical aid to the countries can be given as examples of these responsibilities. In the following section the linkage between these and TIKA's projects will overviewed.

First of all, we should underline the structure of the aid activities. While the assistance given by a country creates important influence in the eyes of the recipient country, those assistance activities may also create positive outcomes in other specific events as well. For instance, TIKA's development assistance activities that were organized in Africa in line with the objectives of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs helped to create a convenient atmosphere for Turkey's election to the temporary membership of

---

[406] Kalaycıoğlu, **Turkish Dynamics: Bridge Across Troubled Lands**, p.191-192.

the UN Security Council with 151 out of 192 votes.[407] The positive votes of the majority of the African countries can be interpreted as showing their positive understanding regarding Turkey.

Moreover, since TIKA's activities in several recipient countries help to improve the life conditions of the people, the recipient countries react positively. For instance, because of the TIKA's project in Mongolia for developing Mongolia-Turkey Friendship Park in Sukhbaatar and the others, TIKA was given the medal of "Ulanbator's 370. Anniversary" in the Sagan Sar (Ak Ay) Festival. Additionally, in Kyrgyzstan, the results of a poll which was conducted by Iyyık Ata Jurt (Kutsal Anavatan) Youth Foundation and Sookum Science Periodical announced Turkish Minister of State, Faruk Çelik, as the "man of the year" due to his services and contributions for improvement of the relations between two countries. TIKA's Kyrgyzstan coordinator Tayfun Atmaca was given the award on behalf of the minister.[408]

Nevertheless, it should be also noted that, only the correctly planned development assistance may play important role in improving the image of a country in the eyes of the citizens of the recipient countries. In this case, 'aid effectiveness' which can be defined as the effectiveness of development assistance in achieving economic, social and political development also appears as an important criterion. The aid effectiveness agenda enshrined in the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness (2005)[409] and more recently through the Accra Agenda for Action (AAA) (2008)[410], aims to improve the quality of the delivery, management, and use of official development assistance (ODA) in order to maximize its development impacts."[411] Although aid effectiveness plays important roles for the recipient countries, it has also special importance for the development assistance provider countries as well. TIKA also took a series of steps for fulfilling aid effectiveness which were mentioned previously. Nevertheless, as TIKA President Musa Kulaklıkaya stated in an interview, currently

[407] Türkiye'nin Afrika'ya Desteği, http://www.tasamafrika.org/tr/arsiv/makaleler/281-tuerkiyenin-afrikaya-destei.html [05.07.2010]
[408] "Devlet Bakanı Faruk Çelik, Kırgızistan'da 'Yılın Adamı' Seçildi", 21.12.2009, http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1343 [19.05.2010]
[409] ACCRA High Level Forum, Milestones of Aid Effectiveness, Paris Declaration, http://www.accrahlf.net/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/ACCRAEXT/0,,contentMDK:21690889~isCURL:Y~menuPK: 64861438~pagePK:64861884~piPK:64860737~theSitePK:4700791,00.html [21.02.2010]
[410] ACCRA Agenda for Action, 2-4.09.2008, http://siteresources.worldbank.org/ACCRAEXT/Resources/4700790-1217425866038/AAA-4-SEPTEMBER-FINAL-16h00.pdf [21.02.2010]
[411] Monitoring the effectiveness of the Australian aid program: What is aid effectiveness?, http://www.ausaid.gov.au/ode/default.cfm [17.03.2010]

TIKA does not have a mechanism testing the effectiveness of aids within the context of TIKA's establishment principles. Kulaklıkaya also mentioned about a revision in the institution's organizational structure that will meet the requirements of the increasing work-load. So, TIKA has been planning an activity of capacity development in order to be more effective in the field of development assistance. Those activities are also related with the implementation of the Bridging South-South Cooperation and Emerging Donor Roles: Strengthening Turkey's Participation in International Development Cooperation project.[412]

Currently TIKA is the central agency that organizes Turkish development assistance. Although projects are being planned based on the needs of the countries which are stated by the field office coordinators or the representatives of the countries, a more coordinated way of project planning would be organized via strategy development activities. In this context, reporting affectivity appears as a very important issue for developing strategies. Currently TIKA has twenty-three program coordination offices in several countries. According to TIKA's personnel appointment structure, a program coordinator and coordinator's assistant perform duties and organize the activities in each program coordination office. Nevertheless, program coordination offices do not function as corporate bodies of the Turkish diplomatic missions of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in the recipient countries, and TIKA personnel who working in those offices are assigned for the provisional duties. According to the interviews which were conducted by the writer in TIKA in 10-11.02.2010, this structure grants TIKA a considerably free movement area while designing and implementing its projects on the one hand. On the other, this situation may cause inefficiencies sometimes regarding the project implementation since the period in which the personnel has to stay in the field or the scope of the duty are changeable depending on the conditions.

Besides TIKA's officials, local officials in the host country are also assigned some duties and responsibilities in the framework of the project implemented. Although general information about the implementation of the project is given to headquarter by the program coordination offices, program coordinators are not obliged to present a more detailed report including all the processes and the information regarding the project. During the interviews, the TIKA officials stated, presenting detailed reports are

---

[412]" Turkey as an Emerging Donor", **New Horizons, UNDP Turkey Monthly Newsletter**, Issue 46,October 2009, http://www.undp.org.tr/Gozlem2.aspx?WebSayfaNo=2155 [22.03.2010]

optional nevertheless very important for understanding the dynamics of the host country and for measuring changes and improvements as a result of the projects.[413]

In this context, the linkage between efficient reporting activity and the strategy planning should be emphasized. When properly done, reports on the implementation and the outcomes of the projects' would give very important clues about the field. Moreover, country ownership, assessing whether the recipient country employs the activities that the project needs or takes necessary actions to fasten the processes are highly important. Nevertheless, as Parlak also states sometimes recipient countries seemed to delay the actions that they have to take for the completion of the projects.[414] In TIKA's case, presenting compulsory reports about the field and scheduling follow-up assessments about the implementation of the projects would be helpful in order to avoid those kinds of problems.

As another aspect of the importance of the reporting activities is that it should be stated that, via the reports regarding the projects implemented in several recipient countries, the socio-political structure of those countries could be understood more, which would help to design more effective projects in the recipient countries in the future. Moreover, the issue of country ownership of the recipient countries regarding the implemented projects also has relations with the implemented projects. As mentioned during the interviews, the recipient countries would be more eager to cooperate on implementing the projects which were designed by considering the reality in those countries.[415] Furthermore, considering soft power capabilities, those kinds of projects that were designed directly due to the needs, may create a more effective and positive image in the recipient countries regarding the aid provider. In other words, following Nye's terminology winning hearts and minds would be processed more effectively.

Strategy planning regarding the project implementation is also another factor that plays an important role on countries' foreign policy planning and credibility. Although the primary objective of development assistance appears to develop the countries' social, economic and political conditions, increasing the level of information

---

[413] In-depth Interviews which were conducted in TIKA, 10-11.02.2010, Ankara. [The name of the interviewee is available in the interviewer upon request.]
[414] Nükrettin Parlak, **Orta Asya-Kafkasya-Balkan Ülkeleriyle İlişkiler ve Türk Dış Yardımları (1992-2003)**, TODAİE (Tez, Ankara: Mayıs 2005)
[415] In-depth Interviews which were conducted in TIKA, 10-11.02.2010, Ankara. [The name of the interviewee is available in the interviewer upon request.]

about Turkey in those countries and strengthening Turkey's credibility in the international arena are also seen as important objectives. In line with the trends in the notion of development assistance, Turkey, like other donors, provides assistance for several reasons. Referring to Janet Hunt's writings in which she specified the purposes of aid in detail[416], improving the conditions in the recipient country and establishing political or economic relations for both the donor and the recipient's should be considered.

In this context, taking into consideration the above mentioned bilateral purpose of aid, it should be stated that TIKA's activities are also related with the policy making of the government and foreign policy orientations of Turkey as well. Those orientations also have been related with the politicians' point of view and priorities. Since TIKA is not completely immune from effects of the domestic politics besides the foreign politics, its projects and development aids planning may be shaped under those political conditions. Examples of this situation may be traced especially in the immediately aftermath of the Cold War period as the new Turkic republics gained their independence. According to the interviewees in TIKA, after the long Cold War era, those aid projects conveyed the message that Turkey has began to establish relations with those republics and add those issues in its foreign policy agenda.[417] Nationalists in Turkey defined those newly independent states as the continuation of the Turkic soul and tradition. TIKA, in the first place, was established in order to provide development assistance for those countries and create a sphere of influence. In the current situation, TIKA still preserves its alignment with the foreign policy objectives of the government as well. Government's ambition of 'zero problems' with its neighbors includes establishing peaceful relations with them as well as diminishing the existing conflicts by negotiations. Currently, instead of focusing on one region or certain countries, Turkish foreign policy is being conducted on a wide spectrum including the Middle East, Balkans, the Central and Eastern Europe as well as the African continent. Concerning the new developments in the International Relations, it is observed that mere hard power measures are not the only back-up or alternative for the foreign policy implementation. As mentioned previously, development assistance activities are considered as important assets while conducting foreign policy.

---

[416] Janet Hunt, "Aid and Development", Damien Kingsbury, Joe Remenyi, John McKay and Janet Hunt, **Key Issues in Development** (New York: Palgrave MacMillan: 2004), p.67.
[417] In-depth Interviews which were conducted in TIKA, 10-11.02.2010, Ankara. [The name of the interviewee is available in the interviewer upon request.]

Currently TIKA's fields of project implementation include people in several countries. Nevertheless as stated during the interviews, TIKA's aid providing activities should not be limited with the people who are only having Turkic origins or the groups of Muslim people.[418] In order to be more effective in the field, the projects should be designed to include all groups of people whoever need those kinds of support. Furthermore, this discussion was also held in the Turkish Grand National Assembly while the issue of 2010's budget was discussed. JDP Ankara MP Haluk Özdalga also stated that considering TIKA as an Agency which was designed only for the Turkic world would be a serious mistake.[419]

Additionally, related with the previously mentioned strategic planning and the efficient reporting activities, the knowledge regarding the recipient countries helps the Agency to develop the appropriate discourse while establishing the primary communication with those countries. In this context, the importance of the experts having the knowledge of the field appears while discussing TIKA's effectiveness and its share on contributing Turkey's soft power capabilities.

TIKA's budgetary procedures appear to be important indicators while evaluating TIKA's activities. With the amount of budget exceeding 100 million TL[420], TIKA appears as an important instrument of Turkish foreign policy. Nevertheless, in contrast with the points with which TIKA creates a high degree of influence, its annual budget is provided by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and TIKA does not have a determining role on how the budget is prepared. TIKA's activities start after the budget is given to the agency and projects for different countries are then planned and implemented. For that reason, TIKA's comments and suggestions while preparing the budget would be helpful since TIKA has a field experience and has more information regarding the specific needs of the countries around the world and in the neighboring area.

Another point that has an impact on the effectiveness of the organization is related with the other organizations which provide assistance as well. As mentioned, currently TIKA is central agency which has been organizing Turkish development assistance for different countries. Although TIKA preserves its central place, there are

---

[418] **Ibid**. , 10-11.02.2010.
[419] 2010 Yılı Bütçesi Genel Kurulda, 24.12.2009,
http://www.resmi-gazete.org/gundem/duyurular/tbmm/2010-yili-butcesi-genel-kurulda.html [16.08.2010]
[420] TIKA 2009 Koordinasyon Toplantısı Yapıldı, http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1357, [20.05.2010]

numerous organizations that provide development assistance in line with their professional fields of experience. Same as TIKA, examples of Turksoy and Yunus Emre Foundation can also be included under the same group. Officials in TIKA mention that[421], those organizations may coordinate similar projects in different channels, which would eventually decrease the efficiency of those projects. On the other hand, if same kind of projects would be organized and handled by a single organization duplications in applications would be minimized and cost- benefit balance would be maintained. Regarding the efficiency of the future projects TIKA's structure may be revised for the Agency to be an *umbrella organization* for the development activities in Turkey. If the coordination of the operations which have been conducted by the several organizations would have assigned to a single organization like TIKA, the effectiveness of the projects and the influence that would be created in those countries would be increased.

In addition to this, another point which could increase TIKA's effectiveness would be possible revisions regarding the Agency's current operational procedures. Currently, firstly the projects for several regions are planned and the related personnel for the implementation of the project are assigned for the projects, and afterwards the program coordination offices coordinate and implement the projects. All those steps and the whole project implementation process are defined by the project implementation regulations.[422] Nevertheless, occasionally there may be more acute situations which require an activity regarding urgent solution. In this context, an immediate response by the aid providing organizations or their countries may solve the issue as well as creating a more positive image in the eyes of the recipient countries. In the case of TIKA, a revision activity regarding the project implementation regulations may be very effective while enabling the Agency to respond the needs of in those countries.[423]

In addition to those points mentioned above, as a comparatively young actor in the development assistance community, it can be aptly suggested that TIKA's operational structure and its projects should be improved due to the requests from the

---

[421] In-depth Interviews which were conducted in TIKA, 10-11.02.2010, Ankara. [The name of the interviewee is available in the interviewer upon request.]
[422] For more information about TIKA's Project Implementation Regulations see, http://www.tika.gov.tr/yukle/dosyalar/Mevzuat/Proje%20Belirleme%20ve%20Uygulama%20Y%C3%B6net meli%C4%9Fi.doc
[423] **Ibid**. , 10-11.02.2010.

recipient countries as well as the needs which arose in line with the current foreign policy objectives.

Currently, TIKA is implementing its projects in several regions around the world. The regions which the development assistance is needed most are also in the agenda of other donor countries and organizations as well. The aid provider organizations that were examined in the previous chapter have activities in Africa, the Middle East or the Central Asia in which TIKA has also been implemented several projects since its establishment. As mentioned, the Paris Declaration's principle of harmonization among the donor countries is one of the bases of the development assistance. In this context, TIKA's coordination offices coordinate and establish good communications with donors. Nevertheless, as argued by one of the TIKA officials, currently although the pace of the development assistance activities is increased, a war of development assistance between assistance provider countries took place in most occasions. In this case, that kind of war refers to the increasing number of the projects as well as the increasing number of the donors and their complex network between recipient and donor countries. Therefore, in order to be more effective in the field, the activities of the other donors should be taken into consideration while establishing the links between them and the internal structure of the Agency.[424] By this way, the integrity between the development assistance community and TIKA would be established which would also strengthen Turkey's image in the eyes of the other countries.

---

[424] In-depth Interviews which were conducted in TIKA, 10-11.02.2010, Ankara. [The name of the interviewee is available in the interviewer upon request.]

CONCLUSION

International Relations between countries in the current years appear to grow on a comparatively different environment than that of the Cold War and the years immediately after the Cold War. While the way of policy making is changing depending on the list of the issues in the agenda of the world politics, foreign policy objectives and the assets that support those objectives are also in a changing trend.

Since the ideological separator between countries was collapsed, world had to face with several new threats which were having direct affects to the national securities of the countries and the individuals living in those countries. So, ethnical and religious conflicts in several regions, corruption, criminal groups, private militias, insecure borders, smuggling and trafficking in weapons, drugs, contraband and people, illegal migration, proliferation of nuclear, chemical, and biological weapons of mass destruction (WMD) and global terrorism can be included under the new issues of security. Additionally, global epidemics like HIV/AIDS also began to affect hundreds of people, as well as the threats of global warming and the environmental degradation issues.

Although the details of those issues are discussed in the previous chapters, the main conclusion for those points can be driven in relation with the fact that a new approach towards those threats should be developed since the traditional approach which has been applied mostly during the Cold War years may not be sufficient to answer the questions of the new century.

Furthermore, while the definition and the context of the national security threats have been changing, the concept of power and the instruments of national power capabilities have also changed especially starting from the post-Cold War years. While the traditional definition of power refers to the military capabilities, the scale of the territory or the amount of the population; the shift which appeared after the Cold War, shed light on the different aspects of power. So, the technological, educational and economic factors become significant in power analysis while geography, population and raw materials preserved their importance. Furthermore, although the hard power preserves its importance, it should also be underlined that, the use of force

started to be discussed as more costly as it was in the previous ages. Some of the other instruments, such as "communications, organizational and institutional skills, and manipulation of interdependence" become more important.[425]Therefore, the importance of the soft power assets had started to be concerned as important sources for creating influence and exercising power over different countries. Nevertheless, as the research was deepened the significance of the hard power elements also appeared since the conflicts in Iraq after the American intervention in 2003 and Afghanistan's situation the severity of which is increasing because of the armed conflicts and weakened governmental authority. In this context, it should be concluded that, although the rising importance of the soft power is obvious, there are the cases which require the employment of the hard power as well. Taking into consideration those facts, Nye also points out a new concept which is the *smart power* as the combination of the soft and hard power in necessary occasions.[426]

According to Nye, the USA's strategy during the Cold War can be given as an example of combining hard and soft power. Nevertheless, especially after the 9/11 terrorist attacks the USA's reliance on the hard power distances its politics from the axis of the smart power. On the other hand, Nye also evaluates the difficulty of wielding soft power for the USA since "many of America's soft power resources lie outside of government in the private sector and civil society, in its bilateral alliances, multilateral institutions, and transnational contacts."[427] In this context, the importance of wielding smart power appears due to the complexity of the events and issues in the general political environment.

Although soft power has numerous instruments, according to Nye, it arises from the attractiveness of a country's culture, political ideals, and policies.[428] Nevertheless, the sources of soft power should not be limited only with those assets in general. While different countries may have different sources for wielding soft power in relation with their own characteristics like their political systems or sound economic structures, some of the countries' soft power capabilities may be directly related with their geographical situation and the other countries in the region which are receptive for

---

[425] Nye, **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization**, p. 71

[426] For more information about Smart Power see, "Smart Power Initiative", 06.05.2009, http://csis.org/program/smart-power-initiative, [16.09.2006]

[427] Nye, Smart Power, 29.11.2007, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/joseph-nye/smart-power_b_74725.html, [02.09.2010]

[428] Nye, **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics**, p.x

the influence created only by those countries due to the several dimensions like common historical heritage or the cultural links.

Despite its relations with the neighboring countries which have a problematic historical background, Turkish foreign policy which is sourcing from Ataturk's words of "peace at home, peace in the world" has objected to maintain good relations with its neighbors. In this context, since soft power has relations with the potential of influencing the actors in the region, Turkish way of continuity in terms of political behavior and its intention of not violating the status-quo and harm the relations within the countries, strengthen Turkey's positive image in the eyes of the other regional countries, which would help Turkey to become an important regional soft power.

Nevertheless, similar to the other countries in the world, Turkey also is not immune from the developments in the international relations. Especially after the Cold War, Turkey also had to go through a number of changes. At the global level, as the USSR demised, the role of Turkey both in NATO and in world politics in general is needed to be reinterpreted. While Turkey was the forefront of the Western block with the Soviet Union, this strategic importance seemed to be decreased as the Cold War order was terminated and Soviet Union declared their demise. Nevertheless, Turkey gained an upper hand in the region as the relations and kinship with the Post-Soviet countries' prevailed. Turkey's efficiency towards those newly independent states in the eyes of the West, especially USA, strengthened the positive image of Turkey compared with the relatively strict Islamic regime of Iran. At the regional level, Turkey's relations with the neighboring regions the Middle East, the Central Asia and Caucasus, the Balkans and the Central and Eastern Europe were shaped under the conditions of the post-Cold War era's dynamics.

In this context, Turkey's soft power capabilities are observed while putting special emphasis on the general tendencies of Turkish foreign policy since the first years of the independence. Furthermore, the democratic basis of the political structure, cultural affinities and historical background (Ottoman Legacy), economic structure and military capabilities as sources of power are observed while Turkey's soft power capabilities are concerned. Depending on the time and the then-conditions of the political conjuncture, the importance and weight of those assets had changed or prioritized.

Taking into consideration those facts, it appeared that besides Nye's views and the traditional sticks and carrots approach, Turkey's soft power may need some additional explanations. As an extension of the general profile of the International Relations after the Cold War, Turkish foreign policy makers also put emphasis on wielding the relations with the countries in the region as well as increasing its area of influence. In this case we may rather underline "some larger concepts of cultural affinity, historical companionship, geographical proximity, social imaginary and how all of these create a sense of belonging."[429]

In addition to those points, Turkey's growing development assistance capacity should also be included in its soft power assets. In line with the general trends in the world indicating that development assistance activities are creating a considerable important degree of influence as well as improving the conditions in those countries, Turkey had also begun to expand its assistance activities. Turkey has been receiving assistance since 1940s and began providing assistance starting from 1980s by providing assistance as food aid in 1985 and continued and diversified the areas of assistance given. Nevertheless, Turkey's development assistance providing activities were institutionalized especially by the establishment of TIKA which was designed for development assistance in 1992.

As Turkey transformed into a country which is not only receiving aids but also providing aids for the needing countries its development assistance activities appeared to be conducted in a more coordinated manner. Moreover, in order to be more effective and coordinated in terms of the activities in comparison with the other donors TIKA was established in 1992. In the related chapters, the comparison between TIKA and other major donors was done based on the activities about development aids. As the research deepened, it also turned out that although being a comparatively young donor, TIKA is one of the largest donors in the non-DAC group as meeting the criterion of providing development assistance of 100 million USD or more.

As the case study of this thesis, TIKA's activities were observed departing from the question of whether TIKA's projects have a role for wielding Turkey's soft power capacity in neighboring regions. Within this aim, the reports of TIKA were examined as well as having in-depth interviews with the personnel in TIKA which also

---

[429] Kalın, "Debating Turkey in the Middle East: The Dawn of a New Geo-Political Imagination", p.90.

deepened our knowledge regarding the organizational structure of the Agency in general while presenting an occasion to reach the views of the personnel about the Agency's activities. While the most up-to-date information about the projects that are currently implemented are provided by the program coordination offices in the fields and can be reached via TIKA's web site as well as the several media channels, the interviews conducted in the headquarter provided the information related with the operational processes of the Agency and the outcomes of the previously established projects.

During the in-depth interviews, a number of arguments about TIKA's operational structure and the project implementation are stated by the interviewees. First of all, aid effectiveness appears as an important issue which has been underlined continuously during the interviews and in TIKA's reports. Currently, TIKA does not have a mechanism testing the effectiveness of aids within the context of TIKA's establishment principles. In this context, the need for establishing a working follow-up procedure appears. The outcomes of the projects that are implemented in recipient countries can be obtained more effectively and the necessary improvement actions can be taken in time by the help of this process.

Maintaining aid effectiveness and establishing follow-up procedures have several elements. We can underline the importance and necessity of the reporting activities as the first element. Compulsory reporting activity helps to fulfill the aid effectiveness as well as improving the country ownership regarding the projects and their implementation by the recipient country which can also be interrelated with the efficient follow-up process regarding the project implementation in the recipient countries. Efficient reporting also helps to understand the conditions and the socio-political realities of the countries, which would be helpful for designing the projects in line with the needs of the country.

During the project designation and implementation, TIKA's program coordination offices have special importance. Currently TIKA has twenty-three program coordination offices in several countries. In this context, improving activities of those offices appear to be considerably important. Currently, program coordination offices are not corporate bodies of the Turkish diplomatic missions of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in the recipient countries and TIKA personnel working in those offices are assigned for the provisional duties. As articulated during the in-depth interviews, this

issue may cause inefficiency regarding the project implementation since the period in which the personnel has to stay in the field or the scope of the duty are variable depending on the conditions.

Additionally, TIKA's relations with the other aid providing activities in Turkey should be also underlined. Currently, TIKA is the central agency which has been organizing Turkish development assistance for different countries. Although TIKA preserves its central place, there are numerous organizations that provide development assistance in line with their professional fields of experience. As also discussed during the in-depth interviews in TIKA, those organizations may coordinate similar projects in different channels, which would eventually decrease the efficiency of those projects. In order to increase the efficiency of the future projects TIKA's structure would be revised for the Agency to be an *umbrella organization* for the development activities in Turkey. By this way, the projects for the recipient countries would be planned more effectively as the budgetary issues and the assigning of the related experts for the projects would be handled by a single organization. Additionally, the assessments of the projects after implementation and the improvement activities - if necessary- would be also done in a more coordinated manner by the umbrella organization.

Furthermore, TIKA's roles and responsibilities should also be revised in order to enable the Agency to respond the acute crises more effectively which occur in different regions of the world. Currently, TIKA's projects have been designed and implemented in line with the project implementation regulations which define the series of actions before and in the course of the project implementation. Nevertheless, sometimes sudden and unexpected situations presenting the urgent need of assistance may occur. As a part of the above mentioned suggestion about transforming TIKA's structure into an umbrella organization, TIKA's procedures may be revised as enabling to respond those kinds of situations as well.

On the other hand, it was also found out that, people living in the recipient countries started to have an understanding about Turkey and the multi-dimensional relations between both governments and the citizens are established by the implemented projects. While observing TIKA's projects being implemented in several countries, it was also noticed that, TIKA's projects can be categorized as the *projects for improving the daily life conditions* of the people in the recipient countries. In TIKA's reports those projects are included under the group of improving the conditions of the

Social Infrastructure as strengthening educational, administrative and civilian infrastructures as well as including the health conditions and digging the drinking water well. In 2008, the share of the aids for the projects under this category was 79, 53 %. During the discussions with the officials in TIKA, it was also mentioned that allocating the largest part of its budget to those kinds of projects also shows that TIKA's aid activities can be liken to the mechanical repairs that are performed to a broken machine metaphorically. In the real sense it would mean that, the most important objective for providing development aids is to help the recipient countries for development. Consequently, the image of the Turkey will be strengthened in parallel with its increasing soft power. Furthermore, 10.62% of all the development assistance were provided for projects of Developing Economic Infrastructure and lastly, 3.93% of all the development assistance were given in order to develop production sector of the countries.

As a comparatively young actor in the development assistance community, Turkey and TIKA will certainly have many challenges and points to develop. Additionally, due to its state-affiliated structure, TIKA may not be completely immune from the then-government's decisions or priorities while implementing its projects. TIKA, with its current structure and the project implementation regulations, may create influence in the eyes of the recipient countries. Nevertheless, in order to increase TIKA's role on wielding Turkey's soft power, improvements regarding TIKA's budgetary process, personnel appointment regulations and the fields of projects implementation, as well as responsibilities and liabilities should be re-defined.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS:

ABRAHAMIAN, Ervand, **Iran between Two Revolutions**, Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1983

AKÇAOĞLU, Emin, **Türk Firmalarının Dış Yatırımları: Saikler ve Stratejiler**, Ankara: Türkiye Bankalar Birliği, Yayın No: 241, 2005

ALDRED, Ken, **Superpowers in the Post-cold War Era**, Hampshire: Palgrave Publishers, 1999

ANDERSON, Benedict, **Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of the Nationalism**, London: Verso, 2006

ARAS, Bülent, "Davutoğlu Era in Turkish Foreign Policy", **Seta Policy Brief**, Brief No: 32, Ankara, May 2009

ART, Robert J., "The Fungibility of Force", ART, Robert J. and WALTZ Kenneth N. (Eds), **The Use of Force: Military, Power and International Politics**, New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc, 2004

ARVIN, B. Mak, "Introduction", ARVIN, B. Mak (Ed) **Allocation of Foreign Aid and Economic Development: New Theoretical and Empirical Perspectives**, Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group, 2002

ARVIN, B. Mak; BARILLAS, Francisco and LEW, Byron "Is Democracy a Component of Donors' Foreign Aid Policies?" B. Mak (Ed) **Allocation of Foreign Aid and Economic Development: New Theoretical and Empirical Perspectives,** Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group, 2002

ATABAKI, Touraj, "The Caliphate, the Clerics and Republicanism in Turkey and Iran, Some Comparative Remarks", ATABAKI, Touraj and ZÜRCHER, Eric J. (Eds.), **Men of Order: Authoritarian Modernization under Ataturk and Reza Shah**, London: I. B. Tauris Co & Limited, 2004

ATMACA, Tayfun, "Teknik Yardım Projelerinin Hazırlanması, Uygulanması, İzlenmesi ve Değerlendirilmesi", **TIKA Uzmanlık Tezi**, Ankara, 2004

BAL, İdris, **Turkey's Relations with the West and the Turkic Republics,** Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2000

BALDWIN, A. David, **Paradoxes of Power**, New York: Blackwell, 1989

BALDWIN, David A., "Power and International Relations", CARLSNAES, Walter; RISSE, Thomas; SIMMONS, Beth A., **Handbook of International Relations,** London: Sage, 2005

BANKES, Steve and BUILDER, Carl, **Seizing the Moment: Harnessing the Information Technologies,** Santa Monica CA, 1992

BARRO, Robert J., **Determinants of Economic Growth: A Cross-Country Empirical Study,** Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1997

BAZOĞLU SEZER, Duygu, "Turkey in the New Security Environment in the Balkan and Black Sea Region", MASTNY, Vojtech and NATION, R. Craig (Eds), **Turkey between East and West: New Challenges for a Rising Regional Power,** Oxford: Westview Press, 1996

BLACK, Jeremy and MACRAILD, Donald M., **Studying History**, London: Macmillan Press, 1997

BOYAR, Ebru, **Ottomans Turks and the Balkans: Empire Lost Relations Altered**, London: I. B. Tauris & Company, Limited: 2007

BRAINARD, Lael "A Unified Framework for U.S. Foreign Assistance", BRAINARD, Lael (Ed), **Security by Other Means: Foreign Assistance, Global Poverty, and American Leadership,** Washington: The Brookings Institution Press, 2006

BRAMAN, Sandra, **Change of State: Information, Policy, and Power,** Cambridge: MIT Press, 2007

BROOKS, Risa A., "Introduction: The Impact of Culture, Society, Institutions, and International Forces on Military Effectiveness", BROOKS, Risa A., STANLEY,

Elizabeth A (Eds) **Creating Military Power: The Sources of Military Effectiveness**, Palo Alto, CA: Stanford University Press 2007

BULL, Hedley, T**he Anarchical Society: A Study of Order in World Politics,** Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2002

BUZAN, Barry, **People, States and Fear**, Second Addition, Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1991

CARR, Edward. H., **The Twenty Years' Crisis,** New York: Palgrave, 1981

CHAN, Sylvia; **Liberalism, Democracy and Development** Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002

CHONG, Alan, **Foreign Policy in Global Information Space: Actualizing Soft Power**, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007

CIMBALA, Stephen J., **Coercive Military Strategy**, Texas: Texas A & M University Press, 1998

CLEMENS, Walter C., **Dynamics of International Relations: Conflict and Mutual Gain in an Era of Global Interdependence,** Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc: 1998

CUTTER, W. Bowman, "*A New International Economic Order?*", HUTCHINGS, Robert L. (Ed), **At the End of the American Century: America's Role in the Post-Cold War World**, London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998

ÇELİK, Yasemin, **Contemporary Turkish Foreign Policy**, London: Praeger Publishers, 1999

DAVUTOĞLU, Ahmet, **Stratejik Derinlik: Türkiye'nin Uluslararası Konumu,** Istanbul: Küre Yayınları, 2008

DEUTSCH, Karl W., **The Nerves of Government: Models of Political Communication and Control,** New York: The Free Press, 1966

DOYLE, Michael W. and IKENBERRY, G. John, "Introduction: The End of the Cold War, the Classical Tradition, and International Change", DOYLE, Michael W. and

IKENBERRY, G. John (Eds) **New Thinking in International Relations Theory,** Colorado: Westview Press, 1997

ECONOMIDES, Spyros and WILSON, Peter, **Economic Factor in International Relations: A Brief Introduction,** London: I. B. Tauris & Company, Limited, 2002

Entering the 21st Century, World Development Report 1999/2000, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000

ERALP, Atilla, "Soğuk Savaş Sonrası Dönemde Türkiye ve Avrupa Birliği" MAKOVSKY, Alan and SAYARI, Sabri (Eds), **Türkiye'nin Yeni Dünyası: Türk Dış Politikasının Değişen Dinamikleri**, Istanbul: Alfa Basım, 2002

ERIKSSON, John R., Toward **Country-Led Development: A Multi-Partner Evaluation of the Comprehensive Development Framework**, Washington, DC: World Bank Publications, 2003

FERGUSON, Niall, **Empire: How Britain Made The Modern World**, London: Penguin Books: 2004

FIRAT, Melek, KÜRKÇÜOĞLU, Ömer, "*1990-2001Orta Doğuyla İlişkiler*". ORAN, Baskın (ed.), **Türk Dış Politikası Kurtuluş Savaşından Bugüne Olgular, Olaylar, Yorumlar,** Cilt II, Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları,2001

FISHER, Glen, **Mindsets: The Role of Culture & Perception in International Relations,** Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press Incorporated, 1997

FISCHER, Markus, "*Culture and Foreign Politics*", SHAFFER, Brenda (ed), **Limits of Culture: Islam and Foreign Policy**, Cambridge: MIT Press, 2006

FISHER, Roger; KOPELMAN, Elizabeth and SCHNEIDER, Andrea Kupfer, **Beyond Machiavelli**, London: Harvard University Press, 1994

FULLER, Graham, "Turkey's New Eastern Orientation", FULLER, Graham E. and LESSER, Ian O. with HENZE, Paul B. and BROWN, J.F., **Turkey's New Geopolitics, From the Balkans to Western China**, Oxford: Westview Press, 1993

FUKUYAMA, Francis, **End of History and the Last Man,** Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1992

GADDIS, John Lewis, **The Cold War: A New History**, London: Penguin Press, 2005

GOLDSTEIN, Joshua S., **International Relations**, New York: Longman, 1999

GÖZEN, Ramazan, "Turkish Foreign Policy in Turbulence of the Post Cold War Era: Impact of External and Domestic Constraints", BAL, İdris (Ed) **Turkish Foreign Policy in the Post Cold War Era,** Florida: Brown Walker Press, 2004

GROVE, K. Andrea, **Political Leadership in Foreign Policy: Manipulating Across Borders**, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007

GÜNLÜK ŞENESEN, Gülay, **1980-2001 Türkiye'de Savunma Harcamaları ve Ekonomik Etkileri**, Istanbul: TESEV Yayınları, 2002

GRIFFITS, Martin, **Fifty Key Thinkers in International Relations,** London: Routledge, 1999

HARRION, Kevin, **Understanding Political Ideas and Movements**, Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003

HENZE, Paul B., "Turkey: Towards The Twenty-First Century", FULLER, Graham E. and LESSER, Ian O. with HENZE, Paul B. and BROWN, J.F., (Eds) **Turkey's New Geopolitics, From the Balkans to Western China**, Oxford: Westview Press, 1993

HINTON, Rachel and GROVES, Leslie, "The Complexity of Inclusive Aid", GROVES, Leslie and HINTON, Rachel (Eds), **Inclusive Aid: Changing Power and Relationships in International Development,** Toronto: Earthscan Canada, 2004

HOBSBAWM, J.E., **Nations and Nationalism, Since 1780**, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990

HOMER-DIXON, Thomas, **Environment, Scarcity, and Violence**, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001

HOOK, Steven V. "Foreign Aid in Comparative Perspective: Regime Dynamics and Donor Interests" in BUSS, Terry F. (Ed), **Foreign Aid and Foreign Policy: Lessons for the Next Half-Century**, New York: M.E. Sharpe, 2007

HOWARD, A. Dougles, **History of Turkey**, Westport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group, Incorporated, 2001

HUNDLEY, Richard O., ANDERSON, Robert H.; BIKSON, Tora K.; NEU, C.Richard, **Global Course of the Information Revolution: Recurring Themes and Regional Variations,** Santa Monica: National Defense Research Institute, 2003

HUNDLEY, Richard O., "The Information Revolution is Affecting Mechanisms of Governance and Empowering New Political Actors", **Global Course of the Information Revolution: Recurring Themes and Regional Variations,** Santa Monica: National Defense Research Institute, 2003

HUNT, Janet, "Aid and Development", KINGSBURY, Damien; REMENYI, Joe; McKAY, John and HUNT, Janet, **Key Issues in Development**, New York: Palgrave MacMillan: 2004

HUNTINGTON, Samuel, **The Clash of Civilizations and the Remarking of World Order,** New York: Touchstone, 1997

İSKİT, Temel, **Diplomasi, Tarihi, Teorisi, Kurumları ve Uygulaması**, Istanbul: Istanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2002

International Conference on Financing and Development, **Monterrey Consensus on Financing for Development**, Monterrey, Mexico, 18-22. 03.2002, UN: 2003, also available in,
http://www.un.org/esa/ffd/monterrey/MonterreyConsensus.pdf [11.04.2010]

KALAYCIOĞLU, Ersin, **Turkish Dynamics: Bridge Across Troubled Lands,** Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005

KEOHANE, Robert O., **International Institutions and State Power,** London: Westview Press, 1989

KEOHANE, Robert O. and NYE, Joseph S., **Power and Interdependence: World Politics in Transition,** Boston: Little, Brown Company, 1977

KHARAS, Homi, **Trends and Issues in Development Aid,** Washington: The Brookings Institution, Wolfensohn Center for Development Working Paper 1, 2007

KODALOĞLU, Melih Tan, **TIKA Çalışma Raporu**, Ankara, 15 Nisan 2002.

KRAMER, Heinz, **Changing Turkey: Challenges to Europe and the United States,** Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2000

KRAHMAN, Elke, **New Threats and New Actors in International Security**, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005

KRASNER, Stephen D. **Sovereignty: Organized Hypocrisy**, Ewing, NJ, USA: Princeton University Press: 1999

KRIESBERG, Louis, "Regional Conflicts in the Post-Cold War Era: Causes, Dynamics, and Modes of Resolution", KLARE, Michael T. and THOMAS, Daniel C. (Eds) **World Security: Challenges for a New Security,** New York: St. Martin's Press, 1994

LEVI, A. Michael and O'HANLON, E. Michael, **Future of Arms Control**, Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2004

LONSDALE, David J., "Information Power: Strategy, Geopolitics, and the Fifth Dimension", GRAY, Colin S. and SLOAN, Geoffrey (Eds), **Geopolitics, Geography and Strategy,** London: Frank Cass Publishers, 1999

LORD, Carnes, **Modern Prince: What Leaders Need to Know Now**, New Haven:Yale University Press, 2004

MACRIDIS, Roy C. and HULLIUNG, Mark L., **Contemporary Political Ideologies, Movements and Regimes**, New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1996

MCALLISTER, Ian, **Sustaining Relief with Development: Strategic Issues for the Red Cross and Red Crescent,** London: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers: 1993

MCCARTHY, Justin; **The Ottoman Peoples and the End of Empire**, London: Oxford University Press: 2004

MASON, John W., **Cold War, 1945-1991**, London: Routledge, 1996

MEAD, Walter Russell, **Power, Terror, Peace and War: America's Grand Strategy in a World at Risk,** New York: Knopf, 2004

MIRRLESS, Tanner, "American Soft Power, or, American Cultural Imperialism?", MOOERS, Colin (ed), **The New Imperialists**, Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2006

MORGENTHAU, Hans J., **Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace**, Brief Edition Revised by THOMPSON, Kenneth W., New York: Mc Graw Hill, New York: Mc Graw Hill, 1993

MUELLER, John, "The Obsolescence of Major War", ART, Robert J. and WALTZ, Kenneth N. (Eds), **The Use of Force: Military Power and International Politics**, New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc, 2004

NYE, Joseph S., "Foreword", WATANABE, Yasushi and MCCONNEL, David (Eds), S. Joseph Nye (Foreword by), **Soft Power Superpowers: Cultural and National Assets of Japan and the United States,** New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc. 2008

NYE, Joseph S., **Power in the Global Information Age: From Realism to Globalization,** London: Routledge, 2004

NYE, Joseph S., **Soft Power: The Means to Success in World Politics,** New York: Public Affairs, 2004

NYE, Joseph S., **The Paradox of American Power, Why the World's Only Superpower can't Go It Alone,** New York: Oxford University Press, 2002

NYE, Joseph S., **Understanding International Conflicts: An Introduction to Theory and History**, New York: Longman, 2007

ORME, John, "The Utility of Force in a World of Scarcity", ART, Robert J. and WALTZ, Kenneth N. (Eds), **The Use of Force: Military, Power and International Politics,** New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc, 2004

OSGOOD, Robert E. and TUCKER, Robert W.; **Force, Order, and Justice**, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1967

ÖZCAN, Gencer, "The Military and the Making of Foreign Policy in Turkey", RUBIN, Barry and KİRİŞÇİ, Kemal (Eds), **Turkey in World Politics: An Emerging Multiregional Power,** Istanbul: Boğaziçi University Press, 2002

PAINTER, David. S., **Cold War: An Interdisciplinary History,** London: Routledge, 1999

PARLAK, Nükrettin, **Orta Asya-Kafkasya-Balkan Ülkeleriyle İlişkiler ve Türk Dış Yardımları,** Ankara: TODAİE Tez, May 2005

PLAMENATZ, John, **Ideology,** New York: Praeger, 1970

POLLUDA, Leon P., "Diplomacy the Missing Link in the Study of International Politics" MCLELLAN, D.S., OLSEN, W.C. and SONDERMANN, F.A.(Eds), **The Theory and Practice of International Relations,** Englewood Cliffs, N.J. Prentice Hall, 1974.

ROBB, Caroline M., **Can the poor influence policy? Participatory Poverty Assessments in the Developing World,** Washington: The International Bank for Reconstruction and development, The World Bank, 1999-2000

ROBB, Caroline M., "Changing Power Relations in the History of Aid", GROVES, Leslie and HINTON, Rachel (Eds), **Inclusive Aid: Changing Power and Relationships in International Development,** Toronto: Earthscan Canada, 2004

ROBBINS, Philip, **Suits and Uniforms: Turkish Foreign Policy since the Cold War,** London: Hursct & Company, 2003

ROTHGEB, John M. Jr, **Defining Power, Influence and Force in the Contemporary International System,** New York: St. Martin's Press, 1993

RUGGIE, J.G., "Continuity and Transformation in the World Polity: Toward a Neorealist Synthesis", KEOHANE, Robert O. (ed), **Neorealism and Its Critics**, New York: Columbia University Press, 1986

RUSSETT, Bruce; STARR, Harvey; KINSELLA, David, **World Politics: The Menu for Choice,** Boston, New York: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2000

RYRIE, William, **First World, Third World**, New York: Macmillan, 1995

SARAÇOĞLU, Rüsdü, "Liberalization of the Economy", HEPER, Metin (Ed), **Politics in the Third Turkish Republic**, Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1994

SHAFFER, Brenda, "Introduction: The Limits of Culture", SHAFFER, Brenda (ed), **Limits of Culture: Islam and Foreign Policy,** Cambridge: MIT Press, 2006

SINGH, J.P., "Introduction: Information Technologies and The Changing Scope of Global Power and Governance", ROSENAU, James N. and SINGH, J.P. (Eds), **Information Technologies and Global Politics**, New York: State of New York University Press, 2002

SLOAN, Geoffrey and GRAY, Colin S., "Why Geopolitics", GRAY, Colin S. and SLOAN, Geoffrey (Eds), **Geopolitics, Geography and Strategy**, London: Frank Cass Publishers, 1999

SØRENSEN Georg and JACKSON, Robert, **Introduction to International Relations**, Oxford: Oxfor University Press, 2001

SÖNMEZOĞLU, Faruk, **İkinci Dünya Savaşı'ndan Günümüze Türk Dış Politikası,** Istanbul: Der Yayınları. 2006

SÖNMEZOĞLU, Faruk, **Uluslararası Politika ve Dış Politika Analizi**; Istanbul: Der Yayınları. 2000

SPETH, James Gustave, **Toward Security for All: Development Assistance and Global Poverty**, Washington: Environmental Law Institute, 2002

STRANGE, Susan, "What About International Relations?", STRANGE, Susan (Ed), **Paths to International Political Economy**, London: Allen&Unwin, 1984

STODDARD, Abby, "Humanitarian NGOs: Challenges and Trends." MACRAE, Joanna and HARMER, Adele (Eds), **Humanitarian Action and the 'Global War on Terror': A Review of Trends and Issues,** London: Overseas Development Institute, In HPG Report 14, 2003

TARP, Finn and HJERTHOLM, Peter (Eds), **Foreign Aid and Development: Lessons Learnt and Directions for the Future**, London: Routledge, 2000

TELLIS, J.Ashley; LAYNE, Christopher; BIALLY, L. Janice, **Measuring National Power in the Postindustrial Age,** Cambridge: Rand Corporation, The, 2001

The Republic of Turkey Ministry of Environment, **National Report Turkey, World Summit on Sustainable Development,** Johannesburg 2002

TICKNER, Ann J., **Gender and International Relations: Feminist Perspectives on Achieving Global Security,** New York: Columbia University Press, 1992

TIKA, **Turkish Development Assistance Report**, Ankara: 2005

TIKA, **Türk İşbirliği ve Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığı 2008 Yılı Faaliyet Raporu**, Ankara: Temmuz, 2009

TIKA, **Türk İşbirliği ve Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığı 2007 Yılı Faaliyet Raporu**, Ankara: 2007

TOYNBEE, Arnold J.; abridgement of volumes I-IV by SOMEERVELL, D. C., **A study of History,** New York: Oxford University Press, 1947

UZGEL, İlhan, "The Balkans: Turkey's Stabilizing Role", RUBIN, Barry and KİRİŞÇİ, Kemal (Eds), **Turkey in World Politics: an Emerging Multiregional Power**, Istanbul: Boğaziçi University Press, 2002

VALI, Ferenc A., Bridge Across the Bosphorus: The Foreign Policy of Turkey**,** Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1971

WATANABE, Yasushi and MCCONNEL, David (Eds), S. Joseph Nye (Foreword by), Soft Power Superpowers: Cultural and National Assets of Japan and the United States, New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc. 2008

WORLD BANK STAFF, **A Case for Aid: Building a Consensus for Development Assistance,** Washington, DC: World Bank Publications, 2002

ZURCHER, Erik Jan, **Modernleşen Türkiye'nin Tarihi,** (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002

PERIODICALS:

ALDIS, Anne and HERD, Graeme, "*Managing* Soft Security Threats: Current Progress and Future Prospects", **European Security,** Vol.13, 2004.

ALTINAY, Hakan, "Turkey's Soft Power: An Unpolished Gem or an Elusive Mirage?" **Insight Turkey**, Vol.10 No.2, 2008.

ALTUNIŞIK BENLİ, Meliha, "The Possibilities and Limits of Turkey's Soft Power in the Middle East", **Insight Turkey,** Vol.10, No.2, 2008

ALLENBY, B.R., "Environmental Security: Concept and Implementation", **International Political Science Review,** Vol.21, No.1, 2000.

BATMAZ, Nihat, "Türkiye - Kazakistan Arasındaki Ticari-Ekonomik İlişkiler, Türk Müteşebbislerinin Bu ülkede Yaptıkları Yatırımların Boyutu ve Karşılaştıkları Sorunlar", Bilig, Sayı 29, Bahar 2004, also available in, http://www.yesevi.edu.tr/bilig/biligTur/pdf/29/4_29.pdf [30.01.2010]

BETTS, Richard K., "Analysis, War, and Decision: Why Intelligence Failures are Inevitable", **World Politics,** 30, 1, 1978.

BETTS, Richard K., "*Surprise Despite Warning: Why Sudden Attacks Succeed*", **Political Science Quarterly,** 95, 4, 1980-81.

BALDWIN, David A. "The Concept of Security", **Review of International Studies,** Vol. 23, No.1, 1997.

ÇANDAR, Cengiz, "Turkey's Soft Power Strategy: A New Vision for a Multi-Polar World**", Seta Policy Brief,** Brief No: 38, Ankara, December 2009.

DAĞI, İhsan, "Editor's Note", **Insight Turkey,** Vol.10, No.2, 2008.

DAVUTOĞLU, Ahmet, "Turkey's Foreign Policy Vision: An assessment of 2007", **Insight Turkey,** Vol.10, No.1, 2008.KALIN, İbrahim, "Debating Turkey in the Middle East: The Dawn of a New Geo-Political Imagination" **Insight Turkey**, Vol.11 No.1, 2008.

"DEİK ile TIKA İşbirliğinde: Türkiye'nin Yardım Performansı Yükseldi", **Referans Gazetesi**, (07.12.2010)

KEYMAN, E. Fuat, "Globalization, modernity and democracy: in search of a viable domestic polity for sustainable Turkish foreign policy", **New Perspectives on Turkey,** no: 40, 2009.

KEYMAN, E. Fuat, "Turkish Foreign Policy in the Era of Global Turmoil" **Seta Policy Brief,** Brief No: 39, Ankara, December 2009.

KEYMAN, E. Fuat, "Turkish Foreign Policy in a Globalizing World", **Turkish Policy Quarterly**, Volume: 8 Number: 1, 2008, p.36.

KRAUSE, Keith and WILLIAMS, Michael C., "Broadening the Agenda of Security Studies: Politics and Methods", **Mershon International Studies Review**, Vol.40, 1996.

KULAKLIKAYA, Musa, "Kalkınma Yardımında Son Trendler ve TIKA", Uluslararası Ekonomik Sorunlar Dergisi, Sayı: 31. November, 2008, also available in, http://www.mfa.gov.tr/data/Kutuphane/yayinlar/EkonomikSorunlarDergisi/sayi31/ Musa%20KULAKLIKAYA.pdf [10.12.2009]

LEBOW, Richard Ned, "Power, Persuasion and Justice," **Millennium** 33, 3, 2005.

LINDLEY-FRENCH, Julian, "The Revolution in Security Affairs: Hard and Soft Security Dynamics in the 21. Century", **European Security**, Vol.13, 2004.

MATTERN, Janice Bially, "Why Soft Power Isn't So Soft: Representational Force and the Sociolinguistic Construction of Attraction in World Politics," **Millenium: Journal of International Studies,** 2005.

MEARSHEIMER, John, "The False Promise of International Institutions", **International Security,** 1994/95.

MEARSHEIMER, John, "Why we will soon miss the Cold War?" **The Atlantic** 266, August 1990, also available in, http://peace.concordia.ca/pdf/cold.war.pdf 03.07.2010 [28.06.2010]

MORAN, Theodore, "International Economics and National Security", **Foreign Affairs,** Vol. 69, 1990/91.

NAFI, Basheer M., "*The* Arabs and Modern Turkey: A Century of Changing Perceptions", **Insight Turkey**, Vol.11 No.1, 2008.

NYE, Joseph. S., "American Strategy after Bipolarity", **International Affairs**, vol.66, No.3, 1990

NOUREDDINE, Mohammed, "Arab-Turkish Cooperation in the New Era", **Insight Turkey**, Vol.11 No.1, 2009.

ROBERTS, Brad, "Human Rights and International Security", **Washington Quarterly,** Vol.13, 1990

ROBINS, Philip, "Between Sentiment and Self-Interest*: Turkey's Policy toward Azerbaijan and the Central Asian States*," **Middle East Journal**, vol. 47, autumn 1993.

ROTHSCHILD, Emma, "What is Security*?*" **Deadalus,** vol.124, No.3, 1995

RUBENSTEIN, Robert A., "Cultural Analysis and International Security", **Alternatives**.13, 1988

PARIS, Roland, "Human Security. Paradigm Shift or Hot Air?", **International Security,** Vol. 26, No.2, 2001.

SCHMIDT, Brian C., "Competing Realist Conceptions of Power", **Millenium: Journal of International Studies**, 2005. Vol. 33, No. 3.

SINGER, Peter W., "AIDS and International Security", **International Security**, Vol. 44, No.1 2002

TURAN, İlter, "Unstable Stability: Turkish Politics at the Crossroads", **International Affairs**, Vol: 83 No: 2, 2007.

ULLMAN, Richard, "Redefining Security", **International Security,** Vol. 8, 1983.

ÜNLÜSARCIKLI, Özgür "EU, Turkey and Neighborhood Policies", **Turkish Policy Quarterly**, Volume 8, Number: 3, 2009.

WALT, Stephen M., "The Renaissance of Security Studies"**, International Studies Quarterly,** Vol. 35, No. 2, 199.

WALTZ, Kenneth, "The emerging structure of International Politics", **International Security** 18, fall 1993.

ZALEWSKI, Piotr,"Turkish Foreign Policy: Telling Style from Substance", **Turkish Policy Quarterly,** Volume: 7 Number: 4, 2008.

ELECTRONIC RESOURCES:

2009 Yaz Staj Programı'na Katılan Öğrenciler Sertifikalarını Aldı, 15.07.2009
http://www.tobb.org.tr/haber_arsiv2.php?haberid=2500 [14.03.2010]

2010 Yılı Bütçesi Genel Kurulda, 24.12.2009,

http://www.resmi-gazete.org/gundem/duyurular/tbmm/2010-yili-butcesi-genel-kurulda.html [16.08.2010]

About DFIF, Who we work with?
http://www.dfid.gov.uk/About-DFID/Who-we-work-with1/ [01.05.2010]

About TIKA,
http://www.tika.gov.tr/EN/Icerik.ASP?ID=345 [23.12.2010]

ACCRA Agenda for Action, 2-4.09.2008,
http://siteresources.worldbank.org/ACCRAEXT/Resources/4700790-1217425866038/AAA-4-SEPTEMBER-FINAL-16h00.pdf [21.02.2010]

ACCRA High Level Forum, Milestones of Aid Effectiveness, Paris Declaration,
http://www.accrahlf.net/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/ACCRAEXT/0,,contentMDK:21690889~isCURL:Y~menuPK:64861438~pagePK:64861884~piPK:64860737~theSitePK:4700791,00.html [21.02.2010]

Afrika Yılı'na Etiyopyalı Başlangıç, yayın tarihi: 09.02.2007,
http://www.radikal.com.tr/haber.php?haberno=212527 [18.04.2010]

Arms Control Association
http://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets [05.02.2010]

Australian Red Cross Time Line,
http://www.redcross.org.au/aboutus_history_timeline.htm [12.05.2010]

Avni Aksoy's Speech in the Project Launch of UNDP/TIKA South-South Cooperation Project in 09.October.2008, Ankara, also available in,
http://www.undp.org.tr/basin_bildirisi/Avni_Aksoy_Speech.doc [27.05.2010]

Avrasya TV,

> http://www.avrasya.tv/s-anasayfa.html [03.04.2010]

Bridging South-South Cooperation and Emerging Donor Roles,

> http://www.undp.org.tr/Gozlem2.aspx?WebSayfaNo=1439 [27.05.2010]

Canadian International Development Agency, About CIDA,

> http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/acdi-cida/acdi-cida.nsf/eng/NIC-5313423-N2A
> [13.05.2010]

CARE,

> http://www.care.org/about/index.asp [12.05.2010]

Central Intelligence Agency, **The World Factbook**,

> https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-
> factbook/rankorder/2034rank.html?countryName=Germany&countryCode=gm&r
> egionCode=eu&rank=97#gm [09.04.2010]

CIDA, Stories from the field,

> http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/acdi-cida/ACDI-CIDA.nsf/eng/JUD-52684956-H39
> [14.05.2010]

ÇAĞAPTAY, Soner, "**Size Matters in Turkey's Shifting International Role**", Hurriyet
Daily News, July 22, 2009, 22.07.2009

> http://www.washingtoninstitute.org/templateC06.php?CID=1312 [18.01.2010]

DAG Background and Structure, 30.01.2010,

> http://www.dagethiopia.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=5&It
> emid=29 [26.05.2010]

Devlet Bakanı Faruk Çelik, Kırgızistan'da 'Yılın Adamı' Seçildi, 21.12.2009,

> http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1343 [19.05.2010]

Dünya'da ve Türkiye'de Turizm, 2007,

> http://www.kultur.gov.tr/TR/Genel/dg.ashx?DIL=1&BELGEANAH=242656&DOS
> YAISIM=sonturizmraporu.DOC [17.02.2010]

EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2008,

http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0015/001548/154820e.pdf [15.04.2010]

GAP'ın Genel Hedefleri,

http://www.gap.gov.tr/gap/gap-in-hedefleri [25.04.2010]

Genç Diplomatlar Eğitim için Türkiye'de, April, 2007

http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=737 [28.03.2010]

GTZ; Sustainable Development Concept,

http://www.gtz.de/en/unternehmen/15534.htm [09.04.2010]

GTZ; who we work for;

http://www.gtz.de/en/unternehmen/1732.htm [28.03.2010]

HIV/AIDS Bölgesel İncinebilirlik Çalışması,

http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=858 [12.04.2010]

History of OXFAM International,

http://www.oxfam.org/en/about/history [12.05.2010]

International Development Association,

http://www.worldbank.org/ida/ [27.04.2010]

Irak ile ticarette hedef 20 milyar dolar, 27.01.2010,

http://www.tobb.org.tr/haber_arsiv2.php?haberid=2732 [30.01.2010]

JICA, About JICA, http://www.jica.go.jp/english/about/organization/ [22.04.2010]

JICA Annual Report 2009,

http://www.jica.go.jp/english/publications/reports/annual/2009/pdf/02.pdf
[14.05.2010]

JICA Facts and Figures,

http://www.jica.go.jp/english/news/field/2008/pdf/081003.pdf [05.07.2010]

JICA, President's Desk,

http://www.jica.go.jp/english/about/president/ , [24.03.2010]

KABALAN, Marwan Al, "**Turkey is becoming a regional broker**" 07.10.2009
http://www.tehrantimes.com/index_View.asp?code=207291 [03.06.2010]

Karadeniz Ekonomik İşbirliği (KEİ),
http://www.dpt.gov.tr/PortalDesign/PortalControls/WebContentGosterim.aspx?Enc=51C9
D1B02086EAFBF69CEF5F299AE5B4 [12.04.2010]

KINZER, Stephen, "**Turkey leads the Muslim World**", 27.10.2009,
http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2009/oct/27/turkey-muslim-world-leader-israel
[03.06.2010]

LESSER, D., "Turkey's Ottoman Mission", Financial Times, 23 November 2009
www.ft.com/cms/s/0/af859474-d868-11de-b63a-00144feabdc0.html [19.12.2009]

Mardin Serbest Bölgesi, 2006,
http://www.mardin.gov.tr/turkce/ekonomi/ekonomimardinserbestbolgesi.asp
[26.12.2009]

Marmara Sağlık Dernekleri Platformu'ndan TIKA'ya "Yılın Devlet Kuruluşu" Ödülü,
24.03.2010,
http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1381 [28.03.2010]

Mehter ve Kızılordu aynı sahnede 13.10.2008,
http://arsiv.ntvmsnbc.com/news/462158.asp [03.03.2010]

Ministry of Culture and Tourism of the Republic of Turkey, Tourism Statistics,
http://www.kultur.gov.tr/TR/Genel/BelgeGoster.aspx?F6E10F8892433CFF2B81939FD5
B60AFA136DF7714D282500 [17.02.2010]

Moğolistan Başbakanı Batbold Sukhbaatar'dan TIKA'ya Madalya, 12.04.2010,
http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1388 [19.05.2010]

Monitoring the effectiveness of the Australian aid program: What is aid effectiveness?
http://www.ausaid.gov.au/ode/default.cfm [17.03.2010]

Musa Kulaklıkaya's Speech in the Project Launch of UNDP/TIKA South-South
Cooperation Project in 09.October.2008, Ankara, also available in,
http://www.undp.org.tr/basin_bildirisi/Musa_Kulaklikaya_Speech.doc [27.05.2010]

Non-DAC Donors reporting their aid to the DAC,
http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/52/16/44376748.xls [05.07.2010]

NYE, Joseph S., "Rice Must Deploy More 'Soft Power'." *Daily Star*, January 25, 2005.
Also available in,
http://belfercenter.ksg.harvard.edu/publication/1386/rice_must_deploy_more_soft_power
.html [13.05.2010]

OECD Ankara Multilateral Tax Center,
http://www.gib.gov.tr/index.php?id=264 [12.04.2010]

OECD History,
http://www.oecd.org/pages/0,3417,en_36734052_36761863_1_1_1_1_1,00.html
[01.04.2010]

OECD Journal on Development: Development Cooperation Report, 2009, 09.03.2009
http://www.oecdbookshop.org/oecd/display.asp?K=5KZG160MNRF7&DS=OECD-
Journal-on-Development-Development-Co-operation-Report-2009 [01.04.2010]

OECD Topics,
http://www.oecd.org/maintopic/0,3348,en_2649_201185_1_1_1_1_1,00.html
[11.05.2010]

ONUR, N.Fisher, "Neo Ottomanism, Historical Legacies and Turkish foreign policy",
EDAM Papers, 2009/3, 03.11.2009
http://www.gmfus.org//doc/Discussion%20Paper%20Series_Fisher.pdf [04.03.2010]

OXFAM, Conflict and Natural Disasters, May 2009,
http://www.oxfam.org.uk/resources/issues/conflict/introduction.html [10.05.2010]

Paris Declaration and ACCRA for Action,
http://www.oecd.org/document/18/0,3343,en_2649_3236398_35401554_1_1_1_1,00.ht
ml [27.05.2010]

Relations with the Balkan Region,
http://www.mfa.gov.tr/relations-with-the-balkan-region.en.mfa [13.05.2010]

SALEM, Paul, "Could This be Turkey's Century in the Middle East?", 29.10.2009
http://www.carnegieendowment.org/publications/index.cfm?fa=view&id=24067
[03.06.2010]

Save the Children, Timeline,
http://www.savethechildren.org/about/interactive-timeline/ [12.05.2010]

Sebahattin Gazanfer's Speech in the Project Launch of UNDP/TIKA South-South Cooperation Project in 09.October.2008, Ankara, also available in,
http://www.undp.org.tr/basin_bildirisi/Sebahattin_Gazanfer_Presentation.ppt
[27.05.2010]

Smart Power, 29.11.2007,
http://www.huffingtonpost.com/joseph-nye/smart-power_b_74725.html
[02.09.2010]

Smart Power Initiative, 06.05.2009,
http://csis.org/program/smart-power-initiative [16.09.2006]

Suriye ile ortak sınır kapısı, ticareti kolaylaştıracak, 21.01.2010,
http://www.tobb.org.tr/haber_arsiv2.php?haberid=2727 [30.01. 2010]

Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency,
http://web.mit.edu/urbanupgrading/upgrading/resources/organizations/Sida.html
[23.04.2010] http://www.sida.se/Svenska/ [23.04.2010]

TAŞPINAR, Omer, Turkey's Middle East Policies: Between Neo-Ottomanism and Kemalism, September, 2008,
http://www.carnegieendowment.org/publications/index.cfm?fa=view&id=22209
[19.12.2010]

TBMM Haber,
http://www.meclishaber.gov.tr/develop/owa/haber_portal.giris [02.04.2010]

TBMM,
http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/ [02.04.2010]

TBMM TV,
http://www.tbmmtv.com/ [02.04.2010]

The Interational Development Research Center, "Swords into ploughshares: IDRC supports a new kind of peace process" , February, 2009,
http://www.idrc.ca/en/ev-136284-201-1-DO_TOPIC.html [14.05.2010]

TIKA 2009 Koordinasyon Toplantısı Yapıldı, 22.01.2010,
http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Icerik_Detay.ASP?Icerik=1357 [20.05.2010]

TIKA Proje Belirleme ve Uygulama Yönetmeliği, 28.08.2001,
http://www.tika.gov.tr/TR/Yukle.ASP?Tur=Dosya&ID=48 [28.03.2010]

TRT Avaz "Merhaba" Dedi, 21.03.2010
http://www.trt.net.tr/Haber/HaberDetay.aspx?HaberKodu=6640f875-aaa9-4ae9-9e9b-fe4e0a144379 [04.04.2010]

TRT El Türkiye Yayında, 04.04.2010,
http://www.trt.net.tr/Haber/HaberDetay.aspx?HaberKodu=1585f56c-a353-4a76-8808-b307c54c4c42 [09.04.2010]

"Turkey as an Emerging Donor", New Horizons, UNDP Turkey Monthly Newsletter,
Issue 46, October 2009,
 http://www.undp.org.tr/Gozlem2.aspx?WebSayfaNo=2155 [22.03.2010]

Turkey: Capacity assessment and response help prepare Turkish Development
Cooperation for expanding mandate, 13 January 2010,
http://europeandcis.undp.org/cpr/show/E606C9DA-F203-1EE9-B54CED599932DB2E
[22.03.2010]

Turkey readies to receive 20,000 Kosovar refugees, 06.04.1999
http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/h.php?news=turkey-readies-to-receive-20000-kosovar-refugees-1999-04-06 [01.02.2010]

Turkey's political relations with Georgia,
http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey_s-political-relations-with-georgia.en.mfa [13.05.2010]

Turkey's political relations with Armenia,
http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey_s-political-relations-with-armenia.en.mfa [13.05.2010]

Turkey's relations with Central Asian Republics,
http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey_s-relations-with-central-asian-republics.en.mfa [11.11.2009]

Turkish Drama Series Gain Popularity in Arab World, 27.04.2008,
http://www.aawsat.com/english/news.asp?section=7&id=12568 [12.04.2010]

Turkish Statistical Institute,
www.tuik.gov.tr [29.05.2010]

Turkology Students in Turkey, 11.07.2009,
http://www.trt.net.tr/international/newsDetail.aspx?HaberKodu=2e127994-cc48-4fa4-a085-f627b39a6380 [14.03.2010]

Türk İşbirliği ve Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığının Teşkilat ve Görevleri Hakkında Kanun,
12.05.2010,
http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/main.aspx?home=http://rega.basbakanlik.gov.tr/eskiler/2001/05/20010512.htm&main=http://rega.basbakanlik.gov.tr/eskiler/2001/05/20010512.htm [28.10.2009]

Türkiye'nin Afrika'ya Desteği,
http://www.tasamafrika.org/tr/arsiv/makaleler/281-tuerkiyenin-afrikaya-destei.html [05.07.2010]

Türkiye-Afrika Zirvesi Başladı, 14.09.2008,
http://www.cnnturk.com/2008/turkiye/08/18/turkiye.afrika.birligi.zirvesi.basladi/490738.0/index.html [18.04.2010]

Türkiye'nin Bölgesel Güç Olması Yolunda TSK'nın Rolü,
http://www.diplomatikgozlem.com/haber_oku.asp?id=58 [23.05.2010]

Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ve Avustralya Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda İşbirliği Çerçeve Anlaşmasının Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun,
14/04/2009,
http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5853 [23.05.2010]

Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ile Katar Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda Eğitim, Teknik ve Bilimsel İşbirliği Anlaşmasının Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun, 08/05/2008,
http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5755 [23.05.2010]

Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ile Kongo Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda Eğitim, Teknik ve Bilimsel İşbirliği Çerçeve Anlaşmasının Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun, 08/05/2007,
http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5640 [23.05.2010]

Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti ile Şili Cumhuriyeti Hükümeti Arasında Askeri Alanda
    Eğitim, Savunma Sanayii, Teknik ve Bilimsel İşbirliği Anlaşmasının
    Onaylanmasının Uygun Bulunduğuna Dair Kanun, 04/04/2007,
    http://www.tbmm.gov.tr/develop/owa/kanunlar_sd.durumu?kanun_no=5616 [23.05.2010]

UNDP,
    http://hdr.undp.org/en/ [03.04.2010]

United Nations Development Group;
    http://www.undg.org [02.02.2010]

United Nations, Millennium Goals,
    http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/ [02.02.2010]

USAID,
    http://www.usaid.gov/stories/tajikistan/ss_tjk_donations.html [13.05.2010]

USAID; About USAID,
    http://www.usaid.gov/about_usaid/ [31.03.2010]

USAID Afghanistan, Health, 30.11.2009,
    http://afghanistan.usaid.gov/en/Program.28.aspx [18.04.2010]

World Bank, Data Catolog,
    http://data.worldbank.org/data-catalog [07.07.2010]

World Health Organization, Data and Statistics,
    http://www.who.int/research/en/ [01.07.2010]